

5-31-2016

## Books Noted and Received

Patrick G. Scott

*University of South Carolina - Columbia*

Follow this and additional works at: <http://scholarcommons.sc.edu/ssl>



Part of the [Literature in English, British Isles Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Scott, Patrick G. (2016) "Books Noted and Received," *Studies in Scottish Literature*: Vol. 42: Iss. 1, 124–137.

Available at: <http://scholarcommons.sc.edu/ssl/vol42/iss1/11>

This Book Reviews is brought to you for free and open access by the Scottish Literature Collections at Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in *Studies in Scottish Literature* by an authorized administrator of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact [SCHOLARC@mailbox.sc.edu](mailto:SCHOLARC@mailbox.sc.edu).

## BOOKS NOTED AND RECEIVED

This list covers books received or noted since publication of *SSL* 40 in October 2014. Inclusion in this list need not preclude possible fuller discussion of a book in a subsequent review or review essay.

Adogame, Afo, and Andrew Lawrence, eds., *Africa in Scotland, Scotland in Africa*. Leiden: Konjinklijke Brill NV, 2014. Paper, €66/\$80. Pp. xii + 363. ISBN 9789004276208.

--While this volume is not primarily focused on literature, it provides the kind of contextual discussion that is currently broadening Scottish literary studies, opening with an astringent discussion of Burns and the African slave trade, and providing a varied set of case studies on Scotland's missionary, commercial, and medical interactions with Africa, especially in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries.

Andrews, Corey. *The Genius of Scotland: The Cultural Production of Robert Burns, 1788-1834*. Leiden: Konjinklijke Brill NV, 2015. Pp. 290. Paper, €72/\$93. ISBN 978-90-04-29436-3.

--This book provides an extended study of Burns and Burns's early reputation, primarily within Scotland, from the first reviews through to the 1830s, treating reputation not as passive reception, but as the active production of emergent and long-lasting authorial identities. The introduction and first chapter, drawing chiefly on Bourdieu, trace the development of "genius theory." These are followed by chapters on the first reviews from 1786-88, both enthusiastic and sceptical; comments on Burns during his post-Edinburgh life (1788-1796); the ambiguities of his immediate posthumous reputation, through 1816, with sustained attention to Maria Riddell's account, as well as those by Heron, Currie, Scott, Jeffrey, and Josiah Walker; poems about Burns written during the same period, with notably cool comments on the Roscoe poem that Currie reprinted and made famous; and a final chapter on James Hogg's role in

shaping responses to Burns. Even though many of the individual reviews or poems discussed will be known to most Burnsians through Donald Low's *Critical Heritage* volume and other studies (and this book is scrupulous in citing previous scholarship), there are some discoveries, and Andrews reads these texts more intensively than reception surveys commonly do. He also makes a fuller attempt to explain their significance, rather than falling into the long-established habit among Burnsians of treating the early assessments as quaint, obtuse, or even treacherous, mischaracterization. A number of recent studies have revised understandings of Burns's reputation in a longer time-frame or in a European, American, or global context, but, within its more tightly-drawn parameters, arguably of more immediate relevance for understanding Burns's work, this study will be of great value.

Baker, Timothy C. *Contemporary Scottish Gothic: Mourning, Authenticity, and Tradition*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014. Pp. 232. Hardcover, \$95. ISBN 978-1-137-45719-6.

--This monograph tackles a much-discussed topic readably and intelligently, reviewing variously influential and partial generic definitions, and carefully distancing its approach from older essentialist accounts of the Scottishness of Scottish Gothic. Baker manages to do this, and to draw usefully on a variety of modern criticism, particularly that of Derrida on mourning, without undermining the interest of the topic itself. The opening pages provide a very useful guide to recent debates and definitions, and each of the following chapters works intertextually, tracing a recognizably Gothic trait or motif (the found manuscript, the island setting, animal transformations, the northern landscape), briefly in older Scottish fiction (Scott, Hogg, Stevenson, of course, but equally Anne Radcliffe's first novel, George MacDonald, and Margaret Oliphant), and then more fully in an astonishing range of contemporary works (by, e.g., Alasdair Gray, James Robertson, Louise Welsh, Ian Rankin, Alice Thompson, A.L. Kennedy, Andrew Crumey, John Burnside, Iain Banks, Elspeth Barker, and Sara Moss). The result is a usefully-flexible and alertly-written study in which admirers of many individual writers will find new networks of connection for their work.

