

2017

Odor and Power in the Americas: Olfactory Consciousness from Columbus to Emancipation

Andrew Kettler
University of South Carolina

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/etd>



Part of the [History Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Kettler, A.(2017). *Odor and Power in the Americas: Olfactory Consciousness from Columbus to Emancipation*. (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/etd/4139>

This Open Access Dissertation is brought to you by Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact digres@mailbox.sc.edu.

Odor and Power in the Americas:
Olfactory Consciousness from Columbus to Emancipation

By

Andrew Kettler

Bachelor of Arts
University of Nebraska-Omaha, 2007

Bachelor of Science
University of Nebraska-Omaha, 2009

Master of Arts
University of Nebraska-Omaha, 2011

Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements

For the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in

History

College of Arts and Sciences

University of South Carolina

2017

Accepted by:

Mark Smith, Major Professor

Matt Childs, Committee Member

Woody Holton, Committee Member

Daniel Littlefield, Committee Member

David Shields, Committee Member

Cheryl L. Addy, Vice Provost and Dean of the Graduate School

Acknowledgements

This dissertation has been reviewed by numerous scholars to whom I owe a debt of gratitude. The dissertation committee, composed of Dr. Mark Smith, Dr. Matt Childs, Dr. Woody Holton, Dr. Daniel Littlefield, and Dr. David Shields at the University of South Carolina have consistently supported this work in both the classroom and outside of seminar. My dissertation advisor, Dr. Smith, has been specifically essential in providing constant critique and support to the theses included with this project. His work on the history of the senses and approach to mentorship have been a driving force in my intellectual and academic maturation. The nuanced materialism applied in Dr. Smith's work on both sensory history and the Old South harkens back to the days of Eugene Genovese, when history mattered as subversive praxis. Dr. Childs has provided a continually optimistic energy within the Atlantic History Reading Group, and has consistently offered essential historiographical critiques and the finest academic psychotherapy that can be found in a Director of Graduate Studies. Dr. Holton arrived later to my project, but has offered constant review during even the most burdensome times of the last political year. Dr. Littlefield is a steady force in the History Department, and during my time at the Institute for African American Research always kept an open door for questions on the goals of an academic life. Dr. Shields provided the primary opinion behind my first publication, another sensory work outside the confines of this dissertation, and has continued to offer important assistance for my projects whenever requested.

Abstract

This dissertation analyzes discourses concerning odor within the Atlantic World from approximately 1492 until 1838. Numerous historians and philosophers have described how the Reformation's emphasis on texts and an increased concentration on visual science during the Enlightenment influenced Western Europeans to heighten the importance of the eye to the detriment of the lower sense of smell. This dissertation begins by thinking about materialist contours of this olfactory decline through a linguistic analysis of sulfur within seventeenth century England. It then proceeds to examine how in the early Americas such a repudiation of the sense of smell did not occur. The nearness to indigenous sensory aesthetics, and the subaltern's use of odor within religious rituals, kept specific European colonists, Africans, and Native Americans vitally in tune with their noses. This retention of olfactory sensibilities is exemplified through the conversion methods of Jesuit Fathers in New France and the scientific observations of Anglo-American botanists in North America. To control this continued use of odor in the Americas, European writers rhetorically linked the lower classes, women, and other races to powerful scents. The construction of blackness specifically included the use of odor to stain African bodies as pungent compared to rhetoric that asserted whiteness as unpolluted. In the Old World, olfactory decline was an essential aspect of nation building and ethnic border control processes during the Early Modern Era, while in the Atlantic World the exchange of new bodies and novel commodities made the transgressive threat of odor irrepressible.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	ii
Abstract	iii
Introduction: <i>Pecunia non Olet</i> : the Bard, the Divide, and the Aromatic	1
Chapter 1: The Devil’s Element: Cultural Constructions of Metaphorical Brimstone and Sulfuric Instrumentality in Early Modern England	47
Chapter 2: “What a Steam...Left Behind”: Mocking the Church’s Sulfur	80
Chapter 3: “Ravishing Odors of Paradise”: Jesuits, Olfaction, and Seventeenth Century North America	109
Chapter 4: “Delightful a Fragrance”: Native American Olfactory Aesthetics within the Eighteenth Century Anglo-American Botanical Community.....	156
Chapter 5: <i>Verschiebung Africanus</i> : Ethnographic Wonder, Freudian Dream-Work, and Atlantic Era Olfactory Discourse	217
Chapter 6: “The Sweet Smell of Vengeance”: Diasporic Medicine and Olfactory Resistance	289
Conclusion: Scientific Racism, Olfactory Positivism, and the Dialogue of Modernity ..	338
Note on Methodology: Sensory Worlds and Archival Activism	356
Bibliography	393

Introduction

Pecunia non Olet:

The Bard, the Divide, and the Aromatic

William Shakespeare was a wedded man, but occasionally the traveling playwright found respite in unwedded arms.¹ His travels took him across his merry isle as a new form of English character, a popular celebrity who gained notoriety increasingly throughout his lifetime.² Sonnet 130 portrays one of the many loves of this wayward playwright; a love for a historically nebulous woman who provided the narcissistic genius a reprieve, most likely in a brothel, possibly in his wandering heart. The piece, which Shakespeare devoted to the “Dark Lady,” a central character in many of Sonnets numbered 127 to 152, describes

¹ This dissertation was supported by numerous grants and fellowships. My final year of writing was funded by the Bilinski Educational Foundation. I researched in London using funds provided by the Institute for African American Research and a Wilfred and Rebecca Calcott Award from the University of South Carolina. My research at the Barbados Department of Archives and the Barbados Museum and Historical Society was financed by the Ceny Walker Institute at the University of South Carolina. Research at the Jamaican Archives Unit was funded by an Atkinson/Wyatt Dissertation Fellowship from the University of South Carolina. Research in South Carolina was partly supported through a Walter Edgar History Scholarship from the Columbia Committee of the National Society of the Colonial Dames of America in the State of South Carolina. Most of the works discovered in these archives have been published in different forms. For those that exist only in manuscript form, I am using the signifier BDA for Barbados Department of Archives. Original manuscripts applied from the National Archives in Kew, Richmond, Surrey, United Kingdom are noted by their office designation. Numerous readers have assisted my committee’s burdensome task of review, by previously offering critique of my work in different forums. Outside of my committee, portions of Part I of the dissertation have been reviewed by Dr. Lauren Sklaroff and Dr. Kathryn Edwards, aspects of Part II have been critiqued by Dr. John Grigg, Dr. Tracy Leavelle, Dr. David Peterson, Dr. Mark Scherer, Dr. Bevan Sewell, Dr. Paul Musselwhite, Dr. Daniela Hacke, Dr. Peter Wood, and Dr. Mark McDonnell. The analysis in Part III has been read in different forms by Dr. Craig Koslofsky, Dr. Marlene Eberhart, Dr. Lynn Sally, Dr. Nicole Maskiell, and Dr. Pat Sullivan. I would also like to thank the readers within the Atlantic History Reading Group who diligently read each piece of this dissertation over the last few years. Among these budding scholars include: Dr. Evan Kutzler, Dr. Tyler Parry, Dr. Chaz Yingling, and Dr. Neal Polhemus. Numerous other scholars have assisted in the production of this dissertation through offering reviews, conversations, and critique. I would specifically like to thank: Dr. Randy Owens, Dr. Tim Minella, Dr. Michael Woods, Gary Sellick, Erin Holmes, Patrick O’ Brien, Robert Greene, Stephen O’ Hara, Katherine Crosby, Don Polite, Will Mundhenke, Cane West, Caleb Wittum, Carter Bruns, Brian Dolphin, Brian Robinson, Nathalia Cocenza, Mitch Oxford, Lewis Eliot, Gabbi Angeloni, Maurice Robinson, Jill Found, and Bingo Gunter. Aspects of this dissertation have been presented at: The University of South Carolina History Center, the Northeastern Conference on British Studies, the Midwest Popular Culture Association, Under Western Skies IV, the Southern Association for the History of Science and Medicine, the College English Association, the British Association for American Studies, the American Comparative Literature Association, the Popular Culture Association/American Studies Association, the Southern Historical Association, the Consortium on the Revolutionary Era, the Missouri Valley History Conference, the Knowing Nature Conference at the Folger Shakespeare Library, and the Senses and the Sacred Conference at the University of York.

² For this reading of Shakespeare as a celebrity and wandering man of his time see, Stephen Greenblatt, *Will in the World: How Shakespeare Became Shakespeare* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2004), esp. 233-249.

this affection, while offering substantial indications to the central argument of this dissertation: that olfactory racism began in the body, from the popular mind and the popular stage, and was experienced well before Enlightenment codes of racial knowing were defined in scientific works of the eighteenth century.³

Shakespeare's "Dark Lady" had: "eyes...nothing like the sun;/ Coral is far more red than her lips' red;/ If snow be white, why then her breasts are dun;/ If hairs be wires/ black wires grow on her head./ I have seen roses damask'd, red and white,/ But no such roses see I in her cheeks;/ And in some perfumes is there more delight/ Than in the breath that from my mistress reeks."⁴ That last line, that reeking breath emerging from heaving lungs beneath breasts that were "dun," or brown, was part of an Elizabethan conceit that African bodies and cultures smelled.⁵ The idea that Africa and her peoples were pungent led later European populations to believe in the desirability of increased purification, and found in the African other diverse forms of spiritual, biological, and material pollution.⁶

³ This directional analysis is akin to the sensory thesis of Emily Thompson who argues: "against the idea of modernity as a cultural zeitgeist, a matrix of disembodied ideas perceived and translated by great artists into material forms that then trickle down to a more popular level of consciousness." Rather, "modernity was built from the ground up." Emily Ann Thompson, *The Soundscape of Modernity: Architectural Acoustics and the Culture of Listening in America, 1900-1933* (Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 2002), quote on 11. For a sensory understanding of Shakespeare's Sonnets see, Ian Maclachlan, "Long Distance Love: On Remote Sensing in Shakespeare's Sonnet 109," in *Sensual Reading: New Approaches to Reading in Its Relations to the Senses*, ed. Michael Syrotinski (Lewistown: Bucknell University Press, 2001), 57-68.

⁴ Dymphna Callaghan, *Shakespeare's Sonnets* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Pub., 2007), quote on 54-55. For the definitive works on racial othering through the sense of smell see, Constance Classen, "The Odor of the Other: Olfactory Symbolism and Cultural Categories," *Ethos* 20, 2 (1992): 133-166, Mark Smith, *How Race Is Made: Slavery, Segregation, and the Senses* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006), and earlier work on race and myth within, Roy Bedichek, *The Sense of Smell* (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1960), esp. 147-174.

⁵ For an early reading of the "dark lady" in the sonnets through a contextualization of "darkness" in Shakespeare's other work as not necessarily racialized, see Leighton Brewer, *Shakespeare and the Dark Lady* (Boston: Christopher Pub. House, 1966), esp. 21-29.

⁶ For debates on the "Dark Lady" as an African see, Kim Hall, *Things of Darkness: Economies of Race and Gender in Early Modern England* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1995), 66-73, the reading of "foul" and "fair" within, Gwyn Williams, *Person and Persona: Studies in Shakespeare* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1981), 115-130, and Robert Fleissner, *Shakespeare and Africa: The Dark Lady of His Sonnets*

At its broadest, this dissertation adds to a growing field of study that focuses on the importance of discourse in the construction of embodied historical experience.⁷ This field argues that both the body and the five senses are culturally constructed.⁸ The other, in this understanding, is commonly assembled within an ontological space rather than experienced as an objective reality.⁹ Sensory experiences of the body often work to create and maintain oppressive language that alters the biological function of the senses whereby the odors, tastes, and sounds of the other are perceived not only through the linguistic episteme through which they take meaning, but also in traces imprinted upon the body before language articulated those perceptions into words.¹⁰ Out of these historiographical fields of body knowledge and discursive analysis emerged the history of the senses, which

Revamped and Other Africa-Related Associations (Philadelphia: XLibris, 2005), 27-37.

⁷ For ideas about discourse in early modern England see the reading of rhetorical “texts as battlefields” and the employment of digressions within the writings of early modern writers within, Anne Cotterill, *Digressive Voices in Early Modern English Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), esp. 126-164.

⁸ For the cultural construction of the senses as embodied experience see, David Abram, *The Spell of the Sensuous: Perception and Language in a More-Than-Human World* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1996), and Mark Johnson, *The Meaning of the Body: Aesthetics of Human Understanding* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007). According to the textbook definition: “perception refers to the way in which we interpret the information that is gathered (and processed) by the senses...you sense the stimulus but you perceive what it is.” Therefore, “perception includes...cognitive processing by which you develop an internal model of what is ‘out there’ in the world beyond your body...it is based on sensations, and can be no more accurate than the information provided by your sensory systems.” Michael Levine, *Levine & Shefner's Fundamentals of Sensation and Perception* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), quote on 1-2. Sensations are not entirely innate, they are cultural edifices. Children learn the way to distinguish the world through an “education of the senses.” James Gibson, *The Senses Considered as Perpetual Systems* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin. 1966), 1-74 and 266-286, quotes from 50-52.

⁹ For racism as implicit understanding, Gramscian common sense, and “somatic knowing” see, Alexis Shotwell, *Knowing Otherwise: Race, Gender, and Implicit Understanding* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2011), esp. 14-15, 34-36, and the importance of the Enlightenment to ideas of common sense and standardization of thought in, James Boon, “Circumscribing Circumcision/Uncircumcision: An Essay Amid the History of Difficult Description,” in *Implicit Understandings: Observing, Reporting, and Reflecting on the Encounters Between Europeans and Other Peoples in the Early Modern Era*, ed. Stuart Schwartz (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 556-585.

¹⁰ For pre-linguistic “traces” for studying embodied experience and cultural history see, Jacques Derrida, *Of Grammatology* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1998 [1976]), esp. 46-92.

asserts as a primary marker of the field's historiography that the ontological breaches caused by the discovery of the New World, the invention of the printing press, changes in religious practice during the Reformation, and the taxonomic desires of the Enlightenment produced an increased separation and re-ordering of the senses during the Early Modern Era.¹¹

This dissertation accesses this discourse that continues to discover significant differences between pre-modern and modern consciousness through asserting that odor was decreasingly perceived within European metropolises diachronically from the age of Johannes Gutenberg until the twentieth century. This project generally offers that European noses entered modernity through delimiting olfactory perceptions as part of the positive project of secularization.¹² Specifically, the lower sense of smelling is understood to have

¹¹ Constance Classen, David Howes, and Anthony Synnott, *Aroma: The Cultural History of Smell* (London: Routledge, 1994), Marshall McLuhan, *The Gutenberg Galaxy; The Making of Typographic Man* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1962), and Dominique Laporte, *History of Shit* (Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press, 2000). For earlier work on the sense of smell that relies more on narrative than on the historiographical concerns of this project see the reading of aroma and sexuality within, Gabrielle Dorland, *Scents Appeal: The Silent Persuasion of Aromatic Encounters* (Mendham: Wayne Dorland Company, 1993), esp. 45-62, work on flowers and perfume within, Roy Genders, *Scented Flora of the World* (London: Hale, 1994), the general reading of smell within sexuality, perfume, and disease in, Ruth Winter, *The Smell Book: Scents, Sex, and Society* (Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1976), esp. 87-104, the broad analysis of smelling in modern social encounters within, Avery Gilbert, *What the Nose Knows: The Science of Scent in Everyday Life* (New York: Crown Publishers, 2008), and the early definitive work on the history of perfume within, C. J. S. Thompson, *The Mystery and Lure of Perfume* (Philadelphia: J.B. Lippincott, 1927). The eyes, in the Renaissance understanding found in Du Bartas' *La Sepmaine* (1608), were the guides to the body, where the ears were the door-keepers of the mind. In the play *Lingua* (1607), generally believed to be written by Thomas Tomkis, the senses were considered as warriors battling one another for the supremacy of the sensorium. Olfactus, the warrior of smell, entered the court of battle dressed in an adornment of fragrant flowers. Two young men entered carrying bottles of oils and censers, and another carrying ointments. Using the imagery and iconography of the era, the author created a play that visualized the senses through the written word, the play performed, and the woodcuts accompanying. Even in representation, Olfactus lost to the power of sight. Louise Vinge, *The Five Senses* (Lund: Gleerup, 1975), 71-103. For the specific medieval/modern break in links between language and sensation, see, Gregor Vogt-Spira, "Senses, Imagination, and Literature," in *Rethinking the Medieval Senses*, ed. Stephen Nichols, Andreas Kablitz, and Alison Calhoun (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2008), esp. 51-52 and 66-67.

¹² For specific debates on whether scenting declined within Europe see, Mark Smith, "Transcending, Othering, Detecting: Smell, Premodernity, Modernity," *Postmedieval* 3, 4 (2012): 380-390, Mark Jenner, "Follow Your Nose? Smell, Smelling, and their Histories," *The American Historical Review* 116, 2 (2011): 335-351, Holly Dugan, *The Ephemeral History of Perfume: Scent and Sense in Early Modern England*

decreased due the increasing reliance on the sense of sight during the Early Modern Era.¹³ Earlier Western consciousness, from the end of the Roman Empire until the Reformation, allowed for a larger proportion of sensory experience that accepted the lower senses and cultural synesthesia in the function of the Western sensorium.¹⁴ Previous Arcadian sensory worlds offered the sense of sight as the preeminent sense for the early Greco-Roman civilizing process. The medieval Church offered a wider sensorium than either the Arcadian sensory worlds defined by Aristotle and modern Western sensory consciousness.¹⁵

The senses, in the medieval model of synesthesia, which borrows a term for a disease of cross-talk between the senses, worked as a singular collective that exchanged and transferred modes of perception.¹⁶ This cross-talk is best exemplified through the

(Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins, 2011), esp. 31-41, and Jonathan Reinartz, *Past Scents: Historical Perspectives on Smell* (Champagne: Illinois, 2014), esp. 42-47.

¹³ Classen, *Aroma*, 57-73, Annick Le Gu  rer, *Scent, the Mysterious and Essential Powers of Smell* (New York: Turtle Bay Books, 1992), and Gabrielle Glaser, *The Nose: A Profile of Sex, Beauty, and Survival* (New York: Atria Books, 2002). For more on the “great divide” of the senses, which argued that the eye moved much higher above the lower senses diachronically during the Early Modern Era see, Lucien Febvre, *The Problem of Unbelief in the Sixteenth Century, the Religion of Rabelais* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1982), Constance Classen, *Worlds of Sense: Exploring the Senses in History and Across Cultures* (London: Routledge, 1993), Norbert Elias, *The Civilizing Process* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2000 [1939]), and Walter Ong, *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word* (London: Methuen, 1982), esp. 110-116.

¹⁴ For synesthesia, the functioning of the five senses relatively equally within a sensorium, or the analytical derivation of the idea of the psychological disease as a cultural and linguistic identity, a common occurrence in non-Western cultures and in pre-modern Europe, see the analysis of inter-sensorial experience and language within, David Howes and Constance Classen, *Ways of Sensing: Understanding the Senses in Society* (New York: Routledge, 2014).

¹⁵ For Aristotle and the sense of sight see, Thomas Kjeller Johansen, *Aristotle on the Sense-Organs* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2007), esp. 32-39 and Mark Smith, *Sensing the Past: Seeing, Hearing, Smelling, Tasting, and Touching in History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007). esp. 27-29.

¹⁶ Synesthesia, rather than exceptional, can be considered the primary form of sensing due to the evolutionary links between the senses deep within the brain. For synesthesia as the primary form of human sensation, rather than separated Cartesian senses as ordered during the Enlightenment, see the phenomenological analysis within, Erwin Straus, *The Primary World of Senses; A Vindication of Sensory Experience* (New York: Free Press of Glencoe, 1963), esp. 214-231. For some relevant olfactory examples of the cultural creation of the senses and synesthesia, see the Andean oral cultures described in Constance Classen, “Sweet

Catholic mass, which combined sensations to elicit reverence for the Eucharist.¹⁷ The sounds of choirs mixed with the smell of incense to create an immersive sensory experience whereby sounds, smells, tastes, sights, and tactile experiences combined to create a common sensory wonderment.¹⁸

The communication between the senses exemplified by this Catholic engagement was increasingly mislaid with the divided sensorium of modernity. The division of the senses increasingly separated after the rise of a Cartesian understanding that the mind was separate from the body. That separation began a long progression of continuous compartmentalization of parts of the body and spaces of the mind.¹⁹ Within this

Colors, Fragrant Songs: Sensory Models of the Andes and the Amazon,” *American Ethnologist* 17, 4 (1990): 722-728, and the Wild Boy of Aveyron, and similar children of the wild studied in the nineteenth century described in Constance Classen, “The Sensory Orders of ‘Wild Children’,” in *The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses*, ed. David Howes (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), 47-60.

¹⁷ For synesthetic links between taste and smell through the biological experimentation of the nature of taste, olfaction and flavorizing in both animals and humans see, Donald Pfaff and Carl Pfaffmann, *Taste, Olfaction, and the Central Nervous System: A Festschrift in Honor of Carl Pfaffmann* (New York: Rockefeller University Press, 1985), the way odor creates positive and negative categories for food and other social categories in different cultures within, Sveta Yamin-Pasternak, Andrew Kliskey, Lilian Alessa, Igor Pasternak, and Peter Schweizer, “The Rotten Renaissance in the Bering Strait: Loving, Loathing, and Washing the Smell of Foods with a (Re)Acquired Taste,” *Current Anthropology* 55, 5 (2014): 619-646, that memories of food, of tasting, like memories of odor, can act as inherently transgressive events against the linear timeline and ordered separation of the five senses that arose during the Enlightenment within, David Sutton, *Remembrance of Repasts: An Anthropology of Food and Memory* (Oxford: Berg, 2001), esp. 91-102, and debates on proper diets relating to excessive worldly sensation in the Early Modern Era within, Laura Giannetti, “Of Eels and Pears: A Sixteenth-Century Debate on Taste, Temperance, and the Pleasures of the Senses,” in *Religion and the Senses in Early Modern Europe*, ed. Wietse de Boer and Christine Göttler (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 289-305.

¹⁸ For examples of synesthesia see: the reading of droughts and odors in, Dianne Young, “The Smell of Green-ness: Cultural Synaesthesia in the Western Desert (Australia),” *Etnofoor* 18 1 (2005): 61-77, Shane Butler and Alex Purves, “Introduction: Synesthesia and the Ancient Senses,” in *Synaesthesia and the Ancient Senses*, ed. Shane Butler and Alex Purves (Durham, UK: Acumen, 2013), 1-8, and examples of synesthesia as a central aspect of Renaissance banqueting within, Michel Jeanneret, *A Feast of Words: Banquets and Table Talk in the Renaissance* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991), esp. 263-265.

¹⁹ For more general works on synesthesia see the links between sight and sound within, Charles Segal, “Synaesthesia in Sophocles,” *Illinois Classical Studies* 2 (1977): 88-96, the reading of specific class signaling words explored within, Benjamin Stevens, “The Scent of Language and Social Synaesthesia at Rome,” *Classical World* 101, 2 (2008): 159-171, and the theoretical analysis of the links between touch and the other senses within, Jean-Luc Nancy, “Rethinking Corpus,” in *Carnal Hermeneutics*, ed. Richard Kearney and

dissertation, the separation of the senses is analogous to the bordering off of the commons. The cultural processes that shifted the complete sensorium functioning across boundaries to a sensorium privatizing and compartmentalizing individual sensations assisted in the grand project of capitalist modernity that created a troublesome logic of dividing and conquering peoples, places, and thoughts.²⁰

This dissertation adds to the paradigm of secularization through offering that the senses were further divided and classified during the Early Modern Era by demonstrating how Europeans used the power of the printed word to shift odor from their own bodies to that of the African other in order to support ideas of European Christian purity.²¹ In his analysis of sensory history, Donald Lowe focused on the rise of bourgeoisie sensory regimes within Victorian England as a “displacement” or “superimposition of one culture of communications media over another.” For Lowe, the rise of bourgeoisie culture of

Brian Treanor (New York: Fordham University Press, 2015), 77-91.

²⁰ I offer that this separation is part of a form of archival repression that continues to suppress the subaltern, fragment the body and mind for ease of neoliberal capitalist ascension, and mollify revolutionary sentiments. For more, see the “Note on Methodology” that follows this dissertation’s “Conclusion.” For odor and the making of spatial distance through attempting to manipulate “civil inattention” through “olfactory class consciousness” see, Kelvin Low, “Presenting The Self, The Social Body, and The Olfactory: Managing Smells in Everyday Life Experiences,” *Sociological Perspectives* 49, 4 (2006): 607-631, the idea of the self-fashioning the olfactory self through nostalgia about good and bad odors within, D. D. Waskul, Phillip Vannini, and Janelle Wilson, “The Aroma of Recollection: Olfaction, Nostalgia, and the Shaping of the Sensuous Self,” *The Senses and Society* 4, 1 (2009): 5-22, the ways that odor can assist community creation through the taste of wine and the smell of perfume as upsetting categories of political development created by Immanuel Kant within, Isabelle Rieusset-Lemarié, “What Taste and Smell Add to the Political Interpretation of the Kantian Aesthetic Judgement by Arendt and Deleuze,” *Proceedings of the European Society for Aesthetics* 4 (2012): 412-432, and the moral self-fashioning of smells within, Anthony Synnott, “A Sociology of Smell,” *Canadian Review of Sociology* 28, 4 (2008): 437-459.

²¹ For the role of cleansing and deodorizing of England in the nationalizing process see, Keith Thomas, “Cleanliness and Godliness in Early Modern England,” in *Religion, Culture, and Society in Early Modern Britain: Essays in Honour of Patrick Collinson*, ed. Patrick Collinson, Anthony Fletcher, and Peter Roberts (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 56-83, and the nuanced critique of Thomas’ arguments within, Mark Jenner, “Civilization and Deodorization? Smell in Early Modern English Culture,” in *Civil Histories: Essays Presented to Sir Keith Thomas*, ed. Peter Burke, Brian Howard Harrison, Paul Slack, and Keith Thomas (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 127-144.

limiting sexuality in the public sphere contributed to the decline of odor through lessening the power of aromas related to female sexuality.²² This dissertation describes an earlier foundational displacement that occurred in the deep recesses of the European body during the Early Modern Era.²³

To critic Jonathan Sawday, for many Europeans during sixteenth century:

The new philosophy of human reason, operating within a universe which was to be understood as corporeal in nature, and infinitely vast, alerted the enquiring minds of natural scientists to new prospects of doubt, disturbing chimeras of the imagination. At heart, lay the problem of sensory experience itself. If the universe, and all that was contained in it, was indeed to be understood as corporeal, then how trustworthy was the mind – the reasoning faculty – which measured its dimensions?²⁴

²² Donald Lowe, *History of Bourgeois Perception* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982), 5-9, 101-103 quotes on 7. For an earlier study of a similar shift from oral and qualitative descriptions to spatial and quantitative descriptions see, Walter Ong, *Ramus, Method, and the Decay of Dialogue; From the Art of Discourse to the Art of Reason* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1958).

²³ For more of the general understanding of the “great divide” of the senses, see Valerie Allen, *On Farting: Language and Laughter in the Middle Ages* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007) and Robert Mandrou, *Introduction to Modern France, 1500-1640: An Essay in Historical Psychology* (New York: Holmes & Meier, 1976), esp. 50-57. Like the senses, the parts of the body were increasingly separated into compartmentalized pieces during the Early Modern Era. The whole of the human form was partitioned to be analyzed and controlled through diverse means. For the breakdown of the holistic body see, David Hillman and Carla Mazzio, “Introduction: Individual Parts,” in *The Body in Parts: Fantasies of Corporeality in Early Modern Europe*, ed. David Hillman and Carla Mazzio (New York: Routledge, 1997), xi-xxix, and the importance of the broken apart body within the culture of dissection within, Jonathan Sawday, *The Body Emblazoned: Dissection and the Human Body in Renaissance Culture* (London: Routledge, 1995), 1-11.

²⁴ Sawday, *Body Emblazoned*, quote on 92. Comparatively, the ancient Greeks lived hedonistic, synesthetic, and sensuous lives. But, they understood that the senses could be tricked by the mind. Such fallibility of the senses created a mistrust that grew throughout later historical epochs. By partly dividing the senses from the mind, the Greeks laid the track for the later railroads of Christianity and modernity against the innate nature of the senses. The later Protestant tradition created a sensory body at war with a reasoned mind. Thus, to Anthony Synnott, “After the Renaissance, concern with the senses became less moralistic, and more practical, more epistemological, and more scientific.” Michel Montaigne and Thomas Hobbes claimed that there was

To cure anxious concerns over how to justify the multifarious and confusing sensations of the New World, Europeans created the later New Science and articulated hierarchies of ethnic superiority that shifted sensory concern and anxiety of encountering the other to a space of symbolic representation; to places within the theatre and literature that contained the sensory excess of the other through manufacturing stereotypes of the other as inferior.²⁵

In accordance with Andrew Rotter's recent analysis of imperial schemes in India and the Philippines that called for multisensory analyses to better uncover the goals, successes, and failures of imperial projects, this dissertation explores the sense of smell within a discourse of empire and resistance.²⁶ This is therefore among the first dissertations to apply the phenomenological approaches of sensory history to the study of racial discourses within the Atlantic World.²⁷

both value and threat in the sensory world. All knowledge to Hobbes, came from the sense organs. To Descartes, in *Meditations* (1641), the senses were seen much more as a threat. As such, man should aim to control the senses through a "systematic doubt" that would cure the fallibility of the senses. As Descartes had rejected the sensory world, John Locke, in his *Essay on Human Understanding* (1690), found the senses of implicit value. He wrote that "nothing can be in the intellect which was not first in the senses." Anthony Synnott, "Puzzling over the Senses: From Plato to Marx," in *The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses*, ed. David Howes (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), esp. 68-71.

²⁵ For the "somatic" work of the body see, Phillip Vannini, Dennis Waskul, and Simon Gottschalk, *The Senses in Self, Society, and Culture: A Sociology of the Senses* (New York: Routledge, 2012), esp. 6-19. On the simplest of terms, sensory theory was debated in the Enlightenment amongst those who followed the ideas of Locke, that the senses were educated upon the mind from the world as a *tabula rasa*, where the sensory experience of the body confirmed the existence of a person, and Descartes who separated the mind and the body, and the confirmation of existence was defined by the ability to think, or come to terms with understanding that one thinks about sensory input to create identity. Classen, *Worlds of Sense*, esp. 4-5; Lisa Shapiro, "How We Experience the World: Passionate Perception in Descartes and Spinoza," in *Emotion and Cognitive Life in Medieval and Early Modern Philosophy*, ed. Martin Pickavé and Lisa Shapiro (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 193-216; Alison Simmons, "Descartes on the Cognitive Structure of Sensory Experience," *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* 67, 3 (Nov., 2003): 549-579.

²⁶ Rotter explores how scholarship on "the senses helps us understand how empire functioned, or did not, and especially how it came to an end." Andrew Rotter, "Empires of the Senses: How Seeing, Hearing, Smelling, Tasting, and Touching Shaped Imperial Encounters," *Diplomatic History* 35, 1 (2011): 3-19, quote on 5.

²⁷ For the general history of the Atlantic World as a milieu created through the vast mobility of bodies and commodities throughout the Early Modern Era, see, Jack Greene and Philip Morgan, *Atlantic History: A Critical Appraisal* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 3-33, concerns over expanding the discourse too broadly within, Alison Games, "Atlantic History: Definitions, Challenges, and Opportunities," *American*

The field of Atlantic history inherently focuses the importance of global interactions upon the structures of economies and the alterations of cultures in Europe, Africa, and the Americas during an era that was defined by the rise of the Atlantic Slave Trade, the centralization of mercantilist Western state apparatuses, and the commodification of science and political theory within the discourses of the later Enlightenment.²⁸ The various economic and social forces of the Atlantic World birthed Western modernity through invasive forms of knowledge, rather than imperial forms of understanding.²⁹ As Charles Taylor has aptly summarized: “The belief that modernity comes from one single universally applicable operation imposes a falsely uniform pattern on the multiple encounters of non-Western cultures with the exigencies of science,

Historical Review 111 (June 2006): 741-757, the focus on economic trust and networks within, Karen Kupperman, *The Atlantic in World History* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), the importance of cultural retention, historical memory, and heritage within, John Thornton, *A Cultural History of the Atlantic World, 1250-1820* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2012), esp. 1-4, the centrality of imperial rivalry on the periphery within, Jeremy Adelman, "Mimesis and Rivalry: European Empires and Global Regimes," *Journal of Global History* 10, 1 (2015): 77-98, the creation of identity out of violence as central to the field within, Brian Sandberg, "Beyond Encounters: Religion, Ethnicity, and Violence in the Early Modern Atlantic World, 1492-1700," *Journal of World History* 17, 1 (2006): 1-25, the role of racism, religious superiority, and national pride as structural aspects of expansion analyzed within, G. V. Scammell, "Essay and Reflection: On the Discovery of the Americas and the Spread of Intolerance, Absolutism, and Racism in Early Modern Europe," *The International History Review* 13, 3 (1991): 502-521, and the centrality of the creative adaptations of these groups to their changing circumstances within, Thomas Benjamin, *The Atlantic World: Europeans, Africans, Indians and Their Shared History, 1400-1900* (Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 2009).

²⁸ For the anti-capitalist tone of Atlantic History see the analysis of “romantic liberalism” that included forms of “melancholy witnessing” and “disinterested propriety” that allowed for the commodification of slave bodies, even within a society that felt itself to be moral, within, Ian Baucom, *Specters of the Atlantic: Finance Capital, Slavery, and the Philosophy of History* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2005), esp. 138-139, 167, 288-290.

²⁹ For how poetry, through a “theology of trade,” can support mercantilist goals of the market see, David Shields, *Oracles of Empire: Poetry, Politics, and Commerce in British America, 1690-1750* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990), esp. 13-92. And, for a similar analysis of how literature justifies imperial goals see, Daniel O’ Quinn, *Entertaining Crisis in the Atlantic Imperium, 1770-1790* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2011), esp. 3-4, and the construction of the foreign through literary classifications of how outsider’s function in foreign cultures within Shakespeare’s canon as analyzed in, Carole Levin and John Watkins, *Shakespeare’s Foreign Worlds: National and Transnational Identities in the Elizabethan Age* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2009), esp. 9-13, and Leslie Fiedler, *The Stranger in Shakespeare* (New York: Stein and Day, 1972), esp. 139-198.

technology, and industrialization.”³⁰ Atlantic history exposes these flaws in the universalizing narratives of imperial history and earlier forms of the history of the sciences, by showing how modernity was a contested process that involved cultural, social, and scientific inputs from more than a dominant Western European intellectual dialogue.³¹

During the Atlantic Era, myriad populations of Africans, Native Americans, and Europeans met in colonized Atlantic environments wherein identity construction, racial othering, and adaptation marked bodies and minds with different, assertive, and creolized sensory perceptions.³² Within this Atlantic cultural milieu, the odor of the other became a vital aspect in the construction of Western identities as pure and Protestant, phallic on the world’s proscenium, cleansed for entrance into the eschaton of modernity. As Denise Albanese has argued, New World ethnography converted “alien beings into evidence” while: “at the same moment...the contemporary European male body is exempted from scrutiny and removed...to the site from which the possibility of assessment is

³⁰ Charles Taylor, “Inwardness and the Culture of Modernity,” in *Philosophical Interventions in the Unfinished Project of Enlightenment*, ed. Axel Honneth, Thomas McCarthy, Claus Offe, and Albrecht Wllmer (Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press, 1992), 88-112, quote on 93. For cultural changes for the popular masses that accelerated through the printing press see, Lucien Paul Victor Febvre and Henri-Jean Martin, *The Coming of the Book: The Impact of Printing 1450-1800* (London: N.L.B., 1976 [1958]), Elizabeth Eisenstein, *The Printing Press As an Agent of Change: Communications and Cultural Transformations in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979), and Roger Chartier, *The Cultural Uses of Print in Early Modern France* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1987), esp. 71-109, 235-239.

³¹ This dissertation understands that multiple forms of Enlightenment existed in different geographical regions during the Early Modern Era. Many were radical and productive, others were inherently regressive and controlling of women and racial others. The “Enlightenment” writ large in this dissertation does not include the specific “radical Enlightenment” in the works of Margaret Jacob and Jonathan Israel as the peak of Enlightenment thought that had the least to do with the bastardization of the rhetoric of freedom that asserted the racial other as unable to access freedom. Jonathan Israel, *Radical Enlightenment: Philosophy and the Making of Modernity, 1650-1750* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), esp. 71-81; Margaret Jacob, *The Radical Enlightenment: Pantheists, Freemasons, and Republicans* (Lafayette, LA: Cornerstone Book, 2006).

³² For the idea of the sensescape, and the possibilities of confusing and schizophrenic aspects of the sensorium emergent at times of cultural contact, see, R. Murray Schafer, *The Tuning of the World* (New York: A.A. Knopf, 1977), esp. 90-91.

contemplated.”³³

The constructed other, in opposition to the Caucasian same or the progressive and positivist self, set the path of modernity through their place within discourses about Western discovery. The swerve of modernity was an assertion of a new sensory regime that defined the past as different from what European modernity aimed to become.³⁴ The Western modernization process asserted its own history as praxis, through types of ethnographical and religious history that each state used to define their power to rule through a legitimacy narrative that increasingly linked faith, race, and nation.³⁵ This merging of narratives centralized the state’s hegemonic abilities through both language and bio-power, or the ability to manipulate the masses through subconscious alteration of the physical form and the five senses.³⁶

I offer my analysis as a critique of Western modernity, which involved a strategic displacement of specific perceptions that were forms of what the ancient Greeks termed *pharmakon*, or the productive and transgressive power of alternative bodily reactions to drugs, peoples, and sensations as possibly resistant to dominant society. These threats, or alternative discourses that can expand to counter constructs of power, are consequently

³³ Albanese, *New Science, New World*, esp. 37-91, quote on 39.

³⁴ Michel Foucault, *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1971); Michel de Certeau, *The Writing of History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988), esp. 209-243; Denise Albanese, *New Science, New World* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1996). For the construction of racism as an aspect of Western state growth see, David Theo Goldberg, *The Racial State* (Malden, Mass.: Blackwell Publishers, 2002), esp. 14-35.

³⁵ De Certeau, *Writing of History*, esp. 6-11.

³⁶ Giorgio Agamben, *Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1998). For a critique of this understanding of bio-power see, Alexander Weheliye, *Habeas Viscus: Racializing Assemblages, Biopolitics, and Black Feminist Theories of the Human* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2014).

scapegoated as outside the governing culture by elites who find in *pharmakon* threats to the *status quo*.³⁷

Throughout the Atlantic World, the odors of bodies, places, and things became scapegoats through a Western European effort to remove the transgressive threat of smell from the prodigious project of capitalist innovation. This project defines capitalism through both the root capitalism of Marxist critique that criticized primitive accumulation, the bordering of the commons, and the manipulation of labor, and through the modern neoliberal capitalism that is critiqued through understandings of linguistic hegemony. The dissertation places capitalism as the causal force in the desire of the European upper class to carve out the panopticon as a place for social domination. It therefore offers a multi-temporal understanding of what capitalism was in specific historical moments, while always offering a constant and activist understanding of what she would become as a determined and positivist force.³⁸

Olfactory Dialectics; the Spectre of Ephemeral Scents

Since historian Lucien Febvre first called for a history of sensibilities in 1941, scholars have integrated the senses into workaday historical parlance. Early sensory history, following Febvre, concentrated on the importance of sight above the lower senses.

³⁷ For introduction to the idea of *pharmakon* see, Michael Ziser, "Sovereign Remedies: Natural Authority and the 'Counterblaste to Tobacco'," *WMQ* 62, 4 (2005): 719-744, Jacques Derrida, *Dissemination* (Chicago: University Press, 1981), esp. 184-185, and Michael Rinella, *Pharmakon: Plato, Drug Culture, and Identity in Ancient Athens* (Lanham, Md: Lexington Books, 2010), esp. 222-225.

³⁸ For early patterns of state hegemony to control the possibilities of social protest see, Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie, *Carnival in Romans* (New York: G. Braziller, 1979), esp. 325-338.

The perceived inferior senses of tasting and smelling were accordingly considered unworthy of the attention.³⁹ With the rise in anthropological integration into historical study during the latter part of the twentieth century, the non-visual senses became valued enough to elicit monographs on individual sensory themes.⁴⁰ Specific to the sense of smell, an increase in academic popularity arrived during the 1980s.⁴¹ Important in the reintroduction of the olfactory into academic and popular deliberation during that decade was historian Alain Corbin's work on the French denial of the odor of Paris in the late

³⁹ Robert Jütte, *A History of the Senses: From Antiquity to Cyberspace* (Cambridge, UK: Polity, 2005), 8-12. With his study of the senses in European history, Febvre aimed to challenge positivist notions of the advancement of Western society by unifying a history that instead of praising the Western record as progress, would study "a slow repression of emotional activity and greater rationality of behavior." Alain Corbin, *Time, Desire, and Horror: Towards a History of the Senses* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1995), quote on 181. As Jim Drobnick stated in regards to visual dominance of sensory history, "Unlike the voluminous discourse on the senses of vision and hearing, texts focusing on the sense of smell appeared relatively intermittently prior to the 1980s." Jim Drobnick, "Introduction: Olfactocentrism," in *The Smell Culture Reader*, ed. Jim Drobnick (Oxford: Berg, 2006), 3-4, quote on 3. To Constance Classen, the "reluctance of late-twentieth-century anthropologists to examine and recognize the cultural importance of smell, taste, and touch is due not only to the relative marginalization of these senses in the modern West, but also to the racist tendencies of an earlier anthropology to associate the 'lower' senses with the 'lower' races." Constance Classen, "Foundation for an Anthropology of the Senses," *International Social Science Journal* 153 (September, 1997): 401-412, quote on 404-405.

⁴⁰ For more examples of the growth of sensory analysis, see the works of: George Roeder, "Coming to Our Senses," *Journal of American History* 81 (Dec., 1994): 1113-1122, Charles Ross, *Civil War Acoustic Shadows* (Shippensburg, Pa: White Mane Books, 2001), Peter Payer, "The Age of Noise," *Journal of Urban History* 33, 5 (2007): 773-793, Karin Bijsterveld, "The Diabolical Symphony of the Mechanical Age: Technology and Symbolism of Sound in European and North American Noise Abatement Campaigns, 1900 – 40," *Social Studies of Science* 31 (2001): 37-70, Sarah Keyes, "'Like a Roaring Lion': The Overland Trail as a Sonic Conquest," *Journal of American History* 96, 1 (June, 2009): 19-43, Glenda Goodman, "'But They Differ from Us in Sound': Indian Psalmody and the Soundscape of Colonialism, 1651-75," *WMQ* 69, 4 (2012): 793-822, James Cook, "Seeing the Visual in U.S. History" *Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 432-441, Richard Cullen Rath, *How Early America Sounded* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 2003), Conevery Bolton Valencius, *The Health of the Country: How American Settlers Understood Themselves and Their Land* (New York: Basic Books, 2003), esp. 109-132, and Adam Mack, *Sensing Chicago: Noisemakers, Strikebreakers, and Muckrakers* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2015), esp. 11-18.

⁴¹ For more on the long term prejudices against the study of smells see, Synnott, "Sociology of Smell," 437-459. For specific analysis of the importance of olfaction in debates on modern artwork see the reading of lost smelling in the works of Paul Gauguin within, Jim Drobnick, "Towards an Olfactory Art History: The Mingled, Fatal, and Rejuvenating Perfumes of Paul Gauguin," *Senses & Society* 7 (2012): 196-208, the reading of Freudian theories of sex and scent in the artwork of the 1990s within, Jim Drobnick, "Toposmia: Art, Scent, and Interrogations of Spatiality," *Angelaki* 7, 1 (2002): 31-47, and work on odor and identity by the artist Clara Ursitti explored within, Jim Drobnick, "Clara Ursitti: Scents of a Woman," *Tessera* 32 (Summer 2002): 85-97.

eighteenth century, *The Foul and the Fragrant* (1982), and Patrick Süskind's widely read novel, *Perfume: the Story of a Murderer* (1986).⁴²

Corbin argued, in the vein of earlier scholars from different fields, that odor declined with modernity. Corbin's analysis focused upon the stench beneath Paris as a motivator towards a revolutionary ethos, which after the French Revolution caused an increase in individuality and personal controls over the body that helped to create the private self against the class consciousness of the early nineteenth century.⁴³ To Corbin, olfactory declension grew out of the criticism of bad odors that came from a new bourgeois space reserved for the purity of the cleansed. In summation, Corbin argued: "A fundamental aspect of this revolution in olfactory tolerance was the linkage forged between the criticism of 'odors' and the rise, and then the spread, of the bourgeoisie mentality."⁴⁴

Numerous authors of sensory works have since offered similar analyses of olfactory decline.⁴⁵ Hans Rindisbacher explored declension through a quantitative and qualitative

⁴² For the preeminent work on olfactory history, see Alain Corbin, *The Foul and the Fragrant: Odor and the French Social Imagination* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1986). For the tale of the scentless murderer obsessed with creating a perfect odor, see Patrick Süskind, *Perfume: the Story of a Murderer* (New York: Pocket Books, 1986).

⁴³ Corbin, *Foul and the Fragrant*, esp. 65-70. For more examples of how different cultures perceive smelling in diverse ways see; Classen, "Odor of the Other," 133-166, Constance Classen, "Sweet Colors, Fragrant Songs: Sensory Models of the Andes and the Amazon," *American Ethnologist* 17, 4 (1990): 722-735, W. E. A. van Beek, "The Dirty Smith: Smell as a Social Frontier Among the Kapsiki/Higi of North Cameroon and north-eastern Nigeria," *Africa* 62 (1992): 38-58, Michael Taussig, *Mimesis and Alterity: A Particular History of the Senses* (New York: Routledge, 1993), Ryan Bishop, "The Huntsman's Funeral: Targeting the Sensorium," *Social Identities* 16, 5 (2010): 607-619, Phillip Vannini, Dennis Waskul, and Simon Gottschalk, *The Senses in Self, Society, and Culture: A Sociology of the Senses* (New York: Routledge, 2012), and Elizabeth Harvey, *Sensible Flesh: On Touch in Early Modern Culture* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003).

⁴⁴ Corbin, *Foul and the Fragrant*, quotes on 68, 69. Similar analysis of olfactory decline was analyzed within, Rodolphe El-Khoury, "Polish and Deodorize; Paving the City in Late Eighteenth Century France," in *The Smell Culture Reader*, ed. Jim Drobnick (Oxford: Berg, 2006), 18-28.

⁴⁵ For another example see the reading of the control of the odors of specific industries as aspects of social control within, Jo Wheeler, "Stench in Sixteenth-Century Venice," in *The City and the Senses: Urban Culture Since 1500*, ed. Alexander Cowan and Jill Steward (Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2007), 25-38.

analysis of Western literature.⁴⁶ Rindisbacher offered a literary criticism of nineteenth century formalist and romantic writings that focused upon changes in concepts of smelling depending on literary forms, narrative genres, and the location of authors. His study of “olfactory perception in literature” analyzed the “fate” of the sense of smell during the nineteenth century.⁴⁷

Many works on the decline of odor in the West focused upon hygiene. Keith Thomas was among the first historians to discuss the prominence of cleanliness procedures in the decline of odor regarding the rise of the English nation. He explored, for both shame and medical necessity, how odors of the unclean were controlled and removed throughout England starting during the seventeenth century. The goals of deodorization offered “considerations of health and civility which did most to propel the British people in the direction of more frequent and more thorough washing of their bodies from year to year.”⁴⁸

⁴⁶ Hans Rindisbacher, *The Smell of Books: A Cultural-Historical Study of Olfactory Perception in Literature* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1992), esp. 13-16.

⁴⁷ Rindisbacher, *The Smell of Books*, esp. v-x. J. Douglas Porteous similarly placed geography into the literary study of the senses through analysis of the works of Graham Greene and Malcolm Lowry. Porteous noted the mapping possibilities for studies of the smellscape: “it is not by accident that the West Ends of English cities were located upwind of the East Ends, where lived ‘the great unwashed’.” J. Douglas Porteous, *Landscapes of the Mind: Worlds of Sense and Metaphor* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1990), esp. 4-7, 24-45.

⁴⁸ Thomas, “Cleanliness and Godliness,” quote on 76. This work on emotions and sensations in early modern England has been greatly aided by the analyses of Gail Kern Paster, who analyzes the body as both a material and social form that she reads through scientific and popular texts. Gail Kern Paster, *Humoring the Body: Emotions and the Shakespearean Stage* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004), esp. 22-27. Following in the trend set out by Maurice Merleau-Ponty, Norbert Elias, and Pierre Bourdieu, historians of emotion since the cultural turn in historical study have focused upon how perception of the senses (inwardly sensed or sensory output) and emotional experience are learned experiences that alter over time. Monique Scheer, “Are Emotions a Kind of Practice (And Is That What Makes Them Have a History)? A Bourdieuan Approach to Understanding Emotion,” *History and Theory* 51 (May 2012): 193-220. For a general history of emotional history see, Daniel Wickberg, “What Is the History of Sensibilities? On Cultural Histories, Old and New” *AHR* 112, 3 (2007): 661-684. These scholars have tended to limit the mind/body binary through arguing that such a separation disavows how the body learns how to act by habit. Thus emotions, as with the senses, are born within the mind, the body, and the *habitus*. For a reading of emotions in the structure of Western law through the downward influence of disgust and shame see, Martha Craven Nussbaum, *Hiding from Humanity: Disgust, Shame, and the Law* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004), esp. 70-88. Jane Gallop’s work also explores the place of the body in the creation of language and the construction of

Georges Vigarello wrote of similar French assertions of the importance of cleanliness that emerged during the seventeenth century, through concentrating upon the fears of water bathing, the positive sight of the clean body, and the blanched whiteness of laundered cloth.⁴⁹ Dominique Laporte's *History of Shit* (2000) described such an olfactory downturn in France through earlier analysis of royal concerns over the propensity of garbage, shit, and filth on Paris streets.⁵⁰ Valerie Allen's work, *On Farting* (2007), similarly exposed a medieval acceptance of the entertaining sounds and smells of farts and feces, while also attending to the associated decline of stinking emanations with the rise of shame in modernity.⁵¹

Other aspects of the narrative regarding olfactory decline include analyses of the natural environment, technology, and religion. Constance Classen explored the deodorization of the West through the metaphor of the rose and comparisons between Western cultures and indigenous aromatics throughout the globe.⁵² Robert Jütte summarized aromatic decline through a reading of the growth of technology and science, akin to McLuhan's work on the tone of modernity that shifted man from aural to visual

emotional consciousness. Her understanding is that the body, through an "erotics of engagement," informs the construction of language and culture from below. Jane Gallop, *Thinking through the Body* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988), quote on 139.

⁴⁹ Most of these traditions altered with the turn of the nineteenth century towards an increased use of water for bathing and a belief that water "protected" rather than "infiltrated." The continued rise of privacy in the late nineteenth century reflected the continuation of the civilizing process as cleanliness was defined by "the visible surfaces of the body and the regard of others." Georges Vigarello and Jean Birrell, *Concepts of Cleanliness: Changing Attitudes in France since the Middle Ages* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 1-3, 20-27, 56-77, 85-99, 148-162, 226. For more on the beliefs that water was a negative for bathing prior to the Enlightenment see, Jean-Pierre Goubert, *The Conquest of Water: The Advent of Health in the Industrial Age* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1989), esp. 68.

⁵⁰ Laporte, *History of Shit*, esp. 1-5.

⁵¹ Allen, *On Farting*, esp. 42-51.

⁵² Classen, *Worlds of Sense*, 22-36.

regimes of knowledge.⁵³ Specific case studies by David Barnes, William Cohen, and David Inglis, on the rise of bacteriology and industrial sewage, have also portrayed aspects of the scientific, institutional, and medical aspects of olfactory declension.⁵⁴

Many authors recently resisted the idea of significant olfactory decline. Diane Ackerman's work on the natural history of the senses, which exposes places of the sense of smell outside of social constructionist terminology, offers that smell has always been vital in marking the other and living within diverse human environments.⁵⁵ Mark Smith exposed that the simple narrative of odor's decline needed to be critiqued, while uncovering places where the grand narrative was upset by the links between racial knowing concerning pre-modernity and modern racialization.⁵⁶ In his analysis of the English Reformation, Matthew Milner has similarly argued that sensual behaviors, especially regarding Anglican religious practices, were retained despite the shifting laws of the English state that worked to limit Catholic superstition and the use of incense.⁵⁷

⁵³ Jütte, *History of the Senses*, esp. 170-172, 265-280. For history of vision, image, and the gaze in the transition to modernity see, Margaret Miles, *Image as Insight: Visual Understanding in Western Christianity and Secular Culture* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1985), esp. 30-39.

⁵⁴ David Barnes, *The Great Stink of Paris and the Nineteenth-Century Struggle against Filth and Germs* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2006). For similar work regarding sewers in later eras see, David Inglis "Sewers and Sensibilities: the Bourgeois Faecal Experience in the Nineteenth-Century City," in *The City and the Senses Urban Culture Since 1500*, ed. Alexander Cowan and Jill Steward (Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2007), 105-130, the possible transgression of the space of the sewer within, David Pike, "Sewage Treatments: Vertical Space and Waste in Nineteenth-Century Paris and London," in *Filth: Dirt, Disgust, and Modern Life*, ed. William Cohen and Ryan Johnson (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), 51-77, and the importance of theology to understanding epidemiological concerns within, Michael Brown, "From Foetid Air to Filth: the Cultural Transformation of British Epidemiological Thought, Ca. 1780-1848," *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 82, 3 (2008): 515-544.

⁵⁵ Diane Ackerman, *A Natural History of the Senses* (New York: Random House. 1990), esp. 15-25.

⁵⁶ Smith, "Transcending, Othering," 380-390.

⁵⁷ Matthew Milner, *The Senses and the English Reformation* (Farnham, England: Ashgate, 2011), esp. 4-7, 185-186. For more debates on incense and olfactory cultures to be explored in chapter three see, Suzanne Evans, "The Scent of a Martyr," *Numen* 49, 2 (2002): esp. 198-207, Susan Ashbrook Harvey, *Scenting Salvation: Ancient Christianity and the Olfactory Imagination* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006), Jacob Baum, "From Incense to Idolatry: The Reformation of Olfaction in Late Medieval German

Mark Jenner critiqued the idea of significant olfactory downturn in many works on water and cleanliness, while noting the importance of analyzing explicit sensations in specific moments rather than through structures of perception. His work also deconstructed the overemphasis on odor's decline in Keith Thomas' earlier discussions of cleanliness and perfume in Early Modern England.⁵⁸ Jenner summarized: "All too often, historians' talk of deodorization unhelpfully confuses the removal of *particular* scents, notably fecal odors and the smells of human sweat, with the removal of *all* smells."⁵⁹

In this more focused tradition of sensory history that defines the metanarrative as lacking, numerous scholars fixated on the cultivation of sensory skills and the historicity of the senses in specific times and places. C. M. Woolgar analyzed the sensation of the late Medieval Era through focusing on specific cases of the odor of sanctity that follows holy persons, incense, flowers in churches, and the stench of sin. In the more recent tradition that critiques the metanarrative, Woolgar only briefly touches on larger accounts of odor's decline, the rise of fumigation, and the scientific production of healthful scents that

Ritual," *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 44, 2 (2013): 323-344, Holly Crawford Pickett, "The Idolatrous Nose: Incense on the Early Modern Stage," in *Religion and Drama in Early Modern England: The Performance of Religion on the Renaissance Stage*, ed. Jane Hwang Degenhardt and Elizabeth Williamson (Farnham, Surrey, England: Ashgate, 2011), 19-38, and David Robertson, "Incensed over Incense: Incense and Community in Seventeenth-Century Literature," in *Writing and Religion in England, 1558-1689: Studies in Community-Making and Cultural Memory*, ed. Roger Sell, and A. W. Johnson (Burlington, VT, USA: Ashgate, 2009), 389-409.

⁵⁸ Jenner, "Civilization and Deodorization," 127-144. For similar analysis of odor studies in more micro-historical terms related to both positive and negative scents as experience see, Peter Burke, "Urban Sensations: Attractive and Repulsive," in *Volume III of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 43-60, esp. 44-46.

⁵⁹ Jenner "Follow Your Nose?" quote on 341. For "sensory skills" as cultivated phenomena see, Mark Jenner, "Tasting Lichfield, Touching China: Sir John Floyers' Senses," *The Historical Journal* 53, 3 (2010): 647-670. For cultivating a sense of smell as a sensory skill see, Jonathan Reinartz, "Uncommon Scents: Smell and Victorian England," in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 129-148.

emerged during the Early Modern Era.⁶⁰

Emily Cockayne has also offered a guide for how to perform the micro-historical work that Jenner describes as essential for sensory history to bridge the gap between determinism and microhistory. Her analysis of sensations in the spatial and temporal confines of specific English cities emphasizes that filth and odor were an essential aspect of early modern life. Cockayne explicitly analyzed the rising disgust felt through sensory experiences of early capitalism through concepts of ugliness, the sensory worlds near dogs, and the types of trades linked to specific classes and bodies.⁶¹

Holly Dugan expanded this olfactory dialectic between the metanarrative and the focused critique to look at aspects of power related to odor in the early modern English Atlantic. Her work exposed that power often used odor to display an olfactory form of spectacle. Dugan's work also emboldens a significant aspect of Atlantic history that focuses on material culture and the experience of encountering specific commodities. She argues that scent had a "precise language" in Early Modern England, rather than the widely accepted understanding that scenting is too subjective to have a proper terminological codex.⁶² Her work discussed scents as "staged" in the court of Henry VIII, linked to the

⁶⁰ C. M. Woolgar, *The Senses in Late Medieval England* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006), 117-146. For the changes in sensation during the Early Modern Era as bringing about alterations in what was deemed private or public see, Marshall McLuhan, "Inside the Five Sense Sensorium," in *Empire of the Senses: The Sensual Culture Reader* David Howes (Oxford: Berg, 2005), 43-54, and Holly Dugan and Lara Farina, "Intimate Senses/Sensing Intimacy," *Postmedieval* 3, 4 (2012): 373-379.

⁶¹ Emily Cockayne, *Hubbub: Filth, Noise & Stench in England 1600-1770* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007), esp. 74-76. For a similar historical urban tour using the senses see, Richard Wrigley, "Making Sense of Rome," *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 35, 4 (2012): 551-564. C. Y. Chiang has similarly applied a materialist olfactory analysis through a micro-historical reading of twentieth century fishing communities in California. C. Y. Chiang, "The Nose Knows: The Sense of Smell in American History," *Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 405-416.

⁶² Dugan, *Ephemeral History*, quote on 4. For more on the importance of material culture to religion see the study of the debates on modernity within, Sally Promey, "Religion, Sensation, and Materiality: An Introduction," in *Sensational Religion*, ed. Sally Promey (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014), 1-22,

Atlantic World and transnational courts through trade in ambergris perfumed gloves, and as vital to the rise of fragrant perfume industries that surpassed the earlier use of animal musk to scent human bodies.⁶³

Though not often defined as sensory history, works by Wolfgang Schivelbusch, Kathleen Brown, Marcy Norton, Robert DuPlessis, and Jennifer Anderson follow epistemologies of history that focus on similar experiences of the body encountering the New World.⁶⁴ Much of this debate on material culture focuses on the role that Atlantic commodities played as cultural texts when those goods entered European markets.⁶⁵

the summary of pre-modern liturgical synesthesia within, Beatrice Caseau, "The Senses in Religion: Liturgy, Devotion, and Deprivation," in *Volume II of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen and Richard Newhauser (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 89-110, the often euphoric and communal use of saffron and hemp within, Volker Schier, "Probing the Mystery of the Use of Saffron in Medieval Nunneries," *The Senses and Society* 5, 1 (2010): 57-72, the physical manifestations of "grace" within horse food analyzed within, Matthew Milner, "The Physics of Holy Oats: Vernacular Knowledge, Qualities, and Remedy in Fifteenth-Century England," *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies* 43, 2 (2013): 219-245, and the example of the analysis of sensory encounters with amber in, Rachel King, "'The Beads With Which We Pray Are Made From It': Devotional Ambers in Early Modern Italy," in *Religion and the Senses in Early Modern Europe*, ed. Wietse de Boer and Christine Göttler (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 153-175.

⁶³ Dugan, *Ephemeral History*, esp. 4-19. For the history of the senses in artistic creations within the Atlantic World see the reading of pleasure and pain associated to encountering the artwork of the other within, David Shields, "The Atlantic World, the Senses, and the Arts," in *The Oxford Handbook of the Atlantic World, C.1450-C.1850*, ed. Nicholas Canny and Philip Morgan (Oxford: New York, 2011), 130-146. For more on the importance of smell as a transitional sense for religious rituals across cultures see, David Howes, "Olfaction and Transition; An Essay on the Ritual Uses of Smell," *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology* 24, 3 (1987): 398-416.

⁶⁴ Kathleen Brown, *Foul Bodies: Cleanliness in Early America* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2009); Wolfgang Schivelbusch, *Tastes of Paradise: A Social History of Spices, Stimulants, and Intoxicants* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1992), esp. 145-146; Marcy Norton, *Sacred Gifts, Profane Pleasures: A History of Tobacco and Chocolate in the Atlantic World* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2008). Also see the patterns of consumption analyzed within the subaltern material history of fabrics in, Robert DuPlessis, *The Material Atlantic: Clothing, Commerce, and Colonization in the Atlantic World, 1650-1800* (Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2016), and the different labor regimes for lumber within, Jennifer Anderson, *Mahogany: The Costs of Luxury in Early America* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 2012). There is also an aspect of sensory history that focuses on similar aspects of olfactory materials in earlier eras. For a selection see the use of spices in ancient medical traditions within, R. A. Donkin, *Dragon's Brain Perfume: An Historical Geography of Camphor* (Leiden: Brill, 1999), and the shift from ideals about the healing nature of spices to the importance of spices for the spectacle of the banquet within, Paul Freedman, *Out of the East: Spices and the Medieval Imagination* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008).

⁶⁵ For example, see the large literature on the aesthetics, addictiveness, questions of power, threats to royalty, and profits of tobacco as the weed entered Europe throughout the Early Modern Era within, Sarah Augusta Dickson, *Panacea or Precious Bane; Tobacco in Sixteenth Century Literature* (New York: New York Public

Numerous studies of perfume culture have also explored the sense of smell, though often focus on applying aromas to narratives of the rise of perfume industries in Europe and the wider world rather than on larger historical concerns.⁶⁶ Jonathan Reinartz has recently focused many of these historiographical debates on odor upon differences between material goods and philosophical materialism. He asserts that the narrative of odor decline

Library, 1954), esp. 190-206, debates on tobacco in early modern England that often focused on the threat to royalty that a new pharmaceutical could provide within, Ziser, "Sovereign Remedies," 719-722, and within Sandra Bell, "The Subject of Smoke: Tobacco and Early Modern England," in *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, ed. Helen Ostovich, Mary Silcox, and Graham Roebuck (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2008), 153-169. Also, see the role of printing culture and the problem of Native American associations to the drug within debates on tobacco within, Peter Mancall, "Tales Tobacco Told in Sixteenth-Century Europe," *Environmental History* 9, 4 (2004): 648-678, the racially and politically threatening aspects of tobacco culture felt by James I analyzed within, Susan Campbell Anderson, "A Matter of Authority: James I and the Tobacco War," *Comitatus: A Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies* 29, 1 (1998): 136-163, and the linguistic analysis of an applied proxy war through the metaphor of tobacco to cure similar threats felt by Charles I within, Todd Butler, "Power in Smoke: The Language of Tobacco and Authority in Caroline England," *Studies in Philology* 106, 1 (Winter, 2009): 100-118. Histories on other consumer goods similarly relied on an understanding of the subconscious change associated to how the reception of goods altered sensory perceptions enough to foment cultural shifts. Much work focused on the consumer revolution in goods informed by local innovators and manufacturers on the American countryside. David Jaffee, *A New Nation of Goods: The Material Culture of Early America* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010), 1-5. For more on the consumer revolution and American politics in the Revolutionary Era see the 'empire of goods' in T. H. Breen, *The Marketplace of Revolution: How Consumer Politics Shaped American Independence* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), and the consumer revolution born in England which spread to the colonies in Neil McKendrick, John Brewer, and J. H. Plumb, *The Birth of a Consumer Society: The Commercialization of Eighteenth-Century England* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982). These changes in the meaning of luxury and convenience focused on "the culture of sensibility" that "identified the phenomenon of discomfort and made it susceptible to rational correction." The desire for comfort was "naturalized" as common sense rationality. Sympathy, the mark of the new sociability, shaped a material culture where one could understand, through their senses, the feelings of their neighbors via: "imaginatively experiencing their emotions and sensations." John Crowley, *The Invention of Comfort: Sensibilities & Design in Early Modern Britain & Early America* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001), ix-x, 153-168, quote on 168.

⁶⁶ For example, see the reading of history of perfumes through alchemical contributions within, Mandy Aftel, *Essence and Alchemy: A Book of Perfume* (New York: North Point Press, 2001), esp. 11-47, the reading of the roots of modern Western perfumery in chemistry as part of the modern sense of deodorizing within, Maksym Klymentiev, "Creating Spices for the Mind," *The Senses and Society* 9, 2 (2015): 212-231, the possible odor semiotics that can be created through perfume critique within, Tove Solander, "Signature Scents," *The Senses and Society* 5, 3 (2010): 301-321, the scents of the bazaar and the rise of capitalism analyzed within, Abby Schrader, "Market Pleasures and Prostitution in St. Petersburg," in *Russian History Through the Senses: From 1700 to the Present*, ed. Matthew Romaniello and Tricia Starks, ed. (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2016), 67-94, and the analysis of modern perfumery through a focus on specific material traditions for scenting within, Mandy Aftel, *Fragrant: The Secret Life of Scent* (New York: Riverhead Books, 2014).

trumpeted by Corbin often overlooks many olfactory materials and falsely labels modernity as an era of complete deodorization via perception, rather than simply the redirection of concern upon specific smells and the retention of other aromas.⁶⁷

Following from these historiographical concerns, Carolyn Purnell recently provided a sensory history of the Enlightenment that focused upon the sensory theories of elite scholars of French and English academies. Her work submits that other historians overemphasized the dividing of the proximate senses, smell and taste, from the distant senses in their analyses of the Enlightenment. Within Purnell's analysis of the writings of the French *philosophes*, she argued that odor use increased during the Enlightenment through the use of new aromatic materials for medicine, for social ordering, and as a significant aspect of constructing the private and the public. Her analysis focuses, like Dugan's work, on the role of material goods and their olfactory components. For Purnell, odor was increasingly used upon bodies, even while the sense was moved to a "divergent intellectual space." Her analysis defines the Enlightenment as an era when the senses were integrated to communicate differently than in the pre-modern West.⁶⁸

For Reinartz, Dugan, and Purnell the idea that the senses were positioned differently throughout the Enlightenment has less to do with shifts in consciousness than with changes in material cultures. Combined, these authors have worked to deconstruct the idea of the

⁶⁷ Reinartz, *Past Scents*, esp. 42-47. For a similar debate on the decline of sensations see, Joseph Moshenska, *Feeling Pleasures. Sense of Touch in Renaissance England* (Corby: Oxford University Press, 2014), esp. 1-14.

⁶⁸ Carolyn Purnell, *The Sensational Past: How the Enlightenment Changed the Way We Use Our Senses* (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 2017), esp. 44-45, 102-122, quote on 107. For similar ways in which odor marked spaces of private and public, gendered and classist, see the reading of the aromas of the transgressive macaroni within, William Tullett, "The Macaroni's 'Ambrosial Essences': Perfume, Identity and Public Space in Eighteenth-Century England," *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 38, 2 (2015): 163-180.

“great divide of the senses” by showing that Western sensory worlds became more integrated, materially driven, and aromatically vibrant than narratives of de-olfaction described within previous histories of European secularization.⁶⁹ Whereas these authors essentially describe how materials were used to change the smell of specific bodies, cultures, and homes, I examine the specific odors of bodies and bodily experience as part of both the material environment and rhetorical consciousness. My work is a materialist analysis of bodies through phenomenological reading of the common language of experience, rather than an analysis of materials that were used to scent bodies and goods.

In the project of olfactory history, fiction has also become a vital point of ingress for scholars wishing to discover the cultural poetics that informed how to perceive through the five senses. As Emily Friedman has recently summarized in her analysis of sensory philosophy of the eighteenth century, the “act of naming” odors within literature is “tied to one’s ability to identify odors, and odorant language seems to trigger both linguistic and olfactory parts of our brain.”⁷⁰ The history of odor has not shied away from engaging with fiction in both historical studies of the past or with the idea of using narratives of fragrance from the present. Most historical fields waver at using modern fiction as a means of conceptualizing the past, deeming the use of such texts and theories as anachronistic, but odor studies have not concerned themselves with such disciplinary rigor, choosing instead to borrow from the likes of Italo Calvino, J. K. Huysmans, and Nikolai Gogol to analyze

⁶⁹ Purnell, *Sensational Past*, esp. 231-242; Reinartz, *Past Scents*, esp. 177-179; Dugan, *Ephemeral History*, esp. 182-190.

⁷⁰ Emily Friedman, *Reading Smell in Eighteenth-Century Fiction* (Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2016), quote on 6. For more on literature and olfactory experience see a reading of the senses that relates to integration with nature within, Kerry McSweeney, *The Language of the Senses: Sensory-Perceptual Dynamics in Wordsworth, Coleridge, Thoreau, Whitman, and Dickinson* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1998), esp. 98-119.

the ephemeral odors of both the past and the present.⁷¹ As Bruce Smith summarized: “When it comes to explanations of sensations and affects, truths have the virtue of being accepted once and for all, theories can be tested over time and revised to take account of new research, but fictions are truest to experience.”⁷²

Much work on eras outside the confines of this dissertation has also exposed the importance of smell to class relationships, medicine, and sanitation. Historians have conceptualized a deeply engaged sensory history that created an olfactory dialectic with important central questions for the historical profession. For this project, these questions relate to metanarratives, transgressive language, and the path of modernity.⁷³ The historiography of odor has therefore established itself differently than historiographies of

⁷¹ J. K. Huysmans, *A Rebours*. (*Against the Grain*) (London: Fortune Press, 1946 [1884]); Nikolai Gogol, *The Nose* (Brooklyn, NY: Melville House Pub, 2014 [1836]); Italo Calvino, *Under the Jaguar Sun* (San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1988), esp. 65-84; J. Douglas Porteous, *Landscapes of the Mind: Worlds of Sense and Metaphor* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1990), esp. 21-45; Richard Griffiths, “From Sexual Arousal to Religious Rapture: The Importance of the Sense of Smell in the Writings of Zola and Huysmans,” in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 263-292; Susan Stewart, *Poetry and the Fate of the Senses* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002), esp. 28-32; Hugo de Rijke, “The Point of Long Noses: Tristram Shandy and Cyrano de Bergerac,” in *Nose Book: Representations of the Nose in Literature and the Arts*, ed. Victoria De Rijke, Lene Oestermarck-Johansen, and Helen Thomas (London: Middlesex University Press, 2000), 55-76; Ralf Hertel, “The Senses in Literature: From the Modernist Shock of Sensation to Postcolonial and Virtual Voices,” in *Volume VI of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen and David Howes (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 173-194; Mary Bryden, “The Odorous Text: A Deleuzian Approach to Huysmans,” *Romanic Review* 100, 3 (2009): 265-278.

⁷² Bruce Smith, “Afterword: Senses of an Ending” in *Shakespearean Sensations: Experiencing Literature in Early Modern England*, ed. Katharine Craik and Tanya Pollard (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 208-217, quote on 209. For the importance of scents in religious literatures see, Nathalie Wourm, “The Smell of God: Scent Trails from Ficino to Baudelaire,” in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 79-100.

⁷³ As Janice Carlisle relayed: “Within the context of an olfactory encounter, then, class is a practice of everyday life, a way of comprehending quotidian, individual experience, rather than a sociological formulation or a political agenda. Less a structure that sorts out large groups of people into two or three categories, it is a process of setting one person in comparative relation to another.” For the role of scenting in Victorian novels as a marker of difference see, Janice Carlisle, *Common Scents: Comparative Encounters in High-Victorian Fiction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), quote on 13, and the specific analysis of odor and masculinity as a critique of capitalism within texts of the Victorian Era in, Janice Carlisle, “The Smell of Class: British Novels of the 1860s,” *Victorian Literature and Culture* 29, 1 (2001): 1-19.

the other four senses.⁷⁴ A clear dialectic developed between scholars who assert odor declined with modernity and those who find pungent spaces against the argument that the sense of smell declined. Within this essentially binary dialectic are numerous arguments that relay similar oppositional forces. Some scholars argue that smell is essentially productive of power, others argue that smell is inherently transgressive and anathema to authority.⁷⁵

I assert my work within this historiographical discussion through exposing a renewed importance to the metanarrative, rather than the focused temporal confines that much recent sensory work espouses. This dissertation defines the subaltern as a place that has yet to be fully conceptualized as an olfactory figure, essentially due to previous reliance on textual hermeneutics of the intermittent imperial archive. I re-assert that olfactory language is inherently transgressive, synesthetic, and culturally defined, which made the Atlantic World an increasingly confusing and aromatic space for the numerous cultures that shared the spatial and temporal confines of the Atlantic Slave Trade, the Columbian

⁷⁴ For modern understandings of the biology of sensing odors see the analysis of levels of odor recognition that combines biological triggers with learning and memory within, Donald Wilson and Richard Stevenson, *Learning to Smell: Olfactory Perception from Neurobiology to Behavior* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2006), esp. 243-264, the recent Nobel Prize winning work on receptors within, Linda Buck and Richard Axel, "A Novel Multigene Family May Encode Odorant Receptors: a Molecular Basis for Odor Recognition," *Cell* 65, 1 (1991): 175-187, and the biology of the sense of smell and education of odor presences into adulthood within, J. A. Mennella and G. K. Beauchamp, "Olfactory Preferences in Children and Adults," in *The Human Sense of Smell*, ed. David Laing, Richard Doty, and W. Breipohl (Berlin: Springer-Verlag, 1991), 167-180.

⁷⁵ For more on olfactory transgression see: the reading of Western metaphysics of the eye and deconstruction through taste and odor explored within, Fiona Borthwick, "Olfaction and Taste: Invasive Odours and Disappearing Objects," *The Australian Journal of Anthropology* 11, 2 (2000): 127-140, and the inability to express smells objectively, and therefore the power of smell through linguistic transgressiveness, within, Daniel Press and Steven Minta, "The Smell of Nature: Olfaction, Knowledge and the Environment," *Ethics, Place & Environment* 3, 2 (2000): 173-186, Jillyn Smith and Chris Smith, *Senses and Sensibilities* (New York: J. Wiley, 1989), esp. 103-118, and Felizitas Ringham, "The Language of Smell," in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 23-36.

Exchange, and the Conquest of America.⁷⁶ When analyzing smell, scholars essentially analyze conceptions of progress and the diametric opposition of the other, be they Native American, Asian, African, or part of a lower economic class.⁷⁷ In the aggregate, I resist those who find nuance against the structural analysis of odor's decline in metropolitan Europe, while offering that olfactory deterioration also existed as a spatially and ethnically determined process within the Atlantic World.⁷⁸

⁷⁶ Language lacks the ability to describe odors because the sense is tied inherently to memory and experience rather than universally common perceptions. As Hannah Higgins recently described in her analysis of the anti-art culture of Fluxus, "Since smell is not semiologically detached—there is no semiotic divide between the signifier and the signified—smell is ill suited at best to the mediated format of language, despite the vividness with which smell can be experienced and remembered." Hannah Higgins, *Fluxus Experience* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), quote on 46. As such, smell is a "highly elusive phenomena." Because each smell is subjective to each individual, the classification of scents becomes nearly impossible on a level similar to colors or sounds processed through the mind over a longer period than smells. Simply, "there is no effective way of either capturing scents or storing them over time." Classen, *Aroma*, quote on 3. For more examples of the transgressive nature of smell see a reading of modern olfactory artistic programs within, E. R. Straughan "The Smell of the Moon," *Cultural Geographies* 22, 3 (2015): 409-426, the lacking ability to pin down direct signifiers for specific odors within the reading of Victorian print culture in, David Trotter, *Cooking with Mud: The Idea of Mess in Nineteenth-Century Art and Fiction* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), esp. 98-142, and the possibility of representing odor accurately in the reading of synesthesia within, Clare Batty, "A Representational Account of Olfactory Experience," *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* 40, 4 (2010): 511-538.

⁷⁷ For more examples of social power in sensescapes see, Karin Bijsterveld, *Soundscapes of the Urban Past: Staged Sound As Mediated Cultural Heritage* (Bielefeld: Transcript, 2013), David Henkin, *City Reading: Written Words and Public Spaces in Antebellum New York* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1998), Anika König, "Smelling the Difference; the Senses in Ethnic Conflict in West Kalimantan, Indonesia," in *Senses and Citizenships: Embodying Political Life* ed. Susanna Trnka (NY: Routledge, 2013), esp. 120-132, the "imagined listening community" within, Carolyn Birdsall, *Nazi Soundscapes: Sound, Technology and Urban Space During Nazi Germany* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2012), esp. 12-19, the olfactory complexity of the concentration camp within, Hans Rindisbacher, "The Stench of Power," in *The Smell Culture Reader*, ed. Jim Drobnick (Oxford & New York: Berg, 2006): esp. 137-147, and G. L. Tul'chinskii, "The Word and Body of Postmodernism - From the Phenomenology of Irresponsibility to the Metaphysics of Freedom," *Russian Studies in Philosophy* 42, 3 (2003): 5-35, esp. 9-10.

⁷⁸ For the "microhistory of the senses" as a means to critique structural histories of sensation see, Jenner, "Tasting Lichfield," esp. 655-661. For an example of such micro-historical work on sensory skills see the reading of hospital records within, Jonathan Reinartz, "Learning to Use Their Senses: Visitors to Voluntary Hospitals in Eighteenth-Century England," *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 35, 4 (2012): 505-520, the use of sensory empiricism within sentimental traditions of a new medical middle class within, Sarah Knott, "The Patient's Case: Sentimental Empiricism and Knowledge in the Early American Republic," *WMQ* 67, 4 (2010): 645-676, the analysis of learning to hear within modern medicine analyzed in, Sarah Maslen, "Researching the Senses as Knowledge," *The Senses and Society* 10, 1 (2015): 52-70, and earlier studies of specifically educated senses within medical practice described within, Susan Lawrence, "Educating the Senses: Students, Teachers, and Medical Rhetoric in Eighteenth-Century London," in *Medicine and the Five Senses*, ed. W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 154-178.

Though relatively brief, recent historical attention to odor has helped to highlight the importance of the senses to religious experiences and cultural practices in the past.⁷⁹ Odor history has explicitly portrayed the importance of alterity to specific cultural encounters. As well, the history of odor highlights the important relationship between language and the social construction of experience. The comparatively slight study of odor in American history, and recently within Atlantic history, has been analyzed regarding the importance of perceiving cleanliness, material culture, and the history of empire.⁸⁰ This study attends to these numerous examples of sensory history through analyzing racial construction, phenomenology, and the metanarrative within numerous historical dialectics concerning the defining master texts of history for the Atlantic littoral during the Early Modern Era.⁸¹

⁷⁹ For more background on animal scenting and human retention of animal senses see, D. Michael Stoddart, *The Scented Ape* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), and the analysis of odor through modern chemistry within, Luca Turin, *The Secret of Scent: Adventures in Perfume and the Science of Smell* (New York: Ecco, 2006), esp. 4-9. Because of the way the sense of smell passes to the cortex, by not passing through the thalamus as other senses, humans can be bombarded by smell more than the other sense. Levine, *Fundamentals of Sensation*, 463-465; D. Michael Stoddart, *Adam's Nose, and the Making of Humankind* (Hoboken, NJ: Imperial College Press, 2015), esp. 41-118. For more on the sense of smell in philosophical and scientific traditions see the reading of Polish philosophers Wladyslaw Tatarkiewicz and Tadeuz Gadacz within, Beata Hoffmann, "Scent in Science and Culture," *History of the Human Sciences* 26, 5 (2013): 31-47.

⁸⁰ For the use of scents to mark aspects of power and wealth in the Western tradition see the use of gardens and perfumes within, David Potter, "Odor and Power in the Roman Empire," in *Constructions of the Classical Body*, ed. James Porter (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1999), 169-189, the use of artificial odors to create metaphors to floral power within, Jo Day, "Imagined Aromas and Artificial Flowers in Minoan Society," in *Making Senses of the Past: Toward a Sensory Archaeology*, edited by Jo Day (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2013), 286-309, the ubiquitous presence of smell within Greco-Roman power categories discussed in Gregory Aldrete, "Urban Sensations: Opulence and Ordure," in *Vol. I of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen and Jerry Toner (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 45-68, esp. 50-53, and the critique of those Greco-Roman categories through excrement within, Blake Leyerle, "Refuse, Filth, and Excrement in the Homilies of John Chrysostom," *Journal of Late Antiquity* 2, 2 (2009): 337-356.

⁸¹ For the advantages of microhistory see, Lara Putnam, "To Study the Fragments/Whole: Microhistory and

Smelling is an adaptive sensitivity that is excited by novelty and dulled by the familiar.⁸² In the Atlantic World, the novel was the common. To analyze this constant malleability and transformability of people and odors in the Atlantic World, I borrow from James Scott's investigations of "hidden transcripts" and "weapons of the weak" to highlight how subalterns and non-Western peoples of the Atlantic littoral remained transgressive through creating shadow olfactory cultures of funerals, festivals, and intensely scented diets. Scott's analysis of worker's discourses against post-colonial elites finds a place in this dissertation through the similarities in the languages of labor used to resist the capitalism of either European empires or slave masters.⁸³

As Uri Almagor described in his analysis of the languages of odor: "The study of the private world of odors through a model of phenomenology could open up new perspectives on individual perception and the construction of reality which would be difficult to gain through other means."⁸⁴ In this phenomenological tradition, I offer that the

the Atlantic World," *Journal of Social History* 39, 3 (2006): 615-630, and the historiographical touchstone of, Natalie Zemon Davis, *The Return of Martin Guerre* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1983).

⁸² Paul Rodaway, *Sensuous Geographies: Body, Sense, and Place* (London: Routledge, 1994), 64-65. For an extended theoretical reading on the nature of sensation as partly biological, essentially intermodal, inherently relational, and constructed as part of a larger body politic see, F.A. Hayek, *The Sensory Order: An Inquiry into the Foundations of Theoretical Psychology* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1952), esp. 19-22, and the discovery of the hypothalamus and the place of odor within deeper parts of the brain in the early nineteenth century within, Lyall Watson, *Jacobson's Organ and the Remarkable Nature of Smell* (New York: W.W. Norton, 2000).

⁸³ James Scott, *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990). For more on the philosophical resistance to separation of the senses see the reading of odor as inherently synesthetic within, Michel Serres, *The Five Senses: a Philosophy of Mingled Bodies* (London: Continuum, 2009), esp. 17-84.

⁸⁴ For the importance of understanding odor as a transgressive assertion of the private space of the individual against the dominance of linguistic universalization see, Uri Almagor, "Odors and Private Language: Observations on the Phenomenology of Scent," *Human Studies: A Journal for Philosophy and the Social Sciences* 13, 3 (1990): 253-274, the scents of nothing as important in phenomenological analysis of private space in hospitals within, Anette Stenslund "A Whiff of Nothing: The Atmospheric Absence of Smell," *The Senses and Society* 10, 3 (2016): 341-360, and the analysis of language, scent, and ritual within, Alfred Gell, "Magic, Perfume, Dream," in *Symbols and Sentiments*, ed. Alfred Gell and Gilbert Lewis (London: Academic Press, 1977), 25-38.

Cartesian ideal of separating the mind and the body is an Enlightenment flaw that has turned history away from the body and the critical capacities of the so-called lower senses.⁸⁵

This dissertation is separated into three parts. Part one, *The Great Divide and Olfactory Discourse in the Old World*, offers two background chapters on the European experience with odor during the era of contact with the Western Hemisphere. After 1492, the dominant European olfactory discourse became essentially Protestant, patriarchal, and employed whiteness as a marker of moral and biological cleanliness. I portray these changes through an analysis of the material culture of sulfur. From this focused sensible lens, the first section summarizes the sensory disenchantment caused by New World discoveries, the textuality of the Reformation, and the investigations of the New Science.⁸⁶ These operations of science are located within culture, and alter the body through the manipulations of what Pierre Bourdieu has defined as the bio-political *habitus*, the cultural

⁸⁵ For the earlier Renaissance era as indulging in the sense of smell see the artistic representations of falling or thrown flowers within, François Quiviger, *The Sensory World of Italian Renaissance Art* (London: Reaktion Books, 2010), esp. 125-136.

⁸⁶ For the social construction of science see, Andrew Pickering, *Science As Practice and Culture* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), esp. 6-10, Thomas Kuhn, *The Essential Tension: Selected Studies in Scientific Tradition and Change* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1977), 128-147, the self-fashioning of scientists within Steven Shapin, *The Scientific Revolution* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1996), 55-64, the role of the market within, Pamela Smith, *The Business of Alchemy: Science and Culture in the Holy Roman Empire* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994), the examples of knowledge of the nervous system as scientific disciplining over the Scottish Highlands in, Christopher Lawrence, "The Nervous System and Society in the Scottish Enlightenment," in *Natural Order: Historical Studies of Scientific Culture*, ed. Barry Barnes and Steven Shapin (Beverly Hills, Calif: Sage Publications, 1979), 19-40, the relationship between the sense of sight, optics, and political thought within Theresa Levitt, *The Shadow of Enlightenment: Optical and Political Transparency in France, 1789-1848* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), the analysis of odor surveys as defining the construction of the body within, Bruno Latour, "How to Talk About the Body?: The Normative Dimension of Science Studies," *Body & Society* 10, 2-3 (2004): 205-229, general analysis within Peter Dear, *The Intelligibility of Nature: How Science Makes Sense of the World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006), and the foundational work on relationships between political motives and science within, Steven Shapin and Simon Schaffer, *Leviathan and the Air-Pump: Hobbes, Boyle, and the Experimental Life* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2011).

milieu that defines the proper emotions, perceptions, and bodily gestures within a society, in part created through discussions of what is considered tasteful.⁸⁷

Chapter one, “The Devil’s Element,” describes intra-European cultural baggage related to changing classifications of the senses during the Enlightenment. Using travel narratives of hell, early modern literature about demons and ghosts, and imperial encounters that reference sulfur, this chapter analyzes how odors were reclassified during the English Renaissance and later Reformation.⁸⁸ This chapter describes the first phase of this shift, which moved pungent associations from the European core of London to the colonial periphery as a first step in deodorizing the metropole.⁸⁹

Through a reading of plays on the English stage and sermons from the pulpit, chapter two, “‘What a Steam...Left Behind’,” shows how these shifting connotations for sulfur, within England proper, exemplify the fluctuating powers of the market, religious voices, and the state to define what should be considered too environmentally pungent for economic consumption. This chapter focuses on the metropolitan conception of sulfuric odor as culture transitioned a particular and indulgent Renaissance nose to a universalizing

⁸⁷ Pierre Bourdieu, *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1984), esp. 190-191; Alan Petersen, *The Body in Question: A Socio-Cultural Approach* (London: Routledge, 2007), esp. 50-52. For sociology and the role of the habitus in fecal othering see, David Inglis, *A Sociological History of Excretory Experience: Defecatory Manners and Toiletry Technologies* (Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 2001), esp. 30-45, 128-132, 156-160.

⁸⁸ For a close reading of vision during the Early Modern Era see the link between sight and understanding within, Katherine Hindley, “Sight and Understanding: Visual Imagery as Metaphor in the Old English Boethius and Soliloquies,” in *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, ed. Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer (Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016), esp. 21-35.

⁸⁹ For historical theory regarding the relationship between core and periphery, a vital aspect of the cultural and economic exchanges of the Atlantic World see, Immanuel Wallerstein, *World-Systems Analysis: An Introduction* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004), and Fernand Braudel, *The Mediterranean and the Mediterranean World in the Age of Philip II* (New York: Harper & Row, 1972).

Protestant nose that bounded and legitimated categories of gender, race, and class through self-identifications of purity and cleanliness.⁹⁰

Throughout the Early Modern Era, the senses shifted from gateways where sin could enter the body to channels that connected bodies in spaces of the lived world. The central tone of sensory discussions in the early modern academy offered moral concerns entering the body through the senses not from evils, but from a growing spatial regime where encountering bodies at an increased rate led to moral concerns from the state.⁹¹ The signs of sulfur were non-human actors in these bodily and linguistic networks of the Early Modern Era. These signs, with the force of capitalism, increasingly linked with ideas of state progress to create a superstructure where sulfur was increasingly less stinking, less disgusting, and less evil because capitalism needed sulfur for primitive accumulation through the acceptance of industrial waste. The aesthetic distribution of the senses created a new and general English consciousness that increasingly accepted the odor of sulfur on the home island, even as the yellow metal poisoned lungs and tortured nasal passages with the stink of previously evil connotations.⁹²

⁹⁰ See, for example, a reading of androids and the education of human emotions within, Adelheid Voskuhl, *Androids in the Enlightenment: Mechanics, Artisans, and Cultures of the Self* (Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2013).

⁹¹ Elizabeth Robertson, "Afterword: From Gateways to Channels. Reaching towards an Understanding of the Transformative Plasticity of the Senses in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods," in *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, ed. Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer (Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016), 286-296. John Davies *Nosce Teipsum* (1599) placed the senses as bulwarks in a castle, protecting and messaging the body and soul of dangers and opportunities. Smell, in such a treatment, was viewed as a positive in need of protection: "And yet good sents doe purifie the braine,/ Awake the fancie, and the wits refine;/ Hence old Deuotion, incense did ordaine/ To make mens' spirits apt for thoughts divine." Vinge, *Five Senses*, 93-96.

⁹² For the rise of environmentalism as a self-fashioning performance of English middle-class sensibility during the eighteenth century see, Vladimir Janković, *Confronting the Climate: British Airs and the Making of Environmental Medicine* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010).

Consequently, the first section shifts historiographical discussion of olfactory decline to a study of ontological change as opposed to one of material modification. Odor was less perceived in England, in Western European states, because rhetorical and semiotic shifts made specific goods less pungent as those goods were needed for the rise of the capitalist economy. Sulfur became more common in the environment, but connotations that defined the yellow rock's pungency as evil declined due to the force of the superstructure to shift meaning and sensory perception.⁹³

The second section, *Scenting the Atlantic: The Sensory Exotic in European Imagination*, accesses a vital historiography on sensory history that defines the American Revolution as partially born from a distancing between the rustic American rebel and the sensory esoteric British gentleman. In general, studies regarding sensory perception in colonial America develop from this paradigm shaped by historian Peter Charles Hoffer in *Sensory Worlds in Early America* (2005), which outlined the five senses through their significance in creating the American Revolution out of distortions away from English etiquette.⁹⁴

Following Hoffer, this section offers two chapters that focus on the changing aspects of Old World olfactory sensations as European noses entered New World environments and faced off against different conceptions of the scented environment as

⁹³ This first section therefore explores various aspects of the "disenchantment" thesis proposed by Max Weber and expanded within, Keith Thomas, *Religion and the Decline of Magic* (New York: Scribner, 1971). For materialism in the historical study of environmentalism, as portrayed through the reading of trial-and-error experiments with waste in the nineteenth century Rust Belt see, Joel Tarr, *The Search for the Ultimate Sink: Urban Pollution in Historical Perspective* (Akron, Ohio: University of Akron Press, 1996), esp. 7-35.

⁹⁴ Peter Charles Hoffer, *Sensory Worlds in Early America* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003), 189-251.

perceived by non-Western peoples.⁹⁵ From roughly the seventeenth century onward, European societies enhanced the ocular and systematized information, all which contributed to a tangential process of deodorization. In turn, aromatic sexuality, the acceptance of pungency in plants and foods, and the use of scents in medical treatment all decreased. In America, as opposed to within European metropolises, the process was considerably slower.⁹⁶

Chapter three, “‘Ravishing Odors of Paradise’,” shows, through a close reading of the *Jesuit Relations* and other French documents from the American interior, how Catholic traditions were inherently altered by indigenous practices of olfactory spirituality. This chapter portrays how French Jesuits of the seventeenth century were forced to increase their use of the lower senses in the practice of Catholicism in order to convert Native Americans to the Church. These Fathers of New France augmented their use of incense, their discussions of the odors to be encountered in hell, and their rhetorical applications of the odor of sanctity, whereby saints exuded floral aromas reminiscent of heaven. The chapter consequently situates Native American uses of odor as formative in the European retention of a pre-modern sense of smell in the New World. This Native American attachment further divided the incipient Protestant normative body from the sensual

⁹⁵ For the role of archeology in the recovery of material culture in urban environments of the Atlantic see, Bernard Herman, “The Poetics of Urban Space,” in *Material Culture in Anglo-America: Regional Identity and Urbanity in the Tidewater, Lowcountry, and Caribbean*, ed. David Shields (Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2009), 191-201.

⁹⁶ While Hoffer placed his paradigm in the political realm, as caused essentially by cultural changes and democratizing elements of the American experience, Stephen Shapiro argued that a “revolution of the senses” during the seventeenth century, which altered American “social manners,” was triggered by an increase in consumption of Caribbean produced stimulants. Stephen Shapiro, *The Culture and Commerce of the Early American Novel: Reading the Atlantic World-System* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2008), quotes on 42.

Catholic body. Accordingly, a liminal space of cultural contact developed in New France, wherein odor could be used for cross-cultural concordance, rather than implicit othering.⁹⁷

Chapter four of my project, “‘Delightful a Fragrance’,” offers the role botanical odors played in the making of Anglo-American resistance to the European Enlightenment. The continued use of odor in Anglo-American herbals and travel narratives, and the nearness to African and Native American olfactory traditions, provided colonial botanists in the thirteen colonies methodological arguments to resist Royal Society botanical methods that assumed vision should be the supreme arbiter of truth within botanical study.

These declarations, read through travel literatures that included botanical observations, passed into political motives, which later contributed to the ideal of the rustic American rebel. This chapter first defines changing uses of odor within early modern European botany; from a pre-modern sense of odor as valuable in vernacular studies of plants for dietary and medicinal use to a modernizing tone of the Enlightenment that asserted vision, topography, and empire against the use of aroma to define plants. The chapter then shows how Anglo-American writers like John and William Bartram, John Lawson, and Robert Beverley continued to apply the ultimate sense of proximity, smelling, as a means to mark their settler environments.

Colin Calloway has summarized that European travelers, “alone into Indian country and making their adobes in Indian villages...had to adapt to Indian ways...many lived in Indian lodges, ate Indian food, and traveled the seasonal round by canoe and snowshoe. They learned the native language, adapted their messages to suit Indian oratorical styles,

⁹⁷ For the construction of the American psyche as counter to the ideal of the noble savage, while still indulging in the idea of escaping into the nature of the frontier, see, Gaile McGregor, *The Noble Savage in the New World Garden: Notes toward a Syntactics of Place* (Toronto, Ont: University of Toronto Press, 1988), esp. 155-161.

and behaved as much as possible according to Indian protocol and cultural expectations.” To Calloway, early America was a mix of cultures where subtle changes left lasting imprints on European colonists.⁹⁸

Native American civilization included large cities and large populations. These nations often patterned social mores that Europeans followed when traveling in the interior. The indigenous world that eighteenth century botanical writers entered when moving into the early west was heavily populated. Within these communities, these herbalists showed their integration with nature and Native American culture rather than their dominance above a natural vacuum that was emptied of the ethnic enemy.⁹⁹ European colonials, especially on the frontier, sensed their newfound sexual, dietary, and wilderness world in divergent ways than their cousins in England who continued to desensitize their developing bourgeois sensory edifices.¹⁰⁰

Part three of this dissertation, *The Influence of Irrepressible Aroma*, exposes discourses on the aromatic othering of the African body that occurred during the Early

⁹⁸ Colin Calloway, *Dawnland Encounters: Indians and Europeans in Northern New England* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1991), quote on 60.

⁹⁹ Thomas Hallock, *From the Fallen Tree: Frontier Narratives, Environmental Politics, and the Roots of a National Pastoral, 1749-1826* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2003), esp. 29-33.

¹⁰⁰ For sensibility, sociability and the senses in the study of early America see the readings of discourse on the importance of emotionality to political discussions within, Nicole Eustace, *Passion Is the Gale: Emotion, Power, and the Coming of the American Revolution* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia by University of North Carolina Press, 2008), esp. 4-13, the emotionality of early American novels, analyzed through the release of “physic realism” of the “plight of the other” implicit in the growth of American sentimentality, especially in the 1790s, within, Julia Stern, *The Plight of Feeling: Sympathy and Dissent in the Early American Novel* (Chicago, Ill: University of Chicago Press, 1997), esp. 2-8, and the language of sentimentalism and sociability in the Anglo-Atlantic within, Norman Fiering, “Irresistible Compassion: An Aspect of Eighteenth-Century Sympathy and Humanitarianism,” *Journal of the History of Ideas* 37, 2 (1976): 195-218, and G. J. Barker-Benfield, *The Culture of Sensibility: Sex and Society in Eighteenth-Century Britain* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992).

Modern Era.¹⁰¹ Capitalism was born with slavery, kissing cousins hiding their embrace in a grand concert on Southern Plantations, upon West Indian Isles, in Brazilian Big Houses, and within the European metropole. The cyclical and incestuous relationship grew to incorporate the modern state that supports finance capital, but it was in the African body where capitalism was first discovered. The commodifying mechanisms that defined that body as property included the use of European perceptions, and Western discourses about proper aesthetics, that codified the African body as an animal to be bought and sold.¹⁰²

The Roman poet Juvenal asserted that money does not smell, but the commodified African body defies that very maxim. A stinking African, formed through hard labor and racist discourse, instituted capitalism by helping to create a later pecuniary system which truly did not smell, a system of numbers in space, of automated personalities who traded human souls on ships of wood and iron. Sensory identities justified the horrors of slavery by marking the African body as something that could be wasted as inherently surplus because of a rhetorically created pungency that equated the African form as excremental to European modernity.¹⁰³

¹⁰¹ For theoretical backgrounds for “othering” see, Edward Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1978). Much of the marking of the other involves the level of humanity that was attributed to different groups of peoples. These attributions involved smell as a means to mark hierarchies of what theorist Mel Chen has called “animacies.” These identities are defined by the language hierarchy in different cultures that defines the animate-ness of any matter or body. For Chen, the level of animacy, animation or non-static nature, of a person or object defines their value in a society. Thus, African American children in America are often deemed less animate than white children because they are deemed toxic and nearer to metal due to semiotic associations that attribute bodies with lead found in lower income housing. Mel Chen, *Animacies: Biopolitics, Racial Mattering, and Queer Affect* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012), esp. 1-20, 159-222.

¹⁰² For an interesting reading of how race making can directly relate to diet and the sensory experience of food see the racial categories of Ecuador within, Emily Walmsley, “Race, Place, and Taste, Making Identities through Sensory Experience,” *Etnofoor* 18, 1 (2005): 43-60.

¹⁰³ For an introduction to the capitalism and slavery debate to be explored in chapter five see, Sven Beckert and Seth Rockman, “Introduction. Slavery's Capitalism,” in *Slavery's Capitalism: a New History of American Economic Development*, ed. Sven Beckert and Seth Rockman (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016), 1-28.

Part three offers two chapters on how increasingly advantageous Europeans asserted this African other as pungent, while also providing a narrative of significant aromatic resistance from subaltern groups within the Atlantic littoral. Chapter five, “*Verscheibung Africanus*,” focuses on the early constructions of African odors, buried deep in the often gendered and sexualized ethnographical observations of European voyagers, the stereotypes of the English theatre, and within the fearful texts of the Reformation pulpit.

Chapter six, “The Sweet Smell of Vengeance,” offers aromatic resistance to states and churches that arose from antipodal considerations within African spiritualist traditions. Reading through observations about African spiritualism in Jamaican Obeah trials and African American’s responses to interviewers of the Federal Writers Project, this chapter shows how African ethnic traditions about the importance of odor were partially retained throughout the New World. Resisting the English literary construction, within plays, sermons, and children’s folklore, that asserted African bodies were inherently pungent, these Africans created olfactory “rival geographies” through retaining ethnically specific olfactory traditions that applied scented “weapons of the weak.” My conception of the “ethnogenetic olfactory” exposes how the early modern European conceptions of African bodies as pungent was used to define the slave system in the New World, and how ethnically diverse uses of odor by Africans helped to resist slavery.¹⁰⁴

This section describes how blackness began as an Elizabethan pre-text and became symbolic through the social construction of knowledge about how to experience

¹⁰⁴ For the similar role of science in the assertion of socially constructed bourgeois racial ideals see the analysis of phrenology in, Steven Shapin, “Homo Phrenologicus: Anthropological Perspectives on a Historical Problem,” in *Natural Order: Historical Studies of Scientific Culture*, ed. Barry Barnes and Steven Shapin (Beverly Hills, Calif: Sage Publications, 1979), 41-72, and the importance of the spirometer within, Lundy Braun, *Breathing Race into the Machine* (Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press, 2014).

encountering the African.¹⁰⁵ All societies use odor to solidify hierarchies through the senses. Most people do not notice their own scent or that of their group, but between groups smells are vital to perceiving the relative cleanliness, diet, and civility of an opposing ethnic group, economic assemblage, or social class. With the rise of capitalism, smelling became intersectionally ingrained in class and racial structures that defied stench increasingly through biological terms. Perceptions changed due to social structuring and rhetorical shifting, rather than solely from the materials of body odor.¹⁰⁶

Ethnic groups have always been classified, in part, through the sensory and the aromatic. The German natural historian Lorenz Oken once classified mankind through a sensory hierarchy whereupon the European was the ‘eye-man,’ the Asian the ‘ear-man,’ the Native American the ‘nose-man,’ the Australian the ‘tongue-man,’ and the African the ‘skin-man’.¹⁰⁷ Greeks, Egyptians, and Mesopotamians defined the classes of their society in the odors they deemed apparent. Similarly, Romans claimed they could smell a poor man by his polluting respiration, which could be metallic in nature due to the practice of

¹⁰⁵ For the relationship between European contact with the New World and the Scientific Revolution see, Joyce Oldham Appleby, *Shores of Knowledge: New World Discoveries and the Scientific Imagination* (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 2013), the shifting of the application of the story of Eden from sin to the search for knowledge, “adamic epistemology,” within, Joanna Picciotto, *Labors of Innocence in Early Modern England* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2010), esp. 87-104, and Albanese, *New Science, New World*.

¹⁰⁶ Classen, “Odor of the Other,” 137-140; Brown, *Foul Bodies*, 98-157. For an analogous example of othering see the reading of touch in the making of Goethe’s conception of the other within, Sander Gilman, *Inscribing the Other* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1991), esp. 36-42.

¹⁰⁷ Classen, “Foundation,” 405-408, quotes on 405 originally from Stephen Jay Gould, *The Flamingo’s Smile: Reflections in Natural History* (New York: Norton, 1985), 204-205. A *National Geographic* study from 1987 found that in different nations across the world diverse proportions of peoples identified different smells more effectively. In the United States, thirty-seven percent of men could not identify androstenone while in Africa, an area of more tribal distinction; only twenty-one percent could not smell the compound, Rodaway, *Sensuous Geographies*, 74-76. For a deeper analysis of the *National Geographic* survey within a reading of odors, evolution, and bonding, see James Vaughn Kohl and Robert Francoeur, *The Scent of Eros: Mysteries of Odor in Human Sexuality* (New York: Continuum, 1995), 169-173.

the underprivileged carrying coins in their mouths.¹⁰⁸ Such scentful perceptions sustained racial and gendered lines as well. In Suyá culture of the Amazon, women are perceived as pungent, not simply because of biological smell, but because women are given lower status in Suyá society.¹⁰⁹ In some African cattle cultures, pastoralists are positively aromatic within their society the more they smell of cow urine, patties, and the feed of their wealth bearing occupation.¹¹⁰

In sensory studies of slavery, numerous authors described forms of slave resistance through sensory worlds. Shane White and Graham White portrayed slaves' outward expression of sensory values as confrontation. Black outward expression through clothing often subverted the enslaver's culture through resistance to the white blandness of linen.¹¹¹ African hair styles may have similarly represented individual resistance to cultural

¹⁰⁸ Classen, *Aroma*, esp. 35-45; Robert Parker, *Miasma: Pollution and Purification in Early Greek Religion* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1983). Kelvin Low and James McHugh's work on East Asia can also be instructive when analyzing discourses on the odor of the other. Low analyzes smelling as a cultural construction that inherently marks the self and the other. Kelvin Low, "Ruminations on Smell as a Sociocultural Phenomenon," *Current Sociology* 53, 3 (2005): 397-417; Kelvin Low, *Scents and Scent-Sibilities: Smell and Everyday Life Experiences* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Pub, 2009). McHugh shows the vast uses for scent in Indian religion and culture, including the smell of religious perfumes and dietary offerings to bring the self and other closer together, to overcome continuing orientalism in the study of East Asia. James McHugh, "Seeing Scents: Methodological Reflections on the Intersensory Perception of Aromatics in South Asian Religions," *History of Religions* 51, 2 (2011): 156-177; James McHugh, *Sandalwood and Carrion: Smell in Premodern Indian Religion and Culture* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013).

¹⁰⁹ Classen, "Odor of the Other," 138-147. Humans are not "hardwired" to like or dislike any odors because the ability to adapt was necessary in formative eons. Because organisms needed "chemotaxis," the ability to respond to and avoid threats, the evolutionary tract of organisms needed to transfer their chemotaxis to new organisms, but those new organisms would need to understand their threats differently and therefore build new concepts of predator and prey. As such, smells were forced, evolutionarily, to be adaptable to new conditions. Rachel Herz, "I Know What I Like; Understanding Odor Preferences," in *The Smell Culture Reader*, ed. Jim Drobnick (Oxford: Berg, 2006), 193-203.

¹¹⁰ Van Beek, "The Dirty Smith," 38-58. For a deeper reading of sensory reasoning in tribal societies see the specific reasoning activates that occur around major life moments within, Franz Klaus Jansen, "Sense-Oriented Reasoning at Three Progressive Levels in Tribal and Modern Societies," *Philosophy Study* 2, 8 (2012): 579-593.

¹¹¹ Shane White and Graham White, *Stylin': African American Expressive Culture from Its Beginnings to the Zoot Suit* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1998), 1-84. For more on racial discourse see the connections between white clothing and slave bodies within, Brown, *Foul Bodies*, 42-117.

annihilation; through the shaving of heads or the increased use of styling most likely born of ethnic memory of an African past where bare heads, braiding, and the threading of hair was common prior to European slave trading.¹¹²

In *The Sounds of Slavery* (2005), Shane and Graham White also discussed the sensory resistance of slaves as dependent on cultural memory of Africa. Numerous slaves found horror in the soundscapes of their slave environments.¹¹³ However, slaves also resisted attempts at domination of their soundscape through the use of calls, songs, and psalms.¹¹⁴ Slave calls specifically were similar to noise in “the West African-ring, the center of communal life and locus of culture-affirming movement.” These noises and dances represented, “not merely a time-honored African and African-American means of communication but deep seated cultural memory.”¹¹⁵

To be able to define the other as dirty, as improper, as pollution, marked the culture of Europe that developed upon the Atlantic littoral.¹¹⁶ Rhetoric of pestilence moved the

¹¹² White, *Stylin*, esp. 56-60. Similar analysis of outward use of African retention of style and clothing as resistance in the antebellum South within, Helen Bradley Foster, *New Raiments of Self: African American Clothing in the Antebellum South* (Oxford: Berg, 1997), esp. 18-74.

¹¹³ Shane White and Graham White, *The Sounds of Slavery: Discovering African American History Through Songs, Sermons, and Speech* (Boston: Beacon Press, 2005), 5-9.

¹¹⁴ For the master’s culture of sound and the desire for quietude among slaves see, Mark Smith, *Listening to Nineteenth-Century America* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2001). Lauri Ramey discussed that captives’ songs similarly recorded the “ability to overcome adversity and illuminate the strength of slave society in achieving unprecedented cultural production under circumstances of dire repression.” Lauri Ramey, *Slave Songs and the Birth of African American Poetry* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), quote on xviii.

¹¹⁵ White, *Sounds of Slavery*, 24-34; Renee Harrison, *Enslaved Women and the Art of Resistance in Antebellum America* (New York: Palgrave, Macmillan, 2009), quote on 204-205. For a similar tradition in Jamaica, which described the specific way the sounds of chants were made, see, Leonard Barrett, *The Sun and the Drum: African Roots in Jamaican Folk Tradition* (Kingston, Jamaica: Sangster's Book Stores, 1976), esp. 56-57, and the creolized tones explored within, Richard Cullen Rath, “Drums and Power: Ways of Creolizing Music in Coastal South Carolina and Georgia, 1730-99,” in *Creolization in the Americas*, ed. David Buisseret and Steven Reinhardt (College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 2000), 99-130.

¹¹⁶ For links between touch and smell, as both lower senses associated to people classified as often lower on the social hierarchy see, Constance Classen, *The Deepest Sense: A Cultural History of Touch* (Urbana:

European body out of an epidemic past of plagues, sulfur, and poxes into the cleanliness of modernity through a striking policy of rhetorical deodorization that defined the other as stinking.¹¹⁷ In summary, the first section of this dissertation exposes patterns of olfactory decline through linguistic manipulation in the core. The second section exposes how that decline could not happen with the encounters of the Atlantic World due to the necessity of marking the sameness and otherness of novel objects and hierarchically defined bodies. The third section explores how odor decline became a significant aspect of racialization that removed odor from the increasingly homogenized metropole through placing smell upon the sexualized, deviant, and aromatically inborn African other.¹¹⁸

The idea of what is deemed the excrement of modernity appropriates the world both physically and symbolically, through the marking of one's property through the improper.¹¹⁹ Marking the proper with the inappropriate is the process of appropriation. The

University of Illinois Press, 2012), esp. 69-75.

¹¹⁷ For the philosophical idea that pestilence is marked upon the other, as a means of removing pollution from the self and same, as a process to assert utopian ideals of progress see, Elana Gomel, "The Plague of Utopias: Pestilence and the Apocalyptic Body," *Twentieth-Century Literature* 46, 4 (2000): 405-433.

¹¹⁸ In several cultures, smell penetrated initial sexual identifications between two peoples enough to give rise to language idiomatically. In southern India, a greeting previously equated to "give me a kiss" in the Western world is precisely transliterated as "give me a smell." In Burma, smell is the same word as "greet." Persians use the identical word for smell to define yearning and love, and in French loving, feeling, and smelling all derived from the verb "sentir." This use of the nose in sexuality is a multi-staged process. Initially, scenting determines attractiveness, one then detects an aroma of social similarity to oneself, and finally, specific sexual attraction starts when the smell of the sexual organs and sweat entering the nasal passages creates psychological attraction. Janet Hopson, *Scent Signals: The Silent Language of Sex* (New York: Morrow, 1979), 29-30 and 128-143; Rachel Herz, *The Scent of Desire: Discovering Our Enigmatic Sense of Smell* (New York: William Morrow, 2007); P. A. Vroon, Anton van Amerongen, and Hans de Vries. *Smell: The Secret Seducer* (New York: Farrar, Straus & Giroux, 1997). For a reading of Freud's sources in the anthropology of Bronislaw Malinkowski see, David Howes, "Freud's Nose: The Repression of Nasality and the Origin of Psychoanalytical Theory," in *Nose Book: Representations of the Nose in Literature and the Arts*, ed. Victoria De Rijke, Lene Oestermarck-Johansen, and Helen Thomas (London: Middlesex University Press, 2000), 265-282.

¹¹⁹ As Marcel Proust elegantly surmised in his work on childhood romance, modern Westerners have also have an inherent positive olfactory sense of the past. Jonah Lehrer, *Proust Was a Neuroscientist* (Edinburgh: Canongate, 2011), esp. 79-81; A. T. Winterbourne, "Is Oral and Olfactory Art Possible?" *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 15, 2 (Apr., 1981): 95-102, esp. 100-102; Caro Verbeek and Cretien van Campen, "Inhaling

right to dirty something, to make it improper, is the human assertion of ownership. As Michel Serres noted: “The more wealth a man or a collectivity amasses, the more noise they make, soft but also hard; the louder the noise and the racket, the further their visual and acoustic productions or excrements will spread, the more hard power they have. Their images, smells, and voices reach far.”¹²⁰

Serres explored this concept in *The Parasite* (1982). Those who are able to mark their territory, human or animal, are those that can access spaces of power through the associated marking of what is considered waste. The ability to expand odors, the stercoral, places the self in a place of power, to mark their own private space. Serres theorized: “The first one who, having shit on a terrain, then decided to say, this is mine, immediately found people who were disgusted enough to believe him. They distanced themselves from his territory, without war or treaty.”¹²¹

Serres continued: “This can be translated into: the world is my marked territory; the world is my diarrhea. Among good idealists, the privileged are those that come out of their bodies. Saliva, blood, urine, sweat, vomit, and sperm, other such defecations. These

Memories: Smell and Taste Memories in Art, Science, and Practice," *Senses and Society* 8, 2 (2013): 133-148; Paul Stoller, *The Taste of Ethnographic Things: The Senses in Anthropology* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1989), esp. 8-25.

¹²⁰ Michel Serres, and Anne-Marie Feenberg-Dibon, *Malfeasance: Appropriation through Pollution?* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2011), 1-6, quote on 46-47; Mary Douglas, *Purity and Danger; an Analysis of Concepts of Pollution and Taboo* (New York: Praeger, 1966).

¹²¹ Michel Serres, and Lawrence Schehr, *The Parasite* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1982), 142-145, quotes on 144. In some ways, what this dissertation often describes is essentially a form of prosopopoeia, the making of a metaphor into an ideal. Desmond Manderson has recently described this diachronic cultural tactic: “The rhetoric of immigration-as-dirt is an example of prosopopoeia, in which the metaphorical idea of pollution is treated as if it were literally true. From a symbolic understanding, in which immigrants are taken to represent pollution, we move quickly to a situation in which they are treated as if they were an actual sign or symptom of pollution.” Desmond Manderson, “Senses and Symbols: The Construction of Drugs in Historic and Aesthetic Perspective,” in *Law and the Senses: Sensational Jurisprudence*, ed. Lionel Bently and Leo Flynn (London: Pluto Press, 1996), 199-216, quote on 203.

dejecta that mark the terrain with their ink make them imperialist owners.”¹²² As Mary Douglas wrote, to be able to define the other as dirty, as improper, as pollution, marks the culture of Western Europe: “In the mind we choose which stimuli to put the most value on depending on our cultural values placed on certain semiotic relationships. After a period of time, the original creations of value, which alter perceptions, become ingrained and conservative in the ideals of a culture.”¹²³

The smells of the Atlantic pulled this dissertation in many different directions. Like the *flanuer* wandering the calm streets of Paris that bubbled beneath with the cacophonous tones of revolutionary sentiment, this project was lugged to the underground study of stinking foods, of perfume, of body odor, of buried shit.¹²⁴ Like in Corbin’s Paris, within the Atlantic littoral different groups were classified in diametric oppositions to other ethnic and class assemblies for forms of economic necessity that marked certain bodies as excrement, culminating in the creation of a progressive tautology that linked “Africa” and “waste” in a semantic hendiadys born of capitalist licentiousness.¹²⁵

Most of these aromatic shifts were for ideological reasons that worked within the

¹²² Serres, *The Parasite*, 142-145, quotes on 145. For a reading of the parasite in the semiotics of the toilet literature of John Harrington see, Julian Yates, *Error, Misuse, Failure: Object Lessons from the English Renaissance* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2003), esp. 67-100. And, for the history of the Harrington toilet as a transgressive space within a study of material culture and the rise of shame in Western society see, Gail Kern Paster, “The Epistemology of the Water Closet: John Harrington’s Metamorphosis of Ajax and Elizabethan Technologies of Shame,” in *Material Culture and Cultural Materialisms*, ed. Curtis Perry (Turnhout: Brepols Publishers, 2001), 139-158.

¹²³ Douglas, *Purity and Danger*, 36-37, quote on 36. For historiography on Douglas and the idea that pollution is “matter out of place” see, William Cohen, “Locating Filth,” in *Filth: Dirt, Disgust, and Modern Life*, ed. William Cohen and Ryan Johnson (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), vii-xxxvii.

¹²⁴ For the sensory worlds of the touring *flanuer* see, Aimée Boutin, *City of Noise: Sound and Nineteenth-Century Paris* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2015), esp. 5-9.

¹²⁵ For the lack of ordering principles within the study of the olfactory as read through a history of the decline of odor in modernity see, William McCartney, *Olfaction and Odours; An Osphrésiological Essay* (Berlin: Springer-Verlag, 1968), esp. 1-15.

superstructure to justify changes in the base that occurred with the primitive accumulation of labor.¹²⁶ In the space between the constructions of such false pecuniary reality and local knowledge lays the primordial expanse for morality, praxis, and change to take hold; the place for ethics to evolve.¹²⁷ In a search for those counter-hegemonic ethics, this dissertation exposes that the fear of encountering what was abjected deep within the European body, odor and the pungency of the other, was emitted like excrement out of the Western metropolitan self into the freshly dug outhouse of the mass slave grave called the Atlantic World.¹²⁸

¹²⁶ For the covering over of the other into the same after the birth of modernity with the contact with the New World see, Enrique Dussel and Michael Barber, *The Invention of the Americas: Eclipse of "the Other" and the Myth of Modernity* (New York: Continuum, 1995), esp. 25-57.

¹²⁷ Michel de Certeau, *Heterologies: Discourse on the Other* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986), esp. 200-215. For the idea that scarcity and want define the sensory regime used to mark spatiality see, Erwin Straus, *Man, Time, and World: Two Contributions to Anthropological Psychology* (Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press, 1982), esp. 143-164.

¹²⁸ For debates on the importance of self-interest and individualism in historiography about the Renaissance, see the critique of self-fashioning within, Douglas Biow, *On the Importance of Being an Individual in Renaissance Italy: Men, Their Professions, and Their Beards* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015), esp. x-xii.

Chapter 1

The Devil's Element:

Cultural Constructions of Metaphorical Brimstone and Sulfuric Instrumentality in Early Modern England

When the traveling chronicler Ranulf Higden summarized the ubiquitous presence of pungent sulfur warming underneath his much-treasured English countryside in the celebrated *Polychronicon* (1387), the monastic scholar noted numerous stenchful baths created through sulfuric founts that “wassheth” the many “poores and skabbis” of his home island’s inhabitants. He continued by noting the comparatively intense sulfuric smells he encountered in specific northern English baths, which through their “savour and...smelle” cleansed the pores of numerous infirm Anglo bodies. Higden encountered sulfur in the English environment in relatively positive manners. His classifications of the olfactory encounters provided by the rock, unlike the classifications of the scent for most of his fellow Englishpersons in the two centuries to follow, were consistently progressive, harkening to the possible uses of sulfur for personal well-being.¹

On most occasions when Englishpersons encountered the pungency of sulfur on later European and Atlantic landscapes from the time of Higden to the Enlightenment, their first mindful associations triggered by the odor, which could be provided through numerous environmental, agricultural, and bodily productions, were to the scents of hell they understood as sulfuric. The English learned of this sulfuric smell of the lake of fire from their readings of the *Book of Revelations*, translations of Dante’s *Inferno* and other Christian literature, or what they heard from fire and brimstone preachers. Many references to the yellow rock’s stench after the English Reformation expanded these sulfuric associations to numerous of the devil’s creations, especially witches, demons, and ghosts on earth.²

¹ Ranulf Higden, *Here Endeth the Discripcion of Britayne* (Westminster: William Caxton, 1480), quotes on 6-7.

² For historical works on sulfur see, Gerald Kutney, *Sulfur: History, Technology, Applications & Industry*

Despite these ardent religious beliefs, numerous early modern writers increasingly articulated sulfur through non-religious associations. Several natural philosophers, alchemists, physicians, and state officials gradually found vast new progressive uses for sulfur, which offered a significant challenge to the discursively dominant sensory categorizations that placed sulfur's smell as inherently signifying evil when encountered in worldly environments. This section analyzes the changing quotients of diachronic meanings for "sulfur" to show how the market for sulfuric goods ruined religious voices ability to define the yellow metal through religious metaphors alone.³

Most historical literature that describes the decline of odor in Europe discusses how specific pungent materials were removed from European environments. These analyses often focus on the cleansing of increasingly private spaces, the introduction of sewage projects, and the rise of the sense of sight as a marker of power and space. I follow these historiographical guidelines, but expand the discussion through contributing that the physical perception of smelling declined significantly further because of changes in the use of language and the shifting of consciousness about what was deemed polluted, dirty, or wasteful.⁴

The accumulative dividing of the senses from a more synesthetic medieval past occurred through a displacement of odor within early modern Europe. The ancient

(Toronto: ChemTec Publishing, 2013), Salomon Bernard Kroonenberg and Andy Brown, *Why Hell Stinks of Sulfur: Mythology and Geology of the Underworld* (London: Reaktion Books, 2013), esp. 5-34, and Alice Turner, *The History of Hell* (New York: Harcourt Brace, 1993).

³ For analysis of sulfuric violence upon the senses see, Karen Holmberg, "The Sound of Sulfur and the Smell of Lightning," in *Making Senses of the Past: Toward a Sensory Archaeology*, edited by Jo Day (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2013), 49-68.

⁴ For a counter-argument, see the recent reading of the materials of olfactory quackery during the late Enlightenment within, Carolyn Purnell, *The Sensational Past: How the Enlightenment Changed the Way We Use Our Senses* (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 2017), esp. 102-122.

Arcadian reliance on sight returned to Europe after the Renaissance, which added to the dislocation of the lower senses from their central place within the medieval Church. However, it was not the specific removal of pungent goods that created the greater proportion of olfactory declension. Rather, pungency was removed through shifting semantic connotations that altered biological sensation through hegemonic and biopolitical mechanisms of language and social ordering.

My analysis of sulfur specifically adds popular illustrations, phenomenological shifts, and technological contours to the process, articulated by Stephen Greenblatt in *Shakespearean Negotiations* (1988) and *Hamlet in Purgatory* (2002), through which sacred metaphors were emptied of their religious meanings during the late sixteenth century and then re-engaged as popular fancy for public consumption.⁵ As Fredric Jameson argued in his analysis of the artwork of Renaissance polymath Paul Rubens: “With modernity and secularization, religion falls into the realm of the social, the realm of differentiation. It becomes one world-view among others, one specialization among many: an activity to be promoted and sold on the market.” Jameson specifically showed how religious languages increasingly lost their universalizing role as readings of the image of Christ’s body were emptied of many totalizing meanings through different forms of theatrical staging rather than sacred reverence and fear. The rise of differing forms of metaphor, the construction of literature as artwork through narrative tropes and political allegory, altered the static body of Christ into a malleable form to be manipulated for

⁵ Stephen Greenblatt, *Shakespearean Negotiations: The Circulation of Social Energy in Renaissance England* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), esp. 112-127; Stephen Greenblatt, *Hamlet in Purgatory* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton, 2002), esp. 141-143.

secular and aesthetic revenue.⁶ Similar changes altered other aspects of religious culture as the previously static became gradually more malleable. In the movement from a religious culture of multisensory experience to the fetishized religion of emptied spiritual metaphors, perceptions of previously religious experiences became less embodied, less significant, and less sacred.⁷

Jonathan Gil Harris studied the sensory construction of the play *Macbeth* (1606) to show that the use of sulfuric squibs in the production (fireworks set off during performances), signaled to the audience the presence of hell as well as the Gunpowder Plot of 1605. To Harris, the auteur Shakespeare created a scent of sulfur, through fireworks, to signify to his audience all of the sensory associations sulfur contained. Shakespearean audiences encountering the smell would instantly be reminded of the Gunpowder Plot, the smell of the devil, and the anti-Catholic sentiment associated to both. Harris's analysis of radical political objectives on the Shakespearean stage examined the myriad complexities of power and audience agency in sulfur's synchronic meanings.⁸ As well, Emily Friedman

⁶ Fredric Jameson, *The Ancients and the Postmoderns* (London; New York: Verso, 2015), esp. 3-30. Even as Protestant artists and playwrights evoked and perpetuated iconoclasm to critique and destroy Roman papacy in England, they had to use Catholic religious traditions to do so. Their critiques would have been worthless if they did not have these traditional forms as a basis for critique. Thus, they invented a more skeptical form of seeing the world rather than destroy all worldly perception as Catholic falsehood. Huston Diehl, *Staging Reform, Reforming the Stage: Protestantism and Popular Theater in Early Modern England* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1997), 38-46.

