This article grew out of a curiosity as to why, after decades of writing novels of real life, fairy tales for children, poems and sermons, George MacDonald returned to the peculiar mode of his early romance *Phantastes* (1858) in his late work *Lilith* (1895). In my past work on these books I have tended to consider them rather more as expressions of MacDonald's ideas and beliefs than in their own right, and to identify more than to separate them. Here the mode will be a direct comparison of the two works, together with interpretation of the data. The critical journey so followed and the conclusions to which it has led have been for this writer at least both exciting and strange.

Some scene setting is necessary at the outset. *Phantastes* and *Lilith* stand out among George MacDonald's writings and Victorian literature generally as attempts to express and imitate the wholly unconscious mind. MacDonald's deepest links were with extreme Romantic writers such as Novalis, Blake or the E.T.A. Hoffmann of *The Golden Pot* (1814). Like them, if not always for the same reasons, he was absolute and uncompromising in his rejection of rationalist or empiricist approaches to the world and in his advocacy of the unconscious imagination as the source of truth. Unlike them, however, he valued the imagination not only from an anti-rationalist
standpoint, but because he believed it to be the dwelling-place of God in men, and hence the fount of absolute rather than possibly subjective truth. God, and not man, was for him the author of all thoughts in the mind, which "from the vast unknown, where time and space are not...suddenly appear in luminous writing upon the wall of...consciousness." For God sits in that chamber of our being in which the candle of our consciousness goes out in darkness, and sends forth from thence wonderful gifts into the light of that understanding which is His candle. Our hope lies in no most perfect mechanism even of the spirit, but in the wisdom wherein we live and move and have our being. Thence we hope for endless forms of beauty informed of truth. If the dark portion of our own being were the origin of our imaginations, we might well fear the apparition of such monsters as would be generated in the sickness of a decay which could never feel--only declare--a slow return towards primeval chaos. But the Maker is our Light.

The human artist must therefore try to avoid imposing patterns or meanings on the gifts of his imagination, for he is expressing God's patterns, which can be understood only in the imagination and by the childlike mind, and not in the intellect: "The greatest forces," MacDonald declares, "lie in the region of the uncomprehended." *Phantastes* is prefixed by a quotation from Novalis on fairy-tales (Märchen) as dream-like successions of images. *Lilith*, MacDonald told his son Greville, seemed to him to have been "a mandate direct from God, for which he himself was to find form and clothing." At the close of *Lilith*, Mr. Vane is given a revelation of the true source of his dreams: "When a man dreams his own dream, he is the sport of his dream; when Another gives it him, that Other is able to fulfil it." MacDonald especially valued *Phantastes* and *Lilith*, almost the first and almost the last of his works, and his dearest literary aims find expression in them.

MacDonald lived a life of almost total isolation from his intellectual and social milieu. He was a Highland Scot living in England, a minister deprived of a pulpit for heterodoxy, a man of uncompromising refusal to bend to the world's standards to make money, a soul longing for death as the door to meeting God, one who lived from the resources of his family and his own spirit rather than from any wider community. This partly explains how he could write works so obscure and severed in character from those of his contemporaries. It may also ex-
plain why his work does not do the Victorian "thing" and evolve, change in character or treat new ideas. Indeed the very fact that he ends his career with a work not dissimilar in basic form from one of his earliest\(^9\) underlies this; it also closes the circle of his literary life just as he himself lived in a sense in a circle of his own.

The similarities of *Phantastes* and *Lilith* are clear enough. With the exception of the very different tale of Celtic second sight, *The Portent* (1864), they are the only romances for adults that MacDonald wrote. Both are dream-structured: that is to say, they consist of a sequence of often inexplicable but suggestive images, described with a curious mixture of precision and vagueness;\(^{10}\) and the landscape is that of both the unconscious mind and the world imaginatively seen. In both there are recurrent primordial images (most of them to be paralleled in the works of C.G. Jung, where they are given psychoanalytic explanation\(^{11}\))—mothers, the anima figure, shadows, water, trees, caves, mirrors and sun and moon. Both works describe death, whether out of the conscious self or life. In each there is one central and isolated human figure who has just come of age and into the management of his estate, and who goes from his house into a fairyland. In these fairylands each hero brings to life a woman enchanted or near death, is repulsed by her, and subsequently pursues her. At the end of each work the hero is returned to "this" world to await a great good which he believes is coming to him (in both books evil is felt to be finally unreal [182, 262]). There are several smaller likenesses. Mirrors are used as magic apparatus in both works; Cosmo’s mirror in the inset story in *Phantastes* has enslaved a princess to appear in the reflection of any room in which it is set; and the mirror-apparatus in Mr. Vane’s garret in *Lilith* is the means of entry into the region of the seven dimensions. Anodos in *Phantastes* finds his evil shadow; Vane is opposed by a Great Shadow. There are feminine doubles in *Phantastes* such as the evil Maid of the Alder-tree and the pure white lady, and in *Lilith* there are a spotted leopardess that is Lilith and a white one that is Mara, child of Eve. The evil Ash and Alder of *Phantastes* have, like Lilith, a spiritual "hole in the heart" which makes them devourers (39, 56–7, 325).\(^{12}\) In both books songs have magical power, whether in binding Lilith (319) or in loosing the white lady from imprisonment as a statue (45–8, 114–9). Both have halls of dancers (110–14, 262–6, 309–10), palaces, and cottages. In each the same poem on the home of life occurs in roughly the same position from the end:
Many a wrong, and its curing song;
Many a road, and many an inn;
Room to roam, but only one home
For all the world to win.

(164, 398)

After that in *Lilith* Vane reflects, "I thought I had heard the song before."

Yet while there is not "evolution" or difference in basic form between the two works, they are radically to be distinguished in subject matter. Just as they circle MacDonald's literary life, so the one completes the circle begun by the other. That circle has nothing to do with development, but rather with completing a pattern. For *Phantastes* deals with some of the First Things; and *Lilith* with the Last. *Phantastes* has as its subject a man embarking on life, and describes a fall (Anodos' enslavement to his evil shadow after an act of disobedience) and a Christ-like act of sacrifice for others by Anodos in the evil forest-church at the end; after which, back in his own world, he finds that his wicked shadow has gone. Anodos concludes, "Thus I, who set out to find my Ideal, came back rejoicing that I had lost my Shadow" (182). The narrative in *Lilith*, however, moves towards the Last Days, and describes the morning of eternity when resurrected souls make their way into heaven; the story focuses on the gradual acceptance by the recalcitrant hero Mr. Vane of his need to lie down and sleep with the dead in Adam's house so that he may waken to eternity.