Bann, Jennifer, and John Corbett. *Spelling Scots: the Orthography of Literary Scots, 1700-2000*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015). Pp. 162. Hardcover, \$120. ISBN 9780748643059.

—This important if fairly brief study provides a clear introduction to the successive conventions through which Scottish writers, editors, and publishers, have chosen to represent Scots in print. The result is a very useful account, and clarification, of the strata of orthographic convention that readers face, and that editors must disentangle, in experiencing almost any Scottish literary text. Technically, it rests on extensive cluster-analysis from the online version of the two great modern Scottish national dictionaries, and on the Glasgow Corpus of Modern Scottish Writing, and this allows comment and data on consistency (and variability) of Scots spelling in such writers as Ramsay, Burns, Hogg, John Wilson, George Douglas Brown, and Hugh MacDiarmid. While this book's approach is primarily historical and descriptive, it brings out well the normative influence exercised by literary works and dictionaries on their successors, and it notes also activist efforts to standardize and differentiate Scots spelling by the Lallans Society and others.

Benchimol, Alex, Rhona Brown, and David Shuttleton, eds. *Before Blackwood's: Scottish Journalism in the Age of the Enlightenment*. The Enlightenment World, 29. London: Pickering and Chatto, 2015. Pp. xii + 163. Hardback, \$150. ISBN: 978-1-84893-550-1.

—This volume presents nine essays on specific periodicals or periodical-based topics, ranging from 1705 to the 1830s, presented as evidence of a new engagement by 18<sup>th</sup> century scholars with the cultural significance of periodical format, in the formation of a Habermasian public sphere. There are some distinguished contributors (Stephen Brown on the *Edinburgh Evening Courant*, Jon Mee on *The Bee*, Nigel Leask on Burns and the *Glasgow Magazine*, Gillian Hughes on Hogg's *Spy*), and worthwhile essays by other scholars. Murray Pittock provides a short, but valuably-sceptical, afterword, suggesting how the conflictual, even violent, strand in Scottish periodical writing complicates application of the Habermasian model. The volume originated in what must have been a stimulating symposium at the University of Glasgow in 2010.

Berry, Simon. *Applauding Thunder: Life, Work, and Critics of Alexander Smith*. Inverness: FTRR Press, 2013. Pp. 240. Paperback, £12.99/\$19.89. ISBN 978-1-905787-59-3.

—Victorian Scottish poetry, if something of a black hole in Scottish literary studies, was an overpopulated black hole, and its continued exploration is much to be welcomed. This is the first modern biography of Smith, who is known to Victorian scholars for his Spasmodic poem *A*

*Life Drama* (in *Poems*, 1853), his essay collection *Dreamthorp* (1863) and his prose idyll *A Summer in Skye* (1865), but now gets into Scottish anthologies chiefly for his poem "Glasgow" (from his *City Poems*, 1857). His edition of Burns (1865) was still being reprinted in Macmillan's Globe series into the 1930s. Berry, a freelance researcher who has been writing on Smith since the 1980s, has produced a readable if understandably defensive survey of Smith's literary career. The book is sometimes patchy in its account, and use, of earlier Smith criticism and research, but it is the only book substantially on Smith since Mark Weinstein's book on the Spasmodics in 1968. Fifty years ago, Berry's book might have appeared from a university press, like Weinstein's, or from a commercial publisher, and it would have benefitted from university-press copy-editing. More important, it would have got better distribution. WorldCat and COPAC show, between them, copies in only two U.K. and two North American libraries. It is a landmark study of a once-influential Scottish writer, and any library for Scottish literary studies should order it while it is still available.

Broadhead, Alex. *The Language of Robert Burns: Style, Ideology, and Identity*. Lewisburg, PA: Bucknell University Press, 2014. Pp. 252. Hardcover, \$75. ISBN 9781611485288.