⁷ For the history of how the odors of heaven and hell were created on the stage see the reading of late medieval plays within, Rory Critten and Annette Kern-Stähler, "The Theatre as Sensory Experience: Smell in the York Corpus Christi Plays," in *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, ed. Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer (Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016), 239-268, the many examples of stenchful hell within, Thomas Seiler, "Filth and Stench as Aspects of the Iconography of Hell," in *The Iconography of Hell*, ed. Clifford Davidson and Thomas Seiler (Kalamazoo, MI, Western Michigan University, 1992), 132-140, and the references to the sulfuric odors of hell within, Piero Camporesi, *The Fear of Hell: Images of Damnation and Salvation in Early Modern Europe* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1991), esp. 76-80, and Constance Classen, *The Deepest Sense: A Cultural History of Touch* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2012), esp. 47-70.

⁸ Jonathan Gil Harris, *Untimely Matter in the Time of Shakespeare* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009), esp. 125-128, and Jonathan Gil Harris, "The Smell of Macbeth," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 58, 4

has recently analyzed the associations for sulfur in the eighteenth century public sphere. Her examination declares that sulfur involved diverse meanings within eighteenth century literature. Encountering sulfur in a text or on a stage, for Friedman, included many multivalent meanings related to the health of baths or the scents of hell.⁹ Like Harris and Friedman, I also analyze connotations for sulfur. However, in the wake of Jameson, Greenblatt, and earlier works by Max Weber, I offer a diachronic and causal argument that portrays disenchantment as a vital causal force for modernity.¹⁰

Put another way, this analysis focuses on how the meanings of sulfur shifted over time, rather than how those connotations existed with many multivalent meanings in different synchronic moments. Rather than analyze sulfur through these synchronic means based in looking back upon the past from the Shakespearean theatre or from the Age of Revolutions, this section attends to the process through which sulfur's meanings changed over time for not only the Shakespearean stage, but for the shifting collective sensory ontology of the Tudor and Stuart eras.¹¹ As a result, this section adds to earlier analyses by

(2007): 465-486. For the role of material culture in Shakespeare's productions, which explored the historical memory of his audience through a "material logic" to expose places where language could not fully universalize a concept, see, Catherine Richardson, *Shakespeare and Material Culture* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), esp. 193-196.

⁹ Emily Friedman, *Reading Smell in Eighteenth-Century Fiction* (Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2016), esp. 100-118.

¹⁰ For similar work that exposes the malleability of Catholic traditions to fit into Protestant practice see the reading of the emotional content of German sermons within, Susan Karant-Nunn, *The Reformation of Feeling: Shaping the Religious Emotions in Early Modern Germany* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), esp. 62-69, and the role anti-Catholic print culture within Arthur Marotti, *Religious Ideology and Cultural Fantasy: Catholic and Anti-Catholic Discourses in Early Modern England* (Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 2005), esp. 131-202.

¹¹ For resistance to the secularization theories described throughout this work, see the persistent use of corporeal metaphors related to the feminine nature of Christ in, Caroline Walker Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987), and the importance of Christianity to later secular concepts of "human rights" in, Larry Siedentop, *Inventing the Individual: The Origins of Western Liberalism* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2014).

exposing the shapes and forms of a longer process of secularization wherein Shakespeare's metonymic use of sulfur was part of an emerging ironic canon that deemphasized religious meanings and increasingly emptied English bodies and environments of the burden of religious metaphors. Applying the causal importance of capital, this section expands earlier arguments for the connotations of sulfur through a reading of change over time that spans centuries and involves the market-oriented "disenchantment of the world."¹²

If sulfur contained the sensory characteristics of hell in sixteenth-century England: boiling heat to the touch, crackling noise to the ears, stinking odor to the nose, burning radiation to the eyes, and biting spoiled taste to the tongue, why was it allowed to increasingly permeate the English sensorium, the culturally educated five sense hierarchy, through the work of alchemists, physicians, and the military?¹³ How did the rock's odor, which since the High Middle Ages had overtly signified hell, become a marker of modernity through scientific and medical progress?¹⁴ Why were alchemists not demons,

¹² For more challenges to theses related to the secularization of the body and its metaphors in early modern Europe see, Jennifer Elizabeth Waldron, *Reformations of the Body: Idolatry, Sacrifice, and Early Modern Theater* (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), esp. 8-13, and the spatial analysis of settlement that followed the Calvinist "disenchantment of the world" as a means of constructing community solidarity within the changing markets of early modern France in, Natalie Zemon Davis, "The Sacred and the Body Social in Sixteenth-Century Lyon," *Past & Present* 90 (1980): 40-70, esp. 58-68.

¹³ For the multisensory assault of hell as understood partly through a reading of the devil's farts and sulfuric brimstone see, Richard Newhauser, "The Multisensoriality of Place and the Chaucerian Multisensual," in *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, ed. Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer (Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016), 199-218.

¹⁴ For the role of capitalism in the making of waste materials, and the increasing acceptance of waste materials in daily life in early modern England see the role of memory in the desire to retain the superfluous within, Sophie Gee, *Making Waste: Leftovers and the Eighteenth-Century Imagination* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2010), esp. 35-41, and for the importance of instrumentality in the acceptance of science during the Early Modern Era see, Peter Dear, *The Intelligibility of Nature: How Science Makes Sense of the World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006).

physicians not warlocks, and armies who smelled of hell due to gunpowder's sulfuric odor not of the inferno?¹⁵

Definitions for sulfur's scent increasingly became secular through the output of the myriad publishing houses lining the seventeenth century Thames.¹⁶ Though much of the English population remained illiterate during this era, changing definitions of sulfur's scent disseminated to the English masses through everyday encounters with the odor in emerging English marketplaces. As well, most written works during the Early Modern Era were read aloud, and thus spread to all who could hear their words in the coffeehouses and town centers of the developing English public sphere.¹⁷

These educative English social contexts of secularization defined different sensory classifications to each individual encountering the scent of sulfur in the environment. English cultural knowledge of something that was a sensible, like sulfur, included linguistic signifiers (reading of sulfur in a text or hearing of sulfur through the spoken word) and environmental signifiers (scenting, tasting, touching, hearing, or seeing material sulfur in the sensescape). These myriad signifiers were determined by power relationships that defined cultural connotations for sensations. What sensing sulfur inferred to Englishpersons changed as language transformed through an era of altering inflections of state, religious, and market power.¹⁸

¹⁵ For alchemists smelling like sulfur see, Christopher Lehrich, *The Language of Demons and Angels: Cornelius Agrippa's Occult Philosophy* (Leiden: Brill, 2003), esp. 82-83.

¹⁶ For material culture and everyday practice see, James Deetz, *In Small Things Forgotten: The Archaeology of Early American Life* (Garden City, N.Y.: Anchor Press/Doubleday, 1977), esp. 6-8, and Simon Bronner, "The Idea of the Folk Artifact," in *American Material Culture and Folklife: A Prologue and Dialogue*, ed. Simon Bronner (Ann Arbor, Mich.: UMI Research Press, 1985), 3-46, quote on 13.

¹⁷ For examples of the common practice of books read aloud see, Stephen Dobranski, *Readers and Authorship in Early Modern England* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2005), esp. 47-49.

¹⁸ For more on the cultural and materialist construction of the senses applied here see, Louise Joy Lawrence,

It became necessary in the London of the Enlightenment to make objects that were filthy and smelly part of daily life because waste was an essential aspect of the rise of the capitalist economy and the early Industrial Revolution. However, England was also undergoing a vast deodorization process that involved links between odor and disease, and included redolent acknowledgement that odors of the other signified evil. How was English culture to equate the waste of early industrialization with the deodorization project that was vital in the assertion of English bodies as pure upon the world's stage?

Literature made specific wastes and trashes acceptable through shifting rhetoric about sensing, as "filth was necessary to opulence and might." English writers made sulfur's smells less evil and more acceptable by minimizing the influence of those odors on English noses. The deodorization of the West occurred through rhetoric that changed biological perceptions, not solely through the removal of scented materials, as pungent goods and stinking waste were essential for modern economies.¹⁹ Therefore, this is fundamentally a section about subconscious changes that occur within structural rhetoric about the meanings of filthiness and what was deemed polluted or unclean.²⁰ Like

Sense and Stigma in the Gospels: Depictions of Sensory-Disabled Characters (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), esp. 10-12, and Mark Smith, *Sensing the Past: Seeing, Hearing, Smelling, Tasting, and Touching in History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007), esp. 133-138. As Sergeij Tokarev has described for methods of applied anthropology: "A material object cannot interest the ethnographer unless he considers its social existence, its relationship to man-to the person who created it and the person who makes use of it." Sergeij Tokarev, "Toward a Methodology for the Ethnographic Study of Material Culture," in *American Material Culture and Folklife: A Prologue and Dialogue*, ed. Simon Bronner (Ann Arbor, Mich: UMI Research Press, 1985), 77-101, quote on 79.

¹⁹ For a reading of Mandeville's *Fable of Bees* within this tradition of increasingly accepting an unclean society for the making of capitalist progress see, G. J. Barker-Benfield, *The Culture of Sensibility: Sex and Society in Eighteenth-Century Britain* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), quote on 120.

²⁰ For debates on ideas of sensory "sweetness" in early modern England as altered by the rise of new markets and the discourse on corruption see, Richard Newhauser, "John Gower's Sweet Tooth," *The Review of English Studies* 64, 267 (2013): 752-769.

Elizabeth Shove's work on the birth and maintenance of cleanliness in the West, I expose how "new practices become normal" through changing meanings in what Arjun Appadurai has termed the "social life of things."²¹

Whether sniffing the shit-laced smell of Newgate Church in the poverty stricken capitol which "no man could abide," suffering through the malevolent odors produced by tanners, butchers, prostitutes, and dogs in the alleys of Manchester, Bath, or Oxford, or becoming odoriferously disoriented due to the miasmic plagues stinking up from beneath a circle of lawyers in sixteenth century Exeter, Englishpersons faced an unrelenting siege of sulfur, dirt, and pungency during the Early Modern Era.²² To cure these pungent ills, England began a vast deodorization process. Most Englishpersons from the time of Higden to approximately 1600 encountering the scents of sulfur on dark and muddy village roads believed the scent to be a signifier of evil within the environment. As the seventeenth century closed, malevolently defined pungent encounters implying evil became less frequent, ironically as sulfur became more prevalent in ordinary English life.²³

By 1700, religious narratives that defined sulfur's smell as the presence of hell in the lived environment faded within England proper. During the 1700s, the idea of hell and

²¹ Elizabeth Shove, *Comfort, Cleanliness and Convenience: The Social Organization of Normality* (Oxford, England: Berg, 2003), esp. 4-9, 21-41, quote on 9; Arjun Appadurai, *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988).

²² Thomas Beard and Thomas Taylor, *The Theatre of Gods Judgements: Wherein Is Represented the Admirable Justice of God against All Notorious Sinners, Great and Small, Specially against the Most Eminent Persons in the World, Whose Exorbitant Power Had Broke Through the Barres of Divine and Humane Law* (London: S. I. & M. H, 1648), quote on 41-42; Manchester, Bath, and Oxford within, Emily Cockayne, *Hubbub: Filth, Noise & Stench in England 1600-1770* (New Haven [Conn.]: Yale University Press, 2007), esp. 41-43, 166-168, and 210-212; anecdote of lawyers in Exeter within, John Hooker, *The Ancient History and Description of the City of Exeter* (Exeter: Andrews and Trewman, 1765), 115-117.

²³ For the argument that modernity of the Renaissance included magic as an important aspect in the transition from religious to scientific justifications of knowledge see, D. P. Walker, *Spiritual and Demonic Magic: From Ficino to Campanella* (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1975), esp. 15, 45-46, 84.

its torments was openly questioned. Only a century before, such questioning was nearly non-existent. This change in the meanings of encountering sulfur's smells was partly due to the ubiquity of sulfur in the environment at the time, caused by the rising importance of science, alchemy, and gunpowder. This ubiquity made it more difficult, and essentially absurd, for historical actors to continue to associate most encounters with sulfur as the environmental presence of evil.²⁴

Similarly consequential, religious voices were gradually less capable of defining sulfur's smell as wicked. The evolving powerlessness of religious opinions to define sulfur as signifying the sinful during the seventeenth century was largely because popular literature turned the smell of sulfur into a metaphor to maliciousness, ugliness, emotional pain, and military prowess, rather than principally an environmental signifier of hell on earth. Although this process was never mutually exclusive, proportional shifts moved the connotations for encountering sulfur towards the secularly benign and away from the religiously engaged. Chapter one explores the contexts of sulfur as a religious evil that was shifted upon the New World. Chapter two discovers how that shifting allowed for different connotations for sulfur to develop on the English stage of the seventeenth century as a means of weakening sulfuric links to evil due to the need for sulfuric smells to enter English society at a higher proportion during the Industrial Revolution. These analyses essentially rely on discourse theory, specifically on what Paula Backscheider describes as the "hegemonic apparatus" of the early modern theatre that was "used to influence a critical

²⁴ D. P. Walker, *The Decline of Hell; Seventeenth-Century Discussions of Eternal Torment* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1964), esp. 3-5, 19-58. For a reading of exorcism as a discourse performed upon the English body see the contest for authority within, Marcus Harnes, "The Devil and Bishops in Post-Reformation England," in *Supernatural and Secular Power in Early Modern England*, ed. Marcus Harnes and Victoria Bladen (Farnham, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2015), 185-206.

public in order to legitimate” the ideology of capitalism and progress.²⁵

“Hideous Flame, Stinking of Sulphure”: Hellish Scents in Early Modern England

Religious descriptions defining the devil’s element as emitting the hellish “noisom stench of sulphur,” which sprung from what Anglican preacher Lewis Bayly described as the “sulphurous mouth of the bottomless pit, gaping to receive thee” proportionately dominated secular definitions for sulfur before the seventeenth century.²⁶ Englishmen attributed specifically sulfuric pungency to hell through knowledge they learned from Christian authors of the Middle Ages who summarized the place of sulfur’s odor beneath the earthen crust through travel narratives of hell that leaned on interpretations learned from the Old Testament, especially within Isaiah 30:33, through readings of the *Book of Revelations*, and within Roman traditions of Hades.²⁷

These olfactory identities often emerged from ancient tomes. The fifth century Eastern European monk John Cassian described smelling sulfur while at study as the presence of evil in the library where he often transcribed. For Cassian, Demons would

²⁵ For how texts, especially of the stage, can be used to influence the public as a hegemonic apparatus see, Paula Backscheider, *Spectacular Politics: Theatrical Power and Mass Culture in Early Modern England* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993), quote on 65.

²⁶ Lewis Bayly, *The Practice of Piety: Directing a Christian How to Walk, That He May Please God* (London: D. Midwinter, 1711), quotes on 58-62.

²⁷ For introductions to religion and scenting see, Suzanne Evans, “The Scent of a Martyr,” *Numen* 49, 2 (2002): esp. 198-207, Susan Ashbrook Harvey, *Scenting Salvation: Ancient Christianity and the Olfactory Imagination* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006), Constance Classen, “The Breath of God; Sacred Histories of Scent,” in *The Smell Culture Reader*, ed. Jim Drobnick (Oxford: Berg, 2006), 375-390, and Gale Largey and Rod Watson, “The Sociology of Odors,” in *The Smell Culture Reader*, ed. Jim Drobnick (Oxford: Berg, 2006), 29-40.

regularly smell of sulfur in the lived world, offering their scents as “overwhelming” signifiers of evil that should be avoided by the pious.²⁸

As Suzanne Evans argued: “there is a long history of the use of scent to communicate between the human and divine worlds. The ancient Egyptians, Hebrews, Babylonians, Greeks and Romans all gave the gift of scent to their gods...wide use of incense in sacrifice indicates how common was the belief that the gods as well as humans had sensitive noses and could be persuaded to look favorably on those making the offering.”²⁹ The spirit realm in such cultures was often defined through a battle between the good and bad odors of different gods. As Constance Classen illustrated: “for the ancient Egyptians, incense was the scent of the gods. By acquiring this scent, the king affirmed his basic identity with the gods: ‘My sweat is the sweat of Horus, my odour is the odour of Horus’.”³⁰

Deities, in these cultures, created and smelled of the scents of piety or malevolence. Later monotheist traditions continued similar religious olfactory patterns. The food of heaven in the Torah, *manna*, had a scent that the pious on earth acquired for their ascents into the afterlife. Moreover, aroma affected Abrahamic religions through its influence on the “reservoir of images within both Christian and Shia martyrologies.”³¹ Early modern Christian doctrine following from these traditions educated Englishpersons to the horrors

²⁸ John Cassian, and Boniface Ramsey, *John Cassian, the Conferences* (New York: Paulist Press, 1997), 92-108.

²⁹ Evans, “Scent of a Martyr,” quote on 198.

³⁰ Constance Classen, “The Odor of the Other: Olfactory Symbolism and Cultural Categories,” *Ethos* 20, 2 (1992), esp. 148-152, quote on 154.

³¹ Evans, “Scent of a Martyr,” quote on 207.

of hell's sulfuric stink. The material of sulfur became meaningful as a document of European cultures through these religious attributions.

Numerous early modern authors summarized the *Book of Revelations* wherein God would send Lucifer to burn in the lake of fire for challenging the authority of heaven during the apocalypse. This fire reeked of the pungent yellow rock. The Roman Catholic theologian Denis the Carthusian summarized the devil's future punishment for European audiences in the fifteenth century: "It is written in the apocalips...The devill shal be sent into the lake of fier and of sulpher and brymston/ where the evyll beast and the false prophete shal be tourmented nyght and day in the world of worldes." This punishment would be for all sinners who did not follow Catholic doctrine: "And he/ that shal not be fonden in the book of lif/ shal be sent into ye lake of fier there forto dwell in the shadowe of deth/ where is noon ordre/ but...horroure and sorowe."³²

English perceptions were similarly educated to believe in sulfur's evil stench through the *Book of Genesis* wherein God used fire and brimstone to destroy Sodom and Gomorrah due to their inhabitants numerous idolatrous duplicities. The English religious author William Hunnis summarized this "great rayne of fyre...Sulpher strong" that burned the depraved ancient cities.³³ The later religious chronicler John Foxe similarly offered sulfuric aspects of the Bible for his flock. His summary of the *Book of Revelations*, the

³² Denis the Carthusian, *Thus Endeth the prologue of this bbook named. Cord`yal. Whiche Treteth of the Four Last and Final Tthinges that Ben to Come* (London: William Caxton, 1479), quotes on 55-56. For similar sulfuric punishments in hell see, John Hall, *The Courte of Vertue* (London: Thomas Marshe, 1565), 160-161.

³³ William Hunnis, *A Hyve Full of Hunnye Contayning the Firste Booke of Moses, Called Genesis. Turned into English Meetre, by William Hunnis, One of the Gent. of Her Maiesties Chappel, and Maister to the Children of the Same* (London: Thomas Marsh, 1578), quotes on 49-50. For an earlier summary of sulfuric fires burning "Gomore and Sodome" see, Geoffroy de La Tour Landry and William Caxton, "[Here Begynneth the Booke Which the Knyght of the Toure Made And Speketh of Many Fayre Ensamples and Thensygnementys and Techyng of His Doughters]" (Westminster: William Caxton, 1484), 40-42.

aforementioned “apocalips,” included a lake of fire in the depths of hell that contained “sulphure and brimstone” where the tormented lived through a “gnashyng of teeth” in a stenchful “world wythout ende.”³⁴

A full conception of this olfactory image of hell and purgatory was portrayed within the vision literature of the Monk of Evesham, near Worcestershire, who wrote near the end of the twelfth century. The monastic sage wrote of encountering a wayward priest who found himself trapped in purgatory, often within “stinking baths of brimstone and pitch.” Deeper in hell, the Monk witnessed many souls that were:

roasted at the fire; some were fried in a pan; some were pierced with fiery nails even to their bones and to the loosening of their joints; some were soaked in baths of pitch and brimstone with a horrible stench, and others in molten lead and brass and other metals. Some were gnawed by the venomous teeth of wonderful worms; others were thrown down in serried rows, and smitten through with sharp stakes and pales with points of fire. Some were hung on gallows; others were dragged with hooks, and some were sorely beaten with scourges.

These fires were “steaming with a great stench” and pursued evil sinners with the “thick fumes” of hell’s righteousness.³⁵

³⁴ John Foxe, *Actes and Monuments of Matters Most Speciall and Memorable, Happening in the Church: With an Universall History of the Same* (London: Peter Short, 1596), quotes on 1832-1833. A similar stinking torture is found in Geoffrey Chaucer’s *Canterbury Tales* (1475). Jeffrey Chaucer, *The Works of our Ancient, Learned, & Excellent English Poet, Jeffrey Chaucer* (London: [s.n.], 1687), 172-174.

³⁵ Valerian Paget, *The Revelation to the Monk of Evesham Abbey...Rendered into Modern English by Valerian Paget* (London: Alston Rivers, 1909), quotes on 101, 152, 173. The visions of Roman Catholic Emperor Charles the Fat, from the ninth century, had similarly included critiques of earlier Church leaders through references to the burning odors of brimstone that tortured the bodies of “fathers” and “uncles” of the Church

Vision literature of the Medieval Era, these often dreaming and wandering accounts of hell, included numerous Christian scholars who would write of their sensory perceptions of perdition.³⁶ In this tradition, Dante portrayed the smell of hell akin to that of the privy: “From a steaming stench below, the banks were coated with a slimy mold that stuck to them like glue, disgusting to behold and worse to smell.” As Dante and Virgil looked into the depths beneath they perceived a “bottom ...so hollowed out of sight” with “souls in the ditch plunged into excrement that might well have been flushed from our latrines.”³⁷

As the travelers progressed deeper into the circles of hell, the scents of the brimstone covered sixth ring became vehemently abrasive to their senses: “the disgusting overflow of stench the deep abyss was vomiting forced us back.” The travelers, consequently pushed backwards, read a nearby inscription on the walls of this circle of hell that summarized that anyone who traveled through must delay “somewhat so that our sense of smell may grow accustomed to these vile fumes.”³⁸ Like Dante and his Roman guide in the depths of perdition, encountering sulfuric smells in European sensescapes during the

who lived near “fiery valleys” of boiling pits of metal, wax, and grease. John Sharpe William and J. A. Giles, *William of Malmesbury's Chronicle of the Kings of England. From the Earliest Period to the Reign of King Stephen* (London: G. Bell and Sons, 1883), quotes on 103.

³⁶ Turner, *History of Hell*, 91-98.

³⁷ Dante, *The Divine Comedy: Volume One: Inferno*, trans. Mark Musa (New York: Penguin Books, 1971), quotes on 235-236.

³⁸ Dante, *Divine Comedy*, quote on 168. Dante did not reference sulfur in his classifications of the scents of hell, but other works, including Tundal's *Vision* (1149), previously tied the smells Dante discussed later to sulfuric exhalations. For sulfur and Tundal see, Jan Swango Emerson, “Harmony, Hierarchy, and the Senses in the Vision of Tundal,” in *Imagining Heaven in the Middle Ages: A Book of Essays*, ed. Emerson and Hugh Feiss (New York: Garland Pub, 2000), esp. 12-14, and Gary Schmidt, *The Iconography of the Mouth of Hell: Eighth-Century Britain to the Fifteenth Century* (Selinsgrove, Pa: Susquehanna University Press, 1995), esp. 100-101. Sulfuric exhalations were increasingly linked to the coal industry in the early seventeenth century due to the increasing presence of sulfuric smells arriving as seacoal to English cities. Ken Hiltner, “‘Belch's Fire and Rowling Smoke’: Air Pollution in *Paradise Lost*,” in *Milton, Rights and Liberties*, ed. Christophe Tournu (Bern: Lang, 2007), esp. 297-300.

Renaissance, rather than within literature, continually signaled some otherworldly evil presence.

Many early modern Europeans also associated these often summarized smells of perdition to aspects of heavily sulfuric environments. In a discussion of sulfuric environmental attributes of nearby Iceland, the scholastic Bartholomew summarized myths related to, “the hill *Hecla*...from the toppe whereof, is cast foorth the blacke and graye Pommice stones, wherout issueth a hideous flame, stinking of sulphure.” This hill, a volcano in what is modern Iceland, emanated the odor of sulfur that “common people of that Countrey, beleewe...to bee a part of hell, because there are divers apparations of ghostes, that shew themselves visible, and profer their service to men.”³⁹

Akin to these ghosts who flew out of Iceland’s volcanic chasms, Englishpersons whose own bodies smelled of sulfur remained closer to death and associated damnation. Strategies for long life thus included dietary guidelines meant to avoid smelling of the yellow stone.⁴⁰ The ideal of hell’s malign pungency, exemplified by the writings of Denis the Carthusian, Dante, the Monk of Evesham, and Bartholomew prior to the Renaissance, infused English culture into the Early Modern Era through the dissemination of widely understood Christian beliefs about hell’s sulfuric odors.

These religious traditions that defined sulfur’s stench as hellish increasingly informed Englishpersons environmental encounters with the rock’ scent during the sixteenth century. English audiences may have been informed of these encounters from

³⁹ Bartholomaeus, *Batman Uppon Bartholome: His Booke De Proprietatibus Rerum, Newly Corrected, Enlarged and Amended: with Such Additions As Are Requisite, Unto Every Severall Booke: Taken Foorth of the Most Approved Authors, the Like Heretofore Not Translated in English. Profitable for All Estates, As Well for the Benefite of the Mind as the Bodie* (London: Thomas East, 1582), quotes on 204-206.

⁴⁰ Roger Bacon, Duarte Madeira Arrais, and Richard Browne, *The Cure of Old Age and Preservation of Youth* (London: Tho. Flesher...and Edward Evets, 1683), 78-80.

Reformation era Swiss chronicler Ludwig Lavater, who recorded early modern folklore that described: “certayne things whiche shyne only in the nighte, as some precious stones doo, the eyes of certaine beastes, a Gloewoorme, or gloebearde, as also some kynd of rotten wood, wherewith many times children so terrifie their playfellows, that they imagine with themselves, to see evil spirits, or men...burning with fire.” Despite his efforts as a skeptic of ghostly emanations, Lavater tied these stenchful figures of flame, which shined as glowing rocks, to the exhalations of sulfur and brimstone that “proceede of fierie matter” from the inner earth “seeking a vent to gushe out at.”⁴¹ The children of early modern Europe, to Lavater, were pliable enough to be entertained into succumbing to the enchantments of the devil; his stenchful beings dancing as olfactory sirens through their adolescent minds.⁴²

Varied environmental references also tied the smell of sulfur to the devil himself. The “common adversary and enemy” of all early modern Christians was Satan. People in opposition to the Christian God, and therefore beside the devil, “do plainly smell of fire and brimstone” on earth.⁴³ Sixteenth century Cambridge theologian Hugh Clark’s religious exertions in Northamptonshire thus involved scents created when the townspeople resisted

⁴¹ Ludwig Lavater, and Robert Harrison, *Of Ghostes and Spirites Walking by Nyght: And of Strange Noyses, Crackes, and Sundry Forewarnynges, Whiche Commonly Happen Before the Death of Menne, Great Slaughters & Alterations of Kyngdomes* (London: H. Benneyman for Richard Watkyns, 1572), quotes on 51-53.

⁴² For the rhetoric of Lavater as attempting to prove that ghosts were not formerly living humans, but demonic apparitions, see, Catherine Stevens, “‘You shal reade marvelous straunge things’: Ludwig Lavater and the Hauntings of the Reformation,” in *Supernatural and Secular Power in Early Modern England*, ed. Marcus Harms and Victoria Bladen (Farnham, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2015), 141-162.

⁴³ Samuel Annesley, *Casuistical Morning-Exercises: The Fourth Volume* (London: James Astwood for John Dunton, 1690), quotes on 55. For numerous examples of this context of the devil’s odors, and Renaissance scholar Tomasso Campanella’s description that “all things that smell evil, are evil,” see, Piero Camporesi, *The Incorruptible Flesh: Bodily Mutation and Mortification in Religion and Folklore* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), esp. 80-84.

his word to honor the Sabbath. In the night after their failure to rest for their Lord, “there was a great noise and rattling of chains up and down the town which was accompanied by such a smell and stink of fire and brimstone, that many of their guilty consciences suggested unto them, that the devil was come to fetch them away quick to hell.”⁴⁴ Sulfur’s pungency signified mischievous supernatural beings for Englishpersons of the sixteenth century. Though declining in frequency later, this tradition continued into the seventeenth century through both literary metaphor and for many descriptions of environmental encounters with sulfuric stench.⁴⁵

References to the devil’s smell took on increasingly metaphorical, rather than environmentally encountered, connotations to evil throughout the Early Modern Era.⁴⁶ The fifteenth century Suffolk monk John Lydgate summarized the sensory signatures attributed to the Roman god of the underworld in metaphor to the devil whom he preached against. Lydgate poetically discussed Pluto, who was often shrouded in a “derke myst envyrond all aboute... his clothyng was made of a smoky net” and smelled of “fyre and sulphure.”⁴⁷ Miguel de Cervantes’ *Don Quixote* (1605) described that spirits haunting the Spanish inns

⁴⁴ Samuel Clarke, *A General Martyrologie, Containing a Collection of All the Greatest Persecutions* (London: A. M. for Thomas Underhill and John Rothwell, 1651), quote on 388.

⁴⁵ For references to sulfur’s scent as signifying the devil, in early modern Scotland, see, Elizabeth Foyster, “Sensory Experiences; Smells, Sounds, and Touch,” in *A History of Everyday Life in Scotland 1600 to 1800*, ed. Elizabeth Foyster and Christopher Whatley (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2010), esp. 217-218.

⁴⁶ For the history of the devil, and the understanding that references to the devil increased after the Reformation in England and synthesized into a coherent trickster ideal, see, Darren Oldridge, *The Devil in Early Modern England* (Stroud: Sutton, 2000).

⁴⁷ John Lydgate, *Hrre Folowyth the Interpretac[I]on of the Names of Goddis and Goddesses of This Treatyse Folowyng As Poetes Wryte* (S. I: Wynkyn de Worde, 1498), quote on 4. For the importance of changing connotations for “air” in early modern England see the rising visibility of air as connoting the supernatural analyzed within, Jayne Elizabeth Lewis, *Air’s Appearance* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012), esp. 31-35, 130-189.

of Sancho Panza and the errant knight's travels similarly smelled of sulfur and brimstone.⁴⁸ Daniel Defoe's later *History of the Devil* (1726) summarized the oft-told tale of the ability of medieval Saint Francis of Assisi to similarly discover the Lord of Darkness in the world through either Lucifer's cloven-feet or "his smell of sulphur."⁴⁹

Numerous English references from the seventeenth century also allocated the smell of sulfur to the devil's minions on earth.⁵⁰ Witchcraft prosecutions, which focused especially on examinations of evidence of sexual orgies with demons and pacts with Satan, grew into an unassailable frenzy during the Early Modern Era, especially after the Reformation and prior to the Restoration.⁵¹ In 1645, the witch-hunt of Margaret Moone of Colchester involved an accusation that involved a presence that appeared to be a rat, which

⁴⁸ Miguel de Cervantes Saavedra, John Philips, and Thomas Hodgkin, *The History of the Most Renowned Don Quixote of Mancha and His Trusty Squire Sancho Pancho* (London: Tho. Hodgkin, 1687), 264. For how the devil, and the ideals of his evil powers in the lived world, declined from physical manifestations into increasingly subconscious temptations in early modern England see, Nathan Johnstone, "The Protestant Devil: The Experience of Temptation in Early Modern England," *The Journal of British Studies* 43, 2 (2004): 173-205, the decline of demons due to the epistemological instability of demonology analyzed within, Stuart Clark, *Thinking with Demons: The Idea of Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), esp. 8-10, 174-176, and the analysis of witchcraft and veridicality within, Stuart Clark, "Demons, Natural Magic, and the Virtually Real: Visual Paradox in Early Modern Europe," in *New World Encounters*, ed. Stephen Greenblatt (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993), 223-246.

⁴⁹ Daniel Defoe, *The Political History of the Devil Containing, His Original. A State of His Circumstances. His Conduct Public and Private...The Whole Interspers'd with Many of the Devil's Adventures* (London: John Atkinson, 1754), quote on 45-46. For the importance of transnational links in the study of European witchcraft, through a reading of Reginald Scot and Jean Bodin see, Pierre Kapitaniak, "Reginald Scot and the Circles of Power: Witchcraft, Anti-Catholicism and Faction Politics," in *Supernatural and Secular Power in Early Modern England*, ed. Marcus Harnes and Victoria Bladen (Farnham, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2015), 41-66.

⁵⁰ For a German reference to similar sensory attributes of witches in the sixteenth century see, Charles Zika, *The Appearance of Witchcraft: Print and Visual Culture in Sixteenth-Century Europe* (London: Routledge, 2007), esp. 199-201.

⁵¹ For witchcraft and legalism see the reading of evidentiary claims within, Gary Waite, *Heresy, Magic and Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe* (Basingstoke; New York, N.Y.: Palgrave, 2003), esp. 87-117, and the use of smell as evidence within *The Lawes against Witches and Coniversion* (1645) and *A Guide to Grand-lury Men* (1627) in, Orna Darr, *Marks of an Absolute Witch: Evidentiary Dilemmas in Early Modern England* (London: Ashgate, 2011), esp. 106, 231-232.

“dropped from her skirts” and filled “the room with an unbearable smell.”⁵² Charles Goodall summarized the sulfuric scents of a demonic brew mixed by similar English witches in 1689; “When to her Cabin now the Witch returns,/ Sulphur...mixt in a Cauldron, burns.”⁵³

In the southern Welsh region of Glamorgan in the early seventeenth century an account of an apparition similarly included attributing sulfuric smells to hellish minions. The Puritan preacher Richard Baxter wrote of the, “noise of Whirlwind” caused by an “Apparition...having an unsufferable Stench, like that of a putrified Carcase, filling the Room with a thick Smoak, smelling like Sulphur.”⁵⁴ The collected witchcraft cases

⁵² Malcolm Gaskill, *Witchfinders: A Seventeenth-Century English Tragedy* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2005), quotes on 63-64. For introduction to the history of witchcraft see, Charles Mackay, *Extraordinary Popular Delusions and the Madness of Crowds* (New York: Barnes & Noble Books, 2004 [1841]), esp. 374-450, Jonathan Barry and Owen Davies, *Palgrave Advances in Witchcraft Historiography* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), and Marion Gibson, *Witchcraft and Society in England and America, 1550-1750* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2003).

⁵³ Charles Goodall, *Poems and Translations, Written upon Several Occasions, and To Several Persons* (London: Henry Bonwicke [etc.], 1689), quote on 85-89. For another example of sulfur as part of cauldron brew, see, Reginald Scot, *The Discoverie of Witchcraft: Wherein the Lewde Dealing of Witches and Witchmongers Is Notable Detected...Heereunto Is Added a Treatise Upon the Nature and Substance of Spirits and Divels* (London: W. Brome, 1584), 283-284. For the historiographical debate on the decline of witchcraft from approximately 1650 to 1750 see different theories of: modernization, within, Geoffrey Scarre and John Callow, *Witchcraft and Magic in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century Europe* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001), the rise of religious pluralism, urbanization, and the need for elites to assert a new form of power due to a crisis of religious authority, within, Owen Davies, "Urbanization and the Decline of Witchcraft: An Examination of London," *Journal of Social History* 30, 3 (1997): 597-617, the medical assertion of disease taking the place of possession, within, D. P. Walker, *Unclean Spirits: Possession and Exorcism in France and England in the Late Sixteenth and Early Seventeenth Centuries* (Philadelphia, Pa: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1981), esp. 75-84, the deterministic link between weather and witchcraft accusations explored within, Wolfgang Behringer, "Weather, Hunger and Fear: Origins of the European Witch-Hunts in Climate, Society and Mentality," *German History* 13, 1 (1995): 1-27, and a growing Enlightenment belief in the ability to control the world against supernatural forces within, Ian Bostridge, *Witchcraft and Its Transformations, 1650-1750* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997) and Edward Bever, "Witchcraft Prosecutions and the Decline of Magic," *Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 40, 2 (2009): 263-293.

⁵⁴ Richard Baxter, *The Certainty of the Worlds of Spirits and, Consequently, of the Immortality of Souls Of the Malice and Misery of the Devils and the Damned: and of the Blessedness of the Justified, Fully Evinc'd by the Unquestionable Histories of Apparitions, Operations, Witchcrafts* (London: T. Parkhurst...and J. Salisbury, 1691), quotes on 10-11. For the differentiation between English witches who were deemed to have more agency, and focused on local concerns, compared to satanically manipulated continental witches, who influenced much wider areas through storms and diseases see the reading of witchcraft as a ritual structure

Saducismus Triumphatus (1681) summarized numerous bewitching instances for English readers. A 1664 case in Somerset involved the haunting of Anne Bishop by a man dressed all in black, later rendered to be Satan, who, “After all was ended...vanished, leaving an ugly smell at parting.” Numerous other cases collected within this compendium involved the “sulphurous smell” left behind after various nightly visitations from Mephistopheles and many of his demonic sycophants.⁵⁵

These cultural poetics of odor later shifted to define what was once deemed evil into something that could no longer be considered malevolent. Part of this shift involved removing the idea of evil sulfur from England proper and placing that ideal upon the others of the New World. Another aspect of the disenchantment of Albion, to be described in chapter two, involved turning the evil odors of sulfur into a literary tactic for performance rather than a sensory encounter to be experienced in the lived world. The vast poetics that engaged the Reformation to tear down English abbeys and define laws to control the use of incense also contained deep rhetorical power to alter the function of the human nose.⁵⁶

within, J. A. Sharpe, *Instruments of Darkness: Witchcraft in England, 1550–1750* (London: Penguin, 1996), esp. 64–66, 240–242.

⁵⁵ Joseph Glanvill, Henry More, and Anthony Horneck, *Saducismus Triumphatus, or, Full and Plain Evidence Concerning Witches and Apparitions in Two Parts: the First Treating of Their Possibility, the Second of Their Real Existence* (London: J. Collins and S. Lownds, 1681), 93, 157, 164, 166, quote on 149. In some Catholic areas within Western Europe, odor was also essential in the “Night Battles” that occurred between different groups of witches and popular practitioners that followed Catholic traditions. The smoky haze of flowers would hang low over the fields of battle as members of the Friuli fertility cult entered to fight witches with aromatic fennel stalks in pitched battles four times a year. Carlo Ginzburg, *The Night Battles: Witchcraft & Agrarian Cults in the Sixteenth & Seventeenth Centuries* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins, 1983), esp. 74–77; Carlo Ginzburg and Raymond Rosenthal, *Ecstasies: Deciphering the Witches' Sabbath* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1991), esp. 163.

⁵⁶ For the increasing presence of sulfuric smells arriving as seacoal to English cities. Hiltner, “‘Belch’s Fire and Rowling Smoke’,” esp. 297–300.

Odors Shifted, Odors Contained

Environmental references to sulfur's aroma as tied to the devil and his pungent underworld crossed into narratives of exotic New World adventures of English travelers who sensed in their fresh discoveries the ever-presence of the mischievous sprite. The smell of the Atlantic African coast often offered such "putrid and sulpherous exhalations" breathed "out in such venomous Blasts, that they breed Pestilentiall Feavers, and other diseases in the inhabitants."⁵⁷

Thomas Herbert, an English traveler near the Cape Verde Islands during the seventeenth century, implicitly linked the scents of sulfur to hell when he summarized the "Aethiopian" inhabitants of the islands as "idolaters" whose weather during Herbert's time spent in the area "had no wind" and "was very sulphurous and raging hot, so that (albeit we had...Awnings to shade us, and were almost naked) we could enjoy no rest, nor eate, drinke, lie still, or what else without excessive sweating day and night."⁵⁸

Early modern English travelers were concerned with how their temperaments would be altered by encountering this sulfuric weather in both Africa and the New World. These English travelers believed that their bodies were set to a specific climate, and altering that environment throughout life would inherently change English dispositions, in the case

⁵⁷ Ralph Bohun, *A Discourse Concerning the Origine and Properties of Wind With an Historicall Account of Hurricanes and Other Tempestuous Winds* (Oxford: W. Hall for Tho. Bowman, 1671), quotes on 203-204.

⁵⁸ Thomas Herbert, and William Marshall, *A Relation of Some Yeares Travaile Begunne Anno 1626. Into Afrique and the Greater Asia, Especially the Territories of the Persian Monarchie: and Some Parts of the Orientall Indies, and Iles Adjacent. Of Their Religion, Language, Habit, Discent, Ceremonies, and Other Matters Concerning Them. Together with the Proceedings and Death of the Three Late Ambassadors: Sir D.C. Sir R.S. and the Persian Nogdi-Beg: As Also the Two Great Monarchs, the King of Persia, and the Great Mogol* (London: P. William Stansby and Jacob Bloome, 1634), quotes on 6-8.

of the Atlantic islands making Englishmen more savage.⁵⁹ These cultural clashes within the Atlantic littoral were often defined through a narrative that placed the Atlantic as a battleground in the Manichean encounter between God and the devil.

The stench of sulfur in the New World thus often signaled hell to travelers struggling through new encounters on troubled seas and within strange lands.⁶⁰ While traveling in the Caribbean during the late seventeenth century, Welsh explorer Lionel Wafer relied on his nose to detect these dreaded malevolent aspects of the otherworldly. During his voyages a strong storm caused the air to bring forth a confusing “sulpherous smell,” a common odor detected by many Atlantic voyagers which for some signified sensory omens of approaching satanic wonders.⁶¹ William Dampier’s *A New Voyage Round the World* (1699) similarly described an implicitly hellish scene of tornadoes and lightning storms, including sulfuric smells, encountered by Captain Eaton in his 1684 travels to Peru.⁶²

⁵⁹ Karen Kupperman, "Fear of Hot Climates in the Anglo-American Colonial Experience," *WMQ* 41, 2 (1984): 213-40; Joyce Chaplin, "Natural Philosophy and an Early Racial Idiom in North America: Comparing English and Indian Bodies," *WMQ* 54 (1997): 229-252; Kathleen Donegan, *Seasons of Misery: Catastrophe and Colonial Settlement in Early America* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), esp. 2-4.

⁶⁰ For history of the early encounter with the New World as this Manichean battle see, Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra, *Puritan Conquistadors: Iberianizing the Atlantic, 1550-1700* (Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press, 2006), and the complex interplay between the desire for the New World utopia and the fear of cannibalism within, Mario Klarer, "Cannibalism and Carnavalesque: Incorporation As Utopia in the Early Image of America," *New Literary History* 30, 2 (1999): 389-410.

⁶¹ Lionel Wafer, and George Parker Winship, *A New Voyage and Description of the Isthmus of America* (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1903), quotes on 46, 100.

⁶² William Dampier, *A New Voyage Round The World: Describing Particularly, the Isthmus of America, Several Coasts and Islands in the West Indies, the Isles of Cape Verd, the Passage by Terra Del Fuego, the South Sea Coasts of Chili, Peru, and Mexico* (London: Knapton, 1699), 131-133. For importance of sulfur to Peruvian conquests and Native Americans lack of understanding the value of the rock see, Antonio de Ulloa, *A Voyage to South America: Describing at Large, the Spanish Cities, Towns, Provinces, & C. on That Extensive Continent. Interspersed Throughout with Reflexions on Whatever Is Peculiar in the Religion and Civil Policy; in the Genius, Customs, Manners, Dress, & C. of the Several Inhabitants; Whether Natives, Spaniards, Creoles, Indians, Mulattoes, or Negroes. Together with the Natural as Well As Commercial History of the Country. And an Account of Their Gold and Silver Mines* (London: L. Davis and C. Reymers, 1760), 495, and Richard Rolt, *A New and Accurate History of South America* (London: T. Gardner, 1756),

While travelling south of the Rio Grande during the middle of the seventeenth century, English author Thomas Gage noted that specific earthen ware cookery often was deemed superior to other pottery because it was created in areas that the Spanish deemed to be near to the “mouth of hell.” Neighboring a rural town in New Spain, a volcano breathed “a thick black smoak smelling of Brimstone, with some flashes now and then of fire.” The Spanish, to Gage, believed this emission to be from the depths of hell, which was signified to their Old World sensoriums through the smells of sulfur and brimstone that emanated from within the geological formations.⁶³

On the Island of Nevis a comparable sulfuric smell implied the heat of hell boiling from underneath the English region of St. John’s Parish. This “considerable spot of sulpherous ground,” called “Sulpher Gut,” was so scorching that colonists who walked above the area felt the radiating heat through their “shoe soals.” Two doctors, curious about the scorching temperature beneath their feet, buried “some eggs about an inch deep in that spot for the space of three or four minutes.” After that period, “they were full as hard quite thorough” as much as “boyling or roasting could make them.” Though increasingly analyzed through scientific experimentation, the volcanic isle of Nevis offered evidence of hell’s radiating heat and scents to travelers who encountered the island’s noisome excesses.⁶⁴

esp. 327.

⁶³ Thomas Gage, *The English-American* (London: R. Cotes, 1648), quotes on 183.

⁶⁴ William Smith, *A Natural History of Nevis, and the Rest of the English Leeward Charibee Islands in America With Many Other Observations on Nature and Art: Particularly an Introduction to the Art of Decyphering* (Cambridge, England: J. Bentham, 1745), 39, 53-56, quote on 55. For early modern understandings of geology, as related to earthquakes and their sulfuric content, in the wake of the 1580 London earthquake see, Thomas Twyne, *A Shorte and Pithie Discourse, Concerning the Engendring, Tokens, and Effects of All Earthquakes in Generall Particularly Applied and Conferred with That Most Strange and Terrible Worke of the Lord in Shaking the Earth, Not Only Within the Citie of London, but Also in Most Partes of All Englande: Which Hapned Upon Wensday in Easter Weeke Last Past, Which Was the Sixt Day*

Early modern English voyages to the East likewise involved smelling sulfuric scents as possibly emanating from hell. Englishman Robert Knox, a Captain traveling to the East Indian island of Ceylon during the sixteenth century, summarized an encounter with inhabitants who believed a tree that “no sort of Cattle will eat,” because it smelled of sulfur, was a sign of the presence of Satan.⁶⁵ A similar allusion to the sulfuric devil and his pungent signifiers in worldly environments was presented in Thomas Herbert’s aforementioned travels, which perhaps elicited references to the Garden of Eden for English readers of the seventeenth century. His travel accounts of India included an encounter in Cape Comorin that contained an environment with trees “strange both in shape and nature.” Herbert, while curiously pondering an extraordinary tree, decided to taste its dubious nectar. After a short period his “mouth and lips” were “malignantly wronged” by the biting taste of brimstone.⁶⁶

The devil was leaving England for areas of the world where Christianity and Europeans had yet to dominate.⁶⁷ Englishmen, confident that the devil was departing their homeland, placed his manifestations in places in the world where Europeans entered to proselytize, later creating justifications for myriad imperial abuses.⁶⁸ In Salem of 1693,

of April, Almost at Sixe a Clocke in the Evening, in the Yeare of Our Lord God (London: John Charlewood for Richarde Johnes, 1580).

⁶⁵ *Weekly Memorials for the Ingenious; or, an Account of Books Lately Set Forth in Several Languages. With Other Accounts Relating to Arts and Sciences. No. 1-50* (London: Printed for Henry Faithorne and John Kersey, 1682), quote on 86.

⁶⁶ Herbert, *A Relation of Some Yeares Travaile*, 209-212, quote on 212.

⁶⁷ For Atlantic witchcraft prosecutions as rising during the political and social tensions of the English Civil War see, Virginia Bernhard, "Religion, Politics, and Witchcraft in Bermuda, 1651–55," *WMQ* 67, 4 (2010): 677-708.

⁶⁸ For the use of the devil for some justifications of colonial policies in the Americas see, Patricia Cleary, *The World, the Flesh, and the Devil: A History of Colonial St. Louis* (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 2011), esp. 9, 20.

when Cotton Mather went to visit with Margaret Rule, the troubled woman appeared to have blisters on her skin from an unseen and invisible sulfur that ephemeral demons were sprinkling upon her tortured body.⁶⁹ For many Englishpersons, these demons and witches of Salem smelled of sulfur and brimstone left from the devil's presence in their homes during nocturnal incantations, the environments of new worlds included strange smells attributed to hellish manifestations, and indigenous peoples often smelled of wafted malevolence.⁷⁰

Many of these ideals were created in cyclical exchange with the Catholic rhetoric of Iberian conquests in the New World.⁷¹ Especially within the sixteenth century writings of Jesuit naturalist Jose de Acosta, the use of the devil found a place as a marker of the evil that could be found within indigenous bodies.⁷² Often informing English traditions, and in turn being educated by English texts, these sulfuric connotations involved the use of indigeneity to mark the rural cultures of the Western Hemisphere as satanic.⁷³

⁶⁹ Robert Calef, "From 'More Wonders of the Invisible World'," in *Narrative of the Witchcraft Cases*, ed. George Lincoln Burr (New York: 1914), 289-394, esp. 314-315, 322-323. For witchcraft in Salem through a materialist reading see, Paul Boyer and Stephen Nissenbaum, *Salem Possessed: The Social Origins of Witchcraft* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1974).

⁷⁰ For the smells associated with witchcraft, including the battle of scents whereby Puritans would often use urine cakes to prevent their homes from satanic invasion, see Peter Charles Hoffer, *Sensory Worlds in Early America* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003), esp. 106-107.

⁷¹ For the use of folk magic and beliefs about the devil as a means of social judgement and protection in early New England see, Richard Godbeer, *The Devil's Dominion: Magic and Religion in Early New England*. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), esp. 91-97.

⁷² For general history of witchcraft in early New Spain as a means for female agency see, Nicole von Germeten, *Violent Delights, Violent Ends: Sex, Race, and Honor in Colonial Cartagena De Indias* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2013), esp. 125-138, and indigenous responses to witchcraft accusations within, Fernando Cervantes and Andrew Redden, "Introduction," in *Angels, Demons and the New World*, ed. Fernando Cervantes and Andrew Redden (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 1-14.

⁷³ Andrew Redden, "Vipers under the Altar Cloth: Satanic and Angelic Forms in Seventeenth-Century New Granada," in *Angels, Demons and the New World*, ed. Fernando Cervantes and Andrew Redden (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 146-170. For more on the subversive power of gender in witchcraft accusations in Spanish America see, Irene Silverblatt, "Andean Witches and Virgins: Seventeenth Century

Many of these accusations often included the use of the senses.⁷⁴ Historian Fernando Cervantes' reading of the inquisition records of Fray Pablo Sarmiento in New Spain, stationed near the College of Santa Cruz de Querétaro, described the "most intolerable stench" of evil that was emanating from a possessed woman who was being tormented by many demons in the late summer of 1691. To exorcise these demons, Sarmiento provided the woman "two or three holy drinks" that forced her to expurgate three large avocado stones from her esophagus, signifying the removal of the demons and the associated cleansing of evil odor from the room. Once the stones were removed from her throat, a stinking toad was discovered living beneath the former blockage. This demon in amphibious form was thereafter burned with holy fires. As the toad died in the flames, the amphibian emitted an "indescribably unpleasant smell."⁷⁵

As Jorge Canizares-Esguerra has aptly stated regarding earlier eras of contact between Europe and the Americas:

Despite all their differences, intellectuals in both the British and Iberian Atlantics saw Satan as enjoying control over the weather, plants, animals, and landscapes in the New World....demonological views of nature and colonization encouraged a

Nativism and Subversive Gender Ideologies," in *Women, "Race," and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, ed. Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker (London: Routledge, 1994), 259-271.

⁷⁴ For the sounds of Native Americans as savage and demonic during the early era of contact see, Gary Tomlinson, *The Singing of the New World: Indigenous Voice in the Era of European Contact* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2007), esp. 3-4.

⁷⁵ Fernando Cervantes, *The Devil in the New World: The Impact of Diabolism in New Spain* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994), quotes from original inquisition records from 116-118. For more on these witchcraft accusations in New Spain, and the narrative Christianization of indigenous visions in Mexico, see, Serge Gruzinski and Eileen Corrigan, *The Conquest of Mexico: the Incorporation of Indian Societies into the Western World, 16th-18th centuries* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1993), esp. 177-183.

particular perception of the American landscape among Europeans: the New World often came to be seen as a false paradise that to be saved needed to be destroyed by Christian heroes.⁷⁶

Such evil, often signified by the odors of sulfur, permeated the later North American colonial experience. In Pennsylvania of the 1730s, numerous thunderstorms portended evil through a specifically sulfuric smell that often accompanied lightning strikes. Therein, colonials also wrote of a sulfuric smelling globe that would float in the night sky near their homes.⁷⁷ The amorphous figure and the associated ephemeral smells of brimstone allocated the New World as the place of existential threats of odor that were increasingly removed from the European, and especially English, cultural core.

Similar sulfuric anxieties about Native Americans surrounded a mysterious blue shell stone that early American historian Jeremy Belknap investigated in the 1780s near Lebanon, Maine.⁷⁸ As these evil, confusing, and sulfuric smells often attributed to the devil, his toadies, and conjurers were leaving England proper for the wider world, those religiously defined odors were also parting English landscapes for a dwelling as literary metaphors rather than as signifiers of evil within English environments.

⁷⁶ Cañizares-Esguerra, *Puritan Conquistadors*, quote on 33. For later reference to the sulfuric smell of Native Americans, specifically the Apache in the early twentieth century southwest, see the travels of D. H. Lawrence in, David Higdon, *Wandering into Brave New World* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2013), 164-165.

⁷⁷ "Bristol, Sept. 16," *American Weekly Mercury*, Tuesday 1/23 to Thursday 2/8, 1738/1739, p. 3.

⁷⁸ Russell Lawson, *Ebenezer Hazard, Jeremy Belknap and the American Revolution* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2011), 97-99.

Part of knowledge gathering within the novel and confusing New World involved a preternatural lens that attributed pungent odors to indigenous peoples, the environment, and the numerous slaves quickly being brought to the sugar plantations of the West Indies. As chapter five will expand, European cultural cores deodorized, in part, through shifting these myriad odors onto the othered bodies of the Western Hemisphere. Sulfur is but one aspect of this phenomenological shift of previously malevolent Old World scents merging with New World environments and bodies.⁷⁹

When sailors on English ships crossed into the tropics on journeys away from their cherished homes they immersed themselves into what they believed was a more deeply scented world. Part of this process often included violent baths in stinking oils and tars that created a new figure that could succeed in the sensuous environments of the Americas with new skin healed over the scars of the recently removed film. In Barbados of the 1790s, English traveler George Pinckard wrote of such a ceremony that involved immersing the sailor passing into the tropics for the first time with “a nasty compound of grease, tar, and stinking oil,” which burned the skin to be removed by sharpened razors of the English crew.⁸⁰

⁷⁹ For general importance of the rhetorical shifting of evil practices onto populations of the New World see the reading of cannibalism within, Michael Palencia-Roth, “The Cannibal Law of 1503,” in *Early Images of the Americas: Transfer and Invention*, ed. Jerry Williams and Robert Earl Lewis (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1993), esp. 21-64, and the role of headless figures within Hispanic literature analyzed in, Scott Oldenburg, “Headless in America: The Imperial Logic of Acephalism,” in *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, ed. Helen Ostovich, Mary Silcox, and Graham Roebuck, 39-57 (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2008).

⁸⁰ George Pinckard, *Notes on the West Indies* (London: Printed for Longman, Hurst, Rees, and Orme, 1806), esp. 206-208. Also, see a similar account within, Henry Fitzherbert, “The Journal Henry Fitzherbert Kept While in Barbados in 1825,” *JBMHS* 44 (Nov/Dec, 1998): 117-191, esp. 132-133.

These intense acculturation rituals prepared English bodies for the experience of excess sensation in the New World. The boundary maintenance of the senses was also apparent to Gage in the North America of his later travels. The chronicler wrote:

Thus as wee were truely transported from *Europe* to *America*, so the World seemed truely to bee altered, our senses changed from what they were the night & day before when we heard the hideous noise of the Mariners oifing up Sailes, when wee saw the deep and monsters of it, when we tasted the stinking water, when we smelt the Tarre and Pitch; but here wee heard a quivering and trembling voice and instrument well tuned, wee beheld wealth and riches, wee tasted what was sweet, and in the Sweet-meates smelt the Muske and Civit, wherewith that Epicurean Prior had seasoned his Conserves.⁸¹

Such ceremony and immersion entered the Old World sailor into the New World environment through shedding of skin and encountering the other as a means to prepare the new body for the aromatic wonders to be encountered.

Due partly through shifting pungent odors onto the New World throughout the seventeenth century, many Englishpersons found that their sensory skills to discern the divine and his spiritual enemies in the metropole became increasingly clouded by secular language that informed their noses of sulfur's non-religious meanings.⁸² Though some

⁸¹ Gage, *English-American*, quote on 23.

⁸² For the role of the Great Chain of Being in these discussions of natural philosophy see, Chiara Bottici, *Imaginal Politics: Images Beyond Imagination and the Imaginary* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2014), esp. 26-30, and Richard Bradley, W. Mears, and John Cole, *A Philosophical Account of the Works of Nature: Endeavouring to Set Forth the Several Gradations Remarkable in the Mineral, Vegetable, and Animal Parts of the Creation, Tending to the Composition of a Scale of Life: to Which Is Added, an Account*

references to the devilish odor of sulfur continued, based upon this belief in the liminal space between earth and the lake of fire, most mentions of the rock's pungency after approximately 1650 treated sulfur as literary metaphor to evil traits and as a positive material used to cure diseases and fill muskets, as gunpowder included sulfur for ignition. By the eighteenth century, the odor of sulfur as connoting hell within the lived world was substantially dissociated from the general English sensory consciousness. Though numerous references to the magic of the devil's sulfuric scent remained in the feminized and aromatized New World and for literary cleverness, proportionately more mentions of the rock were applied for the New Science, as industrial coal, or designed for the social control of women and racial others.⁸³

From approximately 1500 to 1650, English references to sulfur's stench as hell included relatively equal amounts of scientific uses, literary metaphor, and indications of wickedness in the lived world. Thereafter, most English references to sulfur's evil stench turned proportionately to literary metaphor and technological progress. The essentially benign use of sulfuric stench within secularizing literary culture, and the aggressive shifting of sulfur upon the New World, limited the role of sulfur as a definitive signifier of hell manifesting in the English environment, thereafter opening the cultural construct of the scent of sulfur to be defined by a wider audience which demarcated the scent in more ways than simply signifying the devil on earth.

This opening within discourse led to a semantic dispersion whereby the linguistic

of the State of Gardening, As It Is Now in Great Britain, and Other Parts of Europe: Together with Several New Experiments Relating to the Improvement of Barren Ground, and the Propagating of Timber-Trees, Fruit-Trees: with Many Curious Cutts (London: W. Mears, 1721).

⁸³ For the feminization of the New World, through similarities to the *Rape of Lucrece*, through an analysis of the term "blazon" see, Patricia Parker, *Literary Fat Ladies: Rhetoric, Gender, Property* (London: Methuen, 1987), esp. 126-154, quote on 147.

signifier sulfur increasingly took on various new signified meanings rather than the term's previous preponderance as an environmental signifier of the scent of the devil and his sensory toadies. Economic expansion could not occur without accompanying ideology, as new sensory values had to be forged in the fire of the Enlightenment.⁸⁴

⁸⁴ For general reading of Enlightenment through materialist ideals see, Joyce Appleby, "Consumption in Early Modern Social Thought," in *Consumption and the World of Goods*, ed. John Brewer and Roy Porter (London; New York: Routledge, 1993), 162-176.

Chapter 2

“What a Steam...Left Behind”: Mocking the Church’s Sulfur

To most Englishpersons prior to approximately 1700, sulfur scented in the environment usually signified the odors of hell not as metaphor to evil, but as evil present in the world. Whether judging heretics or Jews as fetid, scenting witches in Salem or within England proper, encountering the pungent New World and its perceived demonic indigenous peoples, or avoiding ghosts on the reeking fenlands, Englishpersons sensed the yellow stone as signifying hell on earth. However, during the seventeenth century sulfur's smell increasingly became a multivalent secular metaphor through the dispersion of popular literature on the banks of the Thames.¹

This process of turning a malignant religious ideal into a benign literary construct altered English perceptions of sulfur in the lived environment. By 1700, references for sulfur dovetailed toward a relatively positive classification of sulfur's smell for science as narratives of technological instrumentality triumphed over religious texts that defined sulfur's smell in the environment as the presence of evil. The devil's element, with its noisome odor, was necessary for modernity and consequently could not continue to be judged as inherently evil in an England that continued to shed religious bases of knowledge for the truths of scientific progress, stereotypical narratives of the stage, and newly deafening blasts of the gunpowder processional of state supremacy.²

The death rattle of English Catholicism included an intensification of sensory justifications in the lived world. The Church shifted towards a deeply engaged worldliness

¹ For the early modern construct of the scents of Jewishness see, Kenneth Stow, "Was the Ghetto Cleaner...." in *Rome, Pollution, and Propriety: Dirt, Disease, and Hygiene in the Eternal City from Antiquity to Modernity*, ed. Mark Bradley and Kenneth Stow (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 169-181, and Mark Smith, "Transcending, Othering, Detecting: Smell, Premodernity, Modernity," *Postmedieval* 3, 4 (2012): 380-390.

² For the displacement of popular magic through the New Science see the reading of magic as central to the Renaissance worldview within, Ioan Culianu, *Eros and Magic in the Renaissance* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987), esp. 87-106.

that was meant to scare and engage Catholics throughout Europe threatened by Reformation discourses. This increased the importance of scent in the European sensorium through the augmented attribution of aromas to the world as signs from God or the devil. However, the Reformation expended decades shattering this sixteenth century sensory excess through shifting odors from the environmental sphere to the dreamscape of the poetical imagination.³

What had been birthed with Catholicism centuries prior, the belief in forms of self-reflection through the application of the full sensorium to questions of spiritual transcendence, was shattered as the Reformation took hold and slowly began to deconstruct the ephemeral links between heaven, the earth, and damnation. The transient movement between these realms, often necessitated by the sense of smell in earlier belief systems of popular Catholicism, was deconstructed for numerous motives related to the rise of capitalism and the assertion of Protestant elites as the true inheritors of the world. Sulfur exemplifies these changes through the mechanism of semantic dispersion as metaphors on the stage emptied previously malignant religious ideals, while concurrently altering consciousness to perceive the yellow rock as less pungent.⁴

³ The scents of religion had offered popular Catholicism links between hell, purgatory, the world, and heaven. These scents were essential in what marked the self-examination implicit in the practice of early Christianity as different from the religious past. For Michel Foucault, self-examination was something new with early forms of Christianity. To show the value of confession as self-examination in new form, Foucault describes the early writings of John Cassian that summarized the story of Serapion, a young monk. This monk could not live through a fast, and began to steal bread. When discovered through his own confession, a smell of sulfur came from inside of him and filled the room. Truth was only known through the act of bodily confession. Only in that act of synesthetic release did sulfur mark the body as committing evil. Michel Foucault, Henri-Paul Fruchaud, Daniele Lorenzini, Laura Cremonesi, Arnold Davidson, Orazio Irrera, and Martina Tazzioli, *About the Beginning of the Hermeneutics of the Self: Lectures at Dartmouth College, 1980* (Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016), esp. 4-8 and 66-72.

⁴ In the former tradition, religious signifiers were often transcended by the most ephemeral of sensations, smell, as a way to cope with the deaths of loved ones or the needs of faith in troubled times. The Reformation attempted to close these links, which for previous Christians allocated the scents of fragrances to the very beauty of Christ. For the early attributions of beautiful odors to the body and spirit of Christ see, Tzvi Novick,

Cleansing the Market on the Shakespearean Stage

Demons had been associated to foul scents in the Christian tradition for much of the history of the Catholic Church. The inclusion of oil within ceremonies of baptism and exorcism often functioned as a means to scent the body in positive manners to rid the evil stench of demons and hell through the introduction of a new perfume for freshly anointed Christians.⁵ Over time, these aromatic justifications faded in the face of a market that needed to have scentful goods either removed from the public sphere, or altered through rhetoric to be made not restrictively pungent. During the 1600s, although English persons were still partly informed by religious classifications of sulfur's scent as from hell, they increasingly bypassed religious definitions of the rock's pungency in favor of accepting multifarious and environmentally invalid literary metaphors for sulfur's scent.

In early modern plays that included Lucifer, or his many manifestations as theatrical characters, actor's skins were usually in great danger as they held fire or firecrackers, termed squibs, in their hands to show the burning power of hell, as metaphor for evil, to amused audiences. Costumes for demons and Satan thus included mud-backed masks so that actors would not burn their faces with the sulfuric gunpowder.⁶ The early seventeenth century humorist Samuel Rowlands created a similar literary metaphor of hell for popular consumption when he linked the devil's stench to the odor of a dragon's breath: "The ugly

"Peddling Scents: Merchandise and Meaning in 2 Corinthians 2:14-17," *Journal of Biblical Literature* 130, 3 (Fall, 2011): 543-549.

⁵ Mary Thurlkill, *Sacred Scents in Early Christianity and Islam* (Lanham: Lexington Books, 2016), esp. 88-94.

⁶ Jonathan Gil Harris, "The Smell of Macbeth," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 58, 4 (2007): 465-486, esp. 465-470.

beast...So terrible seem'd his devouring jaws:/ Wide gaping, grisly, like the mouth of hell...His blazing eyes did burn like living fire,/ And forth his smoaking gorge came sulphur smoke.”⁷ Through popular literature, exemplified by fireworks on the stage and dragons on the page, sulfur’s smell became a disenchanted metaphor and less an environmental signifier of evil manifestations throughout the seventeenth century.⁸

The proportional representation of sulfur’s scent was therefore defined through a discursive battle in which the secularizing voices of literature and natural philosophy were progressively capable of defining sulfur’s pungency differently than religious dogma, and Englishpersons were increasingly listening to English author’s secular definitions. Shakespeare specifically made sulfur’s violent sensory characteristics a metaphor to pain, both emotional and physical. Audience members at the Globe in secularizing London were increasingly influenced by the anodyne of metaphor pronounced by Lord Chamberlain’s Men, rather than fear the smell of sulfur as the devil. When Othello stood above Desdemona’s recently deceased body in *Othello* (1603) he cried out, “From the possession of this heavenly sight, Blow me about in winds, roast me in sulphur, Wash me in deepe downe gulphes of liquid fire: O Desdemona, Desdemona.”⁹ As well, playwright Christopher Marlowe applied sulfur as metaphor to ancient gods and hubris in his works

⁷ Samuel Rowlands, *Famous History of Guy, Earle of Warwicke* (London: Elizabeth All-de, 1607), quote on 39-43.

⁸ For another metaphorical use of sulfur see the tales of loss and rescued hearts in the journeys of Britomart in Spenser’s *The Faerie Queen* (1590). Edmund Spenser, *The Faerie Queene Disposed into Twelve Books* (London: William Ponsonbie, 1590), esp. 157-160.

⁹ William Shakespeare, “Othello,” in *The Arden Shakespeare: Complete Works*, edited by Richard Proudfoot (London: Thomson Learning, 2007), quote on 926. For background on fiction’s ability to alter the sensorium see, Bruce Smith, “Afterword: Senses of an Ending,” in *Shakespearean Sensations: Experiencing Literature in Early Modern England*, ed. Katharine Craik and Tanya Pollard (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), esp. 208-209.

on Tamerlane and Queen Dido.¹⁰ The comedies of Francis Beaumont and John Fletcher likewise applied sulfur's sensory characteristics as metaphors. The writers' *A King and No King* (1619) compared the flames of sulfur to visible ugliness: "But thou appear'st to me after thy grant,/ The ugliest, loathed detestable thing/ That I ever met with. Thou hast eyes/ Like the flames of Sulphur."¹¹

Additionally increasing the semantic dispersion of sulfur were olfactory metaphors of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries that included diverse meanings made operative through patriarchal power.¹² Within Tudor England, women were often deemed incapable of controlling the flow of their breath, and therefore their possibly critical words. This provided women the potential for power that the patriarchy found troublesome.¹³ Accordingly, the "common scold," the term for a female gossip or hysterical woman during the Early Modern Era, was often negatively considered "animated gunpowder...always belching forth flames of sulphur." These gossips, often punished through wearing metal

¹⁰ Christopher Marlowe, *Tamburlaine the Great Who, from a Scythian Shepheard, by his Rare and Woonderfull Conquests, became a Most Puissant and Mightye Monarque* (London: Richard Jhones, 1590), 54; Christopher Marlowe, *The Tragedie of Dido Queene of Carthage played by the Children of her Maiesties Chappell* (London: The Widdowe Orwin for Thomas Woodcocke, 1594), 10.

¹¹ Francis Beaumont, John Fletcher, and William Marshall, *Fifty Comedies and Tragedies. Written by Francis Beaumont and John Fletcher, Gentlemen. All in One Volume. Published by the Authors Original Copies, the Songs to Each Play Being Added* (London: J. Macock and H. Hills, for John Martyn, Henry Herringman, Richard Marriot, 1679), quotes on 193-194.

¹² For gender and the senses see the reading of controlling touch in, Erin Benay and Lisa Rafanelli, *Faith, Gender and the Senses in Italian Renaissance and Baroque Art: Interpreting the Noli Me Tangere and Doubting Thomas* (Burlington: Ashgate, 2015), esp. 147-176, the improper tongues and voices of women in the Early Modern Era, and the control of orality through the printed word within, Carla Mazzio, "Sins of the Tongue," in *The Body in Parts: Fantasies of Corporeality in Early Modern Europe*, ed. David Hillman and Carla Mazzio (New York: Routledge, 1997), 53-80, and the reading of women as metaphors to leaky pipes within, Jonathan Gil Harris, "This is Not a Pipe: Water Supply, Incontinent Sources, and the Leaky Body Politic," in *Enclosure Acts: Sexuality, Property, and Culture in Early Modern England*, ed. Richard Burt and John Michael Archer (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994), 203-229.

¹³ For the importance of female agency to listen, as much as to speak in an era when their breaths were controlled as troublesome, as part of what shaped concern over female ability to disrupt see, Gina Bloom, *Voice in Motion: Staging Gender, Shaping Sound in Early Modern England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007), 12-15, 66-110, esp. 84-96.

helmets called the “scold’s bridle” meant to suppress speaking with a bit placed within the lady’s mouth, had tongues that were described as “the clapper of the devil’s bell.” The inner sulfuric hotness discursively imposed upon these women led, as it had for sundry witches before them, to the use of “ducking chairs” meant to discipline unruly rumor-makers. Women were strapped to seats attached to *ad hoc* yard arms that stretched out above frigid English lakes and streams.¹⁴

The ladies were then slowly dipped into the water, and nearly drowned, to cool their brimstony temperaments.¹⁵ Gender was often policed through these sensory and rhetorical means.¹⁶ The construction of women as sensory others, trapped into categories where their voices were controlled as possibly including sulfur, marks one aspect of the primitive accumulation that drove women into specific forms of private labor and away from the public settings where their evil gossip could be spread as vigorous brimstone.¹⁷

¹⁴ Poor Robin, *Poor Robin's True Character of a Scold, or, The Shrews looking-glass Dedicated to all Domineering Dames, Wives Rampant, Cuckolds Couohant, and Hen-peckt Sneaks, in City or Country* (London: L. C., 1678), quotes on 3-4. For the idea of class relationships being created through the manipulation of gender categories and “women’s work” see, Judith Butler, “Speaking Up, Talking Back: Joan Scott’s Critical Feminism,” in *The Question of Gender: Joan W. Scott's Critical Feminism*, ed. Judith Butler and Elizabeth Weed (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2011), 11-30.

¹⁵ For analysis of “common scold,” “scold’s bridle,” and “ducking chairs” see controlling the devilish member of the female body, the open mouth, within, Lynda Boose, “Scolding Brides and Bridling Scolds: Taming the Woman's Unruly Member,” *Shakespeare Quarterly* 42, 2 (1991): 179-213, Danielle Tyson, *Sex, Culpability, and the Defence of Provocation* (London: Routledge, 2013), esp. 82-84, David Underdown, “The Taming of the Scold’: Enforcement of Patriarchal Authority in Early Modern England,” in *Order and Disorder in Early Modern England*, ed. Anthony Fletcher and John Stephenson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), and a 1719 example of “immoderate heat” to be cooled by ducking within, Robert Pierce Cruden, *The History of the Town of Gravesend in the County of Kent and of the Port of London* (London: William Pickering, 1843), 268-272.

¹⁶ For the tradition of equating women with bad odors throughout Western history see the reading of marjoram as a way women could cover their perceived pungency in Ancient Rome within, Shane Butler, “Making Scents of Poetry,” in *Smell and the Ancient Senses*, ed. Mark Bradley (London; New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2015), 74-89, and general analysis of herbalism and gender within, Heinrich von Staden, “Women and Dirt,” *Helios* 19, 1-2 (1992): 7-29.

¹⁷ For staging gender through smell, due to the male characters playing female roles on the stage see the reading of specific characters and their odors within, Holly Dugan, “Scent of a Woman: Performing the Politics of Smell in Late Medieval and Early Modern England,” *The Journal of Medieval and Early Modern*

Shakespearean era scholars, playwrights, and gossip retaliators used sulfur as a metaphor to describe the hubris of the ancient world, the pain of emotional loss, burning jealousy, dishonorable canards, or for controlling women through these absurd apparatuses. Sulfur colored eyes, sulfuric stench, and ancient trebuchets and triremes which smelled or looked of sulfuric fire all signaled to Elizabethan audiences and readers the manifestations of evil in metaphorically diverse means rather than inherently malevolent when sensed on earth.¹⁸

Hamlet (1599) included such a manipulation of odor that relied on shifting connections between the evil of hellish scents from the lived world onto a legendary past of the Danish throne. Throughout the play, smell marked the evil characters who doomed the prince to his fate. As Naomi Conn Liebler describes, Hamlet uncovers the smells of an “unweeded garden” and the politics of coup that are increasingly “rank and gross in nature.” When holding Yorick’s skull, Hamlet uncovers that Denmark is faced with a fomenting rebellion that needed to cure the “foul and pestilent congregation of vapors” that heavens breath upon him, and the odors that “hell itself breathes out/ Contagion to this world.”¹⁹ Shakespeare’s masterpiece is a play essentially about the retention of popular Catholic beliefs in England; about the ghosts that must be prayed for if they are ever to make it out of purgatory. When the Reformation banned the narratives of purgatory and hell from discourse in churches, those narratives, forever weakened, transitioned to a place

Studies 38, 2 (2008): 229-252.

¹⁸ For the control of women’s bodies through rhetoric and jokes about the female form in early modern England see, Laura Gowing, *Common Bodies: Women, Touch, and Power in Seventeenth-Century England* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003), esp. 4-5.

¹⁹ Naomi Conn Liebler, *Shakespeare's Festive Tragedy: The Ritual Foundations of Genre* (London: Routledge, 1995), quotes on 185-187.

on the stage.²⁰

The early Stuart comedy *The Puritan: Or the Widow of Watling-Street* (1607), most likely written by Thomas Middleton, exemplifies such a growing disenchantment with sacred metaphors for the odors of hell. The performance included a confidence game in which the show's antagonist Captain Idle conjured a demon with hopes of becoming principal suitor to the play's protagonist Lady Plus. The gullible Edmund, the son of Lady Plus, humorously bought into this confidence game proclaiming the truth of the conjuror's skills in bringing about the demonic presence: "Oh! This Room's mightily hot I'saith. Man? Shirt sticks to my Belly already; what a steam the Rogue has left behind him? For, this room must be air'd, Gentlemen, it smells horribly of Brimstone...let's open the Windows."²¹ Smells of the devil, and the idea that smells of the body signified evil, became jokes to be sneered at rather than confirmations of evil within the world.²² The Church could offer little resistance to such inherent mocking of their previously sulfuric truths as odoriferous witches, ghosts, and demons left the lived world for the printed page.

Literary critic Emily Friedman offers numerous other examples of sulfur within eighteenth century literature. My reading of sulfur's smell in this literature, especially in the century prior, signifies that odor was being displaced from the environment onto the

²⁰ Stephen Greenblatt, *Hamlet in Purgatory* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton Univ. Press, 2002), esp. 151, 240; George Wright, "Hendiadys and Hamlet," *PMLA* 96, 2 (Mar., 1981): 168-193.

²¹ Wentworth Smith and William Shakespeare, *The Puritan: or the Widow of Watling-Street [By W.S., I.E. Wentworth Smith? Sometimes Attributed to William Shakespeare. With an Engraved Frontispiece]* (London: N. Pub, 1709), quote on 1334. For another mocking reference to the devil's odor from the early modern stage see, Thomas Dilke, *The City Lady: Or, Folly Reclaim'd. A Comedy* (London: H. Newman, 1697), 38-40, and the general critical nature of the use of odor in *Westward Ho* (1604), which showed the restrictive controlling of space in early modern London, within, Hristomar Stanev, "The City Out of Breath: Jacobean City Comedy and the Odors of Restraint," *Postmedieval* 3, 4 (2012): 423-435.

²² For the seventeenth century use of farts for jokes that could include the metaphor of scented gunpowder or the fumes of evil see, Clare Brant, "Fume and Perfume: Some Eighteenth-Century Uses of Smell," *Journal of British Studies* 43, 4 (2004): esp. 450-455.

printed page. Friedman argues that sulfur had multivalent meanings for the reader of the eighteenth century that reinforced sensory identities. I argue against such hermeneutics through asserting that literature can work through a mechanism that empties the lived world through processes of hegemony that offers interplay between the market, nature, and literature. I offer a discursive battle between forces fighting over the rights to hegemony and state legitimacy rather than a cultural reading of multivalent synchronic references.²³

Applying this methodology, I argue that John Milton's *Paradise Lost* (1667) further moved religious ideals from an embodied experience of the senses to the secular and political debates of the English Civil War. Rather than asserting further the religiosity of the Reformation, Milton's work secularized sensory experiences. References to sulfur and brimstone within the narrative of Lucifer, his rebel angels, and Adam and Eve linked English debates on religion into the printed public sphere, further weakening the role of sulfur in the environment through displacing the meanings of sulfur from religious and embodied reality to political metaphor.²⁴

In turn, the devil's scent was modified by besieged pious Christians hoping to retain sensory divining abilities, the use of the senses to come across the presence of God or the devil on earth through sensory encounters, which they had applied through their understanding of the perfection of God's world within the Great Chain of Being, the early

²³ Emily Friedman, *Reading Smell in Eighteenth-Century Fiction* (Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2016), esp. 100-101, 112-118.

²⁴ John Milton, *Paradise Lost* (London: Longman, 1998 [1667]). For the political allegory of *Paradise Lost* see, Martin Dawes, "The Politics of Supernatural Wonders in *Paradise Lost*," in *Supernatural and Secular Power in Early Modern England*, ed. Marcus Harnes and Victoria Bladen (Farnham, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2015), 163-181, and the excess of sensation as dooming the political goals of the English Civil War within, Jens Martin Gurr, "The Senses and Human Nature in a Political Reading of *Paradise Lost*," in *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, ed. Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer (Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016), 177-195.

modern ordering hierarchy of heaven, the earth, and hell that included tiered organizations of heavenly, earthly, and demonic beings. Religious authors attempted to respond to the secularization of sulfur's smell by making their own definitions for the devil's scents malleable, further deconstructing the vital permanency upholding the Great Chain ideal as God's faultless conception.

The preacher Thomas Adams, a seventeenth century Puritan sermonizer, articulated the ability of the devil to mask the inherent sulfuric stench upon his figure through a process of self-sweetening. Adams summarized: "he that hath two infirmities, nay enormities that betray him: a stinking breath, and a halting foot. For his breath, though it smell of sulphure, and the hote steame of sinne and hell, yet hee hath art to sweeten it."²⁵ If the devil could mask his pungent traits, did those olfactory signatures matter at all? During the Early Modern Era, numerous writers began to implicitly increase questioning a discourse defining the smell of sulfur as inherently hellish. Religious writers tried to offer a devil malleable enough to resist the secularization of sulfur's scents.

Within the discursive combat between science and God, religious voices compared sulfur to the hubris of worldliness in a sacred context. Eliciting notions akin to Icarus's failed flight to the Sun, the sixteenth century English preacher John Bridges briefly summarized the tragic end of the life of the Roman era naturalist Pliny the Elder hoping to provoke an anti-scientific response from his dotting flock. Bridges summarized the cessation of Pliny's life was caused by, "too curiously searchinge oute the causes of the fiery flames of the Hill *Vesuvius*," stopped by the "piercyng ayre of the sulphure, and so

²⁵ Thomas Adams, *Englands Sicknes, Comparatively Conferred with Israels: Divided Into two Sermons* (London: E. Griffin for John Budge, and Ralph Mab, 1615), quote on 16-17.

hee perished for his curiositie.”²⁶

The foremost shift from sulfur’s odor signifying hell to sulfur’s aroma as metaphor to hell and other malevolent traits, took place diachronically throughout the seventeenth century. By 1700, references to the scents of hell as signifying demons, the devil, ghosts, or witches in the English environment had proportionately faded. Religious voices struggled to keep their flocks against this literary encouraged tide of science and secularism that pushed sulfur’s smell as the signification of evil “out the windows” and onto the printed page. Sensing material value in sulfur, many writers similarly, and more explicitly, began to question defining the rock’s stench as essentially signifying evil, especially after a proportional increase in the use of sulfur for progressive medicine, emerging science, and nascent coal-fired commerce. As the discursive power of physicians and alchemists increased, their narratives of the healthful powers of sulfur triumphed.

Religious scholars attempted to make a science of the fires of hell to resist these secularizing patterns. Puritan scholar Isaac Ambrose’s *Ultima* (1650) described the numerous traits of sulfuric fires in hell in a systematic manner meant specifically to question those, like John Calvin, who were increasingly attributing ideas about the lake of fire to religious metaphor and not material reality. Ambrose described the numerous traits of hell-fire through a skeptical and scientific method that exposed significant differences between the fire of earth, made by men, and the fire of hell, made by God. In doing, Ambrose further separated the realms of God from the realms of men, creating an

²⁶ John Bridges, *A Sermon, Preached at Paules Crosse on the Monday in Whitson Weeke Anno Domini. 1571 Entreating on This Sentence Sic Deus Dilexit Mundum, Vt Daret Vnigenitum Filium Suum, Vt Omnis Qui Credit in Eu[M] Non Pereat, Sed Habeat Vitam Æternam. So God Loved the Worlde, That He Gave His Only Begotten Sonne, That Al That Beleve on Him Shoulde Not Perysh, but Have Eternall Life* (London: Henry Binneman for Humfrey Toy, 1571), quote on 38-39.

ontological boundary between belief in the hell-fire that heated “body and soul both combustible” and the fires of men that included exclusively temporary heat and could not burn the soul nor touch the interior senses.²⁷

This shift to secular definitions of sulfur’s sensory attributes was caused, in part, by a semantic disenchantment with a world previously defined essentially through the universalizing logic of the Bible, its myriad derivatives, and the emerging doctrine of the Great Chain of Being. The growing value of sulfur for the general welfare, the use of sulfuric metaphors in works of fiction and for the control of women, and the classifications of new worlds as inherently wicked created many uses for sulfuric language that did not fit the singularly sacred metaphors used to define a sulfuric devil disembarking his pungent grovelers into the lived world.

“Malign Vapors of Sulphur” for the Public Good

Sulfur is a volatile element culturally as well as chemically.²⁸ Englishpersons developed numerous meanings for encountering the varied manifestations of the rock’s smell in English environments after the Renaissance. The devil’s metal was part of quicksilver, and alchemists believed for centuries that the rock was essential in the production and cleaning of nearly all metals. This was so well acknowledged by early

²⁷ Isaac Ambrose, *Ultima, The Last Things, in Reference to the First and Middle Things: or, Certain Meditations on Life, Death, Judgement, Hell, Right Purgatory, and Heaven* (London: J. A., 1650), esp. 146-154.

²⁸ For the history of sulfur in alchemical practice see the numerous examples of experimentation within, William Newman, *Promethean Ambitions: Alchemy and the Quest to Perfect Nature* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004), esp. 67-74, 109-112, and 253-254.

modern Englishpersons that *The Garden of the Muses* (1610) stated in poetic verse that every metal was “of Sulphur made” as an analogy to certainty.²⁹

The medieval alchemist found much use for sulfur as essential in their hopes of discovering the higher wisdom they believed they could learn from the writings of the original biblical prophets.³⁰ Usually living as both monks and scholars, many alchemists understood the mercurial and unstable nature of the rock.³¹ Bartholomew of England, a thirteenth century academic, defined varied types of natural formulations that included sulfur. He categorized broadly that: “brimstone is sometimes great and boistous, and full of drosse, and sometime pure, white, cleere and subtile.” He continued defining the varied manifestations of the rock for creating fire, quicksilver, and medicine while reminding his readers of sulfur’s stenchful and violent chemical attributes.³²

Ideas of moral certainty, political truth, and scientific verisimilitude worked

²⁹ John Bodenham and Anthony Munday, *The Garden of the Muses* (London: Edward Allde for John Tap, 1610), quote on 27.

³⁰ For links between alchemy and the market, especially regarding how malleable alchemical fields became to survive in the face of reason, see, Paul Kléber Monod, *Solomon's Secret Arts: The Occult in the Age of Enlightenment* (New Haven, Conn: Yale University Press, 2013), esp. 82-83, the importance of alchemy to modern chemistry and early modern European debates on the difference between artifice and nature within, William Newman, *Promethean Ambitions*, esp. 14-16, the roots of modern Western science within alchemical traditions of “books of secret” in early modern Italian city-states within, William Eamon, *Science and the Secrets of Nature: Books of Secrets in Medieval and Early Modern Culture* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994), esp. 114-119, and the importance of alchemy as a religious unifier within all social classes as important in the New Science within, Bruce Janacek, *Alchemical Belief: Occultism in the Religious Culture of Early Modern England* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2011), esp. 4-12.

³¹ Alchemists, using the works of Paracelsus, defined sulfur as one of three basic primes for the production of chemical reactions in metals. Oswald Croll, Henry Pinnell, and Paracelsus, *Philosophy Reformed & Improved in Four Profound Tractates* (London: M. S. for Lodowick Lloyd, 1657), esp. 120-123; Nicholas Goodrick-Clarke, *The Western Esoteric Traditions: A Historical Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 75-78.

³² Bartholomaeus, *Batman Uppon Bartholome: His Booke De Proprietatibus Rerum, Newly Corrected, Enlarged and Amended: with Such Additions As Are Requisite, Unto Every Severall Booke: Taken Foorth of the Most Approved Authors, the Like Heretofore Not Translated in English. Profitable for All Estates, As Well for the Benefite of the Mind as the Bodie* (London: Thomas East, 1582), quote on 267-269.

together during the seventeenth century to mark a new ideal for truth that was essentially constructed through market relationships. Though scientists and politicians rarely understood their actions as driven by economic necessity, it became apparent that each form of “truth” in the New Science began to rely upon rhetoric that deconstructed aspects of religious and popular culture that were possibly detrimental to economic growth.³³

For sulfur, this meant that as scientists increasingly used the product, they gradually found critiques of the scents and intensity of sulfuric chemical processes mislaid. Though alchemists and physicians had used sulfur for centuries prior, during the Early Modern Era the use of the product consequently intensified as medicine found footing against ever-present European disease environments.³⁴ The discourse outlining these uses was implicitly suppressed during earlier eras by the cultural weight of religious narratives defining sulfur’s scent as signifying evil presences on earth.³⁵ The medieval English monk Elias would therefore not use the healthful spas of Bath, a village in England’s south, for fear of the sulfuric smells emanating from the ponds that he associated to hell.³⁶ As well, many cooks would often avoid using eggs if they had too “excrementitious” of a sulfuric

³³ For the social construction of science as creating multiple truths that deconstructed religious ideals in fables and legends as a means to overcome the fallibility of the senses see, Barbara Shapiro, *Probability and Certainty in Seventeenth-Century England: A Study of the Relationships between Natural Science, Religion, History, Law, and Literature* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1983), esp. 22-23, 119-162.

³⁴ For the role of the market in the making of necessary visual cues within retail shops in early modern England as a way to signal to consumers the validity of a medical and retail good see, Patrick Wallis, “Consumption, Retailing, and Medicine in Early-Modern London,” *The Economic History Review* 61, 1 (2008): 26-53, esp. 46-49.

³⁵ Prior to the rise of science, alchemists were often accused of pacts with the devil, and were derided for their use of specific materials that were believed to be demonic. For examples see, Newman, *Promethean Ambitions*, esp. 54-62.

³⁶ C. M. Woolgar, *The Senses in Late Medieval England* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006), 121; Jonathan Reinartz, *Past Scents: Historical Perspectives on Smell* (Champaign: Illinois, 2014), 45.

odor.³⁷ As Deborah Harkness has described, many early modern towns often became concerned with alchemical stinks in their alleys leading to a wide dispersion of alchemical employment: “Alchemists may have spread out...because their practices were likely to annoy their neighbors with smoking stills, fires that were kept hot all day and night, noxious smells, and regular explosions.”³⁸

Though some religious voices continued to resist sulfur’s secular classifications, the product was increasingly applied throughout the Early Modern Era. Methods that increased the value of sulfur for alchemical and medical progress helped to limit the role of the pungent yellow rock as a signifier of the devil or hell in the lived world, especially as sulfur was increasingly being mined as anthracite and collected as seacoal for gunpowder and English boilers, making its smell progressively ubiquitous within English sensescales.³⁹

Sulfur was used by alchemists and early physicians to treat venereal diseases. Though it was a sinful disease cured by sulfur, an ingredient which could signify evil through its smell, venereal diseases were not portrayed as ironically cured by an element believed to be part of hell. The physician and translator Thomas Ambroise recorded in 1665 that for curing the “Lues Venerea” some physicians prescribed “fumigations.” Many of the patients treated in this manner were “taken hold of by a convulsion, and a...trembling

³⁷ Robert Appelbaum, *Aguecheek's Beef, Belch's Hiccup, and Other Gastronomic Interjections Literature, Culture, and Food among the Early Moderns* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006), esp. 67-68.

³⁸ For the creation of neighborhoods in early modern London based on professional classes and knowledge exchange see, Deborah Harkness, “‘Strange’ Ideas and ‘English’ Knowledge: Natural Science and Exchange in Elizabethan London,” in *Merchants & Marvels: Commerce, Science and Art in Early Modern Europe*, ed. Pamela Smith and Paula Findlen (New York, NY: Routledge, 2002), 137-160, quote on 151.

³⁹ For background on odor and early modern medicine see, Richard Palmer, “In Bad Odour: Smell and its Significance in Medicine from Antiquity to the Seventeenth Century,” in *Medicine and the Five Senses*, ed. W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), esp. 61-68.

of their heads, hands, and legs, with a deafness, apoplexie, and lastly, miserable...death, by reason of the malign vapors of sulphur...drawn in by their mouth, nose, and all the rest of the bodie.”⁴⁰ Though a violent treatment, sulfuric vapors were used to treat not only this venereal condition, later attributed to blinding and malforming syphilis, but the social disease of heresy as well. Priests would frequently submit non-believers to a burning of sulfur, forcing the violent vapors up the noses of heretics deemed impious in hopes of conversion induced through sulfuric laced paroxysms.⁴¹

Additional medical uses for the yellow rock continued from previously limited English traditions. Sulfur was described as able to treat ulcers in physician John Bannister’s *Generall and Particuler Curation of Ulcers* (1576) through the practice of drinking corrosive powders containing the element.⁴² Many uses for sulfur in early modern medical culture were intended as salves placed upon the skin for the treatment of acne. Swiss natural philosopher Conrad Gesner’s *New Jewel of Health* (1576) summarized “a powder made by sublimation” that worked through “eating away, and mortifying” acne-inducing substances through heating troubled skin. This powder included the scents of sulfur through its recipe of both sulfur and quicksilver used to heat liquids made into a balsam. But, with sulfuric

⁴⁰ Thomas Paré Ambroise, *De humani corporis fabrica. English. Selections. aut Spiegel, and J. G. Workes of That Famous Chirurgion Ambrose Parey Translated Out of Latin and Compared with the French by Tho Johnson. Whereunto Are Added Three Tractates Our of Adrianus Spigelius of the Veines, Arteries, & Nerves, with Large Figures. Also a Table of The* (S.l: E.C., 1665), quotes on 476-478.

⁴¹ Holly Dugan, *The Ephemeral History of Perfume: Scent and Sense in Early Modern England* (Baltimore, Md: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011), 43, 109. The French state also used sulfuric fire in the executions of Francois Ravallac and Francois Damiens. For these executions see, Michel Foucault, *Discipline and Punishment: The Birth of the Prison* (New York: Vintage, 2012 [1975]), esp. 42-54.

⁴² John Banister, *A Needefull, New, and Necessarie Treatise of Chyrurgerie Briefly Comprehending the Generall and Particuler Curation of Ulcers, Drawen Foorth of Sundrie Worthy Wryters, but Especially of Antonius Calmeteus Vergesatus, and Joannes Tagaltius, by John Banister...Hereunto Is Anexed Certaine Experiments of Mine Owne Invention, Truely Tried, and Daily of Me Practised* (London: Thomas Marshe, 1575), 21-23.

content early modern physicians were always wary of burning the skin “lyke to fyre,” which “both putrifyeth and corrupteth the place, to which this is applied.”⁴³

By the mid-seventeenth century, the majority of English references to sulfur associated the rock to emerging medicine and pharmacology. As cleanliness became an everyday goal of Englishpersons during the seventeenth century, exemplified by Thomas Tryon’s *Treatise on Cleanliness* (1682), debates on sulfur were made complex as sulfuric odors could both clean and dirty various English abodes. Tryon observed that cleanliness and deodorizing had become such a fascination in England that: “Most people take care that their furnitures are daily brushed and rubbed, and their very floors washed, as though they were to eat their food on them.”⁴⁴

For the English, sulfur was a cleaning product that could burn away filth and fumigate against malign vapors protruding from city streets, spoiled and diseased food in village markets, and miasmatic marshes.⁴⁵ As well, sulfur could make dirty English homes in religious contexts by bringing the scents of the underworld nearer to Tryon’s increasingly private and cleansed English chambers. The dichotomy between the positive and negative attributes of sulfur involved mixed connotations whereby physicians, scientists, and soldiers were essentially exempt from religious definitions of sulfur as signifying the devil because of the instrumentality that sulfur provided for sanitization,

⁴³ Conrad Gessner, and George Baker, *The Newe Jewell of Health Wherein Is Contayned the Most Excellent Secretes of Phisicke and Philosophie* (London: Henrie Denham, 1576), quote on 108-110.

⁴⁴ Keith Thomas, “Cleanliness and Godliness in Early Modern England” in Patrick Collinson, Anthony Fletcher, and Peter Roberts, *Religion, Culture, and Society in Early Modern Britain: Essays in Honour of Patrick Collinson* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994, 56-83), 70-76, quote on 76.

⁴⁵ For the odor of medieval towns see the archaeological examples within Eastern Europe described within, Lasz  Bartosiewicz, “There’s Something Rotten in the State. . .: Bad Smells in Antiquity,” *European Journal of Archaeology* 6, 2 (2013): 175-195.

science, and military progress. That exemption allowed doctors, alchemists, and military officers to implicitly provide accounts of sulfur's positivity against the narratives of priests and preachers that defined the smell of sulfur as signifying wickedness in the world.

Sulfur could be used as part of a fumigation recipe to cure relatively innocuous diseases like lethargy, and more tenacious epidemics like the plague. Sixteenth century physician Philip Barrough discussed the method of using sulfur within a compound, "burnt a litle, and holden to the nosethrills," used to wake tired or unconscious persons.⁴⁶ Such olfactory fumigation methods later included larger scale processes introduced by both the English state and private medicine to induce healthful populations; particularly for the extermination of miasmas that killed English cattle or for cleaning exceedingly infectious sailing vessels in an era when many still questioned the purifying capabilities of water.⁴⁷

Fumigation was later vital for curing the effects of the intensely lethal London plague of 1665.⁴⁸ Daniel Defoe, the famed diarist of the outbreak, and of the Great Fire of London to follow a year later in 1666, described how the poor in Newgate Market created

⁴⁶ Philip Barrough, *The Methode of Phisicke Conteyning the Causes, Signes, and Cures of Inward Diseases in Mans Body from the Head to the Foote. Whereunto Is Added, the Forme and Rule of Making Remedies and Medicines, Which Our Phisitians Commonly Use at This Day, with the Proportion, Quantitie, & Names of Ech [Sic] Medicine* (London: Thomas Vautroullier, 1583), quotes on 19-21.

⁴⁷ Richard Bradley, *The Gentleman and Farmer's Guide For the Increase and Improvement of Cattle, Viz. Lambs, Sheep, Hogs, Calves, Cows, Oxen: Also the Best Manner of Breeding, and Breaking Horses, Both for Sport and Burden* (London: Mears, 1732), 199-201; John Wilkinson, *Tutamen Nauticum Or, the Seaman's Preservation from Shipwreck, Diseases, and Other Calamities Incident to Mariners. By John Wilkinson, M.D.* (London: Printed for Dodsley, Pall-Mall, 1763), 122-123. As well, fumigations were used in the emerging clinical ideal. For later examples see, John Leake, *Medical Instructions Towards the Prevention and Cure of Chronic Diseases Peculiar to Women....To which are added, prescriptions...in English, etc. (Practical Observations on the Child-Bed Fever, and the Acute Diseases in General, Most Fatal to Women During the State of Pregnancy.) Fifth Edition, with Additions* (London: London: R. Baldwin; H. Payne, 1781), 153-155.

⁴⁸ For the sensory history of European plagues see, David Gentilcore, "Purging Filth: Plague and Responses to it in Rome, 1656-7," in *Rome, Pollution, and Propriety: Dirt, Disease, and Hygiene in the Eternal City from Antiquity to Modernity*, ed. Mark Bradley and Kenneth Stow (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 153-168.

anti-plague fumigations for “airing and sweetening their houses.” They “burnt perfumes, incense, Benjamin, resin, and Sulphur...and let the air carry it all out with a blast of gunpowder.” The plague, treated through Englishperson’s healthful and cleansing explosions, would be destroyed by the Great Fire due in part to the washing powers of sulfuric smoke, which kept the fire moving through gunpowder stores met by the meandering flames as they slalomed through the city’s tortuous avenues. The London fire, fed by these numerous encounters with the capitol’s arsenals, flooded nasal canals with the stench of sulfur while burning off the diseased vapors of early modern English streets.⁴⁹

George Bate’s later *Pharmacopoeia Bateana* (1694) summarized many of these early modern English medical practices that included sulfur. The rock could be used as part of a water concoction to cure a common cough, as the means to ferment calf’s blood for curing numerous lung disorders, to remedy sores in the mouth and gums, to rectify numerous spirits for the creation of perfumes, and to treat “Continual and Continent Fevers.” When rectifying such spirits for perfume and alcohol based medicines English scholars stayed prudent to watch out for sulfuric fires, “for they come with a great deal of

⁴⁹ Daniel Defoe, and Gideon Harvey, *History of the Plague in London, 1665: To Which Is Added the Great Fire of London, 1666* (London: Bell & Daldy, 1869), 200; Neil Hanson, *The Great Fire of London In That Apocalyptic Year, 1666* (Hoboken, New Jersey: J. Wiley, 2002), esp. 38. Thomas Brooks discussed the facts of the fire as punishment from God for the sins of lascivious Londoners. He discussed the fire of London as metaphor to the fires of hell, but not containing hellish manifestations within their flames. The fire of hell was infinitely stronger than that which consumed London: “our fire is made by the hand of man, and must be maintained by continual supplies of fuel: take away the Coals, the Wood, the combustible matter, and the fire goes out: but the internal fire is created, and tempered, and blown by the hand of an angry sin revenging God.” Thomas Brooks, *London's Lamentations: Or, a Serious Discourse Concerning That Late Fiery Dispensation That Turned Our (Once Renowned) City into a Ruinous Heap. Also the Several Lessons That Are Incumbent upon Those Whose Houses Have Escaped the Consuming Flames* (London: J. Hancock and N. Ponder, 1670), quote on 113. For reference to the use of gunpowder to cure an earlier Italian plague, due to the cleaning powers of sulfur, see, Johann Jacob Wecker, and R. Read, *Eighteen Books of the Secrets of Art & Nature Being the Summe and Substance of Naturall Philosophy, Methodically Digested* (London: Printed for Simon Miller, 1660), 26-27.

violence...if driven too furiously.”⁵⁰

The essential guide for later English and early American homemakers of the eighteenth century, Eliza Smith’s *Complete Housewife* (1727), similarly summarized the use of sulfur for numerous concoctions: powders for the curing of pimples, a drink to “preserve the lungs,” another liquid to cure asthmatic fits, and for burning off of enflamed hemorrhoids: “let the party dip their finger in balsam of sulphur made with oil of turpentine, and anoint the place two or three times a day.”⁵¹

Akin to this cultural shift towards accepting sulfur and its pungent odors as positive for healthcare, sulfur was used within gunpowder despite its previous manifestations of signifying hell in English sensescapes.⁵² The rise of large state armies, which needed the scents of sulfuric gunpowder to be deemed culturally proper, implicitly forced the gradual removal of the devil from semiotic associations to the scents of gunpowder. These connotations were originally designated to a demonically inspired German Friar named Bartold Schwarz.⁵³ However, as the Early Modern Era progressed, and gunpowder became essential for state defense, the religious connotations for gunpowder were semantically weakened. The idea that gunpowder was from the devil entered the realm of the unspeakable, or at least the realm of the mocking, because religious alternative meanings

⁵⁰ George Bate, James Shipton, and William Salmon, *Pharmacopœia Bateana* (London: S. Smith and B. Walford, 1694), quotes on 95-107.

⁵¹ Eliza Smith, *The Compleat Housewife Or, Accomplished Gentlewoman's Companion* (London: J. Pemberton, 1729), quotes on 209, 250, 298.

⁵² For sulfur, gunpowder, and the state see, Brenda Buchanan, *Gunpowder, Explosives and the State: A Technological History* (Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2006), esp. 22-24.

⁵³ Jonathan Gil Harris, *Untimely Matter in the Time of Shakespeare* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009), esp. 127. For early modern gunpowder recipe see, Jacques Rohault, *Rohault's System of Natural Philosophy Illustrated with Dr. Samuel Clarke's Notes Taken Mostly Out of Sr. Isaac Newton's Philosophy. With Additions...Done into English by John Clarke* (London: James and John Knapton, 1729), 191-193.

prevented the full access of the state to gunpowder's myriad benefits.

References to weaponry that used sulfur were increasingly signified as less from the devil, and more for the progress of the state. State leaders increasingly desired to limit the *pharmakon* of religious sensory alternatives to the state's own discourses of power. In this project, English translations of ancient works included references to the use of sulfur in Greek and Roman weaponry. Much of this attribution of sulfur as positive came from an English obsession with the state prowess of ancient Greece and Rome. Early modern English writers triumphantly summarized and translated the works of the Roman historian Appian to describe Hannibal's Carthaginians, who used naval tactics that included "filling their boates with flaxe and brushe, within the wals, that the enimyes should not see it from the shippes...they layd on sulphure and pitch, and then set up sayle...the which being carried with the winde blewe lustily, into the Romane navye, sette the shippes on fire and almost burned them all." Hannibal's use of sulfur in this manner was later attributed as one of the first instances of chemical warfare as the Carthaginian ships, filled with snakes covered in sulfur and tar, were meant to spread both fire to Roman skins and sulfur dioxide gas to ancient lungs.⁵⁴ Rather than find in these tactics the serpentine evils of a sulfuric underworld, Englishpersons articulated these actions as evidence of *pro patria* triumph.

English deacon and religious chronicler Edward Kellett noted ironically in *The Threefold Supper of Christ* (1641) that later European ammunitions using gunpowder included elements that other English religious writers defined as hellish. He questioned, "Who would have thought, that the River-water should be the chief ingredient to make

⁵⁴ Appianus, *An Auncient Historie and Exquisite Chronicle of the Romanes Warres, Both Ciuile and Foren.* (London: Raulfe Newberrie and Henrie Bynniman, 1578), quotes on 226-227, 242-244; Eric Taylor, *Lethal Mists: An Introduction to the Natural and Military Sciences of Chemical, Biological Warfare and Terrorism* (Huntington, NY: Nova Science, 1998), esp. 1-6.

Gunpowder?” Such “River-water” was lava-laden water which exited hell from the River Styx as guarded by the god Charon, the ferry-man to Hades. Kellett adored the inventors of gunpowder, rather than judge them immoral for their use of hellish elements. He offered that England’s “brackish fountains; our Baths; our Brimstony springs, or rivulets, may perhaps” provide sulfuric content for English muskets.⁵⁵ As the commercial market for gunpowder grew, newly prominent state armies enlisted forces with gunpowder ammunition, and new and myriad medical uses for sulfur intensified, Englishpersons shifted away from defining the smell of the devil’s element as signifying perdition when encountered on earth.

Europeans to the south had sometimes classified military disasters as emanating from hell due to the sulfuric stench of gunpowder left after cannon battles. In 1521, the Spanish loss of the Duchy of Brabant had included a torrential rain of ammunition from a “horrible noise in the cloudes” that released a “fyre of heaven” that smelled “unto sulphur and brimstone.” The tone offered by the French humanist Pierre Boaistuau, throughout an encyclopedic work that summarized this specific defeat and other sixteenth century battles, described this hellfire as not simply gunpowder but as supernaturally inspired as punishment for prideful Spanish leadership.⁵⁶ The metaphor of sulfur’s scent as evil or hubris continued to describe later English battles as well, but did not inherently signify evil in the world nor prevent the use of sulfur for gunpowder due to its inherent hellishness because Englishpersons were reconciling their older religious beliefs with their newfound

⁵⁵ Edward Kellett, *Tricoenivm Christi: in nocte proditiōis svae. The Threefold Supper of Christ in the Night that he was Betrayed* (London: Thomas Cotes for Andrew Croke, 1641), quotes on 564-566.

⁵⁶ Pierre Boaistuau, and Edward Fenton, *Certaine Secrete Wonders of Nature Containing a Descriptio[N] of Sundry Strange Things, Seming Monstrous in Our Eyes and Judgement, Bicause We Are Not Privie to the Reasons of Them. Gathered Out of Divers Learned Authors As Well Greeke As Latine, Sacred As Prophane* (London: Henry Bynneman, 1569), quote on 20-22.

imperialism and military progress by rebuffing religious definitions of the world that limited advances into modernity.

A relation of the explosion of Great Torrington Church during the English Civil War included a metaphor to hell based on the scents of sulfur caused by the explosion. The pamphlet, *A Fuller Relation of Sir Thomas Fairfax's Routing All the Kings Armies in the West* (1646), summarized how the Parliamentarians defeated the Cavaliers through artillery that destroyed “the walls of the Church,” after which “all fell and dispersed abroad...the Timber, glasse, stone work, lead, are all lost being dispersed and torn in pieces...like the shot of Granadoes: We feared a treachery...for the blow was so great as any Ordnance could give, Hell itself could not make a more hideous sulphur.”⁵⁷ Throughout the seventeenth century, secular Englishpersons authority to define sulfur, and expend its content in war, became more powerful than the devil’s sulfuric traits as defined by religious writers. The devil could not make as “hideous” sulfur as the New Model Army, especially after a discursive shift away from religious definitions of sulfur’s odor limited fearing the smell of pungent sulfur as inherently satanic.

No longer could religious voices singularly define sulfur as the smell of the devil in a London, York, or Manchester where sulfur was increasingly present. Only as literary metaphor could sulfur’s odors retain significance as evil, as in English sensescape such significance was increasingly omitted. In the late seventeenth century, Englishpersons began to experiment with the wide use of cloud inducing coal fire to heat homes, especially in the growing central metropolis of London. The diarist and monarchist John Evelyn thus wrote of the Restoration Era capitol city in *Fumifugium* (1661) as full of a “deleterious

⁵⁷ *A Fuller Relation of Sir Thomas Fairfax's Routing All the Kings Armies in the West* (London: Mathew Walbanck, 1646), quotes on 12-14.

quality” that floated in “clouds of smoake and sulphur, so full of stink and darkness.”⁵⁸ Implicit in such a reference were metaphorical ties to the darkness and pungency of hell, but no longer a hell manifesting itself in the world explicitly through the specific sulfuric coal which choked city dwellers, blackened miners, and saddled the future workers of the Industrial Revolution with hefty sacks of trenchant bitumen.

The market forced the removal of evil from sulfuric associations, making critiques of sulfuric odors that emerged from coal burning in breweries and brick kilns less potent to English minds. Newly impotent, the small environmental movement, exemplified by Evelyn, the writings of Timothy Nourse, and elites who wanted their homes to remain spectacles of class grandeur, focused upon critiquing excesses of coal smoke, usually with little fruition except in specific local contexts, rather than critiquing coal smoke at its core as something evil within English atmospheres.⁵⁹

Sulfuric Odors in Historical Context

Throughout the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries sulfur became a prized commodity for European nations attempting to create cartels to control the trade of the

⁵⁸ John Evelyn, *Fumifugium, or, The Inconveniencie of the Aer and Smoak of London Dissipated: Together with Some Remedies Humbly Proposed* (London: W. Godbid for Gabriel Bedel and Thomas Collins, 1661), quotes in preface, and 11. For the idea that the rise of capitalism was inherently tied to skepticism about the ways human populations were slowly alienated from the natural world see the reading of ecological imagination within the Christian worldview about the senses analyzed within, Robert Watson, *Back to Nature: The Green and the Real in the Late Renaissance* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2006), esp. 44-46.

⁵⁹ For the rising use of coal, and desire of Charles I to control coal smoke as a means of spectacle to protect the environment for the portrayal of London on the world stage, see William Cavert, "The Environmental Policy of Charles I: Coal Smoke and the English Monarchy, 1624-40," *Journal of British Studies* 53, 2 (2014): 310-333, and the concerns over coal smoke during the seventeenth century within, Keith Thomas, *Man and the Natural World: Changing Attitudes in England, 1500-1800* (London: Allen Lane, 1983), esp. 244-245.

product. Its use, especially within gunpowder, made the substance essential to state growth and defense. As well, the derivative sulfuric acid was vital in the growth of modern chemistry due to its highly reactive nature within chemical processes. The goals of extracting phosphates for the creation of fertilizers or creating fungicides and bactericides drove states to cordon off large portions of the world's sulfur supply to avoid Malthusian inevitabilities. Such advances left many modern peoples choking from anthracite coated lungs incrustated upon by once buried soft coal floated into the hazes of modernity.⁶⁰

In 1527, Pope Clement VII had outlawed trading sulfur to barbarian tribes near the Italian frontier. Sulfur, that evil metal with a scent that signified hell, was prized enough to evoke the controls of the papal state upon its movement. Did the Church control the trade to ward off evil? Was the rock's trade symbolic of emergent maliciousness as identified by Rome, the rise of the devil divined by the pious, or the increased positioning of demons and witches on earth? Certainly not, the rock's movement was controlled by Pope Clement, and later popes of the sixteenth century, European states of the Early Modern Era, and corporate cartels of the modern world due to the necessities of maintaining the power of state and market.⁶¹

In the modernization process, the cultural repercussions of the Reformation limited the use of the lower senses, tasting and smelling, to divine supernatural presences. As

⁶⁰ Gerald Kutney, *Sulfur: History, Technology, Applications & Industry* (Toronto: ChemTec Publishing, 2013), 6-42.

⁶¹ For a general history of the pollution of London from seacoal, with a specific focus on controlling the pollution of specific industries, see, Peter Brimblecombe, *The Big Smoke: A History of Air Pollution in London Since Medieval Times* (London: Methuen, 1987), esp. 32-50, and the royal concern with the smell of dyemakers and seacoal that were to be covered over by the power of bright colors within, Jane Schneider, "Fantastical Colors in Foggy London: The New Fashion Potential of the Late Sixteenth Century," in *Material London, Ca. 1600*, ed. Lena Cowen Orlin (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2000), 109-127, esp. 112-118.

described within the introduction, this diachronic split in the Western sensory hierarchy relies on an understanding of the “great divide of the senses” between pre-modern multisensory societies and modern visually defined and logocentric Western cultures. During the Early Modern Era, vision became the most eminent sense as the arbiter of reason, and the lower senses were valued less and consequently used less within Western sensory consciousness.⁶²

Deeper analysis of this process of Reformation directed desensitization, through the lens of sulfur, shows that in seventeenth-century England religious definitions began to fade into less religiously influenced metaphors through the effects of scientific instrumentality and popular literature, which operated dually to displace religion’s ability to define the environment through spiritual means. Secularism won this discursive battle through emptying religious metaphors of their previously singular meanings and then re-engaging those metaphors as secularized and environmentally invalid signifiers.

During the Medieval Era, bridges between signifier and signified were linked through the universality of religious language. The Renaissance shook this bridge, and the scholarly output of the Enlightenment, unevenly disseminated to different Western populations from the era of Francis Bacon to the French Revolution, attempted to re-link the signifier and the signified through creating new singular truths based upon observable evidence.⁶³

⁶² Robert Jütte, *A History of the Senses: From Antiquity to Cyberspace* (Cambridge, UK: Polity, 2005), esp. 8-12; Constance Classen, David Howes, and Anthony Synnott, *Aroma: The Cultural History of Smell* (London: Routledge, 1994), esp. 57-73; Sigmund Freud, *Civilization and Its Discontents* (New York: Norton, 1961 [1930]); Dominique Laporte, *History of Shit* (Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press, 2000).

⁶³ For distance between signifier and signified in this era see, Robert Miles, *Gothic Writing, 1750-1820: A Genealogy* (London: Routledge, 1993), esp. 31-32; Robert Chia, *Organizational Analysis As Deconstructive Practice* (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1996), esp. 42-45.

Understanding the varied definitions for the smell of sulfur involves accepting that early moderns created multiple definitions for similar biological sensory experiences during an era when this discursive battle between science and God intensified. These multiple meanings for sulfur created after the Renaissance, an era that instituted a new linguistic episteme with the goal of limiting the distance between signifier and signified for scientific advancement, changed the English mind to believe in multiple sensory definitions for their everyday encounters with sulfur's pungency.⁶⁴

References to sulfur's smell contained both positive and negative associations during the Early Modern Era. Sulfur included both hellish implications and positive inferences to medicine, alchemy, or the progress of modernity. The discursive shift from religious definitions of sulfur's odor to secular definitions of sulfur's stench, which intensified during the seventeenth century, involved a change in proportion rather than a comprehensive linguistic displacement. The sheer abundance of sulfuric substances in the environment, caused by increased uses for the rock, added to this dislodgment of religious definitions of sulfur's smell as signifying evil within English sensescapes.⁶⁵

Forms of cultural education shifted to incorporate changing desires for specific goods.⁶⁶ As the Industrial Revolution stuffed English chimneys with more coal and sulfur smoke, the smell of brimstone moved even lower as a problematic odor for the popular

⁶⁴ Michel Foucault, *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1971).

⁶⁵ For the discursive battle between these knowledge bases see, Kocku von Stuckrad, *Locations of Knowledge in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Esoteric Discourse and Western Identities* (Leiden: Brill, 2010), esp. 9-12.

⁶⁶ John Money, "Teaching in the Market-Place, or 'Caesar adsum jam forte: Pompey aderat': the Retailing of Knowledge in Provincial England during the Eighteenth Century," in *Consumption and the World of Goods*, ed. John Brewer and Roy Porter (London; New York: Routledge, 1993), 335-380.

masses. Continuously taught that sulfur meant profit and not evil, English noses found less sin, ecological or religious, in the smell of acrid smoke. As historian Stephen Mosley has noted of these later eras: “unlike the foul odours associated with miasmas,” coal smoke “did not fill the Victorian city dweller with apprehension. Indeed, many people actively embraced the idea that this form of air pollution deodorized and disinfected the urban atmosphere.”⁶⁷

⁶⁷ Stephen Mosley, *The Chimney of the World: A History of Smoke Pollution in Victorian and Edwardian Manchester* (Cambridge, UK: White Horse Press, 2001), 79-84, quote on 84. For later campaigns against coal pollution in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries in London see, Eric Ashby and Mary Anderson, *The Politics of Clean Air* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981), esp. 4-7.

Chapter 3

“Ravishing Odors of Paradise”:

Jesuits, Olfaction, and Seventeenth Century North America

Jesuit missionary Jean de Lamberville stated in 1673 that the “gospel” was “too weak” to convert Native Americans. While working consistently with Mohawks and Onondagas near the St. Lawrence Valley, Lamberville observed Native Americans who appreciated gods who instructed and provided through the entirety of the senses. Lamberville noted, “these tribes, who are chiefly guided by the senses, needed that God should instruct them in a sensible manner.”¹ This celebrated Father, who was believed to have converted the later Roman Catholic Saint Kateri Tekakwitha, realized at this juncture what many Jesuits discovered throughout the early decades of the French colonial experiment in North America, the desire of Native Americans to have a broad assortment of sensation bound within spiritual rituals.

Knowing that Native Americans valued the sensate, Jesuits turned to their noses when trying to convert them. As historian James Axtell noted, “the mysterious fragrance of incense, which resembled [Native Americans] own tobacco offering to the Great Spirit” proved important to many Jesuit conversion efforts.² Most indigenous Americans resisted these Catholic attempts at conversion, and many Jesuits died tortuous deaths due to Iroquois advances during the 1640s and Native American retributive acts throughout the later colonial era. However, for brief periods of possible coexistence in New France, upon the St. Lawrence Valley, and on the later Pays d’en Haut, Natives and Jesuits attempted to find commonalities towards coexistence. These goals of cohabitation included highlighting the spiritual reverence of the lower senses, which increased the importance of smelling

¹ Tracy Leavelle, *The Catholic Calumet: Colonial Conversions in French and Indian North America* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012), quotes on 137-138.

² James Axtell, *The Invasion Within: The Contest of Cultures in Colonial North America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1985), quote on 278.

within cross-cultural exchanges that assisted in the New World retention of odor through the necessity of marking sameness and difference within racial and spiritual orders.³

European state formation, which involved the introduction of sewage projects and subconsciously induced social controls associated with the civilizing process, gradually limited the olfactory in daily life within Europe after the sixteenth century. Jesuits resisted many of these deodorizing tendencies within early modern Europe through confronting Reformation dogma that aimed to control the lower senses of tasting and smelling. These purifying goals were meant to rid Catholic sensuality from Christianity through the heightened use of vision for scriptural analysis. Jesuits crossing the Atlantic to North America in the 1600s, applying respect for the senses as spiritual guides, entered France's American experiment with open noses often uncontrolled by these desensitizing aspects of the Reformation.⁴

Indigenous populations within the American interior frequently appreciated odor in their lives, especially within spiritual practices tied to medicine and subsistence hunting.⁵

³ Jesuits entering the New World often believed that Native American cultures were inherently ephemeral. This "inconstancy" defined for many Jesuits a lack of civilization among their Native American converts, who would often revert to previous states of nature after time away from the Jesuit's guiding hands. For many who tried to convert the Western Hemisphere to the Catholic cross, it became vital to find tactics that entrenched the word of God deep into the body of the convert, as opposed to simply a facile conversion on paper or through the spoken word. For beliefs about the lack of permanence of Native American conversion see the experience of Jesuits in Brazil, among different cannibalistic nations, in Eduardo Batalha Viveiros de Castro, *The Inconstancy of the Indian Soul: the Encounter of Catholics and Cannibals in 16th-century Brazil* (Chicago: Prickly Paradigm Press, 2011), esp. 44-51.

⁴ For critiques on the binaries used to describe indigenous peoples as creating normative categories that have perpetuated despite evidence see, Peter Hulme, *Colonial Encounters: Europe and the Native Caribbean: 1492-1797* (New York: Routledge, 1992), esp. 14-43, and the reading of both pastoralism and primitivism described within, William Hamlin, *The Image of America in Montaigne, Spenser and Shakespeare: Renaissance Ethnography and Literary Reflection* (New York: St. Martin's, 1995), esp. 69-96.

⁵ For the standard work on Native American agency in early America see, Pekka Hämäläinen, *The Comanche Empire* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008), and the idea that Native Americans were adept at migration enough to strengthen their community ties even in the face of constant movement and violence, "parochial cosmopolitanism," within, Stephen Warren, *The Worlds the Shawnees Made: Migration and*

Jesuits learning of this common sensory ground applied, and increased, their own respect for odor to convert different nations to the Catholic faith. Fittingly, this emphasis on the olfactory suited the sensate desires of many Native Americans of the American interior.⁶

These olfactory cross-cultural achievements with goals of economic and cultural harmony were produced through “creative misunderstandings” between Europeans and indigenous North Americans.⁷ As Richard White stated, colonists “had the ability to establish avenues of communication and creativity through the unlikely path of misunderstanding,” creating “with Indian peoples mutually comprehensible worlds.”⁸ In a similar vein, Linford Fisher’s *The Indian Great Awakening: Religion and the Shaping of Native Cultures in Early America* (2012) has articulated how Native Americans co-opted fragments of Christianity rather than convert dogmatically. Within the historiographical tradition of New Indian History, Fisher argued conversion was ambiguous, modified, and fractured, existing as an ever-changing idea that had multifarious cultural, spiritual, and

Violence in Early America (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2014), esp. 12-18.

⁶ For structural aspects of borderland encounters and territorial claims see, Tamar Herzog, *Frontiers of Possession: Spain and Portugal in Europe and the Americas* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2015), and Eric Hinderaker and Rebecca Horn, “Territorial Crossings: Histories and Historiographies of the Early Americas,” *WMQ* 67, 3 (2010): 395-432.

⁷ Richard White, *The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1650–1815* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1991). For critiques of the Middle Ground: as a historiographical standard that places too much emphasis on power relationships see, Jeremy Adelman and Stephen Aron, “From Borderlands to Borders: Empires, Nation-States, and the Peoples in between in North American History,” *The American Historical Review* 104, 3 (1999): 814-841, the constant tension and warfare between Iroquois and French forces within, José Antônio Brandão, *Your Fyre Shall Burn No More: Iroquois Policy Toward New France and Its Native Allies to 1701* (Lincoln, Neb.: University of Nebraska Press, 1997), esp. 52-58, and a nuanced reading of gift-giving within, Catherine Desbarats, “The Cost of Early Canada’s Native Alliances: Reality and Scarcity’s Rhetoric,” *WMQ* 52, 4 (1995): 609-630.