Throughout *Phantastes* Anodos is occupied in waking people up. In a cave he finds a block of alabaster in which he can see the indistinct outline of a woman: on an impulse he sits by this "antenatal tomb" (45) and sets about waking the woman by singing a song against darkness and death, until she actually breaks free from the stone and glides away into the woods (47). Again by song Anodos later renders visible the figure of the lady in a hall of statues in a fairy palace; and when he seizes her from the black pedestal on which she is set she comes to life and escapes from him (115-20). Anodos' last act in Fairy Land is designed to waken his master the knight to the evil of the religious ceremony in the forest church (175). The story of Cosmo and his mirror is also one of an awakening: first the princess, who has hitherto been a passive victim of the mirror, not knowing that she is seen in it, becomes aware of Cosmo; and then, when by an act of sacrifice which prefigures that of Anodos, Cosmo dies to smash the mirror, she is released from its power and from the deadly trances it produces. In *Lilith*, however, the object of Mr.
Raven, or Adam, is to persuade people to lie down and sleep in the house of death. Where Anodos invokes movement and consciousness—"Rest is now filled full of beauty, / And can give thee up, I ween; / Come thou forth, for other duty / Motion pineth for her queen" (46)—all motion in \textit{Lilith} save the one act of climbing on to one of the slabs in the dormitory of the cold sleepers and losing consciousness is seen as evanescent. \textit{Phantastes} could be said to portray the gradual wakening of the hero, who is at first unconscious. Though the first words of the book are "I awoke one morning" the mode of his entry into Fairy Land is like a gradual lapse out of consciousness, into a dream:

[I] became aware of the sound of running water near me; and looking out of bed, I saw that a large green marble basin, in which I was wont to wash, and which stood on a low pedestal of the same material in a corner of my room, was overflowing like a spring; and that a stream of clear water was running over the carpet, all the length of the room, finding its outlet I knew not where. And, stranger still, where this carpet, which I had myself designed to imitate a field of grass and daisies, bordered the course of the little stream, the grass blades and daisies seemed to wave in a tiny breeze that followed the water's flow; while under the rivulet they bent and swayed with every motion of the changeful current, as if they were about to dissolve with it, and, forsaking their fixed form, become fluent as the waters.

My dressing-table was an old-fashioned piece of furniture of black oak, with drawers all down the front. These were elaborately carved in foliage, of which ivy formed the chief part. The nearer end of this table remained just as it had been, but on the further end a singular change had commenced. I happened to fix my eye on a little cluster of ivy-leaves. The first of these was evidently the work of the carver; the next looked curious; the third was unmistakably ivy; and just beyond it a tendril of clematis had twined itself about the gilt handle of one of the drawers. Hearing next a slight motion above me, I looked up, and saw that the branches and leaves designed upon the curtains of my bed were slightly in motion. Not knowing what change might follow next, I thought it time to get up; and, springing from the bed, my bare feet alighted upon a cool green sward;
and although I dressed in all haste, I found myself completing my toilet under the boughs of a great tree, whose top waved in the golden stream of the sunrise with many interchanging lights, and with shadows of leaf and branch gliding over leaf and branch, as the cool morning wind swung it to and fro, like a sinking seawave. (19-20)

Throughout the passage (which is very reminiscent of Hoffmann13) there is a steady increase of change from one mode of being to another mirroring the collapse of the empirical mode of presentation and entry into the unconscious mind and the world it perceives. (It is of a piece with the character of Phantastes as a whole that what is described is not only a change of being, but a shift from stillness into motion.) First it could appear that the basin was overflowing for quite ordinary reasons, and that the stream of water was equally natural—though one might expect more of a spreading flood; and despite Anodos' "stranger still" it would still be possible to believe that his impression of the movement of the grass and daisies of the carpet both beside and beneath the stream was an optical illusion. Anodos, we may note, is readier to believe in a magical transformation than we are: this may be an expression of his having fairy blood in him (22-3); but the passage carefully erodes our ability to be sceptical. The possibility of illusion is removed in the same way that the solidity of the carvings of leaves on the oak dressing-table turns through increasing uncertainty into twisting vegetation. With the movement of the branches and leaves on the bed-curtains being heard as well as seen, we are still further in; and when Anodos leaps out of bed on to a lawn instead of a carpet, we feel sure that little remains of the bedroom itself. The ironic fact is that when Anodos finally rises from his bed he is most fully asleep.14

During the first half of the story Anodos (whose name is the Greek for "pathless," or "having no way") experiences events in a chance manner without any specific object in view;15 he wanders into the cave containing the lady in alabaster, he meets the Ash and Alder by apparent accident, a stream leads him to the fairy palace, he sojourns in the palace for some time. Though he wanders in a generally eastwards direction,16 he does not know why, and can speak of "my custom since I entered Fairy Land, of taking for a guide whatever I first found moving in any direction" (75). Random impulse governs many of his actions, such as his clearing the moss from the alabaster in which the white lady is imprisoned, and then singing to release her (44, 45); entering the cottage
of an ogress and, despite her warning, opening the door of her cupboard and thus being found by his evil shadow (62, 63); or singing in the fairy palace (109). He declares, "it is no use trying to account for things in Fairy Land; and one who travels there soon learns to forget the very idea of doing so, and takes everything as it comes; like a child, who, being in a chronic condition of wonder, is surprised at nothing" (33). This is partly true, but Anodos has to learn how to unite childlikeness with true consciousness. He finds false consciousness in the form of his shadow-self, which is a symbol of intellectual and materialist modes of perception, and removes enchantment from all about him: it turns a beautiful fairy child with magic toys into "a commonplace boy, with a multiplying glass and a kaleidoscope" (66), and leads Anodos to covet, seize and so break the wonderful music-emitting globe of a little girl (68-9).