—This important book provides a different view of Burns's language, in that it focuses on linguistic variety, not as a simple polarity, but as involving frequent linguistic variation and mutation, noting how Burns's own usage in many ways created the language that later commentators saw him as inheriting. The substantial introduction gives a readable and useful overview of the issues in relation to Burns criticism, paying respectful tribute to the skill of earlier commentators but pointing out the often over-simplified sketches they utilize of the Scots language scene in Burns's time. Chapters 1 and 2, with discussions of language use in Burns's poems and letters, will seem most familiar and accessible to unlinguistic readers. Ch. 3, on Burns's use and manipulation of linguistic stereotyping, fits well with more modern appreciation of Burns's rhetorical sophistication. It is in chs. 4 and 5, on language contact theory and the ways in which speakers switch codes during a language transaction, that most Burnsians will feel most sharply that Broadhead is taking them into new territory. Though now chiefly developed for bi- or multi-language situations in post-colonial language settings, code-switching also has an honourable earlier history in the sociolinguistics of education, and so involves issues of class negotiation and identity.

Broadhead's focus is on the malleability of language and the creativity of particular language negotiations, on agency rather than system. For most literary scholars, the value of the book may seem to lie in its detailed comments on particular works or passages, but it also lays out a larger case about the language scene in late 18<sup>th</sup> century Scotland and about Burns's activity and significance for its continuing development.

Brown, Ian and Jean Berton, eds. *Roots and Fruits of Scottish Culture: Scottish Identities, History & Contemporary Literature*. Occasional Papers no. 19. Glasgow: Scottish Literature International, 2014. Pp. 157. Paper, £9.95/\$15.95. ISBN 978-1-908980-07-6.

—This useful collection originated in a joint conference of the ASLS and the Société Française d'Études Écossaises in St. Etienne in 2011, with six contributors from the U.K. and five from France, but includes essays that show evidence of later composition or rewriting. Trish Reid's opening essay, on the different political significance of Lyndsay's *Thrie Estaitis* and David Greig's *Glasgow Girls*, Ian Brown's essay on "History and Tartan," and Karyn Wilson Costa's review-article on the recent anthology *New Poems Chiefly in the Scottish Dialect* all tackle the issue raised in the volume title. Scott Lyall traces the Kailyard idea of fictional community from G. D. Brown and Gibbon through McIlvanney, Spark, and Gray, to Janice Galloway, Alan Warner, and Jackie Kay. One essay is concerned with contemporary art installations on historical themes. But the majority of contributors stay with the contemporary, treating a spectrum of writers from Liz Lochhead and Jackie Kay (who figures in three essays) to James Robertson, Andrew Greig (as novelist), and Paul Johnston. As literary studies morph into cultural studies, accessible contemporary writing gets increasing classroom attention, both in Scotland and elsewhere, yet critical discussion is not always equally accessible. The essays here, though more perhaps about the recent flowers of Scottish writing than its historic roots, will be welcome both to teachers and students.

Calin, William. *The Lily and the Thistle: The French Tradition and the Older Literature of Scotland—Essays in Criticism*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2014. Cloth, \$70.00. Pp. x + 415. ISBN 978-1-4426-4665-0.

—This substantial and well-written volume examines French sources and intertextual relationships across the canon of late medieval and Renaissance Scottish authors, from the *Kingis Quair*, Henryson, Dunbar

and Douglas, through to David Lyndsay, William Alexander, and Drummond of Hawthornden. Calin also includes chapters on the poetry of Mary Queen of Scots and of James VI. A few chapter-sections have appeared in journals or proceedings, but the bulk of the volume is new. Some passages may seem rather introductory to the specialized scholarly reader, and some reviewers have suggested that Calin's focus on French analogues forecloses discussion of, e.g. classical sources, but the upside is that the book is accessible to newcomers in the field and its arguments are always clear. Calin's readable and generally authoritative discussions are an important reminder of the value of a comparatist or international perspective alongside the study of national continuities. .

Coyer, Megan J., and David E. Shuttleton, eds. *Scottish Medicine and Literary Culture, 1726-1832*. Clio Medica 94. Rodopi Amsterdam/New York, NY 2014. xi, 315 pp. Hardback, €70/US\$98. ISBN: 978-90-420-3891-2. E-book, €63/US\$88. ISBN: 978-94-012-1173-4.

–*Scottish Medicine and Literary Culture, 1726–1832* examines the ramifications of Scottish medicine for literary culture within Scotland, throughout Britain, and across the transatlantic world. The contributors take an informed historicist approach in examining the cultural, geographical, political, and other circumstances enabling the dissemination of distinctively Scottish medico-literary discourses. In tracing the international influence of Scottish medical ideas upon literary practice they ask critical questions concerning medical ethics, the limits of sympathy and the role of *belles lettres* in professional self-fashioning, and the development of medico-literary genres such as the medical short story, physician autobiography and medical biography. Other contributions consider the role of medical ideas and culture in the careers, creative practice and reception of such canonical writers as Mark Akenside, Robert Burns, Robert Fergusson, Sir Walter Scott and William Wordsworth. While by no means providing a comprehensive survey, these essays move well beyond traditional medical antiquarianism and give a good sense of current scholarly approaches to the field.