⁸ Richard White, “Creative Misunderstandings and New Understandings,” *WMQ* 63, 1 (2006), quote on 13; For Michael McDonnell, the idea of the Middle Ground does not fully encapsulate power relationships from Native American perspectives. For McDonnell, the equality of relationship that the idea of a Middle Ground requires was absurd to most Native Americans who nearly always perceived themselves in control of the trading area because they surrounded interior European forts, had more land and goods, and understood trading policies. Michael McDonnell, *Masters of Empire: Great Lakes Indians and the Making of America* (New York: Hill and Wang, A Division of Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2015), esp. 13-37, 91-159.

religious meanings.⁹ Many of these conversions involved Native American social sampling; whereby specific nations would test traits of European culture, and then modify those ideals to their own means, or refuse the trait as other.¹⁰ In the late seventeenth century, Jesuit and Native American uses for odor persisted within these improvised and fragmentary cross-cultural middle grounds, partially created through a confused, but still valued, mutual appreciation of the knowledge that could be cultivated through scenting.¹¹

Recent historical analysis has focused on the importance of non-verbal communication in the colonial Americas. Matt Cohen's *The Networked Wilderness: Communicating in Early New England* (2010) highlighted a historiographical ignorance that has placed Native Americans as people apart from the book, whereas white colonists were tied integrally to the written word. Rather, colonials applied a vast array of non-visual and non-literary communication techniques in early New England, and Native Americans participated in the history of the book through publication procedures altered by their

⁹ These religious modifications are essential to understand how Native Americans experienced the Great Awakening. Linford Fisher, *The Indian Great Awakening: Religion and the Shaping of Native Cultures in Early America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012). For New Indian History and religious conversion as malleable rather than dogmatic see the linguistic analysis within, Leavelle, *Catholic Calumet*, esp. 97-123, and the choices of Native Americans regarding what aspects of Christianity to accept or deny within, Kenneth Morrison, *The Solidarity of Kin: Ethnohistory, Religious Studies, and the Algonkian-French Religious Encounter* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2002), and David Silverman, "Indians, Missionaries, and Religious Translation: Creating Wampanoag Christianity in Seventeenth-Century Martha's Vineyard," *WMQ* 62, 2 (2005): 141-174.

¹⁰ For similar cross-cultural borrowing, regarding changes in slave systems throughout the French Atlantic see, Brett Rushforth, *Bonds of Alliance: Indigenous and Atlantic Slavery in New France* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2012).

¹¹ For the importance of religion in the study of colonial identities on American borderlands see the example of Quakerism in, John Smolenski, *Friends and Strangers: The Making of a Creole Culture in Colonial Pennsylvania* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010), esp. 15-57, and the role of religious language for creating cultural harmony within, Patrick Erben, *A Harmony of the Spirits: Translation and the Language of Community in Early Pennsylvania* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia, by the University of North Carolina Press, 2012).

multisensory bases of identity.¹²

Native Americans and European colonials communicated through non-literary means more so than through the written words passed down to the paper archive. Therefore, media analysis should not define a boundary between logocentric Europeans and sensual Natives as both colonials and Native Americans informed the semiotic content of all media that was written, spoken, or smelled across cross-cultural boundaries. In this liminal discursive space, media was reconciled by different cultures to create a syncretic sensory experience that both Jesuit priests and Native Americans could access on aromatic middle grounds.¹³

As Robert Morrissey summarized, Jesuits desired conversion of Native Americans “on the Indians own terms,” opposing French imperial endeavors that hoped to unify indigenous languages for goals of political domination.¹⁴ The cultural expressions desired

¹² Matt Cohen, *The Networked Wilderness: Communicating in Early New England* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010). The reading of sounds and gestures within published texts and ethnographically, highlighted by Cohen as essential to understanding moments of Native American self-representation, has recently been expanded to discuss the importance of gestures in communication between participants in the French Atlantic within, Céline Carayon, *Beyond Words: Nonverbal Communication, Performance, and Acculturation in the Early French-Indian Atlantic (1500-1700)*, Ph.D. Dissertation, College of William and Mary, 2010.

¹³ For multisensory literateness see, Heidi Bohaker, “Indigenous Histories and Archival Media in the Early Modern Great Lakes,” in *Colonial Mediascapes: Sensory Worlds of the Early Americas*, ed. Matt Cohen and Jeffrey Glover (Lincoln: Nebraska, 2014), esp. 106-110, and goals of understanding Native American experience through material culture rather than the colonial archive within, Ann Smart Martin, “Material Things and Cultural Meanings: Notes on the Study of Early American Material Culture,” *WMQ* 53, 1 (1996): 5-12, esp. 10-11.

¹⁴ Robert Michael Morrissey, “The Terms of Encounter; Language and Contested Visions of French Colonization in the Illinois Country, 1673-1702,” in *French and Indians in the Heart of North America, 1630-1815*, ed. Robert Englebert and Guillaume Teasdale (East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 2013), quote on 64. For Jesuit sensory encounters with Native Americans see the gendered colors analyzed within, Tracy Leavell, “The Catholic Rosary, Gendered Practice, and Female Power in French-Indian Spiritual Encounters,” in *Native Americans, Christianity, and the Reshaping of the American Religious Landscape*, ed. Joel Martin and Mark Nicholas (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2010), 159-178, and the cross-cultural linguistic analysis within, Robert Michael Morrissey, “‘I Speak It Well’: Language, Cultural Understanding, and the End of a Missionary Middle Ground in Illinois Country, 1673-1712,” *Early American Studies* 9, 3 (2011): 617-648.

by Native Americans were not merely those terms visually presented as the written word or audibly preached. For most Native Americans of the colonial era, literateness implied more than Western ideals of reading and writing. One such literate sensory skill applied among North American nations was an increased olfactory awareness that read the smells of shifting American environments and incoming European occupiers.¹⁵

The Jesuit appreciation of odor was exacerbated by this powerful Native American desire for olfactory religiosity, symbolism, and knowledge acquisition.¹⁶ In the later seventeenth century, these Native American desires for multisensory, and especially olfactory, knowledge passed into French national goals driven by the fur trade. Later British imitators attempted to politicize through a similar olfactory sensory rhetoric desired by numerous Native Americans.¹⁷

¹⁵ Bohaker, "Indigenous Histories," esp. 106-110; Arjun Appadurai, *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization* (Minneapolis: Univ. of Minnesota Press, 1996), esp. 35-38.

¹⁶ Analyses of Jesuit immersion into other cultures can be accessed in, Ines Zupanov, "Twisting a Pagan Tongue: Portuguese and Tamil in Sixteenth-Century Jesuit Translations," in *Conversion: Old Worlds and New*, ed. Kenneth Mills and Anthony Grafton (Rochester, N.Y.: University of Rochester Press, 2003), 109-139, Eduardo Fernandez, "Jesuits in the U.S. Southwest during the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries: Agents and Chroniclers of Cross-Cultural Ministry and History," in *Cross-Cultural History and the Domestication of Otherness*, ed. Michal Jan Rozbicki and George Ndege (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), 83-102, William Farge, "Adapting Language to Culture: Translation Projects of the Jesuit Missions in Japan and China," in *Cross-Cultural History and the Domestication of Otherness*, ed. Michal Jan Rozbicki and George Ndege (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), 67-81, and Paul Shore, *Jesuits and the Politics of Religious Pluralism in Eighteenth-Century Transylvania: Culture, Politics, and Religion, 1693-1773* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007), esp. 147-152. For historiography on Jesuits and cross-cultural literacy activities in China see discussions of the famed Jesuit Matteo Ricci in, Sangkeun Kim, *Strange Names of God: The Missionary Translation of the Divine Name and the Chinese Responses to Matteo Ricci's Shangti in Late Ming China, 1583-1644* (New York: Lang, 2004), esp. 29-31, 67-82, Michela Fontana and Paul Metcalfe, *Matteo Ricci: A Jesuit in the Ming Court* (Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2011), esp. 99-111, and R. Po-chia Hsia, *A Jesuit in the Forbidden City: Matteo Ricci, 1552-1610* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010).

¹⁷ For the history of sensation in European encounters with Native America, regarding the "double aural advantage" that Native Americans used when producing sound in North America, see, Sarah Keyes, "'Like a Roaring Lion': The Overland Trail as a Sonic Conquest," *The Journal of American History* 96, 1 (June, 2009): 19-43, and the more general analysis of sensory encounters within, Peter Charles Hoffer, *Sensory Worlds in Early America* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003).

Scholars have recently discovered greater links between French colonies in the New World to highlight the important aspects of the interconnectivity of persons and ideas within the early French American Empire.¹⁸ Rather than merely cultural baggage from France informing the production of the French Empire and the Middle Ground, scholars have pieced together a fuller history of links between Native America, New France, the French circum-Caribbean, and the French core in Paris.¹⁹

Within this wider spatial historiography, from a structural perspective, Jesuit religious aromas were partially instruments of legitimization whereby Jesuit Fathers subverted Native American sensibilities to submit Native religiosity to Catholic practice. After such subversion, the Jesuit Fathers contained the ideal of olfactory Catholic exercises by retaining the singular ability to define who possessed aromatic piety. The Jesuits, from this viewpoint informed by the historiographical ideal of “subversion and containment,” created an aesthetic device to which they alone controlled access.²⁰ However, to argue from such a distanced place removes the phenomenological experience of the Jesuit nose as it performed on American landscapes. Jesuits could rarely assert aesthetic sacred ideals for means of control because they believed in those sacrosanct principles. As Peter Moogk analyzed in his social history of religion as foundational for early Quebec, the citizens of “New France and its colonies lived in a world ruled by supernatural forces.”²¹

¹⁸ For the importance of comparative borderlands historiography in deconstructing nation-state narratives see, Michael Adas, "From Settler Colony to Global Hegemon: Integrating the Exceptionalist Narrative of the American Experience into World History," *The American Historical Review* 106, 5 (2001): 1692-1720.

¹⁹ For general New France historiography analyzed throughout this chapter see, Allan Greer, *The Jesuit Relations: Natives and Missionaries in Seventeenth-Century North America* (Boston: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2000), 1-18.

²⁰ For “subversion and containment” see, Stephen Greenblatt, *Shakespearean Negotiations: The Circulation of Social Energy in Renaissance England* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), esp. 21-65.

²¹ Peter Moogk, *La Nouvelle France: The Making of French Canada: a Cultural History* (East Lansing:

Thus, this chapter focuses not on mechanisms of control, but on the phenomenological sensory experience of Jesuits and indigenous populations in North America. Hagiographies, scented relics, aromatic tropes of devotion, and controlling access to those community ideals were legitimizing activities.²² Nonetheless, the Jesuits of New France, indulging in their fragrant proselytizing devotion influenced by Native American sensory requests, rarely understood them as such. Rather, they applied odor as a means of marking sameness and difference in the New World. They used smelling more than most Europeans of the same era, as a way to find middle grounds for cross-cultural *bricolage*.

Scenting God; Reformation and Counter

Scent was vital to religious practice in both the ancient and medieval eras of European history. Monotheist traditions applied principally dichotomous religious olfactory patterns. As summarized in chapter one, the scent of sulfur, in opposition, followed the devil's wake, represented paganism, and sprung from deep within the bowels of the earth.²³ During the Medieval Era, the European public applied scenting through religion to appraise either the sulfuric and wild stench or aromatic piety of those living within Christian societies. Persons who aimed to dissimulate these signifying odors with perfume were often socially indicted for moral negligence. In the anti-Semitic rhetoric of

Michigan State University Press, 2000), quote on 235.

²² For legitimization narratives see, Dominique Deslandres, "In the Shadow of the Cloister: Representations of Female Holiness in New France," in *Colonial Saints: Discovering the Holy in the Americas, 1500-1800*, ed. Allan Greer and Jodi Bilinkoff (New York: Routledge, 2003), 129-152.

²³ Suzanne Evans, "The Scent of a Martyr," *Numen* 49, 2 (2002): 193-211; Susan Ashbrook Harvey, *Scenting Salvation: Ancient Christianity and the Olfactory Imagination* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006).

the era, Jews were many times considered malodorous, while the religiously venerated radiated an olfactory identity of blessedness, in most cases a requirement for Catholic sainthood. These odors of the medieval Church offered perceptions of health, sanctity, and admonitions against encountering those on earth tainted with the devil's perniciousness.²⁴

These earlier traditions can be instructive to analyzing later uses of odor on the Middle Ground. As described in chapter one, smell often involved a "double figuration" in numerous Western religious traditions whereby smells both symbolically represented the divine and were also a vector that allowed religious bodies to move between the realms of life, death, and the afterlife.²⁵ In Byzantine Catholicism of the early Middle Ages, the holy spirit was not only signified by odor but was also embodied as "smell sensed in the fragrance of burning incense." In the Catholic tradition, "Smoke and incense indicated the saint's invisible and spontaneous presence...smell triggered a synaesthesia, which was modeled after the Eucharist."²⁶ For many, these religious odors of saints and relics left the entire sensorium encountered and realized through the deep presence of a loving and feared God.²⁷

²⁴ Constance Classen, "The Breath of God; Sacred Histories of Scent," in *The Smell Culture Reader*, ed. Jim Drobnick (Oxford: Berg. 2006), 375-390; Gale Largey and Rod Watson, "The Sociology of Odors," in *The Smell Culture Reader*, ed. Jim Drobnick (Oxford: Berg. 2006), 29-40. For example, smell was vital to the "seeing" of the icon and the manifestation of holy power within the Byzantine Catholic Church. Bissera Pentcheva, *The Sensual Icon: Space, Ritual, and the Senses in Byzantium* (University Park, Pa: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2010), 31-43, and was essential in funerary practice and mass within the early Church, as described in, Béatrice Caseau, *Euōdia: The Use and Meaning of Fragrances in the Ancient World and their Christianization (100-900 AD)*, Ph.D. Dissertation, Princeton University, 1994, esp. 120-124.

²⁵ Ashley Clements, "Divine Scents and Presence," in *Smell and the Ancient Senses*, ed. Mark Bradley (London; New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2015), 46-59.

²⁶ Pentcheva, *Sensual Icon*, quotes on 39-43. For multisensory liturgical practices see, Eric Palazzo, "Art and the Senses: Art and Liturgy in the Middle Ages," in *Vol. II of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen and Richard Newhauser (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 175-194.

²⁷ For examples of synthesis of sound and scent in Catholic traditions see the ideal of the odor of sanctity as inherently synesthetic within, Catherine Saucier "The Sweet Sound of Sanctity: Sensing St Lambert," *The Senses and Society* 5, 1 (2010): 10-27, and the inherent synesthesia in encountering God explored within,

Two devout European women, Lydwine of Schiedam and Teresa of Avila, exemplify the numerous saints who died emanating odors affiliated with holiness; the odor of sanctity, a “trope of devotion” of the pious dating to as early as the second century.²⁸ Lydwine, a Dutch nurse who lived during the early fifteenth century, vomited parts of her internal organs when ill. Once out of her body, these pieces smelled of sanctity. Her tears, red with blood, left those who encountered their odors scenting flowers. Teresa of Avila, in sixteenth century Spain, was thought to have changed the pungent odors of medicine used upon her skin to aromas of perfume. Scents such as these, which most Catholics considered virtuous while applying them to religiously determined social hierarchies, had their roots in the ancient world.²⁹

Later imitative olfactory traditions, exemplified in the aforementioned saints, created a dually split perceptual paradigm composed of a continuum bookended by scents protruding from either malevolent noisome hell or Edenic aromatic heaven. St. John of the Cross’s *Spiritual Canticle* (1578) summarized the odor of sanctity implicit in the positive side of this scale. He recorded: “profuse are these odors at times that the soul seems to be enveloped in delight and bathed in inestimable glory. Not only is it conscious itself of them, but they even overflow it, so that those who know how to discern these things can perceive

David Chidester, “Symbolism and the Senses in Saint Augustine,” *Religion* 14, 1 (1984): 31-51.

²⁸ Holly Dugan, *The Ephemeral History of Perfume: Scent and Sense in Early Modern England* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins, 2011), quote on 25. For the roots of the idea of the odor of sanctity see, Jerry Toner, “Smell and Christianity,” in *Smell and the Ancient Senses*, ed. Mark Bradley (London; New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2015), 158-170.

²⁹ For Constance Classen: “the aesthetic cornucopia of earlier cosmologies was not simply a hedonistic reveling in sensation. The myriad sensory characteristics of such cosmologies, their colors and odors, tastes and temperatures, were coded with cultural values and linked in chains and hierarchies of meaning...multiplicity of sensory channels of communication meant that one could taste or breathe in the order of the cosmos and society, as well as visualize it.” Constance Classen, *The Color of Angels: Cosmology, Gender, and the Aesthetic Imagination* (London: Routledge, 1998), quote on 1.

them. The soul in this state seems to them as a delectable garden.”³⁰ Often symbolized in such a tradition of classifying sweet-smelling odors as holy were Christians who believed themselves also capable of utilizing their olfactory sense to discern the scentful putridity of the devil in the evil peoples amongst them. However, with the destruction of miraculous proofs of God’s existence fomented by the Reformation, many Christians became disconnected from their previous olfactory religious confirmations.³¹

In English pamphleteer Phillip Stubbs jeremiad, *The Anatomie of Abuses* (1583), readers were scolded for wearing perfume as the scents offered a worldly and “sweet kind of pride” that would only guide them into the “stench and horror in the nethermost hell.”³² Englishman Richard Allestree’s *Ladies Calling* (1673) similarly relayed: “since God professes...that that very *incense* which was design’d as a part of his worship, *was an abomination to him*, because not accompanied with the acts of mercy, we cannot think he will better like of those, which have no higher aim then delicacy and sensuality.”³³ Much of the Protestant, and Christian world in general, moved away from odorphillic sensibilities through a process that began as early as the sixteenth century.³⁴ Though many aromatic

³⁰ Classen, *Color of Angels*, 16-56, quote on 45.

³¹ For related historiographical debates on the “disenchantment of the world” see, Alexandra Walsham, “The Reformation and ‘The Disenchantment of the World’ Reassessed,” *The Historical Journal* 51, 2 (2008): 497-528, and Eamon Duffy, *The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England, C.1400-C.1580* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1992), esp. 262-266, 427-430.

³² Philip Stubbs, and John Payne Collier, *The Anatomie of Abuses* (London: Reprinted by J. P. Collier, 1870 [1583]), quote on 78.

³³ Richard Allestree, *The Ladies Calling in Two Parts* (Oxford: Printed at the Theatre, 1673), quote on 56-57, Allestree’s italics. Also see the reading of “A Fruitfull Exhortation to the Readyng and Knowledge of Holy Scripture,” a common homily in the sixteenth and seventeenth century, which argued written texts of scripture would cure the often stinking rituals of the past, within, Gail Kern Paster, *Humoring the Body: Emotions and the Shakespearean Stage* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004), esp. 72-73.

³⁴ For more on Max Weber and the disenchantment thesis see, Eire, *Reformations*, esp. 316-317, 741-743, 747-750, and H. C. Erik Midelfort, *Exorcism and Enlightenment: Johann Joseph Gassner and the Demons*

tenets remained in Christian practice later, especially within Catholic exercises, the metahistorical trend suggests that the Reformation helped to propel the “discrediting of miraculous proofs of holiness such as the odor of sanctity” and “the prohibition of incense in Protestant churches.”³⁵

Despite these changes within much of Europe, factional Jesuits believed in annihilating the self through sensory purification involving an appreciation of the worldly capability of recognizing the scents of damnation or paradise on earth. In Ignatius Loyola’s foundational meditation on hell in *Spiritual Exercises* (1548) he discussed the discovery of evil on earth through, “the smoke, the sulphur, the filth, and the rotting things.” These odors were perceived on peoples existing in the liminal state between earth and their final destination. The profusion of scentful roses, perfumed tears, and aromatically altered medicine placed their initiator between earth and heaven; sulfur, false perfumes, and decaying odors between the world and pungent damnation. The *Exercises* were practiced in seclusion divided into week long stages. The sulfuric scentful “meditation on hell” occurred during the “purgative” stage that started within the first week. During this stage,

of Eighteenth-Century Germany (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2005), esp. 22-31.

³⁵ Constance Classen, *Worlds of Sense: Exploring the Senses in History and Across Cultures* (London: Routledge, 1993), 28-36, quote on 28. For nuanced comments on the deodorization thesis related to incense and religion see, Matthew Milner, *The Senses and the English Reformation* (Farnham, England: Ashgate, 2011), esp. 4, 348, Dugan, *Ephemeral History*, 31-41, the reading of elite and popular traditions of the Reformation within, Jacob Baum, "From Incense to Idolatry: The Reformation of Olfaction in Late Medieval German Ritual," *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 44, 2 (2013): 323-344, the continuation of the use of incense as a performative discourse between the latent Catholicism of Ben Jonson and the emergent Protestantism of Thomas Middleton within, Holly Crawford Pickett, "The Idolatrous Nose: Incense on the Early Modern Stage," in *Religion and Drama in Early Modern England: The Performance of Religion on the Renaissance Stage*, ed. Jane Hwang Degenhardt and Elizabeth Williamson (Farnham, Surrey, England: Ashgate, 2011), 19-38, and the control on liturgies using incense, but the continuation of incense as a metaphor within texts about both the ancient world and early modern England, as described in, David Robertson, "Incensed over Incense: Incense and Community in Seventeenth-Century Literature," in *Writing and Religion in England, 1558-1689: Studies in Community-Making and Cultural Memory*, ed. Roger Sell and A. W. Johnson (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009), 389-409.

Jesuits were to follow Ignatius's proposals for the use of the senses alongside vision to create multisensory mental images for remembrance of Christ's sufferings.³⁶

As Mary Thurlkill described regarding earlier traditions that the Counter-Reformation hoped to replicate: Christians "employed scent to mark their own emerging religious identities as well as the heretical 'other' that threatened social purity and orthodoxy. These divisions appear most poignantly in a 'rhetoric of disgust' which imagines the 'other' as the source of vile filth and pollution in the body social."³⁷ Such olfactory sensibility of Manichean concepts was apparent within the writing of Juan Alfonso de Polanco, Ignatius's secretary, who noted that through the soul's "longing for Christ, whom it desires to breathe in as the Word inviting us to the enjoyment of full union, it receives a spiritual sense of smell, so that it may walk in the fragrance of Christ's ointments: and thus Christ is its life."³⁸ To Jesuits these spiritual senses, internally sensed perceptions of the soul, were triggered by God within the lived world as physical sensations.³⁹ Because God was perceived in all things, his presence was deemed manifest

³⁶ Ignatius, and George Ganss, *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works* (New York: Paulist Press, 1991), quote on 141, and the practice of stages from, Mary Thurlkill, "Odors of Sanctity: Distinctions of the Holy in Early Christianity and Islam," *Comparative Islamic Studies* 3, 2 (2009), 133-144.

³⁷ Mary Thurlkill, *Sacred Scents in Early Christianity and Islam* (Lanham: Lexington Books, 2016), quote on xviii. For the importance of the ideal of cleansing the Reformation out of the Catholic Church during the Counter-Reformation see the public works projects analyzed within, Katherine Rinne, "Urban Ablutions: Cleansing Counter-Reformation Rome," in *Rome, Pollution, and Propriety: Dirt, Disease, and Hygiene in the Eternal City from Antiquity to Modernity*, ed. Mark Bradley and Kenneth Stow (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 182-201.

³⁸ Jeffrey Chipps Smith, *Sensuous Worship: Jesuits and the Art of the Early Catholic Reformation in Germany* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2002), quotes on 31-40, 152-153.

³⁹ For the "spiritual senses" as a means of sensation existing alongside the senses of the world see the discussion of Origen within, Gordon Rudy, *Mystical Language of Sensation in the Later Middle Ages* (New York: Routledge, 2002), esp. 2-6, the general summary within, Paul Gavrilyuk and Sarah Coakley, "Introduction," in *The Spiritual Senses: Perceiving God in Western Christianity*, ed. Paul Gavrilyuk and Sarah Coakley (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 1-19, and the role of spiritual sensations in understanding the experience of heaven in the sermons of G. B. Giustiniani within, Wietse de Boer, "A Neapolitan Heaven: The Sensory Universe of G. B. Giustiniani," in *Religion and the Senses in Early Modern*

through the physical world to Jesuits regardless of the sinful associations of disproportionate worldliness found within doctrinaire Protestantism.⁴⁰

In North America, Jesuit priests continued to apply these olfactory worldly proofs of God's eminence and the presence of hell after the turn of the eighteenth century due to the Catholic resistance to the Reformation's attempts at the removal of sensory proofs within Europe and because of Jesuit proximity to Native American nations who valued the lower senses. As historian Piero Camporesi described of importance of the physical form to Jesuits: "The body, which was rediscovered during the Renaissance, became encapsulated in a religious dimension during the Counter-Reformation, which used anatomy as a kind of subtle instrument for the rediscovery of God."⁴¹

The *Exercises* of Ignatius applied the olfactory and bodily as critical in perceiving spiritual and earthly worlds. The smell of sulfur as hellish and the odor of sanctity as heavenly were thus, as Mark Smith has stated, "not abstractions" to Jesuits, as sensory proofs had become for many Protestants of the era, "but rather clues to finding God's presence in daily life." Thus, the Jesuits, whom claimed Loyola as their ideological forefather, fell into a larger cohort of the Catholic Counter-Reformation where the space between the spiritually sensed and the physically sensed closed to near equivalence.⁴²

Europe, ed. Wietse de Boer and Christine Göttler (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 363-391.

⁴⁰ For a similar understanding of sensation within a relatively closed community, which extrapolated on "the effect of religious homogeneity on sensory heterodoxy" in the emic understanding of active sensation, see, Nicky Hallett, *The Senses in Religious Communities, 1600-1800: Early Modern 'Convents of Pleasure* (Farnham, Surrey, England: Ashgate, 2013), esp. 14-24, 203-204, quote on 24.

⁴¹ Piero Camporesi, *The Anatomy of the Senses: Natural Symbols in Medieval and Early Modern Italy* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1994), quote on 93. For the sense of smell as inherently vital in religious encounters see the reading of modern African and Muslim encounters of smelling within, David Parkin, "Wafting on the Wind: Smell and the Cycle of Spirit and Matter," *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 13 (2007): S39-S53.

⁴² For Jesuit sensation, and more on the teachings of Loyola regarding the spiritual senses, as part of the

To these mostly Aristotelian trained Jesuits, reasoning set man apart from animals, but reasoning to God and for conversion could only come through the sensory perception of God's majesty on earth. The *Exercises* were thus aimed at overcoming worldly experiences through "self-narration" whereby one articulated their phenomenological past upon a spiritual pathway through applying sensory experiences towards otherworldly cleansing. Jesuit education applying these sensory paradigms propagated in both the New World and Old World through numerous textbooks placing Aristotelian philosophy within Christian doctrine.⁴³ According to John O'Malley, such Arcadian sensory empiricism, through which the Jesuits based many of their scientific, artistic, and theological beliefs, argued that: "intellect is initially a tabula rasa with no innate species of its own by which to understand the world; intellectual cognition must come by way of the senses."⁴⁴ Therefore, as George Healy noted, Jesuits, unlike Calvinists and other early Protestants, had no "inherently serious conflict between the truths of faith and the evidence of the earthbound senses."⁴⁵

During the seventeenth century, Jesuit priests in North America following the ideals of their progenitor Loyola and textbooks based on these sensory teachings of Aristotle

Counter-Reformation within Europe see, John O' Malley, "Trent, Sacred Images, and Catholics' Senses of the Sensuous," in *The Sensuous in the Counter-Reformation Church*, ed. Marcia Hall and Tracy Elizabeth Cooper (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 28-48, Marjorie Boyle, *Loyola's Acts: The Rhetoric of the Self* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), esp. 7-9, W. W. Meissner, *To the Greater Glory: A Psychological Study of Ignatian Spirituality* (Milwaukee, Wis.: Marquette University Press, 1999), esp. 136-173, and Mark Smith, *Sensing the Past: Seeing, Hearing, Smelling, Tasting, and Touching in History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007), esp. 63-65.

⁴³ J. Michelle Molina, "Technologies of the Self: The Letters of Eighteenth-Century Mexican Jesuit Spiritual Daughters," *History of Religions* 47, 4 (2007), quotes on 289, 298.

⁴⁴ John O'Malley, *The Jesuits: Cultures, Sciences, and the Arts, 1540-1773* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999), quote on 531-532.

⁴⁵ George Healy, "The French Jesuits and the Idea of the Noble Savage," *WMQ* 15, 2 (1958) 144-167, quote on 147.

applied their sense of smell diametrically in their early contact with Native American nations. They defined a stenchful sewer of paganism or the fragrance of Eden as sweet flowers in opposition, not wholly as metaphors for the internal scents of souls, but as perception of spiritual flaws uncovered through smelling the physical world.⁴⁶

Throughout their time among the indigenous communities of North America, Jesuits noticed the smell of Native Americans who converted to Catholicism transitioning from an odor of impurity to cleanly aromas or the absence of odors, sometimes represented through floral purity. These perceptions and applications of odor became especially prominent after Jesuit priests noticed a similar appreciation of olfactory proofs applied within Native communities; a sensory resemblance in spiritual practice existing across the Atlantic prior to European contact with the Americas.⁴⁷ Consequently, Jesuits continued to apply odor to mark sameness and difference through their religious drudgery in the New World, even as Europeans began the grand project of deodorization that worked to make the metropolitan core increasingly anesthetized.⁴⁸

⁴⁶ For a reading of Aristotelian influences on the idea of the Native American as a “natural slave” that was inherently at a previous stage of cultural evolution, an idea further explored in chapter five, see, Anthony Pagden, *The Fall of Natural Man: The American Indian and the Origins of Comparative Ethnology* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982), esp. 57-118, and Lewis Hanke, *Aristotle and the American Indians: A Study in Race Prejudice in the Modern World* (Chicago: H. Regnery Co, 1959).

⁴⁷ For material culture and the study of French colonial America see the reading of imperial policies conflicting with the desires of New France during the 1750s in, Christian Ayne Crouch, *Nobility Lost: French and Canadian Martial Cultures, Indians, and the End of New France* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2014), esp. 4-9, and the readings of the importance of archaeology to the study of the fur trade, agriculture, and politics of the American interior within, John Walthall and Thomas Emerson, “Indians and French in the Midcontinent,” in *Calumet & Fleur-De-Lys: Archaeology of Indian and French Contact in the Midcontinent*, ed. John Walthall and Thomas Emerson (Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1992), 1-16.

⁴⁸ The archaeological record has generally been dismissed within studies of the Middle Ground. John Walthall, *French Colonial Archaeology: The Illinois Country and the Western Great Lakes* (Urbana: Univ. of Illinois Press, 1991), esp. 82-83. Many histories showed local influences on French persons in North America included a remnant of Francis Parkman’s understanding of Jesuit openness to change. As James Moore summarized, the Jesuit “openness to change was based upon the Jesuits concepts of natural revelations and natural law.” James Moore, *Indian and Jesuit: A Seventeenth-Century Encounter* (Chicago: Loyola

Native American Reverence for Scenting within Spiritual Practices

The Jesuits arrived in New France in 1625 to reinforce failing Recollect factions who handled the Canadian climate poorly and did not convert enough of the indigenous population to appease European Catholic leadership.⁴⁹ Jesuits, or “black robes” as Native Americans took to calling them, used French advances in the pelt trades to follow economic networks into indigenous areas for attempts at religious conversion. In Huron country rested the central Jesuit mission Saint-Marie. Missions pushed deep into the American interior; around the St. Lawrence Valley by the 1640s, and into the Pays d’en Haut tapped by fur traders as early as the 1670s.

Following more “patient” measures for conversion than their forbearers within New France, these Jesuits aimed to re-articulate the failed conversion message of the Recollects with an altered focus upon respecting customs within indigenous villages. Within these communities, Jesuit fathers “exploited the ceremonial complexity” of Church rituals through the senses in hopes of placing Native Americans into states of amazement on pathways towards what they perceived as honest conversions.⁵⁰

Many Jesuits lauded Native American sensory capabilities upon first contact.⁵¹

University Press, 1982), quote on xi.

⁴⁹ For readings of the Jesuit encounter as situating Native Americans as savages who were misled from God through their experience in the New World see, P. A. Goddard, “Augustine and the Amerindian in Seventeenth-Century New France,” *Church History* 67, 4 (1998): 662-681.

⁵⁰ Alan Taylor, *American Colonies* (New York: Viking, 2001), quotes from 107-111.

⁵¹ Jesuits were informed by numerous ideas about savagery for their initial contact with Native America. These ideas offered much different contentions regarding indigenous land rights than other European colonial powers in the Western Hemisphere. For a reading of the cultural baggage and land rights in French interactions within Native Americans see, Olive Patricia Dickason, *The Myth of the Savage: And the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas* (Edmonton, Alta., Canada: University of Alberta Press,

Italian Jesuit missionary Francesco Giuseppe Bressani wrote during his travels in New France during the early 1650s that Natives were “certainly worthy of particular admiration...their senses, which are most perfect” included what Bressani described as “a rare sense of smell,” with which “they frequently discover fire long before seeing it, especially at night.”⁵² Regarding Native American communities of French Louisiana the later traveler, historian, and Jesuit priest Pierre Charlevoix similarly wrote: “it is besides certain that they have great advantages over us, and I hold for the first of all the extreme perfection of their senses over us both internal and external...their smelling is so exquisite, that they smell fire at a great distance.”⁵³ Describing the nations of the Mississippi region, the Franciscan Louis Hennepin correspondingly summarized this odorphillic Native American use of smell as a safeguarding agent on the vast American landscape: “for in these countries they smell fire at two or three leagues distance, according to the wind...savages take a particular notice of it, to discover where their enemies are.”⁵⁴

The *Jesuit Relations*, a collection of texts sent to European readers as religious guides for future conversion strategies and as travel propaganda, often portrayed Native

1984), esp. 5-25, 251-270.

⁵² Gioseppe Bressani, “Breve Relatione d'alcvne missioni de' PP. della Compagnia di Gies nella Nuova Francia. Macerata, Italy, July 19, 1653,” in *Vol. 38 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610–1791*, Abenakis, Lower Canada, Hurons, 1652–1653, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quote on 257-258. For the French constructions of the other see the reading of critical humanism within, Tzvetan Todorov, *On Human Diversity: Nationalism, Racism, and Exoticism in French Thought* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1993), esp. 264-352, and the reading of the construction of the other as a blank slate that could be manipulated into either savages or noble figures within, Hamlin, *The Image of America*, esp. 1-36.

⁵³ Pierre-François-Xavier de Charlevoix and Louise Phelps Kellogg, *Vol. II of Journal of a Voyage to North America* (Chicago: Caxton Club, 1923 [1761]), quote on 75.

⁵⁴ Louis Hennepin, *A New Discovery of a Vast Country in America* (London: Printed for M. Bentley, I. Tonson, H. Bonwick, T. Goodwin, and S. Manship, 1698), quote on 313.

American cultures as incompatible with European ideals attempting to limit the olfactory.⁵⁵

Throughout the era of contact, Native Americans valued smelling for their spiritual health.⁵⁶ Jesuit writers in the New World were impelled by this sensuous element of sacred life to often discuss their Native American neighbor's sensory worlds.⁵⁷ The French Father Pierre Biard, as early as the 1616 *Relation* questioned why Native Americans seemed so happy with little control upon the sensory pleasures of their religious lives when stating: "if we come to sum up the whole and compare their good and ill with ours, I do not know

⁵⁵ For *Jesuit Relations*, community creation, and the use of hagiographic texts see, Julia Boss, "Writing a Relic: The Uses of Hagiography in New France," in *Colonial Saints: Discovering the Holy in the Americas, 1500-1800*, ed. Allan Greer and Jodi Bilinkoff (New York: Routledge, 2003), 211-234.

⁵⁶ Much history has been written on Native American reverence for scenting and synesthetic perceptions. Different Native American nations represented their sensoriums differently. For the role of the senses, specifically the importance of the sense of smell in courtly traditions in Central American nations see, Stephen Houston, David Stuart, and Karl Taube, *The Memory of Bones: Body, Being, and Experience Among the Classic Maya* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2006), esp. 136-153, the role of scented powder in Aztec rituals analyzed within, Annick Le Guérer, *Scent, the Mysterious and Essential Powers of Smell* (New York: Turtle Bay Books, 1992), esp. 117-120, the role of synesthetic sensory experiences of images during the era that saw Spanish controls on idolatry in New Spain within, Barbara Mundy, "Extirpation of Idolatry and Sensory Experience in Sixteenth-Century Mexico," in *Sensational Religion*, ed. Sally Promey (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014), 515-536, the importance of Amerindian state constructions of sensory power within flower songs, ceramic vessels, and city layouts for soundscapes within, Stacie King and Gonzalo Sánchez Santiago, "Soundscapes of the Everyday in Ancient Oaxaca, Mexico," *Archaeologies* 7, 2 (2011): 387-422, the importance of perfume in pre-contact hygiene within, Eric Taladoire, "The Americas: Hygiene, Body Care and Physical Appearance in Pre-Hispanic Meso-American Societies," in *Perfume, a Global History: From the Origins to Today*, ed. Marie-Christine Grasse (Paris: Somogy Art Publishers, 2007), 23-30, the sensory experience of Peruvian spatiality within, May Weismantel, "Coming to Our Senses at Chavin de Huantar," in *Making Senses of the Past: Toward a Sensory Archaeology*, ed. Jo Day (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2013), 113-136, the multisensory justifications for violence within, David Damrosch, "The Aesthetics of Conquest: Aztec Poetry Before and After Cortes," in *New World Encounters*, ed. Stephen Greenblatt (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993), 139-158, the focus on scented baths within, Rosario Acosta Nieva, "The Americas: Make-Up and Hygiene in Aztec Civilization on the Eve of Conquest (1500-21)," in *Perfume, a Global History: From the Origins to Today*, ed. Marie-Christine Grasse (Paris: Somogy Art Publishers, 2007), 89-93, early modern references to the resins used for much Native American olfactory ritual within, Nicolás Monardes, *Joyfull Newes out of the Newfound World* (London: Thomas Dawson for William Norton, 1580), esp. 3-6, and the use of language to portray the Central American sensory experience of contact within, James Lockhart, *The Nahuas After the Conquest: A Social and Cultural History of the Indians of Central Mexico, Sixteenth Through Eighteenth Centuries* (Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press, 1992), esp. 261-325.

⁵⁷ For critiques of using the *Jesuit Relations* as a means for understanding Native America see the reading of Atlantic paradigms for understanding Native American agency within, Michael Witgen, *An Infinity of Nations: How the Native New World Shaped Early North America* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012), esp. 44-46, 112-115.

but that they, in truth, have some reason to prefer (as they do) their own kind of happiness to ours.” To Native Americans, the sensuous living Biard implied was what their spirits asked of them. Living through the senses and providing the felicity of the senses to the divine was motivation towards, rather than away from, what the spirits wished.⁵⁸

Specifically, the aroma of tobacco smoke was of metaphysical value to Iroquois in the St. Lawrence Valley. Tobacco fumes, odors, and tastes, pleased the spirits and put blessings upon those dispensing such spiritual amusements. The conviction that scents of tobacco were inherently gratifying and valued as pleasant enough to deliver to the spirits continued throughout the colonial era.⁵⁹ Mary Jemison, an Englishwoman who was taken captive by the Shawnee during the French and Indian War, summarized a Shawnee and Seneca religious ceremony that included olfactory aspects of tobacco for the ritual slaughter of dogs. She stated her 1755 observations in the *Narrative of the Life of Mrs. Mary Jemison* (1824) noting, “they are burnt” with the “incense of tobacco or the like into the fire, the scent of which they say, goes up to Nauwaneu, to whom it is pleasant and acceptable.”⁶⁰

⁵⁸ Pierre Biard, “Relation de la Nouvelle France, de Ses Terres, Natvrel du Pais, & de ses Habitans. Paris, 1616,” in *Vol. 3 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quote on 134-135. For similar olfactory complexity in South American indigenous traditions see, Constance Classen, *Inca Cosmology and the Human Body* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1993), esp. 74-75, and Constance Classen, “Sweet Colors, Fragrant Songs: Sensory Models of the Andes and the Amazon,” *American Ethnologist* 17, 4, 1990: 722-735.

⁵⁹ Ronald Dale Karr, *Indian New England, 1524-1674: A Compendium of Eyewitness Accounts of Native American Life* (Pepperell, Mass.: Branch Line Press, 1999), 126-127; Daniel Richter, *The Ordeal of the Longhouse: The Peoples of the Iroquois League in the Era of European Colonization* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia, by the University of North Carolina Press, 1992), esp. 27-28.

⁶⁰ James Seaver, and William Pryor Letchworth, *A Narrative of the Life of Mary Jemison, De-He-Wa-Mis, the White Woman of the Genesee* (New York: G. P. Putnam, 1898), quotes on 227. For background on captivity, as a possibly positive immersion in new lifeways, see, Gary Ebersole, *Captured by Texts: Puritan to Postmodern Images of Indian Captivity* (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1995), esp. 4-8. It is often believed that many Native American nations used tobacco in enemas for spiritual cleansing. There is

Many Native Americans used their noses to guide their senses within numerous herbal traditions. The appropriate aroma of a plant allocated stems and stalks for specific dietary or medicinal uses. Native Americans often used the anise herb to flavor their foods. The herb was “strongly scented” with yellow flowers and long leaf stalks. Many nations ate the berries of the aromatic honeysuckle. Some delighted in a diet of raw onions. The Native American obsession with onions helped many Western travelers easily find encampments from the aroma spread about the surrounding pungent air. Native Americans used the aromatic sage for food and drink. Though extremely stinking, both the skunkbush and the skunkcabbage were used for numerous practices. Another aromatic plant, the yarrow, was used for numerous materials: as a salad topping, for hair treatments, and as a medicinal cure. For headaches, the pungent elderberry was often used within indigenous baths.⁶¹

Like Jesuits who purged their worldly sins through meditative sensory experiences to better contact their Catholic God, many Native Americans in North America also practiced patterns of stench preparation before visiting with myriad spirits.⁶² Describing Native American’s bathing habits and love of the olfactory after cleansing Charlevoix wrote:

specific evidence that these practices were common among the Maya and Aztec in Central America. This was later applied for treating specific medical conditions in Europe of the Enlightenment. Jordan Goodman, *Tobacco in History: The Cultures of Dependence* (New York: Routledge, 2016), esp. 32-35, 115-116; Eric Burns, *The Smoke of the Gods: A Social History of Tobacco* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2007), esp. 8-10.

⁶¹ Virginia Scully, *A Treasury of American Indian Herbs: Their Lore and Their Use for Food, Drugs, and Medicine* (New York: Crown Publishers, 1970), esp. 7, 52, 69-71, 80-87, 104-105, 163.

⁶² There is some possibly cross-cultural similarity to the use of odor in Central American traditions as well. Mayan religious practice often involved the use of “poms” of white powder that was made from fragrant dried tree sap used to prepare for encountering the gods. David Freidel, Linda Schele, and Joy Parker, *Maya Cosmos: Three Thousand Years on the Shaman's Path* (New York: W. Morrow, 1993), esp. 32-38.

It is easy to judge to what a height, both the one and the other must arrive amongst persons who never change their cloaths, till they fall to pieces of themselves, and who take no care to keep them clean. In summer they bathe themselves every day, but immediately afterwards they rub themselves with oil and grease of a very rank smell. In the winter they remain in their fat, and during all that season it is impossible to enter their cabbins without being poisoned with the stench.⁶³

The eighteenth century Irish historian and ethnographer James Adair summarized Chickasaw practices that included similar personal scents controlled by dietary and bathing limitations. These devout celebrants, “were allowed to eat nothing but green tobacco, nor to drink anything except warm water, highly embittered with the button-snake-root, to cleanse their bodies and prepare them to serve in their hold of beloved office before the divine essence.” These dietary limitations and purging dovetailed with the process of perfuming “priestly garments and ornaments” with “bear’s oil” to prepare the Chickasaw for spiritual encounters.⁶⁴

Correspondingly, like the odorphillic nations Adair wrote of, earlier Native Americans near Sault St. Marie burned tobacco as a dispensation to their spirits. Father Jerome Lalemant’s *Relation* of 1642 discussed the use of the plant in religious ceremonies when writing:

⁶³ Charlevoix, *Vol. II of Journal of a Voyage*, 114-115, quote on 155.

⁶⁴ James Adair, *The History of the American Indians* (New York & London: Johnson Reprint Corporation, 1968 [1775]), quote on 122.

the most famous magician in the country was consulted to learn what success might be expected from the corn that had been planted. He gave two answers, - in the first place, that it was necessary that each one should go every day to his field, throw some tobacco on the fire, and burn it in honor of the demon whom he worshipped, calling aloud this form of prayer: 'Listen, O Sky! Taste my tobacco; have pity on us'.⁶⁵

Praiseworthy odors such as these kept the spirits genial. In Paul Le Jeune and Jerome Lalemant's *Relation* of 1640-1641, a tale was presented of one Jesuit Father who recorded such odors of aromatic positivity among Native Americans who, "made a feast over the graves of their dead...at which they served eight moose and ten beavers; the captain, haranguing, said 'that the souls of the deceased took great pleasure in the odor of these good viands'."⁶⁶

However, the odors of these spiritually integrated sensory practices were not always a bouquet of promised prayers. Indigenous populations in the area of New France used mephitic scents to disgust spirits causing deleterious tempers in their lives. Reading

⁶⁵ Hierosme Lalemant, "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en la Nouvelle France, en l'année 1642. Ste. Marie aux Hurons, June 10, 1642," in *Vol. 23 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quote on 54-55. For sensory analysis of prayer, as a means of psychosomatic support to avoid anxiety through sensory repetition see, Greg Downey, "The Importance of Repetition: Ritual as a Support to Mind," in *Ritual, Performance and the Senses*, ed. Michael Bull and Jon Mitchell (London; New York: Bloomsbury, 2015), 45-62.

⁶⁶ Jerome Lalemant, "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en la Nouvelle France, és années 1640. et 1641. *Paul le Jeune*; Kebec and Paris, undated. *Jerome Lalemant*; Ste. Marie aux Hurons, May 19, 1641," in *Vol. 21 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quote on 94-95.

between the uninformed lines of Le Jeune and Lalemant's naive representation of "manitou" in their 1640 *Relation* provides another example of Native American olfactory admiration. The Jesuit authors summarized the tale of "a savage" who was "very sick...his wife waited upon him with great kindness; when she saw that he was struggling and becoming frantic, she took a piece of skin and set fire to it, then rubbed it upon his head, that she might by this foul odor disgust the manitou, — that is to say, the devil, — so that he should not approach her husband."⁶⁷

In the *Relation* of 1639, Le Jeune similarly discussed a Father who observed specific Native Americans who stretched nets around their cabins to catch the scent of souls that may escape. These indigenous groups burned "some ill-smelling thing to turn away the souls." He continued, that these nations of New France, "even put something with a bad odor upon their heads, so that the souls may not come near them."⁶⁸ The French traveler Nicolas Perrot found comparable olfactory sensibilities regarding a specific nation's understanding of the hereafter, noting a belief that when, "souls have escaped from this peril they enter a delightful country...with all kinds of flowers, the odor of which is so admirable that it delights their hearts and charms their imaginations."⁶⁹ Though Europeans initially tried to tie their experiences to the sensory worlds they knew in Western Europe,

⁶⁷ Jerome Lalemant, "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en la Nouvelle France, en l'année 1640. *Paul le Jeune*; Kébec, September 10, 1640. *Jerome Lalemant*; Des Hurons, May 27, 1640," in *Vol. 19 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quote on 69-70.

⁶⁸ Paul Le Jeune and Hierosme Lalemant, "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en la Nouvelle France, en l'année 1639. *Paul le Jeune*; Sillery, September 4, 1639. *Hierosme Lalemant*; Ossossané, June 7, 1639," in *Vol. 16 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quotes on 194-196.

⁶⁹ Nicolas Perrot, "Memoir on the Manners, Customs, and Religion of the Savages of North America," in *The Indian Tribes of the Upper Mississippi Valley and Region of the Great Lakes*, ed. and trans. Emma Helen Blair (New York: Kraus Reprint Co., 1969 [1911]), 89-92, quote on 91.

novel and marvelous olfactory perceptions required the colonial French and English to apply divergent modes of sensory discernment in the New World.⁷⁰

Early European writers noticed an indigenous propensity towards the sinuses and later oral histories included numerous references to the scented ambrosia of the metaphysical. However, scenting spirituality was not solely concerned with the divine in Native American societies. It was an integrated system entwining everyday life with the environment as tied to medicine and subsistence. In Biard's 1616 *Relation* such an olfactive pharmacology was exemplified by the Native American use of oils for massage, which kept them "well...by the use of hot rooms and sweat boxes, and by the bath. They...massage, afterwards rubbing the whole body with seal oil, causing them to emit an odor which is very disagreeable."⁷¹

Some Jesuits found this sweathouse briefly described by Biard to be abhorrent. Le Jeune nearly vomited from the stench emanating from the vapors within. Unlike the Natives who handled the odiousness well, Le Jeune could not but scream out at the sharpness invading his nostrils, "bitter is this drink! How strong its odor!"⁷² Charlevoix also discussed southeastern Native Americans valuing the scent and heat of products that helped to induce sweating as a sign of medicinal and spiritual eminence. He regarded: "another very singular method of provoking sweat, which is made use of in certain

⁷⁰ For mimesis in the early encounter between Europeans and Native Americans see, Stephen Greenblatt, *Marvelous Possessions: The Wonder of the New World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991), esp. 10-12.

⁷¹ Biard, "Relation de la Nouvelle France, de Ses Terres, Natvrel du Pais, & de ses Habitans. Paris, 1616," quote on 115-116.

⁷² Paul Le Jeune, "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en La Nouvelle France, en l'année 1634. Nouvelle France, August 7, 1634," in *Vol. 7 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quote on 41.

diseases: this consists in extending the patient on a couch raised a little above the ground, under which are boiled in a kettle, the wood of the hiccory tree and the branches of pine. The vapour which proceeds from it produces a most profuse sweat...the smell of it,” to these indigenous communities, “extremely wholesome.”⁷³

The olfactory played a substantial role in later Native American herbal rituals. A 1730 letter from Father Le Petit, a missionary at New Orleans, summarized a confidence game involving an olfactory pharmaceutical practice of the Natchez whereby a medicine man would take, “a certain root, which by its smell can put serpents to sleep and render them senseless. After having rubbed their hands and body with this root, they take hold of...reptiles without fearing their bite, which is mortal.” Indicating to his patient’s retinue the use of the anesthetized rattlesnake’s teeth, the physician would then “cut, with a flint, the part” of the ill person’s body “affected with...malady, and then suck out all the blood they can draw from it, and in returning it immediately into a dish, they at the same time spit out a little piece of wood, or straw, or leather, which they have concealed under the tongue. Drawing to it the attention of the relatives of the sick man, ‘There,’ they say, ‘is the cause of the sickness’.”⁷⁴

When describing a similarly scented practice, an Anglo-American settler of Carolina territory, John Lawson, wrote of an earlier tribal tradition of the nose in diagnosis. He recited that the Native American “doctor...smells of the patient's navel and belly, and sometimes scarifies him a little with a flint, or an instrument made of rattle snake's teeth

⁷³ Charlevoix, *Vol. II of Journal of a Voyage*, quote on 163.

⁷⁴ Mathurin Le Petit, “Lettre au Père d’Avaugour, Procureur des Missions de l’Amérique Septentrionale. Nouvelle Orleans, July 12, 1730,” in *Vol. 68 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899), quote on 153.

for that purpose; then he sucks the patient and gets out a mouthful of blood and serum.”⁷⁵

The spirituality of Native life, and the olfactory component therein, did not flow only into these medical treatments or religious performances. To survive and control their environment in the manner they saw fit, Native Americans shielded themselves with an authority given to the nose increasingly lacking in much of Europe during the same era.

Deep into patterns of subsistence, the nose was tied to Native American odorphillic sensibilities and spiritual reverence for the bereavement of animals.⁷⁶ Odorphillia in northeastern Native American hunting practices was evident in William Wood’s *New England’s Prospect* (1639) wherein he fashioned a prejudicial metaphor between Native Americans and the dogs of early modern Europe: “their hunting it is to be noted that they have no swift-foot greyhounds to let slip at the sight of the deer, no deep-mouthed hounds or scenting beagles to find out their desired prey; themselves are all this.”⁷⁷ As Thomas Morton similarly discussed in *New English Canaan* (1637), hunting deer applied scentful tracking skills alongside the visual. Morton having,

⁷⁵ John Lawson. *The History of Carolina* (Raleigh: Printed by Strother & Marcom, 1860 [1714]), 346-349, quote on 348. Olfactory ordering persisted in societies dependent on the odor categorization for specific animals. The Eastern Tukanoan Indians, separated into twenty tribes, living in the Amazon of modern Colombia, follow hunting practices that fixate on the aromatic. Gerardo Reichel-Dolmatoff, “Tapir Avoidance in the Colombian Northwest Amazon,” in *Animal Myths and Metaphors in South America*, ed. Gary Urton (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1985), 107-124. The late twentieth-century South American tribes portrayed by Reichel-Dolmatoff elicited similar conclusions in 1740 when Don Antonio Ulloa and Don George Juan traveled in Peru from Guayaquil to Motupe. Ulloa’s relation of his expedition described a specific South American tribe’s olfactive “method of discovering the way...is to take in their hands, in different places, handfuls of sand and smell it; they distinguish by the odor whether the mules have passed that way, perhaps because the ordure of these animals leaves some scent upon the sand.” Don Antonio Ulloa, “The Desert of Motupe,” in *The History of Hernando De Soto and Florida*, ed. Barnard Shipp (Philadelphia, Collins Publishing, 1881), quote on 603-604.

⁷⁶ For anthropological investigations into the sensory aspects of hunting see, Garry Marvin, “Sensing Nature, Encountering the World in Hunting,” *Etnofoor* 18, 1 (2005): 15-26.

⁷⁷ Karr, *Indian New England*, quote on 86.

seen a dear pass by me upon a neck of land, and a salvage that has pursued him by the view...the salvage, pricking the dear, comes where he finds the view of two dears together, leading several ways. One he was sure, was fresh, but which (by the sense of seeing) he could not judge, therefore, with his knife, he digs up the earth of one; and by smelling, says, that was not of the fresh dear: then digs he up the other; and viewing and smelling to that, concludes it to be the view of the fresh dear, which he had pursued, and thereby follows the chase and kills that dear, and I did eat part of it with him: such is their perfection in these two senses.⁷⁸

According to Rhode Island founder Roger Williams, Native American subsistence tactics involved such knowledge of odor that indigenous hunters could limit the keen sense of smell of deer by using ensconced traps. As with the venison described by Williams and Morton, Wood explained the English admiration for Native American habits of hunting beavers, “too cunning for the English who never catch them.”⁷⁹

Colonel James Smith, a captive among the Mohawks in 1755, was astonished by how his abductors used the aromatic environment to their advantage in hunting the beaver deemed so elusive to earlier generations of Europeans in New England. Smith asked of his captor:

what was the use of the beaver’s stones, or glands’...He said that as the beavers

⁷⁸ Thomas Morton, *New English Canaan* (London: Charles Greene, 1637), quote on 48-49.

⁷⁹ Karen Kupperman, *Indians and English: Facing Off in Early America* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 2000), 168-170, quote on 170.

are the dumbest of all animals, and scarcely ever make noise, and as they were working creatures they made use of this smell in order to work in concert. If an old beaver was to come on the bank and rub his breech upon the ground, and raise a perfume the others will collect from different places and go to work: this is also of use to them in travelling, that they may thereby search out and find their company. Cunning hunters, finding this out, have made use of it against the beavers, in order to catch them...by this perfume...they decoy them to the trap.⁸⁰

Lawson, while in the Carolina backcountry during the early eighteenth century, saw Native Americans burning the bones of such hunted animals in a ritual manner. These men believed “if they omitted that custom, the game would leave their country, and they should not be able to maintain themselves by their hunting.”⁸¹ Adair similarly concluded, when falsely correlating Native American ceremonies to Jewish habits of ritualistic sacrifice, that “Indians have among them the resemblance of the Jewish...for they commonly pull their new-killed venison before they dress it several times through the smoke...of the fire, both by the way of a sacrifice, and to consume the blood, life, or animal spirits of the beast.”⁸²

Numerous Native American oral histories enliven the point that hunting in colonial era indigenous communities involved consistently aromatized components.⁸³ The Fox oral

⁸⁰ James Smith, “Of the Remarkable Occurrences in the Life and Travels of Colonel James Smith,” in *Tragedies of the Wilderness, or, True and Authentic Narratives of Captives Who Have Been Carried Away by the Indians*, ed. Samuel Gardner Drake (Boston: Antiquarian Bookstore and Institute, 1974), quote on 210.

⁸¹ Colin Calloway, *New Worlds for All: Indians, Europeans, and the Remaking of Early America* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997), quote on 72.

⁸² Adair, *History of the American Indians*, quote on 117.

⁸³ For aromatic hunting, origin histories, and Native American place-naming customs that represent Native American odorophilia see, Richard Erdoes and Alfonso Ortiz, *American Indian Myths and Legends* (New

tradition of “When the Cannibal Giant was Killed by Wisahkeha” involved a skirmish between the odors of a bear threatening the survival of the nation and the scents of a girl’s urine to remove the threat of the bear’s pungent *manitou*.⁸⁴ In a tale that had been passed down from Ohio Valley nations, which has come to be called “The Abandoned,” a lost boy became the leader of a Native American nation through his ability to work with a spiritually communicative canine, who through his superior knowledge of scents protected the boy’s village from a similarly pungent bear.⁸⁵ However, it was not simply in spirituality, nor medicine, nor merely hunting where the olfactory found its place. The sensorium evident in tales of Native American lives does not implicate European writers with the false trope of the Noble Savage, because many nations amplified their use of odors as a sociocultural and environmental necessity.⁸⁶

Jesuit Uses of Odor for Conversions and Cross-Cultural Interactions

During the seventeenth century, Jesuits in the North American interior were materially dependent on the Native Americans they attempted to convert. Within this *mêlée*

York: Pantheon Books, 1984), 15-19, 39-41, Jeremiah Curtin, *Creation Myths of Primitive America* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1899), 318-320, 494-497, Kathleen Joan Bragdon, *Native People of Southern New England, 1500-1650* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1996), esp. 194-195, and Howard Harrod, *The Animals Came Dancing: Native American Sacred Ecology and Animal Kinship* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2000), 59-60.

⁸⁴ Brian Swann, *Voices from Four Directions: Translations of the Natives Literatures of North America* (Lincoln, Neb.: University of Nebraska Press, 2004), esp. 448-450.

⁸⁵ C. C. Trowbridge and C. E. Schorer, *Indian Tales of C.C. Trowbridge: Collected from Wyandots, Miamis, and Shawanoes* (Brighton, Mich.: Green Oak Press, 1986), 55-66. For animals in the study of the five human senses, read through early modern English literature, see Steven Connor, “The Menagerie of the Senses,” *The Senses and Society* 1, 1 (2006): 9-26.

⁸⁶ For debates on sensory skills within the environment regarding the trope of the noble savage see, Shepard Krech III, *The Ecological Indian: Myth and History* (New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1999), esp. 16-27.

for souls instigated by European outthrust, the Jesuits perceived the odor of their Native neighbors in various ways during their American endeavors.⁸⁷ Prior to the process of spiritual cleansing involved in Catholic baptism and conversion, Native Americans had to be defined as ill-smelling as a physical signifier of the foul practicing of false religion. Le Jeune initially summarized that Natives, “are dirty in their habits, in their postures, in their homes, and in their eating; yet there is no lack of propriety among them, for everything that gives satisfaction to the senses, passes as propriety...the entrance to their Cabins is like a pig-pen.”⁸⁸

Even after time spent within indigenous homes, some Jesuits found Native American practices foul-smelling. These smells represented to Jesuits that these populations were anti-Christian and continued to exist in a liminal earthly state nearer to hell than heaven. As Tracy Leavelle has described, much of the perception of Native American habits relied upon the relative docility or adaptability of Native nations, dependent on whether those nations were easily converted or resistant. The Illinois were thus described in the Jesuit’s “applied anthropology” as men rather than animals, as experiences tied Jesuits to the Illinois, and their possible conversion to Catholicism.⁸⁹

Other Native Americans received negative sensory categorizations through Jesuit

⁸⁷ For conjuring and spiritual traditions as a battle over whose Gods were superior see the reading of the Little Ice Age as causing Native Americans to often request European forms of “magic” through superior gods analyzed within, Sam White, “Shewing the Difference Between Their Conjurament, and Our Invocation on the Name of God for Rayne’: Weather, Prayer, and Magic in Early American Encounters,” *WMQ* 72, 1 (2015): 33-56.

⁸⁸ Paul Le Jeune, “Relation de ce qui s'est passé en La Nouvelle France, en l'année 1634. Maison de N. Dame des Anges, en Nouvelle France, August 7, 1634,” in *Vol. 6 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quote on 260-261.

⁸⁹ Tracy Leavelle, *The Catholic Calumet: Colonial Conversions in French and Indian North America* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012), 85-96.

noses. As Jerome Lalemant compared in his 1639 *Relation* concerning the Huron: “Casting our eyes over the customs and practices of these peoples, they had always appeared to us like stagnant, ill-smelling pools; yet we had hardly seen, in the past, more than the surface. But since we have been obliged...to search within, and remove this sewer, it cannot be believed what a stench and what wretchedness we have found there.” His smelling was tied directly to the sense’s ability to define levels of piety, or the perception of the lack thereof.⁹⁰

In New France sensory onslaught came in myriad forms to the Jesuits. The New World acted upon Jesuit noses with the stench of the dead that pervaded the literature of many *Relations* sent back to France. In 1640, Lalemant and Le Jeune described such a mephitic bombardment concerning the corporeal consequences of virgin soil epidemics upon ruined indigenous groups near the Ursuline nunneries the French established near Quebec. They noted that the “sick came from all directions in such numbers, their stench was so insupportable...that I do not know how these good sisters...endured...these hardships.”⁹¹ As historian Allan Greer has similarly noted regarding sensory bombardment, the smell of human waste permeated the environment of New France as, “outhouses were by no means universal, and so the streets of Montreal and Quebec, like those of Stockholm, Helsinki, and Paris, functioned as open sewers, particularly disgusting when spring thaw flushed out a whole winter’s accretion.”⁹²

⁹⁰ Hierosme Lalemant, “Relation de ce qui s’est passé en la Nouvelle France, en l’année 1639. Ossossané, June 7, 1639,” in *Vol. 17 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quote on 145.

⁹¹ Jerome Lalemant, “Relation de ce qui s’est passé en la Nouvelle France, en l’année 1640. Paul le Jeune; Kébec, September 10, 1640. *Jerome Lalemant*; Des Hurons, May 27, 1640,” in *Vol. 19 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quote on 9.

⁹² Allan Greer, *The People of New France* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997), quote on 54-55.

Jesuits were propelled by much of this pungent plight to increasingly value odor for numerous environmental and subsistence motives. As a sign of hope in the unrelenting siege of the Canadian climate, the Jesuits found positive the perfume of roses that promised new spring. As the Frenchman Paul Denis summarized in the *Relation* of 1671-1672: “they are in error who have held that this region, whether by reason of the intense cold, the ice and snow, or the lack of wood suitable for building and heating, is uninhabitable...I can assert...there were wild roses here...beautiful and fragrant.”⁹³

Across the continent, French categorization of the New World’s wilds considered similar novel aromatic elements through diametrically opposed odors of heavenly incense, used to honor the altar within Catholic mass within Europe and for purification of the faithful, and the sulfuric odors of hell. As Father Gabriel Marest communicated from his post in Kaskaskia near the Mississippi River in 1712, “the *copal*...issues a gum that diffuses an odor as agreeable as that of incense.”⁹⁴ What must have been seismic shifting was designated by Father Charles Simon in his *Relatio Terræmotus in Nova Francia* (1663), in which he described preternaturally sulfuric, “wide and deep gaps in the earth and frequent fissures...chasms of wonderful depth, exhaling a foul stench.”⁹⁵ Likewise,

⁹³ For new spring see, Claude Dablon, Jacques Fremin, Jacques Bruyas, Pierre Raffeix, Julien Garner, François de Crepieul, Henry Noevel, Charles Albanel, and Marie de l’Incarnation. “Relation de ce qui s’est passé en la Nouvelle France, les années 1671, & 1672. *Claude Dablon* [Quebec, October, 1672; *Jacques Fremin*, St. Xavier des Prez, August 14, 1672; *Jacques Bruyas*, Onneiout, [1672]; *Pierre Raffeix*, Goïogouen, June, 1672; *Julien Garnier*, Tsonnontouan, July, 1672; *François de Crepieul*, Tadoussac, June 2, 1672; *Henry Nouvel*, Ste. Marie du Sault, [1672]; *Charles Albanel*, n.p., n.d.; *Marie de l’Incarnation*, n.p., n.d,” in *Vol. 56 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899), quote on 205-207.

⁹⁴ Gabriel Marest, “Lettre au Père Germon. Cascaskias, November 9, 1712,” in *Vol. 66 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899), quote on 227, Marest’s italics.

⁹⁵ Charles Simon, “Relatio Terræmotus in Nova Francia, 1663, translated into Latin by François Ragueneau. Bourges, December 12, 1663,” in *Vol. 68 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows

Charles Dablon, in his 1680 annual report as the superior of the Canadian diocese in Quebec, discussed a metaphorically spiritual aroma inherent in New France. At his station, “the most common and most wonderful plant...is that which we call the universal plant, because its leaves, when powdered, heal in a short time wounds of all kinds...and its roots have the smell of the laurel.”⁹⁶ The fragrant and implicitly Edenic laurel Dablon classified was later borrowed by Jesuits near New England in 1722 to mix with tallow candles that had offered a sometimes terrible pungency to dimly-lit late night sessions of biblical exegesis.⁹⁷

As with their changing perceptions of the American environment, Jesuit disgust for Native Americans faded into cultural relativity the more time they spent in Native American villages. During the 1630s and 1640s, Native Americans were usually cast as ill-smelling. By the 1670s, *Relations* reflected the transition of Native American smells within Jesuit perceptions. The changing olfactory language in the *Relations* described Native Americans shifting from reeking undesirably to smelling positively based upon religious conversions throughout the seventeenth century. This was reflective of the education of the Jesuit sensorium, rather than any significant changes in Native American’s biological smells, as physical cleanliness during the colonial era was of more concern to indigenous peoples rather than early modern Europeans who usually believed water to be corruptive to health.⁹⁸

Brothers, 1899), quote on 199-201.

⁹⁶ Virginia Louise Snider Eifert, *Tall Trees and Far Horizons: Adventures and Discoveries of Early Botanists in America* (New York: Dodd, Mead, 1965), 16-17, quote on 17.

⁹⁷ James Phinney Baxter, *The Pioneers of New France in New England, with Contemporary Letters and Documents* (Albany, NY: J. Munsell's Sons, 1894), 137-138.

⁹⁸ For water as corruptive to health in early modern European medical traditions see, Georges Vigarello,

Specifically, Jesuit religious reverence in North America began to apply smelling to perceive the odor of sanctity within converted Native Americans and extraordinary Jesuits. Lalemant's *Relation* of 1647 recorded the early voyages of Father Isaac Jogues in Montreal. Beatifically, Lalemant described Jogues' redolent effect on the region: "his memory is still living there; the odor of his virtues still refreshes and comforts all those who have had the happiness to know him and converse with him."⁹⁹

For many Native Americans, according to the Jesuits, conversion came because of this odor of piety associated with venerable priests and their works. The *Relation* of 1679 of Dablon and Vincent Bigot regarded such olfactory redolence of a Native American converted to be a Catholic Father whose "cabin, during the winter hunting" diffused "so sweet an odor of piety that he made even the infidels who hunted near him live as Christians."¹⁰⁰ His scent therefore acted as the conversion cause not simply as metaphor to purity, but as a biologically sensed odor that the Jesuits perceived their Native American converts could detect through their noses as well.

As the *Relation* of 1667-1668 recorded, the concept of a similar aroma of sanctity

Concepts of Cleanliness: Changing Attitudes in France since the Middle Ages (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), esp. 14-45, Kathleen Brown, *Foul Bodies: Cleanliness in Early America* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2009), esp. 37-38, and Mark Jenner, "Quackery and Enthusiasm, or Why Drinking Water Cured the Plague," in *Religio Medici: Medicine and Religion in Seventeenth-Century England*, ed. Ole Peter Grell and Andrew Cunningham (Aldershot: Scolar, 1996), 313-340.

⁹⁹ Hierosme Lalemant, "Relation de ce qui s'est passé la Nouvelle France, sur le Grand Flevve de S. Lavrens en année 1647. Quebec, October 20, 1647," in *Vol. 31 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898), quote on 105-106. For Jogues as a discursive construct see, Paul Perron, "Isaac Jogues: From Martyrdom to Sainthood," in *Colonial Saints: Discovering the Holy in the Americas, 1500-1800*, ed. Allan Greer and Jodi Bilinkoff (New York: Routledge, 2003), 153-168.

¹⁰⁰ Vincent Bigot and Claude Dablon, "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en la Nouvelle France en l'année 1679. Vincent Bigot, revised by Claude Dablon; [Quebec, 1679]," in *Vol. 61 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899), quote on 219.

was perceived within an ill fourteen-year-old Native American girl who noticed an ambrosial paradise on her deathbed: “in the night she was made to smell such ravishing odors of paradise, and her mouth was filled with some unknown substance, so delicious, that she would experience that sweetness and pleasure during all the following day.”¹⁰¹ In North America, the combination of Native American traditions valuing odor and previous sensual Catholic theology prolonged Jesuit odorophilia.¹⁰² The redolent tales of Jogues, the anonymous Native American Father, the teenager summarized above, and especially the life of Tekakwitha, the Mohawk Saint, exemplify the continued appreciation of Counter-Reformation sensuality for Jesuits confronting the Canadian expanse.

Kateri Tekakwitha was born in 1656 in Mohawk country. In 1680, she died after years spent in a Catholic village, but the perceived miraculous nature of her deathbed scene, where God removed her scars and her perceived exquisiteness returned, supported her sainthood within Catholic tradition. Her later grave acted as a perceived healing point and

¹⁰¹ The final fate of Mother Catherine de Saint Augustin, Hospital Mother of Quebec in 1688, likewise furnished occasion for the Jesuits to represent the retention the odor of sanctity in New France. Father Francois Le Mercier stated that the “odor of her virtue was diffused over all this new world.” Francois Le Mercier and Marie de S. Bonnaventure de Jesus, “Relation de ce qui s’est passé en la Nouvelle France, aux années mil fix cens foixante-fept & mil fix cens foixante-huit. *François le Mercier*, n.p., n. d.; *François de Laval*, Quebec, November 8, 1668; *Marie de S. Bonnaventure de Jesus*, Quebec, October 4, 1668,” in *Vol. 52 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899), quotes on 31-33, 79-81. One similar tale of such pious odors was that of Father Jean Pradere who, when ill “sank, as it were, into a sweet sleep; upon awaking therefrom, he felt extremely comfortable, and discovered a perspiration on his leg, bathing it and exhaling an odor so sweet that he had never smelt anything like it. Immediately afterward, he saw his leg entirely free from moisture, and as completely restored as if it had never been affected.” Francois Le Mercier, Claude Jean Allouez, Thomas Morel, and Marie de S. Bonaventure, “Relation de ce qui s’est passé en la Nouvelle France, les années mil six cens soixante six, & mil six cens soixante sept. *François le Mercier*, Kebec, November 10, 1667; *Claude Jean Allouez*, n. p., n. d.; *Thomas Morel*, n. p., n. d.; *Marie de S. Bonaventure*, Kebec, October 20, 1667,” in *Vol. 51 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899), quote on 99-101.

¹⁰² For sensory embodiment amongst colonials who encountered the violence of Native Americans, especially the Mohawk, see, Allan Greer, *Mohawk Saint: Catherine Tekakwitha and the Jesuits* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), esp. 120-123.

a spiritual center for many, Natives and Europeans, who needed the hope of extraordinary therapy. Her eventual consideration for sainthood was earned, in part, because of the godly perfume emanating during her bereavement.¹⁰³

Within Europe the odor of sanctity grew into the desensitized literary metaphor it exists as in the modern West through a process of sensory secularization. In the Americas, the odor of sanctity became increasingly real to Jesuits suffering through novel New World encounters, and, in turn, became an easily perceivable scent that the Jesuits believed their Native American neighbors could sense as well. In North America, the distance within discourse, between the metaphorical odor of sanctity and the spiritually and physically sensed odor of sanctity, diminished at the moment when a process within Europe was separating metaphor of scent from physical and religious reality.¹⁰⁴

Alliance making in North America involved the importance of potlach understandings of gift-giving tied to Native American traditions, frontier subsistence, and religious practices.¹⁰⁵ Native Americans often understood encounters with Europeans in similar ways, finding European odors and smells similarly malleable, but searching for

¹⁰³ Greer, *Mohawk Saint*, 1-24, esp. 22; Daniel Richter, *Facing East from Indian Country: a Native History of Early America* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2001), 78-80. For the transmission of Tekakwitha's narrative to New Spain, regarding debates on the possibilities of virginity among Native Americans, see, Allan Greer, "Iroquois Virgin: The Story of Catherine Tekakwitha in New France and New Spain," in *Colonial Saints: Discovering the Holy in the Americas, 1500-1800*, ed. Allan Greer and Jodi Bilinkoff (New York: Routledge, 2003), 235-250.

¹⁰⁴ For a similar amalgamation of Catholicism with indigenous practices to assist in conversion see, Peter Gose, "Converting the Ancestors: Indirect Rule, Settlement Consolidation, and the Struggle over Burial in Colonial Peru, 1532-1614," in *Conversion: Old Worlds and New*, ed. Kenneth Mills and Anthony Grafton (Rochester, N.Y.: University of Rochester Press, 2003), 140-174.

¹⁰⁵ For a reading of the process of gift-giving as central to the history of colonial America, especially regarding the Mississippi region and the role of Native Americans within imperial rivalry see, Joseph Hall, *Zamumo's Gifts: Indian-European Exchange in the Colonial Southeast* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009), esp. 12-32.

commonalities as a means for productive exchange.¹⁰⁶ Jesuits learned to elevate the lower senses within these Native American communities to better communicate with specific Native American leaders and converts.

Father Louis Hennepin understood the importance of identifying with the other for French geopolitical maneuvering within the American continent when discussing his entrance into areas near Kaskaskia. Hennepin discussed how a Native American chief, Monso, used talk of odors and pungency to falsely portray Hennepin as an ally with the Iroquois, enemies of the Illinois and Miami. To prove “that I was brother of the Iroquois,” the chief, Monso, had to convince his nation that “my breath smell’d like” that of the Iroquois, “that I eat Serpents; that I was sent to betray them, and attack them one way, while the *Iroquois* should attack them by another; that I was hated by all the *Black-Gowns*, who forsook me because I design’d to destroy the *Miamis*, having taken two of them Prisoners; and, lastly, that I understood Physick enough to poison all the World.”¹⁰⁷ Jesuits came to understand that odor marked insider and outsider amongst New World nations, a tradition of defining sameness and difference that was fading within ever more ethnically homogenized Europe of the same era.

Specifically regarding alliances, Europeans had to alter explicitly visual treaties towards correspondence involving more than simply the ocular black and white of a written accord. French documents offer the best examples of sensory language used in agreements between Europeans and their Native American neighbors due to the comparatively tolerant

¹⁰⁶ For Northeastern Native American nations and perceptions of the encounter see the recent work on indigenous religious traditions and coastal borderlands within, Andrew Lipman, *The Saltwater Frontier: Indians and the Contest for the American Coast* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2015), esp. 25-48.

¹⁰⁷ Hennepin, *A New Discovery*, quotes on 313-315.

policies of attempted coexistence with many nations. Claude Charles Le Roy Bacqueville de la Potherie, an early historian of the French colonies in the Americas, described a potlach exchange between Frenchmen and the recently belligerent Miami tribe that relayed instances of sensory respect where the aromatic played an important role in negotiation. Perot, the Frenchman leading peace talks during a 1667 delegation near Sault St. Marie, offered the chief and a few of the sick of the tribe a dose of theriac, a medieval remedy for many diseases that contained opium and was flavored with many aromatic spices such as cinnamon and mace. He noted,

the great chief and two of the most prominent men among them came to awaken the Frenchmen during the night, and made him a present of ten beaver robes, in order to induce him to give them some of this remedy. He...refused the robes. Moreover, he told them that he could not do without the remedy in a voyage wherein he might encounter so many dangers, but they begged it from him even more urgently; and they asked him to permit them at least to smell it. This odor seemed to them so delightful that they believed that they would almost become immortal by rubbing the chest with this remedy.

The French ended up giving up half their theriac to the Miami so as to not insult the more respected tribal members while continuing to pursue negotiations.¹⁰⁸

Numerous tales of calumet smoking involved a distinctive sensory component

¹⁰⁸ Claude Charles Le Roy, Bacqueville de la Potherie, "History of the Savage People who are Allies of New France," in *The Indian Tribes of the Upper Mississippi Valley and Region of the Great Lakes*, ed. and trans. by Emma Helen Blair (New York: Kraus Reprint Co., 1969 [1911]), 344-347, quote on 345-346.

similarly requested by Native Americans and used by Jesuits. Later French political negotiators, using calumets and primed by knowledge of Jesuit sensory conversions, came to appreciate the importance of the senses in politicizing Natives. In creating alliances, many French officials learned that one must acquiesce to all of the sensorium, not solely a paper treaty. As such, the *Relation* of 1671-1672 recited the treaty talks at the Mission of Saint François Xavier with sentient raptness. A Father involved in the mission orated that Onontio, the metaphorical French uncle who retained considerable symbolic political power over Native Americans in the area: “has wrested the war-hatchet from their hands. Your country was dead; he has restored it to life. He has cleared away the trees and rocks that blocked your rivers and checked the course of their waters. Fish, hunt, and trade in all directions, without fear of being discovered by your enemies, either from the noise of your arms, the odor of your tobacco, or the smoke of your fires.”¹⁰⁹

The tobacco calumet, originally an indigenous ceremonial pipe, became both Catholic and political to the French after it developed important ties to interethnic and trans-religious practices during the seventeenth century.¹¹⁰ When a Mesquakie man met with Father Claude-Jean Allouez in 1671 he impressed the priest when he took “handfuls of powdered tobacco” and “scattered it over the crucifix and over me.” This action of the highest honor, for both the Jesuit and the Native American, was provided through the pungent leaves usually set aside for the ritualized act of smoking.¹¹¹

¹⁰⁹ Dablon, et. all, “Relation de ce qui s’est passé en la Nouvelle France, les années 1671, & 1672,” quote on 175.

¹¹⁰ Christopher Parsons, “Natives, Newcomers, and Nicotiana: Tobacco in the History of the Great Lakes Region,” in *French and Indians in the Heart of North America, 1630-1815*, ed. Robert Englebert and Guillaume Teasdale (East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 2013), 21-41.

¹¹¹ Leavelle, *Catholic Calumet*, quote on 74.

The pipe, with all its sensory implications, was valued for numerous later acts of political negotiation. In a letter to the Marquis de Beauharnois from May 21, 1733 the French soldier Pierre Verendrye summarized a peaceful offer the French made using the notorious Native American desire for tobacco. He wrote, “I sent to the Sioux a collar and a pipe of peace on behalf of our savages with some black tobacco to get them to smoke, asking at the same time to make peace.”¹¹² French Jesuits attempted to create sensory linkages to their Native American neighbors through the integration of the tobacco scented calumet into Catholic practice. Native peoples offered numerous Jesuits tobacco as a gift to a perceived spiritual power, the French government in turn responded with the valued crop within political negotiations.¹¹³

For many Native Americans near both English and French borders it was, in part, the smell of tobacco smoke that cemented a treaty. As the ethnographer Francis Densmore described in 1922, “a gift of tobacco accompanied a request and its acceptance signified a promise to grant the request. The smoking of tobacco by both parties was an essential part of the making of a treaty.” The smoking of the calumet in Illinois and Sioux country described above mirrored much of the smoking traditions across the Native American continent and among the Eastern Woodland tribes wherefrom the scattered descendants to the Pays d’en Haut and Western environs would find many of their ancestors.

¹¹² For tobacco in alliance making see, Pierre Gaultier de Varennes La Vérendrye and Lawrence Burpee, *Journals and Letters of Pierre Gaultier De Varennes De La Vérendrye and His Sons* (Toronto: Champlain Society, 1927), 95-167.

¹¹³ For use of tobacco in religious rites within Native North American oral histories see, Joseph Winter, “From Earth Mother to Snake Woman: The Role of Tobacco in the Evolution of Native American Religious Organization,” in *Tobacco Use by Native North Americans: Sacred Smoke and Silent Killer*, ed. Joseph Winter (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2000), esp. 275-286.

Extraordinary similarity persisted in these smoking rituals amongst indigenous nations.¹¹⁴

However, not simply tobacco permeated sensory agreements between Natives and their European counterparts. The union itself could create redolent exquisiteness. Later European nations within Native America applied their knowledge of indigenous sensory appreciation to treaty negotiations as well. George Croghan, an Irish-born English official well-informed of Native American sensory customs, quoted a European negotiator's opinion of a successful agreement settled in 1765: "I gather up all the bones of your deceased friends, and bury them deep in the ground, that the herbs and sweet flowers of the earth may grow over them, that we may not see them anymore."¹¹⁵

The use of scented language represents a learned skill among European negotiators to express themselves in sensuous terms.¹¹⁶ During an unrelated negotiation, Croghan, in the Ohio Valley during the French and Indian War, wrote of Native's scented blessings upon their newly allied British neighbors. The Brethren Chiefs and Warriors involved in the meeting stated, "the ancient friendship that long subsisted between our ancestors is now renewed. I wash the blood off the earth, that has been shed since the present war, that you may smell the sweet scent of the springing herbs and bury the war hatchet in the bottomless

¹¹⁴ Father Jean de Brebeuf described the Huron spiritual use for tobacco in 1639 writing that the smoke "enables them to see clearly through the most intricate matters." James Warren Springer, "An Ethnohistoric Study of the Smoking Complex in Eastern North America," *Ethnohistory* 28, 3 (1981), 217-235, quotes from 219-220.

¹¹⁵ George Croghan, "Croghan's Journal; May 15-September 26, 1765," in *Vol. I of Early Western Travels, 1748-1846: A Series of Annotated Reprints of Some of the Best and Rarest Contemporary Volumes of Travel: Descriptive of the Aborigines and Social and Economic Conditions in the Middle and Far West, During the Period of Early American Settlement*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland, Ohio: A. H. Clark Co., 1904), 156-157, quote on 157.

¹¹⁶ For Jesuit settlement in Illinois communities as a pattern of settlement that opened trade networks for both the French and later English settlers see, Robert Michael Morrissey, *Empire by Collaboration: Indians, Colonists, and Governments in Colonial Illinois Country* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015), esp. 63-70.

pit.”¹¹⁷ In Native American communities, many Europeans followed treaty customs of aroma respect to achieve goals with their indigenous neighbors; a process learned from Jesuits who discovered the Native American desire to understand sensory commonalities through their own spiritual perceptions.¹¹⁸

Jesuits and the Literacy of Scenting

Scholars should not reduce Native Americans through an entirely etic perspective; however, using an etic perspective from colonial texts can allow scholars to come to emic understandings of Native American beliefs and history.¹¹⁹ The integration of Native Americans into the European narrative should therefore not be the goal of Native American historiography. To commit to different goals, this analysis has focused on three significant narrative structures outlined by Daniel Richter: to place a stress on cultural trading of European and Indians, to discover material common to all, and to find the common processes that were important to all groups.¹²⁰

¹¹⁷ George Croghan, “Croghan’s Journal; October 21, 1760-January 7, 1761,” in *Vol. I of Early Western Travels, 1748-1846: A Series of Annotated Reprints of Some of the Best and Rarest Contemporary Volumes of Travel: Descriptive of the Aborigines and Social and Economic Conditions in the Middle and Far West, During the Period of Early American Settlement*, ed. Reuben Gold Thwaites (Cleveland, Ohio: A. H. Clark Co., 1904), 114-117, quote on 116.

¹¹⁸ For sensory rhetoric about landscapes as a way to assert indigenous land rights see, Ruth Van Dyke, “Imagined Narratives: Sensory Lives in the Chacoan Southwest,” in *Making Senses of the Past: Toward a Sensory Archaeology*, ed. Jo Day (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2013), 390-408.

¹¹⁹ For larger patterns of how Catholicism entered into Native American religion through the adoption of local minor alterations see, Allan Greer, “Conversion and Ideology: Iroquois Christianity in Seventeenth-Century New France,” in *Conversion: Old Worlds and New*, ed. Kenneth Mills and Anthony Grafton (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2003), 175-198.

¹²⁰ Daniel Richter, “Whose Indian History?” *WMQ* 50, 2 (1993): 379-393; Richter, *Facing East*, esp. 145-150.

Loyola primed his followers to use hell, with all its possible sensory manifestations, as the premier theme in conversion discourses with unconverted indigenous populations. Many Native Americans would not believe hell could burn continuously as no amount of wood could exist to keep the vast fires blazing incessantly. Hearing of these concerns, a Jesuit priest gathered the leaders of the Native American community in question to prove that “the earth itself could burn.” At the meeting, the priest passed around a lump of sulfur. After inspection, the priest threw numerous pieces of the stenchful rock into the fire: “each time, the sulphur burst into flames and ‘filled the curious noses with a stifling odor,’ at which the Indians placed their hands over their mouths to register their astonishment.” Elaborating on these scentful torments of the damned allowed Jesuit priests to frighten Native peoples into conversions and create what they perceived as honest, and sensory induced, dreadfulness of the Catholic God.¹²¹

To correct the perceived moral failings of Native Americans, Jesuits applied their own beliefs in sensory based religious proofs for educating Natives away from the perceived demons controlling them. More than ten thousand indigenous North Americans converted to Catholicism, most because Catholic “optimism, liturgy, art, music, and incense, appealed to the senses.”¹²² Liturgical modifications towards increased sensuality were amplified by Jesuits due to a powerful request from Native Americans that Jesuits learned to apply when attempting to convert their perceived Native flocks with incense, sulfur, or the doctrine of the odor of sanctity. Such incense was originally created from Arabian trees and oils, but later included many types of American pine sap or ground cedar

¹²¹ Axtell, *Invasion Within*, quotes on 114.

¹²² Raymond Schroth, *The American Jesuits: A History* (New York: New York University, 2007), quote on 41.

bark; similar to the locally influenced allocation of the laurel for previously pungent tallow candles.¹²³ The American environment was altering Jesuit material goods to include more pleasant odors as the Jesuits themselves altered the perceived smell of the Native peoples who lived upon that very environment through conversion.

Hidden beneath promotional literature that discussed encounters with Native America are sub-textual references to sensory influences, an augmented literacy of the olfactory, which Native Americans transmitted to their Jesuit boarders. As Jesuits tried to make Native Americans believe in the Catholic God, increasingly peculiar alterations were occurring within the Jesuit sensorium that could not be fully articulated through the written word. As sensory scholar Michael Taussig summarized, the border between Natives and Europeans was the consistent and instantaneous creator of new identities through the cyclical mechanism of mimesis and othering: “Rather than thinking of the border as the farthestmost extension of an essential identity spreading out from a core...think instead of the border itself as that core...identity acquires its satisfying solidity because of the effervescence of the...border, because of the turbulent forces, sexual and spiritual, that the border not so much contains as emits.”¹²⁴

Efforts at cultural accommodation through similarities in the spiritual sensorium helped to create some cross-cultural concordance between Jesuit Fathers and Native Americans. This respect for the olfactory existed within a Jesuit siege mentality, born of the Counter-Reformation, which exacerbated sensory proofs while applying odor for the

¹²³ Material history from Louis Nicolas, Francois Marc Gagnon, Réal Ouellet, and Nancy Senior, *The Codex Canadensis and the Writings of Louis Nicolas, The Natural History of the New World* (Tulsa, Okla.: Gilcrease Museum, 2011), esp. 288-300.

¹²⁴ Michael Taussig, *Mimesis and Alterity: A Particular History of the Senses* (New York: Routledge, 1993), esp. 66, 90-94, 106, quote on 150.

attempted conversion of Natives; combining the sensory seal of tobacco, the odor of piety, and the understanding of a forcefully influential Native respect for odor to Catholic conversion tactics and European alliance formation. Le Jeune had once noted that “faith enters by the ear,” paying homage to the oral preaching of Saint Paul.¹²⁵ Upon the Pays d’en Haut and within the St. Lawrence Valley of the seventeenth century faith entered not only through the Catholic word of God as written in scripture, as spoken in mass or on the missionary circuit, or as tasted through the bread and wine, but through the common experience of the olfactory that many Jesuits and Native Americans shared while open-nosed upon the American frontier.¹²⁶

The shock of discovery forced a worldview whereby the other was increasingly made into the same. For Native Americans and French Jesuits, the experiment of conversion involved finding similarities within modes of sensory representation. As the use of odor to mark difference declined in a Europe that hoped to assert common ethnic traits for new imagined communities, the New World offered a place for older patterns of olfactory marking of insider and outsider to persist on borderlands and frontiers of European imperial projects. As the Old World continued to deodorize, the New World offered a vast space and wilderness where smells continued to inform travelers within indigenous lands.

¹²⁵ Carole Blackburn, *Harvest of Souls: The Jesuit Missions and Colonialism in North America, 1632-1650* (Montreal, Quebec: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2000), quote on 148.

¹²⁶ For the importance of Jesuit and Native American interaction in the creation of peaceful communities within the Middle Ground see the examples of Kaskaskia within, Winstanley Briggs, “Le Pays Des Illinois,” *WMQ* 47, 1 (1990): 30-56.

Chapter 4

“Delightful a Fragrance”:

Native American Olfactory Aesthetics within the
Eighteenth Century Anglo-American Botanical Community

When describing Native American women harvesting strawberries during his travels through the American South in the 1770s, the Pennsylvanian botanist William Bartram wrote of a scene composed of “Cherokee virgins, some busily gathering...rich fragrant fruit, others having already filled their baskets...reclined under the shade of floriferous and fragrant native bowers...bathing their limbs in the cool fleeting streams.” Bartram’s summary continued in such a perfumed manner describing his men’s attempt at intrusion, which failed due to an alarm sounding from a few Native American men who had watched the English skulk nearby. Within this sequence of Bartram’s travels in May of 1775, the botanist and his men placed themselves in distinct sensory worlds composed from the dual influences of Native American culture and the North American landscape.¹

The sensual influence of these North American environments altered Bartram and his men enough to craft a desire to love indigenous wilderness life and Native American women with a sensorium that included an increased appreciation for the aesthetic and scientific detections of the nose.² Fragrant strawberries, the smell of mountain flowers compared to that of the perceived odoriferous breaths of Native American females, and Native women’s scented bodies enticingly gathering fruit in a valley, offered Bartram a

¹ Richard Godbeer, “Eroticizing the Middle Ground: Anglo-Indian Sexual Relations along the Eighteenth Century Frontier,” in *Sex, Love, Race: Crossing Boundaries in North American History*, ed. Martha Elizabeth Hodes (New York: New York University Press, 1999), 91-111, quotes on 96. For the importance of botany to the founding generation of the United States see the reading of George Washington as an engaged gardener at Mount Vernon within, Andrea Wulf, *Founding Gardeners: The Revolutionary Generation, Nature, and the Shaping of the American Nation* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2011), esp. 9-11, 13-34.

² As Michel de Certeau has described, travel “narratives are of interest to a history of science: in them, mobile configurations of evolving disciplines intersect, grow distinct, and become ordered; in them, as in the archives, units become determinate which will exercise their constraints on the sciences destined to express them within systems.” Michel de Certeau, “Travel Narratives of the French to Brazil: Sixteenth to Eighteenth Centuries,” *Representations* 33, Special Issue: The New World (Winter, 1991): 221-226. For the inherent desire in the colonizer’s mind see the reading of utopian ideology and the exotic senses through keyword analysis of “exotic” within, Christa Knellwolf, “The Exotic Frontier of the Imperial Imagination,” *Eighteenth Century Life* 26, 3 (2002): 10-30.

different sensory world than that desired by a European botanical community increasingly focused on visual reasoning apart from nature.³

The instrumentality necessary on the American frontier, for finding food or classifying novel plants, continued Old World botanical traditions of smelling well into what has been considered the Linnaean era of the natural sciences.⁴ As Sara Gronim describes, there was essentially a much slower and “selective adoption” of scientific and botanical structures throughout the Atlantic World than within European intellectual centers. Colonists were often able to choose whether to accept or resist scientific doctrines that emerged from the metropole.⁵

As different cultures clashed in the American interior, Anglo-American botanists combined sensoriums through bridges and middle grounds of sensory perception, partly through a desire to become the Native American other, whereby the frontier was the creator of vernacular and syncretic sensory identities. As Holly Dugan discussed in *The Ephemeral*

³ Gregory Waselkov and Kathryn Holland Braund, *William Bartram on the Southeastern Indians* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1995), 79-82.

⁴ For the importance of the early American environment to human agency and disease patterns see, Alfred Crosby, *The Columbian Exchange: Biological and Cultural Consequences of 1492* (Westport: Greenwood, 1972), and the importance of local knowledge of natural disease environments leading to skepticism of scientific epistemology in colonial New York analyzed within, Sara Stidstone Gronim, *Everyday Nature: Knowledge of the Natural World in Colonial New York* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2007), esp. 39-57.

⁵ Gronim, *Everyday Nature*, esp. 106-133, quote on 8. For Atlantic readings of the interchange of colonial literatures see the reading of the containment of the roots of New World knowledge for reasons of scientific power through patterns of “epistemic mercantilism” within, Ralph Bauer, *The Cultural Geography of Colonial American Literatures: Empire, Travel, Modernity* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), esp. 18-26, the importance of New World knowledge that focused more on altered core ideologies of liberty, especially in France, rather than power dynamics of the encounter within, William Brandon, *New Worlds for Old: Reports from the New World and Their Effect on the Development of Social Thought in Europe, 1500-1800* (Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 1986), esp. 24-31, and the general idea that Western science is more parochial than inclusive of knowledge from other areas of the world, and discursively asserts that parochial narrative, within, Maurice Bazin, “Our Sciences, Their Science,” in *Race, Discourse, and the Origin of the Americas: A New World View*, ed. Vera Lawrence Hyatt and Rex Nettleford (Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995), 231-240.

History of Perfume (2011), European explorers who were “faced with ‘oceans’ of forests and the ‘roar’ of the sea...increasingly relied on the sense of smell. As the English searched for sensible, and merchandisable, matter in these realms, they learned that their failure and success depended on mastering new strategies of ‘discovery,’ including olfaction.”⁶ For English botanists in North America, the mechanism most accountable to the continuation of olfactory botany was the consistent nearness to Native American nations and the fragrant American environment, which altered the colonial English botanical sensorium to complete “experiments in practice” that sustained acceptance of olfactory knowledge.⁷

Because of the relatively alien nature of environmental contact for each individual crossing the Atlantic, these colonials and travelers were forced to apply their previous sensory perceptions in profound ways while relying greatly on Native American guides. Through this accessibility of Native American sensory knowledge, the lower senses of the olfactory and gustatory, increasingly repudiated as sensory focuses within Europe, found a renewed place in scientific study in the Americas due to the need to classify peoples, plants, and fauna previously unobserved.⁸

⁶ Atlantic understandings of the influence of Native American aesthetics from, Holly Dugan, *The Ephemeral History of Perfume: Scent and Sense in Early Modern England* (Baltimore, Md: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011), quote on 73, Marcy Norton, “Tasting Empire: Chocolate and the European Internalization of Mesoamerican Aesthetics,” *The American Historical Review* 111, 3 (2006): 660-691, esp. 660-661, and James Delbourgo and Nicholas Dew, “Introduction, The Far Side of the Ocean” in *Science and Empire in the Atlantic World*, ed. James Delbourgo and Nicholas Dew (New York: Routledge, 2008), 1-28, esp. 4-6, 9-12.

⁷ For examples of English adoption of Native American environmental skills and climate awareness see, Thomas Wickman, “‘Winters Embittered with Hardships’: Severe Cold, Wabanaki Power, and English Adjustments, 1690—1710,” *WMQ* 72, 1 (2015): 57-98, quote on 63, and examples of European medical expertise as arising from indigenous traditions during the Early Modern Era within, Timothy Walker, “Acquisition and Circulation of Medical Knowledge within the Early Modern Portuguese Colonial Empire,” in *Science in the Spanish and Portuguese Empires, 1500-1800*, ed. Daniela Bleichmar (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2009), 247-270.

⁸ A similar shift toward the natural has been analyzed for early American orality involving a “rhetorical revolution” wherein “natural language” replaced “artificial language” in political discussions. Within this elocutionary revolution performativity and emotion superseded the written languages of gentility. Jay

As Anglo-American botanists pushed into the interior, they discovered the need to use their limbic senses to find their place in densely wooded and novel American environments, even as their works entered European markets often removed of Native American knowledge.⁹ In the Old World, European sensory identities progressively resisted olfactory indigenous knowledge in favor of structural taxonomies, especially as numerous imperial botanists sent their tracts to European printing houses stripped of Native American references. This helped to support the trope of the hero botanist as a knight in service of a king. The hero botanist could not have his identity stained by using indigenous information or sensuality.¹⁰

However, in North America botanists continued to apply odor to their analyses of the environment based on what they learned from Native American uses of that sense.¹¹

Fliegelman, *Declaring Independence: Jefferson, Natural Language & the Culture of Performance* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1993), esp. 23-29, 62, 189. This elocutionary turn toward natural language involved appreciating performativity in myriad forms of communication. Native American culture involved a similar natural language based in performativity. In turn, “the American colonies would use their own savage eloquence to speak back to the imperial center as oratory became the defining genre of the Revolution.” Sandra Gustafson, *Eloquence Is Power: Oratory and Performance in Early America* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture by the University of North Carolina Press, 2000), quotes on 116-118. This turn to natural language often involved performative treaty discussions that offered multi-sensory spectacles for alliance making with Native Americans. Richard Cullen Rath, “Hearing Wampum: The Senses, Mediation, and the Limits of Analogy,” in *Colonial Mediascapes: Sensory Worlds of the Early Americas*, ed. Matt Cohen and Jeffrey Glover (Lincoln: Nebraska, 2014), 290-321.

⁹ For the lack of American knowledge within European natural philosophy of the Enlightenment era see, Henry Lowood, “The New World and the European Catalog of Nature,” in *America in European Consciousness, 1493-1750*, ed. Karen Kupperman (Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, VA, by the University of North Carolina Press, 1995), 295-323, esp. 310-317.

¹⁰ For an interesting case of these botanical tropes related to the social construction of science see, Emma Spary, “Of Nutmegs and Botanists,” in *Colonial Botany: Science, Commerce, and Politics in the Early Modern World*, ed. Londa Schiebinger and Claudia Swan (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005), 187-203.

¹¹ Americans broke from their English past through declension from an English gentlemanly ideal. In turn, this cultural break, through the senses, led to an American Revolution fought between the falsely proper gentlemen of Britain and self-identifying natural Americans who, through their encounter with the wilderness, became the frontiersmen of Turnerian lore. Peter Charles Hoffer, *Sensory Worlds in Early America* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2003), 189-251. For the reassertion of the Turner thesis in early

The type of olfaction colonials specifically chose, and reported upon, involved combining previous olfactory modalities with the adoption of Native American sensoriums into a creole sensory aesthetic based upon cross-cultural inclusion and sensory appreciation.

There was little fear among Anglo-American botanists that including Native American sources and sensoriums in their work would limit the document's importance. In turn, the use of this olfactory identity began to inform how creole Americans spoke of their identity as less English and more rustic, rural, embedded, and sensuously embodied.¹² These Americans became phenomenologically distinct through their use of the lower senses in the American colonies, and they understood that embodied distinction.

Susan Scott-Parrish has argued that: "America's unique matrix of contested knowledge making – its polycentric curiosity – was crucially formative of modern European ways of knowing."¹³ This chapter agrees with that assessment, but differs in understanding the patterns and comprehensiveness of knowledge that informed Old World understandings. Rather than informed directly by the data of the New World, the European Enlightenment denied specific forms of knowledge that the Western Hemisphere offered. Rather than a horizontal integration of botanical knowledge between American and European printing houses, there was a significant decoding of botanical knowledge that

American studies see, Stephen Hornsby, *British Atlantic, American Frontier: Spaces of Power in Early Modern British America* (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2005) and Eric Hinderaker and Peter Mancall, *At The Edge of Empire: the Backcountry in British North America* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2003), esp. 48-54.

¹² For another example of the *ad hoc* nature of scientific investigation in the New World see, Edward Wilson and José María Gómez Durán, *Kingdom of Ants: José Celestino Mutis and the Dawn of Natural History in the New World* (Baltimore, Md: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2010).

¹³ Susan Scott Parrish, *American Curiosity: Cultures of Natural History in the Colonial British Atlantic World* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006), quote on 7. For recent analysis of the transmission of Enlightenment thought from Europe to the New World see the rejection of "diffusionist theory" within, Caroline Winterer, *American Enlightenments: Pursuing Happiness in the Age of Reason* (New Haven; London: Yale University Press, 2016), esp. 12-17.

removed many Native American elements.¹⁴ In some ways, as Neil Safier has summarized, the Old World Enlightenment silenced as much New World knowledge as it captured through its systemic web of structural taxonomies.¹⁵

During the seventeenth century, scholars of the natural world within Europe commenced technological advancement that limited the olfactory within scientific observation. Through technological progress of empirical knowledge, medical necessity toward removing noxious vapors, the invention of the printing press, and the socio-genetic manipulation caused by the civilizing process, Europeans denied their previous sentient lives in favor of a relatively anesthetized world that repudiated the lower senses. This new sensory hierarchy focused on the printed word and the visual reliability of the eye rather than the aromatic pleasures of sexuality, perfume, and strong flavors in food. Because of these changes, the influence of Native American olfactory knowledge of plants was increasingly hidden beneath ocular focused European botanical classifications. The abundance of knowledge that Native Americans did provide to European botanical adventurers, merchants of the various royal gardens, or private traders of botanical goods, was consistently defined as worthless through what Londa Schiebinger has defined as botanical agnotology, or cultural forms of forgetting, or not transferring, important forms

¹⁴ For interesting accounts of these phenomena of removing indigenous influences see, Emma Reisz, "Curiosity and Rubber in the French Atlantic," *Atlantic Studies* 4, 1 (2007): 5-26 and Neil Safier, *Measuring the New World: Enlightenment Science and South America* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008). This agnotology was due to the desire to remove Native American influences from early modern botany and the Catholic other from a Northern European botany that wished to rid itself of what was deemed Catholic supernaturalism within scientific study. As explored in, Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra, *How to Write the History of the New World: Histories, Epistemologies, and Identities in the Eighteenth-Century Atlantic World* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2001), Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra, *Nature, Empire, and Nation: Explorations of the History of Science in the Iberian World* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2006), and through the role of secrecy in the early Spanish scientific exchange analyzed within, Maria Portuondo, *Secret Science: Spanish Cosmography and the New World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009).

¹⁵ Safier, *Measuring the New World*, esp. 9-10.

of knowledge about vegetal goods.¹⁶

As the Enlightenment progressed, references to the odors of many American plants were increasingly removed by imperial officials and merchants informing European leadership of the botanical wealth of the Americas. However, in America, transplanted English colonists and their descendants, such as John and William Bartram, Robert Beverley, and John Lawson, sustained olfactory patterns of analysis based upon constant nearness to indigenous informants, growing envy of Native American sensoriums, and through continuing to apply odor from earlier European nasal traditions within botanical and medical studies.

As James Deetz has described, analysis of material culture of American environments can show how patterns of Englishness declined within the American experience. For Deetz, after 1660 American material culture began to develop distinctly to construct new identities within the American environmental hearth.¹⁷ Botany offers a signifying aspect of a similar change within material culture related to perceptions of the New World and her material goods. While English botanists within Europe from 1650 to 1800 increasingly worked in libraries, herbariums, and visional gardens while using a deodorized scientific methodology that found the vernacular and Native American influences distasteful and increasingly useless, English colonial botanists, both amateur and professional, analyzed plants in their frontier environment with all of their sense

¹⁶ Londa Schiebinger, *Plants and Empire: Colonial Bioprospecting in the Atlantic World* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2004), esp. 3-5. For the use of the visual, textual, and spatial to construct power relationships in early America see, Sara Stidstone Gronim, "Geography and Persuasion: Maps in British Colonial New York," *WMQ* 58, 2 (2001): 373-402.

¹⁷ James Deetz, *In Small Things Forgotten: The Archaeology of Early American Life* (Garden City, NY: Anchor Press/Doubleday, 1977), esp. 36-43.

organs, especially the nose.¹⁸

Fragrant Medicine for pre-Modern Europeans; the Nose in the “Doctrine of Signatures”

Much of pre-Enlightenment European botany focused on analyses that included significant references to odor. By eliciting all the senses in the traditions of Dioscorides, Paracelsus, and Pliny the Elder, printed herbals of the early modern literate classes categorized plants using the sensory vernacular of common persons. Using the entire sensorium, most pre-Enlightenment European botanists, usually affluent men involved in the study of the natural sciences as a philosophical leisure pursuit, believed plants offered particular signatures to the human sensorium as to their practical uses.¹⁹

Through this “Doctrine of Signatures,” to later be fully expressed in Jakob Bohme’s *The Signature of All Things* (1621), botanists could identify the relevant medical and dietary uses of plants through essentially allegorizing plant shapes and sensory attributes to specific human organs.²⁰ Odors were part of these sensory rubrics applied to understand

¹⁸ Studies of the spread of Western science into the New World originally followed the Basalla model of scientific transfer named for historian George Basalla. The model implied steps involving, as Roy Macleod has summarized, “colonial dependency, a period of adolescence, which in turn would be followed by a phase of maturity, scientific independence and national autonomy.” This model did not leave much room for input from indigenous forms of science, but rather a “linear and unidirectional” movement of science across boundaries from an original Western European hearth. Roy MacLeod, *Nature and Empire: Science and the Colonial Enterprise* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000), quotes on 2-3; George Basalla, “The Spread of Western Science,” *Science* 156, 3775 (1967): 611-622; George Basalla, *The Evolution of Technology* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988). For example see the earlier reading of Anglo-American science and botany without non-European influences within, Raymond Phineas Stearns, *Science in the British Colonies of America* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1970), esp. 44-83.

¹⁹ Ian Maclean, *Logic, Signs and Nature in the Renaissance: The Case of Learned Medicine* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), esp. 77-80, 153-161; Gerhard Jaritz and Verene Winiwarter, “On the Perception of Nature in Renaissance Society,” in *Nature and Society in Historical Context*, ed. Mikuláš Teich, Roy Porter, and Bo Gustafsson (Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 91-111.

²⁰ Paracelsian scholars began to understand the doctrine through the essences the plants offered through alchemical distillation rather than the visual representation of plants in their natural state. Allen Debus, *Man*

the effectiveness of herbal medicines and inorganic remedial pharmaceuticals.²¹

Many works from the time, such as Rembert Dodoens' widely used *New Herbal* (1578), and John Gerard's *General History of Plants* (1633), an addendum to Dodoens' work, focused partially on a plant's aroma to determine herbal and nutritional uses. The medical prescriptions of this era of odoriferous diversity might guide patients to dip their handkerchiefs into many various tubs of floral fragrances, others were told to carry aromatic fruit pomanders to ward off disease; such as a lemon in the pocket, an orange in the trousers.²²

As European doctors of the era employed smells for finding proper pharmaceutical treatments for plants, they similarly used their noses to discover variations in the odor of human sicknesses. Brice Bauderon's *The Expert Physician* (1657) summarized numerous of these pre-Enlightenment sentient measures. For Bauderon, fever's "signes are rusous, crass, stinking dejections, sometimes fat and viscid, with a spume or froth which indicates heat." For treating a "synochus" fever, a virus believed to be born of a blood clot near the

and Nature in the Renaissance (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978), 50-53. For odor in this understanding based on artisanal, religious, and natural philosophical ideals see, Nathalie Wourm, "The Smell of God: Scent Trails from Ficino to Baudelaire." in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 79-100.

²¹ For the importance of experience and description in Renaissance era natural philosophy see the examples of sensory experience as practice within, Brian Ogilvie, *The Science of Describing: Natural History in Renaissance Europe* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006), esp. 129-130, 204-206.

²² Rembert Dodoens, *A New Herbal* (London: Gerard Dewes, 1578), example on 266; John Gerard, *The Herbal or General History of Plants* (New York: Dover, 1975 [1633]), esp. 290, 343, 410, and 431. For the use of odor in these European medical traditions see, Charles Webster, "Alchemical and Paracelsian Medicine," in *Health, Medicine, and Mortality in the Sixteenth Century*, ed. Charles Webster (Cambridge, Eng.: Cambridge University Press, 1979), 301-334, esp. 329-331, Annick Le Gu  rer, *Scent: the Mysterious and Essential Powers of Smell* (New York: Turtle Bay Books, 1992), 70-77, P. A. Vroon, Anton van Amerongen, and Hans de Vries, *Smell: The Secret Seducer* (New York: Farrar, Straus & Giroux, 1997), 5-10, Andrew Wear, *Knowledge and Practice in Early Modern English Medicine, 1550-1680* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000), esp. 84, Mark Jenner, "Civilization and Deodorization? Smell in Early Modern English Culture," in *Civil Histories: Essays Presented to Sir Keith Thomas*, ed. Peter Burke, Brian Howard Harrison, Paul Slack, and Keith Thomas (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), esp. 131-132.

heart, pre-Enlightenment doctors, trained in Galenic humoralism, similarly used their noses to diagnosis the potency the infection had reached.²³

Similar aromatic sensitivity was evident in French doctor Ogier Ferrier's foundational 1548 advice to physicians regarding prescription and identification of the plague. Prior to entering the home of a suspected victim, a practitioner would disinfect and make fragrant all the doors and windows of the house. Inside the home, a box full of scented roses, aloes, and cloves were all burned on hot coals to make the bedchamber fragrant. Once at the bedside, the doctor would diagnose and treat by:

holding a bit of massapa in your mouth, and holding the hand with the
aforementioned fragrances under the nose and in the other the aforementioned
branch of burning juniper, you must look upon your patient from a certain distance
away and enquire into his sicknesse and symptoms and whether he be in pain, or if
he hath any tumor anywhere, and so converse with him. And then, approaching

²³ Brice Bauderon, *The Expert Phisician* (London: R. I., 1657), quotes on 75-76, 154-155. For the importance of Galenic medicine for the wider social organization of early modern England see, Michael Carl Schoenfeldt, *Bodies and Selves in Early Modern England: Physiology and Inwardness in Spenser, Shakespeare, Herbert, and Milton* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), the link between Galenic medicine and odor within, Vivian Nutton, "Galen at the Bedside," in *Medicine and the Five Senses*, ed. W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 7-16, the direct connections between the brain and smelling explored through hot and cold smells within, Bruce Stansfield Eastwood, "Galen on the Elements of Olfactory Sensation," *Rheinisches Museum Für Philologie. N. F.* 124, 3-4 (1981): 268-290, the first widespread European use of odor to treat in surgery of the 1200s within, Michael McVaugh, "Smell and the Medieval Surgeon," *Micrologus* 10 (2002): 113-132, the use of gardens to cure diseased airs within, Carole Rawcliffe, "'Delectable Sights and Fragrant Smelles': Gardens and Health in Late Medieval and Early Modern England," *Garden History* 36, 1 (2008): 3-21, Rudolph Siegel, *Galen on Sense Perception: His Doctrines, Observations and Experiments on Vision, Hearing, Smell, Taste, Touch and Pain, and Their Historical Sources* (Basel: S. Karger, 1970), esp. 140-142, Laurence Totelin, "Smell as Sign and Cure in Ancient Medicine," in *Smell and the Ancient Senses*, ed. Mark Bradley (London; New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2015), 17-29, the reading of Vesalius and anatomical medicine upsetting, but not displacing, the idea of the inner senses of Galenic medicine within, Simon Kemp and Garth Fletcher, "The Medieval Theory of the Inner Senses," *American Journal of Psychology* 106 (1993): 559-576, and the general historical analysis of these many scented discourses within, Richard Palmer, "In Bad Odour: Smell and its Significance in Medicine from Antiquity to the Seventeenth Century," in *Medicine and the Five Senses*, ed. W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 61-68.

him, and with your backe turned upon him, you will hand your branche of wood to someone who will continue to hold it before your face and, reaching behind you with your hand, you will take the patient's pulse and feele his forehead and the region of his harte, always maintaining some fragrance beneath your nose.

Later, the physician who had turned his eyes away from the patient in diagnosis, a doctor now deemed healthful due to the perceived protection of consistent fragrance, would collect the patient's urine and fecal matter for analysis that no doubt included the use of the perceptive sinuses as well.²⁴

This use of smell to define diseases was so common that specific olfactory medical analyses became gendered.²⁵ As Gail Kern Paster described in her materialist history of early modern shame through a summary of physician John Fletcher's treatise on English

²⁴ The plague worked much to change Europeans from odorphillic to odorophobic during the Early Modern Era. The plague, initially seen by most Europeans as a spiritual breakdown, quickly became a disease of the miasmas and smells surrounding medieval and early modern towns. The controlling of such diseased smells pushed all smell to increasingly negative classification. In 1348, the Paris medical school first correlated the smell of the air to the diseased areas of the plague. Such "deadly corruption of the air" equated smells to death. Well into the eighteenth century, such polemics of the evils of smell of the air were considered only folklore by some, but the tide had begun with the 1348 *Opinion*, and, in time would change medicine throughout the early modern world. Le Guérér, *Scent*, 39-50, quote on 76. For the use of scent in medical practice during the Renaissance also see the reading of nature's signs within, Maclean, *Logic, Signs and Nature*, esp. 198-199. Douglas Biow has offered that such a propensity to use odor to analyze bodily ejecta was probably more performative within medical texts than a significant part of medical practice of the Renaissance. Using satires about the physician Fioravanti, Biow displays the use of odor as part of an alternative medical regime, rather than an aspect of the mainstream. Douglas Biow, *On the Importance of Being an Individual in Renaissance Italy: Men, Their Professions, and Their Beards* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015), esp. 125-128.

²⁵ See, especially: Faith Wallis, "Signs and Senses: Diagnosis and Prognosis in Early Medieval Pulse and Urine Texts," *Social History of Medicine* 13, 2 (2000): 265-278; Faith Wallis, "Medicine and the Senses: Feeling the Pulse, Smelling the Plague, and Listening for the Cure," in *Vol. II of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen and Richard Newhauser (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 133-152, the analysis of women as linked to odors of excrement for medical diagnoses within Greco-Roman traditions of applying animal excrement as pharmaceuticals within, Heinrich von Staden, "Women and Dirt," *Helios*. 19, 1-2 (1992): 7-29, and the reading of aromatic treatments for infertility to avoid the shame of touching the female body within, Jennifer Evans, "Female Barrenness, Bodily Access and Aromatic Treatments in Seventeenth-Century England," *Historical Research* 87, 237 (2014): 423-443.

urology, *The Differences, Causes, and Judgements of Urine* (1623): “One of the things urine signifies-and confirmed-was the nature of women...most advocates of uroscopy were convinced that age and sex functioned materially in the taxonomy of urines along with other key determinants such as color, temperature, quantity, smell, taste, ‘substance’, and ‘contents’.” Men’s urine was believed to be “not stinking” while that of a woman exceeded men’s urine regarding its potent smell.²⁶

Many of these medicinal diagnoses using smelling existed due to the lack of a universal semiotic map for understanding medicine and disease. Popular folk medicine about gender and disease offered numerous ways to understand the signifiers of the body.²⁷ Emerging from earlier medieval traditions that were based on particular vernacular knowledge for prognosis, many early modern medical traditions prior to the Enlightenment focused on the use of different sensory worlds within the semiotic mess of various medical traditions. Consequently, for most physicians, common sense drove medical ingenuity through the senses.²⁸

During the early seventeenth century, English pharmaceutical goods continued to be chosen partially for their scentful proclivities. Thomas Cogan’s *The Haven of Health*

²⁶ Gail Kern Paster, *The Body Embarrassed: Drama and the Disciplines of Shame in Early Modern England* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1993), quotes on 40-41.

²⁷ The gendered body emerged during the Early Modern Era through the ideal of the male form as essentially the model and the female form as the deviation. Consequently, both types of bodies were considered in need of different forms of medical care. In the works of Paracelsus, from the early sixteenth century, these ideals began to emerge through theories of embodiment that defined sex as natural difference. See, especially, the reading of syphilis within, Amy Eisen Cisló, *Paracelsus's Theory of Embodiment: Conception and Gestation in Early Modern Europe* (London: Pcikering and Chatto, 2010), esp. 36-42, and the idea that women were inherently deformed and a threat to the upright normative man that was breathed into life by God, as analyzed within, Marjorie Boyle, *Senses of Touch: Human Dignity and Deformity from Michelangelo to Calvin* (Leiden: Brill, 1998), esp. 18-19.

²⁸ For the differences between pre-modern and Enlightenment science regarding the movement from natural philosophy to instrumentality see, Peter Dear, *Revolutionizing the Sciences: European Knowledge and Its Ambitions, 1500-1700* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2009), esp. 5-9 and 126.

(1636) summarized therapeutic mixtures said to “quicken the braine by smelling thereto.” Spices, herbs, and Cogan’s savories cured illnesses; their potency learned from demonstrated sensory signals. Lavender was therefore, “not onely sweet of smell, and therefore comfortable to the braine, but also is good for the palsie, and all other infirmities of the braine proceeding of cold.”²⁹ The search for botanical and environmental goods was a favored pastime for many pre-Enlightenment Europeans precisely because herbs offered the possibilities of healthfulness, a similar ideal of smelling applied in the architecture of healthful garden spaces on lush English estates.³⁰

As European travelers pushed into the New World they continued to value plants for their deeply sensuous dietary and medical attributes consistently learned from myriad and malleable sensory signatures.³¹ During this Age of Exploration, European adventurers educated in a world applying such sensory awareness encountered a botanical ecosphere of wondrous variation.³² Christopher Columbus found this odoriferous quality of the

²⁹ Thomas Cogan, *The Haven of Health* (London: Anne Griffin, 1636), quotes on 42, 55-56.

³⁰ For the creation of healthful smells in English gardens of the sixteenth century see, Rawcliffe, “Delectable Sights and Fragrant Smelles,” 3-21, the rise of picturesque landscape garden in later centuries analyzed within, Mark Laird, *The Flowering of the Landscape Garden: English Pleasure Grounds 1720-1800* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999), esp. 83-99, 133-140, and discussions of sociality and the levelling public space of gardens within, Peter Borsay, “Pleasure Gardens and Urban Culture,” in *The Pleasure Garden: From Vauxhall to Coney Island*, ed. Jonathan Conlin (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), 49-77, and Hannah Greig, “‘All Together and All Distinct’: Public Sociability and Social Exclusivity in London’s Pleasure Gardens, Ca. 1740-1800,” *Journal of British Studies* 51, 1 (2012): 50-75.

³¹ Works on botany and food from other European nations during the pre-Enlightenment similarly included notes derived from a continued appreciation of all the senses for discovery. David Attenborough, Susan Owens, Martin Clayton, and Rea Alexandratos, *Amazing Rare Things: The Art of Natural History in the Age of Discovery* (New Haven, Ct: Yale University Press, 2007), esp. 75-78; Michael Sidney Tyler-Whittle, *The Plant Hunters: Being an Examination of Collecting with an Account of the Careers & the Methods of a Number of Those Who Have Searched the World for Wild Plants* (New York, NY: Lyons & Burford, 1997), 10-45.

³² “Wonder is...not the sign of revulsion but of ravishment, an ecstatic joy that can be experienced anew even twenty years later through an act of remembrance....wonder precedes, even escapes, moral categories. When we wonder we do not yet know if we love or hate the object at which we are marveling; we do not know if we should embrace or flee from it.” Stephen Greenblatt, *Marvelous Possessions: The Wonder of the New*

Caribbean appealing in his first voyage to the sea in October of 1492.³³ He relayed information of the newfound island “Isabella” stating he “found the smell of the trees and flowers so delicious that it seemed the pleasantest thing in the world.” Columbus, like many Iberian travelers, used comparisons to European knowns to describe his novel olfactory discoveries. In November of 1492, he wrote in his journal of “roots called zanahorias [yams], with a smell like chesnuts.” Farther inland, the explorers found such vibrant nasal awakening pleasurable, encountering “many kinds of trees, herbs, and sweet-smelling flowers.”³⁴

Similarly attempting to assimilate and edenize New World flora through metaphors to Old World goods, Hernando De Soto offered a list of wondrous and unique odoriferous flavors to foods and fruits in North America of the early sixteenth century. He and his men encountered:

great orchards and many trees in them, differing from those of Spaine: there
be figgetrees which beare figges as big as ones fist, yellow within, and of small

World (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2003), quote on 16. For the roots of “wonder” in early modern England see the analysis of classical texts that informed how to experience the marvelous as a respite from reason within, Peter Platt, *Reason Diminished: Shakespeare and the Marvelous* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1997), esp. 36-65.

³³ For a reading of Columbus’ sense of “wonder” through an analysis of the religious ideal of exile and wandering in the desert see, Alexander Nava, *Wonder and Exile in the New World* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2013), esp. 29-71.

³⁴ Christopher Columbus, *The Journal of Christopher Columbus*, ed. and trans. by Clements Markham (London: Printed for the Hakluyt Society, 1893), quotes on 52, 68, and 71. For Columbus’ use of metaphors to European knowns see, Anthony Padgen, “Ius et Factum: Text and Experience in the Writings of Bartolome de Las Casas,” in *New World Encounters*, ed. Stephen Greenblatt (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993), esp. 86-87, and the reading of Columbus’ medieval sources that created a specifically orientalist mentality within, Valerie Flint, *The Imaginative Landscape of Christopher Columbus* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1992), esp. 42-77. This phenomenon, of assimilating New World goods into ideals about similar European items through metaphor, also explored within, Antonello Gerbi, *Nature in the New World: From Christopher Columbus to Gonzalo Fernandez De Oviedo* (Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1985), esp. 17-18.

taste; and other trees which beare a fruit which they call ananes, in making and bignes like to a small pineapple: it is a fruite very sweete in taste: the shel being taken away, the kernel is like a peece of fresh cheese. In the granges abroad in the countrie there are other great pineapples, which grow on low trees, and are like the aloetree: they are of a very good mameis, an smell and exceeding good taste.³⁵

An early historian for many of these travelers to the New World, Pietro Martire d' Anghiera, offered an example of how some of these early adventurers tried to understand these newfound fragrant botanical encounters with optimism toward future trade ventures:

Rodericus and *Franciscus* who departed from *Dariena*...do both affirme...that ...there are divers Ilandes lying westwarde from the Iland of *Dites* and sainte Michaels goulfe, in many of the which are trees engendred and nourisshed which bring foorth the same aromaticall fruites, as doth the region of *Collocutea*, This lande of *Collocutea*, with the regions of *Cochinus* and *Camemorus*, are the chiefe marte places from whence the Portugales have their spices. And hereby do they conjecture that the land where the frutfulnesse of spyce begynneth, shulde not be

³⁵ Hernando De Soto, "Virginia Richly Valued," in *The Voyages of the English Nation to America*, ed. and trans. by Richard Hakluyt, in *Vol. II of Hakluyt's Collection of Voyages (1598-1600)*, ed. Edmund Goldsmith (Edinburgh: E & G Goldsmith, 1889), quote on 550. What "we usually call 'taste', is smell...taste receptors on the tongue detect salt, sweet, bitter, and sour, as well as the taste of MSG (a taste called 'umami'), but not other taste characteristics. Everything else-meatiness, rose and saffron flavors, scorched tastes, yeasty and fermented notes, and all-is processed by scent receptors in the nose." Eugene Anderson, *Everyone Eats: Understanding Food and Culture* (New York: New York University Press, 2005), quote on 70. For the importance of smell in flavorizing see, Alexandra Logue, *The Psychology of Eating and Drinking* (New York: Brunner-Routledge/Taylor & Francis Group, 2004), 45-61, and Donald Pfaff and Carl Pfaffmann, *Taste, Olfaction, and the Central Nervous System: A Festschrift in Honor of Carl Pfaffmann* (New York: Rockefeller University Press, 1985), esp. 307-321.

farre from thense.³⁶

These two captains believed specific Panamanian islands closer to the desired spice islands of Asia due to the aromas of the plants discovered off the coasts of Central America. A similar false attribution of Asia was relayed by the explorer Giovanni Da Verrazano near the Carolinas in 1524, where the color of the ground, the smell of the “laurels” and “cypresses,” and the “medicinal and aromatic drugs” expected therein created hope that the Iberian princes had not faltered in their western adventures to find the lands of Marco Polo’s many tales.³⁷

Many explorers wanted to know the New World in all its wondrous variation, but found that their objective perceptions were clouded through their desire for New World goods and the cultural baggage they carried across the ocean sea. The encounter with the Caribbean laurel offers such a romantic longing for Eden and a symbol of the romantic possession that was implied through taking Caribbean islands in the name of Europe. The letters of Dr. Diego Alvarez Chanca that summarized the second voyage of Columbus demonstrated how explorers used metaphorical manipulations that took the other of New World botanical variety and forced that diversity into the same of Old World cultural knowledge. Chanca summarized an example where explorers, “found a tree, whose leaves had the finest scent of cloves I ever saw, and it was like laurel, except not so large; even

³⁶ Pietro Martire d' Anghiera, *The Decades of the Newe Worlde or West*, trans. Richard Eden (London: Guilhelmi Powell, 1555), quote on 146-147.