In the fairy palace he begins to be more purposive, and to plan ahead. Around the central hall of the palace are twelve radiating halls, each filled with human statues and curtained off: Anodos becomes convinced that the statues are often dancing and tries to surprise them at it, but in vain, for they are always motionless on their pedestals when he enters. He discovers that "a premeditated attempt at surprise, though executed with the utmost care and rapidity, was of no avail" (113): if he has any preformed intention of catching the statues before he lifts one of the curtains he is bound to fail, for what is needed is "a sudden thought suddenly executed" (ibid.). By trial and error, giving his mind to other thoughts and images than the dancers, he arrives at a moment when the impulse to catch them comes just as he is next to one of the curtains, and can dart through on the instant. Clearly there has to be a fusion of conscious and unconscious intention: the wish to surprise the statues must be "put to sleep" until the right moment arrives. Elsewhere in the second half of Phantastes we find emphasis on the notion of being at once prepared and unprepared. Faced by the evil Ash-tree, the knight of the rusty armour knows that "'earthly arms availed not against such as he; and that my soul must meet him in its naked strength'" (139); and later tells Anodos that a man will do none the worse in Faerie for not being "'burdened with provision and precaution'" (169). In the battle with the giants the brothers and Anodos have no time to don their carefully-prepared armour (155), though their resolution, training and some of their weapons remain to them. In the church in the forest, when Anodos wishes to expose the evil he feels there, he hands his battle-axe to one of the congregation, "for I wished to test the matter unarmed, and, if it was a
man that sat upon the throne, to attack him with hands bare"
(176).17

Thus we find that, in the second part of Phantastes, Anodos' actions emerge from rather more sustained desires and sequences of motive and act than hitherto, though these are combined with the previous unconscious mode. When early on, he brought to life the white lady in the alabaster, his search for her lasted little further than his unhappy confusion of her with the Maid of the Alder. But when he makes her both visible and mobile in the fairy palace he sets off in a pursuit of her which becomes an intermittent motif during the remainder of his experience in Fairy Land. In misery at his loss of her, he journeys through underground caverns until he comes to the shore of a dreary sea, into which he casts himself. Through one of the magic doors of the island cottage to which he is next transported he is the invisible witness of a discussion about him between the white lady and the knight of the rusty armour who, to Anodos' pain, is clearly her love (138-41). Later he meets the knight in a wood, and serves him as a squire until his own death. After his death he listens to the knight and the lady as they weep over his body, bear him to his grave and speak together of him above it (177-9). There is another chain of connection among the cottage, the battle with the giants, and the tower in which Anodos is later placed in the forest. The old woman of the cottage sends him forth to "'do something worth doing'" (145), and when he comes to land he meets two princes, who are preparing to fight three giants who menace their country; it transpires that these princes have been told previously by the old woman that Anodos will help them in their struggle (149-50). Anodos is the only survivor of the eventual battle, in which all three giants are slain. When he has been feted by the king and populace and has set out on his travels again, he has thoughts of vanity concerning his part in the fight. Immediately he encounters a double of himself who unmans him with fear and leads him to a tower in the wood, in which he remains for some time, locked in self but able, unknown to himself, to walk out whenever he wishes (162-3).

These more "conscious" and purposive elements are interwoven with the previous unconscious ones,18 in that the white lady motif is disconnected from the account of the battle with the giants and its aftermath; and there are several mysterious episodes that Anodos happens upon or is told of, and which have no relation to either of these topics—the island-cottage itself and three of its four doors, the dead dragon with which Anodos finds the knight of the rusty armour encumbered (166-9) and the little girl who is searching for butterflies to make
wings for herself but who is continually being knocked over by invisible wooden creatures (169-72).

In the end Anodos finally loses his evil shadow in what is an act at once conscious and unconscious: he senses in his soul that there is evil in the forest church, and he perceives with his keen eyesight that something suspicious is being done to the people led to the central throne (174). Together these sensations bring him to a decision and an act which is more his own than anything previously in the book (if there is still an evil tincture of revenge in his motivation [176]). It is the culmination of a development of true consciousness, and with it the false consciousness of the shadow goes for ever. The product of that consciousness is also death, but it is a death in which his perceptions are more fully awake than ever before.

The hot fever of life had gone by, and I breathed the clear mountain-air of the land of Death. I had never dreamed of such blessedness. It was not that I had in any way ceased to be what I had been. The very fact that anything can die, implies the existence of something that cannot die; which must either take to itself another form, as when the seed that is sown dies, and arises again; or, in conscious existence, may, perhaps, continue to lead a purely spiritual life. If my passions were dead, the souls of the passions, those essential mysteries of the spirit which had embodied themselves in the passions, and had given to them all their glory and wonderment, yet lived, yet glowed, with a pure, undying fire. They rose above their vanishing earthly garments, and disclosed themselves angels of light. But oh, how beautiful beyond the old form! (178)

This was anticipated by the framing stanza of the song Anodos sang to the princes before the battle with the giants: "'Oh, well for him who breaks his dream / With the blow that ends the strife; / And, waking, knows the peace that flows / Around the noise of life!'" (154). In that peace, waking and dreaming, conscious and unconscious, are one. Anodos has one further stage to go, however, for he has to "die" back out of Fairy Land into this world and mortality once more; so that in a sense, just as he is divided from Faerie, so he is divided from the true unconscious life once more.

The idea that to be truly dead or asleep is to be truly alive and awake is also central in Lilith, but is demonstrated from the opposite direction (illustrating the words of the
song in both works—"Many a road... /...but only one home / For all the world to win" [164, 398]). In Lilith, we move from a condition of stubborn consciousness into unconsciousness. The means by which Mr. Vane finds himself in the region of the seven dimensions is an apparatus whose magical workings are described in quasi-scientific terms concerning the polarisation of light: it is a mirror, which in this context is a symbol of the intellect, the conscious self, and is thus quite opposite in character to the gateway to Fairy Land in Phantastes. Unlike Anodos, Vane enters the strange realm of his story in a wakeful, questioning state, and in pursuit of something specific, the strange librarian, Mr. Raven. He is constantly surprised at what he sees, and unlike Anodos spends much time inquiring into the nature of the new world he has entered: "Could it be that I was dead, I thought, and did not know it? Was I in what we used to call the world beyond the grave? and must I wander about seeking my place in it? How was I to find myself at home?" (196-7). Mr. Raven, whom he meets in this other world, baffles his questions with riddles and paradoxes which themselves continue the intellectual, conscious element—for example, "you have not yet left your house, neither has your house left you. At the same time it cannot contain you, or you inhabit it!" (202). Later he tells Vane by intellectual means that he must do without intellect (326-7). The "wakeful" condition of Vane throughout Lilith is part of the reason for that work's being more consistently connected in structure and motivation than Phantastes.