Falconer, Rachel, ed. *Kathleen Jamie: Essays and Poems on Her Work*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015. Pp. 256. Hardcover, \$120. ISBN 9780748696000.

–This volume, with a mixture of personal essays, a lot of literary criticism, and seven poems, is part critical companion and part *festschrift*. It covers the full thirty-plus years of Jamie's writing and offers linked

audio of Jamie herself reading some of the poems discussed. Among the contributors are Robert Crawford, Alan Riach, Roderick Watson, and Andrew Greig. The critical essays, mostly close-grained reading of single works that will be welcomed by Scottish students, successfully convey appreciation for Jamie's achievement, but the comments on wider themes or literary relationships tend rather to be allusive than fully worked out.

Fulton, Henry L. *Dr. John Moore, 1729-1802, A Life in Medicine, Travel, and Revolution*. Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2015 (distributed through Rowman & Littlefield). Pp. xxii + 788. Hardcover, \$150/£100. ISBN 978-1-61149-493-8.

--Dr. John Moore, perhaps best known in Scottish literature as the recipient of Burns's "autobiographical letter," was born in Stirling (where his father was a minister), educated in Glasgow under Hutcheson and Cullen (and later son in law of Professor Simson), served as a surgeon's mate in the army in Flanders, studied in Paris, and travelled on the Continent with his cousin Dr. Tobias Smollett, all before being licensed as a surgeon at the age of 22, and moving south to make a career in London. Fulton's biography takes Moore's rooting in the early phases of the Scottish enlightenment as its starting point for the fullest exploration to date of Moore's remarkable literary (and political) connections in his subsequent life (including, for example, friendship with Godwin and a famous interview with Voltaire). He assesses Moore's own writings, which include novels as well as his *View of the Causes and Progress of the French Revolution* (1795). It will be tempting for busy scholars to dip in the index and scan only the chapter they need for a specific project, but almost any scholar of 18<sup>th</sup> century Scottish literature (or late 18<sup>th</sup> century London literary society) will learn much from taking the time to give this account of Moore's life a leisurely read in its entirety. This is a heroic and authoritative biography that may be fitly compared with such precursors as Snyder on Burns, Knapp on Smollett, Mossner on Hume, or Thornton on Currie.

Garside, P.D. ed. *Waverley*, by Walter Scott. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2014. Pp. vii + 365. Hardcover, £14.99. ISBN 978-0-7486-9787-8.

Lamont, Claire, and Katherine Sutherland, eds. *Waverley*, by Walter Scott. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015. Pp. 528. Paper, £9.99/\$15.95. ISBN 9780198716594.



—These two modestly-priced reprints celebrate the 200<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the first anonymous appearance of Scott's first novel. In both cases the reprints rely on earlier more substantial editions from the same editors and publishers, and in both instances the basis for the text is (with minor variation) the first edition, rather than Scott's later *Magnum Opus* version. The hardback, using Peter Garside's authoritative 2007 text from the Edinburgh Edition of the Waverley Novels, is remarkably good value, if you want slightly larger type and a clean reading text without annotation or apparatus. The paperback, an updated World Classics edition, but ultimately descending from Claire Lamont's landmark 1981 Clarendon edition, is a more standard study text, with a substantial new introduction by Kathryn Sutherland, and Scott's *Magnum Opus* preface and notes.

Gidal, Eric. *Ossianic Nonconformities: Bardic Poetry in the Industrial Age*. Under the Sign of Nature: Explorations in Ecocriticism. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2015. Pp. xii + 226. Hardcover. \$39.50. ISBN 978-0-8139-3817-2.

—This innovative study is less concerned with Macpherson's Ossianic writings in themselves than with what is revealed when later defenders linked Macpherson's "imaginary geographies" to the changing landscape and social structure of late 18<sup>th</sup>- and early 19<sup>th</sup>-century Scotland. Gidal shows such linkage not only for the Highlands but in the Clyde Valley and near Belfast, areas more obviously affected by economic and industrial development. Of particular interest is the way Ossian appears in attitudes to landscape and antiquities at the parish level in the great *Statistical Account of Scotland*, and in the revolutionary developments in understanding of Scottish geomorphology and geological change from Hutton to Hugh Miller.