³⁷ George Parker Winship, *Sailors Narratives of Voyages along the New England Coast, 1524-1624* (New York: B. Franklin, 1968), 6-11, quote on 6-7. For more examples of the use of the aroma of timber as a means of detecting specific woods for profit in the New World see, Jennifer Anderson, *Mahogany: The Costs of Luxury in Early America* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2012), esp. 23, 98.

so, I think laurel was its species.”³⁸

As many of these aromatic examples portray, the New World had to be made into the same because of its alien and pungent content.³⁹ Smell offers a lens into how metaphors that displaced the other into the same were necessary as the confusing and lacking language for individual smells forced those encountering the new to reach back into their olfactory past to find similarities to define their explorative present. In that vein, the sights, sounds, and smells of Tenochtitlan were deemed uncontrollable by the lost Spanish explorers navigating her many rivers. Thus, the explorer’s perceptions codified the vast otherness through metaphors to the Old World. As David Boruchoff has described in his summary of the rhetorical skills of Bernal Diaz de Castillo:

The novelty of the Aztec capital surpasses the grasp of purely descriptive terminology, for there is nothing within the author's frame of reference that can equal the diversity and perfection that he sees in these new lands, save the magical world of the romances of chivalry. And even here, resemblance is mere analogy. The architecture of Tenochtitlan and its geographic setting bring to mind abstract fantasies: the ‘things and enchantment’.

These metaphors to Old World goods or classical tales were meant to “sanction the action of the conquest through association with commonplace belief.” In early Spanish accounts,

³⁸ For the importance of symbolic imagery and metaphors of desire in New World discovery texts, as informed by the work of Petrarch, see Roland Greene, *Unrequited Conquests: Love and Empire in the Colonial Americas* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999), 1-33, quote on 55.

³⁹ For the reconciliation of New World knowledge with Old World systems of knowing, through a reading of cartography, see, P. J. Marshall and Glyndwr Williams, *The Great Map of Mankind: Perceptions of New Worlds in the Age of Enlightenment* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1982), esp. 1-63.

the New World “takes shape solely in its reproduction of ‘recognizable’ or established patterns present within the Old World.”⁴⁰

Many early English travelers similarly found it difficult to understand fresh olfactory marvels in encounters with American environments. Many of these encounters were coded in the religious language of the era, equating the abundance of the New World with an edenic paradise that would provide products without significant cultivation.⁴¹ Many sailors could smell the pine forests of the coming American land before they visualized the coastline. The earliest English explorers of Virginia to write of their discoveries, Arthur Barlowe and Philip Amadas, encountered novel scents of the New World near “shole water, wher we smelt so sweet, and so strong a smel, as if we had bene in the midst of some delicate garden abounding with all kinde of odoriferous flowers, by which we were assured that the land could not be farre distant.”⁴²

The discovery of the Hudson River was an olfactory experience for those men who encountered such novel experiences that the fauna and flora of the area offered. English chronicler Robert Juet’s journal of the 1609 discovery described, “The lands...were as

⁴⁰ For the making of the hero conquistador, as a conqueror in a lost land overcoming the New World as a religious quest, see, David Boruchoff, “Beyond Utopia and Paradise: Cortés, Bernal Díaz and the Rhetoric of Consecration,” *MLN* 106, 2, Hispanic Issue (Mar., 1991): 330-369, esp. 331-333, quotes on 331-334.

⁴¹ Michael Ziser, *Environmental Practice and Early American Literature* (Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013), esp. 54-55 and 88-95.

⁴² Arthur Barlowe, “The First Voyage Made to the Coasts of America,” in *Early American Writings*, ed. Carla Mulford, Angela Vietto, and Amy Winans (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002), quote on 166; Colin Calloway, *New Worlds for All: Indians, Europeans, and the Remaking of Early America* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997), esp. 8. Similarly, Winthrop’s journal compared the smell of gardens to that of the air off Boston as his ship came into port in June of 1630. John Winthrop, “From Winthrop’s Journal,” in *The Literatures of Colonial America: an Anthology*, ed. Susan Castillo and Ivy Schweitzer (Malden, Mass: Blackwell Publishers, 2001), 250. As well, Jasper Danckaerts described the confusing “sweet smell in the air” when approaching Manhattan in 1679 within, Jasper Danckaerts, *Journal of Jasper Danckaerts, 1679-1680*, edited by Bartlett James and J. Franklin Jameson (New York, Barnes and Noble, 1913), quote on 68.

pleasant with grasse and flowers and goodly trees as ever they had seene, and very sweet smells came from them.”⁴³ Similarly, the English read of Dutch traveler David Pieterz De Vries who noted the odor of Native Americans burning trees as his crew came to the shores of the Middle Colonies during the 1630s. He summarized that the crew:

smelt the land, which gave a sweet perfume, as the wind came from the northwest, which blew off land, and caused these sweet odors. This comes from the Indians setting fire, at this time of year, to the woods and thickets, in order to hunt; and the land is full of sweet-smelling herbs, as sassafras, which has a sweet smell. When the wind blows out of the northwest, and the smoke is driven to sea, it happens that the land is smelt before it is seen.⁴⁴

Numerous early voyages recounted by the promoter Richard Hakluyt for Englishpersons in his *Discourse Concerning Western Planting* (1584) relayed tales similarly fresh with the aromatic bouquets of a marvelous wilderness.⁴⁵ In the compendium, prospective travelers

⁴³ Robert Juet, *The Discovery of the Hudson River* (Boston: Old South Leaflets 94, 1981), quote on 4.

⁴⁴ David Pietersz De Vries, “From the Korte Historiae Ende Journaels Aenreyskeninge, By David Pietersz De Vries, 1630-1633, 1643 (1655),” in *Narratives of Early Pennsylvania, West New Jersey and Delaware, 1630-1707*, ed. Albert Cook Myers (New York: C. Scribner's Sons, 1912), 1-29, quote on 15. For the importance of earlier alchemical and occult traditions in offering a transitional discourse that linked Old World medicinal folklore with local knowledge in the New World to create the New Science see, Ralph Bauer “A New World of Secrets; Occult Philosophy and Local Knowledge in the Sixteenth-Century Atlantic,” in *Science and Empire in the Atlantic World*, ed. James Delbourgo and Nicholas Dew (New York: Routledge, 2008), 99-126, and the reading of rhetorical strategies that were used to justify the use of New World goods within European medical markets within, Antonio Barrera, “Local Herbs, Global Medicines: Commerce, Knowledge, and Commodities in Spanish America,” in *Merchants & Marvels: Commerce, Science and Art in Early Modern Europe*, ed. Pamela Smith and Paula Findlen (New York, NY: Routledge, 2002), 163-181.

⁴⁵ Humphrey Gilbert, “Orders Agreed Upon by the Captaines and Masters, to be Observed by the Fleet of Sir Humphrey Gilbert,” in *The Voyages of the English Nation to America*, ed. Richard Hakluyt, in *Vol. I of Hakluyt's Collection of Voyages (1598-1600)* ed. Edmund Goldsmith (Edinburgh: E & G Goldsmith, 1889),

could read of London traveler Richard Fisher who found the Americas possessed an “abundance of raspes, strawberries...and herbes of good smell...and grasse very ranke.”⁴⁶

French travelers also found the novelty of the New World easily categorized into aromatic types of the European past. As the French sailor and hydrographer François Froger noted during his excursions to Caribbean islands: “Vanilla is a Plant that creeps up along other Trees, in the same manner as Ivy does; its Leaves being of a bright green Colour, thick, long, strait, and pointed at the ends. About seven Years after it is planted, it begins to bear a sort of Husks that are full of an oily Matter, and Seed that is smaller than that of Poppy, which they make use of in that Country, to give a good Scent to Tobacco, and Liquors they have amongst them.”⁴⁷ Similarly applying analogies, Pierre Charlevoix wrote from his post in Quebec during the early eighteenth century, that in Illinois country:

The most remarkable of the fruit-trees, peculiar to this country, are the Pacane, the Acimine, and the Piakimine trees. The Pacane is a nut of the size and shape of a large acorn. The shell of some of them is very thin, while others have it harder and thicker, but the fruit is so much the less on that account. All have a very fine and

328-338.

⁴⁶ Richard Fisher Master Hilles Man of Redriffe, “The Voyage of the Ship called Marigold,” in *The Voyages of the English Nation to America*, ed. Richard Hakluyt, in *Vol. II of Hakluyt’s Collection of Voyages (1598-1600)*, ed. Edmund Goldsmith (Edinburgh: E & G Goldsmith, 1889), quote on 57.

⁴⁷ François Froger, *A Relation of a Voyage Made in the Years 1695, 1696, 1697, on the Coasts of Africa, Streights of Magellan, Brasil, Cayenna, and the Antilles, by a Squadron of French Men of War, Under the Command of M. De Gennes* (London: M. Gillyflower, 1698), quote on 129-130.

delicate taste; the tree rises to a great height; in its wood, bark, smell and shape of its leaves, it seems to me greatly to resemble the filbert trees of Europe.⁴⁸

Numerous early travelers to Barbados similarly used metaphors to describe their botanical and vegetal encounters through their nose and tongue. Sir Henry Colt, who travelled to the island in 1631, summarized the pineapple as “most like a strawberry” in taste. Watermelons tasted “like a small orange, but red within.”⁴⁹ George Waymouth’s voyage to northern New England during the spring of 1605 likewise involved the use of smell as a means to make the confusing environment more manageable through metaphors to European goods. Sailor James Rosier’s account of the voyage included encountering: “wood of sundry sorts, some very great, and all tall, as birch, beech, ash, maple, spruce, cherry tree, yew, oak, very great and good, fir tree, out of which issueth turpentine in so marvelous plenty, and so sweet, as our chirurgeon and others affirmed they never saw so good in England. We pulled off much gum, congealed on the outside of the bark, which smelled like frankincense.” Rosier wrote of tobacco in similar manners, defining the odor of the plant through an analogy to “sweet marjoram” he had smelled in his English past.⁵⁰

In Englishman Samuel Clarke’s *Geographical Description of all the Countries in the Known World* (1657) the use of the lower senses in vegetal exploration was similarly apparent. Clarke wrote from his English home of early travelers to Newfoundland who

⁴⁸ Pierre-François-Xavier de Charlevoix and Louise Phelps Kellogg, *Vol. II of Journal of a Voyage to North America* (Chicago: Caxton Club, 1923), quote on 207.

⁴⁹ Sir Henry Colt, “The Diary of Sir Henry Colt, 1631,” *JBMHS* 21 (November, 1953): 5-12, quotes on 8-9.

⁵⁰ James Rosier, and George Prince, *Narrative of Waymouth's Voyage to the Coast of Maine, in 1605* (Bath, ME: Eastern Times Press, 1860), quotes on 21, 40.

found “damask-roses, with others; beautiful, and delightful both to the eye, and smell.” The bouquet of New Scotland’s flora similarly appealed, where “many safe harbours, and great rivers, having on the sides of them delicate medows, where the earth of itself, bringeth forth roses red, and white, and lillies, having a dainty smell.” Clarke’s discussion of cocoa nuts and the liquid inside them, as akin to “new white-wine,” similarly applied the sensorial pattern that defined New World variety through previous aromatic Old World experiences.⁵¹ When describing Jamaica, the Englishman John Speed recorded, from traveler’s notes, of a similarly fragrant encounter with medicinal herbs, where “*cocao*...abounds also with many other rich plants, precious drugs, aromattick spices, and delicious fruits.”⁵² These numerous examples highlight English travelers continuation of olfactory botany from pre-modern traditions through their continued use of odor to identify healthful foods, aromatic living spaces, and pharmaceutical properties for plants.

Within the American interior, olfactory analyses of the environment continued to inform English perceptions. Ralph Barlowe investigated the Virginia of his late seventeenth century travels using his nose to judge the land’s ability to yield profits. He was consistently struck by the bouquet of the lumber he wished to exploit, which had a “quality and fine fragrance” including “at least fourteen different sweet-smelling timbers.”⁵³ George Alsop described the inland Maryland of his late 1650s explorations in

⁵¹ Samuel Clarke, *A Geographical Description of all the Countries in the Known World* (London: Thomas Newberry, 1657), 183-185, quotes on 185, 198.

⁵² John Speed, *An Epitome of Mr. John Speed's Theatre of the Empire of Great Britain And of His Prospect of the Most Famous Parts of the World* (London: Tho. Basset and Ric. Chiswel, 1676), quote on 235, Speed’s italics.

⁵³ Virginia Louise Snider Eifert, *Tall Trees and Far Horizons: Adventures and Discoveries of Early Botanists in America* (New York: Dodd, Mead, 1965), quote on 2-3. The profit made from the cutting of such timber in early New England was ecologically disastrous. William Cronon, *Changes in the Land: Indians, Colonists, and the Ecology of New England* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1983).

similarly optimistic methods, pointing his senses towards the perfection associated with a paradisiacal new season. Alsop, astonished with his new environment, wrote “that he, who out of curiosity desires to see the landskip of the creation drawn to the life, or to read natures universal herbal without book, may...view Mary-land drest in her green and fragrant mantle of the spring.”⁵⁴ Like these earlier travelers, Pennsylvania founder William Penn found his seashore encounter with early colonial America in 1682 to be a fragrant episode, stating, “while...yet far from the land there was wafted to them as delightful a fragrance as if it came from a freshly blossoming garden.”⁵⁵

To many voyagers the smell of breezes off the American coast, the distant aroma of cedars, elms, and pines, struck European noses with the suggestion of aromatic spices and scented gardens from their homelands.⁵⁶ These many voyagers and amateur botanists applied a previous European sensorium aimed at protecting oneself from unknown

⁵⁴ George Alsop, “A Character of the Province of Maryland,” in *Narratives of Early Maryland, 1633-1684*, ed. Clayton Colman Hall (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1910), quote on 344. This region was not as purely unaltered as Alsop and others may have imagined. Rather, Native American subsistence tactics in the region often responded to climate change through altering the environment in novel ways. James Rice, *Nature and History in the Potomac Country: From Hunter-Gatherers to the Age of Jefferson* (Baltimore, Maryland: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2009), esp. 70-71.

⁵⁵ Penn quoted in, Francis Daniel Pastorius, “Circumstantial Geographical Description of Pennsylvania, By Father Daniel Pastorius, 1700,” in *Narratives of Early Pennsylvania, West New Jersey and Delaware, 1630-1707*, ed. Albert Cook Myers (New York: C. Scribner's Sons, 1912), quote on 379.

⁵⁶ For early modern gardening with a focus on the importance of the pleasure of practice, see Rebecca Bushnell, *Green Desire: Imagining Early Modern English Gardens* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2003), esp. 92-94, the role of the visual spectacle of gardening in, Kenneth Woodbridge, “The Nomenclature of Style in Garden History” in *British and American Gardens in the Eighteenth Century: Eighteen Illustrated Essays on Garden History*, ed. Robert Maccubbin and Peter Martin (Williamsburg, VA: Colonial Williamsburg Foundation, 1984), 19-25, esp. 20-22, James Kornwolf, “The Picturesque in the American Garden before 1800,” *British and American Gardens in the Eighteenth Century: Eighteen Illustrated Essays on Garden History*, ed. Robert Maccubbin and Peter Martin (Williamsburg, VA: Colonial Williamsburg Foundation, 1984), 93-106, the role of the Italian garden as informing theatrical performances of landscape within, John Dixon Hunt, *Garden and Grove: The Italian Renaissance Garden in the English Imagination, 1600-1750* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1996), esp. 42-58, and the sensory changes of perceiving gardens and roses within, Constance Classen, *Worlds of Sense: Exploring the Senses in History and Across Cultures* (London: Routledge, 1993), esp. 15-36.

environments while searching for the enticing greens that God promised to the weary traveler.⁵⁷ In doing, their heightened and resilient sensuality sometimes allowed these voyagers an ability to indulge in the other of American nature and indigenous sensoriums through following scented signatures to understand the proper human provisions that American landscapes conveyed.⁵⁸ The continued use of a medieval olfactory sense, through attempting to assimilate New World botany through metaphors to Old World goods and using the nose to discover healthful spaces and plants, later combined with Native American appreciation of the olfactory to further the botanical sense of smell for numerous Anglo-American botanists.

Enlightened Science and the Decline of Odor

Prior to the start of the Enlightenment, a majority of Europeans, those traveling across the vast Atlantic or those living within metropolitan Europe, followed ancient and medieval systems of smelling the world in aesthetic, protective, and economically optimistic manners.⁵⁹ However, as larger metahistorical narratives portray, the European

⁵⁷ For the links between religious advancement and the growth of Enlightenment knowledge in early America see, Nina Reid-Maroney, *Philadelphia's Enlightenment, 1740-1800: Kingdom of Christ, Empire of Reason* (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 2001).

⁵⁸ For a reading of the material agency of the landscape see the phenomenological analysis of tobacco, potatoes, and apples as altering human choices within, Ziser, *Environmental Practice*, esp. 85-118, and the theoretical idea of agency of the nonhuman world as explored within, Jane Bennett, *Vibrant Matter: A Political Ecology of Things* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2010). See also the discussion of the odor of the aloe tree in the Caribbean, for both profit and medicinal advantages, in, Jean Mocquet and Nathaniel Pullen, *Travels and Voyages into Africa, Asia, and America, the East and West-Indies, Syria, Jerusalem, and the Holy-Land Performed by Mr. John Mocquet...: Divided into Six Books, and Enriched with Sculptures* (London: William Newton...Joseph Shelton, and William Chandler, 1696), esp. 93-98.

⁵⁹ For the importance of medieval era science in the creation of the New Science see, David Lindberg, *The Beginnings of Western Science: The European Scientific Tradition in Philosophical, Religious, and Institutional Context, 600 B.C. to A.D. 1450* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), esp. 366-367, and

sensory world was changing due to medical concerns heightened by the plague, the creation of the printing press, the textual implications of the Reformation, and the civilizing process. These sensory changes decreased the importance of smelling within the Old World in favor of an increased rationality based on the eye.⁶⁰

The wondrous New World, with its demon peoples who frequently smelled of brimstone and mythical creatures within excessive sensory environments imagined in texts of the burgeoning print community of early modern Europe, had to be controlled by an increasingly ordered European consciousness that made curiosity something only for the popular masses and not the reasoning elite. Increasingly, as Lorraine Daston and Katharine Park describe, “the order of nature was the anti-marvelous; the enlightened were the anti-vulgar; and, by a kind of contrapositive analogy, marvels were vulgar.”⁶¹

In European cores, forms of Protestant anxiety and the shock of New World discovery met to create a New Science that perpetuated the rise of the visual gaze as the preeminent arbiter of objective truth.⁶² In Richard Brathwayt’s *Essays upon the Five Senses*

the false periodicity caused by the links between modernity and science analyzed within, Edward Grant, *The Foundations of Modern Science in the Middle Ages: Their Religious, Institutional, and Intellectual Contexts* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), esp. 204-206.

⁶⁰ Walter Ong understood, this “greater visualism” was “given more and more play in the West through the Middle Ages and then is suddenly brought to a new intensity in the fifteenth century.” Walter Ong, “The Shifting Sensorium,” in *The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses*, ed. David Howes (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), quotes on 30. To Marshall McLuhan, the printing press caused this shift translating “man from the magical world...to the neutral visual world.” Marshall McLuhan, *The Gutenberg Galaxy*, esp. 11-19, 120-125. For more on these debates on forms of vision that rose during the Early Modern Era, see, Julie Stone Peters, “Orality, Literacy, and Print Revisited,” in *Time, Memory, and the Verbal Arts: Essays on the Thought of Walter Ong*, ed. Dennis Weeks and Jane Susan Hoogestraat (Selinsgrove: Susquehanna University Press, 1998), 27-61, esp. 31-32, and Barbara Maria Stafford, “Presuming Images and Consuming Words: The Visualization of Knowledge From the Enlightenment to Post-Modernism,” in *Consumption and the World of Goods*, ed. John Brewer and Roy Porter (London; New York: Routledge, 1993), 462-477.

⁶¹ Lorraine Daston and Katharine Park, *Wonders and the Order of Nature, 1150-1750* (New York: Zone Books, 1998), quote on 350.

⁶² For more on Protestant anxiety and the possible truth of vision see, Bruce Smith, *The Key of Green: Passion*

(1635), the sense of smell was therefore portrayed as a gate “by which the world doth besiege us,” a vector through which the “Devill doth tempt us, and the flesh ensnare us.” In Europe, smell was believed especially vulnerable to the outside world of evil and sin: “Some are of opinion, that this peculiar sense, is an occasion of more danger to the body than benefit, in that it receives crude and unwholesome vapours, foggie and corrupt exhalations, being subject to any infection.” Brathwayt considered scent the most unnecessary and pompous of all the senses: “This sense of mine shall not be subjected to outward delicacies: Let the Courtier smell of perfumes, the sleeke-fac’d Lady of her paintings.”⁶³

Part of the modern sense of progress that emerged during the Early Modern Era, according to sociologist Norbert Elias, included a process instituting the “elementary control of body impulses” through mirroring the life of the “courtoisie,” or members of the nobility and their toadies. Accordingly, the sensory world that was “freely expressed,” during the Middle Ages, “aggressively...is banished today in a psychic underground, where it lurks in hidden desires of unconscious conflict, isolated outbursts of dreams.”⁶⁴

and Perception in Renaissance Culture (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009), esp. 153-155.

⁶³ Richard Brathwayt, *Essays Upon the Five Senses* (London: Anne Griffin, 1635 [1620]), 70-74. The senses had been portrayed as gateways since the Roman era, but took on new watchful aspects and sensory discipline during the Reformation. Hristomir Stanev, *Sensory Experience and the Metropolis on the Jacobean Stage (1603-1625)* (Farnham: Ashgate Publishing Ltd., 2014), 18-20.

⁶⁴ European meat consumption decreased under the weight of an upper class that scorned the sight and smell of blood. Banquets became visual and protocolized rather than eliciting previous boisterous sensuality. While in the Middle Ages men devoured meat, usually with their hands, in the Early Modern Era society frowned upon viewing flesh exposed. Correspondingly, the carving of meat during the Middle Ages, an honor given to the head of the table in sight of the whole retinue, moved behind the scenes of a court table becoming, in turn, associated with plebian servants. As also represented in Giovanni Della Casa’s *Galateo* (1558), odors became undesirable for curiosity. Della Casa described dead animals that would previously have been observed with all the senses, but during the civilizing process it became: “far less proper to hold out the stinking thing for the other to smell, as some are wont, who even urge the other to do so, lifting the foul-smelling thing to his nostrils and saying, ‘I should like to know how much that stinks’, when it would be better to say, ‘Because it stinks do not smell it’.” Norbert Elias, *The Civilizing Process* (Oxford: Blackwell,

Such lower sensory reticence was evident in Francis Hawkins' *Youth's Behaviour* (1651). Readers were meticulously guided to destroy "not a flea, or other unclean vermine in the presence of others; and if thou seest any filth on the ground, as some thick spettle, or the like, put thy foot thereon dexterously." Civil axioms such as these became the quintessence of what the lower and middling classes wished to emulate. One would internally restrict themselves to "blow not upon thy meat," nor, "smell not thy meat, and if thou holdest thy nose to it, set it not afterwards before another." This highly detailed decorum denied most limbic delights. The discursive focus on courtesy turned European societies to the prominence of the visual, not the lower sensory pleasures a meal could generate. Thus, banqueters were told to: "drink not...leisurely, nor too hastily, nor as chawing the wine, nor too often. Before and after than thou hast drunk wipe thy lips and breath not with too great a noise then, nor ever, for it is an uncivill thing."⁶⁵ Smelling was increasingly denied at the kitchen table of early modern England as increasingly uncivil. As courtesy author Obadiah Walker guided: "It is against health to *swallow your meat unchewed*, or greedily, or much, or much variety, or delicacies: and against civility to eat after others, to throw your bones or offal upon the floor, to gnaw your bones, to handle dogs...at the table, to observe what and how others eat, to dispraise or praise immoderately the meat, or smell to it; for if you suspect it let it alone, lest you offend others."⁶⁶

These emerging ideals of etiquette involved a shifting to a sensory hierarchy headed

2000 [1939]), quotes on 99-103, 111.

⁶⁵ Francis Hawkins, *Youth's Behaviour, Translated from Various French Sources* (London: W. Wilson, 1651), quotes on 7, 33, 37.

⁶⁶ Obadiah Walker, *Of Education* (Oxon: At the Theater, 1673), quote on 220-222.

by a supreme eye.⁶⁷ The poet Patrick Hannay wrote of such an internalized struggle between the senses in *A Happy Husband* (1619). The lower senses could trick the mind into believing a poor “carpet knight” was worthy of noble attention. The pitiable trickster could use “powders, perfumes...profusely spent, to rectifie his native nasty sent.” But, with a rational soul, and the visual sense in control, the trickster would make no headway; “for sensuall things at *reasons* law must stand.”⁶⁸

Of most significance for botanists during this cultural shift toward a visually dominant sensory hierarchy based in reasoning was the introduction of the scientific method within the natural sciences of the seventeenth century, which moved European scholars away from smelling as a basis for scientific knowledge because of the sense’s supposed innate subjectivity. Under this paradigm shift, many European botanists began to value vegetation more so with their eyes rather than for sweet scents.⁶⁹

The removal of odor in scientific pursuits began during the middle of the seventeenth century. In England, this technique of deodorized examination grew through botanical analysis within the work of John Ray. His *Method of Plants* (1682) and *History of Plants* (1686) used visual systems to categorize plants based on their number of seed-bearing leaves.⁷⁰ Those who followed Ray’s methods often wrote of the strong smells of

⁶⁷ For the role of the state, piety, and the rising transactional power of images see, Sarah Stanbury, *The Visual Object of Desire in Late Medieval England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), esp. 78-79, and the earlier role of the image, power of the state, and the gaze within, Margaret Miles, *Image As Insight: Visual Understanding in Western Christianity and Secular Culture* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1985), esp. 152-153.

⁶⁸ Patrick Hannay, *A Happy Husband or, Directions for a Maide to Choose her Mate As also, a Wives Behaviour towards her Husband after Marriage* (London: Printed for Richard Redmer, 1619), n. pag., Hannay’s italics.

⁶⁹ Parrish, *American Curiosity*, 7-10.

⁷⁰ Mary Gribbin and John Gribbin, *Flower Hunters* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 7-26. Immanuel Kant summarized the post-Enlightenment understanding of the sense of smell succinctly regarding that it,

plants, but increasingly found that odors were clouding the study of objective botany. In this tradition, John Wilson's *A Synopsis of British Plants* (1744) offered most summaries of plant's odors as biting and harsh, and only reliant on comparisons to other smells; odors that were often disconcerting to the botanist hoping to uncover their medical and herbal propensities.⁷¹ These odors, because of the increasing harshness of their nasal burdens to increasingly troubled British noses, were mislaid by Enlightenment scholarship. Later European botanists followed the instruction of Carolus Linnaeus, the famed Swedish naturalist. As historian Virginia Eifert has summarized, "Linnaeus's great mission was not only to find names for all plants, but also to standardize the nomenclature and make each species uniquely and unmistakably distinctive."⁷²

The botanists of Europe increasingly worked in libraries and with plants outside of natural habitats. Usually seeds were shipped and planted in England for analysis. Linnaeus himself worked most consistently with dried samples in his original study of specimens

"does not pay us to cultivate it or to refine it in order to gain enjoyment; this sense can pick up more objects of aversion than of pleasure (especially in crowded places) and, besides, the pleasure coming from the sense of smell cannot be other than fleeting and transitory." Constance Classen, "Other Ways to Wisdom: Learning through the Senses across Cultures," *International Review of Education* 45, 3-4 (1999): 272-277, quote on 272. For more on the anti-olfactory ideals of the Enlightenment through a reading of Kant and the repression of aroma within the nineteenth century bourgeoisie public sphere see, Hannah Arendt and Ronald Beiner, *Lectures on Kant's Political Philosophy* (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1990), esp. 66, and Immanuel Kant, *Analytic of the Beautiful, from the Critique of Judgment* (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1963) [1790]), 28-36.

⁷¹ John Wilson, *A Synopsis of British Plants, in Mr Ray's Method: With Their Characters, Descriptions, Places of Growth, Time of Flowering, and Physical Virtues...; Together with a Botanical Dictionary, Illustrated with Several Figures* (Newcastle upon Tyne: John Gooding, 1744), esp. 97-98, 256, 264.

⁷² Eifert, *Tall Trees and Far Horizons*, quote on 27-28. For a reading of the botanical education of Linnaeus as guiding his analysis of the sexual systems of plant growth see, Gunnar Eriksson, "Linnaeus the Botanist," in *Linnaeus, the Man and His Work*, ed. Tore Frängsmyr, Sten Lindroth, Gunnar Eriksson, and Gunnar Broberg (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983), 63-109, and the influence of gendering plants on discussions of sexuality in early modern botany within, Londa Schiebinger, "Gender and Natural History," in *Cultures of Natural History*, ed. Nicholas Jardine, James Secord, and Emma Spary (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 163-177.

used for his *Systema Naturae* (1735). Within that work, Linnaeus developed his system of classification because he considered previous classifications outdated as they focused on human perspectives most concerned with medical utility or whether the plant was edible. As such, his work aimed to create a system outside the bounds of subsistence and more in form with scientific observation away from human subjectivity.⁷³

Since smell was difficult to articulate between persons, due to inherently subjective noses, applying olfaction to botanical analysis would prove unproductive.⁷⁴ The work of universalizing against this subjective sense of smell had begun earlier, with Ray and the Italian botanist Andrea Cesalpino, who understood the smell of a plant as one of many accidents that afforded no structural or scientific knowledge.⁷⁵ Flowing from these general scientific trends, Linnaeus' classification system shifted even further away from the limbic and olfactory, toward the rational and visual. Resisting indigenous, vernacular, and particular influences, "Linnaeus fancied himself a taxonomical lawgiver bringing order to

⁷³ Andrea Wulf, *The Brother Gardeners: Botany, Empire & the Birth of an Obsession* (New York: Knopf, 2008), 48-55, 148-192. For Linnaeus, scientific methods, and early modern cameralism see, Lisbet Koerner, *Linnaeus: Nature and Nation* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1999), esp. 148-192.

⁷⁴ Linnaeus attempted to create structural categories for analyzing odor. His attempt, in *Amoenitates Academicæ* (1756), created seven odor classes based upon fairness and foulness of odors to different noses. These structures were borrowed in later scientific literature that attempted to classify odors, as in the works of later perfumers. For these essentially failed classification schemes see, Roland Harper, E. C. Bate-Smith, and D. G. Land, *Odour Description and Odour Classification; A Multidisciplinary Examination* (New York: American Elsevier Pub. Co, 1968), esp. 19-21, and modern attempts to create similar categories, although these plans always need non-olfactory language to define olfactory characteristics, within, Tony Curtis, "The Development of Odour Language between Professionals in the Aroma Trades Industry," in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 57-78.

⁷⁵ For the rise of universal language and taxonomies that excluded odor, during an era that shifted from observation to experimentation, especially in the work of Cesalpino, see, M. M. Slaughter, *Universal Languages and Scientific Taxonomy in the Seventeenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982), esp. 44-60, and the role of botanical images, using anatomical traditions, in linking newly generalized arguments with older Greco-Roman theories during the Renaissance within, Sachiko Kusukawa, *Picturing the Book of Nature: Image, Text, and Argument in Sixteenth-Century Human Anatomy and Medical Botany* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011), 98-248, esp. 174-175.

the botanical commonwealth threatened by the ‘invasion’ of ‘vast hordes’ of foreign plants and their ‘barbarous names’.”⁷⁶

For Linnaeus, the physical universe existed in perpetual stasis whereby all that would be created had been in the first six days of biblical ferment, and therefore could be analyzed within an unchanging taxonomic assemblage.⁷⁷ However, as I will suggest later in accordance with the work of Londa Schiebinger, as much as Linnaeus and the metropolitan elite wanted a streamlined science on the ground, “the developing conventions of colonial...relationships rendered Europeans unduly dependent on their guides in the tropics.”⁷⁸

In later decades, natural philosophers took on these traits of universal categorization and instrumentality as opposed to previous scholarly emphasis on vernacular knowledge.⁷⁹ Irish novelist Oliver Goldsmith’s *A History of the Earth and Animated Nature* (1774) offered a significant discourse on the place of smell as a subjective sense in many different societies. Goldsmith, like many of his era, found in this subjectivity a reason to remove smell from botanical and zoological analyses. Because “the sense of smelling gives us very often false intelligence,” humans should not follow the sense to find either sustenance or aesthetic judgement. Goldsmith provided the example of the manchineel apple to justify

⁷⁶ Schiebinger, *Plants and Empire*, esp. 59-68, 75-83, quote on 194.

⁷⁷ Dear, *Revolutionizing the Sciences*, 10-15, 19, 50-54; Emma Spary, “Political, Natural, and Bodily Economies,” in *Cultures of Natural History*, ed. Nicholas Jardine, James Secord, and Emma Spary (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 178-196.

⁷⁸ Schiebinger, *Plants and Empire*, 59-68.

⁷⁹ For the rise of systematic rhetoric to organize botanical knowledge during the Enlightenment see, John Lesch, “Systematics and the Geometrical Spirit,” in *The Quantifying Spirit in the 18th Century*, ed. Tore Frängsmyr, J. L. Heilbron, and Robin Rider (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990), 73-112, esp. 73-74.

his argument by portraying its fragrant odors as desirous, though the poison inside relays nature's olfactory canard.⁸⁰

Through an increasing English tradition of topographical writing during the Enlightenment, literature about the environment in England consistently became more spatial and visual, emerging as a self-conscious discipline with a central gaze.⁸¹ An increasingly linked network of sociable scholars, tied together through the expansion of the Royal Mail, increasingly wrote about the spaces and maps of their English countryside.⁸² English doctor Erasmus Darwin's *Botanic Garden* (1791) represents that these texts became essentially visual, mislaying smelling as a childish and wandering sense. Darwin's praise of the Industrial Revolution and her steam pump as akin to a child's first suckling from their mother's breast, portrayed smelling as "venom" in a "tortured ear." This excessive power of odor was often used by Erasmus as a means to show how progress of the Industrial Revolution must mislay the "sweetness" that leads the "infant train" of the legendary past away from the productions of the future.⁸³

In the late eighteenth century writings of Hampshire native Gilbert White, as analyzed through nature diaries by historian Mary Ellen Balanca, smell and taste were also

⁸⁰ Oliver Goldsmith, *A History of the Earth and Animated Nature: In Eight Volumes* (Dublin: J. Christie, 1813 [1774]), esp. 130-133, quote on 131. Also, see a similar account of manchineel as aromatic, but life-threatening, within, Felix Christian Spoeri, "A Swiss Medical Doctor's Description of Barbados in 1661: The Account of Felix Christian Spoeri," edited and translated by Alexander Gunkel and Jerome Handler, *JBMHS* 33, 1 (May, 1969): 3-13, esp. 10-11.

⁸¹ For the history of description in Britain of the eighteenth century see the changing role of vision in the rise of narratives about landscapes and interior spaces within, Cynthia Wall, *The Prose of Things: Transformations of Description in the Eighteenth Century* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006), esp. 70-95.

⁸² For the increasing role of topographical writing see, Elizabeth Yale, *Sociable Knowledge: Natural History and the Nation in Early Modern Britain* (Baltimore: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016), esp. 21-54.

⁸³ Erasmus Darwin, *The Botanic Garden: A Poem in Two Parts* (New York: Swords, 1798 [1791]), 16-18, 76-78, 84-88, quotes on 17, 77.

subsumed beneath a similar desire for visual analysis of the English environment.⁸⁴ White's *The Natural History and Antiquities of Selborne* (1789) portrayed nature as a visual spectacle to be analyzed and objectified: "On every side as the observer turned his eyes might he behold a continual succession of fresh flakes falling into his sight, and twinkling like stars as they turned their sides towards the sun."⁸⁵ Because vision was the most replicable of sensory observations, European botanists desired analyses of their homelands through that sense above all others. Odor was considered irrational and increasingly linked to the formation of disease throughout the eighteenth century, further pushing the positive detections of the sense of smell lower on scientific hierarchies as all scents were sought out in deeper corners of European homes and hovels.⁸⁶

The Enlightenment changed Old World European minds towards attempting to order the New World through the discursive language of human supremacy over nature. In botany, this took the form of Linnaean, literate, and optical study in the libraries and universities of the major European cultural centers. For the European scientific community, botany was increasingly expensive and exclusive. The equipment necessary to start a valuable collection of plants involved various metallic tools and, above all, the need for an erudite education. A plant hunter would need to keep a noted diary and detailed maps of where plants were found. As such, European botany became a literary tradition away from nature, above the natural world objectifying the environment below.⁸⁷

⁸⁴ Mary Ellen Bellanca, *Daybooks of Discovery: Nature Diaries in Britain, 1770-1870* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2007), esp. 58-63.

⁸⁵ Gilbert White, *The Natural History of Selborne* (London: J.M. Dent and Co., 1901 [1789]), quote on 219.

⁸⁶ Alain Corbin, *The Foul and the Fragrant: Odor and the French Social Imagination* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1986), 16-19.

⁸⁷ Tyler-Whittle, *The Plant Hunters*, 109-118.

As historian Judith Magee summarized, the “desire for order that came to characterize Enlightenment thought, and that is seen today as one of its lasting achievements, was epitomized by the Linnaean classification system, which was applied to all living things. By the end of the century, taxonomy and systematics began to dominate over the other trend in the study of natural history, that of observation and description.”⁸⁸ Keith Thomas similarly concluded that: “the latter seventeenth century was...a decisive period in the separation of popular from learned views of the natural world.” The later “detached natural scene” involved observer and the visually observed rather than interaction with the environment. The “man-centered symbolism” of earlier redolent botanical and faunal study gave way to a study focused upon the visually replicable.⁸⁹

Thus, in Scottish scholar James Lee’s *Introduction to Botany* (1760), which collected and translated much of Linnaeus’ later work for English scientists, scholars were instructed to disregard the smells of plants as they bore no scientific weight. As Lee wrote:

considering the structure of the parts of fructification, the principal objects to be attended to are, 1. The *number* of each part. 2. Its *figure*. 3. Its *proportion*; by which is to be understood its height in respect to the rest; and, 4. Its *situation* which will include also its *insertion* and connections, as to any other differences, such as a difference in the size, color, smell, or taste, it is not safe to allow any weight to

⁸⁸ Judith Magee, *The Art and Science of William Bartram* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State Univ. Press, 2007), 1-4, quote on 4.

⁸⁹ Keith Thomas, *Man and the Natural World: Changing Attitudes in England, 1500-1800* (London: Allen Lane, 1983), 67-73, 80-99, quotes on 67, 80. For the role of increasingly efficient uses of a mathematical language of civic virtue to cure the growing distance between signifier and signified during the Early Modern Era see, Timothy Reiss, *Knowledge, Discovery, and Imagination in Early Modern Europe: The Rise of Aesthetic Rationalism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), esp. 19-69.

them, as they might lead us to make distinctions, not justifiable by the true principles of the science.⁹⁰

The projects of imperial science did not use the popular and vernacular knowledge of Europe when attempting to control the wildness of the New World through botanical structuralism. The rise of the “disciplinary eye” was meant to speak “truth to nature” rather than receive truth from nature.⁹¹

Odorphillic Divergence in Anglo-American Botanical Study

Prior to the late seventeenth century, most English colonial botanists in America followed previous English patterns of odorphillic botanical identifications. In Europe, enthusiasm for Linnaean ideals and Enlightenment influences led to an increase in optical scientific knowledge regarding plants and their classifications. After these optic-based scientific methods took firm hold of classification systems in England, colonials in the Americas, even with knowledge of such a tide of rationalization, created a divergent scientific panorama by staying vitally in tune with their noses. In eighteenth century North America, practicing within a sensory replete environment became the focus of the majority

⁹⁰ James Lee, *An Introduction to Botany: Containing an Explanation of the Theory of that Science* (London: J. F. Rivington, L. Davis, B. White and Son, S. Crowder, C. Dilly, G. G. J. and J. Robinson, T. Cadell, and R. Baldwin, 1788 [1760]), quote on 22, Lee’s italics.

⁹¹ Lorraine Daston and Peter Galison, *Objectivity* (New York: Zone Books, 2007), esp. 48-59. For critiques of the belief that vision became the ultimate arbiter of truth during the Enlightenment see the lack of consensus within optical theory analyzed within, Stuart Clark, *Vanities of the Eye: Vision in Early Modern European Culture* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), esp. 343-345, and the multiple ways of viewing artwork within, Peter De Bolla, *The Education of the Eye: Painting, Landscape, and Architecture in Eighteenth-Century Britain* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2003), esp. 146-148.

of the botanical community, both amateur and professional.⁹²

Many American botanists followed pre-Enlightenment traditions of botany that articulated the use of signatures provided from the environment. In this tradition, they continued to use complete sensorial analysis from Old World teachings and from a common community understanding of the value of odor for protective, aesthetic, and herbal considerations. This added to an indigenous influence that Marcy Norton has described as the “material grammar” of consuming the environment for botanical goals, which shifted European perceptions within the New World to include Native American aesthetics.⁹³

The differences between the professional lives of botanists Peter Collinson and Pennsylvanian John Bartram exemplified the variances between these European and American modes of study. Collinson, a Quaker merchant usually working out of his London storerooms, read of botany, collected and forwarded samples, and spoke of botanical theories in the elite scientific circles of his capitol. Bartram lived botanically, as a farmer and scientist he integrated himself into the very environments that Collinson and the London elite wished to study. Those English studies, with ocular reason as their method, differed from the study of Bartram and the colonial naturalists who, integrated with nature, relied on analyses from all of the senses.⁹⁴

The Royal Society in England saw such sensory scholarship and aesthetic

⁹² Parrish, *American Curiosity*, esp. 15-17, 54-60, 128-135, 140-150.

⁹³ Marcy Norton, *Sacred Gifts, Profane Pleasures: A History of Tobacco and Chocolate in the Atlantic World* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2008), esp. 7-9.

⁹⁴ Edmund Berkeley and Dorothy Smith Berkeley, *The Life and Travels of John Bartram from Lake Ontario to the River St. John* (Tallahassee: University Presses of Florida, 1982), esp. 1-49. For the difficulty in relaying seeds and botanical information from Bartram to Collinson see, Christoph Irmscher, *The Poetics of Natural History: From John Bartram to William James* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1999), 13-55, esp. 20-27.

indulgence as ignorantly creole, considering the writing Britons sent from America to England poorly written and methodologically weak. Perceiving American botany as such, these elites believed expertise in natural studies, in the refined Western European sense, could not continue in the New World. Those botanists writing from perceived creolized methodology did not follow European trends of resolved rationality because the American botanical community found it could not study as within the libraries and universities of Europe.⁹⁵

The fear of what Cotton Mather defined as “Criolian Degeneracy” plagued much of the scientific discourse of the Atlantic World. Many colonials, attempting to construct science out of the American wilderness, faced the rhetorical wrath of those who viewed the English home and mind as superior to the sensory experiences of the American wilderness. It was often believed that forms of “Indianization” would change skin color, body function, and perceptions of the environment.⁹⁶ Though the Royal Society outlined a differing pattern for the analysis of the natural world, one that would exist outside of nature as to not be hampered by nature, the emerging American naturalist would take the first step of a different empirical process, that of embedded sensory experience, to study the natural world in diverse American settings.⁹⁷

These Anglo-Americans had to study within the wilderness via the totality of the sensory input available. The Bartram’s, Lawson, Beverley, and others analyzed the New World with the olfactory methodology of the past, not against the botanical classifications

⁹⁵ Parrish, *American Curiosity*, esp. 17, 143.

⁹⁶ Parrish, *American Curiosity*, 89-102.

⁹⁷ Parrish, *American Curiosity*, 109-112, quote on 109.

of Europe, but alongside such ideals, within perceived ambrosial American natural settings. Rather than understand themselves as inferior, these scholars spoke back to the European botanical core with pride in their North American knowledge. These botanists found their own scientific methods through what Pamela Smith has deemed the “artisanal epistemology” that involved *ad hoc* sensory knowledge, which became replicable structures within later forms of science.⁹⁸ These Anglo-Americans believed in their colonial periphery as a well-informed core of its own due to nearness to indigenous knowledge of botanical goods.⁹⁹

European transition into these indigenous controlled areas was often one of irrational sensory barrage. The founding of Concord in early Massachusetts by Captain Simon Willard involved such a bombarding scentful encounter with indigenous lands where “the sweet Ferne, whose scent is very strong” caused intense feelings of faintness.¹⁰⁰ According to historian James Merrell, to a colonial visitor of North America: “Indian country looked different, from its bark houses and unkempt fields to its denizens’ dress and tattoos...sounded different, from its jangling beads and soft guttural voices to its wailing mourners and warriors whoops. It smelled different, the air thick with the scent of curing deerskins and tobacco smoke. It even tasted different, with its dishes of dog and bear, its array of corn soups and stews.”¹⁰¹

⁹⁸ Pamela Smith, *The Body of the Artisan: Art and Experience in the Scientific Revolution* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004), esp. 18-20.

⁹⁹ For more on the importance of indigenous knowledge for botanical study on colonial peripheries see, Richard Grove, *Green Imperialism: Colonial Expansion, Tropical Island Edens, and the Origins of Environmentalism, 1600-1860* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), esp. 30-55.

¹⁰⁰ Sir Ferdinando Gorges, *America Painted to the Life* (London: N. Brook, 1658-1659), quote on 81-82.

¹⁰¹ James Merrell, *Into the American Woods* (New York: Norton, 1999), quote on 60.

As summarized in chapter three, Natives Americans consistently brought their own heightened ways of smelling to encounters with these confused and multisensory besieged Europeans. Native Americans did not aim to manage smelling through social constructions. Rather, various groups frequently elevated the sense as their religiosity depended on it, much indigenous pre-contact spiritualism belied any need for Western sensory controls, and New World civilizations relied on the scentful sensorium for subsistence. Many Europeans found this Native American sensory hierarchy both alluring and barraging. In the recording of Native American oral histories of the Delaware and Mohican nations by John Heckwelder in the 1770s, reference was made to the oral tradition of the contact era, specifically when the Dutch reached Manhattan in 1609. Heckwelder described the tradition of the Native Americans of the area passing around a gourd or cup of aromatic substances that was smelled, rather than imbibed, by the chiefs of the individual nations. The peace ceremony, which culminated in the consumption of large amounts of liquor, was often attributed as important to the foundational term for the island of Manhattan, from the root place name of the ceremony, *Mannahattanink*.¹⁰²

European appreciation of Native American smelling often focused on the spiritual, medical, and subsistence nature of aromatic wilderness life.¹⁰³ The most quoted of the observers of Native American ways of smelling during the colonial period was Englishman Thomas Morton who stated, in *New English Canaan* (1637), in probable recitation of a narrative of the French historian Marc Lescarbot, “that in the sence of smelling, they have

¹⁰² John Heckwelder, “Meeting the Dutch at Manhattan,” in *The World Turned Upside Down: Indian Voices from Early America*, ed. Colin Calloway (Boston: St. Martin’s Press, 1994), 35–38.

¹⁰³ Hoffer, *Sensory Worlds*, 33-37, quote on 35.

very great perfection...so perfect in the use of that sence, that they will distinguish between a Spaniard and a Frenchman by the scent of the hand onely.”¹⁰⁴

The work of John Bartram embodied a contradictive science to the London metropole because his analyses were altered through his understanding of nearness to these Native American sensory acuities that many Anglo-Americans increasingly lauded. For Bartram, the steep rise in the number of new species to analyze escalated the importance of classifications that relied on multi-sensory considerations. Bartram summarized his sensory centered analytical methodology when noting that: “the scientific gaze is...quite penetrating, exploring strata and internal features not visible to more superficial looks, sometimes engaging the senses of touch, taste, and smell in common with visual perception.”¹⁰⁵

The farmer Bartram perused the models of Linnaeus. The Swedish naturalist’s essentially visual sexual arrangements of plants, those relying on plants reproductive capacities, roused Bartram’s inquiries on floral anatomy. Nevertheless, Bartram maintained patterns of aromatic classification waning within European botanical studies. He described botany with the odor inclusive sensorium, asserting that plants: “have their particular excellencies, some for the beauty of their flowers, others their sweet scent...Some [are] admired for their odd appearance and many that offend the taste, smell, and sight, too, [are] of virtue in phisic.” Like the elder Bartram in early Pennsylvania, most

¹⁰⁴ Thomas Morton, *New English Canaan* (London: Charles Greene, 1637), quote on 48; Marc Lescarbot, *Nova Francia* (London: George Bishop, 1609), 187-188. Describing the Natives of early Maryland the Englishman Andrew White also lauded sensory endowments that “excell in smell and taste.” Andrew White, “A Brief Relation of the Voyage unto Maryland,” in *Narratives of Early Maryland, 1633-1684*, ed. Clayton Colman Hall (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1910), quote on 44.

¹⁰⁵ Parrish, *American Curiosity*, 200-205; Tyler-Whittle, *The Plant Hunters*, 52-57; Thomas Slaughter, *The Natures of John and William Bartram* (New York: Knopf. 1996), quote on 69.

American naturalists of the eighteenth century used medical texts and herbals as their botanical guides. These colonists, using motives derived from these earlier volumes, felt that integrative analysis with comprehensive sensory data provided preeminent value for their fellow settlers.¹⁰⁶

Part of the cause of such retained olfactory practices was the novel odor of indigenous American vegetables, herbs, spices, and fruits.¹⁰⁷ Colonials initially accepted for sustenance, later denied as other, and then incorporated these indigenous foods into their diets. Once planted in the New World, English fare was preferred when it was in abundance as Englishmen and women feared indigenous foods for the modifying influences that the English believed could alter their perceived superior body and mind perfected with English diet and climate. Such suspicion of American provisions initially grew from difficulty in digestion. As Englishmen and women's stomachs struggled to process maize and tomatoes they concocted a conviction that American plants would malevolently alter the English body, essentially by overheating the calm, cool-weather fixed, English temper.¹⁰⁸

¹⁰⁶ Slaughter, *Natures of John and William Bartram*, quote on 65, Slaughter's brackets; Eifert, *Tall Trees and Far Horizons*, 5-7.

¹⁰⁷ For the continuation of Renaissance magic and alchemy in Anglo-America see the undercurrent of natural astrology within the Enlightenment explored within, Herbert Leventhal, *In the Shadow of the Enlightenment: Occultism and Renaissance Science in Eighteenth Century America* (New York: New York University Press, 1976), esp. 13-65, and the reading of John Winthrop Jr.'s often scented alchemical projects as akin to his social, religious, and political ideals that differed from earlier Puritans through changing "alchemical culture" within, Walter William Woodward, *Prospero's America: John Winthrop, Jr., Alchemy, and the Creation of New England Culture, 1606-1676* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture by the University of North Carolina Press, 2010), esp. 43-74, 111-112, quote on 51.

¹⁰⁸ Joyce Chaplin, *Subject Matter: Technology, the Body, and Science on the Anglo-American Frontier, 1500-1676* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2001), 148-151; Michael LaCombe, *Political Gastronomy: Food and Authority in the English Atlantic World* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012), esp. 60-62. The Puritans of early New England tied their new land using metaphor to their home back in England and to the chaos they were entering. By using both "garden" and "wilderness" to describe their newfound home, the Puritans straddled the line between existing in a natural world under the natural order of the Natives, and the cultural world under the rule of rational order of Western civilization. Though

The American environment altered the English body, thereafter defining each new tempestuous aspect of the American experience as an encounter to be overcome and conquered. Each encounter on the frontier exposes how early Americans understood their landscape through a sensory and medical geography of power and place.¹⁰⁹ Malcolm Gaskill has summarized the formative role of such anxiety and danger on the early boundary: “Colonists became accustomed to danger-electrical storms, extreme temperatures, predators, and vermin-and acquired local knowledge. They learned how to kill wolves with fishhooks wrapped in fat, and how to render bear grease to make ointment. The testicles of a muskrat gave linen ‘a grateful smell’.”¹¹⁰

Englishmen and women on the borderline of settlement, where most botanists performed their travels, were forced to encounter these travails and received sustenance from numerous Native American dishes, which led to relatively instantaneous rites of sensory imitation. Sensory integration from this American diet came from an abundance of “wild meats, fish, fowl, insects, seeds, berries, nuts, oils, roots, and vegetables.” Native nations like the Iroquois specifically gathered numerous varieties of plants: “milkweed stems, immature flower clusters, marigold, waterleaf, yellow dock, pigweed, lambsquarters, mustard, purslane, dandelion, burdock, nettle, skunk cabbage, leek, wild

the Puritans attempted to harden themselves away from the environment, diet, and waters, many of their greatest writers lamented the fact that they would be changed by their newfound land. Martha Finch, “‘Civilized’ Bodies and the ‘Savage’ Environment of Early New Plymouth,” in *A Centre of Wonders: The Body in Early America*, ed. Janet Moore Lindman and Michele Lise Tarter (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 2001), 43-59, quote on 54.

¹⁰⁹ For the experience of airs and smells on the frontier to understand disease environments and how to tame miasmas see, Conevery Bolton Valencius, *The Health of the Country: How American Settlers Understood Themselves and Their Land* (New York: Basic Books, 2003), esp. 116-126.

¹¹⁰ For the effect of the American environment on the making of Americans out of Englishmen during the seventeenth century see, Malcolm Gaskill, *Between Two Worlds: How the English Became Americans* (New York: Basic Books, 2014), quote on 123.

garlic, sensitive fern, and others.”¹¹¹

Fermenting caused various indigenous drinks to emit an unpleasant odor, but many indigenous nations only found this made the libations more appealing. The *sofki*, a drink served among the Creek during most meals had a sharp, bitter, taste and a strong beer like odor. Similarly, many Native Americans preferred to eat putrefied food. After allowing it to spoil, both the Mandan and the Iroquois indulged in this sampling. The preference was probably discovered accidentally, but it became ubiquitous.¹¹² Though the three sisters of the Native American diet, corn, beans, and squash, provided most of the protein and calories for Native American life, the complementary food for Native Americans was supplemented with more various goods than the diet of Englishpersons in Europe who usually had their calories covered by a few staple foodstuffs, especially cereals and domesticated meats.¹¹³

The botanically inclined Britons began to know themselves through the nasal passages of the other, turning Englishpersons into colonials due to these repetitious and reflexive sensory events on the frontier. The earliest of English settlers had feared using New World tomatoes in their diet as the malodorous smell the plant let off led them to

¹¹¹ Donna Gabaccia, *We Are What We Eat: Ethnic Food and the Making of Americans* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1998), 14-15, quote on 15.

¹¹² Linda Murray Berzok, *American Indian Food* (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 2005), quote on 115.

¹¹³ For European dietary blandness during the Early Modern Era see, C. Anne Wilson, *Food and Drink in Britain* (Chicago: Academy Chicago, 1991 [1973]), 91-99, 120-126, 215-222, Malcolm Thick, “Root Crops and the Feeding of London’s Poor in the Late Sixteenth and Early Seventeenth Centuries,” in *English Rural Society, 1500-1800: Essays in Honour of Joan Thirsk*, ed. Joan Thirsk, John Chartres, and David Hey (Cambridge [England]: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 279-296, Christopher Dyer, “Did the Peasants Really Starve in Medieval England,” in *Food and Eating in Medieval Europe*, ed. Martha Carlin and Joel Thomas Rosenthal (London: Hambledon Press, 1998), 53-72, esp. 66-70, Mary Anne Caton and Joan Thirsk, *Foibles and Fricassees: Food in Shakespeare's England* (Washington, D.C.: Folger Shakespeare Library, 1999), 13-14, 35, and the symbolic construction of food within European cosmology within, Piero Camporesi, *The Magic Harvest: Food, Folklore, and Society* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1993), 51-77.

believe it harmful. By the eighteenth century, the idea of tomatoes being baneful faded and the fruit burrowed its way into the American diet newly odorized. As Sandra Oliver summarized, as with stenchful tomatoes, the “love lies bleeding,” or *Amaranthus Caudatus*, a flowering annual, “though purely an ornamental curiosity in England...was a primary foodstuff” in early North America. Though indigenous nations in the Americas used the plant as a boiled salad, in England the plant was valued solely for its visual beauty.¹¹⁴

The New World was a confusing and often dangerous place for those who did not understand botany with the full sensorium. The edenic magnetism of the manchineel apple in Barbados offers a striking example, across many centuries, of a product that consistently hurt those Europeans who were unwilling to analyze the environment using New World systems. While serving in the Napoleonic Wars on the island of Barbados, British Lieutenant Henry Sherwood relayed a tale:

As I rode along I plucked a leaf & put it into my mouth which was observed by a negro walking on the road who cried out ‘Throw away Throw away Manchineel’. I immediately threw the leaf away but I found a burning in my lips which soon became sore & blistered. The man advised me to wash my lips in sea water which in some degree relieved me. The Manchineel is known as a violent poison & no grass will grow under it. It is said that land crabs living under it are poisonous.¹¹⁵

¹¹⁴ Sandra Oliver, *Food in Colonial and Federal America* (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 2005), 16-26, 61-62; Lawrence Griffith and Barbara Temple Lombardi, *Flowers and Herbs of Early America* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2008), quote on 89-90.

¹¹⁵ Henry Sherwood, “The Journal of Lt. Henry Sherwood, 53rd Foot Describing his Service in the West Indies during the War against Napoleon,” *JBMHS* 58 (2014): 173-179, quote on 174; Larry Dale Gragg, *Englishmen Transplanted: The English Colonization of Barbados, 1627-1660* (Oxford: Oxford

Living amongst these extremes and threats of the Western Hemisphere created the necessity to define the world through retained olfactory sensibilities well into the Revolutionary Era. In the Barbados journal of English diarist Nicholas Cresswell from his travels on the island in September, 1774, the ever feared and poisonous manchineel was considered to have “the smell and fragrance of an English apple, but small...one apple is sufficient to kill 20 people.”¹¹⁶ Over time, the colonists of Barbados, and in other regions of the New World, had to rely on Native American and African informants to avoid such violent New World goods. Those informants taught them of the smells of plants as important signifiers of dietary malevolence.

Operating under some of these new dietary choices that included the intensely olfactory, the traveler and botanist William Bartram described a Native American beef dish served to him near the Alachua Savannah in 1775:

The banquet succeeds; the ribs and choicest fat pieces of the bullocks, excellently well barbecued, are brought into the apartment of the public square, constructed and appointed for feasting; bowls and kettles of stewed flesh and broth are brought in for the next course, and with it a very singular dish, the traders call it tripe soup; it is made of the belly or paunch of the beef, not overcleansed of its contents, cut and minsed pretty fine, and then made into a thin soup, seasoned well with salt and

University Press, 2003), esp. 17-22.

¹¹⁶ Nicholas Cresswell, “Journal of Nicholas Cresswell, September, 1774,” BDA X/10/10.

aromatic herbs.¹¹⁷

Bartram, though on a British imperial mission to provide botanical information to London based Dr. John Fothergill, found himself in a nature under transition that he could not succinctly describe without the use of his entire sensory hierarchy. Fothergill was a wealthy Quaker banker in London. His instructions to Bartram included a desire to have the American botanist follow Linnaean rules. He preferred to have visual outlines of the “parts of fructification and where these parts are very diminutive to have them drawn a little magnified.”¹¹⁸

However, as historian Kathryn Braund has summarized, William’s raptness in nature kept his men in constant search for foodstuffs to which he kept his lower senses keen. He ate mostly venison as his protein while roaming in the backcountry, as well as sampling upon turkey and bear. William described such indulgent dietary bliss when writing: “supremely blessed were our hours at this time! Plenty of delicious and healthful food, our stomachs keen, with contented minds; under no control, but what reason and ordinate passions dictated, far removed from the seats of strife!” The influence of European fruit plants on the ecology of the American southeast had begun in force, but Bartram pushed into the deep limits where indigenous herbs and fruits maintained their hold on the environment. To taste and smell the new foods drove William to the edges of his boundary

¹¹⁷ Waselkov and Braund, *William Bartram on the Southeastern Indians*, quote on 53. For the importance of food, banquets, and the politics of communicating symbolic meanings for diets, at such meals, see the reading of Anglo-Indian encounters prior to 1660 within, LaCombe, *Political Gastronomy*, esp. 90-134.

¹¹⁸ Simon Schaffer, “Visions of Empire; Afterword,” in *Visions of Empire: Voyages, Botany, and Representations of Nature*, ed. David Philip Miller and Peter Hanns Reill (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), quotes on 346-347.

travels. In Florida, dishes offered by Native Americans included gar, turtle, manatee, and rattlesnake served alongside numerous plants, fruits, and vegetables.¹¹⁹

In part, due to this increased odor awareness in their new diets, English natural researchers found sensory fascination in America with the application of lower sensory traditions throughout the North American countryside of the eighteenth century. For Beverley, the American forests of his *History and Present State of Virginia* (1705) were defined using such signals towards a paradise of efficacious pungency. He described plants in his Virginia home, including “the fine tulip-bearing laurel tree, which has the pleasantest smell in the world...It delights much in gravelly branches of chrystal streams, and perfumes the very woods with its odor.” The generally aromatic climate swayed Beverley as well: “here all their senses are entertained with an endless succession of native pleasures...men's taste is regaled with the most delicious fruits, which, without art, they have in great variety and perfection...then their smell is refreshed with an eternal fragrancy of flowers and sweets, with which nature perfumes and adorns the woods and branches almost the whole year round.”¹²⁰ Many Anglo-American botanists, even those attempting to emulate English gentility, could not help but understand the link between the indigenous world and pleasures that informed their sensory hierarchies to differ from Old World visualized methodology. This attribution was part of a larger project among many creole elites who began to define American rusticity as a virtue and not a curse of living on the

¹¹⁹ Kathryn Holland Braund, “William Bartram’s Gustatory Tour,” in *Fields of Vision: Essays on the Travels of William Bartram*, ed. Kathryn Braund and Charlotte Porter (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2010), 33-41, quote on 35.

¹²⁰ Robert Beverley, *The History of Virginia in Four Parts* (Richmond: J. W. Randolph, 1855 [1705]), quotes on 111, 242.

colonial periphery.¹²¹

Like Beverley and Bartram, Lawson in Carolina and William Byrd along the dividing line used immersion into the lower senses to analyze the environment of their new homelands. When being presented to a Santee-Catawba tribal chief, Lawson meticulously observed sensory customs. Such a record portrays how Native American sensory aesthetics, regarding botany, informed Anglo-American sensibilities. When texts were sent to the Old World by European travelers, many of these Native American encounters were removed by explorers and botanists of the imperial powers who wished to portray themselves as heroes discovering a New World through their own wits. The trope of the hero botanist made sure its protagonist, the botanist, could not be informed by inferior Native American knowledge. However, in the Western Hemisphere, because Anglo-American botanists created a creole botanical community with less desire to impress European printers with their tales of botanical expertise, Native Americans could appear as informants and ecological guides. Lawson noted: “some that attend the king presented me with an odoriferous balsamic root, of a fragrant smell and taste.” Similarly, he discussed the aroma of evergreen, jasmine, the olfactory nature of the woods in general; its berries and fruits, all with regard to the sense each provided his acute nose. Specifically, Lawson’s odorophilia was exemplified in his comparative summary of cedars, “white cedar, so called because it nearly approaches the other cedar in smell, bark and leaf.”¹²²

Like Lawson had in Carolina to the south, Byrd, a patriarchal planter who knew the

¹²¹ For Beverley and creole emulations and resistance through claiming their own rusticity see, Trevor Burnard, *Creole Gentlemen: The Maryland Elite, 1691-1776* (New York: Routledge, 2002), 208-211.

¹²² John Lawson. *The History of Carolina* (Raleigh: Strother & Marcom, 1860 [1714]), quote on 41.

value of detecting productive farmland, summarized the disputed lands of his 1728 topographical survey with scentful tact, writing how the area he explored included “noxious vapours” that “rise perpetually from that vast extent of mire and nastiness.”¹²³ Planters in the low country of colonial South Carolina also searched for the “scent of better land” to plant their profitable plantations.¹²⁴ Similarly, Mark Catesby, the famed ornithological printer who often included botanical specimens and prints in his works, applied forms of earlier metaphors that linked New World goods to Old World olfactory traditions. As Andrea Wulf described:

Catesby’s cargo had consisted of dried specimens for the herbaria of English collectors, and a trunk full of drawings he had made. Plant-lovers were entranced by the pictures of magnolia buds which unfolded into enormous, flawless white petals against a background of shiny green leaves, much like silk applique on velvet curtains. They were gripped by Catesby’s depiction of the lilac blossom of American wisteria, which seemed to tumble from the branches like bunches of grapes, or by callicarpa, a highly unusual plant which wore its garish purple berries around its branches like bead bracelets. The aromatic bark of Carolina allspice, Catesby tantalizingly promised, was like cinnamon, while the scent of the copper

¹²³ William Byrd II, “Secret History of the Dividing Line,” in *Colonial American Travel Narratives*, ed. Wendy Martin (New York: Penguin Books, 1994), quote on 104-105.

¹²⁴ Stephen Hornsby, *British Atlantic, American Frontier: Spaces of Power in Early Modern British America* (Hanover NH: University Press of New England, 2005), quote on 112. For the role of slavery in the study of the natural environment, which worked to link analysis of environments in the West Indies with the colonial South see, Christopher Iannini, *Fatal Revolutions: Natural History, West Indian Slavery, and the Routes of American Literature* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2012), esp. 177-218.

red petals would fill the air with the perfume of pineapples.¹²⁵

The integration of the native culinary element into European and British botanical traditions altered the very function of the English body and worked to institute new forms of American sensory identity.¹²⁶

Partly due to his numerous scentful meals and encounters with Native Americans on the southern frontier, the peak of natural botanical analysis using olfactory data in colonial America came within the voluminous writings of the later botanist and explorer William Bartram. During his journeys through Native territories on the eve of the American Revolution, William spent time pondering the scents of his wilderness enchantments. Whether he was examining the putridity of water, the fragrance of newly sprouting orange trees in ancient towns, or the fishy taste and smell of hunted island birds, he kept a lower sensory awareness to every encounter he made. Where vision lacked the capability to define for him the full semblance of his experience, he relied on smelling. Thus, Bartram summarized a flower he studied in Creek country sensuously with a nose towards previous odor signatures, Native American uses, and European knowns: the flower appeared “to be a species of *Collinsonia*; it is diuretic and carminative, and esteemed a powerful febrifuge,

¹²⁵ Wulf, *The Brother Gardeners*, quote on 27. For a narrative of the life of Catesby, whom Bartram tried to partly model his methods after see, George Frederick Frick and Raymond Phineas Stearns, *Mark Catesby: the Colonial Audubon* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1961), Mark Laird, “From Callicarpa to Catalpa: The Impact of Mark Catesby’s Plant Introductions on English Gardens of the Eighteenth Century,” in *Empire’s Nature: Mark Catesby’s New World Vision*, ed. Amy Meyers, Margaret Beck Pritchard (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1998), esp. 213, and David Brigham, “Mark Catesby and the Patronage of Natural History in the First Half of the Eighteenth Century,” in *Empire’s Nature: Mark Catesby’s New World Vision*, ed. Amy Meyers and Margaret Beck Pritchard (Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture by the University of North Carolina Press, 1998), esp. 101-103.

¹²⁶ James McWilliams, *A Revolution in Eating: How the Quest for Food Shaped America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), 1-17, quote on 7.

and infusion of its tops is ordinarily drunk at breakfast, and is of an exceedingly pleasant taste and flavor: when in flower...it possesses a lively aromatic sense, partaking of lemon and aniseed.” At one point in his travels in the southeast, an instance when Bartram feared capture from nearby Choctaws, he remained overcome with exuberance from the floral paradise of *Illiciaceae* exclaiming: “I am come within the atmosphere of the *Illicium* groves, how reanimating is the fragrance! Every part of this plant above ground possesses an aromatic scent...as warm and vivific as cloves or mace.”¹²⁷ The tension of encounter with possible Native American enemies exaggerated the role of odor as the proximate sense without equal for the indulgent Bartram.¹²⁸

For many Anglo-Americans there was increasingly less need for cameralist and mercantilist tendencies that created the desire for the taxonomic botanical gaze. Unlike Linnaeus and other European collectors who wished to universalize and commodify American botany, Anglo-American botanists lived within the wondrous New World. It was their existence as religious and spiritual settlers within American environments, rather than solely as collectors or profiteers, which made their botany less visually defined, more transgressive regarding specific aromatic goods, and increasingly vernacular.¹²⁹

¹²⁷ William Bartram, *Travels and Other Writings: Travels Through North and South Carolina, Georgia, East and West Florida; Travels in Georgia and Florida, 1773-74: A Report to Dr. John Fothergill; Miscellaneous Writings* (New York: Literary Classics of the United States, 1996) examples on 134, 176, 212, quotes on 334, 356. For William Bartram’s associations with the divergence in forms of natural science see, Stephanie Volmer, “William Bartram and the Forms of Natural History,” in *Fields of Vision: Essays on the Travels of William Bartram*, ed. Kathryn Holland Braund and Charlotte Porter (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2010), 71-80.

¹²⁸ For Bartram and the Southeastern Indian fur trade regarding self-interested relations with Native Americans see, Robert Paulett, *An Empire of Small Places: Mapping the Southeastern Anglo-Indian Trade, 1732-1795* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2012), esp. 126-129, 151-165.

¹²⁹ For cameralism, botanical travels, and religion in the making of structural taxonomies see, Staffan Muller Willie, “Walnuts at Hudson’s Bay, Coral Reefs in Gotland: The Colonialism of Linnaean Botany,” in *Colonial Botany: Science, Commerce, and Politics in the Early Modern World*, ed. Londa Schiebinger and Claudia Swan (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005), 34-48, Fredrik Albritton Jonsson,

Sensory wonderment for many Europeans in the New World pushed reliance beyond religion to a dependence on botanical metaphors to the metropolitan homelands.¹³⁰ Botanical discoverers, amateur and professional, tried to assimilate their discoveries into Old World systems of knowledge. The increasingly common failures of these metaphorical descriptions meant to corral such sensory bombardment from a confusing New World of differentiated sentiency led to an increased use of nasal passages beginning to be considered unnecessary within European scientific discourse. The consistent connections within the horizontal Republic of Letters should have informed American botanists to replicate English scientific models. However, travelers, farmers, botanists, and propagandists continued older knowledge patterns using an inclusive sensorium representing sensory wonder within the American environment well into the late eighteenth century.

Thus, the varied tones of imperial power were made mute on lone botanical ventures into western American environs. These eighteenth century divergences from the English core, caused by nearness to indigenous Americans and their environmental expertise in the New World, show how analyzing a small scientific community can hint at a larger breakdown in English sensory control over their myriad colonial subjects. As Simon Schaffer summarized, “Bartram...used the language of primitive nobility,” infusing

"Climate Change and the Retreat of the Atlantic: The Cameralist Context of Pehr Kalm's Voyage to North America, 1748—51," *WMQ* 72, 1 (2015): 99-126, Lisbet Koerner, *Linnaeus: Nature and Nation* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1999), and the reading of British seed gathering in Florida explored within, Robert Olwell, "Seeds of Empire: Florida, Kew, and the British Imperial Meridian in the 1760s," in *The Creation of the British Atlantic World*, ed. Elizabeth Mancke and Carole Shammas (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2005), 263-282.

¹³⁰ For the importance of manipulations of religious rhetoric in botanical practice in early America see the religious justifications for allowing the growth of weeds as representing religious toleration within, James McWilliams, "Worshipping Weeds: The Parable of the Tares, the Rhetoric of Ecology, and the Origins of Agrarian Exceptionalism in Early America," *Environmental History* 16, 2 (2011): 290-311, esp. 305-308.

his botany with a “peculiar political point by linking it with a forceful pantheism which contrasted the natural systems of indigenous life, self-moving and intelligent, with the artificial systems of corrupt society.”¹³¹ English imperial goals of instituting early forms of the gaze could not be fully instituted upon the minds of Anglo-American colonists.

This lacking ability to transfer English sensory identity on Anglo-Americans led, in part, to an American creole consciousness that found in a heightened appreciation for odors a voice to critique English senses of gentlemanly superiority.¹³² Akin to accessing the performativity of Native American orality to speak back to English politicians with a creole rhetoric, American botanists selected rhetoric that included a Native American olfactory to speak aromatic truth to English power.¹³³

An Americanized Approach to the Great Divide of the Senses

The Polish philosopher Zygmunt Bauman once questioned:

Was it an accident that modernity declared war on smells? Scents had no room in

¹³¹ Schaffer, “Visions of Empire: Afterword,” quote on 347. For the study of politics in the history of the senses see the goals explored within, Sophia Rosenfeld, “The Social Life of the Senses: A New Approach to Eighteenth Century Politics and Public Life,” in *Volume IV of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen and Anne Vila (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 21-40.

¹³² For the role of science in the mechanist rhetoric applied to political thought of the Founding Fathers see, I. Bernard Cohen, *Science and the Founding Fathers: Science in the Political Thought of Jefferson, Franklin, Adams and Madison* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1995), esp. 46-49, 83-86.

¹³³ For a similar use of the lower senses as resistance to the rise of the gaze during the era of a coming Revolution see, Richard Clay, “Smells, Bells and Touch: Iconoclasm in Paris during the French Revolution,” *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 35, 4 (2012): 521-533, and the resistance to the gaze, using the sense of smell as a gendered identity, from an earlier era within, Cora Fox, “Isabella Whitney’s Nosegay and the Smell of Women’s Writing,” *Senses and Society* 5, 1 (2010): 131-143.

the shiny temple of perfect order modernity set out to erect. And no wonder, as scents are the most obstreperous, irregular, defiantly ungovernable of all impressions. They emerge all on their own, and by doing so they betray what one would rather keep secret: that not everything is under control and not all is ever likely to be. Odours do not respect borderlines and do not fear border guards; they travel freely between spaces which – if order is to be preserved – have to be kept strictly apart.¹³⁴

European cultures experienced a shift from an odorophilic past to the deodorizing tendencies of the Early Modern Era. The decline of odor began with the plague, which instituted ideas of healthful deodorizing, the printing press, which created an optic world above the magical sensorium of the past, and through the civilizing process, which altered the function the sensory hierarchy for both the court elite and the lower classes who emulated emerging elite and bourgeois sensory aesthetics.¹³⁵ When confronted with the history of European contact with the American environment the narrative of European refutation of odor is weakened by numerous narrative inconsistencies. Specific examination of botanical study within colonial outposts in North America offered one deviation from this common sensory narrative.

The attempted manipulation of the environment, carried out from the core of Kew

¹³⁴ Zygmunt Bauman, “The Sweet Scent of Decomposition,” in *Forget Baudrillard?* ed. Chris Rojek and Bryan Turner (London: Routledge, 1993), quote on 24. From 1700 onward, “With the starvation of the senses went a general starvation of the mind: mere literacy, the ability to read signs, shop notices, newspapers, took the place of that general and sensory and motor training that went with the handicraft and agricultural industries.” Lewis Mumford, *Technics and Civilization* (New York NY: Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1934), quote on 181.

¹³⁵ Classen, *Worlds of Sense*, 15-36.

Gardens for the English, was part of a larger colonialist process, “of preparing the rest of the world to become properly human”¹³⁶ However, as hard as the political maneuvers at Kew Gardens worked, the universalizing project was essentially doomed to fail because local knowledge was consistently overlooked in favor of universalizing procedures. As Richard Drayton explained, the English project “failed to make adequate sense of the local value or meaning of the things which it transacted.”¹³⁷

Mark Jenner recently argued that scholars of the senses should bridge the divide between descriptions of the natural sensory environment and human constructions of sensory worlds. When clearing this gulf, “we will cease to describe or even to reverse the deodorization of the past, but delineate instead the totality of bodily techniques in various historical moments.”¹³⁸ When accessing how the early American contact zone was made manageable through the use of the senses one must understand that differing value systems, or sensory zones as Michael Taussig deemed them, merged and modified sensoriums with syncretic and creole techniques used to apply new sensory skills. As these different sensory zones encountered each other, cultures clashed and combined middle grounds of sensory perception whereby the frontier acted as the creator of sensory identity due to the implication of increased levels of environmental pressure.¹³⁹

¹³⁶ Richard Drayton, *Nature's Government: Science, Imperial Britain, and the 'Improvement' of the World* (New Haven: Yale, 2000), quote on 268.

¹³⁷ Drayton, *Nature's Government*, 272. For similar failures to incorporate local knowledge in the New World, see the reading of early experiments with quinine that failed due to the lack of local input from the Andes within, Matthew James Crawford, "An Empire's Extract: Chemical Manipulations of Cinchona Bark in the Eighteenth-Century Spanish Atlantic World," *Osiris* 29, 1 (2014): 215-229.

¹³⁸ Mark Jenner, "Follow Your Nose? Smell, Smelling, and Their Histories," *The American Historical Review* 116, 2 (2011): esp. 351.

¹³⁹ Michael Taussig, *Mimesis and Alterity: A Particular History of the Senses* (New York: Routledge, 1993). For sensory skills see, Mark Jenner, "Tasting Lichfield, Touching China: Sir John Floyers' Senses," *The Historical Journal* 53, 3 (2010): 647-670.

Native Americans, if scholars are willing to expand their definition of literacy, were literate in multi-sensory manners, which helped indigenous populations resist “subversion and containment” while aiding their European neighbors.¹⁴⁰ Arjun Appadurai has argued for an extension of literacy, essentially a visual skill, to a literacy of “mediascapes” to expose multisensory forms of indigenous knowledge acquisition.¹⁴¹ Accordingly, Heidi Bohaker highlights the need “of building comprehensive media inventories and engaging in regional and culture-or community-specific case studies to both historical studies and large theoretical conversations about communication practices in the Americas.” Notations on pipe bowls and calumets, lengths of stiches in Native American quilts, and familial markings on trees and totems at trail markers were all forms of literacy meant to spread knowledge through different forms of sensation than simply the read word. Bohaker also hopes expanding beyond vision to the multisensory skills used by Native Americans to “read” these sources would elaborate on Native America from a perspective that does not include the veil of European hegemony.¹⁴²

Using this methodological outline, this chapter delineated how Native American understandings of the olfactory were read upon the natural world through Anglo-American noses that indulged in the other during moments of bodily stress through applying newly syncretic sensory skills. Through this indulgence, Anglo-American botanists increasingly

¹⁴⁰ Andrew Newman, “Early Americanist Grammatology,” in *Colonial Mediascapes: Sensory Worlds of the Early Americas*, ed. Matt Cohen and Jeffrey Glover (Lincoln: Nebraska, 2014), 84-85. For “subversion and containment” see, Stephen Greenblatt, *Shakespearean Negotiations: The Circulation of Social Energy in Renaissance England* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), 21-65.

¹⁴¹ Arjun Appadurai, *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization* (Minneapolis: Univ. of Minnesota Press, 1996), 35-38.

¹⁴² Heidi Bohaker, “Indigenous Histories and Archival Media in the Early Modern Great Lakes,” in *Colonial Mediascapes: Sensory Worlds of the Early Americas*, ed. Matt Cohen and Jeffrey Glover (Lincoln: Nebraska, 2014), esp. 106-110, quote on 109.

differed from European botanists, understood their difference, and created a specifically American form of vernacular and creolized botanical knowledge.

Prior to the Early Modern Era, Englishmen and women valued the sense of smell beyond early modern English sentient constructions. Most pre-Enlightenment daily practices valued information gathered from the sense of smell. Europeans of this era found no shame in using feces as emollients placed on the skin. The odor created a distinctive allurements similar to the use of animal musk for male perfume. To return one to youthful beauty, maleficent odors became prized aromas of juvenescence.¹⁴³

Before the Enlightenment, fecopoetics were part of a spiritual enchiridion that allowed for pungency to mark both good and bad forms of material and morality.¹⁴⁴ Odors emerging from bodily functions (breaking wind, defecation, urination), which must have been commonplace in the Middle Ages as books on deportment spoke specifically of ways of dealing with someone performing such acts, faded towards the dimness of the outhouse. Throughout the Early Modern Era, maxims on these functions lost their place in civility manuals as people changed their natural functions to discreet bathroom use in an effort to civilize. Such alterations changed numerous aspects of daily life as integral as these civil manners, religious practice, data collection, sexuality, and diet.¹⁴⁵ English peoples devalorized this sense of smell in favor of a monotonous and predictive sentiency; the odors of sexuality, food, religion, and science all streamlined into a maintained lulling of the lower senses that pervaded in much of Western Europe from the mid-seventeenth century

¹⁴³ Dominique Laporte, *History of Shit* (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 2000), 106-109.

¹⁴⁴ Susan Signe Morrison, *Excrement in the Late Middle Ages: Sacred Filth and Chaucer's Fecopoetics* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), esp. 3-6.

¹⁴⁵ Elias, *Civilizing Process*, 62.

onward. European sensory identity therefore resisted localized sensory knowledge and Native American influences in favor of structural taxonomies, which purposefully removed unwanted knowledge.

However, in America, Anglo-American botanists continued to apply odor within their analyses of the environment. In part, this was due to the wondrous novelty of the American landscape, the odoriferous wafts caused by its gardens, the aromatic food brought from its indigenous crops, and personal choices aimed at dividing a new botanical community from English roots. Intermingling with nature, eighteenth century colonial botanists did not fully adapt to European ocular rationalization. This botanical community upheld traditions of sensory signals, detected from the frontier and informed by indigenous environmental allies, beyond that considered properly scientific within Europe.¹⁴⁶

For a few centuries of the American encounter, botanically inclined colonials experienced the olfactory of the frontier in this more natural state, elevated from its position on the sensory hierarchy of early modern Europe. Through initial nasal othering and environmental scent classification, these Western snouts unfastened into a scentful native wilderness. Once opened, noses entering indigenous communities found an aromatic world of increased sexuality, dissimilar diets, and multifarious sentient divergence. Ideas dying in Europe regarding the odor of sanctity, olfactory vivacity in diet, and scents of the erotic all rebirthed for Europeans on these American borderlands. Native frames of reference were so discordant from Western ideas of progressive perception that they helped to

¹⁴⁶ For more on the creolization of pharmaceutical goods in early North America see the reading of African influences on medical traditions within, Mary Galvin, "Decoctions for Carolinians: The Creation of a Creole Medicine Chest in Colonial South Carolina," in *Creolization in the Americas*, ed. David Buisseret and Steven Reinhardt (College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 2000), 63-98.

refashion the very function of the creolized colonial body.¹⁴⁷

The sensory transformation that occurred on the frontier helped to create the American as an existential, sensual, and rough person compared to a “refined” European opponent. The American Revolution was not specifically fought over these sensory classifications, but did involve the changed ideals of a populace entranced by the frontiersman who experienced the world in a more barraged, less manipulated, and environmentally aware manner. There was something irrational about the lower senses that Western civilization meant to master. While in Europe olfactory life declined, in America, especially on the borderlands, the European colonial changed into a sensory guerilla, experiencing and dominating the frontier with his renewed limbic nasal sense.

Many authors have described how Linnaean systems helped later American writers of the Early Republic assert a “literature of place” whereby colonials could describe natural fauna and flora as part of a larger system.¹⁴⁸ As Robert Lawson-Peebles described, the early nationalizing project displaced the romance of earlier natural philosophy and created a new scientific terrain whereupon: “Revolutionary intellectuals asserted a landscape constructed out of materials adapted from the Old World they all despised. When those materials proved to be inadequate to describe the New World they retreated. The retreat took them

¹⁴⁷ For the importance of reading Native Americans back into the imperial histories of European expansion see, Jace Weaver, *The Red Atlantic: American Indigenes and the Making of the Modern World, 1000-1927* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2014), and Daniel Richter, *Before the Revolution: America's Ancient Pasts* (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2011).

¹⁴⁸ For the role of Linnaean systems in the making of discourses of natural philosophy in early America see, Pamela Regis, *Describing Early America: Bartram, Jefferson, Crèvecoeur, and the Rhetoric of Natural History* (DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 1992), quote on 5, and the role of a growing scientific community that displaced forms of populist natural philosophy in the early nineteenth century in, Andrew Lewis, *A Democracy of Facts: Natural History in the Early Republic* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011), esp. 5-7, 49, 71.

between the confining walls of a library or behind a 'perspective glass'.”¹⁴⁹ Part of this retreat from the wilderness involved what historian Jean O’ Brien has called the “firsting” and “lasting” rhetorical tools that removed Native American expertise and assistance from nineteenth century local narratives of the New England foundation. Where colonial Anglo-American botanists found few flaws with using Native American knowledge to speak truth to English power, the American nation building experiment needed to shed the Native American to assert the exceptional identity of religiously inspired founding upon the footpaths of a new Eden.¹⁵⁰ However, for many prior to the Revolution it was divergence from universalizing language and sensations that marked American identity apart from that of the British. Only after the Revolution, in the great experiment of nation-building, did it become more productive to define the world through universal terms as a means to move west and conquer through structural botanical study.¹⁵¹

¹⁴⁹ Robert Lawson-Peebles, *Landscape and Written Expression in Revolutionary America: The World Turned Upside Down* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), quote on 133. For more on sensory distrust and the desire for multiple ways of seeing to represent the varied voices of early American politics see, Wendy Bellion, *Citizen Spectator: Art, Illusion, and Visual Perception in Early National America* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2011), esp. 6-8. Spanish botanical expansion also included modes of universalization that asserted a desire for objective vision in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Daniela Bleichmar, *Visible Empire: Botanical Expeditions and Visual Culture in the Hispanic Enlightenment* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2012), esp. 64-66, 164-168. British expansion also continued outward using methods they honed in their own core botanical gardens during the eighteenth century. Pulling in the necessities of empires, through botanical goods like rubber, cinchona, and agave, these scientists made it “more profitable...to put overseas investment capital into venture.” Lucile Brockway, *Science and Colonial Expansion: The Role of the British Royal Botanic Gardens* (New York: Academic Press, 1979), quote on 32.

¹⁵⁰ Jean O’ Brien, *Firsting and Lasting: Writing Indians Out of Existence in New England* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010); Jill Lepore, *The Name of War: King Philip's War and the Origins of American Identity* (New York: Knopf, 1998); Kariann Akemi Yokota, *Unbecoming British: How Revolutionary America Became a Postcolonial Nation* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), esp. 62-114; Gaile McGregor, *The Noble Savage in the New World Garden: Notes Toward a Syntactics of Place* (Toronto, Ont.: University of Toronto Press, 1988), esp. 177-204.

¹⁵¹ For the idea that middle class refinement emerged after the Revolution as a part of the nationalizing project through sociability and urban identities see, Richard Bushman, *The Refinement of America: Persons, Houses, Cities* (New York: Knopf, 1992), esp. 238-262, and the reading of middle class cleanliness as driving the emerging industry for soap within the Antebellum Era in, Richard Bushman and Claudia Bushman, "The Early History of Cleanliness in America," *Journal of American History* 74, 4 (1988): 1231-1238.

Chapter 5

Verschiebung Africanus:

Ethnographic Wonder, Freudian Dream-Work, and
Atlantic Era Olfactory Discourse

A peculiar bit of Haitian folklore tells the story of spiritualism, slavery, and the sense of smell in the context of an African child's dream-world. The tale summarizes the racial perspectives of a dark-skinned slave boy named Tabou whose mother, who had also birthed a free and light-skinned brother with her master, finds her son solemnly eating peppered fish on the banks of a Hispaniola stream. The child tells his mother that he feels increasingly distanced from his brethren, as many diasporic tales explicate in binaries based on twins and/or siblings. Tabou protests, "I'm so black, and I don't like it a bit. I'd like to turn white like my half-brother." When asked why Tabou hates his blackness, he proclaims because everyone knows "the blacker folks are, the stronger they smell."¹

To find a cure for this scented blackness, which his mother tells him comes from working on their master's plantation in the hot tropical sun and is not a trait inherent to race, the boy enlists a mermaid and other voodoo spirits to rid himself of the darkness on his skin and the odor associated to that hue.² Through different trials, the boy achieves a dream-like state whereby he becomes a French nobleman and finds himself controlling a full retinue of his own African slaves. Nevertheless, particular traits remain within Tabou while at his Parisian court; both his love of peppered fish and his odor continue to persist.³

¹ Francois Turenne de Pres, "Tabou: A Haitian Folk Tale," *Phylon (1940-1956)* 7, 4 (1946): 365-372, quotes on 365. For the importance of brotherly binaries in tales of the African diaspora see, Marilyn Houlberg, "Magique Marasa: The Ritual Cosmos of the Twins and other Sacred Children," in *Fragments of Bone: Neo-African Religions in a New World*, ed. Patrick Bellegarde-Smith (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2005), 13-31, and the reading of Congo traditions of *bisimbi*, or the plural spirits related to specific localities within, Wyatt MacGaffey, "Twins, Simbi Spirits and Lwas in Kongo and Haiti," in *Central Africans and Cultural Transformations in the American Diaspora*, ed. Linda Heywood (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 211-226.

² Turenne de Pres, "Tabou," 365-372. For the importance of mermaid spirits for assistance with economic, sexual, and gender issues within the African diaspora see, Henry John Drewal, "Introduction: Charting the Voyage," in *Sacred Waters: Arts for Mami Wata and Other Divinities in Africa and the Diaspora*, ed. Henry John Drewal (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2008), 1-18.

³ Turenne de Pres, "Tabou," 365-372. For the political and social language of race, and whether racial identity should be retained as resistance in the post-colonial era, see the discussion of Franz Fanon's work in, Paul

The perseverance of this tale within Haitian folklore of the twentieth century represents the importance of discourse on African odors within the history of slavery in the Atlantic littoral. How did this fictional slave child come to believe that blackness included an inherited biological odor? What mechanisms in the Atlantic World of slavery, race, gender, and class reified an ideal that whiteness was pure and deodorized while blackness contained a pungency that signified inferiority through the act of smelling?⁴ How did slaves resist this clearly socially constructed false consciousness and racial phenomenon?⁵

One moral of the folktale, and there are many in the winding and byzantine story, is that there is not an inherent smell to African bodies, and Tabou should have just washed in the river when in Haiti, because even as a French nobleman he would smell of the odors of the body if he did not bathe, and of the stinking fish which he could never refuse. However, more than a morality and childcare tale for twentieth century Haitian families, the folklore represents a deep cultural *bricolage* of smelling that informed many Atlantic slave societies.⁶

The linked tautology of race and smell, which tied concerns over being unable to

Gilroy, *Postcolonial Melancholia* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), esp. 53-57, and the possible use of race as an identity for resistance in, Frantz Fanon, *Black Skin, White Masks* (New York: Grove Press, 1967).

⁴ For the importance of deconstructing race as a social construct see, Evelyn Brooks Higginbotham, "African-American Women's History and the Metalanguage of Race," *Signs* 17, 2 (1993): 251-274.

⁵ For a later era of "false consciousness" and the shifting of proletariat "attention" away from exploited labor through sensory alterations within capitalist modernity see, Jonathan Crary, *Suspensions of Perception: Attention, Spectacle, and Modern Culture* (Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press, 1999), esp. 5-10, and the reading of sensory controls of cleanliness through the nineteenth century bourgeoisie public sphere within, Alain Corbin, *Time, Desire, and Horror: Towards a History of the Senses* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1995), esp. 13-38.

⁶ Turenne de Pres, "Tabou," 365-372. For a general understanding of the social construction of race, a shift from "nation" and Greek ideas of *gens*, or lineage inheritance, to race as a marker of biological inferiority/superiority, see, Kwame Anthony Appiah, "Race," in *Critical Terms for Literary Study*, ed. Frank Lentricchia and Thomas McLaughlin (Chicago: University of Chicago, 1995): 274-287.

remove the darkness of black hue, even with furious washing, to Tabou's engrained belief that one could never wash away the odor of blackness, was formulated diachronically through the advent of racism during the Early Modern Era.⁷ Firstly, the tale is deeply reminiscent of a scene from *Titus Andronicus* (1594) wherein the Moorish and evil antagonist Aaron summarized a Greek anecdote through the syntax of the Shakespearean pen: "For all the water in the ocean,/ Can never turn the swans blacke legs to white,/ Although shee lave them howrely in the flood."⁸ Secondly, Tabou's tale stems from the aforementioned Greek story of the fabulist Aesop, due to the use of the proverb in Jeremiah 13:23: "Can the Ethiopian change his skin, or the leopard his spots?"⁹ Lastly, Tabou's belief in the odor of African skin resulted from the rise of European racism, which began during the sixteenth century to introduce categories summarizing Africans as a defined race with a demarcated pungency.¹⁰

⁷ For general contexts of skin color during the pre-racial era, and historiography in the study of early modern England see, Francesca Royster, "The 'End of Race' and the Future of Early Modern Cultural Studies," *Shakespeare Studies* 26 (1998): 59-70, Lara Bovilsky, *Barbarous Play: Race on the English Renaissance Stage* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008), esp. 22-23, and Dympna Callaghan, "What's at Stake in Representing Race?" *Shakespeare Studies* 26 (1998): 21-27.

⁸ William Shakespeare, *The Most Lamentable Romaine Tragedie of Titus Andronicus* (London: John Danter, 1594), quote on 26-27. For an introduction to the racial complexity of *Titus Andronicus* see, Francesca Royster, "White-Limed Walls: Whiteness and Gothic Extremism in Shakespeare's *Titus Andronicus*," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 51, 4 (2000): 432-455.

⁹ *The Holy Bible Containing the Old Testament and the New* (Cambridge: Roger Daniel, 1648), quote on xviii; Aesop, and Samuel Croxall. *Fables of Aesop and Others: Translated into English...By Samuel Croxall...The Eleventh Edition, Carefully Revised, and Improved* (London: W. Strahan, 1778), esp. 292-293. For historiography on the use of the proverb see, Jean Michel Massing, "From Greek Proverb to Soap Advert: Washing the Ethiopian," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 58 (1995): 180-201.

¹⁰ For a similar understanding of the false accusations of white planters regarding slave's scents see the testimony of former Alabama slave Henry Baker, who asserted the lack of material means for cleaning as the reason for slave odors, as collected in, John Blassingame, *Slave Testimony: Two Centuries of Letters, Speeches, Interviews, and Autobiographies* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1977), esp. 668-669.

The construction of African odor as a biological inheritance was built upon the dream-work of early modern English popular literature, which formulated racial stereotypes and flat characters for mass consumption.¹¹ For the understanding of “dream-work” this chapter applies Sigmund Freud’s concept of *verschiebung*, or displacement, whereby the mind, as in a dream, codes a conception of reality that is not the true concept in order to displace sexual anxiety of encountering the erotic other, be it human, animal or material. The idea is akin to the notion of the “primal scene” when a child first encounters the sexuality of his or her parents and can be so shocked by the copulation to darkly distort the act into a symbolic other of inexact representation. Simply, subjective stereotypes are made within the social organism of the body politic through the displacement of the real to the imaginary, which then becomes symbolic and domineering.¹²

The shifting of English culture away from ethnographical objectivity of African

¹¹ For the use of odor and pollution within languages of control see, Jack Lennon, *Pollution and Religion in Ancient Rome* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014), esp. 167-187, Iain Fenlon, “Piazza San Marco: Theatre of the Senses, Market Place of the World,” in *Religion and the Senses in Early Modern Europe*, ed. Wietse de Boer and Christine Göttler (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 331-361, Rob Meens, “‘A Relic of Superstition’: Bodily Impurity and the Church from Gregory the Great to the Twelfth Century Decretists,” in *Purity and Holiness: The Heritage of Leviticus*, ed. Marcel Poorthuis and Joshua Schwartz (Leiden: Brill, 2000), 281-293, Susan Morrison, *Excrement in the Late Middle Ages: Sacred Filth and Chaucer’s Fecopoetics* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), esp. 3-6, Warwick Anderson, “Excremental Colonialism: Public Health and the Poetics of Pollution,” *Critical Inquiry* 21, 3 (1995): 640-669, epidemics in Australia analyzed in, Alison Bashford, *Imperial Hygiene: A Critical History of Colonialism, Nationalism and Public Health* (Houndsmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire; New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), Warwick Anderson, *Colonial Pathologies: American Tropical Medicine, Race, and Hygiene in the Philippines* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2006), Mark Bradley, “Approaches to Pollution and Propriety,” in *Rome, Pollution, and Propriety: Dirt, Disease, and Hygiene in the Eternal City from Antiquity to Modernity*, ed. Mark Bradley and Kenneth Stow (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 11-40, Jonathan Gil Harris, “Usurers of Color: The Taint of Jewish Transnationality in Mercantilist Literature and the Merchant of Venice,” in *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, ed. Helen Ostovich, Mary Silcox, and Graham Roebuck (Newark: Delaware University Press, 2008), 124-138, and Mary Douglas, *Purity and Danger: An Analysis of Concepts of Pollution and Taboo* (New York: Praeger, 1966).

¹² For a summary of this concept see, Jacques Lacan, *Ecrits: A Selection* (New York: Norton, 1977), esp. 158-162, the application of Lacanian theory of the self-fashioning of the self through the ambiguity of language to *Othello* within, Stephen Greenblatt, *Renaissance Self-Fashioning: From More to Shakespeare* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980), esp. 222-254, and Arthur Little, “‘An Essence That’s Not Seen’: The Primal Scene of Racism in *Othello*,” *Shakespeare Quarterly* 44, 3 (1993): 304-324, esp. 304-308.

bodies, as shown through analysis of the work of Leo Africanus, to race as a social and literary construct denoting African inferiority, partially through the synecdoche of racial odors as biology, represents such an imaginary undertaking in order to construct Albion as a deodorized community.¹³ This inward looking nature of English Renaissance literature increasingly focused on the world to be discovered, and through literary fancy informed a growing push for expansionism that took on different sensory bounds and rhetoric. That push was informed not by explorers and bureaucrats with a plan for empire, but by poets and playwrights curing a previously vast Anglo-Saxon inferiority complex, which defined the New World through otherworldly fantasies of occupation that included the necessity of portraying the savage other as requiring the cleanliness of civilization.¹⁴

To convey the scents of exotic locales, peoples, and cultures, English writers tied racial blackness to odor in stage performances, within children's folklore, and in sermons preached from the Reformation lectern.¹⁵ This imagined association of pungency to fabricated African bodies, a socially constructed olfactory sensation meant to support ideas of European purity and deodorization while displacing English bodies from any association to stench, can be traced to when race was first created as an increasingly stable notion

¹³ For imagined communities in the making of later European states through popular literature see, Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London: Verso, 1991), esp. 37-46.

¹⁴ Jeffrey Knapp, *An Empire Nowhere: England, America, and Literature from Utopia to The Tempest* (Berkeley, Calif: University of California Press, 1994), esp. 135-136. For an introduction to these ideas, regarding the rise of the Moor on the English stage as an evil character that was also quite malleable and transitory see, Emily Bartels, *Speaking of the Moor: From Alcazar to Othello* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), esp. 65-99.

¹⁵ For an analysis of three dominant tropes of later European representations of the African see, Lemuel Johnson, *The Devil, the Gargoyle, and the Buffoon: The Negro As Metaphor in Western Literature* (Port Washington, NY: Kennikat Press, 1971), esp. 33-103.

within seventeenth century England.¹⁶ Rather than encoding biological alterity upon the numerous African nations encountered, early travelers to Africa had tried to honestly portray their exotic, sexualized, and fragrant contacts.¹⁷ Only later, within the London core, was race made for consumption by the later English slave colonies through a contemptable triangle trade of fictional consciousness.¹⁸

The use of the olfactory as a lens allows this study to conclude that the transition from religious and ethnographic anti-blackness as articulated through cultural, religious, or climatic difference within a monogenetic worldview, to anti-Blackness as virulent polygenetic racism came earlier than most scholars assert and from a core London population rather than the periphery.¹⁹ This work therefore re-conceptualizes the history of

¹⁶ For Africa as an imagined space to assert the imagined community of England, in later contexts, see, Philip Curtin, *The Image of Africa: British Ideas and Action, 1780-1850* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1964).

¹⁷ For background on the inherent scent of the other see, Constance Classen, "The Odor of the Other: Olfactory Symbolism and Cultural Categories," *Ethos* 20, 2 (1992): 133-166, Janice Carlisle, *Common Scents: Comparative Encounters in High-Victorian Fiction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), Chris Woolgar, "The Social Life of the Senses: Experiencing the Self, Others, and Environments," in *Vol. II of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen and Richard Newhauser (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 23-44, Raynalle Udris, "Smell and Otherness in 20th Century Texts: An Ideological Investigation of Scent with Special Reference to European Modernist Texts, French Women's Writings and Beur Literature," in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 293-322, Emily Walmsley, "Race, Place, and Taste, Making Identities through Sensory Experience," *Etnofoor* 18, 1 (2005): 43-60, Carolyn Korsmeyer, *Savoring Disgust: The Foul and the Fair in Aesthetics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), William Ian Miller, *The Anatomy of Disgust* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1997), and Alan Hyde, "Offensive Bodies," In *The Smell Culture Reader*, ed. Jim Drobnick, (Oxford: Berg, 2006), 53-58.

¹⁸ For the creation of the English nation, and English nationalism under the Stuarts, out of stereotyping the other into what Albion was not, see, A. J. Hoenselaars, *Images of Englishmen and Foreigners in the Drama of Shakespeare and His Contemporaries: A Study of Stage Characters and National Identity in English Renaissance Drama, 1558-1642* (Rutherford, NJ: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1992), esp. 15-25, and the assertion of a Moorish other and a Spanish other as races to mark English superiority in geopolitical trade within, Jesús López-Peláez Casellas, "Race' and the Construction of English National Identity: Spaniards and North Africans in English Seventeenth-Century Drama," *Studies in Philology* 106, 1 (2009): 32-51.

¹⁹ For common sense and the implicit understanding of race as the "master code" of deviance to mark difference for supporting colonial rule see, Will Jackson and Emily Manktelow, "Introduction: Thinking With Deviance," in *Subverting Empire: Deviance and Disorder in the British Colonial World*, ed. Will Jackson and Emily Manktelow (Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), 1-21.

race-making in the olfactory realm. It reorients the study of embodied racism in Mark Smith's *How Race is Made* (2006) by offering a wider chronological scope and different causal forces. Smith's analysis focused on the Anglo-American colonial assertion of scented racism starting from the mid-eighteenth century through the pungent racism of twentieth century Jim Crow.²⁰

This chapter expands that timeline by emphasizing how the English body of the seventeenth century performed the somatic work of racism well before the racial codes of scientists marked the races as polygenetically derived for placement within European dominated hierarchies during the era of Scientific Racism.²¹ Racial knowing lives in the bones, in the muscles, in the nasal passages.²² The common sense that African peoples

²⁰ Mark Smith, *How Race Is Made: Slavery, Segregation, and the Senses* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006). For earlier forms of anti-blackness that often informed later discussion of ethnic difference see, Benjamin Isaac, *The Invention of Racism in Classical Antiquity* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2004), esp. 17-23, the role of the Scholastics in racial categorizing within, Peter Biller, "Proto-racial Thought in Medieval Science," in *The Origins of Racism in the West*, ed. Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac, and Joseph Ziegler (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 157-180, and the importance of Greek physiognomy within, Joseph Ziegler, "Physiognomy, Science, and Proto-Racism, 1200-1500," in *The Origins of Racism in the West*, ed. Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac, and Joseph Ziegler (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 181-199.

²¹ For debates on race-making for American history see, Winthrop Jordan, *White Over Black: American Attitudes Toward the Negro, 1550-1812* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture at Williamsburg, VA, by the University of North Carolina Press, 1968), Kathleen Brown, *Good Wives, Nasty Wenches, and Anxious Patriarchs: Gender, Race, and Power in Colonial Virginia* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture by the University of North Carolina Press, 1996), David Brion Davis, "Constructing Race: A Reflection," *WMQ* 54 (January, 1997): 7-18, the falsely ideal types analyzed in, Peter Kolchin, "Whiteness Studies: The New History of Race in America," *The Journal of American History* 89, 1 (2002): 154-173, the debates on religious equality and racialization within, Richard Bailey, *Race and Redemption in Puritan New England* (Cary: Oxford University Press, 2014), esp. 7-10, the links between bodies and religion as the potentiality for Christian conversion was removed from specific races within, Heather Miyano Kopelson, *Faithful Bodies: Performing Religion and Race in the Puritan Atlantic* (New York: New York University Press, 2016), esp. 4-6, 107-125, and the construction of the legality of whiteness in, Matthew Frye Jacobson, *Whiteness of a Different Color: European Immigrants and the Alchemy of Race* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1998).

²² For the closest chronology for the rise of race applied in this chapter see, Kim Hall, *Things of Darkness: Economies of Race and Gender in Early Modern England* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1995), and the idea that race emerged in different historical contexts prior to theories of racism emerging in those social contexts within, Francisco Bethencourt, *Racisms: From the Crusades to the Twentieth Century* (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2013), esp. 3-8.

smelled was initially a marking of cultural otherness described by travelers, but during the sixteenth and seventeenth century altered proportionally more from descriptions of cultural otherness to increased attributions of embodied racism through the machinations of popular literature upon the imagined European community.²³

Consequently, this chapter re-centers the African in Atlantic history by following categories of difference, otherness, and exclusion outlined by Marxist philosopher Etienne Balibar.²⁴ Rather than reproduce racial categories and assert phenotype using historical terminology and historicity, I choose to take a structural view of racism as a construct based upon community needs in different historical situations. Race is not inherently about skin color. Rather, racism breaks down categories of identity in order to create stereotypes that make pecuniary relationships more controllable. Recovering the roots of otherness in the imagination, as exclusion through legal structures, as difference through cultural means, and as caused by other material factors that have no basis in biological reality, is an essential aspect of materialist history. The construction of race is one form of the construction of the other, which is simply the construction of the alienated self, or what the ego attempts to abject as alien.²⁵

²³ For analysis of this process of defining others through their cultures and nations to later analysis of race see, Nicholas Hudson, "From 'Nation' to 'Race': The Origin of Racial Classification in Eighteenth-Century Thought," *Eighteenth-Century Studies* 29, 3 (1996): 247-264.

²⁴ For centering the African in the study of modernity see, Chris Uroh, "Looking Through a Broken Mirror: Blackness, Shared Memory, Shared Identity and Shared Destiny," in *Africa, Brazil, and the Construction of Trans-Atlantic Black Identities*, ed. Barry Boubacar, Elisee Akpo Soumonni, and Livio Sansone (Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press, 2008), 127-146, and the general analysis within, Michael Gomez, *Reversing Sail: A History of the African Diaspora* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), esp. 162-215.

²⁵ Etienne Balibar, "Difference, Otherness, Exclusion," *Parallax* 11, 1 (2005): 19-34. As Smith describes, the role of the lower senses in studies of racialization is essential as race, as a social construct, could never be fully stabilized in the racist's consciousness through vision alone. Smith, *How Race Is Made*, esp. 62-68. For arguments that whiteness only emerged out of ideals of beauty in the late eighteenth century see, Renato Mazzolini, "Skin Color and the Origin of Physical Anthropology (1640-1850)," in *Reproduction, Race, and Gender in Philosophy and the Early Life Sciences*, ed. Susanne Lettow (Albany: State University of New

In early modern England these categories of racial construction combined to create forms of value for whiteness against what was deemed a wasteful, pungent, and polluted blackness.²⁶ Well before Francois Bernier, Carolus Linnaeus, and Georges-Louis Leclerc, Comte de Buffon, fixed racial hierarchies within Enlightenment thought, English bodies were experiencing those hierarchies as bodily reactions to implicitly understanding Africans through stereotypes perceived on the London stage.²⁷ Alongside Kim Hall's "semiotics of race" this chapter therefore revises the timeline of the rise of racism asserted by a number of scholars.²⁸ Through the use of synesthetic analysis of somatic experience and inter-sensorial language that included odor, this chapter asserts that by the middle of the seventeenth century the idea of race as a permanent marker of biological inferiority was clearly a tenet of English consciousness in both the colonies and the home isle.²⁹ Chapter six describes later resistance to that olfactory coding of African bodies as biologically

York Press, 2014), 131-162.

²⁶ For the rise of ideals that equated beauty with whiteness within changing languages of color in early modern England see, Sujata Iyengar, *Shades of Difference: Mythologies of Skin Color in Early Modern England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005), 140-169, and the role of the masque as asserting the importance of whiteness in Hall, *Things of Darkness*, esp. 131-136.

²⁷ For Bernier's racial groupings in 1684 see, Siep Stuurman, "Francois Bernier and the Invention of Racial Classification," *History Workshop Journal* 50 (2000), 1-21, and for Linnaeus and Buffon regarding the use of the term "race" and racial classifications in the 1730s and 1740s see, Hudson, "From 'Nation' to 'Race,'" 247-264, and the idea of "human types" analyzed within, Richard Popkin, "The Philosophical Basis of Eighteenth-Century Racism," *Studies in Eighteenth-Century Culture* 3 (1973): 245-262.

²⁸ For a later understanding of the solidification of racial thinking, a hardening from 1770-1850 out of the tenets of the Scottish Enlightenment, see, Roxann Wheeler, *The Complexion of Race: Categories of Difference in Eighteenth-Century British Culture* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2000), and the specific analysis of miscegenation as not yet a taboo within English novels of the eighteenth century in, Roxann Wheeler, "The Complexion of Desire: Racial Ideology and Mid-Eighteenth-Century British Novels," *Eighteenth-Century Studies* 32, 3 (1999): 309-332.

²⁹ For the later era of 1760-1860 as a period of intense othering that brought about a new form of Englishness against the racialized indigenous populations of the British Empire, as tied inherently to the military prowess of the new British state, see, C. A. Bayly, "The British and Indigenous Peoples, 1760-1860: Power, Perception, and Identity," in *Empire and Others: British Encounters with Indigenous Peoples, 1600-1850*, ed. M. J. Daunton and Rick Halpern (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999), 19-41.

pungent; a resistance that came from a colonial slave population that retained African ways of smelling and applied those proboscian methods as structural, diasporic, and ethnogenetic olfactory consciousness through Bakhtinian carnivalesque responses to Atlantic slave systems.³⁰

"Scent of that Alluring Fruit": African Aromas in the Pre-Racial European Imagination

Race was not yet a fixed category within most sixteenth century ethnography and cosmography.³¹ During the Renaissance, in much of Europe, black skin was increasingly considered a negative trait.³² However, that did not mean that the person with that hue was considered inherently inferior. Especially prior to the rise of slave trade, most portrayals of Africans living within England were positive.³³ There were significant possibilities for

³⁰ For background on the study of the senses in slave systems see, Mark Smith, "Getting in Touch with Slavery and Freedom," *The Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 381-391. For debates on ethnogenesis and creolization see, James Sidbury, *Becoming African in America: Race and Nation in the Early Black Atlantic* (Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), Gunvor Simonsen, "Belonging in Africa: Frederik Svane and Christian Protten on the Gold Coast in the Eighteenth Century," *Itinerario* 39, 1 (2015): 91-115, and Richard Price, "On the Miracle of Creolization," in *Afro-Atlantic Dialogues: Anthropology in Diaspora*, ed. Kevin Yelvington (Santa Fe: School of American Research Press, 2006), 115-147.

³¹ The title of this section comes from, John Milton, *Paradise Lost* (London: Longman, 1998 [1667]), quote on 504. For the importance of cultural wonder and borrowing rather than racism in Atlantic contacts see, Karen Kupperman, *The Atlantic in World History* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), Richard White, *The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1650-1815* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1991), and Jonathan Gil-Harris, "Sick Ethnography: Recording the Indian and the Ill English Body," in *Indograpy: Writing the "Indian" in Early Modern England*, ed. Jonathan Gil-Harris (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), 133-150.

³² Peter Erickson, "Representations of Blacks and Blackness in the Renaissance," *Criticism* 35, 4 (1993): 499-528; Peter Mark, *Africans in European Eyes: The Portrayal of Black Africans in Fourteenth and Fifteenth Century Europe* (Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University, 1974), esp. 70-98. For the role of Moroccan trading in the making of these increasingly negative tropes see, Jack D'Amico, *The Moor in English Renaissance Drama* (Tampa: University of South Florida Press, 1991), esp. 7-40.

³³ For the importance of climate as a marker of skin color, as analyzed through Ben Jonson's *Masque of Blackness* (1605) as a pre-racial performance, see, Mary Floyd-Wilson, "Temperature, Temperance, and Racial Difference in Ben Jonson's 'The Masque of Blackness'," *English Literary Renaissance* 28, 2 (1998): 183-209, and the *Masque of Blacknesse* related to the resistant Catholicism of Queen Anne and the critique

Africans to enter English communities. Many were allowed to intermarry and assimilate into English society.³⁴ Similarly racially ambiguous, consistent discussions of national variance in ethnographic texts that summarized Africans shows how vital the characteristics of culture and nationality, rather than race, were to early modern Englishpersons.³⁵ The consistent mixing of metaphors and anecdotes about varying peoples of the world were key aspects of early modern ethnographical travel, not inherent markers of racism.³⁶

European readings of skin color were often racially illegible prior to the discovery of the New World. Religion dominated the consciousness of most pre-modern Europeans. Skin color, in this era was thus a marker of religious weakness or a blot of climate rather than any form of biological inheritance. The medieval romance *The King of Tars* included a tale of a formless black mass birthed by a white woman and her Saracen lover. Only after baptism could the lump of black mass become human, white, and Christian. The Saracen father, also upon baptism alongside his child, could become pure and white with the water of Christ. The interiority of Christian whiteness could mark a dark body as white on a previously dark exterior because race was not yet a permanent category.³⁷

of racialization within Protestantism in, Molly Murray, "Performing Devotion in *The Masque of Blacknesse*," *Studies in English Literature 1500-1900* 47, 2 (2007): 427-449.

³⁴ Imtiaz Habib, *Black Lives in the English Archives, 1500-1677: Imprints of the Invisible* (Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2008), esp. 116-145.

³⁵ For general analysis of ambiguous classifications of race, especially regarding religious beliefs, in pre-modern England, see, Stephen Harris, "An Overview of Race and Ethnicity in Pre-Norman England," *Literature Compass* 5, 4 (2008): 740-754.

³⁶ Philip Morgan, "Encounters Between British and 'Indigenous' Peoples, c. 1500-1800," in *Empire and Others: British Encounters with Indigenous Peoples, 1600-1850*, ed. M. J. Dauntton, and Rick Halpern (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999), 43-78.

³⁷ Katie Walter, "The Form and the Formless: Medieval Taxonomies of Skin, Flesh, and the Human," in *Reading Skin in Medieval Literature and Culture*, ed. Katie Walter (New York, New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 119-140.

Following these tenets regarding the religious evils of blackness, some ethnographical summaries of the Early Modern Era sometimes defined black bodies as stinking demons in the vein of the writings of Sir John Mandeville, the tales of Ham and Cain's racial markings, and the progeny of Plinian stupefaction.³⁸ With this tradition, it was often difficult for many Renaissance thinkers to conceptualize the full geography of Africa because the cosmographical descriptions of the area focused on religious discussions of characters like the Queen of Sheba and Prester John in the Maghreb and North Africa.³⁹ Over time, it became increasingly difficult to remove both the geographical focus on that northern coast and to believe in the continent as something more diverse geographically and culturally.⁴⁰

Mandeville's oft-cited and read *Travels*, which were first disseminated throughout Europe during the fourteenth century and were collected from numerous sources of different levels of repute, exposed Europeans to different areas of the world through wondrous myths, honest summary, and imaginary beings. The text summarized a world of

³⁸ What is clear in discussion of Ham's skin color and national origin in the sixteenth century is that there was much debate on the topic. Rather than a signifier for racial Africans, Ham's origin tale was often used as a metaphor for confused lineage. Elliot Tokson, *The Popular Image of the Black Man in English Drama, 1550-1688* (Boston, Mass.: G. K. Hall, 1982), esp. 10-16. For the blackness of Ham as it changed over time see, Benjamin Braude, "The Sons of Noah and the Construction of Ethnic and Geographical Identities in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods," *WMQ* 54, 1 (1997): 103-142, the importance of transmission in, David Whitford, *The Curse of Ham in the Early Modern Era: The Bible and the Justifications for Slavery* (Farnham, England: Ashgate Pub. Ltd., 2009), esp. 101-102, the possible influence of Jewish anti-black traditions explored within, David Goldenberg, *The Curse of Ham: Race and Slavery in Early Judaism, Christianity, and Islam* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2003), esp. 195-200, and the shift of geographical location of Canaan (Ham's son) from Semitic areas to Africa within, William McKee Evans, "From the Land of Canaan to the Land of Guinea: The Strange Odyssey of the 'Sons of Ham'," *The American Historical Review* 85, 1 (1980): 78-102.

³⁹ For the use of maps, as a form of illustrated literature that marked forms of otherness, see, John Gillies, *Shakespeare and the Geography of Difference* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), esp. 54-55.

⁴⁰ For shifts from conjectural knowledge of the 1400s and 1500s about wonders and monsters to experiential knowledge in cartography and ethnography in descriptions of Africa see, Francesc Relaño, *The Shaping of Africa: Cosmographic Discourse and Cartographic Science in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002).

many intelligent species who could wear skins that kept animals away from attacking, a tree that could change odor every hour, and a group of pygmies that lived only on the smell of apples.⁴¹ The geographical ambiguity in Mandeville's texts led Europeans to later place these stories in different areas among many peoples they hoped to mark as inferior.⁴² Homologizing the non-European other was provoked by Mandeville wonders, which often continued into the imaginations of later Europeans.⁴³

However prejudicial Mandeville's influence became, within most early modern ethnographic texts on Africa focus remained on wonder and cultural bartering, especially before the rise of the slave trade in the late seventeenth century after John Hawkins' first large excursions to African slave shores in 1562.⁴⁴ Most of these works, like the narrative of John Leo Africanus, an African Moor, focused on different cultural totems and, rather than define Africans as a singular race, summarized each tribe or nation differently. These

⁴¹ John Mandeville, *The Voyages and Travels Of Sir John Mandevile, Knight* (London: A. Wilde, 1722); Rosemary Tzanaki, *Mandeville's Medieval Audiences* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003). For the continuation of these tales see the summary of these wondrous monsters, animals, and peoples within, Edward Tyson and Michael van der Gucht, *Orang-Outang, Sive, Homo Sylvestris, or, The Anatomy of a Pygmie Compared with That of a Monkey, an Ape, and a Man To Which Is Added, A Philological Essay Concerning the Pygmies, the Cynocephali, the Satyrs and Sphinges of the Ancients: Wherein It Will Appear That They Are All Either Apes or Monkeys, and Not Men, As Formerly Pretended* (London: Thomas Bennet and Daniel Brown, 1699), esp. 18-20.

⁴² Despite the increased contact with Africans in Europe, many images in art and on maps used older stereotypes of Africans as from a monstrous area, with monstrous traits. Jean Michel Massing, "The Image of Africa and the Iconography of Lip-Plated Africans in Pierre Decelie's World Map of 1550," in *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, ed. T. F. Earle and K. J. P. Lowe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 48-69. For the role of wonders in the European discovery of the New World and Africa see, Lorraine Daston and Katharine Park, *Wonders and the Order of Nature, 1150-1750* (New York: Zone Books, 1998).

⁴³ For the senses and the idea of the monstrous other, described as a marking of English identity as what English identity was not through the perception of the Blemmye, or the headless being discussed by Mandeville, see, Lara Farina, "Wondrous Skins and Tactile Affection: The Blemmye's Touch," *Reading Skin in Medieval Literature and Culture*, ed. Katie Walter (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 11-28.

⁴⁴ For historiography on the origins debate regarding whether African slavery or anti-Black racism was first reified within the Anglo-Atlantic see, Laurence Shore, "The Enduring Power of Racism: A Reconsideration of Winthrop Jordan's *White Over Black*," *History and Theory* 44, 2 (2005): 195-226, and Alden Vaughan, "The Origins Debate: Slavery and Racism in Seventeenth-Century Virginia," *The Virginia Magazine of History and Biography* 97, 3 (1989): 311-354.

transnational ethnographic texts from the periphery separated peoples by their language, diets, and cultural traditions of oiled skins, perfumed ceremony, and stinking weeds. The use of smell was rarely attributed to non-cultural causes like race. Blackness was perceived in European perception, after Mandeville and before Shakespeare, as either a cultural mark of evil perpetrated by God upon sinful Ham, or as a climatological mark of living in areas of intense heat, scorched by the Sun.⁴⁵ Direct encounters rarely produced polygenetic racial codes, instead they marked distinct ethnicities and cultural constructs.⁴⁶

Dutch explorer Pieter de Marees' *Description and Historical Account of the Gold Kingdom of Guinea* (1602) described such pungency through cultural traditions, even with his perceptions attune to what he deemed uncivil. He noted the towns near the coast of Guinea "stink like carcasses because of the rubbish which they throw out on the road in

⁴⁵ For Anglo-Atlantic arguments linking skin color to climate see, Roger Williams, *A Key into the Language of America* (London: Gregory Dexter, 1643), esp. 50-52, Levinus Lemnius and Thomas Newton, *The Touchstone of Complexions* (London, 1633 [1576]), esp. 62-65, William Basse's poem "Urania" in, William Basse and John Payne Collier, *The Pastorals and Other Workes of William Basse* (Oxford: T. Richards, 1653), esp. 108-110, and a late attribution of this belief of the birthing of Africans as white, and then blackened by the sun within, Bernard Romans, *Concise Natural History of East and West Florida Containing an Account of the Natural Produce of All the Southern Part of British America in the Three Kingdoms of Nature, Particularly the Animal and Vegetable* (New York: R. Aitken, 1776), esp. 111-112.