The geography of the region of the seven dimensions is clear, with the Bad Burrow, the Evil Wood, the dried watercourse, the two cottages, the home of the Little Ones and the giants, and the town of Bulika all fairly clearly placed in relation to one another. Vane follows a steady sequence of motive and act in a way that Anodos does not till near the end of his history. He refuses Mr. Raven's invitation to lie down in the house of the dead; he meets the Little Ones and eventually leaves them in the hope of eventually helping them in their development and in their difficulties with the giants; he finds the almost-dead Lilith and revives her; he pursues her to Bulika where she feigns love for him in order to gain access to "this" world, whence she is beaten off by Mr. Raven. Once more offered death by Mr. Raven, Vane refuses and sets off on the horse of his futile passions (329-33) to help the Little Ones, but finds them already prepared, under the guidance of Lilith's daughter Lona, to do battle against the giants and set off to assault Bulika and Lilith. The latter aim results in the capture of Lilith, who eventually agrees to
lie down with the dead, whereupon Vane does also. Vane re­
 mains at a consistent level of truant wakefulness for much of
Lilith, unlike Anodos, who as we have seen, gradually loses
his state of simple, passive unconsciousness.

In keeping with the injunction to more consciousness in
Phantastes and less in Lilith—and also with the fact that
Anodos in the former is portrayed as a spiritual child at
first—we find that where Anodos is often asked to resist
something, Vane and Lilith are required to give way. Anodos
is forbidden to touch his fairy-grandmother (17), told to
guard against the evil Ash and Alder trees, and warned by the
ogress of the peril of opening the cupboard-door in her cot­
tage. Despite the inscription "TOUCH NOT!" (111), he lays
hands on the female statue he renders visible by his singing
in the fairy place, whereupon, with the reproachful cry, "'You
should not have touched me!'''', the lady darts away through a
door over which is the command, "'No one enters here without
the leave of the Queen'"—a prohibition which Anodos again
ignores (119-20). Later he is told in vain by the old lady
of the cottage in the sea not to go through the fourth door
of the cottage, the door of the Timeless: as a result he has
to leave and the sea rises to cover the cottage for a year
(143-5). Lilith and Vane, on the other hand, are told to do
rather than not to do something. They wrongfully resist for
long the injunction to lie down and sleep. Lilith maintains
that to do so would be to go against her own will, but Mara,
Eve's daughter, replies that her deepest will is to be one
with God: to Lilith's "'you shall not compel me to anything
against my will!'"', Mara answers, "'Such a compulsion would be
without value. But there is a light that goes deeper than
the will, a light that lights up the darkness behind it: that
light can change your will, can make it truly yours and not
another's—not the Shadow's'''; or again, "'[I] will with the
deeper will which created mine. There is no slave but the
creature that wills against its creator"' (371-2). The im­
perative here is to go with the grain of the universe, in
which one finds oneself borne forward by a will deeper than
one's own; where for Anodos the need is often to stand back,
to remove himself from absorption in himself and phenomena.
In a sense Anodos finds his true self by a process of separa­
tion, Vane by one of immersion: the one has to do with what
is needed for living, the other with dying.

Much of this difference relates to the theme of maternity
in Phantastes, and the fact that the history of Anodos is one
of gradual removal from over-dependence on mother-figures and
a condition of unthinking passivity. The eyes of his fairy­
grandmother, whom he meets in his home before he goes to
Fairy Land, fill Anodos with "an unknown longing" at which he remembers that 'my mother had died when I was a baby" (18). The Beech-tree who shields him from the predatory Ash calls him a baby and holds him in her arms and sings to him (39-40); though he feels he would have done better not to, he leaves her (41). As he wanders in the dark wood before he encounters the Maid of the Alder, he feels that he is "walking in a perfect night of our own old nursing earth" (50). Saved from the horrors of the Ash and Alder, he is glad to be mothered by the woman of the cottage he next comes to (56). Later, drifting in a boat on a river, Anodos falls asleep "in this cradle, in which mother Nature was rocking her weary child" (72). Worn out by his wanderings in search of the white lady, he is only too ready to be mothered by the old lady of the island cottage (131), but this is only a temporary respite from a more final parting from such dependence on mothers:

Then putting her arms around me, she held me to her bosom; and as I kissed her, I felt as if I were leaving my mother for the first time, and could not help weeping bitterly. At length she gently pushed me away, and with the words, "Go, my son, and do something worth doing," turned back, and, entering the cottage, closed the door behind her.

(145)

Thereafter Anodos meets no more mother-figures during his life in Fairy Land; when at one point he feels "unmanned" by a weak desire for maternal comfort, he "dash[es] away the tears, ashamed of a weakness which I thought I had abandoned" (162). In his death, however, which is the product of a fully "adult" decision and sacrifice, he enters that higher childhood of union with earth, of solid self with solid self, which the earlier mothers have in part prefigured, "I seemed to feel the great heart of the mother beating into mine, and feeding me with her own life, her own essential being and nature" (178).²⁵

After Anodos leaves the island cottage, his journey is no longer connected with water or baths, symbols both of the womb and of the melting of one's identity in an infant state of dependency on the mother: there are no more streams, deep rivers, or seas, but only dry land, the upland of the conflict with the giants, the royal city and the forest. In Lilitth, however, Vane is to be seen as an adult who, with an adult's consciousness, is active rather than passive, until he learns a self-surrender which has nothing to do with flight to a refuge, but is rather the opening of the self to the living
stream of the universe. For much of Lilith the landscape is waterless and arid, reflecting this insistence on the conscious and personal self: when Lilith gives herself up, the river wells up from the subterranean depths in which it was lost (394).26

One of the central themes of Phantastes is possession. To seek to "get" is to be possessed or helpless.27 Even the voracious Ash-tree, with its need to devour all that it meets, is in a sense a passive victim: the Beech-tree tells Anodos that "he has a hole in his heart that nobody knows of but one or two; and he is always trying to fill it up, but he cannot" (39). It is because Anodos lacks a truly "born" self that he himself feels the need to possess things, to lay hands on the lady of the fairy palace, or, through the effect on him of his evil shadow, to seize the little girl's beautiful crystalline ball of harmony (68-9). Because most of his acts of seizing are impulsive and childlike rather than actively malignant, he is frequently being mothered. But when he learns to be a separate individual, he learns also to let things be separate from him. He sees the course of his story as a gradual doing without greed and pride, for these are functions of infancy: "I learned that he that will be a hero, will barely be a man; that he that will be nothing but a doer of his work, is sure of his manhood" (165). Thus at the end of the story he finds his true self by giving rather than getting, in his sacrifice in the forest church.