Gottlieb, Evan and Ian Duncan, eds. *Approaches to Teaching Scott's Waverley Novels*. New York: Modern Language Association of America, 2009. Pp. vi + 202. Paper, \$19.75. ISBN 978-1-60329-036-4. Hardcover, \$37.50. ISBN 978-1-60329-036-4.

—This collection in the MLA's well-established if often quixotic series is especially welcome, because increased critical interest in Scott has seemed especially mismatched, at least in the U.S. context, with changing student interests and expectations. Ian Duncan notes in his introduction to the "Approaches" section, several essayists "begin their chapters by apologizing for the difficulties most students (and many teachers) will

encounter” (p. 19), and a moment of truth breaks through in Simon Edwards’s passing remark that, a week or so before *The Bride of Lammermoor* looms on his syllabus, “news breaks of long-standing hospital appointments, unexpected family crises, not-to-be-missed job interviews” (p. 80). The volume confronts these issues with good humour and a fundamental belief that Scott is once again a major author worth teaching, providing a wide range of essays mostly by established Scott scholars, using a variety of (historically-based) critical approaches. If some contributions seem very close to standard critical articles (and are worth reading in those terms), and some essays (Mack, Gilbert) are intentionally focused on providing historical background, others do indeed take as starting point a specific classroom situation, as, for example, Claire Simmons’s essay on Scott in a Law and Literature course, Kenneth McNeil and Tara Ghoshal Wallace’s essays on multicultural and postcolonial Scott, and Antony Hasler’s account of discussing *Old Mortality* and nationalist resistance with Irish-American students in the age of *Braveheart*, terrorism, and inflammatory political web-sites. This volume came out in 2009, during the period when *Studies in Scottish Literature* was not publishing reviews (and we are grateful to the MLA for initiating this belated notice), but despite the time-lapse Evan Gottlieb’s section on teaching materials remains one of the most useful features of the collection.

Irvine, Robert P., ed., *Prince Otto* by Robert Louis Stevenson. The New Edinburgh Edition of the Works of Robert Louis Stevenson. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2014. Pp. liv + 213. Hardcover, £70. ISBN 978-0-7486-4523-7.

–This volume, the first in the multi-volume AHRC-funded complete Stevenson edition now in progress under the general editorship of Penny Fielding, presents a newly-edited text of one of Stevenson’s less-known works, a short novel from the early 1880s set in the tiny German principality of Grünewald, Ruritanian perhaps, but a decade before Hope’s *Prisoner of Zenda* canonized the term. In the early 80s, Stevenson was trying to combine his well-developed fascination with the craft of prose and his felt need to experiment with commercially-successful genres. Other products of the same phase of his career are his adventure stories, beginning with *Treasure Island*, and his “crawlers,” such as “The Body-Snatchers.” Though *Prince Otto* was serialized (very profitably) in *Longman’s Magazine*, the text here is based on a slightly-amended version of the first book edition; while the edition does not provide the

usual collation of variants from life-time texts, it includes (as an appendix) an interpretative essay recording and discussing major revisions, and there is a separate two-page list of (very acute) emendations to the copytext. The editor, Robert Irvine, also provides a substantial introductory essay on the composition, publication history, and literary background of the book (in Meredith, de Musset, Disraeli, Dumas *pere* and  *fils*, Eugène Sue, Offenbach libretti, and elsewhere), as well as extensive explanatory annotation in surprisingly large type on sources and allusions; such annotations, perhaps with an eye to future or non-Scottish readers, include quite simple glosses and explain fully even quite ordinary Biblical allusions, but they also include interesting citations to specific sources for Stevenson's borrowings from, e.g. Leigh Hunt, Meredith, Offenbach, or Richard Strauss. Given that most libraries and many individual scholars already have on their shelves older "complete" sets of Stevenson, it will be tempting to skip buying a new edition of the less-studied works, but it would be a false economy, at least for research libraries, not to invest in this series.

Leask, Nigel, ed. *The Oxford Edition of the Works of Robert Burns Vol. I: Commonplace Books, Tour Journals, and Miscellaneous Prose*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2014. Pp. xvi + 448. Hardcover, £125. ISBN: 978-0-960317-6.