⁴⁶ For examples of where Plinian wondering still dominated early modern ethnography see, Jennifer Morgan, "'Some could suckle over their shoulder': Male Travelers, Female Bodies, and the Gendering of Racial Ideology, 1500-1770," *WMQ* 54 (1997): 167-192, and a primary account of such gendering in Barbados within, Felix Christian Spoeri, "A Swiss Medical Doctor's Description of Barbados in 1661: The Account of Felix Christian Spoeri," edited and translated by Alexander Gunkel and Jerome Handler, *JBMHS* 33, 1 (May, 1969): 3-13, esp. 7-8. Gender and reproduction underlay the entire construction of slavery in the New World. Suckling over the shoulder proved that women of African descent could do both reproductive and agricultural labor at the same time, unlike the perception of white women; as expanded within: Jennifer Morgan, *Laboring Women: Reproduction and Gender in New World Slavery* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), esp. 12-49. For narratives on separating the supposed purity of white women from the darkness of black women as a means of upholding slavery see, Hilary Beckles, *Natural Rebels: A Social History of Enslaved Black Women in Barbados* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1989), esp. 29-30, the role of rape in the construction of whiteness within, Sharon Block, *Rape and Sexual Power in Early America* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006), esp. 166-226, and the racial hierarchies that depended on gender analyzed as essential to the growth of modern patriarchal science within, Londa Schiebinger, *Nature's Body: Gender in the Making of Modern Science* (Boston, Mass.: Beacon Press, 1993), and Londa Schiebinger, "The Anatomy of Difference: Race and Sex in Eighteenth-Century Science," *Eighteenth-Century Studies* 23, 4 (1990): 387-405.

heaps.”⁴⁷ Iberian ethnographical texts of the sixteenth and seventeenth century described African smells of different nations similar to Marees descriptions, as cultural manufactures. Portuguese explorer Duarte Lopes’ *Report of the Kingdome of Congo* (1597), later to be included in *Purchas’s Pilgrims* (1626), summarized the smell of African bodies as originating from the odor of copper powder and palm oil that the people of the “Anziques” nation anointed their bodies. In summarizing the use of this oil, Lopes retained a fantastical ear for wondrous stories. During his travels, which began in 1578, he noted a certain type of African wolf that “smell this oyle a farre off” and would steal viles of this palm oil between their teeth and flee into the night.⁴⁸ The importance of scented body oils as a cultural material was summarized earlier in the Alvise Cadamosto letters sent from the Italian slave trader to Henry the Navigator from the 1450s until the 1470s from African outposts. In one letter, probably referencing Mali, Cadamosto summarized the “Azaneques” people who covered their mouths with linen to prevent people from smelling their breaths, while using pungent fish oil to cover their bodies.⁴⁹

⁴⁷ Pieter de Marees, A. van Dantzig, and Adam Jones, *Description and Historical Account of the Gold Kingdom of Guinea* (1602) (Oxford: Published for the British Academy by Oxford University Press, 1987), quote on 77. For earlier excursions of British slavery into areas of the Mediterranean, especially through an illegal trade in “white slaves” from the Canary Islands, see Gustav Ungerer, *The Mediterranean Apprenticeship of British Slavery* (Madrid: Editorial Verbum, 2008), esp. 11-26, 52-53, and the emergence of the term “Caucasian” to describe white female slaves from areas deemed to produce beautiful women within, Sara Figal, “The Caucasian Slave Race: Beautiful Circassians and the Hybrid Origin of European Identity,” in *Reproduction, Race, and Gender in Philosophy and the Early Life Sciences*, ed. Susanne Lettow (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2014), 163-186.

⁴⁸ Duarte Lopes, *A Report of the Kingdome of Congo, a Region of Africa* (London: John Wolfe, 1597), quotes on 33-34, 88-89. For summary in *Purchas* see, Samuel Purchas, Jerome Horsey, William Methold, Jirjis ibn al-‘Amīd Makīn, Thomas Erpenius, William Stansby, and Henry Featherstone, *Purchas His Pilgrimage, or, Relations of the World and the Religions Observed in All Ages and Places Discovered, from the Creation Unto This Present* (London: William Stansby for Henrie Fetherstone, 1626), quotes on 763-764.

⁴⁹ Richard Major, *The Life of Prince Henry of Portugal Surnamed the Navigator and Its Results: Comprising the Discovery, Within One Century, of Half the World* (London: Asher, 1868), esp. 254-255. For the idea that antiquity did not believe in racial codes against African bodies see, Frank Snowden, *Blacks in Antiquity; Ethiopians in the Greco-Roman Experience* (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1970), esp. 178, 204, and the resistance to that idea from a reading of Roman ideas of anti-blackness until

Some of these travelers were informed by a growing Islamic and Old Testament contention regarding the inferiority of black-skinned peoples.⁵⁰ Historian William McKee Evans wrote that the cause of the shifting location of Ham to African territories and the belief in the inferiority of black skin came from medieval Islamic sources. Though there was no link between race and slavery, or between Ham and Africa, in the *Quran*, there existed a cultural link within Islam between race and slavery linguistically (*abid* as a black slave compared to *mamluk*, an elite whiter slave) and between Ham and Africa (the concept of *Banu-Ham*, or son of Ham, associated to black-skinned slaves).⁵¹

In the Medieval Era of “racism without race” Islamic society emerged as the most racially defined. As James Sweet also summarized, “The Muslim world expected blacks to be slaves.”⁵² This emergent civilization, later to disseminate culture and science to Iberian travelers and Europe in the centuries to follow, included an assertion that black bodies had inherent odors. The eleventh century Baghdad Christian physician Ibn Botlan, in “The Art of Making Good Purchases of Slaves” had accordingly summarized that black slaves “have the whitest teeth and this because they have much saliva. Unpleasant is the smell emitted from their armpits and coarse is their skin.”⁵³

the Early Modern Era within, Paul Edwards, “The Early African Presence in the British Isles,” in *Essays on the History of Blacks in Britain: From Roman Times to the Mid-Twentieth Century*, ed. Jagdish Gundara and Ian Duffield (Aldershot, England: Avebury, 1992), 9-29.

⁵⁰ For traditions of anti-blackness in Abrahamic religions within early modern England, see, Joseph Washington, *Anti-Blackness in English Religion, 1500-1800* (New York: E. Mellen Press, 1984), esp. 90-97.

⁵¹ Evans, “From the Land of Canaan to the Land of Guinea,” 78-102. For the idea that slavery was already a deeply understood pattern of labor, from religious sources, and did not emerge in large numbers only after indentured servitude failed, see, Michael Guasco, *Slaves and Englishmen: Human Bondage in the Early Modern Atlantic World* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014), esp. 11-40.

⁵² James Sweet, “The Iberian Roots of American Racist Thought,” *WMQ* 54, 1 (1997): 143-166, quotes on 143, 147.

⁵³ Sweet, “Iberian Roots,” 143-166, quote on 151.

Spanish Jesuit Alonso de Sandoval's *De Instauranda Aethiopum Salute* (1647) similarly noted of the "rudeness, nudity and bad odor" of Ethiopians. Placing Ham as the progenitor of the African race, Sandoval noted the specific "bad odor in the mouth" of specific African nations.⁵⁴ However, later in his work he linked this bad odor, rather than to race, to specific unguents that many African nations chewed during his travels.⁵⁵ Like Lopes before him, Sandoval also leaned on early interpreters, like Mandeville, when describing the wondrous people of Africa, describing one group, the "Astomos," as having no mouth with which to eat and thus lived through the sustenance of smell alone; they "uphold the smell of fruit and flowers" as their only dietary nourishment.⁵⁶

Portuguese Jesuit Manuel Alvares' *Ethiopia Minor and a Geographical Account of the Province of Sierra Leone* summarized many travelers' accounts of voyages into sub-Saharan Africa from the sixteenth century while on his own mission to the region from 1607 to 1617. Alvares' collection similarly noted odors that came from cultural rituals and African technology rather than race. He discussed the process for tarring boats for river travel in Sierra Leone, the use of strong-smelling foods as a mark of African culture near Ethiopia, and while among the "Sousos" people, probably ancestors to the Susu of modern Guinea, his chronicle summarized the cultural skill of the nation of Putases who "sniff their

⁵⁴ Alonso de Sandoval, *De Instauranda Aethiopum Salute* (Madrid: A. de Paredes, 1647), quotes on xxii ("y entre ellas mas destituidas de ensenanca, quales son las de los etiopes, cuya rudeza, des nudez y mal olor suele arredrar al Obrero mas serioso."), and 18 ("Los hijos de Mezrain, hijo segundo de Cham, nacieron sobre negros, disformed y feos, como lo yemos en los Egypcios, y Getulosilos quales demas del color negro, tienen tambien mal olor en la boca, cosa que les obliga a traer siempre en ella sal."), translated by author.

⁵⁵ Sandoval, *De Instauranda Aethiopum Salute*, quote on 210 ("Otros le ungian con unguentos aromaticos que preferuan de corrupcion, en especial con el zumo de una como yedra, que alla fe da, y llaman buyo, calidifsima, que a los uviuos los fultenta mucho, conforta la dentadura, aprieta las enzias, y da bue olor aliento."), translated by author.

⁵⁶ Sandoval, *De Instauranda Aethiopum Salute*, quote on 320 ("Otros llamados Astomos, no tiene boca, sustentase con el olor de las frutas, y flores, y con el mal olor mueren."), translated by author.

noses, as one does when sniffing scent” when people of this community encountered each other.⁵⁷ Like most of these Iberian travelers, other transnational European ethnographers had not shifted anti-blackness in the European religious and cultural tradition to anti-blackness as a racial categorization.⁵⁸

During the High Middle Ages, a persecuting society developed within Europe that introduced new levels of violence against cultural, religious, and gendered others with new governmental and juridical institutions of the state supporting social violence. For historian R. I. Moore, this was not because these populations were increasing, or interaction with lower classes became more common, or something inherent in medieval religiosity, but because the ruling elite asserted their power through creating institutions that could play commoners against each other.⁵⁹

Still, even as these pre-texts for later racism developed during the late Medieval Era, most European portrayals of darker skinned peoples were usually positive.⁶⁰ Black

⁵⁷ Manuel Alvares, et al., *Ethiopia Minor and a Geographical Account of the Province of Sierra Leone (c.1615)* (Liverpool: Dept. of History, University of Liverpool, 1990), Part One, Ch. 4, quotes on 6-7, Part Two, Ch. 4, quotes on 4-6, Appendix, “Of the Province of the Sousous: Single Chapter,” quotes on 7-8. For background on Alvares’ mission see, P. E. H. Hair, “Heretics, Slaves and Witches-As Seen by Guinea Jesuits C. 1610,” *Journal of Religion in Africa* 28, 2 (1998): 131-144, esp. 131-132. For a summary of Iberian attitudes to Africans in this era see the reading of idioms about blackness and other religiously inspired language about dark skin within, Eileen MacGrath Grubb, “Attitudes Towards Black Africans in Imperial Spain,” *Legon Journal of the Humanities* 1 (1974): 68-90, and the anecdotes about the smell of João de Sa Panasco, a slave to the court of Portuguese King John III in the sixteenth century within, Francisco Bethencourt, *Racisms: From the Crusades to the Twentieth Century* (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2013), esp. 90-92.

⁵⁸ For a counter to this idea, an assertion that most portrayals of Africans in sixteenth century England were negative, see the analysis of the travel narratives and chronicles of George Best, Francisco Lopez de Gomara, Robert Baker, and George Abbot, in Alden Vaughan and Virginia Mason Vaughan, “Before Othello: Elizabethan Representations of Sub-Saharan Africans,” *WMQ* 54, 1 (1997): 19-44, esp. 27-34.

⁵⁹ R. I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Power and Deviance in Western Europe, 950-1250* (Oxford: B. Blackwell, 1987), esp. 2-5.

⁶⁰ For the roots of the term “race”, as attributed to Jewish people and Pygmies, in early modern England see, Thomas Browne, Edward Dod, Andrew Croke, William Wordsworth, and Thomas Dunham Whitaker, *Pseudodoxia Epidemica, or, Enquiries into Very Many Received Tenents, and Commonly Presumed Truths*

bodies portrayed in art prior to the Renaissance frequently focused on the Black Magi tradition, which became a “totalizing allegory” that asserted both the strangeness of Africa and the fear of encountering the other.⁶¹ This Magi, or king, would usually be portrayed in a white crowd signifying difference as a questioning of the crowd’s piety rather than later assertions of racial superiority.⁶²

Even as race increased as a marker of difference for many groups, the English Renaissance was yet to fully code the black body as a marker of biological inferiority. For those who could read the Old Testament, positive portrayals of darker-skinned Africans persisted. The story of the eunuch Ebed-Melech, in Jeremiah 38:7, summarized the inherent ingenuity and bravery of the Ethiopian in rescuing Jeremiah from Babylonian dungeons through the use of a pulley.⁶³

In antiquity, blackness had been considered exotic, but not necessarily negative.⁶⁴ During the Medieval Era, blackness, and the associated scents of sin, became markers of possible evil. But, this was an evil mark of skin coloring that could be transcended through

(London: Edward Dod, 1658), esp. 255-257.

⁶¹ For the role of positive African images, either of the Black Magus, Queen of Sheba, or Prester John, prior to the rise of the slave trade see, Paul Kaplan, *The Rise of the Black Magus in Western Art* (Ann Arbor, Mich.: UMI Research Press, 1985), esp. 43-62, and Joseph Leo Koerner, “The Epiphany of the Black Magus Circa 1500,” in Book I of *Volume III of The Image of the Black in Western Art*, ed. David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen Dalton (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010), 7-92, quote on 14.

⁶² Erickson, “Representations,” 499-528. For positive portrayals without much “anti-black prejudice” also see, Mark, *Africans in European Eyes*, esp. 40-53.

⁶³ For a discourse on Jeremiah and Ebed-Melech see, Robert Allen, *A Treatise of Christian Beneficence, and of That Like Christian Thankfulness Which Is Due to the Same: The Which, As They Are Duties of Singular Account with God, so Are They of As Necessarie Use to All Christians, for the Keeping of Faith and a Good Conscience, As Are Fire and Water for Common Use and Comfort to the Naturall Life of All Men* (London: John Harison for Thomas Man, 1600), esp. 62-63.

⁶⁴ For the idea that Greco-Roman antiquity and early Christianity did not include color prejudices because they relied on an objective realism when encountering the other see, Frank Snowden, *Before Color Prejudice: The Ancient View of Blacks* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1983), esp. 99-108.

the baptism of the inner person.⁶⁵ Other groups were considered to possibly emit odors, as with the natural “stink” of Jews within Thomas Browne’s *Pseudodoxia Epidemica* (1646), but these classifications mostly retained religious and satirical meanings that could change through conversion, rather than existing permanently as polygenetic racial traits.⁶⁶ In sixteenth century England, and in Europe as a whole, most portrayals of Africans in literature and art therefore remained positive. This allowed many African peoples to achieve significant social mobility in their adopted countries. Many were simply court ornaments, but a significant few achieved advancement in court politics and the arts.⁶⁷

English language accounts of Africa similarly described Africans as different nations with different culturally created odors.⁶⁸ These culturally described odors allowed for an expansion of signifiers to be attributed to skin color, but these signifiers remained culturally demarcated. English texts were consistently informed by an Aristotelian

⁶⁵ Anu Korhonen, “Washing the Ethiopian White: Conceptualising Black Skin in Renaissance England,” in *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, ed. T. F. Earle and K. J. P. Lowe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 94-112, esp. 96-107.

⁶⁶ Mary Campbell, *Wonder & Science: Imagining Worlds in Early Modern Europe* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1999), esp. 85-96. For race and odor, related to anti-Semitism as a pre-text to future assertions of African odor in the Early Modern Era see, Smith, “Transcending, Othering, Detecting,” 380-390, Colin Kidd, *The Forging of Races: Race and Scripture in the Protestant Atlantic World, 1600-2000* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006), esp. 61-75, and the creation of anti-Semitism analyzed through the growing attribution of a comical and nasally nose to Jewish populations in Europe of the Early Modern Era within, Don Harrán, “The Jewish Nose in Early Modern Art and Music,” *Renaissance Studies* 28, 1 (2014): 50-70.

⁶⁷ Habib, *Black Lives in the English Archives*, 116-145.

⁶⁸ For factual gathering and the search for similarities in early anthropology see, Margaret Hodgen, *Early Anthropology in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1964), esp. 295-353, the importance of common knowledge shared across classes within, Antonio Barrera-Osorio, *Experiencing Nature: The Spanish American Empire and the Early Scientific Revolution* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 2006), the importance of local knowledge to Oviedo in, Antonello Gerbi, *Nature in the New World: From Christopher Columbus to Gonzalo Fernandez De Oviedo* (Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1985), the diachronic shifts from ethnography to racialized discourse within, P. E. H. Hair, “Attitudes to Africans in English Primary Sources on Guinea Up to 1650,” *History in Africa* 26 (1999): 43-68, and the analysis of epistemological roots of Iberian science in, María Portuondo, *Secret Science: Spanish Cosmography and the New World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009).

conception of difference that was based on geographical variance whereby skin was black due to the heat of the sun's rays.⁶⁹ Under this ideal, a child was always white, and numerous English midwives were surprised when children born of a black father and white mother in England turned out to be dark.⁷⁰

Flowing from this traditional assertion, Leo Africanus' *Geographical Historie of Africa* (1600) described the nations of Africa using cultural differences of ritual practice and geographical locale.⁷¹ His olfactory references focused on the wondrous landscapes encountered during his African travels. He summarized the state of "Maraco" as "greene every where, and most fertile of all things, which serve for foode, or which delight the senses of smelling or seeing."⁷² Poor smells of these areas and their built environments were described using cultural motifs rather than biological inheritances. Thus, the people who lived near Mount Dedes on the plains of Todga, in present day southern Morocco, smelled poorly because of the "stinking smell" of their goats who wandered their villages.⁷³ The people of Tegassa, near Tunis, similarly lived in a stinking part of Africa, though it

⁶⁹ For more secondary analysis of climate and skin color see the analysis of North/South ideas of geohumoralism and the barbarianism of Northern peoples that had to be argued against within, Mary Floyd-Wilson, *English Ethnicity and Race in Early Modern Drama* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), esp. 67-86.

⁷⁰ Tokson, *Popular Image of the Black Man*, esp. 15-16; Josiah Blackmore, "Imagining the Moor in Medieval Portugal," *Diacritics* 36, 3 (2008): 27-43, esp. 37-39. For the role of humoral medicine in the making of a moral code about skin color during the Early Modern Era see, Gail Kern Paster, "The Pith and Marrow of Our Attribute: Dialogue of Skin and Skull in *Hamlet* and Holbein's 'The Ambassadors'," *Textual Practice* 23, 2 (2009): 247-265, esp. 250-252.

⁷¹ For Africanus' objectivity see, Tokson, *Popular Image of the Black Man*, esp. 16-18. For Africanus as defining the Moor through objective terms, but retaining a disdain for Africans in general see, Hair, "Attitudes to Africans," esp. 52-53.

⁷² Leo Africanus, and John Pory, *A Geographical Historie of Africa, Written in Arabicke and Italian by John Leo a More, Borne in Granada, and Brought Up in Barbarie* (London: Eliot's Court Press; George Bishop, 1600), esp. 56-65, quotes on 64-65.

⁷³ Africanus, *Geographical Historie*, 106-108.

was the “extreme...smell of their fishes” that caused the odor rather than later assertions of biological inferiority.⁷⁴

Africanus, a Muslim from Christian Grenada who was original named Al-Hassan Ibn Mohammed Al-Wezaz Al-Fasi and became John Leo Africanus when baptized by Pope Leo X in Rome, offered ethnographical texts that described each nation as a separate culture. In part, Africanus tricked the Christian world in which he lived into thinking him a Catholic through the application of *taqiyya*, or the denouncement of Islamic faith as a means to protect the body during duress. He was therefore a transgressive figure, a trickster bound to nothing, and it was his transgressive forms (even his homoeroticism) that mark his historical identity.⁷⁵ As part of this trickster identity, Africanus kept a keen sensory lens for cultural wonder in worldly environments and the peoples he encountered.⁷⁶ However, when his work was sent to publisher John Pory the terms which Africanus originally used in his Latin text for each nation were covered over by the use of the term Moor to describe all of the national groups living in Africa.⁷⁷ The metropolitan English core turned the variation, culturally defined through odor among other sensory observations, into a common other through a process of amanuensis that shifted sexual threats into

⁷⁴ Africanus, *Geographical Historie*, quote on 187-188.

⁷⁵ For the most explorative biography of Africanus through the lens of this ruse, see, Natalie Zemon Davis, *Trickster Travels: A Sixteenth-Century Muslim between Worlds* (New York: Hill and Wang, 2006).

⁷⁶ Davis, *Trickster Travels*, esp. 266-269.

⁷⁷ For the editorial hand of Pory see, Emily Bartels, "Making More of the Moor: Aaron, Othello, and Renaissance Refashionings of Race," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 41, 4 (1990): 433-454, esp. 436-438, Eldred Jones, *The Elizabethan Image of Africa* (Charlottesville: Published for the Folger Shakespeare Library by the University Press of Virginia, 1971), esp. 21-37, and the idea that editors had a central role in removing local particulars to create universal meanings for larger audiences during the Early Modern Era within, J. Andrew Mendelsohn, "The World on a Page: Making a General Observation in the Eighteenth Century," in *Histories of Scientific Observation*, ed. Lorraine Daston and Elizabeth Lunbeck (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011), 396-420.

progressively more symbolic orders.⁷⁸

The power of mass culture changed what those experiencing the periphery knew to be false.⁷⁹ Racializing rarely occurred in moments of direct contact where the necessity of go-betweens and communication for bartering trumped the impenetrable disgust of later racial knowing. Most encounters on the periphery between peoples of different ethnicities involved wonder and desire rather than contempt and dominance. The early periphery offered a place for common motivations for survival. Therein, early European ethnographers, travelers, and explorers often wrote of other peoples they encountered as different fruits from the same tree.⁸⁰

It was the later English metropole that created race through stage productions that oversimplified ethnicity in Africa to the flat character of the “foul” Moor or stinking African for simple productive tropes and static characters.⁸¹ The blackamoor, the Moor,

⁷⁸ For early modern European dialogues that “effectively homogenized” the diverse others of the world through a “grammar of sameness” see, Benjamin Schmidt, *Inventing Exoticism: Geography, Globalism, and Europe's Early Modern World* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015), esp. 13-18, 118-139, and the mixed origins of Othello analyzed within, Jonathan Burton, “‘A most wily bird’: Leo Africanus, *Othello* and the Trafficking in Difference,” in *Post-Colonial Shakespeares*, ed. Ania Loomba and Martin Orkin (London: Routledge, 1998), 43-63.

⁷⁹ For the role of amanuensis in the later Black Atlantic, as a means of controlling portrayals of African American sexuality see, Gillian Whitlock, “Volatile Subjects: *The History of Mary Prince*,” in *Genius in Bondage: Literature of the Early Black Atlantic*, ed. Vincent Carretta and Philip Gould (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2001), 72-86, and Felicity Nussbaum, “Being a Man: Olaudah Equiano and Ignatius Sancho,” in *Genius in Bondage: Literature of the Early Black Atlantic*, ed. Vincent Carretta and Philip Gould (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2001), 54-71.

⁸⁰ As Nancy Shoemaker similarly discussed, because both Native Americans and English had similar concepts about the body, the value of right-handedness as an example, they used those concepts in diplomatic ritual to come to common understandings in early America. For Shoemaker, all body parts, excluding skin color, seem to have been used to tie the Native to the Englishman in diplomatic discussions. Nancy Shoemaker, “The Body as a Source of Sameness and Difference in Eighteenth Century American Indian Diplomacy East of the Mississippi,” in *A Centre of Wonders: The Body in Early America*, ed. Janet Moore Lindman and Michele Lise Tarter (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2001), 211-222, and a similar assertion of the importance of common goals in early America that possibly limited racial tensions within, Mechal Sobel, *The World They Made Together: Black and White Values in Eighteenth-Century Virginia* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1987).

⁸¹ For the homogenizing of the African and Moorish other into a common black race, see a similar tactic in

the Ethiopian, the Hottentot, and the African all emerged from the English stage onto the Atlantic littoral as a singular black race. The conceptualization of the European, or specific European nations, was born through forms of what Colin Kidd has described as “ethnic theology,” identity apart from national origin that only arose during the sixteenth century, especially through the monogenetic racialized exegesis of the stories of Noah and Canaan.⁸² As the new biological identity formed, it needed a linguistic other; thus rose the African, as the other to the European, as marked in European literature rather than from the perspectives of those on the periphery who had perceived the monogenetic similarities between themselves and African peoples.⁸³

Synesthesia on the Proscenium and the Pulpit: Triangle Trading on the Pungency of Race

Significant populations of Africans lived in England during the 1500s.⁸⁴ This population grew enough to lead Elizabeth I to draft laws to remove the black presence from her kingdom during the late sixteenth century.⁸⁵ Nonetheless, for most Englishpersons the

Richard Hakluyt's *Navigations*, to that of Pory, in Emily Bartels, “Imperialist Beginnings: Richard Hakluyt and the Construction of Africa,” *Criticism* 34, 4 (Fall, 1992), 517-538, esp. 522-526, and for the homogenizing of Spanish, Moorish, and African others into a single conception of a semiotic other in early modern England see, López-Peláez Casellas, “‘Race’ and the Construction,” esp. 41-48.

⁸² Colin Kidd, *British Identities before Nationalism: Ethnicity and Nationhood in the Atlantic World, 1600-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), esp. 11-12, 290-291. For the idea of difference as contagion to the body politic in early modern England see, Jonathan Gil Harris, *Foreign Bodies and the Body Politic: Discourses of Social Pathology in Early Modern England* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), esp. 50-81.

⁸³ For the ambiguous nature of the “Moor” in earlier Portuguese texts see, Blackmore, “Imagining the Moor,” 27-43.

⁸⁴ For laxity of immigration laws in Tudor England see, Laura Hunt Hume, *Strangers Settled Here Amongst Us: Policies, Perceptions, and the Presence of Aliens in Elizabethan England* (London: Routledge, 2003).

⁸⁵ For Elizabeth's proposed removal of Africans from England as a scapegoat for failing policies, see Emily Bartels, “Too Many Blackamoors: Deportation, Discrimination, and Elizabeth I,” *Studies in English*

conception of the African did not come from the rare occurrence of encountering a Moorish court ornament, musician, or envoy. It did not come from the sporadic incidence of stumbling upon Africans on the streets of London or on ships in the ports of Liverpool or Plymouth. Rather, the conception of the African came through popular culture, out of what critic Jean Ferrick has termed the shifting categories of race within “textual moments” articulated by English writers.⁸⁶

Emerging from the deep sexual fear of encountering the other, these racial stereotypes recurrently pooled in the olfactory realm.⁸⁷ Such scents were referenced as both pungent and aromatically sensuous in numerous art-forms.⁸⁸ Analysis of the term “foul” in its early modern contexts shows that what may seem an implicit reference to moral constitution was, during the era of Shakespeare, a synesthetic assertion of pungent odor. Similarly, the aforementioned proverb “to wash a blackamoor white” contained implicit synesthetic concerns with odor that have been overlooked in the analysis of the metaphor, used especially as analogy to the concept of striving in vain.⁸⁹ These explicit and implicit

Literature, 1500-1900 46, 2 (2006): 305-322.

⁸⁶ Jean Ferrick, *Strangers in Blood: Relocating Race in the Renaissance* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2010), quote on 21. Scholars have estimated approximately 20,000 Africans lived in London in 1600, between approximately three and six percent of the population of London for the years 1538-1603. Most came from the continent, and a significant portion lived with Sephardic Jews while in England. Onyeka, *Blackamoors: Africans in Tudor England, Their Presence, Status and Origins* (London: Narrative Eye, 2013), esp. 1-18, 107-128.

⁸⁷ For the role of sexual fear in the creation of Atlantic racism, as in the writings of Africanus and Jean Barbot that focus on African dancing, see, Katrina Dyonne Thompson, *Ring Shout, Wheel About: The Racial Politics of Music and Dance in North American Slavery* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2014), esp. 13-24.

⁸⁸ For the perpetuation of biopower among the masses see, Antonio Negri, “At the Origins of Biopolitics (translated by Diana Garvin),” in *Biopower: Foucault and Beyond*, ed. Vernon Cisney and Nicolae Morar (Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016), 48-64.

⁸⁹ For a reading of the metaphor within English Renaissance plays as representing the increasingly racialized evil of blackness see, Carolyn Prager, “‘If I Be Devil’: English Renaissance Response to the Proverbial and Ecumenical Ethiopian,” *Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies* 17, 2 (Fall, 1987): 257-279.

textual references highlight how the literary use of odor linked African bodies to pungency in order to free England of its label as a previously barbarian backwater.⁹⁰

English culture began its seventeenth century racializing program through defining African nations as overly sexual and jealous of their women. This understanding of the sexuality of the other, usually arising from pre-textual sources within the objective ethnography previously analyzed, changed the English mind to induce a racist defense mechanism that was articulated, out of sexual fear, on the stage and through the pen.⁹¹ The senses changed as momentary perceptions were shifted through a cultural alteration of psychological proportions. The intensive sexual anxiety of encountering Africans was portrayed in Robert Heath's *Clarastella* (1650). This collection of literature included a brief poem entitled "To a Lascivious Blackamoore Woman." Heath composed: "Tis Night in thine, in my face day: but yet/ Should wee joyn; wee might mongrel twilight get;/ A Tawny-moore that would of both partake:/ Haunt me not Shade! I'l no new monster make."⁹² The child of miscegenation, for Heath, was a "new monster" that the dark-skinned woman hoped to create through a form of sexual trickery. Richard Brome's play *The*

⁹⁰ Floyd-Wilson, "Temperature," 183-209.

⁹¹ Freud introduced the concept of *verschiebung* to address sexual anxiety of individual patients. It is shifted here into psychoanalytical history to describe the dream-work that Englishpersons found necessary to overcome the deep sexual anxiety caused by discovering other humans throughout the world. For a philosophical and psychoanalytical reading of Freud and the inherent fantasy of the possibly existing other through methods of symbolic ordering see, Jacques Lacan, and Jeffrey Mehlman, "The Other Is Missing" *October* 40 (1987): 131-133, and the application of this idea in historical study within, Joel Fineman, *Shakespeare's Perjured Eye: The Invention of Poetic Subjectivity in the Sonnets* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986), esp. 42-46.

⁹² Robert Heath, *Clarastella: Together with Poems Occasional, Elegies, Epigrams, Satyrs* (London: Humph. Moseley, 1650), quotes on 1-2. For the importance of gender and patriarchy in the making of race in early modern literature see, Ania Loomba, "The Color of Patriarchy: Critical Difference, Cultural Difference, and Renaissance Drama," in *Women, "Race," and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, ed. Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker (London: Routledge, 1994), 17-34, and Lynda Boose, "'The Getting of a Lawful Race': Racial Discourse in Early Modern England and the Unpresentable Black Woman," in *Women, "Race," and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, ed. Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker (London: Routledge, 1994), 35-54.

English Moor (1659) likewise exposed such anxiety when a wife was painted black and a crowd instantly believed her to be offering sexual favors.⁹³

A similar sexual apprehension caused by the temptation of an African woman can be found in nonconformist preacher and politician William Greenhill's *Sound-Hearted Christian* (1670). In the sermon, Greenhill described that: "if a man be in love with a Blackamore, it may be she hath a good feature, but she is black...the world is but a Blackamore, an evil thing, and it's full of corruption...the world is corrupted through lusts, and is full of loathsomness; but look upon the beauties of God, and the excellencies of God are such as would ravish a mans soul, and draw it up unto him."⁹⁴ Such temptation, the sexual fear of the "sensory misgovernance" of African women, created the tension necessary to define race to remove attraction as opinions of biological inferiority increasingly meant sexual incompatibility.⁹⁵

Within this artistic construction of race, the African became a deeply sensuous and

⁹³ Richard Brome, *Five New Playes, Viz. The English Moor, or the Mock-Marriage. The Love-Sick Court, or the Ambitious Politique: Covent Garden Weeded. The New Academy, or the New Exchange. The Queen and Concubine* (London: A. Crook and H. Brome, 1659), esp. 36-40.

⁹⁴ William Greenhill, *The Sound-Hearted Christian, or, A Treatise of Soundness of Heart With Several Other Sermons* (London: Nath. Crouch, 1670), quotes on 318-319. Similar fears of intermarriage and miscegenation appear in George Peele's *Battle of Alcazar* (1589) and Francis Beaumont and John Fletcher's *The Knight of Malta* (1647). Anthony Gerard Barthelemy, *Black Face, Maligned Race: The Representation of Blacks in English Drama from Shakespeare to Southerne* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1987), esp. 150-162; Ania Loomba, *Gender, Race, Renaissance Drama* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1989), esp. 43-47. For the evil moor as the dominant trope of black-skinned characters on the English stage see, Eldred Jones, *Othello's Countrymen; The African in English Renaissance Drama* (London: Published on behalf of Fourah Bay College, the University College of Sierra Leone by Oxford University Press, 1965).

⁹⁵ These sexual fears possibly arose from a similar Iberian fear of the African sexual other, analyzed through the *Verses of How a Lady Begs a Black Slave to Sing to Her* (1520) in, Jeremy Lawrance, "Black Africans in Renaissance Spanish Literature," in *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, ed. T. F. Earle, and K. J. P. Lowe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 70-93. For personal "sensory misgovernance" as the mark of the other in early modern England see, Matthew Milner, "To Captivate The Senses: Sensory Governance, Heresy, and Idolatry in Mid-Tudor England," in *Religion and the Senses in Early Modern Europe*, ed. Wietse de Boer and Christine Göttler (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 307-327, quote on 308.

olfactory character.⁹⁶ Many painted references to black bodies took on the trope of the “Smoking Moor” wherein the character portrayed in portraiture would be set in a smoky room, smoking, or clouded in what seemed to be fragrant airs.⁹⁷ These explicit references to the “Smoking Moor,” and the “dark lady” of numerous sonnets, linked African bodies to a deeply embodied and conspiratorial sensuality.⁹⁸

In the translation of Traiano Boccalini’s *New-Found Politicke* (1626) Englishpersons would have been commonly aware enough of these racialized tropes, asserted from the time of Elizabeth’s “cult of whiteness” and the “blanching” campaigns of James I in the Highlands, to understand the metaphor applied by Boccalini regarding the stench of the Moor to portray the disdain for three women being allowed to enter an academic organization in ancient Greece. These “Poeticall Ladies of Parnassus” read sonnets to the “Academicall Corporation” that “offended *Apolloes* divine nostrills worse than the stinke of a Blackamore.”⁹⁹ The commonsensical use of the metaphor, in such an

⁹⁶ For the history of African images in English art of the Early Modern Era see the reading of allegory within, David Bindman, “The Black Presence in British Art: Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries,” in *Book I of Volume III of The Image of the Black in Western Art*, ed. David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen Dalton (Cambridge, Mass: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010), 235-270.

⁹⁷ Lemuel Johnson, *Shakespeare in Africa (& Other Venues): Import & the Appropriation of Culture* (Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press, 1998), esp. 106-110. For the productions of Shakespeare on the African continent, and the reception of his works within African nations see, Edward Wilson-Lee, *Shakespeare in Swahililand: In Search of a Global Poet* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2016).

⁹⁸ For the “dark lady” see, Hall, *Things of Darkness*, 66-73. For forms of inversion within these images of black characters see, David Dabydeen, *Hogarth's Blacks: Images of Blacks in Eighteenth Century English Art* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1987), esp. 57-140, and the role of scent in artistic self-fashioning along similar lines, through the example of freedman Julius Soubise who would often scent himself at high society gatherings as a fop for English amusements during the late eighteenth century, within, F. O. Shyllon, *Black People in Britain 1555-1833* (London: Published for the Institute of Race Relations by Oxford University Press, 1977, esp. 42-44.

⁹⁹ Traiano Boccalini, William Vaughan, John Florio, and Thomas Scott, *The New-Found Politicke* (London: Francis Williams, 1626), esp. 201-202. For the “cult of whiteness” perpetuated by Elizabeth in the final years of her reign see Erickson, “Representations”, 499-508, and for the “blanching” or civilizing of the Scottish Highlands through the metaphor of the Ethiopian in Jonson’s *Masque of Blackness* (1605) see, Floyd-Wilson, “Temperature,” esp. 202-206.

obvious manner referenced through the common political allegory of ancient Greece, implies the consistent use of racist tropes in the common transnational European culture of the early seventeenth century that increasingly asserted normative whiteness.¹⁰⁰

The theater became the essential space for marking embodied experiences for how to encounter the racial other.¹⁰¹ The stage, either on the home isle or performing English plays in the colonies with the “intimate distance” of a perceived common Englishness, was the central space for creating what could or could not remain a part of the “performative commons,” the discursive domain where identity was negotiated and debated, and the space for performative resistance that Jacques Rancière has recently deemed *dissensus*.¹⁰²

In this combative cultural sphere, similarly denoting a growing commonsensical olfactory racism, was the play *Lust's Dominion* (1657), usually attributed to Thomas Dekker and possibly performed in decades prior. The play centers upon the machinations of an evil and murderous Moorish character Eleazar, who gained power in the court of the King of Fez, earning his role as Prince through malicious politicking.¹⁰³ The brutal Moor feigned love to the Queen Mother to get closer to the King, and murdered the Queen Mother's son Philip. In a dramatic conclusion to the play, Eleazar then kills the Queen

¹⁰⁰ For the rise of whiteness as a normative good in early modern England see, Kim Hall, “‘These bastard signs of fair’: Literary Whiteness in Shakespeare's Sonnets,” in *Shakespeare and Race*, ed. Catherine Alexander and Stanley Wells (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 64-83.

¹⁰¹ For the centrality of the stage in the making of racialization in early modern England see, Anne Mangum, *Reflection of Africa in Elizabethan and Jacobean Drama and Poetry* (Lewiston, NY: E. Mellen Press, 2002), esp. 1-38.

¹⁰² Elizabeth Maddock Dillon, *New World Drama: the Performative Commons in the Atlantic World, 1649-1849* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2014), quotes on 13-16; Jacques Rancière, and Steve Corcoran, *Dissensus: On Politics and Aesthetics* (London: Continuum, 2010), esp. 135-137. For the role of politics in the making of the sensible see the reading of aesthetic practices within, Jacques Rancière, *The Politics of Aesthetics: the Distribution of the Sensible* (London: Continuum, 2004), esp. 32-50.

¹⁰³ For the debate on the authorship of this play see, Arthur Freeman and Janet Ing Freeman, *John Payne Collier: Scholarship and Forgery in the Nineteenth Century* (London: Yale University Press, 2004), esp. 130-133.

Mother and the King in a vain attempt to gain the throne. His plans are dashed as he himself is run through. His evil, in this final failure, was previously linked to his internal odors and race. Philip, preparing for his unsuccessful contest, had proclaimed: "Ambition plumes the Moor, whilst black despair,/ Offering to tear from him the diadem/ Which he usurps, makes him to cry at all,/ And to act deeds beyond astonishment;/ But Philip is the night that dark his glories:/ This sword, yet reeking with his negro's blood,/ Being grasp'd by equity and this strong arm,/ Shall through and through."¹⁰⁴ The play, especially as a text that came to modernity without a specific author, represents an early modern England that had set for the Moor an evil level of jealousy, offered African's internal flowing blood as pungent, and linked Moorishness in a homology with the dark skin of the similarly classified "negro."¹⁰⁵

As the eminent critic Walter Benjamin understood, "There is no document of civilization which is not at the same time a document of barbarism."¹⁰⁶ The shifting of odor upon the racialized other is a time-worn tradition that represents such an assertion.¹⁰⁷ Ideas

¹⁰⁴ Christopher Marlowe and George Robinson, *The Works of Christopher Marlowe* (London: W. Pickering, 1826 [1657]), esp. 268-270, quote on 270.

¹⁰⁵ For concerns with using blackness as the dominant categorization of race in study of the Early Modern Era see, Kathleen Brown, "Native Americans and Early Modern Concepts of Race," in *Empire and Others: British Encounters with Indigenous Peoples, 1600-1850*, ed. M. J. Daunton and Rick Halpern (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999), 79-100.

¹⁰⁶ Walter Benjamin, Hannah Arendt, and Harry Zohn, *Illuminations* (New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, 1968), quote on 256. For the idea that race, in the modern sense, only emerged in the Enlightenment, see the reading of Kant's racial categories within, Robert Bernasconi, "Who Invented the Concept of Race? Kant's Role in the Enlightenment Construction of Race," in *Race*, ed. Robert Bernasconi (Malden, Mass.: Blackwell, 2001), 11-36, the reading of Bernier, through his medical past, within, Pierre Boule, "Francois Bernier and the Origins of the Modern Concept of Race," in *The Color of Liberty: Histories of Race in France*, ed. Sue Peabody and Tyler Edward Stovall (Durham: Duke University Press, 2003), 11-27, and the intense racialization within French colonies of the Atlantic analyzed within, William B. Cohen, *The French Encounter with Africans: White Response to Blacks, 1530-1880* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1980), esp. 35-59.

¹⁰⁷ For the ascension of whiteness as a means of overcoming the sexual fear of encountering the racial other see the reading of Lacan, the real, and the importance of lack and desire within, Kalpana Seshadri-Crooks,

about the savagery and odors of Africans came from a diverse tradition of smelling that included textual reference to religious, noble, and literary definitions of pungency that, in their own right, were discourses of barbarity.¹⁰⁸

Such olfactory alterity is also present in *The Tempest* (1610).¹⁰⁹ Therein, the racially ambiguous oddity Caliban represents the cacophonous confusion that Europeans met when encountering the shores of the New World.¹¹⁰ As critic Jodi Byrd has recently summarized:

Beginning with Trinculo and Caliban's first encounter, we can sketch a reading: 'What have we here? a man or fish? dead or alive? A fish: he smells like a fish; a very ancient and fish-like smell; a kind of not of the Newest Poor-John. A strange fish! Were I in England now, as once I was, and had but this fish painted, not a holiday fool there but would give a piece of silver: there would this monster make a man; any strange beast there makes a man: when they will not give a doit to relieve

Desiring Whiteness: A Lacanian Analysis of Race (London: Routledge, 2000), esp. 3-7.

¹⁰⁸ For the subaltern transcending of early modern racial classifications and the homogenizing racial tendencies of early modern England, through the image of Pocahontas, see, Karen Robertson, "Pocahontas at the Masque," *Signs* 21, 3 (1996): 551-583.

¹⁰⁹ For the changing associations in *The Tempest*: see Caliban as a "primitive monster" who could be considered to represent blackness due to the etymology of his name, possibly within "cauliban" or a Gypsy term for blackness, see, Alden Vaughan and Virginia Mason Vaughan, *Shakespeare's Caliban: A Cultural History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), esp. 4-12, 32-36, the concept of the dual aspects of wonder, as upsetting reason and creating visual amazement, as created in the reading of Caliban as part of the constructed other of travel narratives within, Platt, *Reason Diminished*, esp. 169-187, and Caliban as a hybrid character of the wild man, savage, and African slave within, Leslie Fiedler, *The Stranger in Shakespeare* (New York: Stein and Day, 1972), esp. 234-244.

¹¹⁰ For Caliban as a postcolonial carnivalesque character see, John Demaray, *Shakespeare and the Spectacles of Strangeness: The Tempest and the Transformation of Renaissance Theatrical Forms* (Pittsburgh, PA: Duquesne University Press, 1998), esp. 53-61, later interpretations of Caliban in performances analyzed within, Jonathan Bate, "Caliban and Ariel Write Back," in *Shakespeare and Race*, ed. Catherine Alexander and Stanley Wells (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 165-176, and Jan Kott, *The Bottom Translation: Marlowe and Shakespeare and the Carnival Tradition* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1987), esp. 84-106.

a lame beggar, they will lay out ten to see a dead Indian. Legged like a man! And his fins like arms! Warm, o' my troth! I do now let loose my opinion, hold it no longer: this is no fish, but an islander that hath lately suffered by a thunderbolt.' In this meeting, Trinculo takes great pains to categorize Caliban, naming him first as fish, then as Poor-John or dried hake, and in the course of the scene constructs a taxonomy that classified Caliban as dead Indian, and finally as an islander within a generic family. From the beginning of this passage, Caliban exists in a liminal space between man and beast, food and cannibal, alive and dead Indian. This indeterminacy in Trinculo's first encounter with Caliban is mediated further by his thoughts of using Caliban to make money on the streets of London. Whatever else he may be, Caliban is profit.¹¹¹

Such a deep sensory reading of texts for sensory cues about definitions of modernity and fecundity, especially for a character as complex as the Algerian exile Sycorax's son, allows scholars to advance methodology about the shifting multivalence of words as they modified diachronically.¹¹²

Specifically, synesthetic and olfactory implications of the term "foul" were used to

¹¹¹ Byrd, *Transit of Empire*, quote on 55. For a reading of Caliban as part of a debate on the categories of humanity in early modern England see, Julián Jiménez Heffernan, *Shakespeare's Extremes: Wild Man, Monster, Beast* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), esp. 109-150.

¹¹² For the importance of multivalent meanings of sensory language in early modern England see the semantic and the somatic analyzed through reading practices in, Katharine Craik, *Reading Sensations in Early Modern England* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), esp. 3-5, the older meanings of terms in the study of cognition applied in, Lowell Gallagher and Shankar Raman, "Introduction," in *Knowing Shakespeare: Senses, Embodiment and Cognition*, ed. Lowell Gallagher and Shankar Raman (Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 1-29, and the specific keyword analysis of "burden" to discover historical meanings for sound-making in *The Tempest* within, Michael Neill, "'Noises, Sounds, and Sweet Airs': The Burden of Shakespeare's *Tempest*," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 59, 1 (2008): 36-59.

define Africans as stinking during the Early Modern Era. As portrayed in chapter two, the semantic economies that support changing material drives often shifted the sensory meaning of words for audiences in the Elizabethan theatre.¹¹³ As critic Jonathan Dollimore aptly described, Elizabethans had a significant “capacity to have the sensory imagination triggered by a commonplace abstraction” created through the “range of meanings encoded” in specific multivalent terms.¹¹⁴

The term “foul” had many more linguistic implications than simply a negative demeanor or moral malevolence. For many it inherently meant scent, partially because odor was linked so strongly to marking foul demeanor and sulfuric scented sin. Foul comes from the original Latin *pūs*, meaning to stink, as in putridity. It retained much of this meaning prior to metaphorical attributions on the later English stage, to ideas such as foul play. The use of the term “foul” in modern parlance elicits moral disquiet, the movement beyond an ethical boundary, even the penalty for breaking that moral limit. In the time of Shakespeare, foul usually meant pungent; the term meant odor not in the sense of a specifically stinking item as pungent implies today, but pungent in the moral, ethical, religious, and inter-

¹¹³ For more on the methodology for how to use materialist readings of terms during the era of Shakespeare see, Patricia Parker, *Shakespeare from the Margins: Language, Culture, Context* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996), esp. 20-55.

¹¹⁴ Jonathan Dollimore, *Radical Tragedy: Religion, Ideology, and Power in the Drama of Shakespeare and His Contemporaries* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984), quote on 94. For more on the use of terminological analysis to understand culture in early modern England see the reading of “rude” and “mechanical” within, Patricia Parker, “Rude Mechanicals,” in *Subject and Object in Renaissance Culture*, ed. Margreta De Grazia (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 43-82, the analysis of “fame” and the noise of ill-meaning words within, Kenneth Gross, *Shakespeare's Noise* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001), esp. 88-118, the changing consciousness about terms related to the “world” within, Ayesha Ramachandran, *The Worldmakers: Global Imagining in Early Modern Europe* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2016), esp. 10-32, the “critical semantics” applied to keywords within, Roland Arthur Greene, *Five Words: Critical Semantics in the Age of Shakespeare and Cervantes* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013), esp. 107-142, and the emotional effects of words outside of their meanings within, William Empson, *The Structure of Complex Words* (London: Penguin Books, 1995 [1951]), esp. 19-34.

sensorial sense.¹¹⁵ Thus, when English writers summarized the foul blackamoor or African, they were referencing not only the moral foulness of the African for his paganism, nor simply the foulness of his dark hue, they were directly referencing the African odor that was associated to blackness as both implicitly anti-Christian and increasingly racially coded.¹¹⁶

These references to “foul” were manifold in early modern England. Thomas Heywood’s *The Four Prentices* (1615) described the foulness of an “Aethiop” as a metaphor to becoming the other when wearing burnt cork as blackface.¹¹⁷ As historian Winthrop Jordan summarized to exemplify the intense associations between black bodies and sexuality in early modern England, Francis Bacon’s *New Atlantis* (1627) included the tale of a pious hermit who, “desired to see the Spirit of Fornication; and there appeared to

¹¹⁵ For the definition of “foul” as a scented term, or at least a term with scent included in its synesthetic implications see Natasha Korda’s reading of Falstaff in *Merry Wives of Windsor* (1602) as regarding resistance of women through their placing of Falstaff in a bucket of dirty laundry and then dumping him into the Thames: “This dissatisfaction results in the merry wives quite literally scouring him clean in Act III, when Falstaff is ‘carried in a basket, like a barrow of butcher’s offal’, ‘rammed...in with foul shirts and smocks, socks, foul stockings, greasy napkins’ and ‘the rankest compound of villainous smell that ever offended the nostril.’” Natasha Korda, *Shakespeare's Domestic Economies: Gender and Property in Early Modern England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2002), quotes on 85-86. In *Coriolanus* (1608) and *Timon of Athens* (1606): “Shakespeare and Middleton develop a particular olfactory catalogue of purges and a state of metaphorical asphyxiation that imagine the social and material breakdown of Athens as a residue of volatile, challenging, and breath-taking odors...the play’s connection to the rhetorical domain of plague and its unusual manifestation as a collection of lost breaths, foul smells, and purged airs channel contemporary fears of the noxious effects of aggressive social conflict of a volatile and overcrowded city, not unlike Jacobean London.” Hristomir Stanev, *Sensory Experience and the Metropolis on the Jacobean Stage (1603-1625)* (Farnham: Ashgate Publishing Ltd., 2014), quotes on 160-161.

¹¹⁶ For earlier references to the common appearance of the devil as having dark skin see, Michael Goodich, “Sexuality, Family, and the Supernatural in the Fourteenth Century,” *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 4, 4 (1994): 493-516, esp. 512.

¹¹⁷ Thomas Heywood and Mary Ann Weber Gasior, *The Four Prentices of London: A Critical, Old-Spelling Edition* (New York, Garland, 1980 [1615]), esp. 60. For general analysis of the multivalent meanings of “foul” at the time see, Johnson, *Shakespeare in Africa*, esp. 80-92, and Mangum, *Reflection of Africa*, esp. 41-50.

him a little foul ugly Aethiop.”¹¹⁸ Shakespeare’s *Antony and Cleopatra* (1607) similarly used the olfactory informed reference to portray Cleopatra as a “foul Egyptian” who “hath betrayed” the noble Antony.¹¹⁹ Likewise, the duplicitousness of women was portrayed as “foul and blacker than/ The Night, or sun-burnt African,” in English Bishop Henry King’s poem “The Defense.”¹²⁰ Additionally, Lady Mary Wroth’s *Urania* (1621) involved a complex plot that worked to subvert gender categories through the application of racial embodiment using similar language. Within this intricate tome, the term “foul” was applied to discuss the “inward” immortality of the manipulations of skin color that might affect the categories of nobility that were central to the play.¹²¹

Similar synesthetic use of the term was applied in Shakespeare’s most racially analyzed plays, *Othello* (1603) and *Titus Andronicus* (1594).¹²² Throughout his canon, and especially in these dramas, Shakespeare often explored everyday experience through a mixed style that linked the high culture of literature with the low culture of representative

¹¹⁸ Jordan, *White over Black*, quote on 17.

¹¹⁹ William Shakespeare, “Antony and Cleopatra,” in *The Arden Shakespeare: Complete Works*, edited by Richard Proudfoot (London: Thomson Learning, 2007), quote on 150. For African pretexts within *Antony and Cleopatra* see, Wole Soyinka, “Shakespeare the Living Dramatist,” in *Shakespeare and Race*, Catherine M. S. Alexander and Stanley Wells (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 82-100.

¹²⁰ Henry King, and Lawrence Mason, *The English Poems of Henry King* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1914), quote on 40.

¹²¹ Kim Hall, “‘I Rather Would Wish to be a Black-Moor’: Beauty, Race, and Rank in Lady Mary Wroth’s ‘Urania,’” in *Women, “Race,” and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, ed. Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker (London: Routledge, 1994), 178-194; Mary Wroth, and Simon van de Pass, *The Countesse of Mountgomeries Urania* (London: Augustine Mathewes for John Marriott and John Grismand, 1621), esp. 29-30, 144.

¹²² For the idea that Shakespeare, and Elizabethan drama in general, had an important radical motivation that essentially critiqued power structures by questioning ideologies of religious doctrine and royalism see the essential decentering of the subject within, Dollimore, *Radical Tragedy*, esp. 4-9, and the role of those radical ideas about human nature in contemporary Western culture within, Jan Kott, *Shakespeare our Contemporary* (New York: Norton, 1974).

reality.¹²³ For the famed critic Erich Auerbach, smell was essential in this link. In that vein, the German scholar summarized:

A large number of the elements of mixed style are mentioned or alluded to...in Shakespeare's tragic works. Examples of the portrayal of the physical-creatural are numerous: Hamlet is fat and short of breath (according to another reading he is not fat but hot); Caesar faints from the stench of the mob acclaiming him; Cassio in *Othello* is drunk; hunger and thirst, cold and heat affect tragic characters too; they suffer from the inclemencies of the weather and the ravages of illness...and death, which can be depicted on the level of the pure sublime, here often has its medieval and creatural appearance (skeletons, the smell of decomposition, etc.).¹²⁴

In this tradition, which linked the high and low as a form of new narrative that described and critiqued European culture and royalty, Shakespeare penned *Othello* as a play that questioned and possibly reinforced categories about race, honor, and gender through the trope of the false cuckold.¹²⁵

¹²³ For examples of the linking of high and low culture in early modern theatre see, Don Wayne, "'Pox on Your Distinction!': Humanist Reformation and Deformations in *The Staple of News*," in *Renaissance Culture and the Everyday*, ed. Patricia Fumerton and Simon Hunt (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999), 67-91.

¹²⁴ Erich Auerbach, *Mimesis: The Representation of Reality in Western Literature* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003 [1953]), esp. 201-231, quote on 313. For similar sensory analysis see the reading of *Coriolanus* (1609) through questions of masculinity and the odors of the revolting masses who use their foulness against the elite within, Holly Dugan, "'Coriolanus and the 'Rank-Scented Meinie': Smelling Rank in Early Modern England," in *Masculinity and the Metropolis of Vice, 1550-1650*, ed. Amanda Bailey and Roze Hentschell (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 139-159.

¹²⁵ *Othello* has been interpreted as central to much more than these topics. For an interesting reading of *Othello* as an olfactory metaphor for black weeds as standing in for the invasion of tobacco into early modern England see, Dennis Kezar, "Shakespeare's Addictions," *Critical Inquiry* 30, 1 (2003): 31-62. As Mary Floyd-Wilson has summarized, the play was performed "at a crossroads in the history of ethnological ideas

The essential narrative follows from the coupling of Othello, a Moorish general, and Desdemona, a white Venetian.¹²⁶ The antagonist Iago tricks Othello into believing that Desdemona has committed adultery, thus leading to the final climactic scene wherein Othello murders his perceived adulteress wife.¹²⁷ Scholars have debated the racial contexts of the play since the time of Samuel Taylor Coleridge and the early Shakespearean critics.¹²⁸ Most agree that the play is motivated, but not driven, by a racial conception of Othello that early modern English audiences generally shared.¹²⁹ Thus, when Iago referenced Othello's thoughts of being cuckolded through a synesthetic allusion to foulness

when an emergent racial discourse clashed with the still-dominant classical and medieval geohumoralism." Floyd-Wilson, *English Ethnicity*, quote on 140. For more on the idea that race was more mutable and transitory, as based on climate in discussion of English bodies in North America, even well into the eighteenth century see, Katy Chiles, *Transformable Race: Surprising Metamorphoses in the Literature of Early America* (Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), esp. 31-63.

¹²⁶ For the importance of Venetian Christian hypocrisy and the role of Leo Africanus as possible pre-texts for the tension in the play and the character of Othello, respectively, see, Rosalind Johnson, "Parallels between Othello and the Historical Leo Africanus," *Bim* 18, 70 (1986): 9-34.

¹²⁷ For questions of interiority and virginity see the reading of Desdemona's anatomy within, Howard Marchitello, *Narrative and Meaning in Early Modern England: Browne's Skull and Other Histories* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), esp. 10-38.

¹²⁸ For more on racial complexity in *Othello* see: how both Othello and Desdemona's monstrousness and sin is more important than their race in, Patricia Parker, "Fantasies of Race and Gender: Africa, Othello, and Bringing to Light," in *Women, "Race," and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, ed. Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker (London: Routledge, 1994), 84-100, an analysis of Othello as a civil rather than racial monster through comparisons between concepts of Moors and East Indians of the same era in, Michael Neill, "'Mulattos,' 'Blacks,' and 'Indian Moors': Othello and Early Modern Constructions of Human Difference," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 49, 4 (1998): 361-374, the importance of whiteness to questions of barbarianism and language within, Ian Smith, "Barbarian Errors: Performing Race in Early Modern England," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 49, 2 (1998): 168-186, the expansion of the argument that English identity was constructed off of the linguistic other from Greco-Roman traditions as opposed to modern concepts of the racial other within, Ian Smith, *Race and Rhetoric in the Renaissance: Barbarian Errors* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), esp. 97-121, the importance of nobility to the character of Iago, the frame of the witch-hunt of Othello, and the inherent pre-racial tone of Shakespeare described within, Martin Orkin, "Othello and the 'Plain Face' Of Racism," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 38, 2 (1987): 166-188, and a summary of Othello as a wandering other through insect metaphors, rather than as a racial other, in Phyllis Natalie Braxton, "Othello: The Moor and the Metaphor," *South Atlantic Review* 55, 4 (1990): 1-17.

¹²⁹ For more on Othello as a mixture of geographical otherness rather than any sense of modern racial blackness see, John Gillies, *Shakespeare and the Geography of Difference* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), esp. 24-28, and for Othello as a play about the worldly excess of women and Africans in an increasingly Protestant England see, Korda, *Shakespeare's Domestic Economies*, esp. 114-116.

of Desdemona's possible betrayal he continued to inform early modern England as to the duplicitous scents of foul sensuality: "Ay, there's the point: as, to be bold with you,/ Not to affect many proposed matches/ Of her own clime, complexion, and degree,/ Whereto, we see, in all things nature tends;/ Foh! one may smell in such, a will most rank/ Foul disproportion, thoughts unnatural." When Brabantio, the father of Desdemona, first learned of Othello's wishes upon his daughter he similarly used the olfactory terminology to describe Othello as a "foul thief," who had "enchanted" his daughter with a mixture of African sexuality and implicit tribal witchcraft. He had "practiced on her with foul charms," and "abused her delicate youth with drugs or minerals."¹³⁰ Each reference to "foul" triggered sensations in the English audience that linked the low culture of foul smells with the high culture of using foul to describe morality, further connecting smells to the bodies on stage through the synesthetic hearing of specific terms.¹³¹

¹³⁰ William Shakespeare, "Othello," in *The Arden Shakespeare: Complete Works*, edited by Richard Proudfoot (London: Thomson Learning, 2007), quotes on 933-935, 946-948. Modern scholars must be aware to read *Othello* through the lens of white privilege within the modern academy in order to remain a "reliable narrator" for Othello's tale. Ian Smith, "We Are Othello: Speaking of Race in Early Modern Studies," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 67, 1 (2016): 104-124. For race and sexuality in debates over the racial monstrousness of Othello see: the analysis of material culture and the image of the bed as both an imagined and ocular proof in, Michael Neill, "Unproper Beds: Race, Adultery, and the Hideous in *Othello*," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 40, 4 (1989): 383-412, the importance of celebrating whiteness through discussions of rape in the era of Shakespeare within Arthur Little, *Shakespeare Jungle Fever: National-Imperial Re-Visions of Race, Rape, and Sacrifice* (Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press, 2000), 68-101, the use of darkness of the exterior as a way for Iago to displace his own inner darkness within, Janet Adelman, "Iago's Alter Ego: Race as Projection in *Othello*," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 48, 2 (1997): 125-144, and the importance of homosexual and homosocial tension between Iago and Othello in, Little, "An Essence That's Not Seen," esp. 317-324, and Ben Saunders, "Iago's Clyster: Purgation, Analogy, and the Civilizing Process," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 55, 2 (2004): 148-176.

¹³¹ For material culture as signals of whiteness in *Othello*, regarding the white handkerchief of Desdemona see, Karen Newman, "'And Wash the Ethiop White': Femininity and the Monstrous in *Othello*," in *Shakespeare Reproduced: The Text in History and Ideology*, ed. Jean Howard and Marion O' Connor (New York: Methuen, 1987), 143-162, the idea that Shakespeare was informed by African pre-texts in the writing of *Othello*, with a focus on witchcraft, within, Diana Adesola Mafe, "From Ògún to Othello: (Re)Acquainting Yoruba Myth and Shakespeare's Moor," *Research in African Literatures* 35 (2004): 46-61, and an earlier reading of the "foulness" of Othello as part of the trope of the evil moor within earlier analysis from, Ruth Cowhig, "Blacks in English Renaissance Drama and the role of Shakespeare's *Othello*," in *The Black Presence in English Literature*, ed. David Dabydeen (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1985), 1-25, esp. 10-12.

Titus Andronicus (1594) is a play about violence, race, language, and the role of the barbarian in ancient Rome.¹³² The play's central character, Aaron, is an evil dark-skinned prisoner of the Roman general Titus Andronicus who starts the play returning from conquering the Goths and their barbarian Queen Tamora. After family squabbling and numerous murders, Tamora vows revenge on Titus. Tamora's lover, the Moor Aaron, persuades Tamora's two sons to murder and violently rape Lavinia, the daughter of Titus.¹³³ This scene, one of the most horrific in Shakespeare's catalogue, shapes the plays violent contours, which conclude with Tamora's consumption of her two convicted rapist sons in a pie baked by Titus.¹³⁴

The racial contexts of the play involves the affair between Tamora and Aaron, which produced a mixed-race child that Aaron must keep secret by murdering the midwife and fleeing into the Roman forests. To save his child once captured, Aaron revealed Tamora's plot to destroy Titus's family, and for his honesty is buried to die of starvation. Aaron is undoubtedly an evil character in a violent and tragic play. Scholars have debated the importance of his race to the performance and have generally agreed that his dark hue would have been essential to the play's meaning for early modern spectators.¹³⁵

¹³² For how colonialist texts do harm on the ground see the reading of Titus as an act of violence within, Christopher Tomlin, "Law's Wilderness: The Discourse of English Colonizing, the Violence of Intrusion, and the Failures of American History," in *New World Orders: Violence, Sanction, and Authority in the Colonial Americas*, ed. John Smolenski and Thomas Humphrey (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005), 21-46.

¹³³ For the importance of rape in marking the other and questioning ethnic difference in Shakespeare's canon see, Little, *Shakespeare Jungle Fever*, esp. 25-67.

¹³⁴ For the symbolic role of food in understanding the performative aspects of sensation portrayed on the English stage see, Denise Cole, "Edible Performance: Feasting and Festivity in Early Tudor Entertainment," in *The Senses in Performance*, ed. Sally Banes and André Lepecki (New York: Routledge, 2007), 92-104.

¹³⁵ For more on the racial complexity of *Titus Andronicus*: regarding the use of language to denote barbarianism see, Ian Smith, "Those 'slippery customers': Rethinking Race in *Titus Andronicus*," *Journal of Theatre and Drama* 3 (1997): 45-58; regarding the trope of botanical grafting see, Jean Feerick, "Botanical

Numerous times within the play, Shakespeare references the “foul” actions set in motion by Aaron.¹³⁶ Specifically, when the mutilated Lavinia is discovered, her brother Marcus proclaimed: “O, why should nature build so foul a den,/ Unless the Gods delight in tragedies.”¹³⁷ As Virginia Vaughn has described, the play was based on the second part of Matteo Bandello’s *Novelle* (1554), which tells the story of similar Moorish induced love triangles with parallel levels of intense violence. The story ends with a suicide by the evil Moor when he has accomplished his most dastardly deceits. For Bandello, the moral: “men should not make use of slaves of this sort, for...they are seldom found faithful and are mostly full of all manner of filth and uncleanness and stink at all seasons like buck-goats.”¹³⁸

Tortured Skin upon the Scoured Blackamoore

These foul and increasingly biological African odors were also linguistically tied

Shakespeares: The Racial Logic of Plant Life in *Titus Andronicus*,” *South Central Review* 26, 1-2 (2009): 82-102; regarding the fear of miscegenation and alien whiteness of Tamora see, Royster, “White-Limed Walls,” 432-455, focusing on the racial knowledge of Aaron rather than those defining him racially see, Jeannette White, “‘Is Black so Base a Hue’: Shakespeare’s Aaron and the Politics and Poetics of Race,” *CLA Journal* 40, 3 (1997): 336-366, and regarding the bodies in the play as markers of the barbarian past of England as a pre-text to the idea of barbarian access to language see, Carolyn Sale, “Black Aeneas: Race, English Literary History, and the ‘Barbarous’ Poetics of *Titus Andronicus*,” *Shakespeare Quarterly* 62, 1 (2011): 25-52.

¹³⁶ For more on the importance of embodied experience to Shakespeare, especially concerning the sense of smell in the graveyard scene of *Hamlet* see, David Hillman, “Visceral Knowledge,” in *The Body in Parts: Fantasies of Corporeality in Early Modern Europe*, ed. David Hillman and Carla Mazzio (New York: Routledge, 1997), 81-106.

¹³⁷ William Shakespeare, “*Titus Andronicus*,” in *The Arden Shakespeare: Complete Works*, edited by Richard Proudfoot (London: Thomson Learning, 2007), quote on 1127.

¹³⁸ Virginia Mason Vaughan, *Performing Blackness on English Stages, 1500-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), quotes on 43-44.

through an implicit metonymical and synesthetic link to the folkloric tradition, from roots within Jeremiah 13:23, that one could not “Wash the Blackamoore White.” Originally from a Greek proverb, the idea of not being able to remove black skin became a rhetorical tool for humanist disputants of the sixteenth century. Throughout the sixteenth and seventeenth century, much of Europe applied the phrase to visual art and poetry. Political discourses from the English Civil War used many references to washing blackamoors to describe the evils of different political factions and their vain attempts to usurp power.¹³⁹

The implicit links between washing and the black colored skin of the racial other grew to encompass more than simply a visual metaphor. The implication of washing tied the blackamoor not only to a darker hue, but to a murkier scent, a scent linked to blackness that throughout the Medieval Era had possibly meant the presence of the devil, or at least the marker of sin on earth, and was increasingly being used to define a separate and pungent race. English emblem book author, poet, and illustrator Geoffrey Whitney applied the metaphor both visually and textually in his *A Choice of Emblemes* (1586). Beneath a heading where an image of a dark-skinned man in a tub was being washed by two fully clothed and clean white men, Whitney summarized: “Leave of with paine, the blackamore to skowre,/ With washinge ofte, and wiping more then due.”¹⁴⁰ Pamphlet author and courtesy essayist Joseph Swetnam expanded the metaphor to describe the fault of marrying a widow compared to the fruitlessness of trying to wash a blackamoor white in his

¹³⁹ For examples see, John Goodwin and George Glover, *Hybristodikai: The Obstructours of Justice* (London: Henry Cripps and Lodowick Lloyd, 1649), esp. 67-70, John Cook, *Monarchy, No Creature of Gods Making* (Waterford in Ireland: Peter de Pienne, 1651), esp. 88-98, and the history of the proverb and extensions of intense racial tropes into soap advertising of the modern era within, Massing, “From Greek Proverb to Soap Advert,” 180-201.

¹⁴⁰ Geoffrey Whitney, *A Choice of Emblems and Other Devises: For the Most Part Gathered Out of Sundrie Writers* (Leyden: Francis Raphelengius, 1586), quote on 57.

Araignment of Lewd, Idle, and Unconstant Women (1615). He summarized that in taking on a widow the “unfortunate” husband must make the woman “forget her former corrupt and disordered behaviour, the which if thou take upon thee to doe, thou hadst even as good undertake to wash a Blackamore white.”¹⁴¹

The fable was re-born from ancient roots. The return of the Greeks and Romans to literary prominence ignited interest in the Aesop fable and its derivative proverb in the Old Testament. During the mid-seventeenth century, the use of this metaphor took on new intensity. The proportional growth in the use of the allegory is evidence of a growing racial sentiment in England that marked the inability to wash away black skin and scent. Welsh poet George Herbert’s *Remains* (1652) summarized the metaphor in a list meant to convey the idea of certainty to English audiences. He noted, “Of a pigs taile you can never make a good shaft/ The Bathe of the Blackamoor hath sworne not to whiten.”¹⁴² English Puritan Henry Burton’s *Truth’s Triumph over Trent* (1629) applied the metaphor in a Reformation text to describe the inherent vanity of Aristotelian scholars who sided with the Counter-Reformation. He stated, “They but wash the Blackamore, when they thinke to have Aristotle to be our adversary.”¹⁴³ The use of the metaphor in such religious and rhetorical battles increased the presence of the image and text of the washing of the blackamoor into the general public. Michael Drayton’s poetic reimagining of *King Lear* similarly applied the metaphor in 1605. He relayed, through the words of the neglected Cordelia: “As easy

¹⁴¹ Joseph Swetnam, *The Araignment of Lewd, Idle, Froward, and Unconstant Women* (London: George Purslowe for Thomas Archer, 1615), quotes on 59-60.

¹⁴² George Herbert and Barnabas Oley, *Herbert's Remains, or, Sundry Pieces of That Sweet Singer of the Temple* (London: Timothy Garthwait, 1652), quotes on 154-157.

¹⁴³ Henry Burton, *Truth's Triumph over Trent, or, The Great Gulfe Betweene Sion and Babylon* (London: Mich. Sparke, 1629), quote on 250-252.

is it for the Blackamoore,/ To wash the tawny colour from his skin,/ Which all oppose against the course of nature,/ As I am able to forget my father.”¹⁴⁴

The constant and repetitive assertion of the fable implies the moment when race became something increasingly certain in the English mind. English nonconformist cleric Anthony Burgess’s *Spiritual Refining* (1664) offered a long discourse on the blackamoor metaphor and the possibilities of baptism, cleanliness, and purity. In doing, he continued the wider cultural project of defining race through his use of the metaphor to discuss the very inability to baptize or clean the dark-skinned body. Burgess summarized: “Doe not thou then rest in thy Baptism, doe not presume upon that; for unlesse thereby thou art taught to loath thy self for sinne: unlesse thou art washed from filthy sinnes and lustfull wayes, this washing is no more to thee, than the washing of a Blackamoor, which leaves him as deformed as he was.”¹⁴⁵ This use of the metaphor works in two ways. Firstly, to assert the hollowness of believing that baptism, without an unsoiled life, would enter one into heaven. And second, and more subversive and subconscious, the common sense proclamation of race through the inability of any blackamoor to achieve religious cleanliness.

Religion was vital in the making of race as a deeply scented phenomenon, especially as blackamoors often appeared in numerous plays and literature as stereotypical references to demons and devils. Productions commonly used the figure of a Moorish boy

¹⁴⁴ Michael Drayton and Thomas Heywood, *The True Chronicle History of King Leir, and His Three Daughters, Gonorill, Ragan, and Cordella* (London: Simon Stafford for John Wright, 1605), quotes on 18-19.

¹⁴⁵ Anthony Burgess, *Spiritual Refining: Or, A Treatise of Grace and Assurance* (London: A. Miller for Thomas Underhill, 1652), quotes on 377-378. The pamphlet *The Accomplish'd Sea-Man's Delight* (1686) also included: “I will assure him, that he shall loose his labour, and as soon may he wash a *Blackamore* white, as to make such a needle as that turn.” Anonymous, *The Accomplish'd Sea-Mans Delight* (London: Benj. Harris, 1686), quotes on 127-129.

to tie the devil to blackness. In Richard Carpenter's *The Pragmatical Jesuit* (1665), a "Blackamoor Boy" was thus the puppet of the pungent Lucifer who worked to subvert London politics.¹⁴⁶ In Antonio Torquemada's *The Spanish Mandevile of Miracles* (1600) earlier Englishpersons read of the blackamoor disguised demon who encountered an esteemed Spaniard, Don Anthonio de la Cueva, in a darkened Spanish chamber. As the nobleman rested:

he perceaved come from under the bed close by the bed side an arme and hand, seeming to be of a naked Blackamoore: which taking the candell, turned it downwards in the candlestick and put it forth, and at that very instant, offered to come into the bed to him, which he endeavoring to resist, the blacke Moore, or rather devill, grasped him by the armes...beginning to wrestle and strugle together with such force, and making so great a noyse, that the servaunts of the house awaked, who comming into the Chamber to knowe what the matter was, found Don Anthonio de la Cueva alone, in such a heate and sweating, as though he had newly come out of a Stew or Hothouse, who declared unto them the particularitie of this accident, and withall, that so soone as they began to enter into the Chamber, the vision untwynged himselfe from him, so that he knew not what was becom thereof.¹⁴⁷

¹⁴⁶ Richard Carpenter, *A New Play Call'd The Pragmatical Jesuit New-Leven'd A Comedy* (London: N. R., 1665), quotes on 2-3. The associations between devils, smells, and blackness had a considerably long trajectory. For the fifth century monk John Cassian, who envisioned a demon as a black boy or woman who was both pungent and deformed, and would often shoot fiery and pungent arrows of sulfur, see, Cohen, *French Encounter*, esp. 13-15, and John Cassian, and Boniface Ramsey, *John Cassian, the Conferences* (New York: Paulist Press, 1997), esp. 61, 73, and 96.

¹⁴⁷ Antonio de Torquemada, Lewis Lewkenor, and Ferdinand Walker, *The Spanish Mandevile of Miracles* (London: James Roberts for Edmund Matts, 1600), quotes on 72-74. For more on the roots of the link between

This story represents the transnational linking of race to the idea of this inherent dirtiness and sinfulness of dark skin, which often included implicit sodomy. The intense racial marking applied in Lewis Machin and Gervase Markham's *The Dumble Knight* (1608) similarly represents such a reiterative semantic manacle between dirt and blackness. The authors used the pungent term "sooty" to describe resistance to arranged marriage from Philocles, the dumb knight. Pleading to the King of Cyprus, the protagonist Philocles summarized disdain for the proposed bride, "But not me my thrice royall soveraigne./ I'll rather wed a sooty blackamoore,/ A Leaper, monster, Incubus or hagge,/ A wretch deformd in nature, loath'd of men/ Then her that hath bemonster'd my pure soule,/ Her scorne and pride had almost lost her life,/ A maid so faulted, seldome proves' good wife."¹⁴⁸ These secularizing voices of the stage, yearly parades of Africans alongside the Thames, and emerging science drove the English core to believe in the pungency of Africans as a marker of biological inheritance and inferiority during the seventeenth century.¹⁴⁹

Lord Mayor's Pageants paraded Africans throughout the streets of London as a marker of English imperial superiority throughout the seventeenth century.¹⁵⁰ These

blackamoors, sodomy, and threats to the Catholic body see the oft-told tale of Origen in, Samuel Clarke, *A Mirrour or Looking-Glasse Both for Saints and Sinners* (London: Tho. Newberry, 1654), esp. 170-173, and another traditional of using the blackamoor as a puppet or association of the devil within the temptation of eleventh century St. Bernard of Clairvaux described in Pedro de Ribadeneyra, *The Lives of Saints, with Other Feasts of the Year, According to the Roman Calendar* (London: B. S., 1730), esp. 194-195.

¹⁴⁸ Lewis Machin and Gervase Markham, *The Dumble Knight* (London: Nicholas Okes, 1608), quotes on 19-20.

¹⁴⁹ For the merging of black persons and black associated objects as increasingly tautological during the seventeenth century see the "chromatic materiality" applied in the reading of the character of the Moor within, Ian Smith, "White Skin, Black Masks: Racial Cross-Dressing on the Early Modern Stage," *Renaissance Drama* 32 (2003): 33-68.

¹⁵⁰ For general history of the construction of nationalism within these pageants as a historiographical corrective to an over-focused analysis of texts, rather than performances, in the Early Modern Era see, Tracey Hill, *Pageantry and Power: A Cultural History of the Early Modern Lord Mayor's Show, 1585-1639*

African bodies marched with markers of a jungle past, including lions, giraffes, and elephants, which defined their civilizations in the Great Chain of Being as pre-modern and sub-human.¹⁵¹ Many times, scent was inherently associated to these marches through the floral attributes of the floats on parade. Race construction was informed by these Pageants that occurred between 1585 and 1692.¹⁵² African figures would ride on many different African animals, but they were never allowed to speak and mostly just represented their own subservience in the face of English eminence in the modern world of empire, racialization, and exchange.¹⁵³

In a letter to Sir Robert Southwell in 1677, English scientist William Petty summarized significant differences between different types of men based on numerous traits, including their “natural manners” and the “internall Qualities of their Minds.” Borrowing from the biblical “scale of creatures” applied by Sir Matthew Hale in *Primitive Origination of Mankind* (1677), Petty scaled different species of men by their natural physical attributes and their internal dispositions.¹⁵⁴ Such scientific assurances of race

(Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2010), esp. 4-6.

¹⁵¹ For monogenetic racialization and the Great Chain of Being see the reading of links between sentimentalism and abolitionism within, Markman Ellis, *The Politics of Sensibility: Race, Gender, and Commerce in the Sentimental Novel* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996), esp. 65-66.

¹⁵² For references to African symbols in Lord Mayor’s Shows of the late seventeenth century see, F. W. Fairholt, *Lord Mayors’ Pageants: Being Collections Towards a History of These Annual Celebrations, with Specimens of the Descriptive Pamphlets Published by the City Poets* (London: Percy Society by T. Richards, 1843), esp. 66-67, 83, and 102.

¹⁵³ For the role of blackface and these portrayals to support imperial economies see, Virginia Mason Vaughan, *Performing Blackness*, esp. 32-34, Barthelemy, *Black Face, Maligned Race*, esp. 46-47, and David Worrall, *Harlequin Empire: Race, Ethnicity and the Drama of the Popular Enlightenment* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2007), esp. 34-38.

¹⁵⁴ William Petty and Henry William Edmund Petty, *The Petty Papers; Some Unpublished Writings of Sir William Petty* (London: Constable & Co.; Boston and New York, Houghton Mifflin Co., 1927), esp. 31-32. Although, Hale had asserted the monogenetic roots of mankind by describing a historical breaking apart of the world in the time after the flood, Matthew Hale, *The Primitive Origination of Mankind, Considered and Examined According to the Light of Nature* (London: William Godbid for William Shrowsbery, 1677), esp.

proposed by the early Enlightenment increasingly melded with previous conceptions of the stage and from the pulpit that black bodies smelled. This violent olfactory discourse perpetuated a triangle trade in racism that fed a colonial mindset that buttressed an increasingly profitable slave system.¹⁵⁵

The image of the African as an olfactory other in travel narratives of the early English empire could not help but transfer into the plays of the early modern English stage as the polymath writers of the Globe, Phoenix, and Rose read travel narratives and wondered of the world beyond their curtained halls. It was here, in these halls, where not present African bodies were marked in the English imaginary as stenchful to the English masses who could afford the revels of the English stage, with their painted African masques, sulfuric fireworks, and olfactory references to African bodies. This turned to the science of Petty, and the later linguistic arrangements applied by Linnaeus and Buffon. These secular ideals justified English advances in the slave trade, through making the other as a colorful figure with stained skin, vibrant odors, vitalized dances, and queer noises. These slave trade developments, though small compared to Spain and Portugal prior to 1650, increased rapidly, in part justified through the coloration of the black body as a pungent racial symbol and not a cultural or climatological anomaly.¹⁵⁶

176-190.

¹⁵⁵ For the justifications for slavery through the creation of core ideologies about labor see, Abigail Leslie Swingen, *Competing Visions of Empire: Labor, Slavery, and the Origins of the British Atlantic Empire* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2015), esp. 5-8, and the role of race in supplanting earlier categories of gender as socially dominant in English ideology within, Susan Dwyer Amussen, *Caribbean Exchanges: Slavery and the Transformation of English Society, 1640-1700* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2007), esp. 232-235.

¹⁵⁶ For the rise in literature about Africa during the eighteenth century as a justification for the profits of the slave trade see, Anthony Barker, *The African Link: British Attitudes to the Negro in the Era of the Atlantic Slave Trade, 1550-1807* (London: F. Cass, 1978), esp. 22-26, 194-196.

The smell of the African body is an overburdened imaginary.¹⁵⁷ The odor of African bodies was rarely sensed by those exacerbating upon the trope in early modern England.¹⁵⁸ The acidity was rarely encountered by the gourmands of Fleet Street or in the gardens of Parliament. Rather, the odor of African bodies was constructed through the ear by word of mouth, through the eye by the spectacle of “Africans” as a darkened other on a stenchful stage, and through encounters with exotic sensations deemed African in London parades.¹⁵⁹

The raw material of cultural ethnography was sent from the periphery to the core.¹⁶⁰ English writers then took that raw material and coded it as stereotype for the consumption of the English masses. For all their genius, these writers took a vast and diverse ethnographic corpus from the likes of Richard Hakluyt, Leo Africanus, and Samuel Purchas and created flat racial stereotypes necessary for theatrical production. These colonialist productions entered racism into a vast and increasingly scientific Republic of

¹⁵⁷ For the general shifting from particulars to universals in the language of conquest see, Stephen Greenblatt, “Learning to Curse: Aspects of Linguistic Colonialism in the Sixteenth Century,” in *First Images of America: The Impact of the New World on the Old*, ed. Fredi Chiappelli (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976), 561-580.

¹⁵⁸ For the “magic of Enlightenment” as the use of universalizing state language to assert controls see, Michael Taussig, *The Nervous System* (New York: Routledge, 1992), esp. 8-10, the idea of the “magic” of the state applied in, Pierre Bourdieu, Patrick Champagne, Rémi Lenoir, Franck Poupeau, Marie-Christine Rivière, and David Fernbach, *On the State: Lectures at the Collège De France, 1989-1992* (Cambridge; Malden, MA: Polity, 2014), esp. 8-12, references to the importance of odor in asserting this “magic” in Michael Taussig, *The Magic of the State* (New York: Routledge, 1997), 19-23, and Michael Taussig, *What Color Is the Sacred?* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009), esp. 109-110, 148.

¹⁵⁹ For the African body as a medically inferior construct in the twentieth century see, Alexander Butchart, *The Anatomy of Power: European Constructions of the African Body* (London: Zed Books, 1998), and for the importance of deconstructing these portrayals of the African body as medically inferior and animal see, Barbara Thompson, “The African Female Body in the Cultural Imagination,” in *Black Womanhood: Images, Icons, and Ideologies of the African Body*, ed. Barbara Thompson and Ifi Amadiume (Hanover, NH: Hood Museum of Art, Dartmouth College in Association with University of Washington Press, 2008), 27-48.

¹⁶⁰ For the use of core ideals about Africa as secondary to, but also informing, English concerns over the conquest and settlement of the New World see, Emily Bartels, “Othello and Africa: Postcolonialism Reconsidered,” *WMQ* 54, 1 (Jan 1997): 45-64.

Letters.¹⁶¹ This horrendous triangle trade thereafter perpetuated throughout the Atlantic World through a racially informed slave system supported by popular beliefs of olfactory inferiority.¹⁶²

The Proboscian Dialectic: African Bodies and the Master's Nose

As the critic Michael Foss noted in *Undreamed Shores* (1974): "Poetry guided the spirit of discovery as strongly as the compass."¹⁶³ Europeans entered the Atlantic in large numbers during the era of settlement educated by a fragrant conception they had learned through popular culture and literature; that African bodies, imagined into existence, smelled pungent. In the engraving "The Rabbits" of 1792, such a core ideology was already quite virulent. The piece included an African man selling rabbits on a street corner of London. The print portrays a white woman disgusted by the stink of the rabbits. In her confrontation with the Mungo in the portrait, Mungo as a racialized term for black men deemed forward in Britain of the era, she seemed astonished to hear that: "If Blacke Man take you by Leg so – you smell too." This wording can entail that all that the black man touches, in a disgustingly inverse formulation of a dark Midas, would become noxious.¹⁶⁴

¹⁶¹ For another Shakespearean pretext for colonial advancement, into the East Indies through the control on terms regarding miscegenation and the "changeling," see, Margo Hendricks, "'Obscured by Dreams': Race, Empire, and Shakespeare's *A Midsummer Night's Dream*," *Shakespeare Quarterly* 47, 1 (1996): 37-60.

¹⁶² For a comparative analysis of the timing of race construction, as not clarified until well after 1700, see, C. H. Nightingale, "Before Race Mattered: Geographies of the Color Line in Early Colonial Madras and New York," *American Historical Review* 113, 1 (2008): 48-71.

¹⁶³ Michael Foss, *Undreamed Shores: England's Wasted Empire in America* (New York: Scribner, 1975), quote on 11. For the importance of different semiotic constructions of the self and other as causal in European conquests see, Tzvetan Todorov, *The Conquest of America: The Question of the Other* (New York: Harper & Row, 1984), esp. 248-249.

¹⁶⁴ For a reading of "The Rabbits" see, Gretchen Gerzina, *Black London: Life before Emancipation* (New

If not so overtly read, at the very least, the engraving portrays Africans as living in a much more pungent territory than the white women of London with their snowy dogs and blanced corsets.¹⁶⁵

The ideas of olfactory social construction central to this project do not denote that the smells of African bodies were not perceived by English noses. Rather, smells grew out of an imaginary synecdoche that was later introduced to the linguistic episteme as symbolic and subsequently informed the biological function of the colonial sensorium. Language created the sensory experience of smelling through a vast and multivalent semiotic system that incorporated ideas of blackness from religion, race, and other European cultural traditions to mark the African as stinking.¹⁶⁶ This was not a forced sensory skill, every colonist vehemently smelling the African as scented. Rather, the sin of racist semantics marked Africans as scented, thereafter modifying the everyday perceptions of European noses to smell Africans as a separate race.¹⁶⁷

Scottish translator John Ogilby's disseminations on specific African nations and their racialized traits exemplify how colonial accounts took on these scented core ideologies through olfactory pre-texts. Ogilby's *Africa* (1670) described a group of African

Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1995), esp. 10-11.

¹⁶⁵ For a reading of the sensory associations of the Mungo trope as critiquing the continuance of the slave trade through the art of opera see, Dorothy Couchman, "'Mungo Everywhere': How Anglophones Heard Chattel Slavery," *Slavery & Abolition* 36, 4 (2015): 704-720.

¹⁶⁶ For Caliban in *The Tempest* as a colonialist pre-text used to justify white imperialism see, Thomas Cartelli, "Prospero in Africa: *The Tempest* as Colonialist Text and Pretext," in *Shakespeare Reproduced: The Text in History and Ideology*, ed. Jean Howard and Marion O' Connor (New York: Methuen, 1987), 99-115.

¹⁶⁷ For other pre-texts in the colonial advancement in North America used to make Native Americans speak what the English wanted them to speak see, Joyce Chaplin, *Subject Matter: Technology, the Body, and Science on the Anglo-American Frontier, 1500-1676* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2001), and Jonathan Gil Harris, "Introduction: Forms of Indography," in *Indography: Writing the "Indian" in Early Modern England*, Jonathan Gil Harris (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), 1-22.

peoples living on an island south of Ethiopia as “low of Stature, with short Curl'd Hair like Wool...they smell very ranck, when...warm; they are by nature barbarous, cruel, and revengeful.”¹⁶⁸ This analysis, informed through the core pronouncements of African scents “by nature,” an early polygenetic addition to the general understanding of the monogenetic “natural infection” that caused blackness in George Best’s narrative of African travels in 1578, perpetuated into later colonial analyses of both cultural difference and racial hierarchies.¹⁶⁹

Such olfactory complexity did not simply judge Africans as other, but described many enemies of Britain as pungent in the grand imperial game. In the collected articles of Ned Ward’s *The London Spy* (1703), which offered the hatred of nearly all odors that travelers encountered in heterogeneous English markets, readers were granted the summary of the smell of Spaniards: “for they Stink as strong of Garlick as a *Polonian* Sausage.”¹⁷⁰ In the *London Magazine* of 1750 the idea that African bodies smelled continued to grow as part of such an additive hierarchy of these numerous enemies for the emerging British Empire. An anonymous author declared: “the people called Negroes” are the “most remarkably distinct from the rest of the human species....a great difference between Negroes and all other Blacks, both in Africa and the East Indies, lies in this, that the former

¹⁶⁸ John Ogilby, *Africa: Being an Accurate Description of the Regions of Ægypt, Barbary, Lybia, and Billedulgerid, the land of Negroes, Guinee, Æthiopia and the Abyssines* (London: Tho. Johnson, 1670), quotes on 612-613. For how metropolitan culture can be transmitted to peripheral colonies as patterns of domination see, Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London: Routledge, 1992).

¹⁶⁹ For Best’s quote see the analysis in, Karen Newman, “‘And Wash the Ethiop White’: Femininity and the Monstrous in *Othello*,” in *Shakespeare Reproduced: The Text in History and Ideology*, ed. Jean Howard and Marion F. O’Connor (New York: Methuen, 1987), 143-162, esp. 146-147, and Hall, *Things of Darkness*, 11-12.

¹⁷⁰ Edward Ward, *The London-Spy: Compleat, in Eighteen-Parts* (London: J. How, 1703), quote on 67.

smell most abominably when they sweat, whereas the latter have no bad smell even when they are sweating.”¹⁷¹

In a long discourse on the classifications of all the peoples, plants, and animals of the world, British geographers Daniel Fenning and Joseph Collyer’s *New System of Geography* (1765) continued constructing the hierarchies of smell through his descriptions of the Hottentots of South Africa specifically through what “renders them...disagreeable.” These inherently defined traits included: “their woolly hair to be matted together with fat and dirt; their offensive smell, arising from their uncleanly customs; and their abominable lousiness.”¹⁷² Throughout the long eighteenth century, descriptions of cultural traits of using grease and oils to cover bodies started to take on increasingly racial tones that melded pungent grease in hair with biological qualities.¹⁷³

These olfactory classifications had made their way to the colonies from the London of Shakespeare and Dekker. Part of this dissemination came from the general homogenization of the metropole, which included a shifting of odor upon the foreigner, African, and colonial. As Winthrop Jordan noted in *White Over Black* (1968), colonial writers based racial beliefs on metropolitan understandings of the religious definitions of sin, noble bloodlines, and emerging racialized medical documentation.¹⁷⁴ Accordingly,

¹⁷¹ Peter Fryer, *Staying Power: The History of Black People in Britain* (London: Pluto Press, 1984), quote on 152-153.

¹⁷² Daniel Fenning and Joseph Collyer, *A New System of Geography, or a General Description of the World* (London: Crowder, 1765), quote on 364.

¹⁷³ For colonial desires to assert whiteness as a marker of British inheritance and thus property rights and imperial superiority see the analysis of Irish Catholics in the West Indies within, Jenny Shaw, *Everyday Life in the Early English Caribbean: Irish, Africans, and the Construction of Difference* (Athens, University of Georgia Press, 2013).

¹⁷⁴ For the importance of Jordan’s work for the analysis of race in America see, Shore, “The Enduring Power of Racism,” 195-226, an expansion of Jordan’s work into the methods of race construction in the Atlantic World through Protestantism within, Kidd, *Forging of Races*, esp. 9-25, the reviews of recent work on

writers from French, English, and Iberian colonies all summarized, through an increasingly racialized Republic of Letters, the intense smell of the African body and associated odors of various slave cultures.¹⁷⁵

Borrowing from earlier pre-texts, the Enlightenment informed the colonies to order the world through many of these universalizing concepts of race. These colonial writers, even those traveling to encounter actual, rather than imagined, African bodies were increasingly virulent in their racist sentimentalities. Informed by the previous two centuries' emergent attribution of blackness to odor as something other than culturally created, these new colonial writers offered little objectivity to their racist ethnographies.¹⁷⁶

Throughout the Early Modern Era, beliefs about natural philosophy that permeated ideas of natural law turned into the idea of human rights, civil liberties inherently determined by the segregation of who was considered able to access those privileges.¹⁷⁷

anatomical observations and religion explored within, Craig Koslofsky, "Knowing Skin in Early Modern Europe, C. 1450-1750," *History Compass* 12, 10 (2014): 794-806, the specific contexts of anatomical observations and their role in racial science explored within, Andrew Curran, *The Anatomy of Blackness: Science & Slavery in an Age of Enlightenment* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2011), esp. 167-215, and the studies of skin color in the Royal Society that created debates on monogenetic racial ideals of Robert Boyle within, Cristina Malcolmson, *Studies of Skin Color in the Early Royal Society Boyle, Cavendish, Swift* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2013), esp. 1-64.

¹⁷⁵ For early Iberian contributions to racial discourse see, A. J. R. Russell-Wood, "Before Columbus: Portugal's African Prelude to the Middle Passage and Contribution to Discourse on Race and Slavery," in *Race, Discourse, and the Origin of the Americas: A New World View*, ed. Vera Lawrence Hyatt and Rex Nettleford (Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995), 134-168.

¹⁷⁶ For the idea that animalization through class relationships was more important than race in the making of early labor systems in the Anglo-Atlantic see, Simon Newman, *A New World of Labor: The Development of Plantation Slavery in the British Atlantic* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), esp. 245-248. In his possibly satirical discussions of the similarities between Orangutans and the Pygmies of Africa, English natural philosopher Edward Tyson had earlier discussed the senses of hearing and smelling as essentially the same in both figures, further linking the perceived lack of humanity of the African Pygmy with animal intelligence and culture. Tyson, *Orang-Outang*, esp. 53.

¹⁷⁷ Valentin Mudimbe, "Romanus Pontifex (1454) and the Expansion of Europe," in *Race, Discourse, and the Origin of the Americas: A New World View*, ed. Vera Lawrence Hyatt and Rex Nettleford (Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995), 58-65; Justin Smith, *Nature, Human Nature, and Human Difference: Race in Early Modern Philosophy* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2015), esp. 18-25.

Those who followed the proto-evolutionary ideas of the Great Chain of Being, the liberalism of John Locke, and the body politic of Thomas Hobbes defined civilization as inherently surpassing and contrasting to forms of savagery that were susceptible to spectacles of the senses that Europeans believed they had moved past.¹⁷⁸ Through what Stephanie Martens calls an “aboriginalism” that focuses upon the “Far-Away-Long-Ago Fallacy,” many early modern scholars defined the other as part of a historical world already transcended.¹⁷⁹ European colonists often applied this philosophy of the past by asserting ideals of cultural evolution through analyzing Africans and Native Americans as valuable for the study of the European past.¹⁸⁰ This new hierarchy of mankind was based on sensory perceptions related to the ability of non-Europeans to construct new machines and advance technology. It was believed that cultures that applied too much of their animal and acute

¹⁷⁸ For the increasingly ethnographic tone that marked indigenous populations as part of a culture that existed outside of European norms, essentially within a foreign and past world of human agency, see the readings of Theodor de Bry and John White within, Campbell, *Wonder & Science*, esp. 64-67.

¹⁷⁹ Stephanie Martens, *The Americas in Early Modern Political Theory: States of Nature and Aboriginality* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), quotes on 32-35; Richard Ashcraft, “Leviathan Triumphant: Thomas Hobbes and the Politics of Wild Men,” in *The Wild Man Within; An Image in Western Thought from the Renaissance to Romanticism*, ed. Edward Dudley and Maximillian Novak (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1973), 141-182; P. J. Marshall and Glyndwr Williams, *The Great Map of Mankind: Perceptions of New Worlds in the Age of Enlightenment* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1982), esp. 204-222; Antonello Gerbi, *The Dispute of the New World: The History of a Polemic, 1750-1900* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1973), esp. 325-441; Susanne Lettow, “Generation, Genealogy, and Time: The Concept of Reproduction from *Histoire Naturelle* to *Naturphilosophie*,” in *Reproduction, Race, and Gender in Philosophy and the Early Life Sciences*, ed. Susanne Lettow (Albany: State University of New York, 2014), 21-44; Christopher Loar, *Political Magic: British Fictions of Savagery and Sovereignty, 1650-1750* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2014), esp. 51-55, 193-194; Peter Burke, “America and the Rewriting of World History,” in *America in European Consciousness, 1493-1750*, ed. Karen Kupperman (Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Va. by the University of North Carolina Press, 1995), 33-51. Native Americans were specifically made homologous to previous classical peoples from the Old World who had been transcended through European conceptions of progress. Karen Kupperman, *Indians and English: Facing Off in Early America* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2000), esp. 95-102.

¹⁸⁰ Frank Lestringant, *Mapping the Renaissance World: The Geographical Imagination in the Age of Discovery* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994), esp. 58-64; Anthony Pagden, *European Encounters with the New World: From Renaissance to Romanticism* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), esp. 148-152.

senses would make a nation less capable of building new technology.¹⁸¹ Such a conception informed the liberalism of Locke to assert the “waste” of the New World and African territories as justification for the conquest of North America and the profits of Africa.¹⁸²

The Jamaican official Edward Long’s *History of Jamaica* (1774) took on the ideal of scented African bodies as a racial inheritance that trapped Africans in such an animal past, noting especially his reading of many of these Enlightenment racial hierarchies and categorizations of cultural evolution. Long’s analysis described different African peoples: “covering of wool, like the bestial fleece,” the “roundness of their eyes,” the “black colour of the lice which infect their bodies,” and a “bestial or fetid smell, which they all have in a greater or less degree; the Congo’s, Arada’s, Quaqua’s, and Angola’s, particularly the latter, who are likewise the most stupid of the Negro race, are the most offensive; and those of Senegal (who are distinguished from other herds by greater acuteness of understanding and disposition) have the least noxious odour.”¹⁸³ Long separated his conception of the civilized or malleable nature of African nations by how pungent he believed their scents. However, his analysis of difference among African peoples was mostly a brief aside for planter indulgence. Long essentially homogenized African peoples into a single race

¹⁸¹ Michael Adas, *Machines As the Measure of Men: Science, Technology, and Ideologies of Western Dominance* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1989), esp. 122, 315, 397.

¹⁸² Nagamitsu Miura, *John Locke and the Native Americans: Early English Liberalism and Its Colonial Reality* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2013), esp. 47-74; Ann Talbot, *"The Great Ocean of Knowledge": The Influence of Travel Literature on the Work of John Locke* (Leiden: Brill, 2010), esp. 30-44.

¹⁸³ Edward Long, *The History of Jamaica, or, General Survey of the Ancient and Modern State of That Island With Reflections on Its Situation, Settlements, Inhabitants, Climate, Products, Commerce, Laws, and Government* (London: T. Lowndes, 1774), quotes on 352-353. For a similar articulation of “The black color and hair of the Negroes, thick lips, flat nose, crispy woolly hair, and rank smell,” see the Scottish Enlightenment philosopher Lord Kames quoted in, Simon Gikandi, *Slavery and the Culture of Taste* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2011), quote on 227.

through summarizing that the “scent in...them is so excessively strong, especially when their bodies are warmed either by exercise or anger, that it continues in places where they have been near a quarter of an hour.”¹⁸⁴

Long was so puzzled by the odor emanating from African bodies, which he could never fully relate to the back-breaking work of the tropical sugar field and arduous rum economy, that he asserted African peoples in Jamaica were confused by the odor as well. He attributed the African origin tale of the goat among some nations, articulated by Willem Bosman during the seventeenth century, as a way certain groups explained their pungent bodies. Long summarized the tale of a female spirit who anointed African bodies with an odor to attract goats for sustenance. When the African nation she daubed with the perfume asked for more of the fragrance, she became incensed and, in her deceitful manner, “with a box of very foetid mixture...communicated it to their posterity; and to this day, they remain ignorant of the trick put upon them, but value themselves on possessing the genuine perfume; and are so anxious to preserve it undiminished, that they very carefully avoid the rain, and every thing that might possibly impair the delicious odor.”¹⁸⁵ Here, though prejudicial, the Jamaican surveyor portrayed African odor as an inherent cultural survival that slaves believed connected them to their spiritual past.

Long continued his racialized digest, regarding that the “rancid exhalation, for which so many of the Negroes are remarkable does not seem to proceed from uncleanness, nor the quality of their diet.” He focused on a specific anecdote:

¹⁸⁴ Long, *History of Jamaica*, quote on 353.

¹⁸⁵ Long, *History of Jamaica*, quotes on 425-426. For the belief that disparagement of African religions, especially in Senegambia, informed the conception of Africans as a lesser race throughout the Early Modern Era see, Peter Mark, “Fetishers, ‘Marybuckles’ and the Christian Norm: European Images of Senegambians and Their Religions, 1550-1760,” *African Studies Review* 23, 2 (Sep., 1980): 91-99.

I remember a lady, whose waiting-maid, a young Negroe girl, had it to a very disagreeable excess. As she was a favorite servant, her mistress took great pains, and the girl herself spared none, to get rid of it. With this view, she constantly bathed her body twice a day, and abstained wholly from salt-fish, and all sorts of rank food. But the attempt was similar to washing the Black-a-moor white; and, after a long course of endeavors to no purpose, her mistress found there was no remedy but to change her for another attendant, somewhat less odoriferous.¹⁸⁶

Long's text exemplifies two aspects of the discourse of African odors in the Atlantic littoral. Firstly, subconsciously attributing his own belief in racial odors to a metaphor that ironically was partially the cause of those very beliefs, and, secondly noticing how a slave woman could possibly manipulate her own scents to free her purposefully stinking body from a master.¹⁸⁷

Like with many English travelers and surveyors, many French scholars of the Enlightenment era, specifically applying the doctrine of universalism, created similarly strict racial hierarchies.¹⁸⁸ Though often monogenetic, the idea of universal humanity also

¹⁸⁶ Long, *History of Jamaica*, quotes on 425-426. For importance of goats, and their attraction to odors, in the origin stories of a Guinea nation encountered by Bosman in the late 1680s and 1690s see, Willem Bosman and G. Brown Goode, *A New and Accurate Description of the Coast of Guinea, Divided into the Gold, the Slave, and the Ivory Coasts* (London: James Knapton and Dan. Midwinter, 1705), esp. xiii-xiv, 237-239.

¹⁸⁷ For female manipulation of the slave system, especially through the idea of "elite concubinage," see, Meleisa Ono-George, "'Washing the Blackamoor White': Interracial Intimacy and Coloured Women's Agency in Jamaica," in *Subverting Empire: Deviance and Disorder in the British Colonial World*, ed. Will Jackson and Emily Manktelow (Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire; New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), 42-60.

¹⁸⁸ For French racialism as essential in the rise of the modern French state see the readings within, Tzvetan Todorov, *On Human Diversity: Nationalism, Racism, and Exoticism in French Thought* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1993), esp. 90-170, and a focus on Buffon's monogenetic ideals within, Phillip

led to intense attribution of inferiority to Africans due to perceived cultural and environmental dependency.¹⁸⁹ This extended to the degradation of physical characteristics as something climatically constructed, but still inferior, with white as the normative, and all other climate deviations as inferior. French traveler Monsieur Du Pratz, like Long influenced by these Enlightenment concerns with defining race, demarcated in 1758 that slaves: “ought not to be placed so near your habitation as to be offensive, I mean by that the smell which natural to some nations of negroes, such as the *Congos*, the *Angolas*, the *Aradas*, and others. On this account it is proper to have in their camp a bathing place formed by thick planks.”¹⁹⁰ He continued, “that you may be as little incommoded as possible with their natural smell you must have the precaution to place the negro camp to the north or northeast of your house, as the winds that blow from these quarters are not so warm as the others, and it is only when the negroes are warm that they send forth a disagreeable smell.” In a more categorized minutia, Du Pratz persisted that, “negroes that have the worst smell are those that are the least black; and what I have said of their bad smell, ought to warn you to keep always on the windward side of them when you visit them at their work; never to

Sloan, “The Idea of Racial Degeneracy in Buffon’s *Histoire Naturelle*,” in *Studies in Eighteenth-Century Culture*, ed. American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies (Cleveland, Ohio: Press of Case Western Reserve University, 1971), 293-322.

¹⁸⁹ Cohen, *French Encounter*, esp. 60-120.

¹⁹⁰ M. Le Page Du Pratz, *Vol. II of The History of Louisiana, The Western Parts of Virginia and Carolina Containing a Description of the Countries that lye on bothe sides of the River Missisipi with an account of the Settlements, Inhabitants, Soil, Climate, and Products* (London: T. Beckbt and P. A. Db Hokdt, 1763 [1758 in French]), quote on 262, Du Pratz’s italics. For the assertion of the concept of blood purity in French colonies in order to exempt different races from the rights to property, nobility, and class see, Guillaume Aubert, “The Blood of France: Race and Purity of Blood in the French Atlantic World,” *WMQ* 61 (July, 2004): 439-478, and the reading of Jewish blood as invading Christianity the more Jewish people converted as necessitating the desire for hardened racial ideal within, Charles de Miramon, “Noble Dogs, Noble Blood: The Invention of the Concept of Race in the Late Middle Ages,” in *The Origins of Racism in the West*, ed. Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac, and Joseph Ziegler (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 200-216.

suffer them to come near your chi'dren, who, exclusive of the bad smell, can learn nothing good from them, either as to morals, education, or language.”¹⁹¹

French trader Pierre-Raymond de Brisson's *Voyages to the Coast of Africa* (1792) similarly represents such a colonial reimagining of African scents once those stereotypes formed within European cores. Rather than ethnographically summarize African cultural traits that smelled, Brisson described the female slaves that the Arab populations of North Africa retained as having a “naturall...ill smell.” He continued, the “negresses... exhale a scent sufficient to disgust a man of the least delicacy; insomuch that, notwithstanding my acquaintance with the country, I rather chose to sleep in the open air, than to remain in the same tent with a negress.”¹⁹² He described the slave-holding Moorish women using similar nasal stereotypes learned from centuries of European narratives about scented superiority, “it is impossible for imagination to form a more disgusting and revolting idea than the appearance and smell of a Moorish woman.”¹⁹³ Rather than listing only ethnographic traits, by the late eighteenth century the European cores of Buffon's Paris and Long's London had informed colonial travelers enough to alter ethnographic objectivity to descriptions of inherent and “natural” inferiority through pungent racialization.¹⁹⁴

¹⁹¹ Du Pratz, *Vol. II of The History of Louisiana*, quotes on 262-263. For the colonialist creation of racism within the French core due to French elite fearing miscegenation in late eighteenth century, and reacting by codifying race so the colonial mixed-race could not reach the standard of French nobility, see Pierre Boule, “In Defense of Slavery: Eighteenth-Century Opposition to Abolition and the Origins of a Racist Ideology in France,” in *History from Below: Studies in Popular Protest and Popular Ideology in Honour of George Rudé*, ed. George Rudé and Frederick Krantz (Montréal, Québec: Concordia University, 1985), 219-246, esp. 230-234.

¹⁹² Pierre-Raymond de Brisson, *Voyages to the Coast of Africa* (London: G. G. J. and J. Robinson, 1792), quotes on 98-99.

¹⁹³ Brisson, *Voyages to the Coast of Africa*, quote on 472.

¹⁹⁴ For the continuation of ethnographical discussions of odors in African cultures, see the examples of scented bodies within, François Le Vaillant, *Travels from the Cape of Good-Hope, into the Interior Parts of Africa: Including Many Interesting Anecdotes. With Elegant Plates, Descriptive of the Country and*

European journeys to Africa often continued to include cultural connotations about the filth and odor of environments. Both cultural odors and increasingly biological odors combined to mark Africans as uncivilized as modernity spread her vast white wings. The voyage of the ship Sandown entered the region of Rionunez near the coast of modern Guinea in July of 1793. The log of Commander Samuel Gamble noted, “The Banks swampy and Oozey overrun with Mangroves and noxious weeds[,] full of rivulets & Creeks[,] the Slime and filth of which at low water is very disagreeable especially in the night. This Country appears to be at variance with Mankind.”¹⁹⁵ This variance from “Mankind” was noted by these English sailors who found in smell the vast otherness that marked the primitive through codes of both culture and environment.¹⁹⁶

During analogous decades, English culture in North America was asserting what Long proclaimed of Jamaica and Brisson and Du Pratz asserted through Francophone racial sentiments.¹⁹⁷ These Enlightenment sentiments were often guided by European conceptions of the wild man, often found within yet to be enclosed European forests of the Early Modern Era. The ideal of the wild man often placed much burden on discussions of who could be deemed human, or who could access citizenship, for scholars of the

Inhabitants: Translated from the French of Monsieur Vaillant. In Two Volumes (London: William Lane, 1790), esp. 51-52.

¹⁹⁵ Bruce Mouser and Samuel Gamble, *A Slaving Voyage to Africa and Jamaica: The Log of the Sandown, 1793-1794* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2002), quote on 52.

¹⁹⁶ West Africans found in the European a similar form of othering through the sense of smell. Many Africans found that white sailors smelled and were often offended when Europeans found no shame in flatulence. David Brion Davis, *Inhuman Bondage: The Rise and Fall of Slavery in the New World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), esp. 95-96.

¹⁹⁷ Much of the creation of the American nation arose through a common sense of whiteness out of a Republicanism that fomented meaning through the diametric opposition of the racial other as metaphor to the foreign enemy. Robert Parkinson, *The Common Cause: Creating Race and Nation in the American Revolution* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia, by the University of North Carolina Press, 2016), esp. 10-14, 21-25.

eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. One example of this stereotypical figure was Lord Peter, discovered in 1726. Peter was able to find truffles in his forest dwellings quite easily, as he had a powerful sense of smell gained from his apparent intuitive past. For historian Richard Nash, “The wild man is not safely ‘other’ than the citizen—but is instead one of those troubling, necessary hybrids in part constitutive of an emergent public sphere—[that] has required us to shuffle back and forth between high and low culture, bourgeois and plebian spaces, the savage and the civilized.”¹⁹⁸ Over time, these ideas of the wild man integrated with perceptions of the “savage” as concepts of modernity set a standardized form of the other.¹⁹⁹

As Mark Smith portrayed, ideas of savagery and racialization continued to define Africans in the colonial empires of European slavery. Many English colonists argued that the offensive smell of African Americans would help in silk cultivations due to the “negro” stench being offensive to silk worms. The botanical artist Mark Catesby applied scenting in 1754 when describing the Native Americans of Carolina and Florida as possessing “nothing of the rankness” of the African slave. Such belief in the poor smells of Africans

¹⁹⁸ Richard Nash, *Wild Enlightenment: The Borders of Human Identity in the Eighteenth Century* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2003), esp. 15-66, quote on 101. See also, Julia Douthwaite, *The Wild Girl, Natural Man, and the Monster Dangerous Experiments in the Age of Enlightenment* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002), esp. 60-73, Constance Classen, “The Sensory Orders of ‘Wild Children’,” in *The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses*, ed. David Howes (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), 47-60, and Hayden White, “The Forms of Wildness: Archaeology of an Idea,” in *The Wild Man Within; An Image in Western Thought from the Renaissance to Romanticism*, ed. Edward Dudley and Maximillian Novak (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1973), 3-38.

¹⁹⁹ Gary Nash, “The Image of the Indian in the Southern Colonial Mind,” in *The Wild Man Within; An Image in Western Thought from the Renaissance to Romanticism*, ed. Edward Dudley and Maximillian Novak (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1973), 55-86, esp. 74-76. For the idea of the monstrous as similar to disability that marked specific bodies of the British Empire as outside of the category of human, as defective from a norm of English whiteness, see the reading of race, gender, and human anomalies in English literature of the eighteenth century within, Felicity Nussbaum, *The Limits of the Human: Fictions of Anomaly, Race, and Gender in the Long Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), esp. 189-212.

continued beyond the American Revolution. To some British travelers, the 1780s American South featured the “rank offensive smell” of African American slaves. Much of the discussion of slave smells in this era focused on odor characterized through a medical understanding of “skin scent.”²⁰⁰

The English core received new scientific justification in the interchange of information with the pungent periphery. Oliver Goldsmith’s *A History of the Earth and Animated Nature* (1774) found in the mass of information arriving to English ports a way to also create hierarchies of humanity based on the presence of odor among different peripheral nations. Goldsmith described the beauty of specific nations of Africa, especially those of Mozambique, as not containing any odor, but the “Negroes” of Guinea possessed an “insupportable scent” to go along with the signifying nature of their “extreme ugliness.”²⁰¹ While in Barbados during the 1790s, English physician George Pinckard noted in a letter of a conversation he had with a soldier’s wife from north of the River Tweed that focused upon the smell of African women dancing. When asked if there were any women as pretty in the Highlands, she replied “whether or not – they smell better.”²⁰²

These attributions of odor to African bodies were structural elements within the

²⁰⁰ For these anecdotes, a summary of Long’s survey of Jamaica, and many more colonial examples from North America of the eighteenth century see, Smith, *How Race Is Made*, esp. 12-16, quotes on 13-14, and for the desire of colonial whites to assert their Britishness to remove any association to darker skin or miscegenation see, Trevor Burnard, “West Indian Identity in the Eighteenth Century,” in *Assumed Identities The Meanings of Race in the Atlantic World*, ed. John Garrigus and Christopher Morris (College Station, Tex.: Published for the University of Texas at Arlington by Texas A & M, 2010), 71-87.

²⁰¹ Oliver Goldsmith, *A History of the Earth and Animated Nature: In Eight Volumes* (Dublin: J. Christie, 1813), 163-165, quote on 164.

²⁰² George Pinckard, *Notes on the West Indies* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, and Orme, 1806), quote on 268. For the history of the planter class in Barbados, and their adaptive and creative forms of capital development see, Larry Dale Gragg, *Englishmen Transplanted: The English Colonization of Barbados, 1627-1660* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003), esp. 88-131.

demography of all European colonial slave systems in the Atlantic littoral.²⁰³ In Latin America, such ideas of racial odor grew alongside concepts associated with Catholic religiosity, as described in chapter one, and Church assertions of Iberian blood nobility, *limpieza de sangre*.²⁰⁴ Part of what defined black men as the “devil” throughout Latin American colonies was the fetid smell associated with the black body as linked to the sulfur of perdition.²⁰⁵ The folklore of post-colonial Uruguay also defined the black person as having an “odor like a chimney,” while transnational South America folklore defined the devil in black men due to the bituminous smell that was said to surround their bodies. Similarly prejudicial, black women were considered to smell like the dirty crow in post-emancipation Colombian folklore, a pungent sentiment also summarized in a Brazilian poem that stated: “being black is not a dishonor/ it is a very natural thing/ but they give off a certain odor/ that no one can stand.”²⁰⁶

²⁰³ For a comparative history of slavery in Jamaica and Barbados with a focus on family life and the demographics of labor and the role of the family in daily labor, see, Richard Dunn, *A Tale of Two Plantations: Slave Life and Labor in Jamaica and Virginia* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2014), esp. 23-73, 323-367.

²⁰⁴ For the assertion of blood nobility as race to justify Spanish dominance over the threat of sexuality and miscegenation of African slaves in the New World see, María Elena Martínez, “The Black Blood of New Spain: Limpieza De Sangre, Racial Violence, and Gendered Power in Early Colonial Mexico,” *WMQ* 61, 3 (2004): 479-520, the expansion of that idea to include gendered understandings of breastmilk as possible racial infection, women’s roles in controlling blood purity, and the introduction of “dual descent” to control women’s ability to alter hierarchies in the New World in, Maria Elena Martínez, *Genealogical Fictions: Limpieza de Sangre, Religion and Gender in Colonial Mexico* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2008), the importance of *limpieza de sangre* in the making of colonial Spanish identity through literature within, Verene Stolcke, “Invaded Women: Gender, Race, and Class in the Formation of Colonial Society,” in *Women, “Race,” and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, ed. Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker (London: Routledge, 1994), 272-286, and the racial resistance through the agency of the Native American to alter categorizations based on *limpieza de sangre* within, Rachel Sarah O’Toole, *Bound Lives: Africans, Indians, and the Making of Race in Colonial Peru* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2012), esp. 161-165.

²⁰⁵ The curliness of African hair was attributed to the radiating heat of the devil’s hands placed upon black heads. Alexander Caldcleugh, Edward Francis Finden, W. Daniel, John Murray, and Charles Roworth, *Travels in South America, During the Years 1819-20-21: Containing an Account of the Present State of Brazil, Buenos Ayres, and Chile* (London: John Murray, 1825), esp. 86-88.

²⁰⁶ Paulo de Carvalho-Neto, “Folklore of the Black Struggle in Latin America,” *Latin American Perspectives* 5, 2 (1978): 53-88, quotes on 56, 73-74.

These aromatic roots were later applied by slaveholders throughout the Americas, and specifically in the United States of the nineteenth century, who often discussed African odors as a biological inferiority. Among these later scholars were the Founding Fathers Benjamin Rush and Thomas Jefferson. Later slaveholders during the Antebellum Era justified their peculiar institution through an increasing exchange with scientific communities in Europe that similarly discussed the inferiority of African peoples through the sense of smell.²⁰⁷ Akin to the social construction of phrenology, the science of the nose became essential for slaveholders to justify their beliefs regarding the inherent inferiority of African minds and bodies.²⁰⁸ Born of English literature, and agitated within a global intelligence network of the late Enlightenment, the idea that African bodies smelled perpetuated into modernity as its own stinking discourse of embodied racism.²⁰⁹

Many early Americans like Jefferson relied on the olfactory to determine their perceptions of Africans. *Notes on the State of Virginia* (1787) delineated that Africans “secrete less by the kidneys, and more by the glands of the skin, which gives them a very

²⁰⁷ For materialist connections between slavery and capitalism see, Trevor Burnard, *Planters, Merchants, and Slaves: Plantation Societies in British America, 1650 – 1820* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2015), William Pettigrew, *Freedom's Debt: The Royal African Company and the Politics of the Atlantic Slave Trade, 1672-1752* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2013), esp. 7-8, Christopher Leslie Brown, *Moral Capital: Foundations of British Abolitionism* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006), and Trevor Burnard and John Garrigus, *The Plantation Machine: Atlantic Capitalism in French Saint-Domingue and British Jamaican* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016), esp. 3-8.

²⁰⁸ For justification of the slave trade through tropes of the Anglo-Atlantic in the Stuart Era see, Mangum, *Reflection of Africa*, 51-78, and the artwork of tribal life analyzed within, David Bindman, Charles Ford, and Helen Weston, “Africa and the Slave Trade,” in Book III of *Volume III of The Image of the Black in Western Art*, ed. David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen Dalton (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010), 207-240.

²⁰⁹ For similar justifications of slavery through racial science in nineteenth century America see the physiological applications of the spirometer to show different lung capacities among whites and blacks within, Lundy Braun, *Breathing Race into the Machine: The Surprising Career of the Spirometer from Plantation to Genetics* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2014), esp. 27-54, 109-137.

strong and disagreeable odor.”²¹⁰ Jefferson’s work exemplifies that many of these racist classifications began to take on medical connotations in the increasingly professionalized Anglo-Atlantic. Numerous scientists, including those of the Royal Society, began to link African racial traits to a belief in generational leprosy that many in the Society supposed caused a darkening of skin. This faith that illness, or the “true plague” of leprosy, caused African skin’s dark hue later merged with concerns over odor. In 1744, a colonial member of the Royal Society, John Mitchell, articulated such a certainty when summarizing that the “perspirable matter of black or tawny people is more subtile and volatile in it’s nature; and more acrid, penetrating, and offensive, in it’s effects; and more of the nature, and more apt to degenerate to a contagious miasma, than the milder effluvia of Whites.” From this inherently sweatier skin, “proceeded the first seeds of the measles and small-pox, with the *African* or true plague. From hence likewise proceeds the rank smell, or peculiar feter, of dark-skinned people.”²¹¹

The American doctor Benjamin Rush summarized what the medical establishment believed about the odor of Africans in the *Transactions of the American Philosophical*

²¹⁰ Thomas Jefferson, “Notes on the State of Virginia,” in *The Literatures of Colonial America: an Anthology*, ed. Susan Castillo and Ivy Schweitzer (Malden, Mass.: Blackwell Publishers, 2001), quote on 533. For Jefferson’s inability to confront his own racialism see the performative supplication of Benjamin Banneker within, William Andrews, “Benjamin Banneker’s Revision of Thomas Jefferson: Conscience Versus Science in the Early American Antislavery Debate,” in *Genius in Bondage: Literature of the Early Black Atlantic*, ed. Vincent Carretta and Philip Gould (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2001), 218-241.

²¹¹ John Mitchell, “Causes of the Different Colours of Persons in Different Climates,” in *The Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society (From the Year 1743 to the Year 1750)* (London, 1756): 926-949, quote on 946. For the curliness of African hair, see, Samuel Stanhope Smith and Henry Home, *An Essay on the Causes of the Variety of Complexion and Figure in the Human Species* (Edinburg: American Philosophical Society, 1787), esp. 37-40, and the addition of notations that describe this curliness of hair as partially arising from sulfuric odors that emanate from African bodies within, Samuel Stanhope Smith, *An Essay on the Causes of the Variety of Complexion and Figure in the Human Species: To Which Are Added, Animadversions on Certain Remarks Made on the First Edition of This Essay* (New Brunswick NJ: J. Simpson and Co, 1810), esp. 90-91.

Society of 1799. He wrote that generational leprosy evident in Africa caused the smell that remained in Africans not afflicted with the disease.²¹² Rush expanded the idea that leprosy created the blackened skins and odors of African peoples a year later when correlating the specific aspects of a diseased body to the African race. A patient directly afflicted with a form of leprosy said to cause black skin “exhale perpetually a disagreeable smell, which I can compare to nothing but the smell of a mortified limb.” This diseased body was emphasized as a racial stereotype when Rush compared this specific disease symptom to a certain “smell” which “continues with a slight modification in the African to this day.”²¹³ Dr. Charles White, a London based member of the Royal Society, similarly argued in 1799 that, as Winthrop Jordan described: “The Negro possessed longer arms, thicker skin, ranker smell, shorter life span and earlier maturation, larger breasts, and ‘gibbous’ legs. Negroes excelled Europeans, on the other hand, in certain areas where apes excelled man-seeing, hearing, smelling, and memory.”²¹⁴

Though most colonials accepted European core beliefs through a growing exchange of racial inscription, some later American and Atlantic markets tried to linguistically and

²¹² Jordan, *White Over Black*, quote on 518.

²¹³ Benjamin Rush, “Reasons for Ascribing the Colour of Negroes to Leprosy,” *The Monthly Magazine and American Review* 2, 4 (April, 1800): 298-301, quote on 298; Kariann Akemi Yokota, *Unbecoming British: How Revolutionary America Became a Postcolonial Nation* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), esp. 192-225. For an earlier account of similar arguments regarding generational leprosy as creating black skin in Africa see, Franz Swediaur, *The Philosophical Dictionary, or, The Opinions of Modern Philosophers on Metaphysical, Moral, and Political Subjects* (London: G. G. J. and J. Robinson and for C. Elliot, 1786), 160-161.

²¹⁴ Winthrop Jordan, *The White Man's Burden: Historical Origins of Racism in the United States* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1974), esp. 199-203, quote on 199. For earlier links between Africans and apes see the reading of metonymical wordplay within John Elliott's *Mr. Moore's Revels* (1636) in, Kim Hall, "'Troubling doubles': Apes, Africans, and Blackface in Mr. Moore's Revels," in *Race, Ethnicity, and Power in the Renaissance*, ed. Joyce Green MacDonald (Madison, NJ: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1997), 120-144.

materially control these smells for marketing.²¹⁵ In order to make their products more attractive, many slave traders attempted to change their slave's smells by using violet smelling oil to make their bodies both shiny and fragrant. The oil chosen was usually palm oil cultivated from African trees. In numerous texts this oil was described as pleasant smelling, and was used in the production of soaps meant to scent both white and black bodies.²¹⁶ In Georgia of the 1790s, a scented compound applied was often made of gunpowder, lime juice, and palm oil.²¹⁷ Similarly controlling these perceived odors, slave traders would rarely use the idea of African scents as the association between disease and smell heightened during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.²¹⁸ Not wishing to hurt their ability to turn profits, planters and traders rarely placed odor in their runaway notices and shipping advertisements, choosing instead to use external uncleanness to describe their slave's olfactory characteristics.²¹⁹

Especially during an increased era of industrializing slavery in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century, slave traders and their runaway notices sometimes limited the attribution of racial odors.²²⁰ In a 1797 advertisement to capture his runaway Andrew,

²¹⁵ For the role of bathing in this process, and the use of white clothes as a marker of civility for African slaves in the British Atlantic see, Kathleen Brown, *Foul Bodies: Cleanliness in Early America* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2009).