In the first part of Phantastes there is a sense of enclosure: Anodos is wandering through forests, or entering cottages or palaces. After he leaves the sea-cottage we have more sense of openness in the upland site of the battle with the giants. Later we return to woodland: but the tower of his pride in which Anodos is shut is one out of which he can walk simply by opening the door (163).28 The forest church in which he later finds himself is full of the sense of being confined, "enclosed by four walls of yew....These trees grew to a very great height, and did not divide from each other till close to the top" (173). (The yew tree is a death-symbol.29) The eyes of the circular congregation are directed inwards, the avenue of white-robed men narrows in the distance, and it is growing dark in "the enclosure" (174). The sacrificial victims are constantly "surrounded" and "crowded" towards the central throne (174-5). It is out of this constriction that Anodos breaks, by smashing the idol and suffering death. In the account of his brief "life after death" in Fairy Land (177-80), confinement and freedom, like all other opposites, are reconciled. Anodos lies down in his grave "like a tired child...in his white bed...with a more luxuri-
uous satisfaction of repose than I knew"; but he also then rises above the ground, first in the form of a primrose, and then floating on a cloud in the free air. But then he is returned into this mortal world, becoming "once again conscious of a more limited, even a bodily and earthly life," sinking from his "state of ideal bliss, into the world of shadows which again closed around and infolded me" (180). He now has to await the final deliverance of death out of this world. But at least he has broken free of the womb, and can truly begin his life (at the opening of the story it was emphasised that he was just twenty-one); thus the description of his return to this world is somewhat like that of a birth, "a pang and a terrible shudder went through me; a writhing as of death convulsed me; and I became once again conscious of a more limited, even a bodily and earthly life."

In *Lilith* we have the reverse procedure: a man who wanders for much of the narrative in the open country ends by entering the house of Adam. But the houses in each story are on the whole different: in *Phantastes* it is the house of life, from which one must break free to realise one's own being; in *Lilith* it is the house of death, in which one is once more joined with the earth (but difference ceases in the death-states of the protagonists, when life and death, womb and grave are reconciled). Life is circular, but for MacDonald as for Blake, in spiral form: one must move from innocence to experience as in *Phantastes*, but thence to a higher innocence which is a return at a different level to the childlike state.

Anodos in *Phantastes* follows a roughly linear path, if the direction is not always constant. He is told by the woman of the second cottage he comes to, "'I have heard, that, for those who enter Fairy Land, there is no way of going back. They must go on, and go through it. How, I do not in the least know'" (61). Thus Anodos never covers the same ground twice, but is always happening on new experiences, from the forest containing the first two cottages, the Ash, the Alder and the Beech, the flower-fairies, the lady in the alabaster, and the cottage of the ogress wherein lies the shadow; thence down-river to his sojourn in the fairy with its statue-halls; and thereafter through the sequence of subterranean journey, wintry sea, island cottage, battle with giants, tower in forest, forest church, death, resurrection and return to this world. Narrative is matched by spiritual progression, as we have seen: *Phantastes* is a *Bildungsroman*, Anodos' experiences gradually bringing him nearer true selfhood and humility.

The book is also in a sense centrifugal. Anodos leaves his castle to enter Fairy Land; he starts two female statues into motion and flight; his story is interspersed with other nar-
ratives, such as those of the strange "loveless" planet and of Cosmo that he reads in the library of the fairy palace (82-108), or the ballad sung to him by the woman of the island cottage about Sir Aglovaile and his ghost-wife (131-5); in the fairy library he often lapses out of his own consciousness into those of the authors or characters of the books he reads:

if the book was one of travels, I found myself the traveller. New lands, fresh experiences, novel customs, rose around me. I walked, I discovered, I fought, I suffered, I rejoiced in my success. Was it a history? I was the chief actor therein. I suffered my own blame; I was glad in my own praise. With a fiction it was the same. Mine was the whole story. For I took the place of the character who was most like myself, and his story was mine.

(81-2; see also 53, 87, 89)

In *Lilith*, however, Vane in a sense never moves from his house: Mr. Raven tells him, "'you have not yet left your house, neither has your house left you'" (202). In *Lilith* MacDonald portrays a condition in which objects from different dimensions can co-exist in the same place; this is the burden of the epigraph to the book from Thoreau's "Walking." In the realm beyond the mirror Mr. Raven shows Vane a tree which "'stands on the hearth of your kitchen, and grows nearly straight up its chimney,'" and says that some heads of Faerian wild hyacinth are among the strings of the piano that Vane's housekeeper's niece is playing in the breakfast-room of the house, "'and give that peculiar sweetness to her playing'" (203-4). Another tree grows "'in the ruins of the church on your home-farm'" (205). Later Vane is smitten with terror, "'I was lost in a space larger than imagination; for if here two things, or any parts of them, could occupy the same space, why not twenty or ten thousand?'" (215). Distance is telescoped: Vane is told by Mr. Raven that the closet in the library of his house, into which he emerged immediately on leaving the vaults of the dead (as he does on leaving heaven at the end of the story [419]) "'is no nearer our cottage, and no further from it, than any or every other place'" (326). Thus it is that during the narrative Vane several times returns to his house as Anodos did not (197, 217, 315, 405).

Unlike Anodos' wanderings, those of Vane are centripetal, about the cottage of the dead he for much of the narrative resists, and he traverses the same landscape continually, visiting the Little Ones twice, Bulika twice and the Bad Burrow of hideous monsters four times. Where Anodos follows
a linear path, that of Vane is a circular or spiral one. We hear of his ancestor Sir Upward (190, 219-21), and at the end Vane is told of his awakening, "'here all is upwardness and love and gladness'" (408). To reach the mirror-apparatus in his house Vane must ascend a spiral staircase (197). MacDonald found deep and sacramental meaning in spirals, stairs, heights and church-spires. He found "co-substance between the stairs of a cathedral-spire and our own 'secret stair' up to the wider vision"; and declared, "the movements of man's life are in spirals: we go back whence we came, ever returning on our former traces, only upon a higher level, on the next upward coil of the spiral, so that it is a going back and a going forward ever and both at once."