—This important volume, the first in the multi-volume AHRC-funded complete Burns edition now in progress under the general editorship of Gerard Carruthers, presents annotated diplomatic transcriptions of the raw materials of Burns research, not only the manuscript commonplace books and tours, but the Glenriddell Manuscript and a surprising number of minor items (not all by Burns himself: the volume opens with Burns's father's *Manual of Religious Belief*). Each of the texts has its own detailed introduction, with careful attention to the ideas put forward by earlier editors, even if these prove unsustainable. These introductions set a very high standard for future volumes. The texts themselves provide a readable back-of-the-tapestry introduction to Burns's life and development. For reference purposes, there is no rival modern standard edition of these texts, and there is certainly no edition with this level of scrupulous commentary. The volume is an essential library acquisition.

MacQueen, John, ed. *Tollerators and Con-Tollerators: a comedy attributed to Archibald Pitcairne*. Scottish Poetry Reprints 9. Columbia: Scottish Poetry Reprints, 2015. Pp. 36. Paper. ISBN 978-1511666053.

–This pamphlet makes separately available John MacQueen’s detailed introduction to this satire on the Scottish parliamentary debates of 1703 about religious toleration, together with his annotated text of the play, first published in *SSL* 40 (2014).

McCue, Kirsteen, ed., with Janette Currie. *Songs by the Ettrick Shepherd* [Stirling/South Carolina Research Edition of the Collected Works of James Hogg, vol. 28.] General eds. Douglas S. Mack, Ian Duncan and Suzanne Gilbert. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2014. Pp. xlvii + 369. Hardcover, £70. ISBN 978-0-7486-3936-6.

–One of the original goals of the multi-volume AHRC-funded complete Stirling/South Carolina Edition of James Hogg was to present Hogg’s writings in their original groupings, volume by volume as they had appeared. Inevitably, because Hogg himself rearranged and repackaged some of his writing, this has led, on occasion, to duplication or repetition of material between volumes. The 113 songs in this volume, a new edition of Hogg’s 1831 retrospective song collection of the same title, include songs that were first collected there, and so not previously edited in this series, but the volume also repeats smaller groups or individual songs that have appeared in, e.g., the recent editions of *The Forest Minstrel* (12 songs) or *Jacobite Relics* (11 songs; though Hogg also added Jacobite songs in 1831 that were not in the *Relics*). The new volume is valuable as giving Hogg’s summation of his achievement as a songwriter, and it allows for specialist commentary that complements earlier annotation. Moreover, because the 1831 collection was separately reviewed, the extensive material here dealing with reception has no counterpart in the earlier volumes of the collected edition, even if a song has been included there. Like Hogg’s original 1831 collection (“a pocket volume”), the new edition gives only text, not music. It is, however, intended to be used in conjunction with a parallel volume headed up by the same editor, *Contributions to Musical Collections and Miscellaneous Songs*, with relevant music facsimiles and with additional editorial annotation.<sup>1</sup> Researchers (and libraries) will need both volumes to get the most out of each. As Hogg perhaps intended, bringing together his work

---

<sup>1</sup> Kirsteen McCue, ed., with Janette Currie and Megan Coyer. *Contributions to Musical Collections and Miscellaneous Songs* [Stirling/South Carolina Research Edition of the Collected Works of James Hogg, vol. 29]. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2015. Pp. 832. Hardback, £120. ISBN 978-0-7486-3935-9.

as song-writer in this way allows a fuller appreciation of his achievement in the genre than when the songs are dispersed over several volumes.

McGuirk, Carol. *Reading Robert Burns: Texts, Contexts, Transformations* [Poetry and Song in the Age of Revolution, no. 6.] London: Pickering & Chatto, 2014. Pp.xix + 255. Hardcover, £60/\$99. ISBN: 978-1-84893-519-8.