²¹⁶ Ghilleen Prance and Mark Nesbitt. *The Cultural History of Plants* (New York: Routledge, 2005), esp. 341. For the smell of this oil as that of violet see, Hans Sloane, Michael van der Gucht, John Savage, Caspar Georg Carl Reinwardt, and Roland Napoléon Bonaparte, *A Voyage to the Islands Madera, Barbados, Nieves, S. Christophers and Jamaica* (London, B. M. for the Author, 1707), esp. 115.

²¹⁷ Pinckard, *Notes on the West Indies*, esp. 238.

²¹⁸ Similarly, though the slave ship stank, it had to remain a certain level of cleanliness to keep slaves clean enough to not associate their bodies to disease for sale. For the cure of the stench of slave ships, through the use of vinegar see, Mouser and Gamble. *A Slaving Voyage*, esp. 57.

²¹⁹ For increasing links between smell and disease in the Early Modern Era see, Annick Le Guérer, *Scent, the Mysterious and Essential Powers of Smell* (New York: Turtle Bay Books, 1992), esp. 39-50.

²²⁰ For growth of slavery in the New World after the start of the Industrial Revolution see, Anthony Kaye,

North Carolina planter John Hill described the slave as “remarkably dirty and slovenly in his general appearance, his hair thick, short and matted, and tho' a country-born, I question if it was ever combed.”²²¹ Rather than illustrate the racial or diseased smells, this planter returned to hygiene to avoid possibly lowering the price of his slave through an association to disease. North Carolina planter Francis Batchelor likewise described his runaway, Salem, as wearing “dirty trousers.”²²² Similarly, the “Mulatto” runaway Peter, though “inclined generally to be dirty” was not described as racially scented in the common parlance of the times.²²³ Rather than talk of the inherent smell of runaway slaves, which could have triggered concerns over disease, many slave runaway notices referenced the perceived dirtiness or slovenliness of slaves, an exterior odor, rather than any biological or diseased malformations.²²⁴

This olfactory discourse agitated again within the Old South, especially on the eve of the Civil War, when numerous planters asserted the smell of Africans in order to justify their belief in their paternal rights to the civilizing process upon African bodies.²²⁵ Though

“The Second Slavery: Modernity in the Nineteenth-Century South and the Atlantic World,” *The Journal of Southern History* 75, 3 (2009): 627-650.

²²¹ “Ten Dollars Reward,” *Hall’s Wilmington Gazette*, April 6, 1797, 3

²²² “Ten Dollars Reward,” *North Carolina Gazette*, April, 3, 1778, 3.

²²³ “Runaways,” *Wilmington Gazette*, May 23, 1809, 2. For southern colonial society and the construction of racism, especially through legal codes and baptism, to support slave society see, Anthony Parent, *Foul Means: The Formation of a Slave Society in Virginia, 1660-1740* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia, by the University of North Carolina Press, 2003), esp. 105, 253-265, and Rebecca Goetz, *The Baptism of Early Virginia: How Christianity Created Race* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2012), esp. 86-111.

²²⁴ Similar advertisements associating runaways to dirtiness rather than racial scents in, “One Hundred Dollars Reward,” *Raleigh Register and North Carolina Weekly Advertiser*, October 27, 1815, 3, “Five Dollars Reward,” *Elizabeth City, N.C. : Elizabeth City Star and North Carolina Eastern Intelligencer*, June 17, 1827, 3, “50 reward,” *Raleigh Register and North Carolina Weekly Advertiser*, May 27, 1825, 2, “20 Dollars Reward,” *Wilmington Gazette*, July 28, 1807, 3.

²²⁵ For more on debates on capitalism and paternalism in the American south see, Edward Baptist, *The Half*

slave traders and savvy catchers had avoided using odor for fear of attributing disease to slave bodies in prior decades, plantation owners found in smell a way to assert their beliefs of biological and religious superiority. Thus, pro-slavery author Josiah Priest's *Slavery* (1849) used the inherent "strong odor of the negro's body" to justify numerous beliefs in slave's abilities to digest food easier than white men while linking the smell of African bodies to their ability to ingest human flesh while cannibals in their African past. This type of distorted linguistic linking of Africans to a fabricated historical world justified Old South planter's religious explanations for their institution.²²⁶

Representing such growing ideals among the educated and aristocratic classes of the Atlantic, the French naturalist Julien Virey's *Natural History of the Negro Race* (1837) had categorized different African nations by their odors, increasingly tied to an objective language of science. He noted that when all "negroes sweat, their skin is covered with an oily and blackish perspiration, which stains cloths, and generally exhales a very unpleasant porraceous smell."²²⁷ The nuance of Virey's text exposes the very intensity of the desire to

Has Never Been Told: Slavery and the Making of American Capitalism (New York: Basic Books, 2014), Eugene Genovese, *The World the Slaveholders Made; Two Essays in Interpretation* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1969), Mark Smith, *Debating Slavery: Economy and Society in the Antebellum American South* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), Mark Smith, "Old South Time in Comparative Perspective," *American Historical Review* 101 (December, 1996): 1432-1469, Douglas Egerton, "Markets Without a Market Revolution: Southern Planters and Capitalism," *Journal of the Early Republic* 16 (1996): 207-222, Walter Johnson, "The Pedestal and the Veil: Rethinking the Capitalism/Slavery Question," *Journal of the Early Republic* 24 (Summer, 2004): 299-308, Walter Johnson, *River of Dark Dreams: Slavery and Empire in the Cotton Kingdom* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2013), Walter Johnson, *Soul by Soul: Life Inside the Antebellum Slave Market* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1999), and Lacy Ford, Jr., "Reconfiguring the Old South: 'Solving' the Problem of Slavery, 1787-1838," *Journal of American History* 95 (2008): 95-122.

²²⁶ Josiah Priest, *Slavery, As It Relates to the Negro, or African Race* (Louisville: W. S. Brown, 1849), quotes on 228-229. For the assertion from Southern planters of religious justifications for slavery, especially asserting the roots of Canaan in Africa see, Stephen Haynes, *Noah's Curse: The Biblical Justification of American Slavery* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), esp. 3-19, and for broader history of proslavery thought in religious and libertarian language see, Larry Tise, *Proslavery: A History of the Defense of Slavery in America, 1701-1840* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1987).

²²⁷ Julien Virey, *Natural History of the Negro Race* (Charleston, S.C. D. J. Dowling, 1837), esp. 44-54,

codify African smells in the late Enlightenment as the encyclopedias and scientific methods of the elite approached the era of Scientific Racism.

Even when considered fair, many of the smells of slavery often created much hardship for female slaves always under threat of rape. The smell of female slaves in the Big Houses described by historian Gilberto Freyre were believed to often trail with *catinga*, or the scent of sexual desire or potency akin to the odor of the palm tree and spider-flower, often tautological to *budum*, or the common sense that the smells of Africans were inherently pungent and animal.²²⁸ Likewise gendered, the 1796 Barbados journal of Richard Wyvill referenced the “highly perfumed” scents of “a grand mulatto ball,” or “Dignity Ball,” that was most likely part of an informal sexual performance for wanton masters and the fancy trade.²²⁹

African populations in the Atlantic would not simply internalize such racial olfactory discourses without resistance. They would rise up and retaliate through the sense of smell. As chapter six argues, by exposing the transgressive possibilities of smelling as African agency and using smells to fill gaps in the poor medical care of masters, slaves found creative olfactory spaces for everyday opposition.²³⁰ The transgressive nature of

quotes on 44.

²²⁸ James Lorand Matory, *Black Atlantic Religion: Tradition, Transnationalism, and Matriarchy in the Afro-Brazilian Candomblé* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2005), esp. 154-156; Gilberto Freyre, *The Masters and the Slaves: a Study in the Development of Brazilian Civilization* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986), esp. 279, 346, 480-483.

²²⁹ Richard Wyvill, “‘Memoirs of an Old Army Officer’, Richard A. Wyvill’s Visits to Barbados in 1796 and 1806-7,” edited by Jerome Handler, *JBMHS* 30 (March 1975): 121-130, quote on 24.

²³⁰ For the inability to express smells objectively, and therefore the power of smell through linguistic transgression, see, Daniel Press and Steven Minta, “The Smell of Nature: Olfaction, Knowledge and the Environment,” *Ethics, Place & Environment* 3, 2 (2000): 173-186, and Felizitas Ringham, “The Language of Smell,” in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 23-36.

smell comes from its subjectivity. Most Europeans could not order all smells as simply as they could all sights, because smelling was subjective to individual persons. Still, when saying Africans smelled, Europeans could not say what all Africans smelled like because they would have to use metaphors to articulate that olfactory likeness. So, the dichotomy became fair and foul, foul and fragrant, and because the only possible ordering was dichotomous, African slaves later exposed the vast space between fair and foul by asserting spaces for smelling as contrast to European discourses about binary and racialized odors.²³¹

²³¹ For the importance of the Enlightenment language of freedom and human rights as ironically supporting the slave system see, Wendy Brown, *Regulating Aversion: Tolerance in the Age of Identity and Empire* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2006), esp. 3-13.

Chapter 6

“The Sweet Smell of Vengeance”:

Diasporic Medicine and Olfactory Resistance

The opening epigraph of James Scott's *Domination and the Arts of Resistance* (1990) introduces an Ethiopian proverb to exemplify the concepts of "hidden transcripts" and "weapons of the weak," two notions now essential to understanding subaltern resistance. In this adage, a nobleman walks in front of an Ethiopian serf: "When the great lord passes the wise peasant bows deeply and silently farts."¹ African slaves in the Atlantic littoral applied similar ideas about odor as both "hidden transcripts" and "weapons of the weak" to respond to the conditions of different slave systems.²

For Scott, a hidden transcript implies the inherent lower class critique of class or colonial power that is kept "behind the back" of the dominant populace. A hidden transcript is a way to speak truth to power in a manner that the dominant class cannot perceive, because that class does not attribute enough intellectual ingenuity to the dominated to believe that group could formulate a language of resistance. This "backstage discourse consisting of what cannot be spoken in the face of power" can be represented through the Bakhtinian assertion that carnivalesque uses of odor, pungent material culture, and fecal

¹ James Scott, *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990), quote on v. For introduction to the idea of the Bakhtinian carnivalesque, a pattern of resistance through different forms of sensory indulgence and embodied performance, see, Marlene Ringgaard Lorensen, *Dialogical Preaching: Bakhtin, Otherness and Homiletics* (Gottingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2013), esp. 13-19, 95-115, and the reading of labor resistance of popular forms of materialism within, Michael Bristol, *Carnival and Theater: Plebeian Culture and the Structure of Authority in Renaissance England* (New York: Methuen, 1985), esp. 72-87.

² For subaltern resistance through the senses see, Peter Charles Hoffer, *Sensory Worlds in Early America* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2003), esp. 189-251, the reading of ethnogenetic musical traditions within Richard Cullen Rath, "African Music in Seventeenth-Century Jamaica: Cultural Transit and Transition," *WMQ* 50, 4 (Oct., 1993): 700-726, esp. 715-716, Shane White and Graham White, *Stylin': African American Expressive Culture from Its Beginnings to the Zoot Suit* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1998), Richard Clay, "Smells, Bells and Touch: Iconoclasm in Paris during the French Revolution," *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 35, 4 (2012): 521-533, Walter Ong, "African Talking Drums and Oral Noetics," *New Literary History* 8, 3 (1977): 411-429, Shane White and Graham White, *The Sounds of Slavery: Discovering African American History Through Songs, Sermons, and Speech* (Boston: Beacon Press, 2005), Shane White, "'It Was a Proud Day': African Americans, Festivals, and Parades in the North, 1741-1834," *Journal of American History* 81, 1 (1994): 13-50, and Cora Fox, "Isabella Whitney's Nosegay and the Smell of Women's Writing," *Senses and Society* 5, 1 (2010): 131-143.

matter against the dominant class are a common structural element of many forms of subaltern resistance.³ This use of fecal matter and odor was often intended to resist what critic Warwick Anderson has called the “somatic disciplining” that came with rising colonial forces and their “poetics of pollution.”⁴ The critical backstage use of odor, like all hidden transcripts, can reify against this dominant class rhetoric in transcripts that speak truth to power in open forums of the public sphere.⁵

As the anecdote about the Jamaican slave girl described by Edward Long in chapter five exemplified, African slaves in the Atlantic could also mobilize odor as a weapon of the weak against dominant master classes.⁶ Africans in the diaspora mastered olfactory management techniques to assert medical and spiritual agency and create rival geographies in a spatial game against their master’s judgmental noses.⁷ Though many in the Black

³ Scott, *Domination and the Arts of Resistance*, esp. x-xii, 4-10, quote on xii; M. M. Bakhtin, *Rabelais and His World* (Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 1968). For historiographical debates on the carnivalesque see, Sam Kinser, *Rabelais's Carnival: Text, Context, Metatext* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990), esp. 181-213.

⁴ For the assertion of the filthy, the fecal, and odors in general as resistance to rhetorical uses of pollution and categories of contagion against the subaltern see, Warwick Anderson, “Excremental Colonialism: Public Health and the Poetics of Pollution,” *Critical Inquiry* 21, 3 (1995): 640-669, quotes on 640, 644, Dipesh Chakrabarty, “Open Space/Public Place: Garbage, Modernity and India,” *South Asia: Journal of South Asian Studies* 14, 1 (1991): 15-31, J. D. Esty, “Excremental Postcolonialism,” *Contemporary Literature* 40, 1 (1999): 22-59, and Stephen Greenblatt, “Filthy Rites,” *Daedalus* 111, 3 (1982): 1-16.

⁵ For the possibility of performative critique within the public sphere see, Martin Jay, “The Debate over Performative Contradiction: Habermas versus the Poststructuralists,” in *Philosophical Interventions in the Unfinished Project of Enlightenment*, ed. Axel Honneth, Thomas McCarthy, Claus Offe, and Albrecht Wellmer (Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 1992), 261-279, and Jürgen Habermas, *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: an Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society* (Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 1989).

⁶ For an example of taking on odors as a self-fashioning to perpetuate cultural roots see, Mario Telo, “Aristophanes, Cratinus and the Smell of Comedy,” in *Synaesthesia and the Ancient Senses*, ed. Shane Butler and Alex Purves (Durham, UK: Acumen, 2013), 53-70.

⁷ Kathryn Guerts’ analyses of the importance of animism within modern West African cultural traditions argued that African cultures teach a much different sensory hierarchy than the Western five sense hierarchy, one that includes a much higher appreciation for olfactory sensations. In many African cultures, multiple sensate understandings, beyond the Western five, inform how Africans understand their perceptions of the world around them. Senses of balance, kinesthesia (the muscle sense), and proprioception (the understanding of others’ movement through feelings associated with space around the body through nerves on the skin and

Atlantic resisted the idea of pungent African bodies, Olaudah Equiano prominent among them, other African and diasporic medical and dietary practitioners used aroma throughout the littoral to assert spaces of embodied relief.⁸

This chapter therefore asserts the importance of African survivals in the making of spatialized slave resistance within the early modern Atlantic.⁹ Alongside scholars such as James Sweet, Stephanie Camp, and Jason Young this piece shows how African survivals, especially concerning olfactory medicine and spiritualism, offered Africans in the New World spaces to assert their own forms of identity.¹⁰ These olfactory responses were hard to identify and troublesome to white planters who could not perceive the olfactory complexity of African cultures because they defined African odors as a cultural or

within the inner ear) represent a few of the perceived senses articulated by some West African nations. Kathryn Linn Geurts, *Culture and the Senses: Bodily Ways of Knowing in an African Community* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002). For a similar form of multisensory analysis of modern African cultures, of the Songhay of Nigeria, see, Paul Stoller, *The Taste of Ethnographic Things: The Senses in Anthropology* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1989), esp. 7-9.

⁸ Equiano's *Interesting Narrative* (1789) offered a brief implicit contradiction to the claims of unclean or stinking African peoples. Equiano wrote pertaining to the manners of Africans, who before tasting food "always wash our hands: indeed our cleanliness on all occasions is extreme; but on this it is an indispensable ceremony." Olaudah Equiano, "The Interesting Narrative of the Life of Olaudah Equiano, Or Gustavus Vassa," in *Early American Writings*, ed. Carla Mulford, Angela Vietto, and Amy Winans (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002), quote on 915. For Equiano and resistance to rhetorical dominance through ironic tones of taking on the voice of masters to poke funs at their very accursed institutions see, Shaun Regan, "Learning Not to Curse: Swearing, Testimony, and Truth in Olaudah Equiano's *The Interesting Narrative*," *The Eighteenth Century* 54, 3 (2013): 339-358, and for the use of African slave narratives to prove African survivals in the New World see, Paul Lovejoy, "Speculations of the African Origins of Venture Smith," in *The Changing Worlds of Atlantic Africa: Essays in Honor of Robin Law*, ed. Robin Law, Toyin Falola, and Matt Childs (Durham, NC: Carolina Academic Press, 2009), 371-386.

⁹ For the importance of spatial resistance see, Michel de Certeau and Steven Rendall, *The Practice of Everyday Life* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984), esp. 92-96, and retention of African concerns with landscape and architectural forms in Cuba within, Theresa Singleton, "Slavery and Spatial Dialectics on Cuban Coffee Plantations," *World Archaeology* 33, 1 (2001): 98-114.

¹⁰ Stephanie Camp, *Closer to Freedom: Enslaved Women & Everyday Resistance in the Plantation South* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2004). For the definitive introduction to the practices of vodou, Santería, and Obeah see the reading of creolization within, Margarite Fernández Olmos and Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert, *Creole Religions of the Caribbean: An Introduction from Vodou and Santería to Obeah and Espiritismo* (New York: New York University Press, 2011), esp. 1-23.

biological inferiority.¹¹ Thus, African slaves' uses of odor became hidden transcripts, which the elites of colonial culture were partially anosmiac due to their stereotypical racist olfactory binaries.¹²

African American slaves became adept at understanding the disdain that slaveholders had for the odor of the African and how to apply their own sensory skills throughout the American South.¹³ As one slave told to his industrial labor master, W. B. Morgan, in antebellum Anderson County, Kentucky: "White folks don't like to smell a

¹¹ For the importance of African responses in colonial patterns of legality and power over slaves see, Natalie Zemon Davis, "Judges, Masters, Diviners: Slaves' Experience of Criminal Justice in Colonial Suriname," *Law and History Review* 29, 4 (Nov., 2011): 925-984, and Ariela Gross, "Beyond Black and White: Cultural Approaches to Race and Slavery," *Columbia Law Review* 101, 3 (2001): 640-690.

¹² Some present African nations include sensoriums where smelling is applied greatly in everyday life and leisure. Susan Rasmussen has shown how smelling and tasting in modern Tuareg society of Nigeria involves the intermingling of sensory understandings with a sense of social cohesion: "aroma among the Tuareg, in addition to marking boundaries also challenges boundaries, diminishes distance, and establishes indeterminacy in its deniability and ambiguity. Aroma redefines the perceived 'truth', thereby giving voice, in indirect communication, to those who cannot or will not express themselves directly through speech." Odor is thus applied in social situations to create or deconstruct different communities: "aromas are everywhere and perform a wide variety of functions. They delineate boundaries, but also mix them up and create indeterminacy...raise issues of belonging, ownership, sharing, boundaries, and boundary- crossing." Perfume is present in most rituals associated with rites of passage. In weddings, some lasting eight days, the Tuareg use incense by "saturating the head and clothing with its fragrance, released by the smoldering mixture of scented barks." Herbal traditions based on fragrance are vital to modern Tuareg medicinal cures. Tuareg peoples attach value to the smells of different ointments and cures for various "aches and pains, using touch in conjunction with scent" to cure patients. Susan Rasmussen, "Matters of Taste: Food, Eating, and Reflections on 'the Body Politic' in Tuareg Society," *Journal of Anthropological Research* 52, 1 (1996): 61-83, quotes on 56, 59, 64, 66. Similarly applying the olfactory, in the African culture of the Kapisiki/Higi of North-Eastern Nigeria smell can set one apart in a positive manner associated with agricultural profit, gender, or occupation. W. E. A. van Beek, "The Dirty Smith: Smell as a Social Frontier among the Kapsiki/Higi of North Cameroon and North-Eastern Nigeria," *Africa* 62 (1992): 38-58.

¹³ For issues with understanding the African ethnic roots of specific groups after the Middle Passage see the examples within, Luis Nicholau Pares, "The Hula 'Problem': Ethnicity on the Pre-Colonial Slave Coast," in *The Changing Worlds of Atlantic Africa: Essays in Honor of Robin Law*, ed. Robin Law, Toyin Falola, and Matt Childs (Durham, N.C.: Carolina Academic Press, 2009), 323-346, Kwasi Konadu, *The Akan Diaspora in the Americas* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010), Luis Nicolau Parés, "Ethnic-religious Modes of Identification among the Gbe-speaking People in Eighteenth and Nineteenth century Brazil," in *Africa, Brazil, and the Construction of Trans-Atlantic Black Identities*, ed. Barry Boubacar, Elisee Akpo Soumonni, and Livio Sansone (Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press, 2008), 179-208, and Paul Lovejoy, "Identifying Enslaved Africans in the African Diaspora," in *Identity in the Shadow of Slavery*, ed. Paul Lovejoy (London: Continuum, 2000), 1-29.

live nigger’.”¹⁴ Benjamin Johnson, a former slave in Georgia, offered that his compatriots in the condition of servitude would be careful to hide all evidence of the chickens they stole from their masters for sustenance as: “you had to be careful an’ bury all de feathers in de groun’ ‘cause if you burned ‘em de white folks would smell ‘em.”¹⁵ Wildred Heard, a former slave-woman, wrote much of her ability to use scents to define her environment. Specifically, she noted that her nose was adept at smelling the type of snakes encountered throughout the South.¹⁶

Through a reading of African retention and creolization, Richard Price understood many of these “deep-level, unconscious principles” were “a key to unraveling the African-American past.”¹⁷ Slaves and free blacks in the Atlantic littoral retained African appreciation for smelling from traditions of smelling-out disease, understanding the importance of scenting and de-scenting in the formulae for poisons, knowledge of pungent witchcraft, and beliefs in the importance of producing smells for cultural rituals, personal agency, and herbal medicines.¹⁸

Nevertheless, understanding a widespread slave sensory consciousness is not

¹⁴ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 7, Kentucky, Bogie-Woods* (with combined interviews of others) (Library of Congress, 1936), esp. 123-124.

¹⁵ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 4, Georgia, Part 2, Garey-Jones*. Manuscript/Mixed Material (Library of Congress, 1936), esp. 322-323.

¹⁶ *FWP Vol. 4, Georgia, Part 2*, 165-167.

¹⁷ Richard Price, “The Miracle of Creolization; A Retrospective.” *New West Indian Guide* 75 (2001): quote on 57.

¹⁸ For African survivals in general see, Jason Young, *Rituals of Resistance: African Atlantic Religion in Kongo and the Lowcountry South in the Era of Slavery* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2007), Walter Hawthorne, *From Africa to Brazil: Culture, Identity, and an Atlantic Slave Trade, 1600-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), Ras Michael Brown, *African-Atlantic Cultures and the South Carolina Lowcountry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), Michael Gomez, *Exchanging Our Country Marks: The Transformation of African Identities in the Colonial and Antebellum South* (Chapel Hill: UNC, 1998), and Shane White and Graham White, “Slave Hair and African-American Culture in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries,” *Journal of Southern History* 61 (1995): 45-76.

directly demonstrable from documentation of the slave era.¹⁹ Because of this critical concern, phenomenological readings of contemporary African spirituality can also reveal something important about slave's mindsets as the natural world remains a vital touchstone for smelling in modern African cultures. Accordingly, P. R. McKenzie's *Hail Orisha!* (1997) describes the centrality of the natural within West African religious traditions through a reading of how the spirit Orisha can be detected through the embodied sensations of the Yoruba.²⁰ In his analysis of "choreographic modalities" to show that the categories of cultural retention in the New World often included similarly deep sensory aspects related to the natural environment, Robert Farris Thompson described:

The slang term 'funky' in black communities originally referred to strong body odor...The black nuance seems to derive from the Ki-Kongo *lu-fuki*, 'bad body odor,' and is perhaps reinforced by contact with *fumet*, 'aroma of food and wine,' in French Louisiana. But the Ki-Kongo word is closer to the jazz word 'funky' in form and meaning, as both jazzmen and Bakongo use 'funky' and *lu-fuki* to praise

¹⁹ For problems with reading into slave narratives see, Paul Lovejoy, "Autobiography and Memory: Gustavus Vassa, Alias Olaudah Equiano, the African," *Slavery & Abolition* 27, 3 (2006): 317-347. However, regarding the FWP narratives: "it is of course true that human memory is fallible, but there is no reason to believe that the memories of the ex-slaves interviewed were worse than anyone else's." Slave memories which were recorded usually were ingrained as "pivotal moments in their lives" and were probably remembered clearly. Charles Davis and Henry Louis Gates, *The Slave's Narrative* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985), quote from 42-43.

²⁰ P. R. McKenzie, *Hail Orisha!: A Phenomenology of a West African Religion in the Mid-Nineteenth Century* (Leiden: Brill, 1997), esp. 38-47. For concerns with phenomenology, especially regarding the role of Christianity as a disguised normative that might work to create a static conception of Africa, see James Cox, "Missionaries, the Phenomenology of Religion and 're-presenting' Nineteenth-Century African Religion: a Case Study of Peter McKenzie's *Hail Orisha!*" *Journal of Religion in Africa* 31, 3 (2001): 336-353. For the landscape in Yorubaland during the slave trade see the analysis of martial transformation and the material culture of warfare within, Aribidesi Usman, "The Landscape and Society of Northern Yorubaland," in *Archaeology of Atlantic Africa and the African Diaspora*, ed. Akinwumi Ogundiran and Toyin Falola (Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 2010), 149-159.

persons for the integrity of their art, for having ‘worked out’ to achieve aims. In Kongo today it is possible to hear an elder lauded in this way: ‘like, there is a really funky person!-my soul advances toward him to receive his blessing’ (yati, nkwa lu-fuki! Ve miela miami ikwenda baki).²¹

In Kongo tradition, the smell of a hardworking elder of the community is considered to carry good luck. Funkiness, partly of odor, means a return to the fundamental essence of earthiness important to cultural constructs that began in Africa, but permeated into American jazz and African American culture.²²

Ritualized patterns informed several structural tendencies in African diasporic retention of ways of smelling that can be read through many of these modern African sensory worlds.²³ Ethnobotanists have linked various strong-smelling herbs, barks, and powders from the era of the slave trade to African religious practices in the New World.²⁴

²¹ Robert Farris Thompson, *Flash of the Spirit: African and Afro-American Art and Philosophy* (New York: Random House, 1983), 117-131, quote on 104. Similarly anachronistic, but still relevant, are Victor Turner’s studies of ritual polarization, association, and condensing among the Ndembu of twentieth century Zambia, who used smell as a marker of disease and used numerous stinking roots to cure diseases. Turner noted their belief that: “The bitterness (*kulula*) of the *mwala* root can kill the disease. *Mutata* has a very nasty smell. The woman should drink its medicine to make her stomach smell very much. The disease will smell it and die because of its stink.” Victor Turner, *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1967), quote on 314. For Turner’s later analysis, informed by these ideas, of “communitas” and “liminality” as forms of resistance to dominant ritual and linguistic forms in cultures see, Victor Turner, *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors; Symbolic Action in Human Society* (Ithaca NY: Cornell University Press, 1974).

²² Thompson, *Flash of the Spirit*, quote on 105. For concerns with anachronism and temporality in the study of African history through a European lens see, Akinwumi Ogundiran, “The End of Prehistory? An Africanist Comment,” *The American Historical Review* 118, 3 (2013): 788-801.

²³ As Wyatt MacGaffey understood in *Religion and Society in Central Africa* (1986), rituals remain more vital for African belief systems than myths. Rituals can create entire theories of the world apart from structured lessons found in mythology. Wyatt MacGaffey, *Religion and Society in Central Africa: The BaKongo of Lower Zaire* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1986), esp. 88-90.

²⁴ See the detailed analysis of scent categories within, Tinde van Andel, Sofie Ruyschaert, Kobeke Van de Putte, and Sara Groenendijk, “What Makes a Plant Magical?: Symbolism and Sacred Herbs in Afro-Surinamese *Winti* Rituals,” in *African Ethnobotany in the Americas*, ed. Robert Voeks and John Rashford

Combining these many olfactory references from the era of the trade with numerous later olfactory components of African spirituality portrays plenteous deeply engaged aromatic African cultures that resisted slavery through various acrid and fragrant measures. In numerous New World societies two specific traditions, of smelling-out for divining purposes and using scented objects to heal, helped to provide agency for slaves trapped in the body grinding machine of the slave economy.²⁵

Smelling-Out Anachronism

Whether forcing slaves to work on sugar plantations till their lungs collapsed from heated embolisms or driving African laborers into later South African gold and diamond mines, Western cultures created a multi-temporal idea that witchcraft, and the smelling-out practices of medicine men, was savage and incompatible with ideas of progress.²⁶ Reading between the lines of the racial treatises of the *American Phrenological Journal and Life Illustrated* from 1865 provides a summary of such practices of smelling-out witches as a traditional African skill through the racially termed “Kaffir” peoples analyzed during the late nineteenth century. Like the seventeenth century Guinea nations who sniffed out each other’s morality summarized by traveler Manuel Alvares in chapter five, doctors of the

(New York: Springer, 2013), 246-284.

²⁵ For the ancient roots of different African cosmology within Kametic and Egyptian traditions see, Melvin Rahming, “Reading Spirit: Cosmological Considerations in Garfield Linton’s *Voodooism: A Book of Foretelling*,” in *Literary Expressions of African Spirituality*, ed. Carol Marsh-Lockett and Elizabeth West (Lanham: Lexington Books, 2013), 35-62.

²⁶ For background on West African religion in the twentieth century and forms of witchcraft see, Geoffrey Parrinder, *West African Religion, A Study of the Beliefs and Practices of Akan, Ewe, Yoruba, Ibo, and Kindred Peoples* (London: Epworth Press, 1961), esp. 169-171.

South African populations analyzed by the xenophobic journal: “profess to be able to ‘smell out’ the person they say bewitched the sick people.” This nation, as many African cultures articulated prior and since, believed most illness came from witchcraft, and the way to find witches was to smell out their poison, bags of bewitching goods, or scented illnesses upon infirm bodies.²⁷

In a case from July, 1892, an African woman was prevented from leaving the area of Pondoland by the chief of the region, Sigcan, because she was deemed a witch.²⁸ Sigcan cited the “smelling-out” of the accused witch, Mamatiwane, as proof of her malevolence. The British High Commission disputed this ruling, and debated whether “smelling-out” was proof enough for the colonial court to accept this form of punishment on the African frontier. The High Commission warned Sigcan, in the wake of the punishment, against “a continuance of a practice so repugnant to civilization and good government.”²⁹ The ruling of August 1, 1892 concluded that continuing with policies that involved the “smelling-out”

²⁷ Anonymous, “A Kaffir Witch Doctor,” *The American Phrenological Journal and Life Illustrated: A Repository of Science, Literature, and General Intelligence* 41, 6 (June, 1865): quote on 189; Manuel Alvares, et al., *Ethiopia Minor and a Geographical Account of the Province of Sierra Leone (c.1615)* (Liverpool: Dept. of History, University of Liverpool, 1990), Appendix, “Of the Province of the Sousous: Single Chapter,” esp. 7-8. Anachronistic application of later eras to earlier histories is only problematic if value judgements are asserted through a Western understanding of time consciousness and civilization. If time does not inherently mean progress, then it is not specifically judgmental to equate witchcraft of later eras to understand the African past and the spiritualism of slaves in earlier eras. Historically, anachronism was problematic as it could aid in the creation of a rhetorically “static Africa” that was understood as unable to change without Western capital intrusion. However, when Western capitalism is not a normative good, it is less value-laden to define later eras of African history as espousing forms of ritual and witchcraft. For more on static Africa see, Walter Rodney, *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa* (Fahamu, Kenya: Pambazuka Press, 2012), 135-136, 249-250, and Toyin Falola, *The Power of African Cultures* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2008), esp. 52-59.

²⁸ “Pondoland: Unsettled Conditions in Pondoland; Case of ‘smelling-out’ (witchcraft) leading to torture of a woman at instigation of Chief Sigcan,” folio 610, 1891-1892, South Africa, DO 119/118.

²⁹ “High Commission Message to Sigcan on Practice of “smelling-out”, 8/1/1892,” No. 310 in, “Pondoland: Unsettled Conditions in Pondoland; Case of ‘smelling-out’ (witchcraft) leading to torture of a woman at instigation of Chief Sigcan,” folio 610, 1891-1892, South Africa, DO 119/118.

of witches and punishing those encountered as stinking would lead to further interference in Sigcan's region of Pondoland, which had recently become troubled by cattle thieving.³⁰

Mamatiwane escaped after her torture to take refuge among the British. She was the stepmother of Sigcan who had been accused of committing witchcraft on Sigcan's biological mother before Mamatiwane's actions were smelled-out by the witch doctors loyal to Sigcan. When interviewed as to her case, Mamatiwane described the incident. She stated that after journeying to discover the illness: "They at once arrested me and marched me back...when we got there I was told I was smelt out as the cause," of Sigcan's mother's illness. The smelling-out was so strong that Mamatiwane was taken quickly to Sigcan's home, stripped down, and lashed. The punishment continued through more violent means. Mamatiwane was tied to a pole and roasted over an open flame. She was tortured in this manner until she confessed her witch "charms." When removed from the roasting bit, Mamatiwane was taken to an herb garden she tended and told to point out the specific herbs she used in her trinkets. When she could not replicate her witchcraft, she was roasted again over the fire. A family that visited Mamatiwane after her escape were skeptical of Sigcan's doctors, offering in a telegram of July 14, 1892, that: "It is hardly credible that any doctors would smell her out unless he knew Sigcan wished it, and certainly the tortures were inflicted on her by his orders." For much of the previous year, the British hoped to create

³⁰ "Copy of Telegram from C. M. to U. S. N. A, 7/25/1892," in, "Pondoland: Unsettled Conditions in Pondoland; Case of 'smelling-out' (witchcraft) leading to torture of a woman at instigation of Chief Sigcan," folio 610, 1891-1892, South Africa, DO 119/118. For African societies and smelling-out witches see, Geoffrey Parrinder, *West African Psychology: A Comparative Study of Psychological and Religious Thought* (Cambridge: James Clarke & Co., 2002), 164-165, and the later assertion that smelling-out was not witchcraft but a progressive form of medicine in the 1880s within, Karen Elizabeth Flint, *Healing Traditions: African Medicine, Cultural Exchange, and Competition in South Africa, 1820-1948* (Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 2008), 114-116.

more influence in Pondoland, and may have offered this case as an example of the savagery they frequently defined to legitimize their interests in the region.³¹

Later examples of how British officials handled the transgression of witchcraft during an outbreak of Medicine Murders in 1947 and 1948 South Africa are emblematic of earlier traditions that perceived in the transgressive threat of the olfactory *pharmakon* of sorcery a challenge to British hegemony. During the late 1940s and early 1950s, the British and their associated church ministers worked to crack down on conjuring in areas of South Africa as a threat to the colony by linking witchcraft to larger organizational movements against the colonial power through the idea of “ritual murder” that often undermined the power of the state and the justification for punishment by the police.³²

The medicine men involved in one case trapped his medicine in a horn, which would lose or gain power depending on the strength of the charms. This power was threatened by a woman, who was thereafter mutilated sexually for the medicine man to retain his powers. This case was one of dozens of “Medicine Murders,” *liretlo*, in the region of Basutoland that involved witches and medicine men in constant battle with each other over the rights to power as the colonial regime consolidated authority.³³ The essential

³¹ “Copy of Telegram from Scott Kokstad to U. S. N. A., 7/14/1892,” in, “Pondoland: Unsettled Conditions in Pondoland; Case of ‘smelling-out’ (witchcraft) leading to torture of a woman at instigation of Chief Sigcan,” folio 610, 1891-1892, South Africa, DO 119/118.

³² The British had been researching witchcraft for many years in Africa and found that the laws that did exist were faltering due to the corrupt chieftains who profited through the use of witchcraft to suppress challenges to their legitimacy. “Laws Relating to Witchcraft, 1938,” Africa, CO 847/13/11; “Laws Relating to Witchcraft, 1940,” Africa, CO 847/19/9; “Sentence: Capital: *Rex vs. Chiefs Bereng and Gabashane and Others*, 1949: BAS, ‘Ritual Murder and Witchcraft,’” DO 119/1374; “Ritual Murders and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1949,” DO 119/1376, and discussions between British anthropologist G.I. Jones and British officials regarding the finest means of removing ritual murders from South African life within, “Ritual Murder and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1949,” G. 10, DO 119/1378.

³³ “Progress Report on Anti-Medicine Murder Propaganda Campaign in Basutoland,” A/S 117 II, 29 A, DO 119/1383. For the importance of the “medicine horn” for trapping charms see, “To Secretary of State, London, June 10, 1950,” 14, in “Ritual Murder and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1950,” G. 10, DO 19/1380, esp.

tension that instigated British concern involved medicine men increasingly removing human flesh as a means to make new and stronger medicines.³⁴

Motives for the witch doctors in many of these cases were often listed by British officials as strengthening or consolidating the power of their local chiefs. The British were often anxious when chiefs believed themselves gaining power against their British overlords, as these leaders often met in regional councils called Pitsos to discuss British policies. Most of the Medicine Murders involved sexual mutilation prior to homicide, as a means of collecting live human flesh for concoctions and charms.³⁵ Many *Bothuela* or *Mothueala*, both terms for smelling-out doctors, were often implicated as contributing to the sense of supernatural unease that drove many to commit ritual murder. For the British, encountering smelling-out concepts in 1948, these doctors were observed to: “work themselves up into a state of near delirium with the beating of a hardskin drum,” which would pulsate until the *Bothuela* would prophesize through their sense of smell.³⁶

An anthropological report gathered by the British, *Basutoland Medicine Murder* (1951), summarized what the British and their academic supporters believed about Medicine Murders. The British officials relayed that the use of human flesh was a recent

4-6.

³⁴ “Resident Commissioner’s Address to Medicine Murder Pitsos,” A/S 117 II, 9G, DO 119/1383.

³⁵ “Medicine Murder Statistics. Cases under Investigation,” 48 A/B, in “Ritual Murder and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1951,” DO 119/1381. For more on smelling-out in different African nations see and the many twentieth century anthropological references collected within, David Chidester, *African Traditional Religion in South Africa: An Annotated Bibliography* (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1997), 32, 49, 164, 210, 332-333.

³⁶ “Ritual Murders in Basutoland,” No. 20, in “Ritual Murders and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1949,” G. 10. DO 119/1377, esp. 25-26. For traditions of divining witches in other African societies during the era of the slave trade see the summary of *kimpasi* congregations in Congo traditions analyzed within, John Thornton, “Religious and Ceremonial Life in the Congo and Mbundu Areas, 1500-1700,” in *Central Africans and Cultural Transformations in the American Diaspora*, ed. Linda Heywood (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 71-90.

phenomenon in Basutoland witchcraft that was probably brought from Natal, and was only becoming more common due to the poor leadership and political tension in the region. The threat of transgression put fear among the British who understood that “a very quick and very drastic reduction in the power of the chiefs,” was essential in preventing more Medicine Murders.³⁷

In an effort to better understand the Medicine Murders that continued, the British enlisted an emic perspective in the form of memorandum from Basutoland citizens. B. M. Khaketla described the medicine of Basutoland in a longer tradition of African witchcraft and the belief in “contagious magic” that perpetuated ideas of transferring the qualities of bodies and goods within an ephemeral and preternatural realm. The author placed the first *liretlo* murders in the 1890s, when regional discord was common and European states were first settling the region in large numbers as the large kingdom of Moshoeshoe was broken into smaller chiefdoms.³⁸

The author continued with a long digression on the importance of smelling-out doctors to these Basuto traditions. His term for the witch doctors who used smell was “Motheke-Theke.” These practitioners were deemed to be “the most disgraceful of all” those who practiced witchcraft. They were a lower class form of witch or medicine man who would never be allowed to access the clans that retained the power in the area.

³⁷ *Basutoland Medicine Murder: A Report on the Recent Outbreak of Diretlo Murders in Basutoland*, Presented by the Secretary of State for Commonwealth Relations to Parliament by Command of His Majesty, 16 A, in “Ritual Murder and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1951,” DO 119/1381; “Telegram: 196, 11/28/1950,” in “Ritual Murder and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1950,” G. 10, DO 19/1380, quote on 3.

³⁸ B. M. Khaketla, “Memorandum on ‘Liretlo’,” No. 19 A, in “Medicine Murders: Basutoland, 1953,” S. 117. I, DO 119/1382. For reasons for outlawing of “smelling-out” in the 1840s by Basotho leader Moshoeshoe see, Elizabeth Eldredge, *A South African Kingdom: The Pursuit of Security in Nineteenth-Century Lesotho* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), esp. 36-38.

Khaketla described how the smelling-out usually occurred in a ritual of drumming and clapping, although his contention regarded that the diseases discovered were nothing more than a social hysteria brought about by jealousies, which could be uncovered through noticing the fear of these smelling-out doctors to the presence of snakes and millipedes.³⁹

As witchcraft further troubled British officials, surveys continued, leading to a Conference on Medicine Murders in September of 1953 to debate the laws against Medicine Murders and how to prevent future savagery. In that conference, British officials debated numerous historical ideas about witchcraft. At the extended and controversial meeting: “Opinion was divided on the question whether *mathuela* (smelling-out doctors) were directly concerned with medicine murders, some claiming that they are harmless cranks, and others that they oppose progress, prolong the life of the belief in magic, and, at worst, encourage the belief in the magical properties of medicines compounded with human flesh.”⁴⁰

At that conference, members discussed the causes of the murders, and outlined plans to remove all forms of witchcraft and superstition in favor of increased missionary activity in the region. The conference minutes noted that smelling-out doctors were a threat to proper civic order as: “Mathuela roamed the country and told people they could help them in their troubles.” Even as the ritual murders continued, “Mathuela were not concerned,” as none of them had “ever been brought to court,” for their relatively benign

³⁹ Khaketla, “Memorandum,” esp. 26-34.

⁴⁰ “Material Arranged for the Preparation of the Report of the Committee Appointed by the Round Table Conference on Medicine Murder Held at Naseru During the Month of September, 1955.” A/S 117 II, 9G, DO 119/1383; “Report by Major A. H. Donald and Chief Leshoboro Majara on Medicine Murders and Proposals for Combatting Them,” No. 15 A, in “Medicine Murders: Basutoland, 1953,” S. 117. I, DO 119/1382, esp. 3-5.

witchcraft. However, the conference concluded that this nonthreatening practice was inherently malignant and should be outlawed as productive of similar superstitions that led to Medicine Murders.⁴¹ Memoranda after the Conference consequently promoted the outlawing of *mathuela*. One attendee noted: “they should be treated in the same way as lepers.”⁴²

What could not be understood, what could not be made rational in the universal ideas of the later formulations of this British Empire, had to be considered savage and atavistic. More surveys and conferences led to a harsh Witchcraft Bill of 1955 that allowed for the imprisonment of anyone suspected of witchcraft for long sentences, which, through the abstraction in the language of the bill, could lead to life in prison for even the threat of witchcraft.⁴³

However, these forms of witchcraft could not be contained in British influenced regions of Africa. In Northern Rhodesia, near Barotseland, during the late 1950s numerous cases involved threats to British legitimacy from the *pharmakon* of witchcraft that included continued threats to mining companies and their laborers.⁴⁴ *Mathuela* continued as a part of this threat, as later British documents suggested further outlawing or imprisoning

⁴¹ “Conference on Medicine Murder: Naseru, 1st September, 1953,” No. 17 A in “Medicine Murders: Basutoland, 1953,” S. 117. I, DO 119/1382, quotes on 4, 8.

⁴² “Summary of Information and Suggestions Submitted to the Conference,” in “Medicine Murders: Basutoland, 1953,” S. 117. I, DO 119/1382, quote on 15.

⁴³ “A Bill Intituled: An Ordinance to Make Better Provision For the Prevention of Witchcraft and the Punishment of Witches,” Witchcraft Legislation in Uganda, EAF 260/51/01 and CO 822/1136. For the punishment of Medicine Murder see the execution of suspected murderers and the British and Basuto responses to capital punishment in, “Sentence: Capital: *Rex vs. Chiefs Bereng and Gabashane and Others: BAS*,” No. K. 5, in DO 119/1373.

⁴⁴ “Witchcraft in N. Rhodesia, 1957-1959,” CAA 578/4/01.

Mathuela in mental hospitals.⁴⁵ When read against the Obeah accusations, threats, and laws discussed later in this chapter, British apprehensions about witchcraft are quite analogous. These essentially superstructural accusations of savagery occur in different times for similar reasons of accumulated capital.⁴⁶

Many African nation's conceptions of odor during the slave trade often involved similar formations of fair and foul smells that could emerge from work, ritual practice, and witchcraft. Various conceptions of descent, herbalism, witchcraft, and smelling the natural world should not be dismissed as anachronistic to earlier African cultures as the evidence that exists for the history of those societies is often clouded in the etic language of colonial powers. Therefore, this chapter borrows much from modern understandings of scent in African societies, reads against the grain of colonialist texts, and finds some historical emic understandings of African aromas, to determine how slaves understood odor within the Atlantic World.⁴⁷

⁴⁵ "Report of the Committee Appointed by the Round Table Conference on Medicine Murder," 1A, in "Medicine Murders: Basutoland," S. 117 III. DO 119/1384, 1954-1955, esp. 14-15.

⁴⁶ For anthropology that judged smelling in African societies as part of a confidence game see, E. E. Evans-Pritchard, *The Zande Trickster* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1967), esp. 82-83. African societies that applied traditions of smelling-out can be judged as inherently positive in their rejection of Western capitalism, with their retrenchment against positivism, and due to holding on to traditions that were frequently deemed savage. Anachronism is one of the many sins that the archive proclaims as negative for the study of history. However, the present can be read upon the past, with the removal of a Western value system of capital, progress, and linear temporality. For temporal deconstruction in historical study see, Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987).

⁴⁷ In the Beng culture of the modern Ivory Coast, the soul inherited through the matriline is the positive form of the idea of "substance" that creates the legitimacy of power for rulers from different clans. This often involved a "more trivial and pejoratively viewed attribute that may be inherited through the matriline," that of body odor. "Not all individuals have body odor, but those who do invariably inherit it from the matriline; this form of substance, too, may be shared only by matrikin and not by patrikin." Alma Gottlieb, "Witches, Kings, and the Sacrifice of Identity or The Power of Paradox and the Paradox of Power among the Beng of Ivory Coast," in *Creativity of Power: Cosmology and Action in African Societies*, ed. W. Arens and Ivan Karp (Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1989), 245-272, quote on 259.

Throughout the Americas, African ethnic retention of natural knowledge of the environment allowed for patterns of resistance to emerge out of the landscapes where slaves toiled.⁴⁸ Karol Weaver's *Medical Revolutionaries* (2006) described many forms of slave medical managing through the use of such herbal medicine applied on Hispaniola. To cure numerous fevers, African healers would sometimes use a "decocotion" made from "pois-puans (literally, stinking peas; *Cassia occidentalis*).\" It was assumed at the time that "the plant's name came from its foul stench...slaves also roasted it and drank it as a type of coffee."⁴⁹ In 1786, the Consul Superieur of Le Cap put many of these herbal voodoo practitioners on trial in San Domingue. As historian Kate Ramsey described: "A number of these practices described in the indictments resemble ways that...strong roots in Kongo culture, have long been served, including the use of pepper, other hot spices, and gunpowder in ritual preparations, performances, and therapies."⁵⁰

Similar olfactory and herbal agency was applied by slaves and free blacks in colonial South America.⁵¹ Rachel Harding, in her analysis of the importance of female

⁴⁸ For a specific reading of slave's knowledge of the Southern environment through the retention of African natural philosophies as coded by gender categories and features of the landscape, within Congo traditions, see, Ras Michael Brown, "Walk in the Feenda': West-Central Africans and the forest in the South Carolina-Georgia Low Country," in *Central Africans and Cultural Transformations in the American Diaspora*, ed. Linda Heywood (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 289-318.

⁴⁹ Karol Weaver, *Medical Revolutionaries: The Enslaved Healers of Eighteenth-Century Saint Domingue* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2006), quotes on 73. For controls of the Code Noir on voodoo during the era of slavery, including laws against *makandal* bags, *kalenda* dances, and herbal poisons, see, Kate Ramsey, *The Spirits and the Law: Vodou and Power in Haiti* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011), esp. 28-36.

⁵⁰ Ramsey, *The Spirits and the Law*, quote on 39.

⁵¹ For specific analysis of African ethnobotanical traditions within South America see, Robert Voeks, "African Medicine and Magic in the Americas," *Geographical Review* 83, 1 (1993): 66-78.

practitioners to South American religious traditions, summarized the practices of Luiza Pinta, a black freedwoman in Minas Gerais in 1742, which often included the diagnosis of patient's diseases through the smelling of their heads.⁵² Historian Laura de Mello e Souza described how late sixteenth century Brazilian laundress Isabela Maria de Oliveira would place "scented roots inside the clothing of the men she wanted to win over...many people accused this unmarried woman of being a sorceress." Isabela was later interrogated by the Holy Office as a possible witch and "claimed that she used these roots so the clothes she ironed would smell fragrant and pleasing to her customers."⁵³

The diasporic tradition of Mami Wata, the mermaid or water spirit of many African nations, similarly represents the retention of African ways of smelling in South America.⁵⁴ Mami Wata rituals sometimes included dancers who would perform inside a ring of their fellow slaves. In 1775 Suriname, such a dance involved the retention of ways of smelling as divining. The dance, according to the Dutch governor Jean Nepveu, involved the usually Dahomey born dancers moving within a circle of onlookers and smelling-out the metaphorical poison within certain spectators who were then forced out of the circle.

⁵² Rachel Harding, *A Refuge in Thunder: Candomblé and Alternative Spaces of Blackness* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2000), 34-36, quote on 35. For the inherent fluidity of Candomblé, and modern practices of African traditions in Brazil, see, Stefania Capone, *Searching for Africa in Brazil: Power and Tradition in Candomblé* (Durham NC: Duke University Press, 2010), and the reading of the professionalization of Candomblé within, Robert Voeks, *Sacred Leaves of Candomblé: African Magic, Medicine, and Religion in Brazil* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1997), esp. 133-169.

⁵³ For the role of magic, amulets, *bolsa de mandingas*, and African retention of religious practices within syncretic Brazilian religion as resistance to elite Catholicism and capitalism during slavery see, Laura de Mello e Souza, *The Devil and the Land of the Holy Cross: Witchcraft, Slavery, and Popular Religion in Colonial Brazil* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2003), quotes on 151.

⁵⁴ For the definitive introduction to Mami Wata see, Henry John Drewal, *Sacred Waters: Arts for Mami Wata and Other Divinities in Africa and the Diaspora* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2008), and the role of creolization of Mami Wata practices in modern Africa, that often include New World ideas of mermaids, snake charming, and scented products, as analyzed within, Henry John Drewal, "Performing the Other: Mami Wata Worship in Africa," *The Drama Review* 32, 2 (1988): 160-185.

Nepveu described that “they pretend that they can not stand the smell of poisoners who are among the crowd, and who drive them mad; when these are driven away, they start dancing again.”⁵⁵

James Sweet’s *Domingos Alvares* (2011) similarly described the odors of ethnic African agency through the “fetid smell” of the “sack of medicinal plants” that Domingos would carry on his healing and embodied divining missions throughout eighteenth century Brazil, in the employ of masters or as a freed ex-slave.⁵⁶ Harding also described such medicinal bags in her work on Brazil, portraying the often strong-smelling roots that were meant to protect slaves from their masters through the magic placed upon them by the *feticeiro* Jose Francisco Pereira, who was prosecuted for his supposed witchcraft in 1731.⁵⁷ Historian Joao Reis likewise defined the importance of folkways of scent to African cultures in later Brazil of the nineteenth century who battled against an emerging medical professionalism. Therein, slave and free black Catholic confraternities resisted state attempts to control their use of olfactory culture in the keeping of their dead through using lavender water to scent their unburied deceased brethren.⁵⁸

⁵⁵ Alex van Stipriaan, “The Ever-Changing Face of Watramama in Suriname: A Water Goddess in Creolization since the Seventeenth Century,” in *Sacred Waters: Arts for Mami Wata and Other Divinities in Africa and the Diaspora*, ed. Henry John Drewal (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2008), 525-548, quote on 528. For an example of the social power of such water spirits see the reading of labor strikes in 1816 Brazil within, Robert Slenes, “The Great Porpoise-skull Strike: Central-African Water Spirits and Slave Identity in Early Nineteenth-century Rio De Janeiro,” in *Central Africans and Cultural Transformations in the American Diaspora*, ed. Linda Heywood (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 183-208.

⁵⁶ James Sweet, *Domingos Álvares: African Healing, and the Intellectual History of the Atlantic World* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2011), esp. 99-101. For the difficulty of analyzing African “witchcraft” in the Catholic Atlantic, due to the documentary records of the Inquisition see, Kathryn Joy McKnight, “En Su Tierra Lo Aprendio’: An African Curandero’s Defense Before the Cartagena Inquisition,” *Colonial Latin American Review* 12, 1 (2003): 63-84.

⁵⁷ Harding, *Refuge in Thunder*, 24-25.

⁵⁸ João José Reis, *Death Is a Festival: Funeral Rites and Rebellion in Nineteenth-Century Brazil* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2003), esp. 92-94, 234-240. For retention of African religious practices in the New World, including the Brazilian cultural importance of *culundu* (spirit possession), the

Atlantic Africans also often used odor on religious altars. Recent ethnographical works on altar worship has tied the understanding of performative spiritualism to the “flash of the spirit” that occurs when the dead and living are linked in an ephemeral moment of embodied spirituality. Among the modern day San of Namibia and Botswana, healing dances often involved the importance of the sense of smell in therapeutic dances. Robert Farris Thompson has summarized that during these healing ceremonies:

Blood sometimes rushes from the nostrils of a healer...The red of the blood matches the red of the flames. It dramatizes *n/um* heat, ‘boiling’ up the shaman’s back, vaporizing consciousness, driving the dancer to a higher plane. San associate this trance-hemorrhage with blood streaming from the noses of dying elands; it is the sign or seal of passage from this world to the next. Such blood is medicine. In the belief that its smell repels all sickness, San shamans rub its crimson substance on their patients.⁵⁹

Similar practices are evident in earlier art throughout this region of southern and southeastern Africa. As Thompson describes, numerous references from rock art of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries portrays a central healer with his nose highlighted

fear of Brazilian masters of African practices they deemed witchcraft, and the trans-sexual nature of *jinbandas* see, James Sweet, *Recreating Africa: Culture, Kinship, and Religion in the African-Portuguese World, 1441-1770* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2003), and for resistance through Candomblé and white fears and hatred of slave religious leaders see, Joao Jose Reis, “Domingos Pereira Sodre, a Nago Priest in Nineteenth-Century Bahia,” in *The Changing Worlds of Atlantic Africa: Essays in Honor of Robin Law*, ed. Robin Law, Toyin Falola, and Matt Childs (Durham, NC: Carolina Academic Press, 2009), 387-410.

⁵⁹ Robert Farris Thompson, *Face of the Gods: Art and Altars of Africa and the African Americas* (New York: Museum for African Art, 1993), quote on 38.

through artistic styling, often surrounded by a ring of dancers.⁶⁰ These dances, the practices of smelling within diverse ritual and herbal structures, and performances at ephemeral altars were significant for much of African spiritual practice in the New World.⁶¹

In North American traditions, many African survivals similarly occurred during numerous instances of slave and free black agency, often born of traditions wafting on what Julius Scott has deemed “a common wind” that transmitted knowledge amongst slave communities across national and economic boundaries.⁶² Herbal remedies that were acknowledged for their scents informed numerous slave medical traditions across European national boundaries.⁶³ Jason Young has designated the importance of conjurers and root doctors who “often enjoyed ‘even more importance than a preacher’ because many regarded him with the respect that awe and fear excites.” Analyzing the testimony of ex-slave Charles Hunter of St. Simon’s Island in Georgia, Young offered that root doctors often assumed a mystical olfactory character. This was repetitively illustrated in numerous

⁶⁰ Thompson, *Face of the Gods*, 38-45, and 122-123. For debates on the applicability of archaeology to the study of African retention see, M. L. Blakey, “Bioarchaeology of the African Diaspora in the Americas: Its Origins and Scope,” *Annual Review of Anthropology* 30 (2001): 387-422.

⁶¹ For the use of odor in presentations at altars in modern vodou practice, for offerings to Ezili Danto, see, Margarite Fernández Olmos and Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert, *Creole Religions of the Caribbean: An Introduction from Vodou and Santería to Obeah and Espiritismo* (New York: New York University Press, 2011), esp. 115-116.

⁶² Julius Scott, “A Common Wind: Currents of Afro-American Communication in the Age of the Haitian Revolution,” PhD. Dissertation. Duke University, 1986; a theme of communication also explored within Kevin Dawson, “The Cultural Geography of Enslaved Ship Pilots,” in *The Black Urban Atlantic in the Age of the Slave Trade*, ed. Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra, Matt Childs, and James Sidbury (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), 163-184. For the idea that creolization should be studied across geopolitical boundaries rather than defined through interactions on individual plantations see, Linda Rupert, *Creolization and Contraband: Curaçao in the Early Modern Atlantic World* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2012), esp. 248-249.

⁶³ For the historical tradition of claiming other culture’s medicines as dirty as a means of asserting identity see, Desmond Manderson, “Senses and Symbols: The Construction of Drugs in Historic and Aesthetic Perspective,” in *Law and the Senses: Sensational Jurisprudence*, ed. Lionel Bently and Leo Flynn (London: Pluto Press, 1996), 199-216.

slave descriptions of the smoky and scented rooms where conjurers and root doctors practiced.⁶⁴

Historian Walter Rucker has similarly examined the importance of root doctors and slave conjurers as human bridges for North American slaves to connect with their African cultural pasts. The conjurer William Webb of Kentucky had many of his fellow slaves fill bags with numerous herbs, which were then placed in front of the master's house to entice dreams of slave retribution in the master's mind and thus induce better treatment. Henry Bibb, who was repeatedly beaten by his master for running away, enlisted a similar conjurer to protect him from his master's whip. This was performed by sprinkling the body of Henry with herbs, powders, and protective roots. When these failed, and he was beaten again, Henry enlisted another conjurer who provided him a drink made with pungent cow manure and red pepper which, when ingested, would supposedly protect Henry from his master.⁶⁵

Uncle Jake (Juka), a legendary African American healer from North Georgia of the mid-twentieth century, was described as living in a "lusty" cabin that smelled of the red pepper and onions hung from the rafters. The "smelly drippings" that were common in Jake's cabin are suggestive of the slave healers of decades prior who used odors of the

⁶⁴ Young, *Rituals of Resistance*, quotes on 128-129. For critiques of the importance of African retention in the anthropological study of Afro-Caribbean religion see, Stephan Palmié, *The Cooking of History: How Not to Study Afro-Cuban Religion* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2013), esp. 6-12, the specific creolization of methodology in studies of Cuban economic societies of the nineteenth century within, Stephan Palmié, "Ecué's Atlantic: An Essay in Methodology," *Journal of Religion in Africa* 37, 2 (2007): 275-315, and the broader analysis within, Stephen Shennen, "Ethnic Ambiguity: A Cultural Evolutionary Perspective," in *Ethnic Ambiguity and the African Past: Materiality, History, and the Shaping of Cultural Identities*, ed. Francois Richard and Kevin MacDonald (Walnut Creek, California: Left Coast Press, Inc.), 272-285.

⁶⁵ Walter Rucker, "Conjure, Magic, and Power: The Influence of Afro-Atlantic Religious Practices on Slave Resistance and Rebellion," *Journal of Black Studies* 32, 1 (2001): 84-103, esp. 96-99.

environment as a means to keep distance between the slave population and white masters.⁶⁶ Slaves in Arkansas similarly used their knowledge of smells to create distance between their masters and the cabins they adorned with the scents of African diets. As one Arkansas observer, Mrs. Dicey Thomas, noted: “You couldn’t cook nothing without somebody knowin’ it. Couldn’t cook and eat in the back while white folk sit in the front without them knowin’ it. They used to steal from the old master and cook it and they would be burning rags or something to keep the white folks from smelling it.”⁶⁷ A similar tale, of a stolen chicken that had to be covered in “bedclothes” to hide the odor from white masters, was related by the ex-slave Millie Williams from Texas.⁶⁸

The conjurer Dr. Jones, an antebellum figure described by freedwoman Patsy Moses from Texas, often would take baths to scent himself so dogs could not detect him as he travelled to provide conjuring through “frog bones,” “snake skin,” and other objects that he would place as charms on doorsteps of malevolent masters.⁶⁹ An ex-slave interviewed in Florida, Cindy Kinsey, described how slaves would also often tie rabbit’s feet around their necks with stinking “akkerfedity” bags as a way to protect themselves during the era of the Civil War. She noted that: “if a Yankee cotch you wif dat rabbi foots an dat akkerfedity bag roun youh nek, he sush turn you loose right now.”⁷⁰ These scented

⁶⁶ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 4, Georgia, Part 2, Garey-Jones* (Library of Congress, 1936), 310-311.

⁶⁷ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 2, Arkansas, Part 6, Quinn-Tuttle* (Library of Congress, 1936), esp. 288-295, quote on 289.

⁶⁸ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 16, Texas, Part 4, Sanco-Young* (Library of Congress, 1936), esp. 170-172.

⁶⁹ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 16, Texas, Part 3, Lewis-Ryles*. (Library of Congress, 1936), 142-145.

⁷⁰ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 3, Florida, Anderson-Wilson with combined interviews of others* (Library of Congress, 1936), 191-193.

protective charms worked wonders for slaves searching for their freedom in wartime and from the hounds of their owners.

Conjure was common against masters, but was also used as a way to intimidate slaves and ex-slaves after emancipation. While questioning a former slave, Addie, an interviewer noticed the African American woman became agitated about a conjurer who would visit her land each morning and spread his charms. Addie proclaimed: “Does you smell that funny scent? Oh, Good Lawd! Jus’ look at dem white powders on my doorstep! Let me get some hot water and wash ‘em out quick! Now Missy, see how dese Niggers ‘round here is allus up to deir meanness?” Her understanding of conjure came from her youth on plantations in antebellum Georgia when slaves worked their olfactory knowledge to shield themselves from their master’s dominion.⁷¹

Frequently, African root doctors in the Americas would use material culture, sometimes implicating scents and odors of death, to create spaces of resistance.⁷² The use of goofer dust, the dirt of graveyards, as a weapon used as a sprinkling in front of master’s houses, or thrown in front of master’s carriages, exemplifies the importance of funerary retention as resistance through African spirituality and the productive powers of death.⁷³ Goofer dust thus acted, specifically for Kongo slaves in the American South, as a *minkisi*, or material object that has animistic and implicitly synesthetic olfactory powers to

⁷¹ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 4, Georgia, Part 4, Telfair-Young with combined interviews of others* (Library of Congress, 1936), 110-111.

⁷² For the idea that African resistance was essential in the making of later aspects of amelioration and abolitionism, see, Claudius Fergus, "'Dread of Insurrection': Abolitionism, Security, and Labor in Britain's West Indian Colonies, 1760-1823," *WMQ* 66, 4 (2009): 757-780.

⁷³ For the productive power of death for culture change and retention see, Vincent Brown, "Social Death and Political Life in the Study of Slavery," *The American Historical Review* 24, 5 (2009): 1231-1249, and Richard Price, "Dialogical Encounters in a Space of Death," in *New World Orders: Violence, Sanction, and Authority in the Colonial Americas*, ed. John Smolenski and Thomas Humphrey (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005), 47-65.

influence humans in the lived world.⁷⁴

Other slaves and freedmen would use their knowledge of smells and the environment to aid in their escapes from these violent owners. The captured freedman Solomon Northrup was adept at understanding the scent tracking of the dogs that his Louisiana captors used to hunt fugitives. After his escape, he wrote of his cleansing swim in the bayou that he used to overcome the "slight, mysterious scent" that the "quick-smelling" hounds searched to chase fugitive slaves to their return.⁷⁵ A slave named Burrus covered his feet in stinking pig's grease so that these dogs could not catch him during his escape from slavery in North Carolina, as described by the ex-slave Fanny Cannady.⁷⁶ Other slaves would often rub their feet with a vernacular termed herb called "Indian turnip" to cover their scents as they escaped from hounds, as remembered by Gus Smith, an ex-slave in Missouri.⁷⁷ In the game of dogs played against their masters, as the ex-slave America Morgan told interviewer Anna Pritchett, slave blood was often used to train dogs to the scents that masters believed existed in their slave's bodies.⁷⁸ However, through many

⁷⁴ Young, *Rituals of Resistance*, esp. 110, 163-166. For more on the tradition of using objects associated to death, scattered bones and goofer dust, see, Patrick Bellegarde-Smith, "Introduction," in *Fragments of Bone: Neo-African Religions in a New World*, ed. Patrick Bellegarde-Smith (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2005), 1-12.

⁷⁵ Solomon Northrup, *Twelve Years a Slave* (Auburn: Derby and Miller, 1853), quotes on 138-139.

⁷⁶ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 11, North Carolina, Part 1, Adams-Hunter* (Library of Congress, 1936), 3-5.

⁷⁷ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 10, Missouri, Abbot-Younger* (Library of Congress, 1936), esp. 331-332. For the idea that asserting African agency clouds the study of slavery with too many romantic narratives of resistance see, Peter Coclanis, "Slavery, African-American Agency, and the World We Have Lost," *Georgia Historical Quarterly* 79 (1995): 873-884.

⁷⁸ *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 5, Indiana, Arnold-Woodson* (Library of Congress, 1936), 141-144. For the history of bloodhounds and slavery see, Sara Johnson, "'You Should Give them Blacks to Eat': Cuban Bloodhounds and the Waging of an Inter-American War of Torture and Terror," *American Quarterly* 61, 1 (March, 2009): 65-92.

means, slaves found numerous environmental aids to counter these proficient canine's sensory skills.

Sarah Handy's Reconstruction era ethnography "Negro Superstitions" similarly included tales of such scented slave and post-Emancipation African American knowledge. Historian Yvonne Chireau's summary of the racialized ethnography, noted Handy's representation of "one doctor's treatment," which "included the burning of 'various vile-smelling powders' in a patient's room, followed by his opening a window 'to let the devil out'."⁷⁹ As Chireau noted regarding such structural applications of African American ritual traditions: "Over time, certain ingredients emerged as staple components in the material rhetoric of Conjure practices...Materials were selected both for their sympathetic associations and for aesthetic purposes." Among these included: "acrid herbs to displace evil essences....Some of the most powerful charms required exuviae from the body itself: hair, nails, skin, or waste matter such as urine or excrement. The inventory of conjuring materials has remained remarkably consistent for hundreds of years."⁸⁰

Specifically, Obeah practitioners in the Anglo-Atlantic represent the use of forms of African smelling that survived the Middle Passage.⁸¹ White masters in societies with

⁷⁹ Yvonne Chireau, *Black Magic: Religion and the African American Conjuring Tradition* (Berkeley, Calif: University of California, 2003), esp. 106-107; Sara Handy, "Negro Superstitions," *Lippincott's Magazine* 48 (December, 1891): 735-739.

⁸⁰ Chireau, *Black Magic*, quote on 48. Maggie Woods, a daughter of slaves from Summerville, Arkansas, described her use of conjure and medicine when discussing her use of chitlings to create a salve. Woods described: "It smell like chitlings. In that sack is the inside of the chitlings (hog manure). I boil it down and strain it, then boil it down, put camphor gum and fresh lard in it, boil it down low and pour it up. It is a green salve. It is fine for piles, rub your back for lumbago, and swab out your throat for sore throat." *Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 2, Arkansas, Part 7, Vaden-Young* (Library of Congress, 1936), 232-234. For later African use of similar fecal matter in the British era of Medicine Murders see the staining of stones with urine to mark ownership of lands in, "Ritual Murders in Basutoland," No. 20, in "Ritual Murders and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1949," G. 10. DO 119/1377, esp. 6-9.

⁸¹ For early references to Obeah in British literature see the summary of Obia-men as cane-carrying magicians in, James Grainger, *The Sugar-Cane: a Poem, In Four Books* (London: R. and J. Dodsley, 1764), esp. 142-

Obeah practitioners were anxious of the power spiritual practices could garner within slave cultures, especially after the 1760 revolt led by the slave Tacky in Jamaica, himself an Obeah practitioner who was believed by other slaves to be invincible due to his herbal charms.⁸² The fear of white masters to these untamable scents of African medical practice can be seen through analysis of the many laws the English used to control Obeah in Jamaica.⁸³ As well, the creation of Obeah novels in the Anglo-Atlantic of the nineteenth century demonstrates the concern white planters had over the upset that the *pharmakon* of olfactory Obeah could cause their slave societies.⁸⁴

Benjamin Moseley's *A Treatise on Sugar* (1800) summarized the importance of Obeah in the minds of fearful Jamaican planters. Moseley began his explanation by linking Obeah, shortened to Obi in his account, to ancient wisdom of Egyptians and Old Testament Semitic peoples who could manipulate the environment in ways the Europeans had lost touch with. Moseley summarized the "grave dirt, hair, teeth of sharks, and other animals, blood, feathers, egg-shells, images in wax, the hearts of birds, liver of mice, and some potent roots, weeds, and bushes" that Obi practitioners used to create "illness" in their

146, and the summary of Obeah materials used in Barbados within the letters of Thomas Walduck printed within, Thomas Walduck, "T. Walduck's Letters from Barbados, 1710-1711," *JBMHS* 15, 2 (May, 1948): 137-149, esp. 148-149.

⁸² For this intense fear of Obeah see, Richard Robert Madden, *A Twelvemonth's Residence in the West Indies*, (Philadelphia: Carey, Lea and Blanchard, 1835), esp. 72-75, and William Shepherd, "The Negro Incantation," in *The Poetical Register and Repository of Fugitive Poetry for 1803* (London: F. and C. Rivington, 1804), 413-415.

⁸³ For the importance of legal structures in maintaining slavery and asserting colonial identity through the separation of who could inflict violence upon whom see, John Smolenski, "Introduction: The Ordering of Authority in the Colonial Americas," in *New World Orders: Violence, Sanction, and Authority in the Colonial Americas*, ed. John Smolenski and Thomas Humphrey (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005), 1-16.

⁸⁴ For retention as resistance in slavery through Obeah and *myal*, especially due to the presence of Akan populations in Jamaica, see, Dianne Stewart, *Three Eyes for the Journey: African Dimensions of the Jamaican Religious Experience* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), esp. 58-68.

enemies. Rather than judge these practices as mere superstition, Moseley offered a tone of jealousy that “Europeans” were “ignorant” of these practices and their successful applications among Obi doctors. He continued: “Certain mixtures of these ingredients are burnt; or buried very deep in the ground; or hung up a chimney; or on the side of an house; or in a garden; or laid under the threshold of the door of the party, to suffer; with incantation songs, or curses, or ceremonies necromantically performed in planetary hours, or at midnight, regarding the aspects of the moon.”⁸⁵ Moseley summarized the inherent resistance in the practice of Obi by both men, who were more adept at using poisons and *calabashes*, and women, who were more adept at controlling the soul, the wind, and the weather. He prophetically noted, “Laws constructed in the West Indies, can never suppress the effect of ideas, the origin of which is in the centre of Africa.”⁸⁶

Moseley continued his summary to tell the story of the most famous Obi practitioner in Jamaica at the time, Three Fingered Jack, who could make zombie slaves out of a mixture of: “grave dirt, ashes, the blood of a black cat, and human fat; all mixed into a kind of paste.” He applied these goods in tandem with, “A cat’s foot, a dried toad, a pig’s tail, a slip of virginal parchment of kid’s skin, with characters marked in blood on it.”⁸⁷ The implications of zombie slaves, to master’s who wanted static laborers, pushed

⁸⁵ Benjamin Moseley, *A Treatise on Sugar: With Miscellaneous Medical Observations* (London: J. Nichols for G. G. and J. Robinson, 1800), quotes on 190-192. For the need of slaves to create their own medical culture to fill in the gaps where white medicine failed see the reading of Obeah within, Jerome Handler, “Slave Medicine and Obeah in Barbados, Circa 1650 to 1834,” *NWIG: New West Indian Guide/Nieuwe West-Indische Gids* 74, 1-2 (2000): 57-90.

⁸⁶ Moseley, *A Treatise on Sugar*, quote on 194. For large-scale slave resistance within the Atlantic see, Jack Shular, *Calling Out Liberty: The Stono Slave Rebellion and Universal Struggle for Human Rights* (Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2009), Michael Mullin, *Africa in America: Slave Acculturation and Resistance in the American South and the British Caribbean, 1736-1831* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1992), esp. 269-281, and Michael Craton, *Testing the Chains: Resistance to Slavery in the British West Indies* (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1982).

⁸⁷ Moseley, *A Treatise on Sugar*, quotes on 197. For a modern reading of the zombie in Haitian religious

planters to attack and kill Jack for his attempted subversion of the slave system through the use of numerous animistic and usually scented objects.⁸⁸

Many Obeah practitioners became adept at using poisons, on occasion citing knowledge about toxins from African traditions, as in the case of Igbo poisoning customs used in Martinique of the early nineteenth century.⁸⁹ These poisoned wells and bodies of the Atlantic, sometimes exaggerated by white officials for hegemonic discourse, would occasionally be discovered through the feared scent of a poisoned well or the process of other Obeah practitioners smelling-out the accused poisoner.⁹⁰ Olfactory discovery of poison was, of course, avoided by slaves who wished to harm their masters through subversive means. Nevertheless, poison was a pungent commodity, and its odor was something seldom distinguishable to dichotomous white noses. Africans skills at understanding how to create poisons that smelled of other goods, or did not smell at all, portrays a sensory skill that allowed for tangible and often fatal forms of resistance within

traditions, especially regarding the powders used to create zombie puppets, see, Wade Davis, *Passage of Darkness: The Ethnobiology of the Haitian Zombie* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1988), esp. 169-173.

⁸⁸ Moseley, *A Treatise on Sugar*, esp. 198-205. For later performance of a play about Three Fingered Jack, based on earlier novels about his exploits, see, Errol Hill, *The Jamaican Stage, 1655-1900: Profile of a Colonial Theatre* (Amherst, Mass.: University of Massachusetts Press, 1992), esp. 100-102.

⁸⁹ For white exaggerations of poisoning to assert a more dominant hierarchy see, Sasha Turner Bryson, "The Art of Power: Poison and Obeah Accusations and the Struggle for Dominance and Survival in Jamaica's Slave Society," *Caribbean Studies* 41, 2 (2013): 61-90, esp. 63-69, and the idea that British officials in Jamaica created a language of contagion to classify Obeah as a disease within, J. Alexandra McGhee, "Fever Dreams: Obeah, Tropical Disease, and Cultural Contamination in Colonial Jamaica and the Metropole," *Atlantic Studies* 12, 2 (2015): 179-199.

⁹⁰ For the role of poison, regarding the intensive prosecution of poisoners in Martinique due to previous French colonial concerns with poison as a female weapon of the weak in France, see, John Savage, "'Black Magic' and White Terror: Slave Poisoning and Colonial Society in Early 19th Century Martinique," *Journal of Social History* 40, 3 (2007): 635-662. For an example of poisoning see the case of slave Dick Burrowes who poisoned his masters with "deleterious drugs" poured in drinks he served in 1807 within, "Tales of Old Barbados," *JBMHS* 11, 1 (1934): 171-178.

the New World.⁹¹

In Jamaica of 1789, one slave poisoned a well that became so pungent that the white masters whom slaves had hoped to murder discovered the plot through their own sense of smell. Deep in the well the slave had placed a mutilated, pungent, and poisoned dead chicken. When interrogated, other slaves on the plantation pointed to a brother and sister as the culprits. Upon entering the home of the sister, they discovered her Obeah wares: a “Calabash with greenish liquid...recently emptied.”⁹²

The fear of poison became essential as a motive for controlling populations and protecting Anglo-Atlantic bodies throughout the New World. Charles Cave, while in the West Indies during the aftermath of Bussa’s Rebellion, summarized such fear of constructed contagions as leading to increased repression upon slaves even after the “insurrection” was “all now apparently quiet” in June of 1816.⁹³ British masters turned to law to attempt to stop the preponderance of Obeah in their West Indian colonies.⁹⁴ They asserted laws against the production of *makandals* or *calabashes*, which could contain “poisonous or noxious” drugs and herbs, “pounded glass,” and other materials meant to

⁹¹ For debates on agency, resistance, and power see, Walter Johnson, “Agency: A Ghost Story,” in *Slavery’s Ghost: The Problem of Freedom in the Age of Emancipation*, ed. Richard Follett, Eric Foner, and Walter Johnson (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins, 2011), 8-30.

⁹² Bryson, “Art of Power,” esp. 70-72. For a reading of the historical memory of slavery through the “middle passage epistemology,” or the inherent intersectionality and multitemporality of the roots of blackness see, Michelle Wright, *Physics of Blackness: Beyond the Middle Passage Epistemology* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2015), esp. 37-72.

⁹³ Charles Cave, “Charles Cave’s Letter Book, 1815-1836,” June 28, 1816, BDA X 10/17. For how Obeah, both before and after emancipation, was often defined relatively as a means for legal manipulation by British officials see, Diana Paton, *The Cultural Politics of Obeah: Religion, Colonialism and Modernity in the Caribbean World* (Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2015), esp. 6-16.

⁹⁴ For the role of law in controlling African populations in Jamaica before and after emancipation, and the role of Obeah as post-emancipation resistance, see, Diana Paton, *No Bond but the Law: Punishment, Race, and Gender in Jamaican State Formation, 1780-1870* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004), esp. 140-142 and 180-184.

allow what whites believed was an easier path to connivance with the devil and evil spirits.⁹⁵

Like with witches in South Africa of later years, the British became obsessed with rooting out and surveying Obeah elements in the West Indies. Reverend H. Beame's *Report on the State of the Parish of St. James* (1825) summarized many of these infatuations through portraying Obeah as an evil to be overcome by the Christian faith. To Beame, the slave population was made up of liars, thieves, abortionists, and polygamists who committed crimes out of inherent evil. In this judgement, Beame prejudicially described the superstitions of how, at African funerals, the gathered would "kill either a fowl or hog" that would transfer to Africa through the spirit world. Once there, the hog or fowl would feed the slave who had returned to the homeland upon burial.⁹⁶

The practice of such Obeah, under the new slave laws of the nineteenth century, was punishable by death. The ambiguity of how to prove Obeah, when it was a supernatural and transgressive phenomenon, was of utmost concern to those drafting the new slave laws. Thus, the Act of 1826 summarized: "If any slave...shall assault or offer any violence by striking or otherwise, to or towards any white person or persons in free condition...shall upon conviction be punished with death, transportation, or confinement to hard labor for life, or a limited time, or such other punishment as the court at their discretion shall think

⁹⁵ *Slave Law of Jamaica: With Proceedings and Documents Relative Thereto* (London: J. Ridgway, 1828), quotes on 28-30. For role of laws in the control of Obeah in Barbados, Suriname, and Jamaica, from the era of slavery until today, see, Jerome Handler and Kenneth Bilby, *Enacting Power: The Criminalization of Obeah in the Anglophone Caribbean, 1760-2011* (Kingston, Jamaica: University of the West Indies Press, 2012), esp. 16-28.

⁹⁶ "Extracts from the Reverend H. Beame's report of the state of the parish of St. James describing religious instruction provided and comparing the 'disposition' of 'Africans' and 'creoles', and rural and urban people. Touches on polygamy, abortion, Obeah and stresses that 'effectively to promote the improvement of the Slave, the first effort must be with the free'," folios 217-218, in "Correspondence from the bishop of Jamaica, Christopher Lipscomb, to the secretary of state relating to his appointment and work, his visits to Grand Cayman, Honduras and the Bahamas, and to other mainly ecclesiastical matters," CO 137/267.

proper to inflict.”⁹⁷ The idea that an assault could be perpetrated without touching exemplified the white belief in the social, if not spiritual, functions of Obeah, and the desire to control that reifying belief system through harsh penalties.⁹⁸

The environment was an essential space for resistance through these aromatic forms of African spiritualism. In Barbados, practitioners of African medicines often attempted to use the high petroleum content of the island to their advantage in confidence games against their masters. One slave woman, during the 1790s, attempted to portray her witchcraft to white onlookers by lighting a pungent bubbling brook on fire.⁹⁹ Slaves attempted, through these means, to use their environments, and the odors therein, to find means of portraying powers to frighten their masters into offering better treatment.¹⁰⁰

Obeah was a significant form of resistance.¹⁰¹ The similarly noteworthy form of resistance within the scented *myal* herbal practice that was a subsidiary to the spiritualism of Obeah was possibly named for the aromatic weed *Eryngium foetidum* or from the similarly olfactory African Kumina term *mwela*, or breathing power concerning plant

⁹⁷ Society for the Mitigation and Gradual Abolition of Slavery throughout the British Dominions, *The New Slave Laws of Jamaica and St. Christopher's Examined With an Especial Reference to the Eulogies Recently Pronounced Upon Them in Parliament* (London: Society for the Mitigation and Gradual Abolition of Slavery, 1828), quotes on 13-14.

⁹⁸ For the lack of a single meaning for Obeah, even among practitioners, see, Kenneth Bilby, “An (Un)natural Mystic in the Air: Images of Obeah in Caribbean Song” in *Obeah and Other Powers: The Politics of Caribbean Religion and Healing*, ed. Diana Paton and Maarit Forde (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012), 45-79.

⁹⁹ Pinckard, *Notes on the West Indies*, 299-300. For a similar account see, Henry Fitzherbert, “The Journal Henry Fitzherbert Kept While in Barbados in 1825,” *JBMHS* 44 (Nov/Dec): esp. 150-151.

¹⁰⁰ For the idea that Obeah women were vital as bridges to the African past see, Kameelah Martin, “Hoodoo Ladies and High Conjurors: New Directions for an Old Archetype,” in *Literary Expressions of African Spirituality*, ed. Carol Marsh-Lockett and Elizabeth West (Lanham: Lexington Books, 2013), 119-144.

¹⁰¹ Gakandi, *Slavery and the Culture of Taste*, esp. 226-281; James Epstein, *Scandal of Colonial Rule: Power and Subversion in the British Atlantic during the Age of Revolution* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), esp. 13-45.

life.¹⁰² Slaves were forced by poor medical care provided by masters to turn to the African medicine of *myal*'s aromas to keep their bodies and minds in decent health and working order.¹⁰³

Obeah thus became communal by necessity, networked and organized in order to heal sick slaves. Obeah sometimes employed scented waters to wash sick slaves, as in the case of the slave Cornelia in nineteenth century British Guiana. The Obeah-man Willem, in a similar olfactory practice in Guiana, used an herb-scented broom as a healing device, as based on African herbal traditions among the Ga language group of present day Ghana.¹⁰⁴ Rather than the witchcraft and malevolent herbal practice that planters portrayed in Obeah, African herbal traditions helped to cure slaves, or at least provide some scented psychosomatic support, in spaces where white medicine failed.¹⁰⁵

These transgressive olfactory concerns also included colonialist worries over the ability of smelling-out witchcraft among Obeah practitioners.¹⁰⁶ British violence against

¹⁰² For *myal* etymologies see, Stewart, *Three Eyes for the Journey*, esp. 44, 50-51. For the counter-cultural aspects of *myal* applied to later analysis of the Yoruba in Atlantic littoral see, Monica Schuler, "Alas, Alas, Kongo": A Social History of Indentured African Immigration into Jamaica, 1841-1865 (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1980), 32-44.

¹⁰³ For images of Obeah practitioners, with the goals of showing their healing roles rather than the witchcraft that has been associated to Obeah see, Handler and Bilby, *Enacting Power*, 29-38.

¹⁰⁴ Juanita De Barros, "'Setting Things Right': Medicine and Magic in British Guiana, 1803-38," *Slavery and Abolition* 25, 1 (2004): 28-50, esp. 28-34, 44-46. For the use of scented baths, *abô de casa*, and the informal taxonomy of scented herbs on a spectrum from hot to cold, as used within similar Brazilian Candomblé traditions, see, Voeks, *Sacred Leaves*, esp. 95-96, 124-128, and the importance of scented baths within Santería traditions in, Fernández Olmos and Paravisini-Gebert, *Creole Religions*, esp. 178-183.

¹⁰⁵ Kenneth Bilby and Jerome Handler, "Obeah: Healing and Protection in West Indian Slave Life," *The Journal of Caribbean History* 38, 2 (2004): 153-183. For the history of British medicine in the West Indies, and the spaces where African medicine had to fill gaps in British practice even though laws worked to suppress African practices, see, Richard Sheridan, *Doctors and Slaves: A Medical and Demographic History of Slavery in the British West Indies, 1680-1834* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 42-97, esp. 78-79.

¹⁰⁶ For contemporary British literature portraying the fear of Obeah as witchcraft see the summary of African roots of Obeah as applied in, Thomas Campbell and Samuel Rogers, *The Pleasures of Hope: With Other Poems* (Dublin: W. Porter, 1803), esp. 121-122, and the importance of Obeah laws to the tale "The Grateful

Obeah increased throughout the colonies. In 1806, one West Indian slave who practiced Obeah poisoned his master. As a letter from Grenadian Governor Frederick Maitland described: “he was tried as the law instructs...found guilty, and sentenced to be hanged, his head, when dead, to be cut off and placed on a pole.” His accomplices were flogged, and “pounded glass, little filings of copper, and powdered” vegetables that have “injurious qualities” were found in his cabin.¹⁰⁷

However vile the punishments for Obeah became, “slaves were much more mobile than we might imagine.”¹⁰⁸ This mobility was not always considered tangible. Government reports included summaries of the abilities of Obeah men to “enter animals” and control their actions. Controlling buffalo, elephants, and snakes, as noted in the report which must have leaned on descriptions of the African pre-texts to Obeah due to the animals listed, could allow Obeah-men to kill masters and fellow Africans without laying hands upon their bodies. Such Obeah-men were usually “discovered by a process analogous to the 'smelling out' of witches among the Zulu.” This African agency was applied by many Obeah-men in a constant battle of wits and suffering whereby each Obeah-man could usually only work against other Obeah and *myal* practitioners.¹⁰⁹

Negro” in, Maria Edgeworth, Richard Lovell Edgeworth, Samuel Hale Parker, Eliakim Littell, and Robert Norris Henry, *Works of Maria Edgeworth* (Boston: Samuel H. Parker, 1824), esp. 353-354.

¹⁰⁷ Frederick Maitland to William Windhorn, “Letter of December 7, 1806,” in “Refers to importation of articles, with reference to salt fish; refers to an enslaved person of African descent who was convicted ten days previous of an attempt to poison the manager on the estate; person was tried by two magistrates and three white men as the jury, and then was hanged; states that the man was connected with 'obye' [obeah]. Frederick Maitland, Grenada,” folios 177-178, CO 101/44. Such representation of the manipulated dead was a colonial assertion of power used to prevent slaves from revolt and suicide. Vincent Brown, *The Reaper's Garden: Death and Power in the World of Atlantic Slavery* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2008).

¹⁰⁸ James Walvin, *Black Ivory: A History of British Slavery* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2001), quote on 165.

¹⁰⁹ *Report of the Lords of the Committee of the Council Appointed for the Consideration of all Matters*

In Berbice, during the British era of control, such a tale of counteractive Obeah-men included the Obeah doctor Hans who was hired to smell-out the malevolent Obeah applied by the slave Frederick, who would boil highly scented goods in a pot that included: “blood, negro hair, shavings of nails, head of a snake, a ram’s horn.” Hans discovered the evil in the pot through smelling-out the malevolence trapped inside the boiled ram’s horn. In the years to follow, Hans would brag to those who asked him of his powers, “If I go to any house where poison is hid I can discover it from the smell.”¹¹⁰ Over time, British officials came to understand that Obeah worked within African communities of the West Indies as not simply malevolence against British masters and later bureaucrats. Though certain Obeah crimes such as murder continued to be prosecuted harshly, the general herbal medicine of Obeah and *myal* practitioners became less of a threat to British goals in the West Indies after Emancipation.¹¹¹

Even with some officials desires to limit punishing the less vile herbal practices of *myal*, British officials still attempted to root out Obeah after Emancipation, with the wide-

Relating to Trade and Foreign Plantation (London: N. P., 1789), quotes on 20. For importance of separating *myal*, herbal medicine, and Obeah, spiritualism which could contain herbal medicine, in the study of African retention of spiritual traditions see, Stewart, *Three Eyes for the Journey*, esp. 44-47.

¹¹⁰ For the increasingly violent nature of Obeah under slavery, in part through these counteractive Obeah-men, see, R. M. Browne, “The ‘Bad Business’ of Obeah: Power, Authority, and the Politics of Slave Culture in the British Caribbean,” *WMQ* 68, 3 (2011): 451-480, quotes on 477-479. For a later case of similarly counter-active “obeahmen” see the case of Teacher Grant and Teacher Nelson in 1921 Jamaica who used each other’s charms (duppy) against each other’s families in committing robberies. “Reports that a further application was made for the appointment of the Reverend A A Grant, a Minister of the National Baptist Convention of America in Jamaica, as a Marriage Officer. The Governor has refused to make the appointment. In support of his decision, he transmits copies of minutes by the Registrar General and the Inspector General of Police. In particular it is pointed out that the Reverend Grant is suspected of involvement in the practice of ‘Obeah’,” No. 185, folios 67-74, CO 137/747.

¹¹¹ For leniency on Obeah as slavery met its end in the West Indies see the desire to remove punishments against those using “charms”, “incantations”, “magical arts” to hypnotize female populations, and “certain foolish ceremonies” to cure illnesses through “pretended remedies” and “quackery”, within, “Proceedings in trials of T House, Polydore, and Industry convicted for Obeah, Howe Peter Browne, Marquess of Sligo, Governor of Jamaica, Jamaica,” No. 315, folios 355-375, CO 137/209/59, quotes on 358-360, 362-364.

ranging 1845 anti-Obeah law applied extensively after the Morant Bay uprising of 1865.¹¹² To enforce these laws, the British found much use for Herbert Thomas, a policeman and researcher into Obeah who became known as the “Obeah Catcher” in 1870s and 1880s Jamaica. Thomas, who investigated Obeah in the Morant Bay area, the central location for Obeah practitioners, published his reports on Obeah in a pamphlet entitled *Something about Obeah* (1891).¹¹³

Thomas portrayed “obeahmen” as essentially demonic. Their world was one of snakes, deformed faces, and slow gaits due to malformed feet. One cabin was full of: “Wooden images, doll heads, bits of looking glass, fowl-bones, the skins of snakes and frogs, the comb and beak of a cock, a pack of cards, a razor, tiny carved calabashes, brimstone enclosed in a small bag” and “powdered torchwood.” For Thomas, these different items were used for different goals. Many items frequently included synesthetically scented traits. Practitioners would usually use “a little dirt from a grave.” For damaging crops, this dirt would often be mixed with animal excrement and “a couple of rotten eggs and some other filth” to be buried in fields.¹¹⁴

¹¹² For the Morant Bay revolt see, Gad Heuman, *The Killing Time: The Morant Bay Rebellion in Jamaica* (Knoxville, Tenn.: University of Tennessee Press, 1994), esp. 36-42. For continuing British debates on the levels of violence to use against Obeah and *myal* practitioners see the concerns with flogging expressed in a series of 1862 letters collected in, “Continuation of corporal punishment in certain Laws, for example, Act 19, Victoria Chapter 30, ‘the offence of Obeah...subjects the perpetrator of it to corporal punishment’. Edward John Eyre, Lieutenant Governor of Jamaica, Jamaica,” No. 83, folios 502-512, CO 137/367/58.

¹¹³ Herbert Thomas, “Memorial, August 30, 1894,” folios 536-555, in “Sends a further memorial from Inspector Thomas. Includes a pamphlet called ‘Something about Obeah’,” No. 340, folios 536-560, CO 137/561/74.

¹¹⁴ Herbert Thomas, “Something about Obeah,” folios 556-560, in “Sends a further memorial from Inspector Thomas. Includes a pamphlet called ‘Something about Obeah’,” No. 340, folios 536-560, CO 137/561/74, quotes on 6-7. In Barbados of 1876, such a telling of an “Obeah murder” by the practitioner Adolphe La-Croix, also included extremely dark imagery of the mutilation and torture of a “deformed, deaf, and dumb” child for the purposes of Obeah. “Execution of Adolphe La-Croix for alleged Obeah murder. Administrator G. William Des Voeux, forwarded by Sir John Pope Hennessy, Governor of Windward Islands, St. Lucia,” No. 20, folios 274-277, CO 321/12/36. To hopefully stop the perpetuation of violent Obeah, the British introduced wide-scale flogging of practitioners with amendments to Obeah laws in 1898 and 1899. “Obeah

As the “Obeah Catcher” worked his forensics in Jamaican huts, English writers found in his descriptions, and the observations of similar officials, a character to develop within Victorian literature. In this fiction, a mutual brand of reinforcement occurred that continued to reify the tautological links between smell and race within the threatening relations between Obeah practitioners and subaltern resistance.¹¹⁵

African Aromas in Anglo-Atlantic Literature

The reifying power of the African other passed into English literature of early Romanticism. As Kay Dian Kriz noted, this process involved producing a difficult form of artistic hegemony: “If the curiosities represented become too thoroughly pacified in the process of visual and verbal representation, then their capacity for arousing the wonder and desire of the reader is sharply diminished. Too little pacification threatens to expose Otherness that cannot be known, and, even more worryingly, cannot be physically

Amendment Law 1903: Forwards the history of the circumstances leading up to the passing of the Law to Amend the Obeah Laws, 1898 and 1899,” No. 320, folios 2-5, CO 137/635/1. Later officials were concerned with the inability of this flogging to stem the tide of Obeah practice. Sidney Oliver, Acting Governor, to Alfred Lyttelton, Secretary of State for the Colonies, “Letter of August 24, 1904,” in, “Working of Obeah Law 8 of 1903: submits observations of the Inspector General of Police and the Resident Magistrates,” No. 435, folios 360-364, CO 137/641.

¹¹⁵ For the understanding of slavery and the reification of patterns of slave resistance within English literature see, Tim Watson, *Caribbean Culture and British Fiction in the Atlantic World, 1780-1870* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), esp. 1-16. The British consistently searched for new means of punishment to limit Obeah as “medical larceny.” In 1909, officials used a cat-o-nine tails and stocks to increase the tone of public ridicule against Obeah men and Obeah women. “Punishment for Practice of Obeah: following receipt of letter from J Cowell Carver regarding methods adopted in Jamaica [not in item], states is considering use of stocks in preference to the 'cat-o-nine tails', being more effective as means of public ridicule and so weakening power of the Obeah-man,” No. 178, folios 374-377, CO 137/671/50. For more on Obeah prisoners see the imprisonment of male and female suspects in Barbados of 1829 in, “Forwards message from the House of Assembly and letter from the deputy provost marshal concerning transportation of two slaves, Castello and Bynoe, convicted of Obeah,” No. 2, folios 8-11, CO 28/103/2.

contained.”¹¹⁶ Over time, the range of aromatic voices amongst slaves found paths into English literatures of both the periphery and the core. Slaves could rarely be represented as able to inflict damage upon the slave system, or as part of lines of lineage due to the fears of “monstrous hybridity” that came with the Haitian Revolution.¹¹⁷ However, the vast otherness and influence of Obeah and other African spiritualism upon master’s fearful minds could not be entirely pacified.¹¹⁸

However strict the laws and punishments became, Obeah practices of the olfactory did not waver. The more masters used laws, the greater the belief in the power Obeah was reified in the minds of slaves hoping to resist, and amongst scribbling fearful masters.¹¹⁹ This retention was partially because sensory encounters of Obeah offered multiple agencies

¹¹⁶ For an understanding of the earlier West Indies that describes how artworks were systematically constructed to place a veil over the most horrendous aspects of slavery by showing the “metropolitan ornaments” of happy slaves, dancing slaves, and the curiosities of the Western Hemisphere to entice continued emigration see, Kay Dian Kriz, *Slavery, Sugar, and the Culture of Refinement: Picturing the British West Indies, 1700-1840* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008), esp. 195-198, quote on 34. Also see the identity of Barbados planters as cultivating a rhetorically peaceful form of slavery within, Jack Greene, “Changing Identity in the British Caribbean: Barbados as a Case Study,” in *Colonial Identity in the Atlantic World, 1500-1800*, ed. Nicholas Canny and Anthony Pagden (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1987), 213-266, the painting of happy slaves to show elite gentility in the colonial worlds in, David Bindman and Helen Weston, “Court and City: Fantasies of Domination,” in Book III of *Volume III of The Image of the Black in Western Art*, ed. David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen Dalton (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010), 125-170, and the cleansing of paintings from depicting the harshness of the slave trade within, Charles Ford, Thomas Cummins, Rosalie Smith McCrea, and Helen Weston, “The Slave Colonies,” in Book III of *Volume III of The Image of the Black in Western Art*, ed. David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen Dalton (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010), 241-308.

¹¹⁷ For “monstrous hybridity” and the rhetorical control of writing or speaking about Haiti see, Marlene Daut, *Tropics of Haiti: Race and the Literary History of the Haitian Revolution in the Atlantic World, 1789-1865* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2015), esp. 172-174.

¹¹⁸ For forms of medical resistance in North American slave societies see, Sharla Fett, *Working Cures: Healing, Health, and Power on Southern Slave Plantations* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2002).

¹¹⁹ For these ideas of cyclical reification, and the performativity of the court system to suppress Obeah, see, Diana Paton, “Punishment, Crime, and the Bodies of Slaves in Eighteenth-Century Jamaica,” *Journal of Social History* 34, 4 (2001): 923-954, and the general argument regarding these forms of courtroom acknowledgement of slave’s ability to alter systems within, Ariela Gross, *Double Character: Slavery and Mastery in the Antebellum Southern Courtroom* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2000).

for slaves and free blacks in the Atlantic. As literary critic T. W. Jaudon argued, “the practice of obeah gathered together a set of bodily responses to the world unlike the reasonable, objective forms of sense perception that were gaining traction in the Enlightenment.” Obeah allowed for practitioners, followers, and writers who tried to understand the African spiritual past a conduit to access a sensory world outside of the nation-state. The dogma oriented the individual to other bodily experiences through providing sensory power to different material goods.¹²⁰

Numerous Obi-novels of the nineteenth century portrayed an implicit white fear of the ability of Obi sorcerers to manipulate odor and control space, even after the general British emancipation of 1838.¹²¹ Eugene Sue’s *Atar Gull: Or, The Slave’s Revenge* (1846) portrayed the “sweet scent of vengeance” taken by a slave on the body of an old, insane, and ill planter who entrusted the medicine man with healing his sickened body. Atar Gull, the slave, entered the nursing room of the planter, portrayed as a pleasant and sweetly scented arena, and through a series of manipulations was able to implicitly wrest control of the care of his master, Tom Will, from a series of physicians. Thereafter, Atar Gull drove

¹²⁰ T. W. Jaudon. "Obeah's Sensations: Rethinking Religion at the Transnational Turn," *American Literature* 84, 4 (2012): 715-741, esp. 716-718. For these ideas of the senses as resistance to the dominance of the nation-state see, Jacques Rancière, *The Politics of Aesthetics: The Distribution of the Sensible* (London: Continuum, 2004), and for the role of a mobile and spiritually embodied sensation, deemed “kinesomatics”, within diasporic rituals and practices as resistance in the twentieth century see, Floyd Merrell, *Capoeira and Candomblé: Conformity and Resistance in Brazil* (Princeton, NJ: Markus Wiener Publishers, 2005), esp. 12-15.

¹²¹ For the role of British Romanticism, the confusion over the nature of Obeah, and British fear of slave revolts in the making of Obeah fiction see, Alan Richardson, “Romantic Voodoo: Obeah and British Culture, 1797-1807,” in *Sacred Possessions: Vodou, Santería, Obeah, and the Caribbean*, ed. Margarite Fernandez Olmos and Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1997), 171-194, the role of the senses as inherently non-physical entities that assert social distinction within Romantic writings in, Orrin Nan Chung Wang, *Romantic Sobriety: Sensation, Revolution, Commodification, History* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011), esp. 2-4, and the unavoidability of irony and doubt in the critique of aesthetics and sensation within Romantic literature in, Andrew Eastham, *Aesthetic Afterlives: Irony, Literary Modernity and the Ends of Beauty* (London: Continuum International Pub., 2011), esp. 4-6.

his master to madness through herbal concoctions forced down his owner's throat.¹²²

Irish author Maria Edgeworth's *Belinda* (1801) also summarized the social effects of Obeah, which underscores the legitimization of African spiritualism within early Victorian literature. Edgeworth's tale of the life of Belinda Portman in the West Indies included discussions of the odor of Obeah as a means to show the darkness of West Indian slavery and African spiritualism. In her narrative, a troublesome Obeah-woman on the Delacour Plantation on Jamaica placed a hex on Juba, an African servant who would later marry an Englishwoman. The room of Juba's convalescence included the "strong smell of phosphorous," which later investigators concluded was part of the scented confidence game played by the Obeah-woman.¹²³ Much of romantic literature about such carnivalesque moments where slaves could have power partially acted as a release of fear where the comedic exposure of confidence games removed the sub-textual seriousness of slave revolt for readers in the London core who had no daily terror of uprising.¹²⁴

¹²² Eugène Sue and William Henry Herbert, *Atar Gull: Or, The Slave's Revenge* (New York: H. L. Williams, 1846), esp. 86-90. These authors essentially deconstructed what Obeah actually was, and re-aggregated what they could understand into a new form of Obeah that was still threatening to the British public. Kelly Wisecup and T. W. Jaudon, "On Knowing and Not Knowing About Obeah," *Atlantic Studies* 12, 2 (2015): 129-143.

¹²³ Maria Edgeworth, *Belinda* (London: Baldwin & Cradock, 1833), 312-328, quote on 315. The fear of revolt linked to Obeah diachronically as British officials saw links between Obeah rituals and slave resistance. Differences between the 1806 anti-Obeah law and the 1818 anti-Obeah law on Barbados included strengthening the ability of the court to link Obeah to larger revolts due to the recent revolution led by Bussa. "Refers to the 'Act for the better prevention of the practice of Obeah' and states that since its enactment 'a question of law has arisen as to its efficiency as an Act, in consequence of there being no Court specified, before whom the Criminal should be tried as was provided by the former Act' [of 4 November 1806]. The attorney general has expressed his opinion that a court comprising two magistrates and three freeholders was not competent to try a particular case. Asks that the matter should be referred to the law officers," No. 48, folios 96-104, CO 28/87/32, esp. 97-99.

¹²⁴ For the removal of the libidinal energy of the revolutionary carnivalesque through the portrayal of the commodified carnival in eighteenth century literature see, Terry Castle, *Masquerade and Civilization: The Carnavalesque in Eighteenth-Century English Culture and Fiction* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1986), esp. 110-129. Further ideas that Obeah linked with revolt led to increased classification of Obeah as less of a nuisance, but involving more "communication with the Devil" that created superstitious thoughts in the heads of slaves, leading to propensity for revolt, and a further crackdown through violent punishments that could be broadly applied. "An Act for the Punishment of such Slaves as shall be found Practising Obeah, 1806," in "Refers to the 'Act for the better prevention of the practice of Obeah' and states

In the later *Hamel, Obeah Man* (1827), written by British traveler Cynric Williams, Obeah was portrayed through the antipodal character of Hamel, a sorcerer who lived in a highly scented world that planters feared. Hamel's smoke filled room included "a human skull on a table in the midst" of the white men entering the abode. Williams' Gothic romance was part of a canon that asserted literature as a retreat from the fears of African spirituality as missionaries increasingly pushed Christianity among slaves in the nineteenth century. Next to the skull in Hamel's feared chamber was, "a calabash, containing a filthy-looking mixture, placed beside a small iron pot which flamed with burning run, whose blue and ghastly light, sufficient to illuminate the cellar, cast a glare of deeper hideousness on the faces and persons of these practitioners."¹²⁵

Obeah persisted in the white mind as a fear of losing control of their black laborers well after slavery.¹²⁶ The diary of Amelia Culpepper, a European traveler of the late nineteenth century, whose grandfather lived on Barbados during the early nineteenth century, describes the memory of such olfactory complexity. Culpepper relayed a tale from her Parisian depot of 1887 about the desire of Africans to recover the "smell of old times in Africa" that led to the murder of a slave owner in Barbados decades prior. When the slave, Peter, returned home from his violent excursion, his African father was quick to

that since its enactment 'a question of law has arisen as to its efficiency as an Act, in consequence of there being no Court specified, before whom the Criminal should be tried as was provided by the former Act' [of 4 November 1806]. The attorney general has expressed his opinion that a court comprising two magistrates and three freeholders was not competent to try a particular case. Asks that the matter should be referred to the law officers," No. 48, CO 28/87/32, 103-104.

¹²⁵ Cynric Williams, *Hamel, the Obeah Man* (London: Hunt and Clarke, 1827), quotes on 116-117. For importance of *makandals*, or bags of poison goods, in the West Indies, wherein the French and English had different ideas of witchcraft, poison, and the supernatural, see, Diana Paton, "Witchcraft, Poison, Law, and Atlantic Slavery," *WMQ* 69, 2 (2012): 235-264, esp. 254-255.

¹²⁶ For a similar fear of Obeah among free African maroon communities see, James Montgomery, *The West Indies, and Other Poems* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown, 1823), esp. 43-48.

sense the smell of blood on Peter's body. Both the slave who desired an olfactory past that was lost in the back breaking world of slave labor, and his father who could smell the master's blood, represent that odor was an important aspect of both resistance and retention in diverse American slave societies. Such resistance to the system, which came partially from remembered scents, could not be allowed as, "Peter turned King's evidence; the rest were hanged."¹²⁷

What emerged in writings about these spiritualists and the olfactory worlds of African slaves was a romantic ideal that, even when derogatory, exposed the slave figure as a character, a human, with his or her own cultural constructions.¹²⁸ American literary critic and novelist Major Haldane MacFall's *The Wooings of Jezebel Pettyfer* (1898) likewise portrayed the historical memory of white fears of the stench of Obeah. Numerous mentions were made of the "sour smell of negroes" that perpetuated life in the West Indies, many times attributed to the machinations of an Obeah-man. This "sorcerer", Jehu Sennacherib Dyle, was portrayed powerful through his adeptness at manipulating odor, once tricking a female dog by "mixing de smell" of her puppies in order to get the terrier mother to return to her progeny.¹²⁹

¹²⁷ Amelia Culpepper, "Excerpts from Amelia Culpepper's Diary c. 1887," *JBMHS* 47 (November 2001): 80-82, quote on 81. For the smell of sweat from labor see the reading of slave clothing in Robert DuPlessis, *The Material Atlantic: Clothing, Commerce, and Colonization in the Atlantic World, 1650-1800* (Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2016), esp. 144-146, and Kathleen Brown, *Foul Bodies: Cleanliness in Early America* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2009), 98-117.

¹²⁸ For the emergence of a human form of the African, rather than a commodified or animal form, within British plays of the late eighteenth century see the trope of Mungo analyzed within, J. R. Oldfield, "The 'Ties Of soft Humanity': Slavery and Race in British Drama, 1760-1800," *Huntington Library Quarterly* 56, 1 (Winter, 1993): 1-14.

¹²⁹ Haldane Macfall, *The Wooings of Jezebel Pettyfer; Being the Personal History of Jehu Sennacherib Dyle, Commonly Called Masheen Dyle. Together with an Account of Certain Things That Chanced in the House of the Sorcerer* (London: Simpkin, Marshall, Hamilton, Kent, 1898), quotes on 22-23, 154, and 189. This consistent attention to Obeah led to an increase in anti-Obeah legislation that led to many punishments and death sentences throughout the late nineteenth century. For examples see the desire to amend Obeah laws to

Dyle's Obeah household was portrayed as having a "strange odour, the faint sour smell of the dead." The aromatic home was fashioned by this sorcerer, who often controlled animal populations enough to have crabs move at his will. When Deborah Bryan, one of the white protagonists, encountered the dead body of Dyle:

fear of a sudden increased her vision, so that she saw-and seeing, uttered a low cry: the black mangled thing, that lay staring up at her out of eyeless sockets...and it came to her that the ghastly, rent, and disemboweled mass of flesh that sent up the sickly smell of death into her senses must once have been the besotted old sorcerer; but that which had been a human being, save for the grinning sightless head, lay shapeless now as offal flung upon a dunghill.

Deborah wandered the area where she encountered the redolent and otherworldly ephemeral evil of the conjurer's aura, which was to blame for the many deaths of vultures in the season to come.¹³⁰

These novels and the history of Obeah as recorded by prejudicial British officials, informed the analysis of Obeah in Jesuit Father Joseph Williams' *Voodooes and Obeahs* (1932).¹³¹ Educated much by Long's aforementioned *History of Jamaica* (1774), and Bryan

create harsher punishments, and lists of Obeah criminals within, "Reports on the question of amending Law 28 of 1892, The Obeah and Myalism Acts Amendment Law 1892. Governor Henry A. Blake," No. 329, folios 212-218, in CO 137/550.

¹³⁰ Macfall, *The Wooings of Jezebel Pettyfer*, quotes on 341-343. For more on the importance of funerary traditions in the making of Atlantic cultures and resistance see a reading of the deepest modes of resistance regarding the protections over the dead meant to resist master's ideas that white masters retained power over the ghosts of slaves within, Diana Ramey Berry, "'Broad is de road dat leads ter death': Human Capital and Enslaved Mortality," in *Slavery's Capitalism: a New History of American Economic Development*, ed. Sven Beckert and Seth Rockman (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016), 146-162.

¹³¹ For problems with early twentieth century anthropological analyses of Obeah see, Stewart, *Three Eyes for*

Edwards *History, Civil and Commercial, of the British West Indies* (1793), Williams described Obeah through a multi-sensory lens attributable to his twentieth century Catholic and anthropological training. He summarized a sacrificial practice in aromatic terms, which compared the practice of voodoo and Obeah as similarly outside of reason. He noted how a voodoo practitioner could make a girl and a goat switch bodies in order to heal the human illness harming the child. This “blood baptism” ceremony peaked when “the odor of blood was in the air,” as the child “stood quiet, though still wide-eyed, while red silken ribbon were twined” in the goat’s horns, “his hoofs anointed with wine and sweet-scented oils,” before the sacrifice wherein blood from the goat’s slaughter covered the sick child.¹³²

In her discussion of voodoo as existing within a society without a strong sense of privacy, Maya Deren wrote during the 1950s of a similar use of the “warm aroma which rises and pervades” offerings provided to Ogoun. These materials became “fragrant fumes” in worshippers “cupped hands” during ritual offerings to the Yoruba god.¹³³ In Alfred Métraux’s history of voodoo a similar tale was told of mid-twentieth century voodoo cults

the Journey, esp. 6-24, and Stephan Palmié, “Afterword, Other Powers: Tylor’s Principle, Father William’s Temptations and the Power of Banality,” in *Obeah and Other Powers: The Politics of Caribbean Religion and Healing*, ed. Diana Paton and Maarit Forde (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012), 316-340.

¹³² Joseph Williams, *Voodooes and Obeahs; Phases of West India Witchcraft* (New York: L. MacVeagh, Dial Press, 1932), quotes on vii-viii; Edward Long, *The History of Jamaica, or, General Survey of the Ancient and Modern State of That Island With Reflections on Its Situation, Settlements, Inhabitants, Climate, Products, Commerce, Laws, and Government* (London: T. Lowndes, 1774), esp. 416-424; Bryan Edwards, *The History Civil and Commercial of the British Colonies in the West Indies To Which Is Added, an Historical Survey of the French Colony in the Island of St. Domingo* (London: B. Crosby, 1798 [1793]), esp. 164-175. For the transnational and blended aspects of Obeah, related to myths of child sacrifice, see, Lara Putnam, “Rites of Power and Rumors of Race: The Circulation of Supernatural Knowledge in the Greater Caribbean, 1890–1940,” in *Obeah and Other Powers: The Politics of Caribbean Religion and Healing*, ed. Diana Paton and Maarit Forde (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012), 243-267.

¹³³ Maya Deren, *Divine Horsemen: The Living Gods of Haiti* (London, New York: Thames and Hudson 1953), quotes on 132-133. For how this transnational nature of African religions allowed practices to spread well into the twentieth century see, Diana Paton, “The Trials of Inspector Thomas: Policing and Ethnography in Jamaica,” in *Obeah and Other Powers: The Politics of Caribbean Religion and Healing*, ed. Diana Paton and Maarit Forde (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012), 172-197.

in Haiti that understood the history of slavery and their Dahomey past through the ephemeral power of scent to tie their perceptions of odor to the memory of those who were once sold into slavery.¹³⁴ As François Laplantine summarized regarding his modal anthropology fieldwork within Brazil, the ethnographer and anthropologist cannot avoid experiencing the sensible through a “togetherness” with the other “that is elaborated through what...can only be experienced as ephemeral sensation.”¹³⁵

Scents and Class Consciousness

The smell of African medicine and religion, and even of fecal matter, marks a significant aspect of resistance through the sensorium.¹³⁶ In most cases, slaves died on diseased ships, in burdensome cane fields, or under the duress of oppressive tropical heat. Their bodies would putrefy and stink even worse than the sweat of their labor.¹³⁷ As the

¹³⁴ For other twentieth century references to the use of fragrance in West Indian religions, specifically to the case of voodoo, see the reading of divining using smell within, Alfred Métraux, *Voodoo in Haiti* (New York: Schocken Books, 1972), esp. 26-28 and 286-287, and the role of sensory engagement of dancing cultures of the diaspora within, Yvonne Daniel, *Dancing Wisdom: Embodied Knowledge in Haitian Vodou, Cuban Yoruba, and Bahian Candomblé* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2005), esp. 196-197, 249-250.

¹³⁵ François Laplantine, and Philip Jamie Furniss, *The Life of the Senses: Introduction to a Modal Anthropology* (London: Bloomsbury, 2015), esp. 82. For a reading of modern Candomblé as involving a form of secrecy about sensory experience to prevent commodification in the public sphere see, Mattijs van de Port, “‘Don’t Ask Questions, Just Observe!’: Boundary Politics in Bahian Candomblé,” in *Aesthetic Formations: Media, Religion, and the Senses*, ed. Birgit Meyer (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 31-52.

¹³⁶ For references to the evil smells of Obeah in continued forms of African resistance to British laws in the twentieth century see, Diana Paton, *The Cultural Politics of Obeah: Religion, Colonialism and Modernity in the Caribbean World* (Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2015), esp. 191-200.

¹³⁷ For examples of the horrible violence against slaves in the West Indies, especially after the rise of Obeah resistance in the early nineteenth century, see the discussion of the violence of the whip in Barbados of 1818, described within, John Boulton, “Diary of John Boulton, 1799-1854,” BDA X 10/13, 7-9, quote on 9, and the general tone of Thomas Thistlewood’s writings within, Trevor Burnard, *Mastery, Tyranny, and Desire: Thomas Thistlewood and his Slaves in the Anglo-Jamaican World* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2004).

observant naturalist Alexander Garden described from South Carolina of the evil odors of the slave ship: “I have never yet been on board one, that did not smell most offensive and noisome, what for filth, putrid air, putrid dysenteries, (which is their common disorder) it is a wonder any escape with life.”¹³⁸

In the port of Charleston, the smell of dead Africans became detrimental not only to those in slave holds waiting to be seasoned on Sullivan’s Island, but also to the inhabitants of the town when the air of death hung low after a slave trader illegally dumped his dead cargo in the Cooper River in 1769.¹³⁹ George Pinckard, an English physician under the command of Ralph Abercromby, a Scottish politician in Barbados during the 1790s, also described the horrid stench that remained “offensive to European olfactories” even after the slave holds in a slave ship at Bridgetown was thoroughly cleaned. Well after the “cleaning and airing” of the ship, the sailors “could not subdue the stench created” by slaves “sleeping together in such crowded heaps.”¹⁴⁰

While sitting in the holds of these slave ships, African men and women were often forced to defecate upon the places where they would later sleep. Though travelers like Pinckard deemed these habits as “filthy,” such defecation might very well have been a form of resistance, forcing masters to protect their slaves from disease by airing and cleaning their holds at a higher frequency.¹⁴¹ The olfactory dialectic, in this sense, is quite complex.

¹³⁸ Alexander Garden to Stephen Hales, circa 1758-1760, quoted in Edmund Berkeley and Dorothy Smith Berkeley, *Dr. Alexander Garden of Charles Town*, (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1969), quote on 124.

¹³⁹ Peter McCandless, *Slavery, Disease, and Suffering in the Southern Lowcountry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), 44-45.

¹⁴⁰ Pinckard, *Notes on the West Indies*, quote on 234.

¹⁴¹ Pinckard, *Notes on the West Indies*, esp. 234-235; Trevor Burnard, *Planters, Merchants, and Slaves: Plantation Societies in British America, 1650–1820* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2015), 85-86; Marcus Rediker, *The Slave Ship: A Human History* (New York: Penguin Books, 2008), 218-220; David

The very act of defecating on oneself, read through the violent horrors of the slave trade, could very well be an act of agency against slave traders who needed to protect the health of their cargo for sale at market.¹⁴² The use of shit, either from those in power or as dejecta thrown back rhetorically or materially, offers that “excremental language” is frequently an “inherent index of self/other instability,” a specific sematic volatility that appears in moments when self and other are in flux.¹⁴³

However evil the smells of the Middle Passage became, slaves consistently found in the European classification of the African race as an olfactory other a veil they used to resist.¹⁴⁴ The veil of odor, originally a classification of the other that Europeans applied to justify African inferiority and the slave trade, was reserved as a hidden transcript by

Brion Davis, *Inhuman Bondage: The Rise and Fall of Slavery in the New World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), esp. 92-96. Read in part through the understandings of revolt as limiting the population taken on the slave trade within, David Richardson, "Shipboard Revolts, African Authority, and the Atlantic Slave Trade," *WMQ* 58, 1 (2001): 69-92.

¹⁴² For other examples of African religious resistance in the New World see the analysis of zombies in, Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert, “Women Possessed: Eroticism and Exoticism in the Representation of Women as Zombie,” in *Sacred Possessions: Vodou, Santería, Obeah, and the Caribbean*, ed. Margarite Fernandez Olmos and Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1997), 37-58, an emic reading of African retention through the Lucumi and Yoruba in Cuba within, George Brandon, *Santería from Africa to the New World: The Dead Sell Memories* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993), esp. 86-91, voodoo as portrayed in Haitian literature within, Colin Dayan, *Haiti, History, and the Gods* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995), esp. 98-152, and the importance of African retention of a belief in embodied energy within Brazilian Candomblé in, Niya Afolabi, “Axe: Invocation of Candomblé and Afro-Brazilian Gods in Brazilian Cultural Production,” in *Fragments of Bone: Neo-African Religions in a New World*, ed. Patrick Bellegarde-Smith (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2005), 108-123.

¹⁴³ Esty, “Excremental Postcolonialism,” esp. 47-51. In an even more absurdist game of performativity, could the suicide of slave, meant to smell of death as the body putrefied, be a similar cause of olfactory class consciousness meant to protect the community by creating forms of ephemeral distance? For a reading of a slave suicide that created odor see suicide as a possible form of African retention and resistance through the narrative of Charles Ball within, Ras Michael Brown, *African-Atlantic Cultures and the South Carolina Lowcountry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), esp. 140-141, 169-173, and the spectacles of performing the dead bodies of slaves as a way to prevent slaves from committing suicide within, Vincent Brown, “Spiritual Terror and Sacred Authority in Jamaican Slave Society,” *Slavery and Abolition* 24, 1 (2003): 24-53.

¹⁴⁴ For the justifications of the slave trade and profit through tropes of Africans as peacefully accepting slavery and the Middle Passage see, David Dabydeen, “Eighteenth-century English Literature on Commerce and Slavery,” in *The Black Presence in English Literature*, ed. David Dabydeen (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1985), 26-49.

African slaves who hoped to create spaces of resistance distanced from increasingly fearful owners.¹⁴⁵ African medical and dietary traditions involved much olfactory worship that many Europeans found distasteful and were fearful enough to increasingly avoid and draft laws to attempt to control.¹⁴⁶ Still, the strange smells from African fires on white plantations, often set to signal revolt or communicate across plantations, kept white masters in white houses.¹⁴⁷ Spaces of resistance smelled because Africans knew smell would keep the white masters at bay, at least enough for artfully created, though minor and ephemeral, times and spaces of freedom.¹⁴⁸

¹⁴⁵ For more on the horrid smell of the slave ship, see the smell on ships of the Middle Passage as presented before Parliament in the abolition debates in, Niel Douglas, *The African Slave Trade: or, a Short View of the Evidence, Relative to That Subject Produced Before the House of Commons in 1791* (Edinburgh: J. Guthrie, 1792), esp. 32-34, and the intensive use of vinegar to clean ships to remove their stench in Bruce Mouser and Samuel Gamble, *A Slaving Voyage to Africa and Jamaica: The Log of the Sandown, 1793-1794* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2002), esp. 56-57.

¹⁴⁶ For the transnational and malleable aspects of African religious traditions see, John Savage, "Slave Poison/Slave Medicine: The Persistence of Obeah in Early Nineteenth-Century Martinique," in *Obeah and Other Powers: The Politics of Caribbean Religion and Healing*, ed. Diana Paton and Maarit Forde (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012), 149-171.

¹⁴⁷ For African retention of spatializing in New World slavery see, Douglas Armstrong, "The Afro-Jamaican House-Yard: An Archeological and Ethnohistorical Perspective," *Florida Journal of Anthropology* 7 (1991): 51-63, esp. 57-58, and Alexandra Chan, "Bringin the Out Kitchen In?: The Experiential Landscapes of Black and White New England," in *Archaeology of Atlantic Africa and the African Diaspora*, ed. Akinwumi Ogundiran and Toyin Falola (Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 2010), 249-276.

¹⁴⁸ For the fear of African fires: see the signals of fire as connoting the coming rape of white women in the poetry of Dr. M. J. Chapman in Barbados of the early nineteenth century collected within, F. A. Hoyos, "Dr. M. J. Chapman," *JBMHS* 16 1/2 (Nov 1948-Feb 1949), 14-21, and burning of cane trash, in the making of symbols to communicate during slave rebellions within the discussion of Bussa's Revolt, within, Barbados, *The Report from a Select Committee of the House of Assembly, Appointed to Inquire into the Origin, Causes, and Progress, of the Late Insurrection* (Barbados: Printed (by order of the legislature) by W. Walker, Mercury and Gazette Office; London: Reprinted for T. Cadell and W. Davies, 1818), esp. 18-20, 29-34.

Conclusion:

Scientific Racism, Olfactory Positivism, and the Dialogue of Modernity

The English deodorized by shifting their own olfactory identity, as the previous backwater of Europe, to their African slave subjects throughout the Atlantic littoral. It was not the inferior English who smelled of their Anglo-Saxon past while the continent smelled of perfumed and deodorized elegance. Rather, stinking was for the beasts who toiled in the fields of Jamaica, in the cotton dens of the Carolinas, or for those that suffered the slave ships of the Royal Africa Company.

England deodorized from the Renaissance to the twentieth century. Englishpersons did so by displacing pungency onto those they deemed inferior, a process inspired by Islam and Iberia and cyclically reinforced within a transnational Republic of Letters. This was an unconsciously birthed though explicitly rendered cultural act; a *verschiebung* that placed onto African bodies odors that colonial Europeans perceived as markers of racial inferiority.