This linear/spiral, centrifugal/centripetal contrast between Phantastes and Lilith partly reflects the fact that while Anodos develops spiritually throughout, Vane does not. For most of Lilith Vane is simply truant, trying to cling to the ledge of what he considers to be his identity, despite being twice invited to lie down with the dead (209-17, 372-32). He is constantly in the spiritual condition described by MacDonald in one of his Unspoken Sermons:

The liberty of the God that would have his creature free, is in contest with the slavery of the creature who would cut his own stem from his root that he might call it his own and love it; who rejoices in his own consciousness, instead of the life of that consciousness; who poises himself on the tottering wall of his own being, instead of the rock on which that being is built. Such a one regards his own dominion over himself—the rule of the greater by the less, inasmuch as the conscious self is less than the self—as a freedom infinitely greater than the range of the universe of God's being.

Hence, in part, the name "Vane." All he has to do is to give way, to stop, whereas Anodos has to move and change. With Phantastes the question is, "What is it properly to be?"; with Lilith it is, "What is being?": the one is concerned with ethics, the other with ontology. Vane and Lilith do not become: they simply find out what they are. Thus Lilith is brought to Mara's house solely to relinquish her fancied picture of herself, and to see herself as she really is (371-8). Such a seeing will involve transformation into what God meant her to be. During the process, Mara tells Vane, "'The central fire of the universe is radiating into her the knowledge of good and evil, the knowledge of what she is. She sees at last the good she is not, the evil she is" (373).
Mr. Raven's first question of Vane is, "'Who are you, pray?'", at which:

I became at once aware that I could give him no notion of who I was. Indeed, who was I? It would be no answer to say I was who~ Then I understood that I did not know myself, did not know what I was, had no grounds on which to determine that I was one thing and not another. As for the name I went by in my own world, I had forgotten it, and did not care to recall it, for it meant nothing, and what it might be was plainly of no consequence here. I had indeed almost forgotten that there it was a custom for everybody to have a name! So I held my peace, and it was my wisdom; for what should I say to a creature such as this raven, who saw through accident into entity?

(195-6; see also 198)

Mr. Raven then declares, "'No one can say he is himself, until first he knows that he is, and then what himself is. In fact, nobody is himself, and himself is nobody'" (196). Later again, the issue of Vane's true self is raised, when he finds that he cannot even remember his own name, and Mara tells him, "'Your real name, indeed, is written on your forehead, but at present it whirls about so irregularly that nobody can read it'" (253). (It may occur to us here that "Vane" is a partial anagram of "Raven.") There is a motif of metamorphosis, or uncertainty of identity, in Lilith which is not to be found so much in Phantastes. Lilith and Mara can change to leopardsesses and back again. Mr. Raven keeps shifting between appearing as a raven and as a librarian (196, 210, 271, 273, 315, 329). In the Evil Wood the trees and leaves keep turning, to Vane's sight, into the shapes of beasts or men or dancing cadavers and back again (232-4, 262-6).

Because of the emphasis on finding what one truly is, rather than what one may become, time and place are of less moment in Lilith than in Phantastes. Regarding place, we have seen that the story circles about one centre, Adam's cottage, and that there is stress on the notion of "bi-locality": Mr. Raven tells Vane,

"Home is ever so far away in the palm of your hand, and how to get there it is of no use to tell you. But you will get there; you must get there; you have to get there. Everybody who is not at home, has to go home. You thought you were at home where I found
you: if that had been your home, you could not have left it. Nobody can leave home. And nobody ever was or ever will be at home without having gone there."

(225-6)

And Vane later reflects, "But what mattered where while every­where was the same as nowhere! I had not yet, by doing some­thing in it, made anywhere into a place!" (261). As for time, when Vane apologises for his lateness in lying down with the dead, he is told, '"There is no early or late here!'" (399); and while he is asleep he remarks, "For centuries I dreamed--or what it chilids? or only one long night?--But why ask? for time had nothing to do with me; I was in the land of thought--farther in, higher up than in the seven dimensions, the ten senses: I think I was where I am--in the heart of God" (400-01). There is not even a clear finality to the duration of the universe: the sleepers in the house of the dead rise and go to heaven at different times; the last chap­ter is entitled "The 'Endless Ending."

What idea of development there is in Lilith refers primari­ly to the state of death, not what one does when one is "alive"; and it is a circular rather than a linear concept of growth, whereby one goes forward by going backwards. Vane learns that his mother lying in the house of the dead '"will go on steadily growing younger until she reaches the perfec­tion of her womanhood--a splendour beyond foresight'" (399); and the Little One, Odu, after his wakening from the dead, is told of the still cold princess Lilith, '"Her wake is not ripe yet...: she is busy forgetting. When she has forgotten enough to remember enough, then she will soon be ripe, and wake!'" (411). It is Lilith in her corrupt state who thinks of ripening and development in purely linear terms of forward movement: '"the older we grow, the nearer we are to perfec­tion.... ours is a ceaseless ripening. I am not yet ripe, and have lived thousands of your years!'" (305). But true change in Lilith involves a return, through experience, to childhood. Lilith is told, '"A slave thou art that shall one day be a child!'" (378). The rhetorical correlative of this process of going forward by going back is the use of paradox through­out the book. Thus Mr. Raven informs Vane that '"the more doors you go out of, the farther you get in!'" (194); or, '"No one who will not sleep can ever wake!'" (225); or, '"Nothing but truth can appear; and whatever is must seem!'" (272); or, '"you will be dead, so long as you refuse to die!'" (331); or--this from Vane himself when he has found his true being in death--"'no one can die who does not long to live'" (395).

Lilith involves a losing of the self, a merging with others.
The title of the book speaks of a figure who shares the central position in the novel with Vane, a figure who like Vane refuses to yield her will and go to sleep in Adam's house. In the end Vane lies down together with Lilith and the Little Ones in the company of the vast hosts of the dead, in a universal dormitory: the grave in Lilith is no fine and private place. We constantly see people and creatures in groups--Adam and Eve, the Little Ones, the giants, the dancing dead, the quarrelsome skeletons (266-71), the Bad Burrow full of monsters, the "society" of Bulika. Phantastes, on the other hand, which is much more concerned with progressive growth and separation of the self, usually involves single figures--the women of each of the three cottages, the Ash, the Alder, the Beech, the knight of the rusty armour, the lady in the alabaster, the fairy child, the girl with the globe, the statue in the fairy palace. Even the story of Cosmo and his mirror involves his not meeting his beloved princess until he has his death-wound; and we learn that on the strange planet of which Anodos reads in another story, when two people fall in love, "instead of drawing nearer to each other, they wander away each alone, into solitary places, and die of their desire" (87). Though towards the end of the story Anodos becomes somewhat more social, in helping the brothers against the giants, or acting as squire to the knight, his isolation from the white lady is constantly felt, and at the end of his life in Fairy Land his act of sacrifice in the forest church is uniquely his own, no others seeing the evil till he reveals it.