–Carol McGuirk is widely respected among scholars of Burns and 18<sup>th</sup>-century poetry for her groundbreaking study *Robert Burns and the Sentimental Era* (1985, 1996), her annotated Penguin Burns selection (1993), and her collection *Critical Essays on Robert Burns* (1998), as well regular articles and essays. Her new book presents a fresh and important critical reassessment of Burns’s development as a poet. The key chapter here is chapter 1 (pp. 29-74), pivoting on the displacement in early 1786 of Rob Burns by a newly-self-fashioned, literary Poet Burns. The case is built from careful reading, not only of the poems but also of manuscript material and, especially, the First Commonplace Book. This tour-de-force is followed by substantial essays on Wordsworth and Burns, on Burns and Highland song (in relation also to Lady Caroline Nairn), on Fergusson, Burns and Hugh MacDiarmid, and on the aphoristic Burns. Among the book’s strengths is Professor McGuirk’s comfortable reference to e.g. Bourdieu, Bakhtin, Spivack, Bhabha, Deleuze, and Guattari, as well as a wide range of Scottish and Burnsian criticism. What should certainly not be overlooked is Professor McGuirk’s brilliant introduction to the volume, which, after a dutiful summary of the book to follow, goes on to provide a concise overview of issues in current Burns criticism. In just twenty pages (pp. 8-28), McGuirk reviews Burns in relation to both Scottish and English literary canons, Burns and class, Burns and postcolonialism, Burns and language, and Burns and gender, focussed on Burns’s “irrepressible displays of difference” (p. 25), and arguing that he should not to be seen as a “sample of his social class” (he was, she comments, “an unlikely candidate for victimhood”) but as “an extraordinary instance of class-anger, class-denial, and class-bargaining on a grand scale” (p. 26). This introduction should be required reading, not only for advanced classes on Burns, but for those coming to Burns in, for example, courses on Scottish or British Romanticism or labouring-class poetry. While it does not offer an easy, settled perspective on the issues it raises, this book seems likely to be frequently quoted and cited in future discussion of Burns.

O’Flaherty, Patrick. *Scotland’s Pariah: the Life and Work of John Pinkerton 1758-1826*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2015. Pp. xiv + 313. Hardcover. \$70.00. ISBN 978-1-4426-4928-6.

–Pinkerton’s collection *Ancient Scottish Poems* (1786) was a landmark in the late 18<sup>th</sup> century recovery of earlier Scottish literature, but his early creative ballad-forgeries, Celtic-bashing, “controversial asperity” in attacking contemporaries, and unstable personal life have left his reputation at best ambiguous. Even the facts of his life, largely spent in London and Paris rather than Scotland, remain fragmentary. This first full-scale critical biography (rewritten from the author’s 1963 PhD thesis, surely a record) fills this gap readably and informatively, with agreeably-astringent commentary on the wide range of Pinkerton’s writings, and a sympathetic, conversational, but not uncritical approach to the vicissitudes of his life.

Rodner, William S., ed. *Scotia: Interdisciplinary Journal of Scottish Studies*, vol. XXXVII. Norfolk: Department of History, Old Dominion University, 2015. \$10. ISSN 0273-0693.

–Though the current issue of *Scotia* offers only one article (on Mary, Queen of Scots), it includes its usual range of reviews, including comment on the *Edinburgh Companion to Scottish Woman’s Writing*, ed. Glenda Norquay, and Jennie Calder’s new study *Lost in the Backwoods: Scots and the North American Wilderness*.

Scott, Patrick, ed. *The Prayer of Holy Willie, A canting, hypocritical, Kirk Elder by Robert Burns: the 1789 Kilmarnock Chapbook*. Scottish Poetry Reprints 8. Columbia, SC: Scottish Poetry Reprints, 2015. Pp. 32. Paper. \$8.00. ISBN 978-1514814307.

\_\_\_\_\_ *A Bard Unkend: Selected Poems in the Scottish Dialect by Gavin Turnbull*. Scottish Poetry Reprints 10. Columbia, SC: Scottish Poetry Reprints, 2015. Pp. 46. Paper. \$8.00. ISBN 978-1514348512.

–These two pamphlets, adequately explained by their titles, continue the occasional series edited by G. Ross Roy from 1970 to 1996.

Schmidgall, Gary. *Containing Multitudes: Walt Whitman and the British Literary Tradition*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2014. Pp. xxvi + 368. Hardcover. \$69.00. ISBN 978-0-19-937441-0.

–Scottish literature scholars usually approach transatlantic literary relations with a firm sense that Scotland is central, and that America’s

role is primarily that of gratifying responsiveness. Schmidgall's book not only puts Burns's influence on Whitman alongside that of such non-Scots as Blake and Wordsworth, but its forty-page treatment of the Burns-Whitman relationship puts Whitman rather than Burns at centre stage, allowing an interesting, very positive, but quite unconventional rereading of some almost too-familiar Burns poems.