These European traditions became American as new nations were birthed in the Age of Revolutions. Even within numerous abolitionist texts of the American Antebellum Era, the idea of Africans as pungent was used as a marker of race. John Gregg Fee's *Anti-Slavery Manual* (1848) summarized, "The Africans of the present generation in our country, have far less of that smell that their forefathers had."¹ Similarly, U. S. Army Chaplain Stephen Alexander Hodgman, even while critiquing the hypocrisy of other abolitionists as falsely magnanimous, noted:

¹ John Gregg Fee, *An Anti-Slavery Manual* (Maysville, KY: Herald Office, 1848), esp. 198-199, quote on 199. For similarities between the racial conceptions of abolitionists and slave holders see the examples provided within, Roxann Wheeler, "'Betrayed by Some of My Own Complexion': Cugoano, Abolition, and the Contemporary Language of Racialism," in *Genius in Bondage: Literature of the Early Black Atlantic*, ed. Vincent Carretta and Philip Gould (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2001), 17-38. For how forces of the Early Republic increasingly racialized Latin America as a means of setting a new American identity that increasingly mislaid similarities between Latin American revolutions and the American Revolution see, Caitlin Fitz, *Our Sister Republics: The United States in an Age of American Revolutions* (New York: Liveright Publishing Corporation, 2016), esp. 80-115.

Some of the very elite of American Society, the aristocrats of the land, the educated, the fashionable, and the refined, have been able, not only to dwell with them in the same country, and to tolerate their dark color and their African odor, but they even had such a partiality and affection for them, that they could not do without their presence in the nursery, in the kitchen, in the parlor, and in every other department of domestic life.²

Possibly akin to Hodgman's note here, many of these abolitionist works seemed to poke fun at such conceptions of race asserted by Southern racists and hypocritical Northern abolitionists. Asa Greene's parodic *A Yankee among the Nullifiers* (1833) accordingly summarized a machine, created by an industrialist, which was used to cure the "native smell" of African slaves for Southern aristocrats. This machine was called the "Anti-African-Odor-Gas-Generator" meant to purify and sweeten rooms where industrial slaves labored.³

These parodic notes took many decades to come to reified fruition as an assertion of the absurdity of racial odors for the general public. Rather, scented racism grew alongside these parodies into a political assertion throughout the later nineteenth century. Southern physician Samuel Cartwright, creator of the semiosis "drapetomania," argued in the "Natural History of the Prognathous Species of Mankind," later to be applied as an

² Stephen Alexander Hodgeman, *The Nation's Sin and Punishment, or, The Hand of God Visible in the Overthrow of Slavery* (New York: American News Co., 1864) quotes on 215-216.

³ Asa Greene, *A Yankee among the Nullifiers* (New-York: William Pearson, 1833), quotes on 90-94.

informal brief for the court's decision in *Dred Scott v. Sandford* (1857), as an appendix to Justice Roger Taney's xenophobic ruling, that:

The skin of a happy, healthy negro is not only blacker and more oily than an unhappy, unhealthy one, but emits the strongest odor when the body is warmed by exercise and the soul is filled with the most pleasurable emotions. In the dance called *patting juber*, the odor emitted from the men, intoxicated with pleasure, is often so powerful as to throw the negro women into paroxysms of unconsciousness, vulgar hysterics.⁴

The construction of Africans as stinking made African nations both liminal and inferior to American, English, and other European noses that defined them as other.

Olfactory downturn started in the sixteenth century as a cultural and religious project that worked to limit the olfactory supernatural as a means to assert the correct structures of capitalist modernity. Specifically, sulfur exemplified how the English environment was emptied of libidinal sensory encounters. In the New World, this olfactory downturn and linguistic manipulation was not able to offer similar declines on odor in a different spatial setting. Rather, to mark sameness and difference, numerous Europeans in the New World found the sense of smell a still essential sensory experience. Jesuits found olfactory commonality to convert Native Americans to their Church, while Native

⁴ Samuel Cartwright, "Natural History of the Prognathous Species of Mankind," Applied as an Appendix in "The Dred Scott Decision: Opinion of Chief Justice Taney," *New York Day-Book*, Nov. 10, 1857; reprinted in *Cotton is King, and Pro-Slavery Arguments*, ed. E. N. Elliot (Augusta: Pritchard, Abbot and Loomis, 1860), quotes on 707. For the increasing Southern assertion of whiteness on the eve of the Civil War through racialized language see, Walter Johnson, "The Slave Trader, the White Slave, and the Politics of Racial Determination in the 1850s," *Journal of American History* 87 (June, 2000): 13-38.

Americans informed European alliance making tactics to better respect the sensory environment. Botanical scholars in the New World also found odor important to survive in the New World environment, once their attempts at minimizing difference through analogy and metaphor failed to fully classify the dangers of New World foods and herbs.

In the culmination of this marking of sameness and difference, African peoples were increasingly perceived as stinking throughout the Atlantic. Different African nations were progressively placed between man and animal, deemed inferior because of that pungent liminality, but also because even if deemed human, these nations were considered susceptible to a cultural ethos that prized scents and smells, odors that Europeans were not willing to reward as culturally vital after the rise of hygiene and the Reformation against sensuous idolatry.

In European nations, ethnic homogeneity increased throughout the Early Modern Era due to increased border controls, and the rhetorical construction of European nations as ethnically homogenous created the African other as a stinking and dejected diametric opponent to ideas of European senses of purity. Africans resisted these narratives of odor through asserting that Western distastes for odor were absurd and did not allow for the increased knowledge that could come with cross-cultural knowledge about herbs, rituals, and medicine. Smelling thus became a discursive arena for discussions of religion, race, and capital throughout the Early Modern Era.

Scientific Racism of the late nineteenth century took the mass of racial knowledge from both the core and colonies and applied an ordered system to scented bodies in pursuit of continued racial domination. Scatological sciences emerged again to claim the

uncivilized as inferior races through their shit-stained ritual cultures.⁵ Irish-American John Bourke's *Scatalogic Rites of All Nations* (1891) summarized the intense fecophillia of non-Western peoples during the game of New Imperialism whereby cleanliness and the lack of odor persisted as markers of civility. He homogenized Africans through collecting numerous ethnographic tales of a stereotypically stinking people who defecated in the open, drank rhinoceros feces in their nightly concoctions, slept on beds made of cow dung, tanned their animal skins with shit, and split their milk with cattle urine.⁶ Such fecophillia was often also apparent in Charles Kingsley's *At Last: A Christmas in the West Indies* (1871), which portrayed West Indian Africans, as historian Amar Wahab described in his analysis of constructed representations of the Caribbean, as anathema to white ideas of cleanliness and civilization. Within the text, Port of Spain, Trinidad smelled of disease due to the constant licentiousness of the inhabitants in the city, while homes where black bodies lived were always dirty with the sins of moral corruption.⁷

The vast Western racialization project through odor involved different forms of monogenetic and polygenetic justification.⁸ Where racist scatology could not place non-Western peoples as inferior, a tradition of the biological inheritance of odors remained for those Social Darwinists increasingly avowing evolutionary racial hierarchies for imperial

⁵ Stephen Greenblatt, "Filthy Rites," *Daedalus* 111, 3 (1982): 1-16.

⁶ John Gregory Bourke, *Scatalogic Rites of All Nations: A Dissertation Upon the Employment of Excrementitious Remedial Agents in Religion, Therapeutics, Divination, Witchcraft, Love-Philthers, Etc., in All Parts of the Globe* (Washington, D. C.: W. H. Lowdermilk & Co, 1891), esp. 30, 39, 148, 180.

⁷ Amar Wahab, *Colonial Inventions: Landscape, Power, and Representation in Nineteenth-Century Trinidad* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars, 2010), esp. 159-216; Charles Kingsley, *At Last: a Christmas in the West Indies: With Illustrations* (London and N. York: Macmillan, 1871), esp. 49-52, 136-138.

⁸ For an example of the homogenizing of the other as scented and savagely in tune with their noses, essentially for later imperial justifications, see, James Hastings, John Selbie, and Louis Gray, *Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics* (New York: C. Scribner's Sons, 1908), 396-397.

control.⁹ American doctors George Milbry Gould and Walter Pyle's *Anomalies and Curiosities of Medicine* (1896) asserted that certain races, especially after coitus, have specific biological odors. They emphasized, following from a citation to the famed German traveling anatomist of the late nineteenth century Franz Pruner-Bey, that, "Negroes have a rank ammoniacal odor, unmitigated by cleanliness...due to a volatile oil set free by the sebaceous follicles."¹⁰

Medicine made the African body into a scented spectacle in need of racial uplift, supporting justifications for Western adventures in the Scramble for Africa. Common sense dominated these ideals as engrained and embodied racism. As Phillip Curtin's magisterial *Image of Africa* (1964) categorized of British physician J. P. Schotte's analysis of fevers in sub-Saharan Africa in *Synochus Atrabiliosa* (1778): "African...body odor...suggested that Negroes were better able to throw off 'foul and nasty vapours' which poisoned the European body."¹¹ This nineteenth century African body was constructed in order for Europeans to justify capitalist intrusion.¹² Different nations were summarized as statically

⁹ For earlier forms of scatology see the reading of English literature about fecal matter as either carnivalesque or judgmental within, Peter Smith, *Between Two Stools: Scatology and Its Representations in English Literature, Chaucer to Swift* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2012), esp. 227-259.

¹⁰ George Gould and Walter Pyle, *Anomalies and Curiosities of Medicine* (New York: Bell Pub. Co., 1896), esp. 398-400, quote on 399. For the medical attribution, with an exceedingly objective tone, of African odor to the small bumps on the black epidermis see, M. De Quatrefages, "Physical Characteristics of the Human Races," *Popular Science* (March, 1873): 545-548, and for medicine, language, and the construction of control upon the subaltern body see, Michel Foucault, *The Birth of Biopolitics: Lectures at the Collège de France, 1978-79* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), and Andrea Rusnock, "Biopolitics: Political Arithmetic in the Enlightenment," in *The Sciences in Enlightened Europe*, ed. William Clark, Jan Golinski, and Simon Schaffer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999), 49-68.

¹¹ Philip Curtin, *The Image of Africa: British Ideas and Action, 1780-1850* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1964), quote on 84-85. For the study of evolution and racialization since Darwin see, Pat Shipman, *The Evolution of Racism: Human Differences and the Use and Abuse of Science* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1994).

¹² Zine Magubane, "Simians, Savages, Skulls, and Sex: Science and Colonial Militarism in Nineteenth-Century South Africa," in *Race, Nature, and the Politics of Difference*, ed. Donald Moore, Jake Kosek, and

in the past and part of a landscape that was marked in ancient eras, but was no longer being changed. These narratives portrayed lost cultures that used to work, but failed to change the landscape enough to find pathways into modernity. Africans were thus laborers, trapped in the past, in need of capitalism to scratch the land through fresh European instruction.¹³

The metropolitan cores in England and the new imperial United States enlisted a scientific and medical knowledge supported by this virulent racism.¹⁴ Physiognomic texts merged with later concerns over social and racial types in the mid-nineteenth century, as the classification of visual and sensory signs became increasingly racialized.¹⁵ This occurred structurally in most colonialist schemes against many different indigenous peoples. As Greg Grandin summarized regarding nineteenth century Latin America, epidemiology and knowledge of diseases included a vast significance for “representing and defining racial and national identities.”¹⁶ The work of theorist Ann Laura Stoler, who focuses on sexual desire as a means of imperial control, described a similar use of medicine as a means of defining the body of the other as inferior for goals of imperial domination when conferring how Dutch children in colonial Java were prohibited from playing with Javanese girls and boys, partly because of the odor that their sweat was believed to

Anand Pandian (Durham: Duke University Press, 2003), 99-111.

¹³ Mary Louise Pratt, "Scratches on the Face of the Country; or, What Mr. Barrow Saw in the Land of the Bushmen," *Critical Inquiry* 12, 1 (1985): 119-143.

¹⁴ For the role of American anthropology in constructions and deconstructions of racial categories in the twentieth century see the works of Franz Boas analyzed within, Tracy Teslow, *Constructing Race: The Science of Bodies and Cultures in American Anthropology* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014), esp. 32-73.

¹⁵ Ludmilla Jordanova, "The Art of Seeing in Medicine: Physiognomy 1780-1820," in *Medicine and the Five Senses*, ed. W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 122-133.

¹⁶ For the role of epidemiology in the marking of the biologically inferior as a racial tactic in nineteenth century Guatemala see, Greg Grandin, *The Blood of Guatemala: A History of Race and Nation* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000), esp. 85-98, quote on 82-83.

emanate.¹⁷ As Stoler and Frederick Cooper have concluded regarding the structures of modernity: “the tensions between the exclusionary practices and universalizing claims of bourgeois culture were crucial to shaping the age of empire.”¹⁸ More simply, bourgeois culture of Western imperialism asserted both the equality of all men while judging classes and races as inherently different. The opposition between these two poles created both mechanisms for control and spaces for subversive resistance.

As Nancy Stepan concluded: “the history of racial science is a history of a series of accommodations of the sciences to the demands of deeply held convictions about the ‘naturalness’ of the inequalities between human races.”¹⁹ During the late eighteenth century, the well rooted racial ideas of the Enlightenment and racial positivism began to displace older concerns with civic progress and the protection of the body politic from external barbarianism. The rise of the Enlightenment, and the search for the roots of natural sciences created the impetus to promote ideas of ethnic legitimacy.²⁰ This push, existing partly from the seventeenth century, established a questioning of the older political order of civic identity and introduced new ideas that culminated in racial politics.²¹

¹⁷ Ann Laura Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power: Race and the Intimate in Colonial Rule* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), esp. 6-7, 173; Ann Laura Stoler, *Race and the Education of Desire: Foucault's History of Sexuality and the Colonial Order of Things* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1995), esp. 1-18, 186-188. For similar use of separating children, based on beliefs of moral cleanliness rather than smell, see, Robin Bernstein, *Racial Innocence: Performing American Childhood from Slavery to Civil Rights* (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2011).

¹⁸ Ann Laura Stoler and Frederick Cooper, “Between Metropole and Colony: Rethinking a Research Agenda,” in *Tensions of Empire: Colonial Cultures in a Bourgeois World*, ed. Frederick Cooper and Ann Laura Stoler (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 1-58, quote on 37.

¹⁹ For the rise of polygenesis within early Scientific Racism see, Nancy Stepan, *The Idea of Race in Science: Great Britain, 1800-1960* (Hamden, Conn: Archon Books, 1982), esp. 47-110, quote on xx-xxi.

²⁰ For a case study of such legitimation see the reading of Danish legal structures in the West Indies analyzed within, Gunvor Simonsen, “Skin Color As a Tool of Regulation and Power in the Danish West Indies in the Eighteenth Century,” *Kruispunt* 187 (2001): 191-216.

²¹ Ivan Hannaford, *Race: The History of an Idea in the West* (Washington, D. C.: Woodrow Wilson Center

During the Victorian Era, once again from the core: “Theoretical racism of British origin began to be imported to Africa with a new generation of officials.”²² The indigenous other had to be considered profligate, engaging in their environment as a means of othering, in order to assert the necessity of improvement. Consequently, pro-slavery British bureaucrat James MacQueen had summarized the necessity of capitalism to cure the laziness and scented ills of the African race within Sierra Leone in an 1831 letter to Charles, Earl Grey:

How much more difficult and dangerous then, my Lord, must it be to abrogate...society in the Tropical World...where the colour of the skin and the smell of the one race separate the races by almost impassable barriers-where barbarous manners prevail amongst one class, and where, above all, from the ideas, the pursuits, the wants and the inclinations-from the influence of climate and habits amongst the most numerous class-these are disinclined to labour, and more especially disinclined to engage in every species of agricultural labour.²³

This homogenized other of the lazy and reeking African later merged with the homogenized and composite other of all non-Westerners in the great game of New Imperialism with rules that demarcated savage bodies as inferiorly scented.²⁴

Press, 1996), esp. 8-15.

²² Curtin, *The Image of Africa*, esp. 198-286, 343-387, 457-480, quote on 473.

²³ James MacQueen, “Letter to the Right Honourable Earl Grey,” *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* 29 (March, 1831): 454-466, quote on 463.

²⁴ For the homogenizing of the other from separate Moor, Native American, and African, into a common dark person with similar traits regardless of culture, during the Early Modern Era see, N. I. Matar, *Turks*,

The historical memory of Atlantic slavery similarly shaped the odor of the black body well after emancipation.²⁵ The bloodhounds of Canadian author and early Social Darwinist Grant Allen's *In All Shades* (1886) explicitly noted the dog's aptitudes at latching onto the smell of an African as a second nature due to the pungency of runaway's sweat.²⁶ Of course, such olfactory ideologies passed into the early twentieth century.²⁷ In the United States, the rise of Jim Crow increased the marking of black bodies as deeply pungent, and offered a later place for modern culture to perpetuate stereotypes of African Americans that worked to reify African American sensory experiences within a white culture that increasingly prized the cool.²⁸ In Britain, the ideal of inherent black odors persisted to justify continued British imperial goals in Africa and the rest of the Global South.²⁹ In recent decades such beliefs have faded as postmodern cultural relativism has

Moors, and Englishmen in the Age of Discovery (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), esp. 99-107, 170.

²⁵ For the general analysis of the role of sexuality in the making of the African American other in later slavery and the laws of Jim Crow see, Joane Nagel, *Race, Ethnicity, and Sexuality: Intimate Intersections, Forbidden Frontiers* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2003), 91-139.

²⁶ Grant Allen, *In All Shades* (Chicago: Rand, McNally, 1889 [1886]), esp. 40-42, 190.

²⁷ For the debate on the smell of African-American bodies in the twentieth century, including the conclusive experiments of Otto Klineberg in the 1930s that no differences in racial smells could be discovered, see, Gunnar Myrdal and Sissela Bok, *American Dilemma: The Negro Problem and Modern Democracy* (Piscataway: Transaction Publishers, 1994), esp. 1213-1215.

²⁸ Robert Park, "The Bases of Race Prejudice," *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 140 (Nov., 1928): 11-20, esp. 17; Mark Smith, "Making Scents Make Sense: White Noses, Black Smells, and Desegregation," in *American Behavioral History: An Introduction*, ed. Peter Stearns (New York: New York University Press, 2005), 181-200. For debates on the limits and/or universal applicability of the concept of race as a social construct see, Michael Specter, *Denialism: How Irrational Thinking Hinders Scientific Progress, Harms the Planet, and Threatens Our Lives* (New York: Penguin Press, 2009), and Nicholas Wade, *A Troublesome Inheritance: Genes, Race, and Human History* (New York: The Penguin Press, 2014).

²⁹ Radhika Mohanram, *Imperial White: Race, Diaspora, and the British Empire* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2007), esp. 99-108. For the language of "filth" as linking class, race, and gender for imperial control, as in the stories of Sherlock Holmes, see, Joseph Childers, "Foreign Matter: Imperial Filth," in *Filth: Dirt, Disgust, and Modern Life*, ed. William Cohen and Ryan Johnson (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), 201-224. During British attempts to keep Kenya during the winter of 1953, "wind-scenting dogs" were also used often to discover pungent bodies that hid in the deeply wooded forests of the region.

returned a sense of respect to cultural totems as the producers of that which smells. Race, believed by most educated Westerners to be a social construct, has been removed as a creator of odor, returning odors to a place of cultural creation.³⁰

The belief in the odors of inferior races peaked during the nineteenth century, but that does not affirm that racism was not ordered through the nose prior, nor is it to say racism was not as vile or pervasive in the late sixteenth century as in the days of lynched bodies on Mississippi oaks.³¹ Ordering race in literature, from Shakespeare, to the French and their encyclopedias, through Linnaeus, and into the Scottish Enlightenment, was not something new. It was not a novel hierarchy coded first by scholars; it was a vernacular and embodied process birthed centuries prior.³²

The early modern European ideal of biological African odors kept Africans in the wild, in the open fields hewing wood and drawing water, not in the metropolises of deodorizing England, France, and Iberia.³³ Marking Africans as pungent was unconscious

Trained by kennels within England to scent bodies, these dogs were then sent to the R.A.F. to receive their order to clear the forests of Kenya from terrorist organizations. The R.A.F. trained dogs worked to acclimate themselves to the African climate as a means of applying their noses to help British officials capture anti-colonial Mau Mau terrorists. "Correspondence with Col. Baldwin about the use of Dogs in the Kenya Emergency," East Africa Department, EAF 117/389/043, CO 822/478.

³⁰ For the late nineteenth and early twentieth obsession with the smell of the other for scientific means see, Stephen Kern, "Olfactory Ontology and Scented Harmonies: on the History of Smell," *Journal of Popular Culture* 7, 4 (1974): 816-824.

³¹ For the use of the senses in academic study as Marxist praxis see, David Howes, "Introduction: Empire of the Senses," in *Empire of the Senses: The Sensual Culture Reader*, ed. David Howes (Oxford: Berg, 2005), 1-20, Terry Eagleton, *The Ideology of the Aesthetic* (Cambridge, MA, USA: Basil Blackwell, 1990), esp. 7-28, and Mark Smith, *Sensing the Past: Seeing, Hearing, Smelling, Tasting, and Touching in History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007), esp. 15-28.

³² For the social construction of different forms of biological racism and eugenics as democratic and popular rather than simply the tactics of authoritarians like the Nazis, see, Nancy Stepan, *The Hour of Eugenics: Race, Gender, and Nation in Latin America* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1991), esp. 4-14.

³³ For the portrayal of Africans as trapped within nature as a part of European artwork see, Nancy Stepan, *Picturing Tropical Nature* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2001), esp. 12-24.

in its initial conception of the other, but the more it was cultivated and semantically linked to new and diverse ideas about African inferiority and biological inheritance the more it became economically determined and necessary. Africans smelled, and it steadily became more of Mammon's plan that blackamoors remain unwashable. This provided Europeans assurance that slaves were predestined to live in the stinking outdoors of the cane fields of the colonies, not in the deodorizing bedrooms, living rooms, and courts of Europe.

Reified in syntax through stereotyping on the Shakespearean stage, the pungent markers of the black race were sent for violent assertion on the flagellated fringes of Europe's colonial empires. The colonies usually accepted such suppositions and asserted olfactory colonialism upon their laborers.³⁴ All Western European ideological apparatuses, in this oversimplified but essential binary, desired a process of deodorization, cleanliness, and religious purity through the removal of scentful sin, *pharmakon*, and disease. African medical practitioners did not desire such anesthetized anosmia in their religious devotions and medical practices. African retention of the idea of smelling-out witches, poison, and disease survived the Middle Passage in nearly all American slave societies. African slaves used these smells as a way to mark their own territory against their masters. This setting of rival geographies through smell constitutes a structural marker of agency. Thus, smelling-out by smelling-in as a human divining rod, and producing smells as herbal sensory skills, marked two important African survivals that allowed retention of ethnogenetic African

³⁴ For more on the role of capitalism in the creation of race in the Atlantic see, Peter Linebaugh and Marcus Rediker, *The Many-Headed Hydra: Sailors, Slaves, Commoners, and the Hidden History of the Revolutionary Atlantic* (Boston: Beacon Press, 2000), and for resistance to the Marxist contention of race as a singular construct through a reading of historical narratives of the subaltern as resistant to Western, and Marxist, universalization, see, Robert Young, *White Mythologies: Writing History and the West* (London: Routledge, 2008 [1990]).

identities used to respond to slave systems throughout the New World.³⁵

The body had been marking race for centuries.³⁶ The scientific racists, and Enlightenment scholars before them, coded what the body had learned from popular culture in the centuries prior. When analyzing race, and when racism first sprung from the depths of human anxiety, it is improper to look at the texts of ordered racial hierarchies as the initial cause, because ordering and finalizing are the ultimate steps in the scientific method. The first steps on the path that created European racism were the racial hypotheses set forth by playwrights and pastors of the London core. Smells, the olfactory, our very noses, portray how deeply engrained racial ideals were within the early modern body, the place where racism was initially experienced.³⁷

The great sin of modernity from the European core came with attempting to control the other without ever understanding what the other was, or the place of the other in the scheme of world politics, culture, and the environment. Theodor Adorno's analysis of

³⁵ For the importance of asserting African survivals within the study of slavery as resistance and responses to enslavement in the Americas see, Michael Gomez, "African Identity and Slavery in the Americas," *Radical History Review* 75 (1999): 111-20, the role of performative identities in, Joseph Miller, "Retention, Reinvention, and Remembering: Restoring Identities through Enslavement in Africa and under Slavery in Brazil," in *Enslaving Connections: Changing Cultures of Africa and Brazil during the Era of Slavery*, ed. José Curto and Paul Lovejoy (Amherst, NY: Humanity Books, 2004), 81-121, Gwendolyn Midlo Hall, *Slavery and African Ethnicities in the Americas: Restoring the Links* (Chapel Hill: UNC Press, 2005), and John Thornton, *A Cultural History of the Atlantic World, 1250-1820* (Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2012), esp. 1-4.

³⁶ For the role of race in the coding of blackness to justify slavery, even as race was not a linear progression but a highly contested discursive arena, see, Sujata Iyengar, *Shades of Difference: Mythologies of Skin Color in Early Modern England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005).

³⁷ For embodied sensory experience and historical methodology see, Joy Monice Malnar and Frank Vodvarka, *Sensory Design* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2004), esp. 37-39, Pamela Smith, *The Body of the Artisan: Art and Experience in the Scientific Revolution* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004), Bruce Smith, *The Acoustic World of Early Modern England: Attending to the O-Factor* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999), esp. 12-13, the idea of "listening out" within, Kate Lacey, *Listening Publics: The Politics and Experience of Listening in the Media Age* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2013), esp. 6-8, Mark Johnson, *The Meaning of the Body: Aesthetics of Human Understanding* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007), esp. 89-91, 279-280, and Bruce Smith, *The Key of Green: Passion and Perception in Renaissance Culture* (Chicago: University of Chicago, 2009), esp. 6-8.

modernity as an inevitable path toward Fascism hinted at the manipulation of odors, possibly towards the removal of the fragrant as a mark of the bourgeois control necessary for the rise of the popular masses who asserted themselves against human dignity during the twentieth century. Humanity declined as odor was manipulated for the use of capital, and in that manipulation arose the inevitability of the twentieth century hemoclysm. Adorno summarized poetically:

The rose-scents of Elysium, much too voluble to be credited with the experience of a single rose, smell of the tobacco-smoke in a magistrate's office, and the soulful moon on the backdrop was fashioned after the miserable oil-lamp by whose meagre light the student swots for his exam. Weakness posing as strength betrayed the thought of the allegedly rising bourgeoisie to ideology, even when the class was thundering against tyranny. In the innermost recesses of humanism, as its very soul, there rages a frantic prisoner who, as a Fascist, turns the world into a prison.³⁸

The history of the senses exposes how bodies functioned in the past. The field informs a conception of the body as central to the historical experience of the mind. How we remember the body is a conscious understanding of how we remember the past. By marginalizing and defining the other, English bodies defined their identity as lacking in odor and primed for the cleanliness of increasingly visual and spatial modernity. Cleanliness became the marker of who could access modernity, and the black body could never be clean because it was deemed biologically inferior, rather than culturally pungent.

³⁸ Theodor Adorno, and E. F. N. Jephcott, *Minima Moralia: Reflections from Damaged Life* (London: Verso, 1978), quote on 89.

Soap was not able to domesticate the African into English society, as it had for English women who had also previously been deemed overly scented, because polygenesis defined the other of the African with an inherently animal biology.³⁹ As Anne McClintock described concerning the “commodity racism” of the nineteenth century West: “What could not be incorporated into the industrial formation...was displaced on to the invented domain of the ‘primitive’, and thereby disciplined and contained.”⁴⁰ As Simon Gikandi and David Theo Goldberg have also described, the bourgeois English men and women of the nineteenth century claimed modernity through justifying the causes of colonial rule, a prerogative that often created structures of knowledge that reproduced racialized colonialism upon the objectified colonial subject.⁴¹ Modern liberalism, of political sovereignty and equality before the law, needed to create an oppositional symbol in the constructed savagery of the African.⁴²

³⁹ For an example of the education of the senses to use smell for medical segregation see, Jonathan Reinartz, “Learning to Use Their Senses: Visitors to Voluntary Hospitals in Eighteenth-Century England,” *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 35, 4 (2012): 505-520.

⁴⁰ Anne McClintock, “Soft-Soaping Empire: Commodity Racism and Imperial Advertising,” in *Travellers' Tales: Narratives of Home and Displacement*, ed. George Robertson (London: Routledge, 1994), 131-154, quote on 140.

⁴¹ For a reading of the “faculty psychology” that allowed the Founding Fathers to create their understandings of self and nation as both egalitarian and inclusive of racist principles see the reading of semiotics within, Norbert Wiley, *The Semiotic Self* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994), esp. 1-17.

⁴² David Theo Goldberg, *Racist Culture: Philosophy and the Politics of Meaning* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1993), esp. 1-13; Simon Gikandi, *Slavery and the Culture of Taste* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2011); Uday Mehta, “Liberal Strategies of Exclusion,” in *Tensions of Empire Colonial Cultures in a Bourgeois World*, ed. Frederick Cooper and Ann Laura Stoler (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 59-86. See also, Pierre Boule, “In Defense of Slavery: Eighteenth-Century Opposition to Abolition and the Origins of a Racist Ideology in France,” in *History from Below: Studies in Popular Protest and Popular Ideology in Honour of George Rudé*, ed. George Rudé and Frederick Krantz (Montréal, Québec: Concordia University, 1985), 219-246, the general analysis of the roots of segregation as part of a liberal principle regarding Native Americans and the recolonization of slaves in Africa within, Nicholas Guyatt, *Bind Us Apart: How Enlightened Americans Invented Racial Segregation* (New York: Basic, 2016), esp. 133-158, the role of increased racialization in English plays as a means to counter the tide of late eighteenth century abolitionism within, Daniel O'Quinn, *Entertaining Crisis in the Atlantic Imperium, 1770-1790* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2011), esp. 243-301, the role of miscegenation narratives and rhetoric in the making of American racism through the making of the grotesque body of the hybrid child in, Tavia Amolo Ochieng' Nyongó, *The*

To overcome the bias of these texts that ironically support both equality and slavery, scholars must appropriate new tactics of reading the past that overcome both the racism of the masters, but also the commodified language of the oppressed that was forced to borrow from the superstructure of the elite.⁴³ However, to deny that Africans retained forms of agency within their spiritual lives, represented through olfactory knowledge here, is to oversimplify slavery into a form of subjection without any possible patterns of resistance that exist outside of the hegemonic discourse of the master. For Gakandi, and within this dissertation, the use of an anachronistic “postcolonial paradigm” is therefore “the most useful as a strategy for rereading the convergence of structural continuity in the face of temporal disruption, of understanding entrenched memories in the midst of reconfigured desires.”⁴⁴

In recent decades, racial othering has become less about soap, polygenesis, pollution, disease, and the Sons of Noah, and more about genetics and eugenics.⁴⁵ Race, in modern parlance, is a social construct, but materialist drives incentivize many to consider the importance of finding race within the genetic code, and still within different forms of

Amalgamation Waltz: Race, Performance, and the Ruses of Memory (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2009), esp. 104-105, and a similar use of black racial portrayals to counter white symbols of liberty within blackface entertainment on the American stage within, Jenna Gibbs, *Performing the Temple of Liberty: Slavery, Theater, and Popular Culture in London and Philadelphia, 1760-1850* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2014), esp. 177-244.

⁴³ For the idea that many forms of African retention as resistance were merely subjections due to the performative nature of terror, see, Saidiya Hartman, *Scenes of Subjection: Terror, Slavery, and Self-Making in Nineteenth-Century America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997), esp. 116.

⁴⁴ Simon Gikandi, *Maps of Englishness: Writing Identity in the Culture of Colonialism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996), 15-18, quote on 15.

⁴⁵ However, it is still essential to understand the reemergence of perceived whiteness as vital in asserting state borders in the neoliberal age, especially as the Western state feels threatened by immigration and offers “border fortification” through rhetoric about nationality and race. Uli Linke, “Off the Edge of Europe: Border Regions, Visual Culture, and the Politics of Race,” in *Senses and Citizenship: Embodying Political Life*, ed. Susanna Trnka (New York, NY: Routledge, 2013), 178-199.

cultural evolution, as a space to be divined by computers that have replaced the five senses and their embodied perceptions of the racial other.⁴⁶ Race divining is a new materialist pattern meant to disunite humanity for patterns of divide and conquer.⁴⁷ Racialization began in the body, was written in science, and now is read by computers through a genomic code that retains traits of racialization that allows correlation to mean causation in the most absurdist of racial terminologies.⁴⁸

⁴⁶ For the difficulty of modern analysis of race due to the reliance on phenotype, which possibly re-asserts race as biologically real, see Edward Eric Telles, "The Project on Ethnicity and Race in Latin America (PERLA): Hard Data and What is at Stake," in *Pigmentocracies: Ethnicity, Race, and Color in Latin America*, ed. Edward Eric Telles (Chapel Hill: UNC Press, 2014), 1-35, and the UNESCO definitions of race as a social construct within, Ashley Montagu, *Man's Most Dangerous Myth: The Fallacy of Race* (Cleveland: World Pub. Co., 1997 [1942]).

⁴⁷ For critiques of the emergence of forms of genomic racism see, Paul Rabinow and Nikolas Rose, "Biopower Today," in *Biopower: Foucault and Beyond*, ed. Vernon Cisney and Nicolae Morar (Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016), 297-325, Naomi Zack, *Philosophy of Science and Race* (New York; London: Routledge, 2002), esp. 58-118, Stephen Jay Gould, *The Mismeasure of Man* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2008), Tracy Teslow, *Constructing Race: The Science of Bodies and Cultures in American Anthropology* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014), esp. 337-362, the reading of the racialization of DNA evidence within, Sarah Chinn, *Technology and the Logic of American Racism: A Cultural History of the Body As Evidence* (London: Continuum, 2000), esp. 141-167, the concern with modern medicalization of racial analysis and athletics within, Kieth Wailoo, "Inventing the Heterozygote: Molecular Biology, Racial Identity, and the Narratives of Sickle-Cell Disease, Tay-Sachs, and Cystic Fibrosis," in *Race, Nature, and the Politics of Difference*, ed. Donald Moore, Jake Kosek, and Anand Pandian (Durham: Duke University Press, 2003), 235-253, the reading of divination of race as akin to finding witches within, Stephan Palmié, "Genomics, Divination, 'Racecraft'," *American Ethnologist* 34 (2007): 205-222, the increasingly hidden, but still continuing, racial eugenics within modern neoliberal societies analyzed within, Mark Smith, "Finding Deficiency. On Eugenics, Economics, and Certainty," *American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 64, 3 (2005): 887-900, and the prospects for racial negativity within readings of the Human Genome Project within, Mikuláš Teich, "Mapping the Human Genome in the Light of History," in *Nature and Society in Historical Context*, ed. Mikuláš Teich, Roy Porter, and Bo Gustafsson (Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 308-331.

⁴⁸ For recent historical work that possibly reifies race as a means to understand historical changes see, Wade, *Troublesome Inheritance*, Gregory Cochran, Jason Hardy, and Henry Harpending, "Natural History of Ashkenazi Intelligence," *Journal of Biosocial Science* 38, 5 (2006): 659-93, and Richard Herrnstein, and Charles Murray, *The Bell Curve: Intelligence and Class Structure in American Life* (New York: Free Press, 1994).

Note on Methodology:

Sensory Worlds and Archival Activism

Benjamin Rush, the celebrated physician of Revolutionary era Pennsylvania, wrote in 1806 of the commonly held understanding of the “fallacy” of sense perception, especially of the “simple” and ignorant senses, which reason must restrict and clarify.¹ Such reason, as a term containing discursive power within the institutional science Rush practiced, controlled what many Westerners believed to be an “excess of sensation” caused by contact with the New World, the consumer revolution, and the rise of class conflict after the growth of Revolutionary character during the eighteenth century.² Reason, science, wealth, and their associated institutions attempted to regulate the vile excesses of Native American, slave, and lower class sensations that authors often portrayed as immoderate to their European gentlemanly identities.³

¹ Benjamin Rush, *Essays, Literary, Moral and Philosophical* (Philadelphia: Thomas and William Bradford, 1806), quote on 342. The idea of America is a reasoned construction: “As the myth’s dominant symbol, interchangeably sensory and ideological, ‘America’ came to signify both self-gratification and the self-evident good, the most pragmatic of communities and the most abstract of ideals.” Sacvan Bercovitch, *The Rites of Assent: Transformations in the Symbolic Construction of America* (New York: Routledge, 1993), quote on 42.

² For “excess of sensation” see the character of Matthew Bramble, from Tobias Smollett’s *The Expedition of Humphry Clinker* (1771) in, Sarah Knott, *Sensibility and the American Revolution* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia, by the University of North Carolina Press, 2009), 9-11, and the role of the senses as creating pathways for disease through heightened sensory powers within, Ann Jessie Van Sant, *Eighteenth-Century Sensibility and the Novel: The Senses in Social Context* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), esp. 103-104. For the curbing of popular extremes, in non-sensory terms see, Gordon Wood, *The Creation of the American Republic, 1776-1787* (Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture at Williamsburg, VA, by the University of North Carolina Press, 1969), and Kenneth Bowling, “‘A Tub to the Whale’: The Founding Fathers and Adoption of the Federal Bill of Rights,” *Journal of the Early Republic* 8, 3 (1988): 223-251.

³ For English traditions of controlling excess through the ideal of the virtuous mean, or the common moral moderation that was molded into the ideal of proper behavior, see, Joshua Scodel, *Excess and the Mean in Early Modern English Literature* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2002), esp. 12-31, the ideas of senses in peril when encountering marvels of other places on the globe within, Dieter Bitterli, “Strange Perceptions: Sensory Experience in the Old English ‘Marvels of the East,’” in *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, ed. Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer (Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016), 137-162, the debates on the sensory threats of Renaissance diets within, Juliann Vitullo, “Taste and Temptation in Early Modern Italy,” *The Senses and Society* 5, 1 (2010): 106-118, and the reading of the threats of New World tobacco as creating excesses of sensation within the eighteenth century novel within, Emily Friedman, *Reading Smell in Eighteenth-Century Fiction* (Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2016), esp. 25-50.

In analyzing these increasing sensory controls, this work exposed European bias in the archive by articulating aspects of the sense of smell as a specific discourse that existed as an undercurrent against dominant Enlightenment traditions that focused on asserting the sense of sight as the leading human perception to apply to the Western modernization process.⁴ This sensory history of odor has worked to portray that scholars should not stop with the visual when analyzing cultural consciousness. Sensory literacy of the other four senses was learned and understood through similar power relationships as the visual literacy of reading or concerning the assertion of specific skin colors as inferior.⁵

Numerous scholars of the history of the senses, such as Constance Classen, Alain Corbin, Mark Smith, Marshall McLuhan, and David Howes, assert that sensory experiences are culturally constructed.⁶ To analyze sensory understandings of the past, historians study the position of different sensations on culturally educated sensory hierarchies. Depending on the historical era, assorted sensations on the five sense order have been judged as more significant than other sensory perceptions.⁷ These recent

⁴ For the role of vision in the deconstruction of emotions through linear perspective and the making of modern ideas of progress see, Robert Romanyshyn, *Technology As Symptom and Dream* (London: Routledge, 1989), esp. 30-60, 125-127, and the centrality of the visual project within Renaissance aesthetics in, David Summers, *The Judgement of Sense: Renaissance Naturalism and the Rise of Aesthetics* (Cambridge, Mass.: Cambridge University Press, 1994), esp. 179-181.

⁵ For attempts to create structures to classify odors throughout history, despite the inherently transgressive nature of smelling, see, Roland Harper, E. C. Bate-Smith, and D. G. Land, *Odour Description and Odour Classification; A Multidisciplinary Examination* (New York: American Elsevier Pub. Co, 1968), esp. 16-35.

⁶ Constance Classen, "Other Ways to Wisdom: Learning through the Senses across Cultures" *International Review of Education* 45, 3 (1999): 269-280; Alain Corbin, *Time, Desire, and Horror: Towards a History of the Senses* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1995), esp. 181-195; Mark Smith, *Sensing the Past: Seeing, Hearing, Smelling, Tasting, and Touching in History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007).

⁷ For an introduction to the historiography on smelling that focuses on binaries when encountering the other see, Chris Sladen, "Past Scents: The Importance of a Sense of Smell to the Historian," in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), esp. 149-168.

arguments of sensory history emerged out of cultural history that was based upon an *Annales* tradition of assisting the subaltern narrative through a social history of the masses.⁸

This dissertation followed many trends in writing the history of the senses, while adding new methodologies that provided different conclusions regarding the importance of the metanarrative, which remains the central dialectical force that retains the vitality of sensory history within the increasingly fragmented historical profession. The six chapters of this text offered methodology derived from anthropology, sociology, the digital humanities, literary criticism, linguistics, historical phenomenology, and anti-Enlightenment philosophy as a means to critique the historical archive that displaced the lower senses, as metaphor to the subaltern, from historical discussions of agency and power.⁹

The Many Cradles of the Sensory Archive

This study applied Geertzian anthropological analyses of the cultural construction of the senses to show how nations created specific totems and taboos that demarcated behavioral boundaries.¹⁰ Using Geertzian methodology of close reading for cultural ways of meaning allows the researcher access into the sensory language that Europeans, early

⁸ Mark Smith, "Making Sense of Social History," *Journal of Social History* 37, 1 (2003): 165-186; David Howes, "Charting the Sensorial Revolution," *Senses and Society* 1, 1 (2006): 113-128.

⁹ For concerns over the applicability of "truth" within interdisciplinary historical methodology that asserts the social construction of knowledge and perception see, Ian Hacking, *The Social Construction of What?* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1999), esp. 1-7, 28-34.

¹⁰ For Clifford Geertz and New Historicism see, Clifford Geertz, *The Interpretation of Cultures* (New York: Basic Books, 1973), and William Sewall Jr., "Geertz, Cultural Systems, and History: From Synchrony to Transformation," *Representations* 59, 1 (1997): 35-55.

American colonists, Native Americans, and Africans used to describe their environmental, political, and social observations.¹¹ Many anthropologists and cultural historians who study sensory history also follow the intellectual tradition of Marcel Mauss, who applied “techniques of the body” to understand other cultures through ethnographical close reading of bodily performance. Mauss was among the first scholars to understand that the functions of the body were culturally constructed through both “the psychological element” of power relationships and the “biological element” of animal presence.¹²

Cultural history that applies anthropological methods of close reading and the understanding of performativity offered a significant base for those studying the history of the senses.¹³ However, this anthropological influence created an impasse in sensory studies

¹¹ For Geertz and close reading in historical study see, Stephen Greenblatt, “The Touch of the Real,” *Representations* 59, 1 (1997): 14-29. For phenomenology, close reading, and the cultural construction of the senses also see the works of Maurice Merleau-Ponty, the mid-twentieth century philosopher of perception, who argued sensing “is both intentional and bodily, both sensory and motor, and so neither merely subjective nor objective, inner nor outer, spiritual nor mechanical.” Maurice Merleau-Ponty, *Phenomenology of Perception* (London: Routledge, 2002), quote on xiii. The senses are educated alongside cultural entities attributing weight to sensory informed signs, and how those signs should properly be sensed, as learned from the subconscious education of the senses. As such, man possesses rather than “a mind and a body...a mind with a body, a being who can only get to the truth of things because its body is, as it were, embedded in those things.” Maurice Merleau-Ponty, *The World of Perception* (London: Routledge, 2004), quote on 43.

¹² Marcel Mauss, *Sociologie et Anthropologie* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1973), 70-88, quotes on 74, 78. Though Mauss did not explicitly explore sensation, his work led to a growing understanding of power relationships to the social construction of perceptions. Later anthropologists offered a methodology to study the sensory worlds of myriad cultures. For examples see, Claude Lévi-Strauss, *The Savage Mind* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966), and the role of globalization in the deconstruction of botanical forms of sensory cues, qualisigns, of “sweetness” of taste and smell in the creation of more amenable social and gender relations in modern Uitoto Amazonian societies within, Amy Leia McLachlan, “Bittersweet: The Moral Economy of Taste and Intimacy in an Amazonian Society,” *Senses & Society* 6 (2011): 156-176.

¹³ For debates on access to the senses in the past see, Smith, *Sensing the Past*, and Mark Smith, “Producing Sense, Consuming Sense, Making Sense: Perils and Prospects for Sensory History,” *Journal of Social History* 40, 4 (2007): 841-858. I agree that specific aspects of sensation are inherently lost. No one can smell any past in the same manner as past historical actors because sensation is culturally constructed differently in the present. However, ethical lessons that are partially sensory involved knowledge about behavior, power, and resistance that can inform the present through readings of sensory worlds in the past. The sensations of the past are forever lost, however historians can engage the past in a romantic manner through the “paradoxical union of the feelings of loss and love, that is, of the combination of pain and pleasure in how we relate to the past.” Ankersmit, *Sublime Historical Experience*, quote on 9.

regarding the proper space for synchronic studies of culture within diachronic studies of history.¹⁴ The works of Classen and Howes have been instructive for sensory history, and within this dissertation, regarding how to apply synchronic skills to diachronic analysis of the imperial archive.¹⁵

As the documentary and textual archive of the hermeneutical historian is mostly written by elites, sensory historians work to expose the place of the subaltern through different ways of reading bodily experiences of the past.¹⁶ Diana Taylor has summarized that sensory experiences, through her analysis of dance and musical performance, are often mislaid from archival research. This is because a tension exists between the material of the archive and the existing body of performance activities that define culture through dance, sport, rituals, the senses, and gestures.¹⁷

¹⁴ For a brief historiography of sensory studies within the American academy see, Mark Smith, "The Senses in American History: A Round Table Still Coming to 'Our' Senses: An Introduction," *Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 378-381.

¹⁵ Constance Classen, "Foundation for an Anthropology of the Senses," *International Social Science Journal* 153 (September, 1997): 401-412; David Howes, "Can These Dry Bones Live? An Anthropological Approach to the History of the Senses," *Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 442-451; David Howes, "Sensorial Anthropology," in *The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses*, ed. David Howes (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), 167-191; Regina Bendix, "Introduction: Ear to Ear, Nose to Nose, Skin to Skin, The Senses in Comparative Ethnographic Perspective," *Etnofoor* 18, 1 (2005): 3-14; Yannis Hamilakis, "Eleven Theses on the Archaeology of the Senses," in *Making Senses of the Past: Toward a Sensory Archaeology*, ed. Jo Day (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2013), 409-420; Jack Goody, "The Anthropology of the Senses and Sensations," *La Ricerca Folklorica* 45 (2002): 17-28; Laszlo Bartosiewicz, "There's Something Rotten in the State. . .: Bad Smells in Antiquity," *European Journal of Archaeology* 6, 2 (2013): 175-195. For readings of the combination of cognitive anthropology, performance studies, and the anthropology of the senses to questions of ritual and religious transmission, see Michael Bull and Jon Mitchell "Introduction," in *Ritual, Performance and the Senses*, ed. Michael Bull and Jon Mitchell (London; New York: Bloomsbury, 2015), 1-10.

¹⁶ For the importance of non-archival mnemonic reading practices, as with the reading of quipus, winter counts, and wampum belts, to deconstruct the "radical alterity" within the European archive of colonialism, see, Jodi Byrd, *The Transit of Empire: Indigenous Critiques of Colonialism* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2011), esp. xii-xiii.

¹⁷ For studies of archival prejudice see, Carolyn Steedman, *Dust* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2001), 66-79, Marlene Daut, *Tropics of Haiti: Race and the Literary History of the Haitian Revolution in the Atlantic World, 1789-1865* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2015), 1-8, Michel-Rolph Trouillot, *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History* (Boston, Mass: Beacon Press, 1995), Diana Taylor,

Specifically, sensory history focuses on exposing the perceptions and experiences of historical actors through increasing attention on the historicity of sensory understandings to overcome the archival othering of the subaltern, which occurred often within the European documents of what Carlo Ginzburg once called “archives of repression.”¹⁸ Aiding in this revisionist project, this doctoral thesis focused more upon the experiences of sensation that altered sensation from the base than on the sensory theories of early modern writers that constructed sensation from university towers.¹⁹ To analyze these actions, this dissertation applied the materialist methods of Raymond Williams’ *Keywords* (1983) to look at the changing meaning of words diachronically in an effort to analyze the relationships between the body, language, the economy, and cultural change.²⁰

The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas (Durham: Duke University Press, 2003), esp. 16-20, 193-236, Sibylle Fischer, *Modernity Disavowed: Haiti and the Cultures of Slavery in the Age of Revolution* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004), Ifeoma Kiddoe Nwankwo, *Black Cosmopolitanism: Racial Consciousness and Transnational Identity in the Nineteenth-Century Americas* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005), esp. 8-10, the reading of the “fictional” to elicit the historical within, Natalie Zemon Davis, *Fiction in the Archives: Pardon Tales and Their Tellers in Sixteenth-Century France* (Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press, 1987), esp. 1-6, James Epstein, *Scandal of Colonial Rule: Power and Subversion in the British Atlantic During the Age of Revolution* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), esp. 228-265, and Wendy Anne Warren, “‘The Cause of Her Grief’: The Rape of a Slave in Early New England,” *The Journal of American History* 93, 4 (2007): 1031-1049.

¹⁸ Carlo Ginzburg, *The Cheese and the Worms: The Cosmos of a Sixteenth-Century Miller* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1980), quote on xxi.

¹⁹ For critique of the “great divide” see, Herman Roodenburg, “Introduction: Entering the Sensory Worlds of the Renaissance,” in *Vol. III of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 1-18, the discussions of sanitary reform as upsetting the narrative of the great divide within, Bruce Curtis, “‘I Can Tell by the Way You Smell’: Dietetics, Smell, Social Theory,” *The Senses and Society* 3, 1 (2008): 5-22, the importance of social spacing in the modern world within, Edward Hall, *The Hidden Dimension* (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1966), esp. 40-49, and the role of language in the great divide within, Goody, “Anthropology of the Senses and Sensations,” 17-28.

²⁰ Raymond Williams, *Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1985), esp. 57-60, 280-283. For the application of keyword methodology within the practice of New Historicism see the reading of Shakespeare’s use of multivalent terms within, Lowell Gallagher and Shankar Raman, “Introduction,” in *Knowing Shakespeare: Senses, Embodiment and Cognition*, ed. Lowell Gallagher and Shankar Raman (Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 1-29.

Recently, Carolyn Steedman defined the archive as an apparatus that deconstructs memory as it constructs tradition. Following Jacques Derrida's work on the archive, she argues that historical: "observation lies in its partial reversal of the chronology we take for granted, in which modern historical understanding replaces older, informal ways of comprehending the past (in which History replaces Memory)." Accordingly, history must be understood as a process of forgetting rather than simply a digging up of the past through the "stuff" of the archives.²¹ These archival critiques summarize that the power laden discourse of the present alters the past through exploration of the archive and the death of previous historical memory. Combined, these historiographical totems offer that historical actions of the body are often defined by aspects of power and economy that create possibilities for sensation and the sensory worlds remembered within the archive.²²

To attend to these critiques of the archive, I applied the anti-Enlightenment methodologies of the Frankfurt School and the manipulations of theoretical dialogue asserted by the New Historicism, which combined textual hermeneutics with analysis of cultural change.²³ I combined these two theoretical fields through applying aspects of

²¹ Steedman, *Dust*, 67-79; Jacques Derrida, and Eric Prenowitz, *Archive Fever: A Freudian Impression* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996), esp. 27-29.

²² Steedman, *Dust*, 5-10, 39, 79-82. For the importance of controlling the body within the civilizing process, see the analysis of veins and arteries in Gail Kern Paster, "Nervous Tension," in *The Body in Parts: Fantasies of Corporeality in Early Modern Europe*, ed. David Hillman and Carla Mazzio (New York: Routledge, 1997), 107-125, the changing codes of civil comportment, social gestures, orality, and posture, which altered under the force of ideas of civility in Early Modern England, within, Anna Bryson, *From Courtesy to Civility: Changing Codes of Conduct in Early Modern England* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998), esp. 28-42, and the broader comparative analysis of the pace of the civilizing process within, Marvin Becker, *Civility and Society in Western Europe, 1300-1600* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1988), esp. 84-112.

²³ For foundational texts of the New Historicism see, Stephen Orgel, *The Illusion of Power: Political Theater in the English Renaissance* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975), Carolyn Merchant, *The Death of Nature: Women, Ecology, and the Scientific Revolution* (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1980), Stephen Greenblatt, *Renaissance Self-Fashioning: From More to Shakespeare* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980), debates on the reading tactics of the New Historicism within, Leah Marcus, *Puzzling Shakespeare: Local Reading and Its Discontents* (Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press, 1988), esp. 217-219, and the importance of analyzing identity and capitalist transformations to the reading tactics of the New

Marxist structuralism with phenomenological readings of sensory language within early modern texts to diachronic questions of economic and political change over the *longue durée*.²⁴

Specifically, the *longue durée* allows the historian to see larger trends of both continuity and change that cannot be analyzed in specific timespans allowed by archival analysis of specifically coded periods and their colonial office designations. Marc Bloch, the famed *Annales* historian, once noted his understanding of longer discourse of history that must avoid oversimplifying structure and determinism: “Behind the tangible features of landscape, behind what are apparently the most frigid of writings...it is human beings that the historian is trying to discern. If he does not succeed in that he will never be anything, at the best, but a learned hack. But the true historian is like the ogre in the story: wherever he smells human flesh he recognizes his prey.”²⁵ Without the *longue durée* historians are trapped within cordoned off periods of history; stages of the archive. To avoid this trap, this dissertation applied metahistorical narratives as a way to portray larger social trends independent of archival indexes. The importance of metanarratives as master texts is significant as an activist and humanist project for the historical profession.²⁶

Historicism within, Linda Charnes, *Notorious Identity: Materializing the Subject in Shakespeare* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1995), esp. 11-32.

²⁴ For the anti-Enlightenment tone of the Frankfurt School see, Max Horkheimer, Theodor Adorno, and Gunzelin Schmid Noerr, *Dialectic of Enlightenment: Philosophical Fragments* (Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 2002).

²⁵ For methodological examples of the productive analysis that can come from reading documentation over the *longue durée* see, Emmanuel LeRoy Ladurie, “Motionless History,” *Social Science History* 1, 2 (1977): 115-136, Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie, *Times of Feast, Times of Famine: A History of Climate Since the Year 1000* (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1988 [1971]), quote on 18, and the reading of material culture over long periods, as with the scents of lavender, within, Letta Jones, “Plants and Smell – For Whose Benefit?” in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 115-128.

²⁶ One aspect of the advance of the digital humanities argues that scholars should apply a method of “distant

To overcome archival prejudices that privilege the mind over the body and elite texts over the sensory performances of the subaltern, this dissertation demonstrated how historians can apply the phenomenological reading tactics of sensory history to uncover resistance in the experiences of the past.²⁷ As historian Bruce Smith has described: “dominant methods” in the study of history still “cleave to the visual realm and profoundly distrust sense experience.”²⁸ Phenomenology, the study of consciousness through the language of experience, works to critique those dominant methods through exposing the flawed descriptions of the other within Western texts.²⁹ Odor can be accessed through

reading,” whereby academics well-versed in the primary documents of an era can abstract texts into immense aggregates to perceive larger trends that cannot be viewed within a singular text, but only when texts are abstracted into modes and means. Abstracting texts through distant reading enhances sensory history by exposing various spatial and linguistic consequences; how the meaning of words changed based upon different social, cultural, or physical environments and for economic and religious motives. For methodology see, Franco Moretti, *Distant Reading* (London: Verso, 2013), Katherine Bode, *Reading by Numbers: Recalibrating the Literary Field* (London: Anthem Press, 2012), and Stephen Ramsay, *Reading Machines: Toward an Algorithmic Criticism* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2011). And, for examples of this type of analysis see, Jerome McGann, *Radiant Textuality* (New York: Palgrave, 2004), esp. 56-61, Eric Thomas Slauter, *The State As a Work of Art: The Cultural Origins of the Constitution* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009), 21-26, 241-295, Franco Moretti, *The Bourgeois: Between History and Literature* (NY: Verso, 2013), esp. 25-57, Matthew Lee Jockers, *Macroanalysis: Digital Methods and Literary History* (Urbana: University of Illinois, 2013), 1-15, Friedman, *Reading Smell*, Frederick Mosteller and David Wallace, *Applied Bayesian and Classical Inference: The Case of the Federalist Papers* (New York: Springer-Verlag, 1984), esp. ix-xi, 4-28, Franco Moretti, *Atlas of the European Novel, 1800-1900* (London: Verso, 1998), and Franco Moretti, *Graphs, Maps, Trees: Abstract Models for a Literary History* (London: Verso, 2005).

²⁷ For examples of phenomenological history see, Douglas Kahn, *Noise, Water, Meat: A History of Sound in the Arts* (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1999), esp. 4-17, the importance of active forms of hearing as opposed to passive acceptance of sensory educations about how to hear within, Hillel Schwartz, *Making Noise: From Babel to the Big Bang & Beyond* (Brooklyn, NY: Zone Books, 2011), esp. 20-21, and the sensory space between the speaker and the hearer within, Bruce Smith, *The Acoustic World of Early Modern England: Attending to the O-Factor* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999), esp. 12-28.

²⁸ Bruce Smith, “How Sound is Sound History?: A Response to Mark Smith,” *The Journal of The Historical Society* II: 3-4 (Summer/Fall 2002): 307-315, quote on 308. For a similar phenomenological methodology regarding the nature of existence, through a reading of the scream, as occurring from the subject, whether it can be heard by another person or not, see, Peter Schwenger, “Phenomenology of the Scream,” *Critical Inquiry* 40, 2 (2014): 382-395. One way to understand phenomenological readings of history is through what Mark Patterson has called the “haptic knowledges” of the body in many non-Western cultures. Patterson asserts that the actions of the body can tell scholars more about a culture than the texts and language that writers use to describe cultural production. Mark Paterson, “Haptic Geographies: Ethnography, Haptic Knowledges and Sensuous Dispositions,” *Progress in Human Geography* 33, 6 (2009): 766-788.

²⁹ The inherent otherness of sensing something outside of oneself opens a dialogic space between the self and the other. Alphonso Lingis, *Sensation: Intelligibility in Sensibility* (Atlantic Highlands, N.J.: Humanities

phenomenology through bypassing the representational and metaphorical language of narrative through a reading of texts according to their world-directed meanings, their experiential tones.³⁰ These reading methods that apply phenomenology to the metanarrative of Western modernity informed a dissertation that asserts sensory experiences, and the language used to describe them, are essential for understanding history as political engagement. It is vital to understand that texts, stage performances, speeches, and the slave master's whip all inform the body how to act, and also apprise the mind how to discuss experience, through the influence of power relations that alter the body through both the mind, which educates the body, and through the body itself, which can be educated directly through libidinal impulses that effect the function of the physical form through patterns of disgust, pleasure, and shame that are inherently subconscious.³¹

The Body and the Mind; Telling History in the Wake of Enlightenment

In the vein of historical philosophy, this dissertation also read texts through Antonio Gramsci's understanding of hegemony, Foucauldian analyses of bio-political power, and

Press, 1996), esp. 67-88. For a phenomenological reading of aesthetics see the analysis between the words for sensation (semantics) and the order of words used to describe the sensation (syntax) within, Jean-Luc Nancy, *The Sense of the World* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997), esp. 8-15.

³⁰ Clare Batty, "Olfactory Experience I: The Content of Olfactory Experience," *Philosophy Compass* 5, 12 (2010): 1137-1146. For more specific discussions of phenomenology and the study of representational and replicable capabilities of odor language see, Clare Batty, "Olfactory Experience II: Objects and Properties," *Philosophy Compass* 5, 12 (2010): 1147-1156.

³¹ For more on phenomenology and the study of history see the reading of: Edmund Husserl as figuring ways out of narrative traps, Lockean forms of *tabula rasa* sensation, and Kantian understandings of the agency of objects within, David Carr, *Experience and History: Phenomenological Perspectives on the Historical World* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2014), and the idea of "carnal hermeneutics" through embodied sensation, meaning, and direction within Richard Kearney and Brian Treanor, "Introduction: Carnal Hermeneutics from Head to Foot," in *Carnal Hermeneutics*, edited by Richard Kearney and Brian Treanor (New York: Fordham University Press, 2015), 1-14.

how Louis Althusser comprehended the interpellation caused by ideological apparatuses to highlight the types of language applied by Western elites to codify a different form of what was deemed proper during the Enlightenment.³² These works often rely on the study of language, gesture, emotion, and power in the earlier works of Norbert Elias and George Simmel.³³ In these philosophical forms, language creates experience through a top-down mechanism that informs how language is educated upon the mind through the communal act of conversation or via the disciplining of direct speech.³⁴ For many scholars, metaphors and language are the essential mechanism productive of sensory and motor experience.³⁵

This dissertation, though understanding that language constructs experience, also exposed and privileged the manner through which the body directs language construction.³⁶ In the formative idea of hegemony, written texts exist first, and are then read by the populations of a society, which then disseminate the ideas of those texts to different population groups. This mechanism disseminates knowledge, which then inform the function of the body through a bio-political mechanism that changes bodily functions

³² Louis Althusser, *Lenin and Philosophy, and Other Essays* (New York: Monthly Review Press, 2001); Antonio Gramsci, *Prison Notebooks. Volume 1* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2010); Michel Foucault, *Discipline and Punishment: The Birth of the Prison* (New York: Vintage, 2012 [1975]).

³³ Kelvin Low, "The Social Life of the Senses: Charting Directions," *Sociology Compass* 6, 3 (2012): 271-282; Sigmund Freud, *Civilization and Its Discontents* (New York: W.W. Norton, 1962 [1929]); Peter Stearns and Carol Stearns, "Emotionology: Clarifying the History of Emotions and Emotional Standards," *American Historical Review* 90:4 (October 1985): 813-36. For sexuality and the controlling mechanisms of modernity as part of the new bourgeoisie market see, Peter Gay, *Education of the Senses* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1984).

³⁴ Charles Taylor, *The Language Animal: The Full Shape of the Human Linguistic Capacity* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2016), esp. 51-64.

³⁵ Taylor, *Language Animal*, esp. 156-164.

³⁶ For the importance of the body as creating symbolic meanings within "communitas" that emerge outward from ritual rather than downward from structure see, Victor Turner, *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* (Ithaca [N.Y.]: Cornell University Press, 1974), esp. 55-57.

through knowledge of how to act, or how the body should function. However, the body can be primary, it can know before it is told what to know, how to act, where to defecate. The body has its own form of knowledge that can exist apart from the power/knowledge binary of mass communication that relies on the dissemination of written texts.³⁷

In this historical revision that centralizes the body as productive of information and not simply receptive of knowledge, the bodies of the other and the self are to be understood as places of literary and social interpretation. Rather than a window to the world, the body exists within the world as: “the most quotidian part of our landscape and the most potent signifier known to us.”³⁸ The senses, as part of the body, are therefore vital in the creation of historical change, in the development of communities, and for asserting the structure of economic classes.³⁹ By stating this role for the senses, this dissertation worked to cure a central defect of the history of the body that focuses on printed anatomical and medical texts of the upper class archive by exposing many more bodily productions that assisted in the creation of modernity.⁴⁰

³⁷ Bio-power was explored as a direct relationship in Foucault’s early works, but has shifted to include discussions about hegemonic aspects of bio-power that are not simply placed upon the body through institutions like the prison, but manifest amongst the masses as forms of self-control and societal disciplining. Vernon Cisney and Nicolae Morar, “Introduction: Why Biopower? Why Now?” in *Biopower: Foucault and Beyond*, ed. Vernon Cisney and Nicolae Morar (Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016), 1-28.

³⁸ Lucy Gent and Nigel Llewellyn, “Introduction,” in *Renaissance Bodies: The Human Figure in English Culture, c. 1540-1660*, ed. Lucy Gent and Nigel Llewellyn (London: Reaktion Books, 1990), 1-10, quote on 9.

³⁹ For the use of sensations to create community solidarity see, Alain Corbin, *Village Bells: Sound and Meaning in the Nineteenth-Century French Countryside* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1998), and a similar reading of bells as communication mechanisms applied to create American identity within, Deborah Lubken, “Joyful Ringing, Solemn Tolling: Methods and Meanings of Early American Tower Bells,” *WMQ* 69, 4 (2012): 823-842.

⁴⁰ For phenomenological readings of relational aspects of reading culture within spatial and sensory analysis see, Christopher Tilley, *A Phenomenology of Landscape: Places, Paths, and Monuments* (Oxford, UK: Berg, 1994), esp. 10-17.

In order to recover the scents and voices of aromatically resilient subaltern classes, this project specifically applied these many multidisciplinary methodologies within Franco Moretti's rubric of "literary historiography" to expose the place of smell within different culturally educated sensory hierarchies. Literary historiography through the senses helps to create an understanding of the meaning of texts as historical products, through a "sociology of symbolic forms," a "history of cultural convention," and as productive of bodily and historical experience.⁴¹

A guiding work for understanding these conceptions of bodily discourse and the power/knowledge binary is George Lakoff and Mark Johnson's *Metaphors We Live By* (1980). Their analysis exposed that culture is not simply linguistically constructed through a power dynamic that creates truth for the masses, but also presents alteration to language via bodily experience, even before speaking, because metaphors are not simply linguistic. The mixing of these bodily and mental metaphors control and inform all human experience and understanding.⁴² Dan Sperber's *Rethinking Symbolism* (1975) has also been instructive for analyzing the linguistic knowledge of the body. Sperber's work exposed the problem of understanding language as part of a symbolic order. As an attack on semiological understandings of language and meaning, Sperber exposed places where semiotics cannot explain meaning. Specifically, the sense of smell is an often religious and

⁴¹ Franco Moretti, *Signs Taken for Wonders: Essays in the Sociology of Literary Forms* (London: NLB, 1983), esp. 9-21, quotes on 19. For an example of literary historiography of an analogous topic, see the reading of the symbolic associations of the nose within Western literature deconstructed in, Ron Hammond, "The Nose and Stephanger's Elbow," in *Nose Book: Representations of the Nose in Literature and the Arts*, ed. Victoria De Rijke, Lene Oestermarck-Johansen, and Helen Thomas (London: Middlesex University Press, 2000), 11-48.

⁴² George Lakoff and Mark Johnson, *Metaphors We Live By* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008 [1980]), esp. 57-58. For debates on language and the senses, from a perceptive that focuses on the relationship between the body and the making of words see, Asifa Majid and Stephen Levinson, "The Senses in Language and Culture," *Senses & Society* 6 (2011): 5-18.

ephemeral bodily experience that cannot be explained through the use of structural semiotics.⁴³ As historian Piero Camporesi similarly understood in his work on food encounters during the Renaissance, understanding smells must thus come from a categorization through a symbolic order, rather than a semiotic or linguistic order, because smelling offers a loose understanding of meaning that frequently exists outside of language.⁴⁴

The idea that the body can create cultural meanings has a well-established philosophical and sociological grounding in the semiotic academic fields of both Ferdinand Saussure and Charles Peirce. Commencing his work from these contrasting academic arenas, Thomas Sebeok reimagines semiotics, through the idea of the fetish, as a study of how the body interacts with the mind to create forms of behavior, and the ideologies of whether those behaviors should be accepted or denied.⁴⁵ Mark Johnson's *The Body in the Mind* (1987) also explored how meaning and rationality are not constructed singularly from the gift of language, often provided from places of mass communication power. Rather,

⁴³ For smell and the lacking power of semiotics to describe the construction of human language, see, Dan Sperber, *Rethinking Symbolism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1975), esp. 111-123. For the reading of the religious senses of the past through a transitory, ephemeral, synesthetic, and extended sensorium see, Bissera Pentcheva, *The Sensual Icon: Space, Ritual, and the Senses in Byzantium* (University Park, Pa: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2010).

⁴⁴ Piero Camporesi, *The Anatomy of the Senses: Natural Symbols in Medieval and Early Modern Italy* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1994), esp. 15-31. For the distrust of smell during the Renaissance due to a concern over artificial odors see the reading of humanism and reason within, Alessandro Arcangeli, "The Trouble with Odours in Petrarch's *De Remedis*," in *Sense and the Senses in Early Modern Art and Cultural Practice*, ed. Alice Sanger and Siv Tove Kulbrandstad Walker (Farnham, Surrey, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012), 19-30.

⁴⁵ Thomas Sebeok, *Signs: An Introduction to Semiotics* (Toronto, Ont.: University of Toronto Press, 2001), esp. 11-23, 124-126. For a similar reading of the "fetish" see the ideal of the glove as a gendered and fetishized commodity in early modern England within, Peter Stallybrass and Ann Rosalind Jones, "Fetishizing the Glove in Renaissance Europe," *Critical Inquiry* 28, 1 (2001): 114-132, and how races and cultures use the idea of the "fetish" to create hierarchies of belief systems within, David Murray, "Object Lessons: Fetishism and the Hierarchies of Race and Religion," in *Conversion: Old Worlds and New*, ed. Kenneth Mills and Anthony Grafton (Rochester, N.Y.: University of Rochester Press, 2003), 199-217.

the body marks its own metaphorical meanings through offering particular and local resistance to forms of universal language.⁴⁶

Through these roots, this dissertation exposed how activist history can better expose resistance through a consciousness of bodily experience than through a focus upon mindfulness within philosophical texts of the *philosophes*. This is because the body has historically been cordoned off as something to be controlled as incompatible to the structures of Western modernity. Emotional experiences of the body, discovered through phenomenological language, expose feeling and experience at a place devoid of the very reason that asserts shame as a means of labor control. As Carolyn Korsmeyer had noted in similar work on the meanings of disgust as what inherently counters the aesthetic, emotion “profoundly recognizes-intimately and personally-that it is our mortal nature to die and to rot. Acquiescing to this terrible truth and finding beauty in the overall pattern that gives it shape is both an artistic and a philosophical accomplishment. And-not surprisingly-it is rare.”⁴⁷

⁴⁶ Mark Johnson, *The Body in the Mind: The Bodily Basis of Meaning, Imagination, and Reason* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987), quotes on xvii, xxxv, 173, 210-212. This understanding of the dialectic between the body and language is important in the closely linked fields of both sensory history and the history of emotions. The idea of emotions as a “practice” through an understanding of place within the social “habitus” was defined through synthesis of the theses of Pierre Bourdieu. Pierre Bourdieu, *Outline of a Theory of Practice* (Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 1977). The habitus defines how distinction of proper tastes, regarding art or everyday social judgements of class, come into being. Pierre Bourdieu, *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1984), esp. 190-192. For the roots of these ideas of taste within Enlightenment art criticism see, George Dickie, *The Century of Taste: The Philosophical Odyssey of Taste in the Eighteenth Century* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), esp. 3-5. This social analysis has led to recent works on the history of emotion that value cultural inputs and trace diachronic alterations of emotionality. William Ian Miller, *The Anatomy of Disgust* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1997); William Reddy, *The Navigation of Feeling: A Framework for the History of the Emotions* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2001).

⁴⁷ Carolyn Korsmeyer, *Savoring Disgust: The Foul and the Fair in Aesthetics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), quote on 178.

Let us start again with the invisible, a specter haunting Europe. Let me tell you it is not a ghost. Let me tell you it stinks like shit, like mourning, like the *oi polloi*. This is not an apparition. It is active and ever-present, on a molecular level on the mucus membrane, on a cosmic level with scented Gods and floral Saints, and on a material level with the sweat of labor, the brows of the dispossessed, the masses and their atavistic stench. And, then, let us move to the sense of sight, the gaze, always peering from its panoptic tower. Let us pursue what the invisible is at its root. Odor is a manifestation, an emanation, from sites of popular struggle. Odor rises up where it is not wanted. It is then paved over, buried in caskets, cordoned off in pipes and aqueducts of lead-laced water to run on gravity's wake to pollute the bottommost parts of urban environments.

Smell exists in an axiological binary between purity and impurity. There it moves on a discursive spectrum between the pure life of floral exuberance and the pure death of a lacquered coffin.⁴⁸ Blackness and whiteness exist on a similar binary, where white symbolizes virginity, and blackness marks a complete fullness of dirt. Controlling the filth of blackness was the first stage in the construction of capitalism, the first marker of capital as blanched and pure, as the replacement for a pure God of the past for a new march of Mammon's currency. As Alain Badiou recently described: "Indeed. After demonizing black cats, the Devil's dark powers, crows, witches in black rags, the darkness of death,

⁴⁸ Jacques Fontanille, "Olfactory Syntax and Value-Systems: The Treatment of Smell in Celine's *Journey to the End of the Night*," in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 37-56. For links between the self and the other as essential to pursuing the retention of odor in the West, see, Bronwen Martin, "Smell, Cultural Identity and the Quest for Freedom," in *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, ed. Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham (Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003), 169-188.

and the blackness of the soul, we so-called Whites of Western Europe had to invent the fact that the majority of Africa's inhabitants clearly constituted an inferior 'race,' condemned to slavery and then to the forced labor of colonial occupation simply because this enormous population was 'black.'"⁴⁹

Most modern capitalist economies work to turn the intensities of the libidinal into "desires" that can be productive for capital.⁵⁰ The libidinal, the deeply sensuous, can become both a threat to capital through individual agency to create class consciousness and a supportive mechanism for capital as a structure that subsumes individual desires.⁵¹ Materialist scholarship must thus be aware of a language of the libidinal that is simply hegemony manifesting in desired forms: "like some particularly favoured smells to the nasal cavities, like preferred words and syntaxes to the mouth." Akin to the Lydians, who sold their daughters into slavery with the enticements of the odors of vaginal secretion, let us beware to not define our modernity by displacing the olfactory into the oppressive economy of hegemonic apparatuses.⁵² Let us deny the impulse to make odor an increasingly transferable good, let us retain it as *jouissance* within the commons.⁵³

⁴⁹ For a philosophical reading of the many meanings of black see, Alain Badiou, and Susan Spitzer, *Black: The Brilliance of a Noncolor* (Cambridge: Polity, 2017), quote on 91.

⁵⁰ During the late nineteenth century, many in the West began to understand the decline of their senses of smell enough to write of their desire for a more olfactory life. For examples see, Henry Finck, "The Aesthetic Value of the Sense of Smell," *The Atlantic Monthly* 46, 278 (December, 1880): 793-799, and C. P. Cranch, "Plea for the Sense of Smell," *Putnam's Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science, and Art* 13, 15 (March, 1869): 315-319.

⁵¹ For the invasion of olfactory commodification in the non-Western world see the example of cosmetics as upsetting olfactory gender categories within, Bettina Beer, "Boholano Olfaction," *The Senses and Society* 9, 2 (2014): 151-173.

⁵² For the philosophical idea that the deepest libidinal forces can be altered by capital enough to ameliorate resistance see, Jean-François Lyotard, *Libidinal Economy* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993), 1-3, 176-177, quote on 2, and examples within, Jacques Rancière, *Proletarian Nights: the Workers' Dream in Nineteenth-Century France* (London: Verso Books, 2012), esp. 9-17.

⁵³ For discussions of the libidinal capacities of odor and the manipulations of hegemony to control odor:

Utopian imaginings previously included the body, a fixed corporeality that has since been fragmented by the processes of capitalist hegemony. The technical capabilities of modern capitalism inhibit these critical libidinal capabilities that would allow the body to resist. As Western modernity defines the future mostly through the use of the eye, the sense of sight is rarely questioned and the sense of smell is deemed animal.⁵⁴ Therefore, to begin this process of protecting odor as a place for subaltern resistance, a stronger critique of Western biopower is necessitated.⁵⁵ Biopower educates the body to perform the senses in specific ways. Bio-ethics offers nuanced resistance to the overextension of biopower in the modern West. I assert something different as a means of resistance, a form of bioriot that will honestly critique biopower through a counter-hegemonic narrative that can offer a messianic moment of pause in the progression of the modern body to the gates of algorithmic appropriation in a post-human simulation.⁵⁶

through creating self-doubt and patterns of shame, especially in the modern perfume industry, see, Colleen Ballerino Cohen, "Olfactory Constitution of the Postmodern Body," in *Tattoo, Torture, Mutilation, and Adornment: The Denaturalization of the Body in Culture and Text*, ed. Frances Mascia-Lees and Patricia Sharpe (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992), 48-78, esp. 60-64, the use of odor in architectural design in the modern era within, Anna Barbara and Anthony Perliss, *Invisible Architecture: Experiencing Places Through the Sense of Smell* (Milano: Skira, 2006), esp. 29-34, the debates over odor in modern city planning within, Victoria Henshaw, *Urban Smellscapes: Understanding and Designing City Smell Environments* (New York: Routledge/Taylor & Francis Group, 2014), 83-92, and the use of odor in twentieth century theatre performances analyzed within, Mary Fleischer, "Incense and Decadents; Symbolists Theatre's Use of Scent," in *The Senses in Performance*, ed. Sally Banes and André Lepecki (New York: Routledge, 2007), 105-114.

⁵⁴ For the importance of visualization and the role of images of New World goods in the shifting rhetoric that allowed for the rise of the Industrial Revolution see, Chandra Mukerji, *From Graven Images: Patterns of Modern Materialism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983), esp. 243-261.

⁵⁵ For the commodification of odors through trademarking of the inherently ephemeral and transitory nature of scents see, Spyros Maniatis, "Scents as Trademarks: Propertisation of Scents and Olfactory Poverty," in *Law and the Senses: Sensational Jurisprudence*, ed. Lionel Bently and Leo Flynn (London: Pluto Press, 1996), 217-235, and the domestication of odors within the modern marketplace within, Adam Mack, "The Senses in the Marketplace: Commercial Aesthetics for a Suburban Age," in *Volume V of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 77-100.

⁵⁶ For performative resistance through the senses see the importance of bodily experience within, Richard Schechner, "Rasaesthetics," in *The Senses in Performance*, ed. Sally Banes and André Lepecki (New York: Routledge, 2007), 10-28, and olfactory performances to resist bourgeois culture within, Christina Bradstreet,

Aura can be used to create unity. The common experience of understanding commonly appreciated scents can create a unified understanding of a specific living space. My work is but a gesture in this direction of resistance, a blip on a much larger counter-hegemonic radar that needs to assert stronger critiques of modernity to avoid the postmodern sense of consistent fracture that pervades within much of the academy and Western society. One place to find these aggressive critiques is within the body, as a sacred space that can still work to avoid the fetish and commodification of the self through a new technics that privileges counter-hegemonic bodily practices that deterritorialize the superstructures of finance capital through the use of transgressive aspects of the original animal corpus.⁵⁷

Biopower is a form of terror imposed upon the subaltern, and increasingly upon the entire human community. The state, and the hegemony that supports a society reliant on the state, links the commodity fetish with ideas of improvement that educate the body to feel and sense in only a limited and allowed group of possible experiences.⁵⁸ Transgression can perform bioriot against these overextensions of biopower, can push against the final stages of capitalism that offers only chaos cured by repetition as a means of preparing Western society for the falsely rapturous entrance into the simulated perdition of virtual reality.⁵⁹

“A Trip to Japan in Sixteen Minutes: Sadakichi Hartmann’s Perfume Concert and the Aesthetics of Scent,” in *Art, History and the Senses: 1830 to the Present*, ed. Patrizia Di Bello and Gabriel Koureas (Burlington, VT: Ashgate Pub. Co., 2010), 51-62.

⁵⁷ For terror of the state and the rise of the commodity fetish see, Michael Taussig, *Shamanism, Colonialism, and the Wild Man: A Study in Terror and Healing* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1986), esp. 5-6.

⁵⁸ For a reading of odor and biopolitics see the power over learning how to smell as vital to questions of resistance within, Bruno Latour, “How to Talk About the Body?: The Normative Dimension of Science Studies,” *Body & Society* 10, 2-3 (2004): 205-229, esp. 224-227.

⁵⁹ For science fiction and the sense of artificiality within modern vision through consumer desires see, Robert

In this game of bioriot against the biopower of hegemony, we must find in the elite assertions of their own shit-less-ness nothing more than bullshit.⁶⁰ This finds its greatest manifestation in our present modernity, of political tyrants with no assholes to even shit; a perfect cleanliness to assert social domination.⁶¹ However, on that continuum, between the fecal-throwing masses who indulge in the feasts of the plebes in the Abbeys of Theleme and Cockaigne, through the ordered images of the visualized societies of the Courts of Stuart and Windsor, and to the uppermost emblems of power without assholes, we find a discourse. This dialogue is about the sense of smell, about excrement, about identity, animism, race, and evolution. It is about the Magic of the State, a magic that controls bodies through a vast biopower that relies on semantics of pollution, race, and odor.⁶²

That discourse was born during the Early Modern Era, when modern ideas about race, gender, identity, and the self were defined. That discourse continues today in the perfume ads of celebrity wantonness. Stink less to be accepted, stink well to be allowed to enter the halls of power. A fart still draws a sneer in Delmonico's, while at the communal dinner of family or friends it draws a laugh. Polite society hates the idea of odor. Their goal is a technics of oppression that shuts down the olfactory receptors and olfactory producing

Jütte, *A History of the Senses: From Antiquity to Cyberspace* (Cambridge: Polity, 2005), esp. 324-330.

⁶⁰ For gentrification of odors in the increasingly deodorized modern city see, Alex Rhys-Taylor, "Urban Sensations: A Retrospective of Multisensory Drift," in *Volume VI of A Cultural History of the Senses*, ed. Constance Classen and David Howes (London: Bloomsbury, 2014), 55-75.

⁶¹ For reform culture and the history of cleanliness in America see, Suellen Hoy, *Chasing Dirt: The American Pursuit of Cleanliness* (Bridgewater, NJ: Replica Books, 2000), esp. 147-170, and C. Dallett Hemphill, *Bowing to Necessities: A History of Manners in America, 1620-1860* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), esp. 129-159.

⁶² Foucault's work explored direct power first, and then shifted to analyze where power could manifest within the "regime of government" rather than the government itself. For re-centering the state within Foucauldian studies of the rise of liberalism see, Mitchell Dean and Kaspar Villadsen, *State Phobia and Civil Society: The Political Legacy of Michel Foucault* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2016), esp. 165-178.

holes of the human body. The early modern serf, the African slave, the woman of coverture, the religiously beleaguered, and the Native American all asserted their identity against this rhetorically shitless and odorless world of capital. They did so centuries ago.⁶³

The Enlightenment was about disembodied light over embodied experience, it was about denying the truly human in the animal form, about shifting the pre-modern visceral being of the body into the modern citizen of the mind. Central in this tradition was the rise of the ideal that the body is merely a vessel for a visual mind that looks out through a window to the world. Robert Romanyshyn has described:

The window aesthetic, which has so strongly influenced modern life since the fifteenth century, robs the viewer of his/her sensuous body. The window emphasizes vision. It is an instrument of and for the eye. As such, it turns the world primarily into an object to be seen and the viewer into a see-er. Perhaps herein lies the voyeurism of modern consciousness, which in its detached passion for spying on the world wishes to remain invisible, hidden, disembodied. In any case, the viewer is not only a paralyzed cyclops, staring and unmoving, but also *only* an eye. Camera vision not only paralyzes the body it also anaesthetizes it. The smell, taste, touch, and perhaps even the sound of things, are progressively eclipsed. The human body in its erotic and sensuous tie to things is increasingly abandoned.⁶⁴

⁶³ For the control of the senses as technics of oppression see, Lewis Mumford, *Technics and Civilization* (New York NY: Harcourt, Brace and Co, 1934), esp. 180-181, and the altered narratives of architecture that made homes into cleanly living spaces as a means of separating bodies and removing the unifying power of “aura” within, Ivan Illich, “‘The Dirt of Cities, the Aura of Cities, the Smell of the Dead, Utopia in the Odorless City’,” in *The Cities Culture Reader*, ed. Malcolm Miles, Iain Borden, and Tim Hall (London: Routledge, 2000), 355-359.

⁶⁴ Robert Romanyshyn, *Technology as Symptom and Dream* (London: Routledge, 1989), esp. 30-60, 125-

The cultural movement that took the body from living within the world to a mind staring out upon the world, started Western humanity along a pathway of desensitization that leads us now to the door step of what can best be described in the *zeitgeist* of our time as a *Matrix*, a singularity whereby our bodies will be turned into binary code.

There is no smell in the encryption where are bodies are being incorporated; there is light and silicon, bright and fake. The positivist progression from a medieval past where man experienced the world in synchronic enjoyment with the environment and his God, is now lost to the new gods of capitalist expressionism, who offer an art of zeros and ones to march the masses into the motherboard. As Richard Kearney has aptly noted in his analysis of how the image of modernity precedes the representation of the reality it is meant to portray: “It is virtually impossible today to contemplate a so-called natural setting, without some consumerist media image lurking in the back of one’s mind: a beach without an Ambre Solaire body, a meadow without a Cadbury’s Flake, a mountain stream without a Marlboro cigarette, a wild seascape without a hairspray or tourism commercial.”⁶⁵

Odor analysis, because of the centrality of the body and the transgressiveness of the language of smelling, allows for a materialist history that can overcome the burdens of structuralism that were never able to displace consistently adaptable forms of capital and her hegemonic signs.⁶⁶ A Marxist phenomenology can deny the burdens that earlier forms

127, quote on 60.

⁶⁵ Richard Kearney, *The Wake of Imagination: Toward a Postmodern Culture* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1988), 1-4, quote on 1; James Elkins, *Visual Literacy* (New York: Routledge, 2008), esp. 77-87.

⁶⁶ For the economic desire to remove the odor of death to deny labor the ability to question existence see, Ellen Stroud, “Dead Bodies in Harlem: Environmental History and the Geography of Death,” in *The Nature of Cities*, ed. Andrew Isenberg (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2006), 62-76, esp. 70-73.

of materialist writing placed upon structure.⁶⁷ Finding in odor a phenomenological language of resistance can assist in the project of critique through offering a form of criticism that does not rely upon simple binaries of power and resistance, but instead analyzes the continuum of discourse as that dialogue shifted diachronically.⁶⁸ Identifying how significations shifted, and for what reasons discourse has altered human perception, highlights a deep concern with how malleable the human body is to the machinations of power.⁶⁹

Analysis of odor can be a transgressive exposé that provides a space for honest critique of the misanthropic motives and biopolitical means of late capitalism. Phenomenology, rather than structure, allows us to see no art in the spatial technics that consistently separate man from nature in a grand progress of modernity that further links humanity with technology.⁷⁰ Cartesian dualism implies that we should separate the mind and body while analogously placing reason above nature.⁷¹ However, in doing, we put reason above the human, and reason, in her tight syntax and alluring semantics, became powerful enough, in our present era, to completely disembody the human via a

⁶⁷ Michael Albert and Robin Hahnel, *Unorthodox Marxism: An Essay on Capitalism, Socialism, and Revolution* (Boston: South End Press, 1978), 6-7.

⁶⁸ For how the apparatuses of the state creates categories of aesthetics as a means of controlling rhetoric of inclusion and exclusion see, Marc Redfield, *The Politics of Aesthetics: Nationalism, Gender, Romanticism* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2003), esp. 12-16, 176-182.

⁶⁹ For the study of vision in French philosophical traditions of the twentieth century see the consistent distrust of sight due to its hegemonic capabilities within, Martin Jay, *Downcast Eyes: The Denigration of Vision in Twentieth-Century French Thought* (Berkeley, Calif.: Univ. of California Press, 1994), esp. 69-77.

⁷⁰ Ernest Gellner, *Relativism and the Social Sciences* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), esp. 11-12; Bruno Latour, *On Technical Mediation: The Messenger Lectures on the Evolution of Civilization* (Lund, Sweden: Lunds Universitet, 1993).

⁷¹ For debates on sensation in the Enlightenment see the reading of sensationalist theory within, John O' Neal, *The Authority of Experience: Sensationist Theory in the French Enlightenment* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1996), esp. 13-101.

technological singularity through the device of the computer.⁷²

Capitalism works to disembody, this dissertation is an experiment in showing how it performed that disembodiment through placing the window gazing eye inherently above the nose, through separating the senses, dividing and conquering them from their synesthetic past.⁷³ Theorist Jean Baudrillard recently summarized: “The entire Western masquerade relies on the cannibalization of reality by signs, or of a culture by itself.” Language, the very signifiers and signified of our spoken words, turns humanity away from the libidinal capacity for revolutionary action through hegemonic manipulations of meaning. As the pace of finance capital increases for the institution of capitalism to survive, reality is further obscured by the signs of language that displace bodily and animal reality through manipulation of meaning into the structures of capital.⁷⁴

I find in the mechanisms of the Holocaust a lack of odor. I find in technologies of the Atlantic Slave Trade a desire for a dearth of smell. Instead I find IBM’s coding machines and insurance ledger books the precomputed the *Zong*.⁷⁵ These books and

⁷² For modern issues with the state control on aesthetics for sensory dominance and the patterns of resistance within religious traditions see, Birgit Meyer, “Introductions: From Imagined Communities to Aesthetic Formations: Religious Mediations, Sensational Forms, and Styles of Binding,” in *Aesthetic Formations: Media, Religion, and the Senses*, ed. Birgit Meyer (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 1-30.

⁷³ For the rise of the eye and the gaze see, Jonathan Crary, *Techniques of the Observer: On Vision and Modernity in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 1990), esp. 9-19, and the role of social disorder that necessitated the greater assertion of “taming” popular fairs in eighteenth century England within, Anne Wohlcke, *The Perpetual Fair: Gender, Disorder, and Urban Amusement in Eighteenth-Century London* (Manchester; New York: Manchester University Press, 2016), esp. 169-208.

⁷⁴ Jean Baudrillard, Sylvère Lotringer, and Ames Hodges, *The Agony of Power* (Los Angeles, CA: Semiotext(e), 2010), esp. 34-38, quote on 36. For an oppositional reading of the scents of capitalism as displacing the bland odors of socialism and assisting in the new construction of post-socialist Polish identity through the protection of private space see, Martyna Sliwa and Kathleen Riach, “Making Scents of Transition: Smellscapes and the Everyday in ‘old’ and ‘new’ Urban Poland,” *Urban Studies* 49 (2012): 23-42.

⁷⁵ For the concentration camp as the ultimate form of spatial and sensory control, and resistance through poesis as sensuous experience, see, Sten Pultz Moslund, *Literature’s Sensuous Geographies: Postcolonial Matters of Place* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015).

bastions of capital do not smell, they oppress. I find in the modern airport, the modern hospital, the modern city hall a lack of odor. Why can power not contain odor enough to allow its transgressive nature to release upon the world?

Odor is understood to not cause disease. In earlier times the discursive link existed, but science now tells of the bacteriological roots of disease, not the stinking. Still, the powers that be often work to define a world without stench because it is easier to suppress. Think of the discourse on the cleanliness and whiteness not as a curative for pre-modern animalism and violence, but as emblematic of the ontogenesis of modern deolfaction and a palliative for revolutionary sentiment. Think of perfume in the same way. They clean, but they clean too much. And clean, cleaning, defining what is to be cleaned, that is the very Magic of the State. In a purified environment the state can better produce its animism upon the bodies of the masses because there are fewer counter-hegemonic *pharmakons* to question the legitimacy of state power.⁷⁶

There are no limitations to the power of political structures to alter the body, to destroy the body, to turn the body into a simulation of humanity that looks upon the past only as a romantic and atavistic release.⁷⁷ We are lost to the capitalist gods if we are unwilling to see our own systems of oppression, our own reliance on the visual sense, our own increasingly disembodied existence of screens and keyboards. We are drawn ever further from our humanity by capitalism, and we know this to be occurring, but are agents

⁷⁶ For resistance through sensory multicultural, the appreciation of the senses of the other, as part of the possible resistance to relations of power see, Sanjay Sharma, "Unravelling Difference: Towards a Sensory Multiculture," *Senses & Society* 6 (2011): 284-305.

⁷⁷ For a reading of the complex sensory identity of East and West see the smells of shame and civilization within, Mary Neuburger, "To Chicago and Back: Aleko Konstantinov, Rose Oil, and the Smell of Modernity," *Slavic Review* 65, 3 (2006): 427-445.

and incentivized to let it occur. You bathe each day, you brush your teeth, and you sit on white porcelain thrones. And, in doing you provide bytes of hegemonic power to the idea of deodorized and disembodied existence. What is shame, but a mechanism of control?⁷⁸

Capitalism works its vast game of suppressing the original human form in two obvious ways, by totalizing meaning through language and by differentiating personal libidinal energy for revolt through fragmentation of political motives.⁷⁹ Race was constructed for labor manipulation through this splitting process that increasingly separated the senses at the same time that ethnic groups were progressively divided through fabricated traits. Sensory phenomenology, what scholar Richard Shusterman terms “somaesthetics,” can help to overcome the burdens that this isolating race construction has placed on both Western society and the Western sensorium. For Shusterman, living positively must involve understanding the very roots of sensory experience as socially constructed: “the attractive shaping of our lives as an art of living could also be enriched by greater perceptual awareness of aesthetic meanings, feelings and potentials in our everyday conduct of life.”⁸⁰

To overcome the sensory regime of racial knowing, scholars need to expose that “racial prejudice and ethnic enmity are so hard to cure” because: “their visceral roots lie in background feelings and habits that do not come to clear foregrounded consciousness so

⁷⁸ For the importance of scientific progress and numerical categorization and separation of the body as a means to divide the masses see, Ian Hacking, “Biopower and the Avalanche of Printed Numbers,” in *Biopower: Foucault and Beyond*, ed. Vernon Cisney and Nicolae Morar (Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016), 65-81.

⁷⁹ For postmodern fragmentation see, Fredric Jameson, *Postmodernism, or, The Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1991).

⁸⁰ Richard Shusterman, *Thinking through the Body: Essays in Somaesthetics* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), quote on 3.

they can be effectively dealt with, either through merely controlling them or transforming them through more positive somatic feelings. Somaesthetics' powers of heightened consciousness and control offer a possible remedy for such problems."⁸¹ Today's labor manipulation manifests differently through the expansion of signs, machines, and algorithmic technics of oppression. As theorist Maurizio Lazzarato has recently summarized: "The fact that in the current economy one speaks, communicates, and expresses oneself does not bring us back to the linguistic turn, to its logocentrism, and the intersubjectivity of speakers; it is indicative rather of a machine-centric world in which one speaks, communicates, and acts 'assisted' by all kinds of mechanical, thermodynamic, cybernetic, and computer machines."⁸² The "megamachine" of capitalism once suppressed labor through race construction and sensory manipulation, and now performs that suppression through algorithmic influences that have taken the ledger books of slave holds to the threshold of a mechanic enslavement of humanity in a post-human mockup.⁸³

This dissertation analyzed discourses on odor throughout the Early Modern Era. It has focused on the postmodern categories of race, class, and gender to tell a tale of how early modern European elites took the original thoughts of the fearful masses and used the power of the printed word to shift stench upon the other. And, how, at times, the other was

⁸¹ Shusterman, *Thinking through the Body*, quote on 66.

⁸² Maurizio Lazzarato, and Joshua David Jordan, *Signs and Machines: Capitalism and the Production of Subjectivity* (Los Angeles, CA: Semiotext(e), 2014), esp. 12-18, quote on 29. For the reading of modernity as mechanizing the subject within an automated world during the Early Modern Era see, Simon Shaffer, "Enlightened Automata," in *The Sciences in Enlightened Europe*, ed. William Clark, Jan Golinski, and Simon Schaffer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999), 126-168.

⁸³ Lazzarato, *Signs and Machines*, 33-38, quote on 33. For history of the tangible arithmetic that applied to bills of mortality, tax records, parish records, and censuses, which instituted biopolitics through the printed page see, Andrea Rusnock, "Biopolitics: Political Arithmetic in the Enlightenment," in *The Sciences in Enlightened Europe*, William Clark, Jan Golinski, and Simon Schaffer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999), 49-68.

able to throw that shit back in the face of the elite, through printed words and the material of scents that eluded superstructural displacement.⁸⁴ Reading odor as resistance to the core human experiences stolen by the gaze, I have explored how discourse can change sensory perception. Read this as a reminder that sensory worlds can be destroyed for profit, by a modernity that drives our very bodies into a post-humanity of shit-less-ness as technics, as terabytes.⁸⁵

We are meant to believe that our human perceptions are somehow permanent. However, the human senses have been altered, deep into genetic tissue through socio-genetic manipulations of various means and motives. That alteration has sped up as the Malthusian forces of modernity brought about the rise of capitalism and the contributive Atlantic Slave Trade.⁸⁶ The sin of Mammon's money, of greed and necessity, created a human form that was more malleable than before, genetically and socially.⁸⁷ The state, the zoning laws of class relationships and sewage canals, manipulated the citizen from his

⁸⁴ For the reliance of class relationships on the cultural construction of ideas about odor as a means for the bourgeoisie to ascend above and control the proletariat see, Daniel Bender, "Sensing Labor: The Stinking Working-Class after the Cultural Turn," in *Rethinking US Labor History: Essays on the Working-Class Experience, 1756-2009*, ed. Donna Haverty-Stacke and Daniel Walkowitz (New York, NY: Continuum, 2010), 243-265.

⁸⁵ For specific cases of the control of shit and odor for the ascension of class relationships in the American experience see, Christine Rosen, "Noisome, Noxious, and Offensive Vapors, Fumes and Stenches in American Towns and Cities, 1840-1865," *Historical Geography* 25 (1997): 49-82, and Andrew Hurley, "Busby's Stink Boat and the Regulation of Nuisance Trades, 1865-1918," in *Common Fields: An Environmental History of St. Louis*, ed. Andrew Hurley (St. Louis: Missouri Historical Society Press, 1997), 145-162.

⁸⁶ For the desire for quietude among the masses, either the laboring classes or slaves, see, Peter Denney, "'The Sounds of Population Fail': Changing Perception of Rural Poverty and Plebian Noise in Eighteenth-Century Britain," in *Experiences of Poverty in Late Medieval and Early Modern England and France*, ed. Anne Scott (Farnham, Surrey, England: Ashgate, 2012), 295-311, and Mark Smith, *Listening to Nineteenth-Century America* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2001).

⁸⁷ Todd May and Ladelle McWhorter, "Who's Being Disciplined Now? Operations of Power in a Neoliberal World," in *Biopower: Foucault and Beyond*, ed. Vernon Cisney and Nicolae Morar (Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016), 245-258.

previous form as bare life into the being it needed, a mechanical arrangement that gradually lost its animal senses.⁸⁸

In that manipulation of human into machine, of life into financial capital through the mechanisms of “false embodiment,” as body into actuarial tables and ledger books, the sense of smell was deemed anti-logos, anti-Western, anti-state, and anti-science.⁸⁹ Simply, the removal of wasteful aspects of humanity, or those aspects of humanity deemed unwanted, drive the “strength of capitalism” that “lies in the exploitation of machines and semiotic systems that conjoin functions of expression and functions of content of every kind, human and non-human, micro-physical and cosmic, material and incorporeal.”⁹⁰

And, in that manipulation of the body into the incorporeal form for capital, odor became a marker of the transgressive threat, the pre-modern, the irrational, and the other; a profligate sense to be removed. With modernity, the eye increasingly separated from the subject’s body. The aromas of embodied experience of the pre-modern are therefore lost. In essence, this elimination is beyond repair because the human genome altered under the weight of state power and capital drives to understand odor as wasteful.⁹¹

Money is shit, but it does not smell. Muck and money go together. Children mark

⁸⁸ For more on controlling odor in the establishment of nineteenth century state sewage systems see, Stephen Halliday, *The Great Stink of London: Sir Joseph Bazalgette and the Cleansing of the Victorian Metropolis* (Stroud: Sutton, 2001), esp. 108-163.

⁸⁹ For “false embodiment” and the roots of modern senses of anxiety as part of hegemony see, Geoffrey Hartman, *The Fateful Question of Culture* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1997), esp. 99-140, quote on 27.

⁹⁰ Lazaratto, *Signs and Machines*, quote on 88; Zygmunt Bauman, *Wasted Lives: Modernity and Its Outcasts* (Oxford: Polity, 2004)

⁹¹ For overturning the Enlightenment aesthetic tradition of Descartes and Kant through an object-oriented critique of phenomenology, see the reading of Dante’s *Divine Comedy* within, Graham Harman, *Dante’s Broken Hammer* (London: Repeater, 2016), esp. 7-13, 225-249.

their food by licking it, by taunting others that their mark of uncleanness has made something theirs. Animals piss and shit to mark their territory. So does man. He marks his terrain through cordoning off what is shit and what is not. He does so through rhetoric, through changing language, by semantically defining what cannot be made clean. Like the animals who mark their land in a discursive battle of textual urine, man marks his territory through the shit-stained words of his popular culture.

The public sphere contains a battle over consciousness that includes and enhances this throwing of shit. An orangutan in a cage, smearing and tossing, the human finds himself with the deep Freudian urge to smear and throw, to find his identity through exotic and erotic excremental release. Sometimes this is shit itself, but more often it is shit as words, a carnival of fecal texts tossed by those who need power, and from those who are oppressed. Odor marks the self and other, it divides when it is categorized. However, when it is not classified, odor also unites. And the fear of unity is the essential fear of the elite; of the slave-owner, of the warmonger, of the singular corporate power deemed a man.⁹²

Rather than decoding odor by analyzing its chemical components, how those interact with the human nose, and how they sharply contact the mucus membrane, I read odor out, into culture, into the vast malaise of racism and class suppression that began with the rise of capitalism and primitive accumulation. Odor, classifying something as smelly, implies a direct relationship to the discourses on purity and the uncontaminated. Cleaning became a singular mark of modernity through this process, this progress, which marked the cleaning of the dirty, whomever and whatever was classified as polluting.

⁹² For the rise of the eye as the dominant bourgeois sense see the analysis of enlightening within domestic spaces as important for constructions of class power within, Chris Otter, *The Victorian Eye: A Political History of Light and Vision in Britain, 1800-1910* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008).

For the English, and many groups analyzed within this dissertation, the work of modern liberalism involved a deep biopolitics that found common sense in racial experiences of the senses.⁹³ As David Trotter has noted, modern “liberalism used disgust to preserve and indeed to reinforce at the level of 'instinct' social differences for which it no longer saw any moral or political justification.”⁹⁴ Because of this need to classify and divide, Western bodies are increasingly devoid of the sensory pleasure that can be accessed through the totalizing object, because the object is always categorized and fetishized.⁹⁵ To resist this fetish, this overextension of biopower, my dissertation tied the changes in European smelling less to progressive and visualized cleaning procedures and the material change in conditions of the urban environment and the European body, than to concerns over language that informed Europeans to smell the world differently.⁹⁶ Reasoning has a transcendental quality outside of *logos*, language, and Western metaphysics. The power of the central European ego, its belief in its own superiority, tied itself to a desire to be scentless, and that link involved displacing the odor of Europeans onto the others of the New World. This was but one aspect of the grand march of capitalist modernity that

⁹³ For an example of the Victorian desire to indulge in the odor of the other, see the grotesque burning of mummies, sometimes as satirical signifiers to the wood used to barbecue food, described within, Constance Classen, "Touching the Deep Past: The Lure of Ancient Bodies in Nineteenth-Century Museums and Culture," *The Senses and Society* 9, 3 (2014): 268-283, and the making of the Irish other as pungent through class discourses about pigs within, Joseph Nugent, "The Human Snout: Pigs, Priests, and Peasants in the Parlor," *The Senses and Society* 4, 3 (2009): 283-301.

⁹⁴ For the inherent relationship between that which is dirty and the progress of cleaning see, David Trotter, *Cooking with Mud: The Idea of Mess in Nineteenth-Century Art and Fiction* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000), esp. 115-197, quote on 178.

⁹⁵ Zygmunt Bauman, and Leonidas Donskis, *Moral Blindness: The Loss of Sensitivity in Liquid Modernity* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 2013), esp. 13-16.

⁹⁶ For examples of the rise of the scientific eye as a means of controlling the other through medical education see, Alexander Widmer “Seeing Health like a Colonial State: Pacific Island Assistant Physicians, Sight, and Nascent Biomedical Citizenship in the New Hebrides,” in *Senses and Citizenships: Embodying Political Life*, ed. Susanna Trnka (New York, NY: Routledge, 2013), 200-220.

displaces the body from the mind for the goals of a disembodied and commodified human form.⁹⁷

Capital will win, has already won, because the positivist bent of modernity, never conquered by the postmodernists due to the malleability of the culture industry, asserted vision and progress above the importance of a full sensorium that included the sense of smell. Postmodernity, a lost and bewildered caravansary of political impotence, has mislaid the fight to apply the past because of a petrified assertion of relativism against any pursuit of progress. Because of these intellectual elite, frightened away from political debates about utopianism due to the hemoclysms of Holocaust and Hiroshima, the West is now faced with a future space that will completely remove the body from utopian consideration. Struggling to revive the originally oppressed past, and its sensuous body, is therefore the mark of a true materialist history.⁹⁸

⁹⁷ For a deeper analysis of what it means to critique the Enlightenment, while still living in the wake of Machiavellian *fortuna* and the goals of Renaissance self-interest see, Steven Smith, *Modernity and Its Discontents: Making and Unmaking the Bourgeois from Machiavelli to Bellow* (New Haven; London: Yale University Press, 2016), esp. 15-23, 29, the constructions of grace and virtue in the wake of the Renaissance in, J. G. A. Pocock, *The Machiavellian Moment: Florentine Political Thought and the Atlantic Republican Tradition* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1975), critiques of Foucault as starting from a place of “performative contradictions” within, Richard Bernstein, “Foucault: Critique as Philosophical Ethos,” in *Philosophical Interventions in the Unfinished Project of Enlightenment*, ed. Axel Honneth, Thomas McCarthy, Claus Offe, and Albrecht Wllmer (Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T Press, 1992), 280-310, the debate between Foucault and Habermas analyzed within, Christopher Fox, “Introduction: How to Prepare a Noble Savage: The Spectacle of Human Science,” in *Inventing Human Science: Eighteenth-Century Domains*, ed. Christopher Fox, Roy Porter, and Robert Wokler (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995), 1-30, debates on the remaining importance of critiquing science within, Bruno Latour, “The Enlightenment Without the Critique: A Word on Michel Serres’ Philosophy,” *Royal Institute of Philosophy Lecture Series* 21 (1987): 83-97, the tone of skepticism analyzed through the common goals of self-interest within, Lorraine Daston, “Afterword: The Ethos of Enlightenment,” in *The Sciences in Enlightened Europe*, ed. William Clark, Jan Golinski, and Simon Schaffer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999), 495-504, and the analysis of retaining reason, through phenomenology, without oppressive forms of objectivity within, Jacques Derrida, “The ‘World’ of the Enlightenment to Come (Exception, Calculation, Sovereignty),” *Research in Phenomenology* 33, 1 (2003): 9-52.

⁹⁸ For postmodernism as a paralysis for societal change see, Reinhart Koselleck, *Futures Past: On the Semantics of Historical Time* (New York: Columbia University, 2004), 36-40, Joan Hoff, “Gender as a Postmodern Category of Paralysis,” *Women’s History Review* 3, 2 (1994): 149-168, and David Lempert, “What Is Development? What Is Progress? The Social Science and Humanities of Utopia and Futurology,” *Journal of Developing Societies* 30, 2 (2014): 223-241.

Rubbish, shit, and all that stinks are socially defined. In that realization, we can see the links between the rhetorical classifications that define what is deemed valuable. When something is considered refuse, the value of that object is limited. The superstructure defines the value of a good, sensation, body, or mind in order to support the material base. As literary critic Michael Thompson has summarized:

Nature is essentially chaotic and continuous; culture is orderly and discreet. Thus nature continually threatens to break down the water-tight compartments which culture seeks to impose on it. Since natural compartments seldom, if ever, occur, it is likely that there will be some natural elements which are on the borderline between two cultural categories, no matter where that borderline is drawn. These borderline cases...threaten to destroy the precarious order established by culture and so must be accorded special treatment by the culture-bearers. Taboo behavior and pollution avoidances cluster about these borderline cases in all cultures and so, by looking for the anomalies, the taboos, and the avoidances, we can obliquely approach the cultural categories themselves.⁹⁹

To find these cultural categories at the border, in an effort to understand the cultural construction of sensation and the motives of capital to maintain her configurations, I applied the hendiadys and tautology of race and smell within the grand narrative of

⁹⁹ Michael Thompson, *Rubbish Theory: The Creation and Destruction of Value* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1979), quote on 91. For more examples of histories of cleanliness and disgust that define similar forms of scented othering see the shifting moral codes related to the idea of the “scavenger” of waste-trade operations within, Carl Zimring, “Dirty Work: How Hygiene and Xenophobia Marginalized the American Waste Trades, 1870-1930,” *Environmental History* 9, 1 (2004): 80-101.

European modernity to critique that very modernity as productive of forms of power that manipulate languages through a materialism that limits olfaction as a transgressive threat.¹⁰⁰

We must never forget that purity is symbiotically tied to shit. A deep paranoia exists in West for smell, fecal matter, and the orifices that release dejecta. Getting beyond this paranoia can expose the deep othering, the essential creation of private space for capital entrenchment, in the process of marking specific places as pungent or polluted. This dissertation has hopefully opened a lens into what the Western state attempted to control, and consequently uncovered where the state found those possibilities of dominance lacking. Rather than deny the odor of the other, we should indulge in the odors of the other, because in that freedom to unite rests the ability to deny the power of odor to mark the private as significant.¹⁰¹

In the patterning of odor into the public sphere, the acceptance of heterogeneous odors of foreign cuisine, other bodies, and perfumes as equally valuable to Western materials, we can find a place for the production of inclusion, a place for community development in different forms than the construction of identity and community through exclusion, border control, and the marking of private space.¹⁰² This dissertation's effort is an entrance to find the sensorium of the body as a space for unifying resistance, as a place

¹⁰⁰ For materialism in the study of cultural practices see, Pierre Bourdieu, *The Logic of Practice* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1990), esp. 95-97.

¹⁰¹ For how language of epidemics can be used to set insiders and outsiders, as in early New England with Native Americans and the controversies of Anne Hutchinson, see, Cristobal Silva, *Miraculous Plagues: An Epidemiology of Early New England Narrative* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), esp. 62-100.

¹⁰² For inclusion and exclusion see debates on the identity of the "third man" within, Bryan Lueck, "The Terrifying Concupiscence of Belonging: Noise and Evil in the Work of Michel Serres," *Symposium* 19, 1 (2015): 248-267.

for revolutionary action that existed before capital began the march of primitive accumulation, asserted linguistic hegemony, and became bio-politically aware. The superstructure, or the cultural and social content that rests above and upholds economic structures, is the central space for learning to experience the senses and performing sensation.¹⁰³ Sites of possible transgression against hegemony within the superstructure can emerge from the sensory other within spaces of both objectification and desire.¹⁰⁴ Because desire exists, inherently within the construction of the other, the areas of antipodal carnival and inversion can open for riotous forms of resistance against hegemony.¹⁰⁵

The subject, degraded by capital into a mere spectacle consumer, through asserting the importance of the lower senses as part of the utopian dream of Marxism, can once again proclaim the revolutionary body and declare the corporeal form as the antithetical force necessary to resist the false capitalist utopianism that increases with each new wave of technological and algorithmic appropriation of the human form. Resistance can only arrive through attachment to the permanency of the body as a space that retains utopian traces that exist apart from linear time and progress, as a revolutionary force to resist the dividing

¹⁰³ For the senses in performances, as engaged through the symbolic currency that educates the senses through language, see, André Lepecki and Sally Banes, "Introduction: the Performance of the Senses," in *The Senses in Performance*, ed. Sally Banes and André Lepecki (New York: Routledge, 2007), 1-7.

¹⁰⁴ For the link between language, aesthetics, and sensation see the reading of class and the totality of the body within, Elio Franzini, "Rendering the Sensory World Semantic," in *Art and the Senses*, ed. Francesca Bacci and David Melcher (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 115-132, and Maurice Merleau-Ponty, *The Primacy of Perception, And Other Essays on Phenomenological Psychology, the Philosophy of Art, History, and Politics* (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1964). For a reading of temporality and artistic representations of the masses see, Stephen Greenblatt, "Murdering Peasants: Status, Genre, and the Representation of Rebellion," *Representations* 1 (1983): 1-29.

¹⁰⁵ Peter Stallybrass and Allon White, *The Politics and Poetics of Transgression* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1986), esp. 27-79. For early modern European beliefs about the threats of odor as upsetting the internal body through bypassing the "inward wits" more easily than the other senses see, E. Ruth Harvey, *The Inward Wits: Psychological Theory in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance* (London: Warburg Institute, 1975), esp. 17-21.

and fracturing multiplicities of both finance capital and the increasingly commodified postmodern academy.¹⁰⁶

¹⁰⁶ For smelling of the other as a form of communication akin to listening to the other through unconscious speaking see, Philippe Lacoue-Labarthe and Christopher Fynsk, *Typography: Mimesis, Philosophy, Politics* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1989), esp. 160-162.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

“20 Dollars Reward.” *Wilmington Gazette*, July 28, 1807, p. 3.

“50 Reward.” *Raleigh Register and North Carolina Weekly Advertiser*, May 27, 1825, p. 2.

“A Bill Intituled: An Ordinance to Make Better Provision for the Prevention of Witchcraft and the Punishment of Witches, 1955.” Witchcraft Legislation in Uganda. EAF 260/51/01 and CO 822/1136.

A Fuller Relation of Sir Thomas Fairfax's Routing All the Kings Armies in the West. London: Mathew Walbanck, 1646.

Adair, James. *The History of the American Indians*. New York & London: Johnson Reprint Corporation, 1968 [1775].

Adams, Thomas. *Englands Sicknes, Comparatively Conferred with Israels Divided into two Sermons*. London: E. Griffin for John Budge, and Ralph Mab, 1615.

Aesop, and Samuel Croxall. *Fables of Aesop and Others: Translated into English...By Samuel Croxall...The Eleventh Edition, Carefully Revised, and Improved*. London: W. Strahan, 1778.

Africanus, Leo, and John Pory. *A Geographical Historie of Africa, Written in Arabicke and Italian by John Leo a More, Borne in Granada, and Brought Up in Barbarie*. London: Eliot's Court Press; George Bishop, 1600.

Allen, Grant. *In All Shades*. Chicago: Rand McNally, 1889 [1886].

Allen, Robert. *A Treatise of Christian Beneficence, and of That Like Christian Thankefulnese Which Is Due to the Same: The Which, As They Are Duties of*

- Singular Account with God, so Are They of As Necessarie Vse to All Christians, for the Keeping of Faith and a Good Conscience, As Are Fire and Water for Common Vse and Comfort to the Naturall Life of All Men.* London: John Harison for Thomas Man, 1600.
- Allestree, Richard. *The Ladies Calling in Two Parts*. Oxford: Printed at the Theatre, 1673.
- Alsop, George. "A Character of the Province of Maryland." In *Narratives of Early Maryland, 1633-1684*, edited by Clayton Colman Hall, 337-367. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1910.
- Alvares, Manuel, *Ethiopia Minor and a Geographical Account of the Province of Sierra Leone* (c. 1615). Liverpool: Dept. of History, University of Liverpool, 1990.
- Ambroise, Thomas Paré. *De humani corporis fabrica. English. Selections aut Spiegel, and J. G. Workes of That Famous Chirurgion Ambrose Parey Translated Out of Latin and Compared with the French by Tho Johnson. Whereunto Are Added Three Tractates of Adrianus Spigelius of the Veines, Arteries, & Nerves, with Large Figures.* S. L. E. C., 1665.
- Ambrose, Isaac. *Ultima, The Last Things, in Reference to the First and Middle Things: or, Certain Meditations on Life, Death, Judgement, Hell, Right Purgatory, and Heaven.* London: J. A., 1650.
- "An Act for the Punishment of such Slaves as shall be found Practising Obeah, 1806." Folios 103-104. In "Refers to the 'Act for the better prevention of the practice of Obeah' and states that since its enactment 'a question of law has arisen as to its efficiency as an Act, in consequence of there being no Court specified, before whom the Criminal should be tried as was provided by the former Act' [of 4

- November 1806]. The attorney general has expressed his opinion that a court comprising two magistrates and three freeholders was not competent to try a particular case. Asks that the matter should be referred to the law officers.” Folios 96-104. No. 48. CO 28/87/32.
- Annesley, Samuel. *Casuistical Morning-Exercises: The Fourth Volume*. London: James Astwood for John Dunton, 1690.
- Anonymous. “A Kaffir Witch Doctor.” *The American Phrenological Journal and Life Illustrated: A Repository of Science, Literature, and General Intelligence* 41, 6 (June, 1865): 189-190.
- Anonymous, *The Accomplish'd Sea-Mans Delight*. London: Benj. Harris, 1686.
- Appianus, *An Auncient Historie and Exquisite Chronicle of the Romanes Warres, Both Civile and Foren*. London: Raulfe Newberrie and Henrie Bynniman, 1578.
- Bacon, Roger, Duarte Madeira Arrais, and Richard Browne. *The Cure of Old Age and Preservation of Youth*. London: Tho. Flesher...and Edward Evets, 1683.
- Banister, John. *A Needefull, New, and Necessarie Treatise of Chyrurgerie Briefly Comprehending the Generall and Particuler Curation of Ulcers, Drawen Foorth of Sundrie Worthy Wryters, but Especially of Antonius Calmeteus Vergesatus, and Joannes Tagaltius, by John Banister...Hereunto Is Anexed Certaine Experiments of Mine Owne Invention, Truely Tried, and Daily of Me Practised*. London: Thomas Marshe, 1575.
- Barlowe, Arthur. “The First Voyage Made to the Coasts of America.” In *Early American Writings*, edited by Carla Mulford, Angela Vietto, and Amy Winans, 165-169. New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.

Barrough, Philip. *The Methode of Phisicke Conteyning the Causes, Signes, and Cures of Inward Diseases in Mans Body from the Head to the Foote. Whereunto Is Added, the Forme and Rule of Making Remedies and Medicines, Which Our Phisitians Commonly Use at This Day, with the Proportion, Quantitie, & Names of Ech [Sic] Medicine*. London: Thomas Vautroullier, 1583.

Bartholomaeus. *Batman Uppon Bartholome: His Booke De Proprietatibus Rerum, Newly Corrected, Enlarged and Amended: with Such Additions As Are Requisite, Unto Every Severall Booke: Taken Foorth of the Most Approved Authors, the Like Heretofore Not Translated in English. Profitable for All Estates, As Well for the Benefite of the Mind as the Bodie*. London: Thomas East, 1582.

Bartram, William. *Travels and Other Writings: Travels Through North and South Carolina, Georgia, East and West Florida; Travels in Georgia and Florida, 1773-74: A Report to Dr. John Fothergill; Miscellaneous Writings*. New York: Literary Classics of the United States, 1996.

Basse, William, and John Payne Collier. *The Pastorals and Other Workes of William Basse*. Oxford: T. Richards, 1653.

Basutoland Medicine Murder: A Report on the Recent Outbreak of Diredlo Murders in Basutoland. Presented by the Secretary of State for Commonwealth Relations to Parliament by Command of His Majesty. 16 A. In "Ritual Murder and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1951." DO 119/1381.

Bate, George, James Shipton, and William Salmon. *Pharmacopœia Bateana*. London: S. Smith and B. Walford, 1694.

Bauderon, Brice. *The Expert Phisician*. London: R. I., 1657.

- Baxter, James Phinney. *The Pioneers of New France in New England, with Contemporary Letters and Documents*. Albany, NY: J. Munsell's Sons, 1894.
- Baxter, Richard. *The Certainty of the Worlds of Spirits and, Consequently, of the Immortality of Souls Of the Malice and Misery of the Devils and the Damned: and of the Blessedness of the Justified, Fully Evinc'd by the Unquestionable Histories of Apparitions, Operations, Witchcrafts*. London: T. Parkhurst...and J. Salisbury, 1691.
- Bayly, Lewis. *The Practice of Piety: Directing a Christian How to Walk, That He May Please God*. London: D. Midwinter, 1711.
- Beard, Thomas, and Thomas Taylor. *The Theatre of Gods Judgements: Wherein Is Represented the Admirable Justice of God against All Notorious Sinners, Great and Small, Specially against the Most Eminent Persons in the World, Whose Exorbitant Power Had Broke Through the Barres of Divine and Humane Law*. London: S. I. & M. H, 1648.
- Beaumont, Francis, John Fletcher, and William Marshall. *Fifty Comedies and Tragedies. Written by Francis Beaumont and John Fletcher, Gentlemen. All in One Volume. Published by the Authors Original Copies, the Songs to Each Play Being Added*. London: J. Macock and H. Hills, for John Martyn, Henry Herringman, Richard Marriot, 1679.
- Biard, Pierre. "Relation de la Nouvelle France, de Ses Terres, Natvrel du Pais, & de ses Habitans. Paris, 1616." In *Volume 3 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 21-287. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898.

- Bigot, Vincent, and Claude Dablon. "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en la Nouvelle France en l'année 1679. *Vincent Bigot*, revised by Claude Dablon; [Quebec, 1679]." In *Volume 61 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 88-241. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899.
- Blassingame, John. *Slave Testimony: Two Centuries of Letters, Speeches, Interviews, and Autobiographies*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1977.
- Boaistuau, Pierre, and Edward Fenton. *Certaine Secrete Wonders of Nature Containing a Description of Sundry Strange Things, Seming Monstrous in Our Eyes and Judgement, Bicause We Are Not Privie to the Reasons of Them. Gathered Out of Divers Learned Authors As Well Greeke As Latine, Sacred As Prophane*. London: Henry Bynneman, 1569.
- Bodenham, John, and Anthony Munday. *The Garden of the Muses*. London: Edward Allde for John Tap, 1610.
- Boccalini, Traiano, William Vaughan, John Florio, and Thomas Scott. *The New-Found Politicke*. London: Francis Williams, 1626.
- Bohun, Ralph. *A Discourse Concerning the Origine and Properties of Wind with an Historicall Account of Hurricanes and Other Tempestuous Winds*. Oxford: W. Hall for Tho. Bowman, 1671.
- Bosman, Willem, and G. Brown Goode. *A New and Accurate Description of the Coast of Guinea, Divided into the Gold, the Slave, and the Ivory Coasts*. London: James Knapton and Dan. Midwinter, 1705.
- Boulton, John. "Diary of John Boulton, 1799-1854." BDA X 10/13.

Bourke, John Gregory. *Scatalogic Rites of All Nations: A Dissertation Upon the Employment of Excrementitious Remedial Agents in Religion, Therapeutics, Divination, Witchcraft, Love-Philthers, Etc., in All Parts of the Globe*. Washington, D. C.: W. H. Lowdermilk & Co., 1891.

Bradley, Richard. *The Gentleman and Farmer's Guide For the Increase and Improvement of Cattle, Viz. Lambs, Sheep, Hogs, Calves, Cows, Oxen: Also the Best Manner of Breeding, and Breaking Horses, Both for Sport and Burden*. London: Mears, 1732.

Bradley, Richard, W. Mears, and John Cole. *A Philosophical Account of the Works of Nature: Endeavouring to Set Forth the Several Gradations Remarkable in the Mineral, Vegetable, and Animal Parts of the Creation, Tending to the Composition of a Scale of Life: to Which Is Added, an Account of the State of Gardening, As It Is Now in Great Britain, and Other Parts of Europe: Together with Several New Experiments Relating to the Improvement of Barren Ground, and the Propagating of Timber-Trees, Fruit-Trees, &C.: with Many Curious Cutts*. London: W. Mears, 1721.

Brathwayt, Richard. *Essays Upon the Five Senses*. London: Anne Griffin, 1635 [1620].

Bressani, Giuseppe. "Breve Relatione d'alcvne missioni de' PP. della Compagnia di Gies nella Nuova Francia. Macerata, Italy, July 19, 1653." In *Volume 38 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, Abenakis, Lower Canada, Hurons, 1652–1653, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 203-288. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898.