Anodos' dream clearly springs from his own unconscious, but Vane is often not sure whether he is dreaming or being dreamt by others. In the black hall of Lilith's palace, he realises that "in the black ellipsoid I had been in the brain of the princess!" (313; cf. 303); and when at the end he seems to have been returned once more to his house and severed from his fellow-dead, he says, "I had fled from my dream! The dream was not of my making, any more than was my life: I ought to have seen it to the end!" (406). In Phantastes we are dealing with the individual, in Lilith with the corporate subconscious. Even the individual in Lilith is multiple: Mr. Raven, the bird-man, tells Vane,

"Every one, as you ought to know, has a beast-self and a bird-self, and a stupid fish-self, ay, and a creeping serpent-self too--which it takes a deal of crushing to kill! In truth he has also a tree-self and a crystal-self, and I don't know how many selves more--all to get into harmony." (211)
The motif of metamorphosis, by which apparent identity is not sacrosanct but rather shared with other modes of being, is here again significant: all the figures in *LiLith* are, as it were, parts of one huge imagination. Even unconsciously itself is not certain: increasingly towards the end Vane does not know whether he is waking or dreaming: "Can it be that that last waking also was in the dream? that I am still in the chamber of death, asleep and dreaming, not yet ripe enough to wake?" (419). The root of this multiple identity, this corporate mind, is God: thinking does not come from the one, but from the Many who is also the One. MacDonald said, writing of the human imagination, "a man is rather being thought than thinking, when a new thought arises in his mind"; and Harry in his *David Elginbrod* (1863) says, "'I never dream dreams; the dreams dream me.'"

The landscape of *LiLith* is shared by all minds, and is ultimately God's dream; that of *Phantastes* however is usually felt to be an extension of the mind of the solitary hero Anodos. In *Phantastes* Anodos finds his evil shadow; in *LiLith* we encounter the Great Shadow. In *Phantastes* Anodos tells us that he set out to find his Ideal (182). The lady in the alabaster seems to him "perfectly lovely; more near the face that had been born with me in my soul, than anything I had seen before in nature or art" (44-5). It is this personal image of the desirable that he seeks in this lady, in the Maid of the Alder and in the statue-lady in the fairy palace. In his search he at length learns to go beyond the merely personal and the possessive, but his journey remains one into the interior, to discover some hint of the root of his true being. Unlike Vane, however, he never directly encounters God, who is the ultimate source of his desire or *Sehnsucht*, immanent in but not to be identified with the white lady he for long tries to possess. *LiLith*, on the other hand, is directly concerned with matters of heaven and hell (for example 322-3, 408). Vane, standing "in the burial-ground of the universe" (208), moves outward to an understanding of the nature of all being: the figures in his story constitute the whole human race, and in particular the great personages of Christian history--Adam, Eve, Lilith, the Great Shadow, Mara (probably Mary), Christ; and finally God Himself, met, if not quite face to face, in the journey to heaven of the risen sleepers at the end.

*Phantastes* is geared to mortal, *LiLith* to immortal existence. Perhaps expressing this difference, we find that *Phantastes* is rather more dialectical in character. Anodos has to learn to live the dialectic of desiring without seeking to possess. In Fairy Land he finds good and evil forms of his white lady; his experiences with his evil shadow partly embody
the ancient struggle of darkness with light which the ogress describes before he opens the forbidden cupboard-door (62-3). The book is shot through with such opposites as art and nature (the ladies Anodos brings to life are both originally statues), active and passive, conscious and unconscious, dream and reality, opacity and translucency, age and youth. Many of these are, as we have seen, married in Anodos' death. Yet at the very end Fairy Land and this world remain divided: Anodos accepts that he is no longer in the Faerian realm and wonders, "Could I translate the experience of my travels there, into common life? This was the question. Or must I live it all over again, and learn it all over again, in the other forms that belong to the world of men, whose experience yet runs parallel to that of Fairy Land?" He goes on, "These questions I cannot yet answer. But I fear" (181).

Vane, however, does not know whether he is awake in this world or still sleeping and dreaming in Adam's house (419). This uncertainty in part expresses the greater emphasis on the reconciliation of opposites that we find prefigured throughout Lilith. The book could be called apocalyptic in that it continually looks to a future, to death and resurrection. Lilith is eschatology, and eschatology is not finally dialectical. "'When you are quite dead, you will dream no false dream" (403). Evil will cease: Lilith lies down among the dead in peace, and the Great Shadow will do so also (388). Where Anodos seeks to remove his evil shadow, the Shadow in Lilith is to be redeemed.42 This bringing of things together is expressed in the motif of atonement. Eve tells Lilith of the latter's daughter Lona, "'Death shall be the atonemaker; you shall sleep together'' (386). When Vane wakes on his resurrection-morning,

Nothing cast a shadow; all things interchanged a little light. Every growing thing showed me, by its shape and colour, its indwelling idea—the informing thought, that is, which was its being, and sent it out. My bare feet seemed to love every plant they trod upon. The world and my being, its life and mine, were one. The microcosm and the macrocosm were at length atoned, at length in harmony! I lived in everything; everything entered and lived in me.

(412)

The language of paradox in Lilith, in which opposites are yoked together, is also functional here.

A sentence from MacDonald's Unspoken Sermons serves to describe the circle that is begun in Phantastes and completed
in Lilith: "The final end of the separation is not individu­
ality; that is but a means to it: the final end is oneness--
an impossibility without it."43 Seen in this light Phantastes
and Lilith themselves form a larger dialectic: the one con­
cerning itself with the First Things, and with true birth,
self-realisation and movement into the world; the other treat­
ing the Last Things, and true death and the merging of the
self with the greater consciousness which is its root. Yet
there is, as we have seen, something of an "atonement" between
the two works also, in the marriage of opposites in the death-
state which the one briefly describes and the other continual-
ly praises and prefigures: in this sense they could be seen
as together making one fantasy. Having lived in his imagina-
tion, and hence, for him, in God, through the total pattern
of Christian history, MacDonald felt himself to have moved out
of time towards eternity. Shortly after the publication of
Lilith he entered a long silent vigil that preluded the death
(in 1905) to which he had looked forward all his life.

University of Edinburgh

NOTES

1 See my Modern Fantasy: Five Studies (Cambridge, 1975),
pp. 71-2, 75-9.

2 C.L. Dodgson's Alice books, though dream-like, are in-
formed with dream-logic as MacDonald's fantasies are not.
Dodgson was, it should be said, on terms of close friendship
with the MacDonald family.

3 Phantastes has many similarities with Novalis' Heinrich
von Ofterdingen (1802) and with Hoffmann's tale, the latter of
which MacDonald had been re-reading in 1856 with great admira-
tion (Greville MacDonald, George MacDonald and his Wife
[London, 1924], pp. 259, 297-8).

4 George MacDonald, Orts (London, 1882), pp. 24, 25. For a
fuller and more critical account of MacDonald's thought on the
imagination, see Modern Fantasy, pp. 60-71.

5 George MacDonald and his Wife, p. 548.

6 George MacDonald, Phantastes and Lilith (London, 1962;
hereafter are to this edition.
MacDonald's Phantastes and Lilith

7 For these, see particularly MacDonald, "The Imagination: Its Function and Development," Orts, pp. 1-42; and "The Fantastic Imagination" (1893), repr. in MacDonald, A Dish of Orts; Chiefly Papers on the Imagination, and on Shakspere (London, 1893), pp. 313-22.

8 For full accounts, see George MacDonald and His Wife, and the more critical view in Modern Fantasy, pp. 55-60.

9 On the lack of change in MacDonald's vision and thought, see George MacDonald and His Wife, p. 403; and, more critically, in relation to the ideas in the novels, Robert L. Wolff, The Golden Key: A Study of the Major Fiction of George MacDonald (New Haven, 1961), p. 305.

10 For some account of this in relation to Phantastes, see Modern Fantasy, pp. 75-9.


14 Compare Vane's feeling at the end of Lilith, "It may be that, when most awake, I am only dreaming the more!" (420).
See also Modern Fantasy, pp. 76-7.

See Phantastes, pp. 27, 35, 37, 55, 59, 164.

Some preparations may be made for one, such as "The Chamber of Sir Anodos" that the hero finds in the fairy palace (76), or Anodos' part in the battle with the giants (149-50).

This to some extent reverses my earlier view in Modern Fantasy, pp. 75-8, that the two elements are opposed and express a division in MacDonald's creative purpose.

See also the epigraph (from Jean Paul Richter) to ch. 28 (p. 125), "From dreams of bliss shall men awake / One day, but not to weep: / The dreams remain; they only break / The mirror of the sleep."

In September 1895, shortly before the publication of his The Wonderful Visit (1895), H.G. Wells wrote to MacDonald remarking the coincidence of their independent use of the notion of travel into or from dimensions beyond the three that we know. Both, however, may have been recalling A. Square [pseud. of Edwin A. Abbott], Flatland: A Romance of Many Dimensions (Oxford, 1872; rev. ed., 1884). Wells went on to say, "Your polarization and mirror business struck me as neat in the extreme": it may be that this was a partial source for his The Invisible Man (1897). (Letter quoted in Greville MacDonald, Reminiscences of a Specialist [London, 1932], pp. 323-4.)

On this see also Jung, PA, loc. cit., citing Schopenhauer.

See also Modern Fantasy, p. 79.

This expresses MacDonald's benign determinism—on which see Modern Fantasy, pp. 60-2.

On this see also Jung, ST, Part II, chs. 4-6, respectively entitled "Symbols of the Mother and of Rebirth," "The Battle for Deliverance from the Mother" and "The Dual Mother." Significantly the next chapter and stage is called "The Sacrifice" (pp. 394-440) and can clearly be paralleled in Anodos' final sacrificial death—see esp. pp. 414-5 on the "unconscious compulsion" of the child-state.
25Cf. Jung, *ACU*, pp. 177-9, "The Child as Beginning and End": Jung declares that "the 'child' symbolizes the pre­conscious and the post-conscious essence of man. His pre­conscious essence is the unconscious state of earliest child­hood; his post-conscious essence is an anticipation by analogy of life after death. In this idea the all-embracing nature of psychic wholeness is expressed. Wholeness is never comprised within the compass of the conscious mind--it includes the in­definite and indefinable extent of the unconscious as well" (p. 178).

26This is done by Vane's burying Lilith's now severed evil hand at a certain point in the desert sand of the dried-up watercourse.


26The walls also vanish by moonlight (pp. 160-1).

29See also p. 158, where on approaching the last forest Anodos finds an unarmed youth "who had just cut a branch from a yew growing on the skirts of the wood."

30George MacDonald and His Wife, p. 482; see also pp. 348, 349-51. MacDonald also uses the stair-symbol in his "The Golden Key" (1867), *The Princess and the Goblin* (1872) and *The Princess and Curdie* (1883).

31George MacDonald, *England's Antiphon* (London, 1874), p. 56. See also MacDonald, "*Επετα "Απέτα, Unspoken Sermons* (London, 1869), p. 196, "The whole system of the universe works upon this law--the driving of things upward towards the centre."


33For further account of man's God-given true name or sig­nature, see Unspoken Sermons (1869), pp. 105-7.

34Cosmo reflects, "how many who love never come nearer than to behold each other as in a mirror; seem to know and yet never know the inward life; never enter the other soul; and part at last, with but the vaguest notion of the universe on the bor­ders of which they have been hovering for years!" (p. 99).
This may explain why *Phantastes* lends itself more to a Freudian, and *Lilith* to a Jungian reading: see Wolff, op. cit. and Roderick F. McGillis, "The Fantastic Imagination: The Prose Romances of George MacDonald," University of Reading Ph.D. Thesis (1973), respectively.

Orts, p. 4. See also George MacDonald, *A Book of Strife in the Form of The Diary of an Old Soul* (London, 1882), July 18, "not that thou thinkest of, but thinkest me."


See e.g. pp. 44-5, 71, 73, 78, 127, 129-30, 166.

On Christian *Sehnsucht* in MacDonald's fantasies, see *Modern Fantasy*, pp. 94-8.

It is difficult to understand R.F. McGillis' claim in his "George MacDonald--the *Lilith* Manuscripts," *Scottish Literary Journal*, vol. 4, no.2 (December 1977), p. 56, that "MacDonald clearly intended to avoid... direct references to God" in order to encourage us "not to read *Lilith* as a Christian document, as many readers do."

On relative translucency, see pp. 36, 44, 53, 137.

Incorporation in rather than rejection of the Shadow by the self is seen as the key to psychic wholeness by Jung: see e.g. *ACU*, pp. 20-2.