Bridges, John. *A Sermon, Preached at Paules Crosse on the Monday in Whitson Weeke*

Anno Domini. 1571 Entreating on This Sentence Sic Deus Dilexit Mundum, Vt Daret Vnigenitum Filium Suum, Vt Omnis Qui Credit in Eu[M] Non Pereat, Sed Habeat Vitam Æternam. So God Loved the Worlde, That He Gave His Only Begotten Sonne, That Al That Beleve on Him Shoulde Not Perysh, but Have Eternall Life. London: Henry Binneman for Humfrey Toy, 1571.

Brisson, Pierre-Raymond de. *Voyages to the Coast of Africa.* London: G. G. J. and J. Robinson, 1792.

“Bristol, Sept. 16.” *American Weekly Mercury*, Tuesday 1/23 to Thursday 2/8, 1738/1739, p. 3.

Brome, Richard. *Five New Playes, Viz. The English Moor, or the Mock-Marriage. The Love-Sick Court, or the Ambitious Politique: Covent Garden Weeded by The New Academy, or the New Exchange. The Queen and Concubine.* London: A. Crook and H. Brome, 1659.

Brooks, Thomas. *London's Lamentations: Or, a Serious Discourse Concerning That Late Fiery Dispensation That Turned Our (Once Renowned) City into a Ruinous Heap. Also the Several Lessons That Are Incumbent upon Those Whose Houses Have Escaped the Consuming Flames.* London: J. Hancock and N. Ponder, 1670.

Browne, Thomas, Edward Dod, Andrew Crooke, William Wordsworth, and Thomas Dunham Whitaker. *Pseudodoxia Epidemica, or, Enquiries into Very Many Received Tenents, and Commonly Presumed Truths.* London: Edward Dod, 1658.

Burgess, Anthony. *Spiritual Refining: Or, A Treatise of Grace and Assurance.* London: A. Miller for Thomas Underhill, 1652.

Burton, Henry. *Truth's Triumph Over Trent, or, The Great Gulfe Betweene Sion and*

- Babylon*. London: Mich. Sparke, 1629.
- Byrd II, William. "Secret History of the Dividing Line." In *Colonial American Travel Narratives*, edited by Wendy Martin, 77-172. New York: Penguin Books, 1994.
- Caldcleugh, Alexander, Edward Francis Finden, W. Daniel, John Murray, and Charles Roworth. *Travels in South America, During the Years 1819-20-21: Containing an Account of the Present State of Brazil, Buenos Ayres, and Chile*. London: John Murray, Albemarle Street, 1825.
- Calef, Robert. "From 'More Wonders of the Invisible World'." In *Narrative of the Witchcraft Cases*, edited by George Lincoln Burr, 289-394. New York: C. Scribner's Sons, 1914.
- Calvino, Italo. *Under the Jaguar Sun*. San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1988.
- Campbell, Thomas, and Samuel Rogers. *The Pleasures of Hope: With Other Poems*. Dublin: W. Porter, 1803.
- Carpenter, Richard. *A New Play Call'd The Pragmatical Jesuit New-Leven'd A Comedy*. London: N. R., 1665.
- Cartwright, Samuel. "Natural History of the Prognathous Species of Mankind." Applied as an Appendix in "The Dred Scott Decision: Opinion of Chief Justice Taney." In *New York Day-Book*, Nov. 10, 1857; reprinted in *Cotton is King, and Pro-Slavery Arguments*, edited by E. N. Elliot, 706-716. Augusta: Pritchard, Abbot and Loomis, 1860.
- Cassian, John, and Boniface Ramsey. *John Cassian, the Conferences*. New York: Paulist Press, 1997.
- Cave, Charles. "Charles Cave's Letter Book, 1815-1836." June 28, 1816, BDA X 10/17.

- Cervantes, Miguel de, John Philips, and Thomas Hodgkin. *The History of the Most Renowned Don Quixote of Mancha and His Trusty Squire Sancho Pancha*. London: Tho. Hodgkin, 1687.
- Charlevoix Pierre-François-Xavier de, and Louise Phelps Kellogg. *Volume II of Journal of a Voyage to North America*. Chicago: Caxton Club, 1923 [1761].
- Chaucer, Jeffrey. *The Works of our Ancient, Learned, & Excellent English Poet, Jeffrey Chaucer*. London: [s.n.], 1687.
- Clarke, Samuel. *A Geographicall Description of all the Countries in the Known World*. London: Thomas Newberry, 1657.
- Clarke, Samuel. *A Mirrour or Looking-Glasse Both for Saints and Sinners*. London: Tho. Newberry, 1654.
- Clarke, Samuel. *A General Martyrologie, Containing a Collection of All the Greatest Persecutions*. London: A. M. for Thomas Underhill and John Rothwell, 1651.
- Cogan, Thomas. *The Haven of Health*. London: Anne Griffin, 1636.
- Colt, Sir Henry. "The Diary of Sir Henry Colt, 1631." *JBMHS* 21 (November, 1953): 5-12.
- Columbus, Christopher. *The Journal of Christopher Columbus*, edited by and translated by Clements Markham. London: Hakluyt Society, 1893.
- "Conference on Medicine Murder: Naseru, 1st September, 1953." No. 17 A. In "Medicine Murders: Basutoland, 1953." S. 117. I. DO 119/1382.
- "Continuation of corporal punishment in certain Laws, for example, Act 19, Victoria Chapter 30, 'the offence of Obeah...subjects the perpetrator of it to corporal punishment'. Edward John Eyre, Lieutenant Governor of Jamaica, Jamaica." No.

83. Folios 502-512. CO 137/367/58.
- Cook, John. *Monarchy, No Creature of Gods Making*. Waterford in Ireland: Peter de Pienne, 1651.
- “Copy of Telegram from C. M. to U. S. N. A, 7/25/1892.” In “Pondoland: Unsettled Conditions in Pondoland; Case of ‘smelling-out’ (witchcraft) leading to torture of a woman at instigation of Chief Sigcan.” Folio 610, 1891-1892. South Africa. DO 119/118.
- “Copy of Telegram from Scott Kokstad to U. S. N. A., 7/14/1892.” In “Pondoland: Unsettled Conditions in Pondoland; Case of ‘smelling-out’ (witchcraft) leading to torture of a woman at instigation of Chief Sigcan.” Folio 610. 1891-1892. South Africa, DO 119/118.
- “Correspondence with Col. Baldwin about the use of Dogs in the Kenya Emergency.” East Africa Department. EAF 117/389/043. CO 822/478.
- Cranch, C. P. “Plea for the Sense of Smell.” *Putnam’s Monthly Magazine of American Literature, Science, and Art* 13, 15 (March, 1869): 315-319.
- Cresswell, Nicholas. “Journal of Nicholas Cresswell, September, 1774.” BDA X/10/10.
- Croghan, George. “Croghan’s Journal; May 15-September 26, 1765.” In *Volume I of Early Western Travels, 1748-1846: A Series of Annotated Reprints of Some of the Best and Rarest Contemporary Volumes of Travel: Descriptive of the Aborigines and Social and Economic Conditions in the Middle and Far West, During the Period of Early American Settlement*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 126-166. Cleveland, Ohio: A. H. Clark Co, 1904.
- Croghan, George. “Croghan’s Journal; October 21, 1760-January 7, 1761.” In *Volume I of*

- Early Western Travels, 1748-1846: A Series of Annotated Reprints of Some of the Best and Rarest Contemporary Volumes of Travel: Descriptive of the Aborigines and Social and Economic Conditions in the Middle and Far West, During the Period of Early American Settlement*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 100-125. Cleveland, Ohio: A. H. Clark Co, 1904.
- Croll, Oswald, Henry Pinnell, and Paracelsus. *Philosophy Reformed & Improved in Four Profound Tractates*. London: M. S. for Lodowick Lloyd, 1657.
- Cruden, Robert Pierce. *The History of the Town of Gravesend in the County of Kent and of the Port of London*. London: William Pickering, 1843.
- Culpepper, Amelia. "Excerpts from Amelia Culpeper's Diary c. 1887." *JBMHS* 47 (November, 2001): 80-82.
- Curtin, Jeremiah. *Creation Myths of Primitive America*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1899.
- Dablon, Claude, Jacques Fremin, Jacques Bruyas, Pierre Raffeix, Julien Garner, Francois de Crepieul, Henry Noevel, Charles Albanel, and Marie de l'Incarnation. "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en la Nouvelle France, les années 1671, & 1672. *Claude Dablon* [Quebec, October, 1672; *Jacques Fremin*, St. Xavier des Prez, August 14, 1672; *Jacques Bruyas*, Onneiout, [1672]; *Pierre Raffeix*, Goiogouen, June, 1672; *Julien Garnier*, Tsonnontouan, July, 1672; *François de Crepieul*, Tadoussac, June 2, 1672; *Henry Nouvel*, Ste. Marie du Sault, [1672]; *Charles Albanel*, n.p., n.d.; *Marie de l'Incarnation*, n.p., n.d." In *Volume 56 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 17-300. Cleveland: Burrows

- Brothers, 1899.
- Dampier, William. *A New Voyage Round the World: Describing Particularly, the Isthmus of America, Several Coasts and Islands in the West Indies, the Isles of Cape Verd, the Passage by Terra Del Fuego, the South Sea Coasts of Chili, Peru, and Mexico.* London: Knapton, 1699.
- Danckaerts, Jasper. *Journal of Jasper Danckaerts, 1679-1680*, edited by Bartlett James and J. Franklin Jameson. New York: Barnes and Noble, 1913.
- Dante. *The Divine Comedy: Volume One: Inferno*, translated by Mark Musa. New York: Penguin Books, 1971.
- Darwin, Erasmus. *The Botanic Garden: A Poem in Two Parts*. New York: Swords, 1798.
- De Quatrefages, Monsieur. "Physical Characteristics of the Human Races." *Popular Science* (March, 1873): 545-548.
- De Soto, Hernando. "Virginia Richly Valued." In *The Voyages of the English Nation to America*, edited by and translated by Richard Hakluyt, in *Volume II of Hakluyt's Collection of Voyages (1598-1600)*, edited by Edmund Goldsmith, 537-616. Edinburgh: E & G Goldsmith, 1889.
- De Vries, David Pietersz. "From the Korte Historiae Ende Journaels Aenreyskeninge, By David Pietersz De Vries, 1630-1633, 1643 (1655)." In *Narratives of Early Pennsylvania, West New Jersey and Delaware, 1630-1707*, edited by Albert Cook Myers, 1-29. New York: C. Scribner's Sons, 1912.
- Defoe, Daniel. *The Political History of the Devil Containing, His Original. A State of His Circumstances. His Conduct Public and Private...The Whole Interspers'd with Many of the Devil's Adventures.* London: John Atkinson, 1754.

Defoe, Daniel, and Gideon Harvey. *History of the Plague in London, 1665: To Which Is Added the Great Fire of London, 1666*. London: Bell & Daldy, 1869.

Denis the Carthusian. *Thus Endeth the Prologue of this Book by Cord`yal. Whiche Treteth of the Four Last and Final Thinges that Ben to Come*. London: William Caxton, 1479.

Deren, Maya. *Divine Horsemen: The Living Gods of Haiti*. London, New York: Thames and Hudson, 1953.

Dilke, Thomas. *The City Lady: Or, Folly Reclaim'd. A Comedy*. London: H. Newman, 1697.

Dodoens, Rembert. *A New Herbal*. London: Gerard Dewes, 1578.

Douglas, Niel. *The African Slave Trade: or, a Short View of the Evidence, Relative to That Subject Produced Before the House of Commons in 1791*. Edinburgh: J. Guthrie, 1792.

Drayton, Michael, and Thomas Heywood. *The True Chronicle History of King Leir, and His Three Daughters, Gonorill, Ragan, and Cordella*. London: Simon Stafford for John Wright, 1605.

Du Pratz, M. Le Page. *Volume II of The History of Louisiana, The Western Parts of Virginia and Carolina Containing a Description of the Countries that lye on bothe sides of the River Missisipi with an account of the Settlements, Inhabitants, Soil, Climate, and Products*. London: T. Beckbt and P. A. Db Hokdt, 1763 [1758 in French].

Edgeworth, Maria. *Belinda*. London: Baldwin & Cradock, 1833.

Edgeworth, Maria, Richard Lovell Edgeworth, Samuel Hale Parker, Eliakim Littell, and Robert Norris Henry. *Works of Maria Edgeworth*. Boston: Samuel H. Parker, 1824.

- Edwards, Bryan. *The History Civil and Commercial of the British Colonies in the West Indies to Which Is Added, an Historical Survey of the French Colony in the Island of St. Domingo*. London: B. Crosby, 1798 [1793].
- Equiano, Olaudah. "The Interesting Narrative of the Life of Olaudah Equiano, Or Gustavus Vassa." In *Early American Writings*, edited by Carla Mulford, Angela Vietto, and Amy Winans, 912-927. New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Erdoes, Richard, and Alfonso Ortiz. *American Indian Myths and Legends*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1984.
- Evans-Pritchard, E. E. *The Zande Trickster*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1967.
- Evelyn, John. *Fumifugium, or, The Inconveniencie of the Aer and Smoak of London Dissipated: Together with Some Remedies Humbly Proposed*. London: W. Godbid for Gabriel Bedel and Thomas Collins, 1661.
- "Execution of Adolphe La-Croix for alleged Obeah murder. Administrator G. William Des Voeux, forwarded by Sir John Pope Hennessy, Governor of Windward Islands, St. Lucia." No. 20. Folios 274–277. CO 321/12/36.
- "Extracts from the Reverend H Beame's report of the state of the parish of St James describing religious instruction provided and comparing the 'disposition' of 'Africans' and 'creoles', and rural and urban people. Touches on polygamy, abortion, Obeah and stresses that 'effectively to promote the improvement of the Slave, the first effort must be with the free'." Folios 217-218. In "Correspondence from the bishop of Jamaica, Christopher Lipscomb, to the secretary of state relating to his appointment and work, his visits to Grand Cayman, Honduras and the Bahamas, and to other mainly ecclesiastical matters." CO 137/267.

Fairholt, F. W. *Lord Mayors' Pageants: Being Collections Towards a History of These Annual Celebrations, with Specimens of the Descriptive Pamphlets Published by the City Poets*. London: Percy Society by T. Richards, 1843.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 2, Arkansas, Part 6, Quinn-Tuttle. Library of Congress, 1936.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 2, Arkansas, Part 7, Vaden-Young. Library of Congress, 1936.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 3, Florida, Anderson-Wilson with combined interviews of others. Library of Congress, 1936.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 4, Georgia, Part 2, Garey-Jones. Library of Congress, 1936.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 4, Georgia, Part 4, Telfair-Young with combined interviews of others. Library of Congress, 1936.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 5, Indiana, Arnold-Woodson. Library of Congress, 1936.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 7, Kentucky, Bogie-Woods (with combined interviews of others). Library of Congress, 1936.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 10, Missouri, Abbot-Younger. Library of Congress, 1936.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 11, North Carolina, Part 1, Adams-Hunter. Library of Congress, 1936.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 16, Texas, Part 3, Lewis-Ryles. Library of Congress, 1936.

Federal Writers' Project: Slave Narrative Project, Vol. 16, Texas, Part 4, Sanco-Young.

Library of Congress, 1936.

Fee, John Gregg. *An Anti-Slavery Manual*. Maysville, KY: Herald Office, 1848.

Fenning, Daniel, and Joseph Collyer. *A New System of Geography, or a General Description of the World*. London: Crowder, 1765.

Finck, Henry. "The Aesthetic Value of the Sense of Smell." *The Atlantic Monthly* 46, 278 (December, 1880): 793-799.

Fisher, Richard. "The Voyage of the Ship called Marigold." In *The Voyages of the English Nation to America*, edited by Richard Hakluyt, in *Volume II of Hakluyt's Collection of Voyages (1598-1600)*, edited by Edmund Goldsmith, 55-59. Edinburgh: E & G Goldsmith, 1889.

Fitzherbert, Henry. "The Journal Henry Fitzherbert Kept While in Barbados in 1825." *JBMHS* 44 (1998): 117-190.

"Five Dollars Reward." *Elizabeth City, N.C.: Elizabeth City Star and North Carolina Eastern Intelligencer*, June 17, 1827, p. 3.

"Forwards message from the House of Assembly and letter from the deputy provost marshal concerning transportation of two slaves, Castello and Bynoe, convicted of Obeah." No. 2. Folios 8-11. CO 28/103/2.

Foxe, John. *Actes and Monuments of Matters Most Speciall and Memorable, Happening in the Church: With an Universall History of the Same*. London: Peter Short, 1596.

Froger, François. *A Relation of a Voyage Made in the Years 1695, 1696, 1697, on the Coasts of Africa, Streights of Magellan, Brasil, Cayenna, and the Antilles, by a Squadron of French Men of War, Under the Command of M. De Gennes*. London:

- M. Gillyflower, 1698.
- Gage, Thomas. *The English-American*. London: R. Cotes, Humphrey Blanden...and Thomas Williams, 1648.
- Gerard, John. *The Herbal or General History of Plants*. New York: Dover, 1975 [1633].
- Gessner, Conrad, and George Baker. *The Newe Jewell of Health Wherein Is Contayned the Most Excellent Secretes of Phisicke and Philosophie*. London: Henrie Denham, 1576.
- Gilbert, Humphrey. "Orders Agreed Upon by the Captaines and Masters, to be Observed by the Fleet of Sir Humphrey Gilbert." In *The Voyages of the English Nation to America*, edited by Richard Hakluyt, in *Volume I of Hakluyt's Collection of Voyages (1598-1600)*, edited by Edmund Goldsmith, 328-338. Edinburgh: E & G Goldsmith, 1889.
- Glanvill, Joseph, Henry More, and Anthony Horneck. *Saducismus Triumphatus, or, Full and Plain Evidence Concerning Witches and Apparitions in Two Parts: the First Treating of Their Possibility, the Second of Their Real Existence*, London: J. Collins and S. Lownds, 1681.
- Gogol, Nikolai. *The Nose*. Brooklyn, NY: Melville House Pub., 2014 [1836].
- Goldsmith, Oliver. *A History of the Earth and Animated Nature: In Eight Volumes*. Dublin: J. Christie, 1813 [1776].
- Goodall, Charles. *Poems and Translations, Written upon Several Occasions, and To Several Persons*. London: Henry Bonwicke, 1689.
- Goodwin, John, and George Glover. *Hybristodikai: The Obstructours of Justice*. London: Henry Cripps and Lodowick Lloyd, 1649.

- Gorges, Sir Ferdinando. *America Painted to the Life*. London: N. Brook, 1658-1659.
- Gould, George, and Walter Pyle. *Anomalies and Curiosities of Medicine*. New York: Bell Pub. Co., 1896.
- Grainger, James. *The Sugar-Cane: a Poem. In Four Books*. London: R. and J. Dodsley, 1764.
- Greene, Asa. *A Yankee Among the Nullifiers*. New York: William Pearson, 1833.
- Greenhill, William. *The Sound-Hearted Christian, or, A Treatise of Soundness of Heart With Several Other Sermons*. London: Nath. Crouch, 1670.
- Hale, Matthew. *The Primitive Origination of Mankind, Considered and Examined According to the Light of Nature*. London: William Godbid for William Shrowsbery, 1677.
- Hall, John. *The Courte of Vertue*. London: Thomas Marshe, 1565.
- Handy, Sara. "Negro Superstitions." *Lippincott's Magazine* 48 (December, 1891): 735–739.
- Hannay, Patrick. *A Happy Husband or, Directions for a Maide to Choose her Mate As also, a Wives Behauiour towards her Husband after Marriage*. London: Richard Redmer, 1619.
- Hastings, James, John Selbie, and Louis Gray. *Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics*. New York: C. Scribner's Sons, 1908.
- Hawkins, Francis. *Youth's Behaviour, Translated from Various French Sources*. London: W. Wilson, 1651.
- Heath, Robert. *Clarastella: Together with Poems Occasional, Elegies, Epigrams, Satyrs*. London: Humph. Moseley, 1650.

Heckwelder, John. "Meeting the Dutch at Manhattan." In *The World Turned Upside Down: Indian Voices from Early America*, ed. Colin Calloway, 35-38. Boston: St. Martin's Press, 1994.

Hennepin, Louis. *A New Discovery of a Vast Country in America*. London: M. Bentley, I. Tonson, H. Bonwick, T. Goodwin, and S. Manship, 1698.

Herbert, George, and Barnabas Oley. *Herbert's Remains, or, Sundry Pieces of That Sweet Singer of the Temple*. London: Timothy Garthwait, 1652.

Herbert, Thomas, and William Marshall. *A Relation of Some Yeares Travaile Begunne Anno 1626. Into Afrique and the Greater Asia, Especially the Territories of the Persian Monarchie: and Some Parts of the Orientall Indies, and Iles Adjacent. Of Their Religion, Language, Habit, Discent, Ceremonies, and Other Matters Concerning Them. Together with the Proceedings and Death of the Three Late Ambassadors: Sir D.C. Sir R.S. and the Persian Nogdi-Beg: As Also the Two Great Monarchs, the King of Persia, and the Great Mogol*. London: P. William Stansby and Jacob Bloome, 1634.

Heywood, Thomas, and Mary Ann Weber Gasior. *The Four Prentices of London: A Critical, Old-Spelling Edition*. New York, Garland, 1980 [1615].

Higden, Ranulf. *Here Endeth the Discripcion of Britayne*. Westminster: William Caxton, 1480.

"High Commission Message to Sicgan on Practice of "smelling-out", 8/1/1892." No. 310. In, "Pondoland: Unsettled Conditions in Pondoland; Case of 'smelling-out' (witchcraft) leading to torture of a woman at instigation of Chief Sigcan." Folio 610. 1891-1892. South Africa. DO 119/118.

- Hodgeman, Stephen Alexander. *The Nation's Sin and Punishment, or, The Hand of God Visible in the Overthrow of Slavery*. New York: American News Co., 1864.
- Hooker, John. *The Ancient History and Description of the City of Exeter*. Exeter: Andrews and Trewman, 1765.
- Hoyos, F. A. "Dr. M. J. Chapman." *JBMHS* 16 1/2 (Nov 1948-Feb 1949): 14-21.
- Hunnis, William. *A Hyve Full of Hunnye: Contayning the Firste Booke of Moses, Called Genesis. Turned into English Meetre, by William Hunnis, One of the Gent. of Her Majesties Chappel, and Maister to the Children of the Same*. London: Thomas Marsh, 1578.
- Huysmans, J. K. *A Rebours (Against the Grain)*. London: Fortune Press, 1946 [1884].
- Ignatius, and George Ganss. *Ignatius of Loyola: The Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works*. New York: Paulist Press, 1991.
- Jefferson, Thomas. "Notes on the State of Virginia." In *The Literatures of Colonial America: an Anthology*, edited by Susan Castillo and Ivy Schweitzer, 530-536. Malden, Mass.: Blackwell Publishers. 2001.
- Juet, Robert. *The Discovery of the Hudson River From "The Third Voyage of Master Henry Hudson, Toward Nova Zembla, and at His Returne, His Passing from Farre Islands to New-Found Land, and Along to Fortie-Foure Degrees and Ten Minutes, and Thence to Cape Cod, and so to Thirtie-Three Degrees"*. Boston: Old South Leaflets 94, 1981.
- Kant, Immanuel. *Analytic of the Beautiful, from the Critique of Judgment*. Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1963 [1790].
- Karr, Ronald Dale. *Indian New England, 1524-1674: A Compendium of Eyewitness*

- Accounts of Native American Life*. Pepperell, Mass.: Branch Line Press, 1999.
- Kellett, Edward. *Tricoenivm Christi: in nocte proditiōis svae. The Threefold Supper of Christ in the Night that he was Betrayed*. London: Thomas Cotes for Andrew Crooke, 1641.
- Khaketla, B. M. "Memoradum on 'Liretlo'." No. 19 A. In "Medicine Murders: Basutoland, 1953." S. 117. I. DO 119/1382.
- King, Henry, and Lawrence Mason. *The English Poems of Henry King*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1914.
- Kingsley, Charles. *At Last: a Christmas in the West Indies: With Illustrations*. London and N. York: Macmillan, 1871.
- La Tour Landry, Geoffroy de, and William Caxton. "[*Here Begynneth the Booke Which the Knyght of the Toure Made And Speketh of Many Fayre Ensamples and Thensygnementys and Techyng of His Doughters*]". Westminster: William Caxton, 1484.
- La Vérendrye, Pierre Gaultier de Varennes, and Lawrence J. Burpee. *Journals and Letters of Pierre Gaultier De Varennes De La Vérendrye and His Sons*. Toronto: Champlain Society, 1927.
- Lalemant, Hierosme. "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en la Nouvelle France, en l'année 1639. Ossossané, June 7, 1639." In *Volume 17 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 7-217. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898.
- Lalemant, Hierosme. "Relation de ce qui s'est passé en la Nouvelle France, en l'année

1642. Ste. Marie aux Hurons, June 10, 1642.” In *Volume 23 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 17-235. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898.
- Lalemant, Hierosme. “Relation de ce qui s’est passé la Nouvelle France, sur le Grand Flevve de S. Lavrens en année 1647. Quebec, October 20, 1647.” In *Volume 31 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 15-288. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898.
- Lalemant, Jerome. “Relation de ce qui s’est passé en la Nouvelle France, en l’année 1640. *Paul le Jeune*; Kébec, September 10, 1640. *Jerome Lalemant*; Des Hurons, May 27, 1640.” In *Volume 19 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 7-269. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898.
- Lalemant, Jerome. “Relation de ce qui s’est passé en la Nouvelle France, és années 1640. et 1641. *Paul le Jeune*; Kebec and Paris, edited by *Jerome Lalemant*; Ste. Marie aux Hurons, May 19, 1641.” In *Volume 21 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 19-267. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898.
- Lavater, Ludwig, and Robert Harrison. *Of Ghostes and Spirites Walking by Nyght: And of Strange Noyses, Crackes, and Sundry Forewarnynges, Whiche Commonly Happen Before the Death of Menne, Great Slaughters & Alterations of Kyngdomes*. London: H. Benneyman for Richard Watkyns, 1572.

“Laws Relating to Witchcraft, 1938.” Africa. CO 847/13/11.

“Laws Relating to Witchcraft, 1940.” Africa. CO 847/19/9.

Lawson, John. *The History of Carolina*. Raleigh: Strother & Marcom, 1860 [1714].

Le Jeune, Paul. “Relation de ce qui s'est passé en La Nouvelle France, en l'année 1634.

Maison de N. Dame des Anges, en Nouvelle France, August 7, 1634.” In *Volume 6 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 4-235. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898.

Le Jeune, Paul, and Hierosme Lalemant. “Relation de ce qui s’est passé en la Nouvelle France, en l’année 1639. *Paul le Jeune*; Sillery, September 4, 1639. *Hierosme Lalemant*; Ossossané, June 7, 1639.” In *Volume 16 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 7-254. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1898.

Le Mercier, Francois, Claude Jean Allouez, Thomas Morel, and Marie de S. Bonaventure. “Relation de ce qui s'est passé en la Nouvelle France, les années mil six cens soixante six, & mil six cens soixante sept. *François le Mercier*, Kebec, November 10, 1667; *Claude Jean Allouez*, n. p., n. d.; *Thomas Morel*, n. p., n. d.; *Marie de S. Bonaventure*, Kebec, October 20, 1667.” In *Volume 51 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 19-117. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899.

Le Mercier, Francois, and Marie de S. Bonnaventure de Jesus. “Relation de ce qui s’est

- passé en la Nouvelle France, aux années mil fix cens foixante-fept & mil fix cens foixante-huit. *François le Mercier*, n.p., n. d.; *François de Laval*, Quebec, November 8, 1668; *Marie de S. Bonnaventure de Jesus*, Quebec, October 4, 1668.” In *Volume 52 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 17-110. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899.
- Le Petit, Mathurin. “Lettre au Père d’Avaugour, Procureur des Missions de l’Amérique Septentrionale. Nouvelle Orleans, July 12, 1730.” In *Volume 68 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 120-123. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899.
- Le Vaillant, François. *Travels from the Cape of Good-Hope, into the Interior Parts of Africa: Including Many Interesting Anecdotes. With Elegant Plates, Descriptive of the Country and Inhabitants:…Translated from the French of Monsieur Vaillant. In Two Volumes*. London: William Lane, 1790.
- Leake, John. *Medical Instructions towards the prevention and cure of chronic diseases peculiar to women....To which are added, prescriptions...in English, etc. (Practical observations on the Child-Bed Fever, and the acute diseases in general, most fatal to women during the state of pregnancy.) Fifth edition, with additions*. London: R. Baldwin and H. Payne, 1781.
- Lee, James. *An Introduction to Botany Containing an Explanation of the Theory of that Science*. London: J. F. Rivington, L. Davis, B. White and Son, S. Crowder, C. Dilly, G. G. J. and J. Robinson, T. Cadell, and R. Baldwin, 1788 [1760].

Lemnius, Levinus, and Thomas Newton. *The Touchstone of Complexions*. London: Elizabeth Alde for Michael Sparke, 1633 [1576].

Lescarbot, Marc. *Nova Francia: or The Description of that Part of New France, Which is One Continent with Virginia Described in the Three Late Voyages and Plantation Made by Monsieur de Monts, Monsieur du Pont-Grau  , and Monsieur de Poutrincourt, into the Countries Called by the Frenchmen La Cadie, Lying to the Southwest of Cape Breton. Together with an Excellent Severall Treatie of all the Commodities of the Said Countries, and Maners of the Naturall Inhabitants of the Same*. London: George Bishop, 1609.

Long, Edward. *The History of Jamaica, or, General Survey of the Ancient and Modern State of That Island With Reflections on Its Situation, Settlements, Inhabitants, Climate, Products, Commerce, Laws, and Government*. London: T. Lowndes, 1774.

Lopes, Duarte. *A Report of the Kingdome of Congo, a Region of Africa*. London: John Wolfe, 1597.

Lydgate, John. *Hrre Folowyth the Interpretat[i]on of the Names of Goddis and Goddesses of This Treatyse Folowyng As Poetes Wryte*. S. I: Wynkyn de Worde, 1498.

Madden, Robert. *A Twelvemonth's Residence in the West Indies*. Philadelphia: Carey, Lea and Blanchard, 1835.

Macfall, Haldane. *The Wooings of Jezebel Pettyfer; Being the Personal History of Jehu Sennacherib Dyle, Commonly Called Masheen Dyle. Together with an Account of Certain Things That Chanced in the House of the Sorcerer*. London: Simpkin, Marshall, Hamilton, Kent, 1898.

Machin, Lewis, and Gervase Markham. *The Dumble Knight*. London: Nicholas Okes, 1608.

MacQueen, James. "Letter to the Right Honourable Earl Grey." *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* 29 (March, 1831): 454-466.

Maitland, Frederick to William Windhorn. "Letter of December 7, 1806." In "Refers to importation of articles, with reference to salt fish; refers to an enslaved person of African descent who was convicted ten days previous of an attempt to poison the manager on the estate; person was tried by two magistrates and three white men as the jury, and then was hanged; states that the man was connected with 'obyee' [obeah]. Frederick Maitland, Grenada." Folios 177-178. CO 101/44.

Mandeville, John. *The Voyages and Travels Of Sir John Mandevile, Knight*. London: A. Wilde, 1722.

Marees, Pieter de, A. van Dantzig, and Adam Jones. *Description and Historical Account of the Gold Kingdom of Guinea (1602)*. Oxford: Published for the British Academy by Oxford University Press, 1987.

Marest, Gabriel. "Lettre au Père Germon. Cascaskias, November 9, 1712." In *Volume 66 of Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 218-296. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899.

Marlowe, Christopher. *The Tragedie of Dido Queene of Carthage played by the Children of her Maiesties Chappell*. London: The Widdowe Orwin for Thomas Woodcocke, 1594.

Marlowe, Christopher. *Tamburlaine the Great Who, from a Scythian Shepheard, by his Rare and Woonderfull Conquests, became a Most Puissant and Mightye Monarque*.

- London: Richard Jhones, 1590.
- Martire d' Anghiera, Pietro. *The Decades of the Newe Worlde or West*, translated by Richard Eden. London: Guilhelmi Powell, 1555.
- “Material Arranged for the Preparation of the Report of the Committee Appointed by the Round Table Conference on Medicine Murder Held at Naseru During the Month of September, 1955.” A/S 117 II. 9 G. DO 119/1383.
- “Medicine Murder Statistics. Cases under Investigation.” 48 A/B. In “Ritual Murder and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1951.” DO 119/1381.
- Métraux, Alfred. *Voodoo in Haiti*. New York: Schocken Books, 1972.
- Mitchel, John. “Causes of the Different Colours of Persons in Different Climates.” In *The Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society (From the Year 1743 to the Year 1750)* 10 (1756): 926-949.
- Milton, John. *Paradise Lost*. London: Longman, 1998 [1667].
- Mocquet, Jean, and Nathaniel Pullen. *Travels and Voyages into Africa, Asia, and America, the East and West-Indies, Syria, Jerusalem, and the Holy-Land Performed by Mr. John Mocquet...: Divided into Six Books, and Enriched with Sculptures*. London: William Newton...Joseph Shelton, and William Chandler, 1696.
- Monardes, Nicolás. *Joyfull Newes out of the Newfound World*. London: Thomas Dawson for William Norton, 1580.
- Montgomery, James. *The West Indies, and Other Poems*. London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown, 1823.
- Morton, Thomas. *New English Canaan*. London: Charles Greene, 1637.
- Moseley, Benjamin. *A Treatise on Sugar: With Miscellaneous Medical Observations*.

- London: J. Nichols for G. G. and J. Robinson, 1800.
- Mouser, Bruce, and Samuel Gamble. *A Slaving Voyage to Africa and Jamaica: The Log of the Sandown, 1793-1794*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2002.
- Nicolas, Louis, Francois Marc Gagnon, Réal Ouellet, and Nancy Senior. *The Codex Canadensis and the Writings of Louis Nicolas: The Natural History of the New World*. Tulsa, Okla.: Gilcrease Museum, 2011.
- Northrup, Solomon. *Twelve Years a Slave*. Auburn: Derby and Miller, 1853.
- “Obeah Amendment Law 1903: Forwards the history of the circumstances leading up to the passing of the Law to Amend the Obeah Laws, 1898 and 1899.” No. 320. Folios 2-5. CO 137/635/1.
- Ogilby, John. *Africa: Being an Accurate Description of the Regions of Ægypt, Barbary, Lybia, and Billedulgerid, the land of Negroes, Guinee, Æthiopia and the Abyssines*. London: Tho. Johnson, 1670.
- Oliver, Sidney, Acting Governor to Alfred Lyttelton, Secretary of State for the Colonies. “Letter of August 24, 1904.” In “Working of Obeah Law 8 of 1903: submits observations of the Inspector General of Police and the Resident Magistrates.” No. 435. Folios 360-364. CO 137/641.
- “One Hundred Dollars Reward.” *Raleigh Register and North Carolina Weekly Advertiser*. October 27, 1815, p. 3.
- Paget, Valerian. *The Revelation to the Monk of Evesham Abbey...Rendered into Modern English by Valerian Paget*. London: Alston Rivers, 1909.
- Park, Robert. “The Bases of Race Prejudice.” *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 140 (Nov., 1928): 11-20.

- Pastorius, Francis Daniel. "Circumstantial Geographical Description of Pennsylvania, By Father Daniel Pastorius, 1700." In *Narratives of Early Pennsylvania, West New Jersey and Delaware, 1630-1707*, edited by Albert Cook Myers, 353-447. New York: C. Scribner's Sons, 1912.
- Perrot, Nicolas. "Memoir on the Manners, Customs, and Religion of the Savages of North America." In *The Indian Tribes of the Upper Mississippi Valley and Region of the Great Lakes*, edited and translated by Emma Helen Blair, 25-268. New York: Kraus Reprint Co., 1969 [1911].
- Petty, William, and Henry William Edmund Petty. *The Petty Papers; Some Unpublished Writings of Sir William Petty*. London: Constable & Co.; Boston and New York, Houghton Mifflin Co., 1927.
- Pinckard, George. *Notes on the West Indies*. London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, and Orme, 1806.
- "Pondoland: Unsettled Conditions in Pondoland; Case of 'smelling-out' (witchcraft) leading to torture of a woman at instigation of Chief Sigcan." Folio 610. 1891-1892. South Africa. DO 119/118.
- Poor Robin. *Poor Robin's True Character of a Scold, or, The Shrews looking-glass Dedicated to all Domineering Dames, Wives Rampant, Cuckolds Couohant, and Hen-peckt Sneaks, in City or Country*. London: L. C., 1678.
- Potherie, Claude Charles Le Roy, Bacqueville de la. "History of the Savage People who are Allies of New France." In *The Indian Tribes of the Upper Mississippi Valley and Region of the Great Lakes*, edited by and translated by Emma Helen Blair, 275-372. New York: Kraus Reprint Co., 1969 [1911].

Priest, Josiah. *Slavery, As It Relates to the Negro, or African Race*. Louisville: W. S. Brown, 1849.

“Proceedings in trials of T House, Polydore, and Industry convicted for Obeah, Howe Peter Browne, Marquess of Sligo, Governor of Jamaica, Jamaica.” No. 315. Folios 355-375. CO 137/209/59.

“Progress Report on Anti-Medicine Murder Propoaganda Campaign in Basutoland.” A/S 117 II. 29 A. DO 119/1383.

“Punishment for Practice of Obeah: following receipt of letter from J. Cowell Carver regarding methods adopted in Jamaica [not in item], states is considering use of stocks in preference to the 'cat-o-nine tails', being more effective as means of public ridicule and so weakening power of the Obeah-man.” No 178. Folios 374-377. CO 137/671/50.

Purchas, Samuel, Jerome Horsey, William Methold, Jirjis ibn al-‘Amīd Makīn, Thomas Erpenius, William Stansby, and Henry Featherstone. *Purchas His Pilgrimage, or, Relations of the World and the Religions Observed in All Ages and Places Discovered, from the Creation Unto This Present*. London: William Stansby for Henrie Fetherstone, 1626.

“Refers to the 'Act for the better prevention of the practice of Obeah' and states that since its enactment 'a question of law has arisen as to its efficiency as an Act, in consequence of there being no Court specified, before whom the Criminal should be tried as was provided by the former Act' [of 4 November 1806]. The attorney general has expressed his opinion that a court comprising two magistrates and three freeholders was not competent to try a particular case. Asks that the matter should

- be referred to the law officers.” No. 48. Folios 96-104. CO 28/87/32.
- “Report by Major A. H. Donald and Chief Leshoboro Majara on Medicine Murders and Proposals for Combatting Them.” No. 15 A. In “Medicine Murders: Basutoland, 1953.” S. 117. I. DO 119/1382.
- “Report of the Committee Appointed by the Round Table Conference on Medicine Murder.” No. 1A. In “Medicine Murders: Basutoland.” S. 117 III. DO 119/1384, 1954-1955.
- Report of the Lords of the Committee of the Council Appointed for the Consideration of all Matters Relating to Trade and Foreign Plantation.* London, N. P., 1789.
- “Reports on the question of amending Law 28 of 1892, The Obeah and Myalism Acts Amendment Law 1892. Governor Henry A Blake.” No. 329. Folios 212-218. In CO 137/550.
- “Reports that a further application was made for the appointment of the Reverend A A Grant, a Minister of the National Baptist Convention of America in Jamaica, as a Marriage Officer. The Governor has refused to make the appointment. In support of his decision, he transmits copies of minutes by the Registrar General and the Inspector General of Police. In particular it is pointed out that the Reverend Grant is suspected of involvement in the practice of 'Obeah'.” No.185. Folios 67-74. CO 137/747.
- “Resident Commissioner’s Address to Medicine Murder Pitsos.” A/S 117 II. 9G. DO 119/1383.
- Ribadeneyra, Pedro de. *The Lives of Saints, with Other Feasts of the Year, According to the Roman Calendar.* London: B. S., 1730.

- “Ritual Murders and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1949.” DO 119/1376.
- “Ritual Murder and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1949” G. 10. DO 119/1378.
- “Ritual Murders in Basutoland.” No. 20. In “Ritual Murders and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1949.” G. 10. DO 119/1377.
- Rohault, Jacques. *Rohault's System of Natural Philosophy Illustrated with Dr. Samuel Clarke's Notes Taken Mostly Out of Sr. Isaac Newton's Philosophy. With Additions...Done into English by John Clarke*. London: James and John Knapton, 1729.
- Rolt, Richard. *A New and Accurate History of South America*. London: T. Gardner, 1756.
- Romans, Bernard. *Concise Natural History of East and West Florida Containing an Account of the Natural Produce of All the Southern Part of British America in the Three Kingdoms of Nature, Particularly the Animal and Vegetable*. New York: R. Aitken, 1776.
- Rosier, James, and George Prince. *Narrative of Waymouth's Voyage to the Coast of Maine, in 1605*. Bath, ME: Eastern Times Press, 1860.
- Rowlands, Samuel. *Famous History of Guy, Earle of Warwicke*. London: Elizabeth All-de, 1607.
- “Runaways.” *Wilmington Gazette*, May 23, 1809, p. 2.
- Rush, Benjamin. *Essays, Literary, Moral and Philosophical*. Philadelphia: Thomas and William Bradford, 1806.
- Rush, Benjamin. “Reasons for Ascribing the Colour of Negroes to Leprosy.” *The Monthly Magazine and American Review* 2, 4 (April, 1800): 298-301.
- Sandoval, Alonso de. *De Instauranda Aethiopum Salute*. Madrid: A. de Paredes, 1647.

- Scot, Reginald. *The Discoverie of Witchcraft: Wherein the Lewde Dealing of Witches and Witchmongers Is Notablie Detected...Heereunto Is Added a Treatise Upon the Nature and Substance of Spirits and Divels*. London: W. Brome, 1584.
- Seaver, James, and William Pryor Letchworth, *A Narrative of the Life of Mary Jemison, De-He-Wa-Mis, the White Woman of the Genesee*. New York: G.P. Putnam, 1898.
- “Sentence: Capital: *Rex vs. Chiefs Bereng and Gabashane and Others*, 1949.” BAS. DO 119/1373.
- “Sentence: Capital: *Rex vs. Chiefs Bereng and Gabashane and Others*, 1949: BAS. ‘Ritual Murder and Wichcraft’.” DO 119/1374.
- Shakespeare, William. “Antony and Cleopatra.” In *The Arden Shakespeare: Complete Works*, edited by Richard Proudfoot, 121-160. London: Thomson Learning, 2007.
- Shakespeare, William. “Othello.” In *The Arden Shakespeare: Complete Works*, edited by Richard Proudfoot, 941-978. London: Thomson Learning, 2007.
- Shakespeare, William. “Titus Andronicus.” In *The Arden Shakespeare: Complete Works*, edited by Richard Proudfoot, 1125-1152. London: Thomson Learning, 2007.
- Shakespeare, William. *The Most Lamentable Romaine Tragedie of Titus Andronicus*. London: John Danter, 1594.
- Shepherd, William. “The Negro Incantation.” In *The Poetical Register and Repository of Fugitive Poetry for 1803*. London: F. and C. Rivington, 1804.
- Sherwood, Henry. “The Journal of Lt. Henry Sherwood, 53rd Foot Describing his Service in the West Indies during the War against Napoleon.” *JBMHS* 58 (2014): 173-179.
- Simon, Charles. “Relatio Terræmotus in Nova Francia, 1663, translated into Latin by François Ragueneau. Bourges, December 12, 1663.” In *Volume 68 of Jesuit*

- Relations and Allied Documents Travels and Explorations of the Jesuit Missionaries in New France 1610—1791*, edited by Reuben Gold Thwaites, 182-223. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1899.
- Slave Law of Jamaica: With Proceedings and Documents Relative Thereto*. London: J. Ridgway, 1828.
- Sloane, Hans, Michael van der Gucht, John Savage, Caspar Georg Carl Reinwardt, and Roland Napoléon Bonaparte. *A Voyage to the Islands Madera, Barbados, Nieves, S. Christophers and Jamaica*. London: B. M. for the Author, 1707.
- Smith, Eliza. *The Compleat Housewife or, Accomplished Gentlewoman's Companion*. London: J. Pemberton, 1729.
- Smith, James. "Of the Remarkable Occurrences in the Life and Travels of Colonel James Smith." In *Tragedies of the Wilderness, or, True and Authentic Narratives of Captives Who Have Been Carried Away by the Indians*, edited by Samuel Gardner Drake, 178-264. Boston: Antiquarian Bookstore and Institute, 1974.
- Smith, Samuel Stanhope. *An Essay on the Causes of the Variety of Complexion and Figure in the Human Species: To Which Are Added, Animadversions on Certain Remarks Made on the First Edition of This Essay*. New Brunswick NJ: J. Simpson and Co., 1810.
- Smith, Samuel Stanhope, and Henry Home. *An Essay on the Causes of the Variety of Complexion and Figure in the Human Species*. Edinburg: American Philosophical Society, 1787.
- Smith, Wentworth and William Shakespeare. *The Puritan: or the Widow of Watling-Street* [By W.S., I.E. Wentworth Smith? Sometimes Attributed to William Shakespeare].

- With an Engraved Frontispiece.* London: N. Pub, 1709.
- Smith, William. *A Natural History of Nevis, and the Rest of the English Leeward Charibee Islands in America with Many Other Observations on Nature and Art: Particularly an Introduction to the Art of Decyphering.* Cambridge: J. Bentham, 1745.
- The New Slave Laws of Jamaica and St. Christopher's Examined With an Especial Reference to the Eulogies Recently Pronounced Upon Them in Parliament.* London: Society for the Mitigation and Gradual Abolition of Slavery, 1828.
- Speed, John. *An Epitome of Mr. John Speed's Theatre of the Empire of Great Britain and of His Prospect of the Most Famous Parts of the World.* London: Tho. Basset and Ric. Chiswel, 1676.
- Spenser, Edmund. *The Faerie Queene Disposed into Twelue Books.* London: William Ponsonbie, 1590.
- Spoeri, Felix Christian. "A Swiss Medical Doctor's Description of Barbados in 1661: The Account of Felix Christian Spoeri," edited and translated by Alexander Gunkel and Jerome Handler, *JBMHS* 33, 1 (May, 1969): 3-13.
- Stubbs, Philip, and John Payne Collier. *The Anatomie of Abuses: Contayning a Discoverie, or Briefe Summarie, of Such Notable Vices and Imperfections, As Now Raigne in Many Christian Countreyes of the Worlde, but (Especiallie) in a Verie Famous Ilande Called Ailgna: Together with Most Fearefull Examples of Gods Judgementes, Executed Upon the Wicked for the Same, Aswell in Ailgna of Late, As in Other Places Elsewhere. Verie Godly to Be Read of All True Christians Everie Where, but Most Needefull to Be Regarded in Englande.* London: Reprinted by J.P. Collier, 1870 [1583].

Sue, Eugène, and William Henry Herbert. *Atar Gull: Or, the Slave's Revenge*. New York: H. L. Williams, 1846.

“Summary of Information and Suggestions Submitted to the Conference.” In “Medicine Murders: Basutoland, 1953.” S. 117. I. DO 119/1382.

Süskind, Patrick, and John Woods. *Perfume: The Story of a Murderer*. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1987.

Swann, Brian. *Voices from Four Directions: Translations of the Natives Literatures of North America*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2004.

Swediaur, Franz. *The Philosophical Dictionary, or, the Opinions of Modern Philosophers on Metaphysical, Moral, and Political Subjects*. London: G. G. J. and J. Robinson and for C. Elliot, Edinburgh, 1786.

Swetnam, Joseph. *The Araignment of Lewd, Idle, Froward, and Unconstant Women*. London: George Purslowe for Thomas Archer, 1615.

“Tales of Old Barbados.” *JBMHS* 11, 1 (1934): 171-178.

“Telegram: 196, 11/28/1950.” In “Ritual Murder and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1950.” G. 10. DO 19/1380.

“Ten Dollars Reward.” *Hall's Wilmington Gazette*, April 6, 1797, p. 3.

“Ten Dollars Reward.” *North Carolina Gazette*, April, 3, 1778, p. 3.

The Holy Bible Containing the Old Testament and the New. Cambridge: Roger Daniel, 1648.

The Report from a Select Committee of the House of Assembly, Appointed to Inquire into the Origin, Causes, and Progress, of the Late Insurrection. Barbados: Printed (by

- order of the legislature) by W. Walker, Mercury and Gazette Office; London: Reprinted for T. Cadell and W. Davies, 1818.
- Thomas, Herbert. "Memorial, August 30, 1894." Folios 536-555. In "Sends a further memorial from Inspector Thomas. Includes a pamphlet called 'Something about Obeah'." No. 340. Folios 536-560. CO 137/561/74.
- Thomas, Herbert. "Something About Obeah." Folios 556-560. In "Sends a further memorial from Inspector Thomas. Includes a pamphlet called 'Something about Obeah'." No. 340. Folios 536-560. CO 137/561/74.
- "To Secretary of State, London, 6/10/1950." No. 14. In "Ritual Murder and Witchcraft: Basutoland, 1950." G. 10. DO 19/1380.
- Torquemada, Antonio de, Lewis Lewkenor, and Ferdinand Walker. *The Spanish Mandeuile of Miracles*. London: James Roberts for Edmund Matts, 1600.
- Trowbridge, C. C., and C. E. Schorer. *Indian Tales of C.C. Trowbridge: Collected from Wyandots, Miamis, and Shawanoes*. Brighton, Mich.: Green Oak Press, 1986.
- Turenne de Pres, Francois. "Tabou: A Haitian Folk Tale." *Phylon (1940-1956)* 7, 4 (1946): 365-372.
- Twyne, Thomas. *A Shorte and Pithie Discourse, Concerning the Engendring, Tokens, and Effects of All Earthquakes in Generall Particularly Applyed and Conferred with That Most Strange and Terrible Worke of the Lord in Shaking the Earth, Not Only Within the Citie of London, but Also in Most Partes of All Englande: Which Hapned Upon Wensday in Easter Weeke Last Past, Which Was the Sixt Day of April, Almost at Sixe a Clocke in the Evening, in the Yeare of Our Lord God*. London: John Charlewood for Richarde Johnes, 1580.

- Tyson, Edward, and Michael van der Gucht. *Orang-Outang, Sive, Homo Sylvestris, or, The Anatomy of a Pygmie Compared with That of a Monkey, an Ape, and a Man To Which Is Added, A Philological Essay Concerning the Pygmies, the Cynocephali, the Satyrs and Sphinges of the Ancients: Wherein It Will Appear That They Are All Either Apes or Monkeys, and Not Men, As Formerly Pretended*. London: Thomas Bennet and Daniel Brown, 1699.
- Ulloa, Antonio de. *A Voyage to South America: Describing at Large, the Spanish Cities, Towns, Provinces, & C. on That Extensive Continent. Interspersed Throughout with Reflexions on Whatever Is Peculiar in the Religion and Civil Policy; in the Genius, Customs, Manners, Dress, & C. of the Several Inhabitants; Whether Natives, Spaniards, Creoles, Indians, Mulattoes, or Negroes. Together with the Natural as Well As Commercial History of the Country. And an Account of Their Gold and Silver Mines*. London: L. Davis and C. Reymers, 1760.
- Ulloa, Don Antonio. "The Desert of Motupe." In *The History of Hernando De Soto and Florida*, edited by Barnard Shipp, 603-604. Philadelphia: Collins Publishing, 1881.
- Virey, Julien. *Natural History of the Negro Race*. Charleston, SC. D. J. Dowling, 1837.
- Wafer, Lionel, and George Parker Winship. *A New Voyage and Description of the Isthmus of America*. Cleveland: Burrows Brothers, 1903.
- Walduck, Thomas. "T. Walduck's Letters from Barbados, 1710-1711." *JBMHS* 15, 2 (May, 1948): 137-149.
- Walker, Obadiah. *Of Education*. Oxon: At the Theater, 1673.
- Ward, Edward. *The London-Spy: Compleat, in Eighteen-Parts*. London: J. How, 1703.
- Wecker, Johann Jacob, and R. Read. *Eighteen Books of the Secrets of Art & Nature Being*

- the Summe and Substance of Naturall Philosophy, Methodically Digested*. London: Simon Miller, 1660.
- Weekly Memorials for the Ingenious; or, an Account of Books Lately Set Forth in Several Languages. With Other Accounts Relating to Arts and Sciences. No. 1-50*. London: Henry Faithorne and John Kersey, 1682.
- White, Andrew. "A Brief Relation of the Voyage unto Maryland." In *Narratives of Early Maryland, 1633-1684*, edited by Clayton Colman Hall, 25-43. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1910.
- White, Gilbert. *The Natural History of Selborne*. London: J. M. Dent and Co., 1901 [1789].
- Whitney, Geffrey. *A Choice of Emblems and Other Devises: For the Most Part Gathered Out of Sundrie Writers*. Leyden: Francis Raphelengius, 1586.
- Wilkinson, John. *Tutamen Nauticum or, the Seaman's Preservation from Shipwreck, Diseases, and Other Calamities Incident to Mariners. By John Wilkinson, M.D.* London: Dodsley, 1763.
- William, John Sharpe, and J. A. Giles. *William of Malmesbury's Chronicle of the Kings of England. From the Earliest Period to the Reign of King Stephen*. London: G. Bell and Sons, 1883.
- Williams, Cynric. *Hamel, the Obeah Man*. London: Hunt and Clarke, 1827.
- Williams, Joseph. *Voodooos and Obeahs; Phases of West India Witchcraft*. New York: L. MacVeagh, Dial Press, 1932.
- Williams, Roger. *A Key into the Language of America*. London: Gregory Dexter, 1643.
- Wilson, John. *A Synopsis of British Plants, in Mr Ray's Method: With Their Characters, Descriptions, Places of Growth, Time of Flowering, and Physical Virtues...*;

- Together with a Botanical Dictionary, Illustrated with Several Figures.* Newcastle upon Tyne: John Gooding, 1744.
- Winship, George Parker. *Sailors Narratives of Voyages along the New England Coast, 1524-1624.* New York: B. Franklin, 1968.
- Winthrop, John. "From Winthrop's Journal." In *The Literatures of Colonial America: an Anthology*, edited by Susan Castillo and Ivy Schweitzer, 250-256. Malden, Mass.: Blackwell Publishers. 2001.
- "Witchcraft in N. Rhodesia, 1957-1959." CAA 578/4/01.
- Wroth, Mary, and Simon van de Pass. *The Countesse of Mountgomerie's Urania. Written by the Right Honorable the Lady Mary Wroth. Daughter to the Right Noble Robert Earle of Leicester. And Neece to the Ever Famous, and Renowned Sr. Phillips Sidney Knight. And to Ye Most Execl[ent] Lady Mary Countesse of Pembroke Late Deceased.* London: Augustine Mathewes for John Marriott and Iohn Grismand, 1621.
- Wyvill, Richard. "'Memoirs of an Old Army Officer', Richard A. Wyvill's Visits to Barbados in 1796 and 1806-7." Edited by Jerome Handler, *JBMHS* 30 (March, 1975): 121-130.

Secondary Sources

- Abram, David. *The Spell of the Sensuous: Perception and Language in a More-Than-Human World*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1996.
- Ackerman, Diane. *A Natural History of the Senses*. New York: Random House. 1990.
- Adas, Michael. "From Settler Colony to Global Hegemon: Integrating the Exceptionalist Narrative of the American Experience into World History." *The American Historical Review* 106, 5 (2001): 1692-1720.
- Adas, Michael. *Machines as the Measure of Men: Science, Technology, and Ideologies of Western Dominance*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1989.
- Adelman, Janet. "Iago's Alter Ego: Race as Projection in *Othello*." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 48, 2 (1997): 125-144.
- Adelman, Jeremy. "Mimesis and Rivalry: European Empires and Global Regimes." *Journal of Global History* 10, 1 (2015): 77-98.
- Adelman, Jeremy, and Stephen Aron. "From Borderlands to Borders: Empires, Nation-States, and the Peoples in between in North American History." *The American Historical Review* 104, 3 (1999): 814-841.
- Adorno, Theodor, and E. F. N. Jephcott. *Minima Moralia: Reflections from Damaged Life*. London: Verso, 1978.
- Afolabi, Niya. "Axe: Invocation of Candomble and Afro-Brazilian Gods in Brazilian Cultural Production." In *Fragments of Bone: Neo-African Religions in a New World*, edited by Patrick Bellegarde-Smith, 108-123. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2005.

- Aftel, Mandy. *Fragrant: The Secret Life of Scent*. New York: Riverhead Books, 2014.
- Aftel, Mandy. *Essence and Alchemy: A Book of Perfume*. New York: North Point Press, 2001.
- Agamben, Giorgio. *Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1998.
- Albanese, Denise. *New Science, New World*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1996.
- Albert, Michael, and Robin Hahnel. *Unorthodox Marxism: An Essay on Capitalism, Socialism, and Revolution*. Boston: South End Press, 1978.
- Aldrete, Gregory. "Urban Sensations: Opulence and Ordure." In *Volume I of A Cultural History of the Senses*, edited by Constance Classen and Jerry Toner, 45-68. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.
- Allen, Valerie. *On Farting: Language and Laughter in the Middle Ages*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.
- Almagor, Uri. "Odors and Private Language: Observations on the Phenomenology of Scent." *Human Studies: A Journal for Philosophy and the Social Sciences* 13, 3 (1990): 253-274.
- Althusser, Louis. *Lenin and Philosophy, and Other Essays*. New York: Monthly Review Press, 2001.
- Amussen, Susan Dwyer. *Caribbean Exchanges: Slavery and the Transformation of English Society, 1640-1700*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2007.
- Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso, 1991.
- Anderson, Eugene. *Everyone Eats: Understanding Food and Culture*. New York: New

- York University Press, 2005.
- Anderson, Jennifer. *Mahogany: The Costs of Luxury in Early America*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2012.
- Anderson, Susan Campbell. "A Matter of Authority: James I and the Tobacco War." *Comitatus: A Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies* 29, 1 (1998): 136-163.
- Anderson, Warwick. *Colonial Pathologies: American Tropical Medicine, Race, and Hygiene in the Philippines*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2006.
- Anderson, Warwick. "Excremental Colonialism: Public Health and the Poetics of Pollution." *Critical Inquiry* 21, 3 (1995): 640-669.
- Andrews, William. "Benjamin Banneker's Revision of Thomas Jefferson: Conscience versus Science in the Early American Antislavery Debate." In *Genius in Bondage: Literature of the Early Black Atlantic*, edited by Vincent Carretta and Philip Gould, 218-241. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2001.
- Ankersmit, F. R. *Sublime Historical Experience*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2005.
- Appadurai, Arjun. *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1996.
- Appadurai, Arjun. *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Appelbaum, Robert. *Aguecheek's Beef, Belch's Hiccup, and Other Gastronomic Interjections: Literature, Culture, and Food among the Early Moderns*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006.
- Appiah, Kwame Anthony. "Race." In *Critical Terms for Literary Study*, edited by Frank

- Lentricchia and Thomas McLaughlin, 274-287. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1995.
- Appleby, Joyce. *Shores of Knowledge: New World Discoveries and the Scientific Imagination*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2013.
- Appleby, Joyce. "Consumption in Early Modern Social Thought." In *Consumption and the World of Goods*, edited by John Brewer and Roy Porter, 162-176. London; New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Arcangeli, Alessandro. "The Trouble with Odours in Petrarch's *De Remedis*." In *Sense and the Senses in Early Modern Art and Cultural Practice*, edited by Alice Sanger and Siv Tove Kulbrandstad Walker, 19-30. Farnham, Surrey, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2012.
- Arendt, Hannah and Ronald Beiner. *Lectures on Kant's Political Philosophy*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990.
- Armstrong, Douglas. "The Afro-Jamaican House-Yard: An Archeological and Ethnohistorical Perspective." *Florida Journal of Anthropology* 7 (1991): 51-63.
- Ashby, Eric, and Mary Anderson. *The Politics of Clean Air*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981.
- Ashcraft, Richard. "Leviathan Triumphant: Thomas Hobbes and the Politics of Wild Men." In *The Wild Man Within; An Image in Western Thought from the Renaissance to Romanticism*, edited by Edward Dudley and Maximillian Novak, 141-182. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1973.
- Attenborough, David, Susan Owens, Martin Clayton, and Rea Alexandratos. *Amazing Rare Things: The Art of Natural History in the Age of Discovery*. New Haven, CT: Yale

- University Press, 2007.
- Aubert, Guillaume. "The Blood of France: Race and Purity of Blood in the French Atlantic World." *WMQ* 61 (July, 2004): 439-478.
- Auerbach, Erich. *Mimesis: The Representation of Reality in Western Literature*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003 [1953].
- Axtell, James. *The Invasion Within: The Contest of Cultures in Colonial North America*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1985.
- Backscheider, Paula. *Spectacular Politics: Theatrical Power and Mass Culture in Early Modern England*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993.
- Badiou, Alain, and Susan Spitzer. *Black: The Brilliance of a Noncolor*. Cambridge: Polity, 2017.
- Bailey, Richard. *Race and Redemption in Puritan New England*. Cary: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Bakhtin, M. M. *Rabelais and His World*. Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 1968.
- Balibar, Etienne. "Difference, Otherness, Exclusion." *Parallax* 11, 1 (2005): 19-34.
- Baptist, Edward. *The Half Has Never Been Told: Slavery and the Making of American Capitalism*. New York: Basic Books, 2014.
- Barbara, Anna, and Anthony Perliss. *Invisible Architecture: Experiencing Places through the Sense of Smell*. Milano: Skira, 2006.
- Barker, Anthony. *The African Link: British Attitudes to the Negro in the Era of the Atlantic Slave Trade, 1550-1807*. London: F. Cass, 1978.
- Barker-Benfield, G. J. *The Culture of Sensibility: Sex and Society in Eighteenth-Century Britain*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992.

- Barnes, David. *The Great Stink of Paris and the Nineteenth-Century Struggle against Filth and Germs*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2006.
- Barrera-Osorio, Antonio. *Experiencing Nature: The Spanish American Empire and the Early Scientific Revolution*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 2006.
- Barrera, Antonio. "Local Herbs, Global Medicines: Commerce, Knowledge, and Commodities in Spanish America." In *Merchants & Marvels: Commerce, Science and Art in Early Modern Europe*, edited by Pamela Smith and Paula Findlen, 163-181. New York, NY: Routledge, 2002.
- Barrett, Leonard. *The Sun and the Drum: African Roots in Jamaican Folk Tradition*. Kingston, Jamaica: Sangster's Book Stores, 1976.
- Barros, Juanita de. "'Setting Things Right': Medicine and Magic in British Guiana, 1803-38." *Slavery and Abolition* 25, 1 (2004): 28-50.
- Barry, Jonathan, and Owen Davies. *Palgrave Advances in Witchcraft Historiography*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.
- Bartels, Emily. *Speaking of the Moor: From Alcazar to Othello*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008.
- Bartels, Emily. "Too Many Blackamoors: Deportation, Discrimination, and Elizabeth I." *Studies in English Literature, 1500-1900* 46, 2 (2006): 305-322.
- Bartels, Emily. "Othello and Africa: Postcolonialism Reconsidered." *WMQ* 54, 1 (Jan., 1997): 45-64.
- Bartels, Emily. "Imperialist Beginnings: Richard Hakluyt and the Construction of Africa." *Criticism* 34, 4 (Fall, 1992): 517-538.
- Bartels, Emily. "Making More of the Moor: Aaron, Othello, and Renaissance

- Refashionings of Race." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 41, 4 (1990): 433-454.
- Barthelemy, Anthony Gerard. *Black Face, Maligned Race: The Representation of Blacks in English Drama from Shakespeare to Southerne*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1987.
- Bartosiewicz, Laszlo. "There's Something Rotten in the State. . .': Bad Smells in Antiquity." *European Journal of Archaeology* 6, 2 (2013): 175-195.
- Basalla, George. *The Evolution of Technology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Basalla, George. "The Spread of Western Science." *Science* 156, 3775 (1967): 611-622.
- Bashford, Alison. *Imperial Hygiene: A Critical History of Colonialism, Nationalism and Public Health*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.
- Bate, Jonathan. "Caliban and Ariel Write Back." In *Shakespeare and Race*, edited by Catherine Alexander and Stanley Wells, 165-176. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Batty, Clare. "Olfactory Experience I: The Content of Olfactory Experience." *Philosophy Compass* 5, 12 (2010): 1137-1146.
- Batty, Clare. "Olfactory Experience II: Objects and Properties." *Philosophy Compass* 5, 12 (2010): 1147-1156.
- Batty, Clare. "A Representational Account of Olfactory Experience." *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* 40, 4 (2010): 511-538.
- Baucom, Ian. *Specters of the Atlantic: Finance Capital, Slavery, and the Philosophy of History*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2005.
- Baudrillard, Jean, Sylvère Lotringer, and Ames Hodges. *The Agony of Power*. Los Angeles,

- CA: Semiotext(e), 2010.
- Bauer, Ralph. "A New World of Secrets; Occult Philosophy and Local Knowledge in the Sixteenth-Century Atlantic." In *Science and Empire in the Atlantic World*, edited by James Delbourgo and Nicholas Dew, 99-126. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- Bauer, Ralph. *The Cultural Geography of Colonial American Literatures: Empire, Travel, Modernity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.
- Baum, Jacob. "From Incense to Idolatry: The Reformation of Olfaction in Late Medieval German Ritual." *The Sixteenth Century Journal* 44, 2 (2013): 323-344.
- Bauman, Zygmunt. *Wasted Lives: Modernity and Its Outcasts*. Oxford: Polity, 2004.
- Bauman, Zygmunt. "The Sweet Scent of Decomposition." In *Forget Baudrillard?*, edited by Chris Rojek and Bryan Turner, 22-46. London: Routledge, 1993.
- Bauman, Zygmunt, and Leonidas Donskis. *Moral Blindness: The Loss of Sensitivity in Liquid Modernity*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 2013.
- Bayly, C. A. "The British and Indigenous Peoples, 1760-1860: Power, Perception, and Identity." In *Empire and Others: British Encounters with Indigenous Peoples, 1600-1850*, edited by M. J. Daunton and Rick Halpern, 19-41. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999.
- Bazin, Maurice. "Our Sciences, Their Science." In *Race, Discourse, and the Origin of the Americas: A New World View*, edited by Vera Lawrence Hyatt and Rex Nettleford, 231-240. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995.
- Becker, Marvin. *Civility and Society in Western Europe, 1300-1600*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1988.
- Beckert, Sven, and Seth Rockman. "Introduction: Slavery's Capitalism." In *Slavery's*

- Capitalism: a New History of American Economic Development*, edited by Sven Beckert and Seth Rockman, 1-28. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016.
- Beckles, Hilary. *Natural Rebels: A Social History of Enslaved Black Women in Barbados*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1989.
- Bedichek, Roy. *The Sense of Smell*. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1960.
- Beer, Bettina. "Boholano Olfaction." *The Senses and Society* 9, 2 (2014): 151-173.
- Behringer, Wolfgang. "Weather, Hunger and Fear: Origins of the European Witch-Hunts in Climate, Society and Mentality." *German History* 13, 1 (1995): 1-27.
- Bell, Sandra. "The Subject of Smoke: Tobacco and Early Modern England." In *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, edited by Helen Ostovich, Mary Silcox, and Graham Roebuck, 153-169. Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2008.
- Bellanca, Mary Ellen. *Daybooks of Discovery: Nature Diaries in Britain, 1770-1870*. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2007.
- Bellegarde-Smith, Patrick. "Introduction." In *Fragments of Bone: Neo-African Religions in a New World*, edited by Patrick Bellegarde-Smith, 1-12. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2005.
- Bellion, Wendy. *Citizen Spectator: Art, Illusion, and Visual Perception in Early National America*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2011.
- Benay, Erin, and Lisa Rafanelli. *Faith, Gender and the Senses in Italian Renaissance and Baroque Art: Interpreting the Noli Me Tangere and Doubting Thomas*. Burlington: Ashgate, 2015.

- Bender, Daniel. "Sensing Labor: The Stinking Working-Class after the Cultural Turn." In *Rethinking US Labor History: Essays on the Working-Class Experience, 1756-2009*, edited by Donna Haverty-Stacke and Daniel Walkowitz, 243-265. New York, NY: Continuum, 2010.
- Bendix, Regina. "Introduction: Ear to Ear, Nose to Nose, Skik to Skin; The Senses in Comparative Ethnographic Perspective." *Etnofoor* 18, 1 (2005): 3-14.
- Benjamin, Thomas. *The Atlantic World: Europeans, Africans, Indians and Their Shared History, 1400-1900*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
- Benjamin, Walter, Hannah Arendt, and Harry Zohn. *Illuminations*. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, 1968.
- Bennett, Jane. *Vibrant Matter: A Political Ecology of Things*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2010.
- Bercovitch, Sacvan. *The Rites of Assent: Transformations in the Symbolic Construction of America*. New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Berkeley, Edmund, and Dorothy Smith Berkeley. *The Life and Travels of John Bartram from Lake Ontario to the River St. John*. Tallahassee: University Presses of Florida, 1982.
- Berkeley, Edmund, and Dorothy Smith Berkeley. *Dr. Alexander Garden of Charles Town*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1969.
- Bernasconi, Robert. "Who Invented the Concept of Race? Kant's Role in the Enlightenment Construction of Race." In *Race*, edited by Robert Bernasconi, 11-36. Malden, Mass.: Blackwell, 2001.
- Bernhard, Virginia. "Religion, Politics, and Witchcraft in Bermuda, 1651-55." *WMQ* 67,

- 4 (2010): 677-708.
- Bernstein, Richard. "Foucault: Critique as Philosophical Ethos." In *Philosophical Interventions in the Unfinished Project of Enlightenment*, edited by Axel Honneth, Thomas McCarthy, Claus Offe, and Albrecht Willmer, 280-310. Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 1992.
- Bernstein, Robin. *Racial Innocence: Performing American Childhood from Slavery to Civil Rights*. New York, NY: New York University Press, 2011.
- Berry, Diana Ramey. "Broad is de road dat leads ter death": Human Capital and Enslaved Mortality." In *Slavery's Capitalism: a New History of American Economic Development*, edited by Sven Beckert and Seth Rockman, 146-162. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016.
- Berzok, Linda Murray. *American Indian Food*. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 2005.
- Bethencourt, Francisco. *Racisms: From the Crusades to the Twentieth Century*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2013.
- Bever, Edward. "Witchcraft Prosecutions and the Decline of Magic." *Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 40, 2 (2009): 263-293.
- Bijsterveld, Karin. *Soundscapes of the Urban Past: Staged Sound As Mediated Cultural Heritage*. Bielefeld: Transcript, 2013.
- Bijsterveld, Karin. "The Diabolical Symphony of the Mechanical Age: Technology and Symbolism of Sound in European and North American Noise Abatement Campaigns, 1900 – 40." *Social Studies of Science* 31 (2001): 37-70.
- Bilby, Kenneth. "An (Un)natural Mystic in the Air: Images of Obeah in Caribbean Song." In *Obeah and Other Powers: The Politics of Caribbean Religion and Healing*,

- edited by Diana Paton and Maarit Forde, 45-79. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012.
- Bilby, Kenneth, and Jerome Handler. "Obeah: Healing and Protection in West Indian Slave Life." *The Journal of Caribbean History* 38, 2 (2004): 153-183.
- Biller, Peter. "Proto-racial Thought in Medieval Science." In *The Origins of Racism in the West*, edited by Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac, and Joseph Ziegler, 157-180. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
- Bindman, David. "The Black Presence in British Art: Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries." In Book I of *Volume III of The Image of the Black in Western Art*, edited by David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen Dalton, 235-270. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010.
- Bindman, David, and Helen Weston. "Court and City: Fantasies of Domination." In Book III of *Volume III of The Image of the Black in Western Art*, edited by David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen Dalton, 125-170. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010.
- Bindman, David, Charles Ford, and Helen Weston. "Africa and the Slave Trade." In Book III of *Volume III of The Image of the Black in Western Art*, edited by David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen Dalton, 207-240. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010.
- Biow, Douglas. *On the Importance of Being an Individual in Renaissance Italy: Men, Their Professions, and Their Beards*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015.
- Birdsall, Carolyn. *Nazi Soundscapes: Sound, Technology and Urban Space during Nazi*

- Germany*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2012
- Bishop, Ryan. "The Huntsman's Funeral: Targeting the Sensorium." *Social Identities* 16, 5 (2010): 607-619.
- Bitterli, Dieter. "The Perilous Senses. Strange Perceptions: Sensory Experience in the Old English 'Marvels of the East'." In *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, edited by Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer, 137-162. Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016.
- Blackburn, Carole. *Harvest of Souls: The Jesuit Missions and Colonialism in North America, 1632-1650*. Montreal, Quebec: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2000.
- Blackmore, Josiah. "Imagining the Moor in Medieval Portugal." *Diacritics* 36, 3 (2008): 27-43.
- Blakey, M. L. "Bioarchaeology of the African Diaspora in the Americas: Its Origins and Scope." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 30 (2001): 387-422.
- Bleichmar, Daniela. *Visible Empire: Botanical Expeditions and Visual Culture in the Hispanic Enlightenment*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2012.
- Block, Sharon. *Rape and Sexual Power in Early America*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006.
- Bloom, Gina. *Voice in Motion: Staging Gender, Shaping Sound in Early Modern England*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007.
- Bode, Katherine. *Reading by Numbers: Recalibrating the Literary Field*. London: Anthem Press, 2012.
- Boer, Wietse de. "A Neapolitan Heaven: The Sensory Universe of G.B. Giustiniani." In *Religion and the Senses in Early Modern Europe*, edited by Wietse de Boer and

- Christine Göttler, 363-391. Leiden: Brill, 2013.
- Bohaker, Heidi. "Indigenous Histories and Archival Media in the Early Modern Great Lakes." In *Colonial Mediascapes: Sensory Worlds of the Early Americas*, edited by Matt Cohen and Jeffrey Glover, 99-140. Lincoln: Nebraska, 2014.
- Boon, James. "Circumscribing Circumcision/Uncircumcision: An Essay amid the History of Difficult Description." In *Implicit Understandings: Observing, Reporting, and Reflecting on the Encounters Between Europeans and Other Peoples in the Early Modern Era*, edited by Stuart Schwartz, 556-585. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.
- Boose, Lynda. "'The Getting of a Lawful Race': Racial Discourse in Early Modern England and the Unpresentable Black Woman." In *Women, "Race," and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, edited by Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker, 35-54. London: Routledge, 1994.
- Boose, Lynda. "Scolding Brides and Bridling Scolds: Taming the Woman's Unruly Member." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 42, 2 (1991): 179-213.
- Borsay, Peter. "Pleasure Gardens and Urban Culture." In *The Pleasure Garden: From Vauxhall to Coney Island*, edited by Jonathan Conlin, 49-77. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013.
- Borthwick, Fiona. "Olfaction and Taste: Invasive Odours and Disappearing Objects." *The Australian Journal of Anthropology* 11, 2 (2000): 127-140.
- Boruchoff, David. "Beyond Utopia and Paradise: Cortés, Bernal Díaz and the Rhetoric of Consecration." *MLN* 106, 2, Hispanic Issue (Mar., 1991): 330-369.
- Boss, Julia. "Writing a Relic: The Uses of Hagiography in New France." In *Colonial*

- Saints: Discovering the Holy in the Americas, 1500-1800*, edited by Allan Greer and Jodi Bilinkoff, 211-234. New York: Routledge, 2003.
- Bostridge, Ian. *Witchcraft and Its Transformations, 1650-1750*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997.
- Bottici, Chiara. *Imaginal Politics: Images beyond Imagination and the Imaginary*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2014.
- Boulle, Pierre. "Francois Bernier and the Origins of the Modern Concept of Race." In *The Color of Liberty: Histories of Race in France*, edited by Sue Peabody and Tyler Edward Stovall, 11-27. Durham: Duke University Press, 2003.
- Boulle, Pierre. "In Defense of Slavery: Eighteenth-Century Opposition to Abolition and the Origins of a Racist Ideology in France." In *History from Below: Studies in Popular Protest and Popular Ideology in Honour of George Rudé*, edited by George Rudé and Frederick Krantz, 219-246. Montréal, Québec: Concordia University, 1985.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. *The Logic of Practice*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1990.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1984.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1977.
- Bourdieu, Pierre, Patrick Champagne, Rémi Lenoir, Franck Poupeau, Marie-Christine Rivière, and David Fernbach. *On the State: Lectures at the Collège De France, 1989-1992*. Cambridge; Malden, MA: Polity, 2014.
- Boutin, Aimée. *City of Noise: Sound and Nineteenth-Century Paris*. Urbana: University of

- Illinois Press, 2015.
- Bovilsky, Lara. *Barbarous Play: Race on the English Renaissance Stage*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008.
- Bowling, Kenneth. "'A Tub to the Whale': The Founding Fathers and Adoption of the Federal Bill of Rights." *Journal of the Early Republic* 8, 3 (1988): 223-251.
- Boyer, Paul, and Stephen Nissenbaum. *Salem Possessed: The Social Origins of Witchcraft*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1974.
- Boyle, Marjorie. *Loyola's Acts: The Rhetoric of the Self*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997.
- Boyle, Marjorie. *Senses of Touch: Human Dignity and Deformity from Michelangelo to Calvin*. Leiden: Brill, 1998.
- Bradley, Mark. "Approaches to Pollution and Propriety." In *Rome, Pollution, and Propriety: Dirt, Disease, and Hygiene in the Eternal City from Antiquity to Modernity*, edited by Mark Bradley and Kenneth Stow, 11-40. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Bradstreet, Christina. "A Trip to Japan in Sixteen Minutes: Sadakichi Hartmann's Perfume Concert and the Aesthetics of Scent." In *Art, History and the Senses: 1830 to the Present*, edited by Patrizia Di Bello and Gabriel Koureas, 51-62. Burlington, VT: Ashgate Pub. Co., 2010.
- Bragdon, Kathleen Joan. *Native People of Southern New England, 1500-1650*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1996.
- Brandão, José António. *Your Fyre Shall Burn No More: Iroquois Policy Toward New France and Its Native Allies to 1701*. Lincoln, Neb.: University of Nebraska Press,

1997.

Brandon, George. *Santeria from Africa to the New World: The Dead Sell Memories*.

Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993.

Brandon, William. *New Worlds for Old: Reports from the New World and Their Effect on the Development of Social Thought in Europe, 1500-1800*. Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 1986.

Brant, Clare. "Fume and Perfume: Some Eighteenth-Century Uses of Smell." *Journal of British Studies* 43, 4 (2004): 444-463.

Braude, Benjamin. "The Sons of Noah and the Construction of Ethnic and Geographical Identities in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods." *WMQ* 54, 1 (1997): 103-142.

Braudel, Fernand. *The Mediterranean and the Mediterranean World in the Age of Philip II*. New York: Harper & Row, 1972.

Braun, Lundy. *Breathing Race into the Machine: The Surprising Career of the Spirometer from Plantation to Genetics*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2014.

Braund, Kathryn Holland. "William Bartram's Gustatory Tour." In *Fields of Vision: Essays on the Travels of William Bartram*, edited by Kathryn Braund and Charlotte Porter, 33-41. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2010.

Braxton, Phyllis Natalie. "Othello: The Moor and the Metaphor." *South Atlantic Review* 55, 4 (1990): 1-17.

Breen, T. H. *The Marketplace of Revolution: How Consumer Politics Shaped American Independence*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2004.

Brewer, Leighton. *Shakespeare and the Dark Lady*. Boston: Christopher Pub. House, 1966.

- Briggs, Winstanley. "Le Pays Des Illinois." *WMQ* 47, 1 (1990): 30-56.
- Brigham, David. "Mark Catesby and the Patronage of Natural History in the First Half of the Eighteenth Century." In *Empire's Nature: Mark Catesby's New World Vision*, edited by Amy Meyers and Margaret Beck Pritchard, 91-146. Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture by the University of North Carolina Press, 1998.
- Brimblecombe, Peter. *The Big Smoke: A History of Air Pollution in London since Medieval Times*. London: Methuen, 1987.
- Bristol, Michael. *Carnival and Theater: Plebeian Culture and the Structure of Authority in Renaissance England*. New York: Methuen, 1985.
- Brockway, Lucile. *Science and Colonial Expansion: The Role of the British Royal Botanic Gardens*. New York: Academic Press, 1979.
- Bronner, Simon. "The Idea of the Folk Artifact." In *American Material Culture and Folklife: A Prologue and Dialogue*, edited by Simon Bronner, 3-46. Ann Arbor, Mich: UMI Research Press, 1985.
- Brown, Christopher Leslie. *Moral Capital: Foundations of British Abolitionism*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006.
- Brown, Kathleen. *Foul Bodies: Cleanliness in Early America*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2009.
- Brown, Kathleen. "Native Americans and Early Modern Concepts of Race." In *Empire and Others: British Encounters with Indigenous Peoples, 1600-1850*, edited by M. J. Daunt and Rick Halpern, 79-100. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999.

- Brown, Kathleen. *Good Wives, Nasty Wenches, and Anxious Patriarchs: Gender, Race, and Power in Colonial Virginia*. Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture by the University of North Carolina Press, 1996.
- Brown, Michael. "From Foetid Air to Filth: the Cultural Transformation of British Epidemiological Thought, Ca. 1780-1848." *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 82, 3 (2008): 515-544.
- Brown, Ras Michael. *African-Atlantic Cultures and the South Carolina Lowcountry*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Brown, Ras Michael. "‘Walk in the Feenda’: West-Central Africans and the Forest in the South Carolina-Georgia Low Country." In *Central Africans and Cultural Transformations in the American Diaspora*, edited by Linda Heywood, 289-318. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Brown, Vincent. "Social Death and Political Life in the Study of Slavery." *The American Historical Review* 24, 5 (2009): 1231-1249.
- Brown, Vincent. *The Reaper’s Garden: Death and Power in the World of Atlantic Slavery*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2008.
- Brown, Vincent. "Spiritual Terror and Sacred Authority in Jamaican Slave Society." *Slavery and Abolition* 24, 1 (2003): 24-53.
- Brown, Wendy. *Regulating Aversion: Tolerance in the Age of Identity and Empire*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2006.
- Browne, R. M. "The ‘Bad Business’ of Obeah: Power, Authority, and the Politics of Slave Culture in the British Caribbean." *WMQ* 68, 3 (2011): 451-480.
- Bryden, Mary. "The Odorous Text: A Deleuzian Approach to Huysmans." *Romantic*

- Review* 100, 3 (2009): 265-278.
- Bryson, Anna. *From Courtesy to Civility: Changing Codes of Conduct in Early Modern England*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998.
- Bryson, Sasha Turner. "The Art of Power: Poison and Obeah Accusations and the Struggle for Dominance and Survival in Jamaica's Slave Society." *Caribbean Studies* 41, 2 (2013): 61-90.
- Buck, Linda, and Richard Axel. "A Novel Multigene Family May Encode Odorant Receptors: a Molecular Basis for Odor Recognition." *Cell* 65, 1 (1991): 175-187.
- Buchanan, Brenda. *Gunpowder, Explosives and the State: A Technological History*. Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2006.
- Bull, Michael, and Jon Mitchell. "Introduction." In *Ritual, Performance and the Senses*, edited by Michael Bull and Jon Mitchell, 1-10. London; New York: Bloomsbury, 2015.
- Burke, Peter. "Urban Sensations: Attractive and Repulsive." In *Volume III of A Cultural History of the Senses*, edited by Constance Classen, 43-60. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.
- Burke, Peter. "America and the Rewriting of World History." In *America in European Consciousness, 1493-1750*, edited by Karen Ordahl Kupperman, 33-51. Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, VA, by the University of North Carolina Press, 1995.
- Burnard, Trevor. *Planters, Merchants, and Slaves: Plantation Societies in British America, 1650-1820*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2015.
- Burnard, Trevor. "West Indian Identity in the Eighteenth Century." In *Assumed Identities:*

- The Meanings of Race in the Atlantic World*, edited by John Garrigus and Christopher Morris, 71-87. College Station, Tex.: Published for the University of Texas at Arlington by Texas A & M, 2010.
- Burnard, Trevor. *Mastery, Tyranny, and Desire: Thomas Thistlewood and his Slaves in the Anglo-Jamaican World*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2004.
- Burnard, Trevor. *Creole Gentlemen: The Maryland Elite, 1691-1776*. New York: Routledge, 2002.
- Burnard, Trevor, and John Garrigus. *The Plantation Machine: Atlantic Capitalism in French Saint-Domingue and British Jamaica*. Philadelphia: Pennsylvania Press, 2016.
- Burns, Eric. *The Smoke of the Gods: A Social History of Tobacco*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2007.
- Burton, Jonathan. "‘A most wily bird’: Leo Africanus, *Othello* and the Trafficking in Difference." In *Post-Colonial Shakespeares*, edited by Ania Loomba and Martin Orkin, 43-63. London: Routledge, 1998.
- Butchart, Alexander. *The Anatomy of Power: European Constructions of the African Body*. London: Zed Books, 1998.
- Butler, Shane. "Making Scents of Poetry." In *Smell and the Ancient Senses*, edited by Mark Bradley, 74-89. London; New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2015.
- Bushman, Richard. *The Refinement of America: Persons, Houses, Cities*. New York: Knopf, 1992.
- Bushman, Richard, and Claudia Bushman. "The Early History of Cleanliness in America." *Journal of American History* 74, 4 (1988): 1213-1238.

- Bushnell, Rebecca. *Green Desire: Imagining Early Modern English Gardens*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2003.
- Butler, Judith. "Speaking Up, Talking Back: Joan Scott's Critical Feminism." In *The Question of Gender: Joan W. Scott's Critical Feminism*, edited by Judith Butler and Elizabeth Weed, 11-30. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2011.
- Butler, Shane, and Alex Purves. "Introduction: Synesthesia and the Ancient Senses." In *Synaesthesia and the Ancient Senses*, edited by Shane Butler and Alex Purves, 1-8. Durham, UK: Acumen, 2013.
- Butler, Todd. "Power in Smoke: The Language of Tobacco and Authority in Caroline England." *Studies in Philology* 106, 1 (Winter, 2009): 100-118.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker. *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987.
- Byrd, Jodi. *The Transit of Empire: Indigenous Critiques of Colonialism*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2011.
- Callaghan, Dymphna. *Shakespeare's Sonnets*. Malden, MA: Blackwell Pub, 2007.
- Callaghan, Dymphna. "What's at Stake in Representing Race?" *Shakespeare Studies* 26 (1998): 21-27.
- Calloway, Colin. *Dawnland Encounters: Indians and Europeans in Northern New England*. Hanover: University Press of New England, 1991.
- Calloway, Colin. *New Worlds for All: Indians, Europeans, and the Remaking of Early America*. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins. 1997.
- Calloway, Colin. *The World Turned Upside Down: Indian Voices from Early America*. Boston: St. Martin's Press. 1994.

- Camp, Stephanie. *Closer to Freedom: Enslaved Women & Everyday Resistance in the Plantation South*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2004.
- Campbell, Mary. *Wonder & Science: Imagining Worlds in Early Modern Europe*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1999.
- Camporesi, Piero. *The Anatomy of the Senses: Natural Symbols in Medieval and Early Modern Italy*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1994.
- Camporesi, Piero. *The Magic Harvest: Food, Folklore, and Society*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1993.
- Camporesi, Piero. *The Fear of Hell: Images of Damnation and Salvation in Early Modern Europe*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1991.
- Camporesi, Piero. *The Incorruptible Flesh: Bodily Mutation and Mortification in Religion and Folklore*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Cañizares-Esguerra, Jorge. *Nature, Empire, and Nation: Explorations of the History of Science in the Iberian World*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2006.
- Cañizares-Esguerra, Jorge. *Puritan Conquistadors: Iberianizing the Atlantic, 1550-1700*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2006.
- Cañizares-Esguerra, Jorge. *How to Write the History of the New World: Histories, Epistemologies, and Identities in the Eighteenth-Century Atlantic World*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2001.
- Capone, Stefania. *Searching for Africa in Brazil: Power and Tradition in Candomblé*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2010.
- Carayon, Céline. *Beyond Words: Nonverbal Communication, Performance, and Acculturation in the Early French-Indian Atlantic (1500-1700)*. PhD. Dissertation,

- College of William and Mary, 2010.
- Carlisle, Janice. *Common Scents: Comparative Encounters in High-Victorian Fiction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.
- Carlisle, Janice. "The Smell of Class: British Novels of the 1860s." *Victorian Literature and Culture* 29, 1 (2001): 1-19.
- Carr, David. *Experience and History: Phenomenological Perspectives on the Historical World*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Cartelli, Thomas. "Prospero in Africa: *The Tempest* as Colonialist Text and Pretext." In *Shakespeare Reproduced: The Text in History and Ideology*, edited by Jean Howard and Marion O' Connor, 99-115. New York: Methuen, 1987.
- Carvalho-Neto, Paulo de. "Folklore of the Black Struggle in Latin America." *Latin American Perspectives* 5, 2 (1978): 53-88.
- Caseau, Béatrice. "The Senses in Religion: Liturgy, Devotion, and Deprivation." In *Volume II of A Cultural History of the Senses*, edited by Constance Classen and Richard Newhauser, 89-110. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.
- Caseau, Béatrice. *Euōdia: The Use and Meaning of Fragrances in the Ancient World and their Christianization (100-900 AD)*. PhD. Dissertation, Princeton University, 1994.
- Casellas, Jesús López-Peláez, "'Race' and the Construction of English National Identity: Spaniards and North Africans in English Seventeenth-Century Drama." *Studies in Philology* 106, 1 (2009): 32-51.
- Castle, Terry. *Masquerade and Civilization: The Carnavalesque in Eighteenth-Century English Culture and Fiction*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1986.

- Castro, Eduardo Batalha Viveiros de. *The Inconstancy of the Indian Soul: the Encounter of Catholics and Cannibals in 16th-century Brazil*. Chicago: Prickly Paradigm Press, 2011.
- Caton, Mary Anne, and Joan Thirsk. *Fooles and Fricassees: Food in Shakespeare's England*. Washington, D. C.: Folger Shakespeare Library, 1999.
- Cavalletto, George. *Crossing the Psycho-Social Divide: Freud, Weber, Adorno and Elias*. Aldershot, Hants, England: Ashgate, 2007.
- Cavert, William. "The Environmental Policy of Charles I: Coal Smoke and the English Monarchy, 1624-40." *Journal of British Studies* 53, 2 (2014): 310-333.
- Certeau, Michel de. "Travel Narratives of the French to Brazil: Sixteenth to Eighteenth Centuries." *Representations* 33, Special Issue: The New World (Winter, 1991): 221-226.
- Certeau, Michel de. *The Writing of History*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1988.
- Certeau, Michel de. *Heterologies: Discourse on the Other*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986.
- Certeau, Michel de, and Steven Rendall. *The Practice of Everyday Life*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984.
- Cervantes, Fernando. *The Devil in the New World: The Impact of Diabolism in New Spain*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994.
- Cervantes, Fernando, and Andrew Redden. "Introduction." In *Angels, Demons and the New World*, edited by Fernando Cervantes and Andrew Redden, 1-14. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.
- Chakrabarty, Dipesh. "Open Space/Public Place: Garbage, Modernity and India." *South*

- Asia: Journal of South Asian Studies* 14, 1 (1991): 15-31.
- Chan, Alexandra. "Bringing the Out Kitchen In?: The Experiential Landscapes of Black and White New England." In *Archaeology of Atlantic Africa and the African Diaspora*, edited by Akinwumi Ogundiran and Toyin Falola, 249-276. Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 2010.
- Chaplin, Joyce. *Subject Matter: Technology, the Body, and Science on the Anglo-American Frontier, 1500-1676*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2001.
- Chaplin, Joyce. "Natural Philosophy and an Early Racial Idiom in North America: Comparing English and Indian Bodies." *WMQ* 54 (1997): 229-252.
- Charnes, Linda. *Notorious Identity: Materializing the Subject in Shakespeare*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1995.
- Chartier, Roger. *The Cultural Uses of Print in Early Modern France*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1987.
- Chen, Mel. *Animacies: Biopolitics, Racial Mattering, and Queer Affect*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012.
- Chia, Robert. *Organizational Analysis as Deconstructive Practice*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1996.
- Chiang, C. Y. "The Nose Knows: The Sense of Smell in American History." *Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 405-416.
- Chidester, David. *African Traditional Religion in South Africa: An Annotated Bibliography*. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1997.
- Chidester, David. "Symbolism and the Senses in Saint Augustine." *Religion* 14, 1 (1984): 31-51.

- Childers, Joseph. "Foreign Matter: Imperial Filth." In *Filth: Dirt, Disgust, and Modern Life*, edited by William Cohen and Ryan Johnson, 201-224. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005.
- Chiles, Katy. *Transformable Race: Surprising Metamorphoses in the Literature of Early America*. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Chinn, Sarah. *Technology and the Logic of American Racism: A Cultural History of the Body as Evidence*. London: Continuum, 2000.
- Chireau, Yvonne. *Black Magic: Religion and the African American Conjuring Tradition*. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California, 2003.
- Cislo, Amy Eisen. *Paracelsus's Theory of Embodiment: Conception and Gestation in Early Modern Europe*. London: Picador and Chatto, 2010.
- Cisney, Vernon, and Nicolae Morar. "Introduction: Why Biopower? Why Now?" In *Biopower: Foucault and Beyond*, edited by Vernon Cisney and Nicole Morar, 1-28. Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016.
- Clark, Stuart. *Vanities of the Eye: Vision in Early Modern European Culture*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Clark, Stuart. *Thinking with Demons: The Idea of Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997.
- Clark, Stuart. "Demons, Natural Magic, and the Virtually Real: Visual Paradox in Early Modern Europe." In *New World Encounters*, edited by Stephen Greenblatt, 223-246. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.
- Classen, Constance. "Touching the Deep Past: The Lure of Ancient Bodies in Nineteenth-Century Museums and Culture." *The Senses and Society* 9, 3 (2014): 268-283.

- Classen, Constance. *The Deepest Sense: A Cultural History of Touch*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2012.
- Classen, Constance. "The Breath of God; Sacred Histories of Scent." In *The Smell Culture Reader*, edited by Jim Drobnick, 375-390. Oxford: Berg, 2006.
- Classen, Constance. "Other Ways to Wisdom: Learning through the Senses across Cultures." *International Review of Education* 45, 3 (1999): 269-280.
- Classen, Constance. *The Color of Angels: Cosmology, Gender, and the Aesthetic Imagination*. London: Routledge, 1998.
- Classen, Constance. "Foundation for an Anthropology of the Senses." *International Social Science Journal* 153 (September, 1997): 401-412.
- Classen, Constance. *Worlds of Sense: Exploring the Senses in History and Across Cultures*. London: Routledge, 1993.
- Classen, Constance. *Inca Cosmology and the Human Body*. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1993.
- Classen, Constance. "The Odor of the Other: Olfactory Symbolism and Cultural Categories." *Ethos* 20, 2 (1992): 133-166.
- Classen, Constance. "The Sensory Orders of 'Wild Children'." In *The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses*, edited by David Howes, 47-60. Toronto: University of Toronto, 1991.
- Classen, Constance. "Sweet Colors, Fragrant Songs: Sensory Models of the Andes and the Amazon." *American Ethnologist* 17, 4 (1990): 722-735.
- Classen, Constance, David Howes, and Anthony Synnott. *Aroma: The Cultural History of Smell*. London: Routledge, 1994.

- Clay, Richard. "Smells, Bells and Touch: Iconoclasm in Paris during the French Revolution." *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 35, 4 (2012): 521-533.
- Cleary, Patricia. *The World, the Flesh, and the Devil: A History of Colonial St. Louis*. Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 2011.
- Clements, Ashley. "Divine Scents and Presence." In *Smell and the Ancient Senses*, edited by Mark Bradley, 46-59. London; New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2015.
- Cochran, Gregory, Jason Hardy, and Henry Harpending. "Natural History of Ashkenazi Intelligence." *Journal of Biosocial Science* 38, 5 (2006): 659-693.
- Cockayne, Emily. *Hubbub: Filth, Noise & Stench in England 1600-1770*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2007.
- Coclanis, Peter. "Slavery, African-American Agency, and the World We Have Lost." *Georgia Historical Quarterly* 79 (1995): 873-884.
- Cohen, Bernard. *Science and the Founding Fathers: Science in the Political Thought of Jefferson, Franklin, Adams and Madison*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1995.
- Cohen, Colleen Ballerino. "Olfactory Constitution of the Postmodern Body." In *Tattoo, Torture, Mutilation, and Adornment: The Denaturalization of the Body in Culture and Text*, edited by Frances Mascia-Lees and Patricia Sharpe, 48-78. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992.
- Cohen, Matt. *The Networked Wilderness: Communicating in Early New England*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010.
- Cohen, Matt, and Jeffrey Glover. "Introduction." In *Colonial Mediascapes: Sensory Worlds of the Early Americas*, edited by Matt Cohen and Jeffrey Glover, 1-44.

- Lincoln: Nebraska, 2014.
- Cohen, William. "Locating Filth." In *Filth: Dirt, Disgust, and Modern Life*, edited by William Cohen and Ryan Johnson, vii-xxxvii. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005.
- Cohen, William B. *The French Encounter with Africans: White Response to Blacks, 1530-1880*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1980.
- Cole, Denise. "Edible Performance: Feasting and Festivity in Early Tudor Entertainment." In *The Senses in Performance*, edited by Sally Banes and André Lepecki, 92-104. New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Connor, Steven. "The Menagerie of the Senses." *The Senses and Society* 1, 1 (2006): 9-26.
- Cook, James. "Seeing the Visual in U.S. History." *Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 432-441.
- Corbin, Alain. *Time, Desire, and Horror: Towards a History of the Senses*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1995.
- Corbin, Alain. *Village Bells: Sound and Meaning in the Nineteenth-Century French Countryside*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1998.
- Corbin, Alain. *The Foul and the Fragrant: Odor and the French Social Imagination*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1986.
- Cotterill, Anne. *Digressive Voices in Early Modern English Literature*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.
- Couchman, Dorothy. "'Mungo Everywhere': How Anglophones Heard Chattel Slavery." *Slavery & Abolition* 36, 4 (2015): 704-720.
- Cowhig, Ruth. "Blacks in English Renaissance Drama and the Role of Shakespeare's

- Othello*.” In *The Black Presence in English Literature*, edited by David Dabydeen, 1-25. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1985.
- Cox, James. “Missionaries, the Phenomenology of Religion and ‘re-presenting’ Nineteenth-Century African Religion: a Case Study of Peter McKenzie's *Hail Orisha!*” *Journal of Religion in Africa* 31, 3 (2001): 336-353.
- Craik, Katharine. *Reading Sensations in Early Modern England*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.
- Crary, Jonathan. *Suspensions of Perception: Attention, Spectacle, and Modern Culture*. Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 1999.
- Crary, Jonathan. *Techniques of the Observer: On Vision and Modernity in the Nineteenth Century*. Cambridge, Mass: M. I. T. Press, 1990.
- Craton, Michael. *Testing the Chains: Resistance to Slavery in the British West Indies*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1982.
- Crawford, Matthew James. "An Empire's Extract: Chemical Manipulations of Cinchona Bark in the Eighteenth-Century Spanish Atlantic World." *Osiris* 29, 1 (2014): 215-229.
- Critten, Rory, and Annette Kern-Stähler. “The Theatre as Sensory Experience: Smell in the York Corpus Christi Plays.” In *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, edited by Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer, 239-268. Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016.
- Cronon, William. *Changes in the Land: Indians, Colonists, and the Ecology of New England*. New York: Hill and Wang, 1983.
- Crosby, Alfred. *The Columbian Exchange: Biological and Cultural Consequences of 1492*.

- Westport: Greenwood, 1972.
- Crouch, Christian Ayne. *Nobility Lost: French and Canadian Martial Cultures, Indians, and the End of New France*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2014.
- Crowley, John. *The Invention of Comfort: Sensibilities & Design in Early Modern Britain & Early America*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2001.
- Culianu, Ioan. *Eros and Magic in the Renaissance*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987.
- Curran, Andrew. *The Anatomy of Blackness: Science & Slavery in an Age of Enlightenment*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2011.
- Curtin, Philip. *The Image of Africa: British Ideas and Action, 1780-1850*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1964.
- Curtis, Bruce. "‘I Can Tell by the Way You Smell’: Dietetics, Smell, Social Theory." *The Senses and Society* 3, 1 (2008): 5-22.
- Curtis, Tony. "The Development of Odour Language between Professionals in the Aroma Trades Industry." In *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, edited by Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham, 57-78. Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003.
- D' Amico, Jack. *The Moor in English Renaissance Drama*. Tampa: University of South Florida Press, 1991.
- Dabydeen, David. *Hogarth's Blacks: Images of Blacks in Eighteenth Century English Art*. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1987.
- Dabydeen, David. "Eighteenth-Century English Literature on Commerce and Slavery." In *The Black Presence in English Literature*, edited by David Dabydeen, 26-49.

- Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1985.
- Damrosch, David. "The Aesthetics of Conquest: Aztec Poetry Before and After Cortes." In *New World Encounters*, edited by Stephen Greenblatt, 139-158. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.
- Daniel, Yvonne. *Dancing Wisdom: Embodied Knowledge in Haitian Vodou, Cuban Yoruba, and Bahian Candomblé*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2005.
- Darr, Orna. *Marks of an Absolute Witch: Evidentiary Dilemmas in Early Modern England*. London: Ashgate, 2011.
- Daston, Lorraine. "Afterword: The Ethos of Enlightenment." In *The Sciences in Enlightened Europe*, edited by William Clark, Jan Golinski, and Simon Schaffer, 495-504. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999.
- Daston, Lorraine, and Katharine Park. *Wonders and the Order of Nature, 1150-1750*. New York: Zone Books, 1998.
- Daston, Lorraine, and Peter Galison. *Objectivity*. New York: Zone Books, 2007.
- Daut, Marlene. *Tropics of Haiti: Race and the Literary History of the Haitian Revolution in the Atlantic World, 1789-1865*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2015.
- Davies, Owen. "Urbanization and the Decline of Witchcraft: An Examination of London." *Journal of Social History* 30, 3 (1997): 597-617.
- Davis, Charles, and Henry Louis Gates. *The Slave's Narrative*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985.
- Davis, David Brion. *Inhuman Bondage: The Rise and Fall of Slavery in the New World*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Davis, David Brion. "Constructing Race: A Reflection," *WMQ* 54 (January, 1997): 7-18.

- Davis, Natalie Zemon. "Judges, Masters, Diviners: Slaves' Experience of Criminal Justice in Colonial Suriname." *Law and History Review* 29, 4 (Nov., 2011): 925-984.
- Davis, Natalie Zemon. *Trickster Travels: A Sixteenth-Century Muslim between Worlds*. New York: Hill and Wang, 2006.
- Davis, Natalie Zemon. *Fiction in the Archives: Pardon Tales and Their Tellers in Sixteenth-Century France*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1987.
- Davis, Natalie Zemon. *The Return of Martin Guerre*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1983.
- Davis, Natalie Zemon. "The Sacred and the Body Social in Sixteenth-Century Lyon." *Past & Present* 90 (1980): 40-70.
- Davis, Wade. *Passage of Darkness: The Ethnobiology of the Haitian Zombie*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1988.
- Dawes, Martin. "The Politics of Supernatural Wonders in *Paradise Lost*." In *Supernatural and Secular Power in Early Modern England*, edited by Marcus Harnes and Victoria Bladen, 163-181. Farnham, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2015.
- Dawson, Kevin. "The Cultural Geography of Enslaved Ship Pilots." In *The Black Urban Atlantic in the Age of the Slave Trade*, edited by Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra, Matt Childs, and James Sidbury, 163-184. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013.
- Day, Jo. "Imagined Aromas and Artificial Flowers in Minoan Society." In *Making Senses of the Past: Toward a Sensory Archaeology*, edited by Jo Day, 286-309. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2013.
- Dayan, Colin. *Haiti, History, and the Gods*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995.

- Dean, Mitchell, and Kaspar Villadsen. *State Phobia and Civil Society: The Political Legacy of Michel Foucault*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2016.
- Dear, Peter. *Revolutionizing the Sciences: European Knowledge and Its Ambitions, 1500-1700*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2009.
- Dear, Peter. *The Intelligibility of Nature: How Science Makes Sense of the World*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006.
- Debus, Allen. *Man and Nature in the Renaissance*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978.
- Deetz, James. *In Small Things Forgotten: The Archaeology of Early American Life*. Garden City, NY: Anchor Press/Doubleday, 1977.
- Deleuze, Gilles, and Félix Guattari. *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1987.
- Delbourgo, James, and Nicholas Dew. "Introduction: The Far Side of the Ocean." In *Science and Empire in the Atlantic World*, edited by James Delbourgo and Nicholas Dew, 1-28. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- Demaray, John. *Shakespeare and the Spectacles of Strangeness: The Tempest and the Transformation of Renaissance Theatrical Forms*. Pittsburgh, PA: Duquesne University Press, 1998.
- Denney, Peter. "'The Sounds of Population Fail': Changing Perception of Rural Poverty and Plebian Noise in Eighteenth-Century Britain." In *Experiences of Poverty in Late Medieval and Early Modern England and France*, edited by Anne Scott, 295-311. Farnham, Surrey, England: Ashgate, 2012.
- Derrida, Jacques. "The 'World' of the Enlightenment to Come (Exception, Calculation,

- Sovereignty)." *Research in Phenomenology* 33, 1 (2003): 9-52.
- Derrida, Jacques. *Dissemination*. Chicago: University Press, 1981.
- Derrida, Jacques. *Of Grammatology*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1998 [1976].
- Derrida, Jacques, and Eric Prenowitz. *Archive Fever: A Freudian Impression*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996.
- Desbarats, Catherine. "The Cost of Early Canada's Native Alliances: Reality and Scarcity's Rhetoric." *WMQ* 52, 4 (1995): 609-630.
- Deslandres, Dominique. "In the Shadow of the Cloister: Representations of Female Holiness in New France." In *Colonial Saints: Discovering the Holy in the Americas, 1500-1800*, edited by Allan Greer and Jodi Bilinkoff, 129-152. New York: Routledge, 2003.
- Dickason, Olive Patricia. *The Myth of the Savage: And the Beginnings of French Colonialism in the Americas*. Edmonton, Alberta, Canada: University of Alberta Press, 1984.
- Dickie, George. *The Century of Taste: The Philosophical Odyssey of Taste in the Eighteenth Century*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- Dickson, Sarah Augusta. *Panacea or Precious Bane; Tobacco in Sixteenth Century Literature*. New York: New York Public Library, 1954.
- Diehl, Huston. *Staging Reform, Reforming the Stage: Protestantism and Popular Theater in Early Modern England*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press. 1997.
- Dillon, Elizabeth Maddock. *New World Drama: the Performative Commons in the Atlantic World, 1649-1849*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2014.
- Dobranski, Stephen. *Readers and Authorship in Early Modern England*. Cambridge:

- Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- Dollimore, Jonathan. *Radical Tragedy: Religion, Ideology, and Power in the Drama of Shakespeare and His Contemporaries*. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1984.
- Donkin, R. A. *Dragon's Brain Perfume: An Historical Geography of Camphor*. Leiden: Brill, 1999.
- Dorland, Gabrielle. *Scents Appeal: The Silent Persuasion of Aromatic Encounters*. Mendham: Wayne Dorland Company, 1993.
- Douglas, Mary. *Purity and Danger; an Analysis of Concepts of Pollution and Taboo*. New York: Praeger, 1966.
- Douthwaite, Julia. *The Wild Girl, Natural Man, and the Monster: Dangerous Experiments in the Age of Enlightenment*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002.
- Downey, Greg. "The Importance of Repetition: Ritual as a Support to Mind." In *Ritual, Performance and the Senses*, edited by Michael Bull and Jon Mitchell, 45-62. London; New York: Bloomsbury, 2015.
- Drayton, Richard. *Nature's Government: Science, Imperial Britain, and the 'Improvement' of the World*. New Haven: Yale, 2000.
- Drewal, Henry John. "Introduction: Charting the Voyage." In *Sacred Waters: Arts for Mami Wata and Other Divinities in Africa and the Diaspora*, edited by Henry John Drewal, 1-18. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2008.
- Drewal, Henry John. "Performing the Other: Mami Wata Worship in Africa." *The Drama Review* 32, 2 (1988): 160-185.
- Drobnick, Jim. "Towards an Olfactory Art History: The Mingled, Fatal, and Rejuvenating Perfumes of Paul Gauguin." *Senses & Society* 7 (2012): 196-208.

- Drobnick, Jim. "Introduction: Olfactocentrism." In *The Smell Culture Reader*, edited by Jim Drobnick, 1-9. Oxford: Berg, 2006.
- Drobnick, Jim. "Clara Ursitti: Scents of a Woman." *Tessera* 32 (Summer 2002): 85-97.
- Drobnick, Jim. "Toposmia: Art, Scent, and Interrogations of Spatiality." *Angelaki* 7, 1 (2002): 31-47.
- Duffy, Eamon. *The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England, C. 1400-C. 1580*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1992.
- Dugan, Holly. *The Ephemeral History of Perfume: Scent and Sense in Early Modern England*. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011.
- Dugan, Holly. "Corilanus and the 'Rank-Scented Meinie': Smelling Rank in Early Modern England." In *Masculinity and the Metropolis of Vice, 1550-1650*, edited by Amanda Bailey and Roze Hentschell, 139-159. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Dugan, Holly. "Scent of a Woman: Performing the Politics of Smell in Late Medieval and Early Modern England." *The Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies* 38, 2 (2008): 229-252.
- Dugan, Holly, and Lara Farina. "Intimate Senses/Sensing Intimacy." *Postmedieval* 3, 4 (2012): 373-379.
- Dunn, Richard. *A Tale of Two Plantations: Slave Life and Labor in Jamaica and Virginia*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2014.
- DuPlessis, Robert. *The Material Atlantic: Clothing, Commerce, and Colonization in the Atlantic World, 1650-1800*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016.
- Dussel, Enrique, and Michael Barber. *The Invention of the Americas: Eclipse of "the Other" and the Myth of Modernity*. New York: Continuum, 1995.

- Dyer, Christopher. "Did the Peasants Really Starve in Medieval England?" In *Food and Eating in Medieval Europe*, edited by Martha Carlin and Joel Thomas Rosenthal, 53-72. London: Hambledon Press, 1998.
- Eagleton, Terry. *The Ideology of the Aesthetic*. Cambridge, MA: Basil Blackwell, 1990.
- Eamon, William. *Science and the Secrets of Nature: Books of Secrets in Medieval and Early Modern Culture*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994.
- Eastham, Andrew. *Aesthetic Afterlives: Irony, Literary Modernity and the Ends of Beauty*. London: Continuum International Pub, 2011.
- Eastwood, Bruce Stansfield. "Galen on the Elements of Olfactory Sensation." *Rheinisches Museum Für Philologie N. F.* 124, 3-4 (1981): 268-290.
- Ebersole, Gary. *Captured by Texts: Puritan to Postmodern Images of Indian Captivity*. Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia. 1995.
- Eden, Trudy. "Food, Assimilation, and the Malleability of the Human Body in Early Virginia." In *A Centre of Wonders: The Body in Early America*, edited by Janet Moore Lindman and Michele Lise Tarter, 29-42. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2001.
- Edwards, Paul. "The Early African Presence in the British Isles." In *Essays on the History of Blacks in Britain: From Roman Times to the Mid-Twentieth Century*, edited by Jagdish Gundara and Ian Duffield, 9-29. Aldershot, England: Avebury, 1992.
- Egerton, Douglas. "Markets without a Market Revolution: Southern Planters and Capitalism." *Journal of the Early Republic* 16 (1996): 207-222.
- Eifert, Virginia Louise Snider. *Tall Trees and Far Horizons: Adventures and Discoveries of Early Botanists in America*. New York: Dodd, Mead, 1965.

- Eire, Carlos. *Reformations: The Early Modern World, 1450-1650*. New Haven; London: Yale University Press, 2016.
- Eisenstein, Elizabeth. *The Printing Press as an Agent of Change: Communications and Cultural Transformations in Early Modern Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.
- El-Khoury, Rodolphe. "Polish and Deodorize; Paving the City in Late Eighteenth Century France." In *The Smell Culture Reader*, edited by Jim Drobnick, 18-28. Oxford: Berg, 2006.
- Eldredge, Elizabeth. *A South African Kingdom: The Pursuit of Security in Nineteenth-Century Lesotho*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Elias, Norbert. *The Civilizing Process*. Oxford: Blackwell, 2000 [1939].
- Elias, Norbert, "Problems of Involvement and Detachment." *British Journal of Sociology* 7, 3 (1956): 226-252.
- Elkins, James. *Visual Literacy*. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- Ellis, Markman. *The Politics of Sensibility: Race, Gender, and Commerce in the Sentimental Novel*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Emerson, Jan Swango. "Harmony, Hierarchy, and the Senses in the Vision of Tundal." In *Imagining Heaven in the Middle Ages: A Book of Essays*, edited by Jan Emerson and Hugh Feiss, 3-46. New York: Garland Pub, 2000.
- Empson, William. *The Structure of Complex Words*. London: Penguin Books, 1995 [1951].
- Engen, Trygg. *Odor, Sensation, and Memory*. New York: Praeger, 1991.
- Epstein, James. *Scandal of Colonial Rule: Power and Subversion in the British Atlantic during the Age of Revolution*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.

- Erben, Patrick. *A Harmony of the Spirits: Translation and the Language of Community in Early Pennsylvania*. Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia, by the University of North Carolina Press, 2012.
- Erickson, Peter. "Representations of Blacks and Blackness in the Renaissance." *Criticism* 35, 4 (1993): 499-528.
- Eriksson, Gunnar. "Linnaeus the Botanist." In *Linnaeus, the Man and His Work*, edited by Tore Frängsmyr, Sten Lindroth, Gunnar Eriksson, and Gunnar Broberg, 63-109. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983.
- Esty, J. D. "Excremental Postcolonialism." *Contemporary Literature* 40, 1 (1999): 22-59.
- Eustace, Nicole. *Passion Is the Gale: Emotion, Power, and the Coming of the American Revolution*. Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia by University of North Carolina Press, 2008.
- Evans, Jennifer. "Female Barrenness, Bodily Access and Aromatic Treatments in Seventeenth-Century England." *Historical Research* 87, 237 (2014): 423-443.
- Evans, Suzanne. "The Scent of a Martyr." *Numen* 49, 2 (2002): 193-211.
- Evans, William McKee. "From the Land of Canaan to the Land of Guinea: The Strange Odyssey of the 'Sons of Ham'." *The American Historical Review* 85, 1 (1980): 78-102.
- Fallon, April, Paul Rozin, and Patricia Pliner. "The Child's Conception of Food: The Development of Food Rejections with Special Reference to Disgust and Contamination Sensitivity." *Child Development* 55, 2 (1984): 566-575.

- Falola, Toyin. *The Power of African Cultures*. Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2008.
- Fanon, Frantz. *Black Skin, White Masks*. New York: Grove Press, 1967.
- Farge, William. "Adapting Language to Culture: Translation Projects of the Jesuit Missions in Japan and China." In *Cross-Cultural History and the Domestication of Otherness*, edited by Michal Jan Rozbicki and George Ndege, 67-81. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012.
- Farina, Lara. "Wondrous Skins and Tactile Affection: The Blemmye's Touch." In *Reading Skin in Medieval Literature and Culture*, edited by Katie Walter, 11-28. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.
- Febvre, Lucien Paul Victor. *The Problem of Unbelief in the Sixteenth Century, the Religion of Rabelais*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1982 [1942].
- Febvre, Lucien Paul Victor, and Henri-Jean Martin. *The Coming of the Book: The Impact of Printing 1450-1800*. London: N. L. B, 1976 [1958].
- Feerick, Jean. *Strangers in Blood: Relocating Race in the Renaissance*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2010.
- Feerick, Jean. "Botanical Shakespeares: The Racial Logic of Plant Life in *Titus Andronicus*." *South Central Review* 26, 1-2 (2009): 82-102.
- Fenlon, Iain. "Piazza San Marco: Theatre of the Senses, Market Place of the World." In *Religion and the Senses in Early Modern Europe*, edited by Wietse de Boer and Christine Göttler, 331-361. Leiden: Brill, 2013.
- Fergus, Claudius. "'Dread of Insurrection': Abolitionism, Security, and Labor in Britain's West Indian Colonies, 1760-1823." *WMQ* 66, 4 (2009): 757-780.

- Fernandez, Eduardo. "Jesuits in the U.S. Southwest during the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries: Agents and Chroniclers of Cross-Cultural Ministry and History." In *Cross-Cultural History and the Domestication of Otherness*, edited by Michal Jan Rozbicki and George Ndege, 83-102. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012.
- Fett, Sharla. *Working Cures: Healing, Health, and Power on Southern Slave Plantations*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2002.
- Fiedler, Leslie. *The Stranger in Shakespeare*. New York: Stein and Day, 1972.
- Fiering, Norman. "Irresistible Compassion: An Aspect of Eighteenth-Century Sympathy and Humanitarianism." *Journal of the History of Ideas* 37, 2 (1976): 195-218.
- Figal, Sara. "The Caucasian Slave Race: Beautiful Circassians and the Hybrid Origin of European Identity." In *Reproduction, Race, and Gender in Philosophy and the Early Life Sciences*, edited by Susanne Lettow, 163-186. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2014.
- Filsinger, Erik, and Richard Fabes. "Odor Communication, Pheromones, and Human Families." *Journal of Marriage and the Family* 47, 2 (1985): 349-359.
- Finch, Martha. "'Civilized' Bodies and the 'Savage' Environment of Early New Plymouth." In *A Centre of Wonders: The Body in Early America*, edited by Janet Moore Lindman and Michele Lise Tarter, 43-59. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2001.
- Fineman, Joel. *Shakespeare's Perjured Eye: The Invention of Poetic Subjectivity in the Sonnets*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986.
- Fischer, Sibylle. *Modernity Disavowed: Haiti and the Cultures of Slavery in the Age of Revolution*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2004.

- Fisher, Linford. *The Indian Great Awakening: Religion and the Shaping of Native Cultures in Early America*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Fitz, Caitlin. *Our Sister Republics: The United States in an Age of American Revolutions*. New York: Liveright Publishing Corporation, 2016.
- Fitzgerald, G. J., and G. M. Petrick. "In Good Taste: Rethinking American History with Our Palates." *Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 392-404.
- Fleischer, Mary. "Incense and Decadents; Symbolists Theatre's Use of Scent." In *The Senses in Performance*, edited by Sally Banes and André Lepecki, 105-114. New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Fleissner, Robert. *Shakespeare and Africa: The Dark Lady of His Sonnets Revamped and Other Africa-Related Associations*. Philadelphia: Xlibris, 2005.
- Fliegelman, Jay. *Declaring Independence: Jefferson, Natural Language & the Culture of Performance*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1993.
- Flint, Karen Elizabeth, *Healing Traditions: African Medicine, Cultural Exchange, and Competition in South Africa, 1820-1948*. Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 2008.
- Flint, Valerie. *The Imaginative Landscape of Christopher Columbus*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1992.
- Floyd-Wilson, Mary. *English Ethnicity and Race in Early Modern Drama*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2003.
- Floyd-Wilson, Mary. "Temperature, Temperance, and Racial Difference in Ben Jonson's 'The Masque of Blackness'." *English Literary Renaissance* 28, 2 (1998): 183-209.
- Fontana, Michela, and Paul Metcalfe. *Matteo Ricci: A Jesuit in the Ming Court*. Lanham,

- Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2011.
- Fontanille, Jacques. "Olfactory Syntax and Value-Systems: The Treatment of Smell in Celine's *Journey to the End of the Night*." In *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, edited by Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham, 37-56. Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003.
- Ford, Charles, Thomas Cummins, Rosalie Smith McCrea, and Helen Weston. "The Slave Colonies." In Book III of *Volume III of The Image of the Black in Western Art*, edited by David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen Dalton, 241-308. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010.
- Ford, Jr., Lacy. "Reconfiguring the Old South: 'Solving' the Problem of Slavery, 1787-1838." *Journal of American History* 95 (2008): 95-122.
- Foss, Michael. *Undreamed Shores: England's Wasted Empire in America*. New York: Scribner, 1975.
- Foster, Helen Bradley. *New Raiments of Self: African American Clothing in the Antebellum South*. Oxford: Berg, 1997.
- Foucault, Michel. *The Birth of Biopolitics: Lectures at the Collège de France, 1978-79*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.
- Foucault, Michel. *Discipline and Punishment: The Birth of the Prison*. New York: Vintage, 2012 [1975].
- Foucault, Michel. *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1971.
- Foucault, Michel, Henri-Paul Fruchaud, Daniele Lorenzini, Laura Cremonesi, Arnold Davidson, Orazio Irrera, and Martina Tazzioli. *About the Beginning of the*

- Hermeneutics of the Self: Lectures at Dartmouth College, 1980*. Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016.
- Foyster, Elizabeth. "Sensory Experiences; Smells, Sounds, and Touch." In *A History of Everyday Life in Scotland 1600 to 1800*, edited by Elizabeth Foyster and Christopher Whatley, 217-233. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2010.
- Fox, Christopher. "Introduction: How to Prepare a Noble Savage: The Spectacle of Human Science." In *Inventing Human Science: Eighteenth-Century Domains*, edited by Christopher Fox, Roy Porter, and Robert Wokler, 1-30. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995.
- Fox, Cora. "Isabella Whitney's Nosegay and the Smell of Women's Writing." *Senses and Society* 5, 1 (2010): 131-143.
- Franzini, Elio "Rendering the Sensory World Semantic." In *Art and the Senses*, edited by Francesca Bacci and David Melcher, 115-132. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Freedman, Paul. *Out of the East: Spices and the Medieval Imagination*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2008.
- Freeman, Arthur, and Janet Ing Freeman. *John Payne Collier: Scholarship and Forgery in the Nineteenth Century*. London: Yale University Press, 2004.
- Freidel, David, Linda Schele, and Joy Parker. *Maya Cosmos: Three Thousand Years on the Shaman's Path*. New York: W. Morrow, 1993.
- Freud, Sigmund. *Civilization and Its Discontents*. New York: Norton, 1961 [1930].
- Freyre, Gilberto. *The Masters and the Slaves: a Study in the Development of Brazilian Civilization*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986 [1933].

- Frick, George Frederick, and Raymond Phineas Stearns. *Mark Catesby: the Colonial Audubon*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1961.
- Friedman, Emily. *Reading Smell in Eighteenth-Century Fiction*. Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press; Lanham, Maryland, 2016.
- Fryer, Peter. *Staying Power: The History of Black People in Britain*. London: Pluto Press, 1984.
- Gabaccia, Donna. *We Are What We Eat: Ethnic Food and the Making of Americans*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1998.
- Gallagher, Lowell, and Shankar Raman. "Introduction." In *Knowing Shakespeare: Senses, Embodiment and Cognition*, edited by Lowell Gallagher and Shankar Raman, 1-29. Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Gallop, Jane. *Thinking Through the Body*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1988.
- Galvin, Mary. "Decoctions for Carolinians: The Creation of a Creole Medicine Chest in Colonial South Carolina." In *Creolization in the Americas*, edited by David Buisseret and Steven Reinhardt, 63-98. College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 2000.
- Games, Alison. "Atlantic History: Definitions, Challenges, and Opportunities." *American Historical Review* 111 (June, 2006): 741-757.
- Gaskill, Malcolm. *Between Two Worlds: How the English Became Americans*. New York: Basic Books, 2014.
- Gaskill, Malcolm. *Witchfinders: A Seventeenth-Century English Tragedy*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2005.
- Gavrilyuk, Paul, and Sarah Coakley. "Introduction." In *The Spiritual Senses: Perceiving*

- God in Western Christianity*, edited by Paul Gavrilyuk and Sarah Coakley, 1-19. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Gay, Peter. *Education of the Senses*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1984.
- Gee, Sophie. *Making Waste: Leftovers and the Eighteenth-Century Imagination*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2010.
- Geertz, Clifford. *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books, 1973.
- Gell, Alfred. "Magic, Perfume, Dream." In *Symbols and Sentiments*, edited by Alfred Gell and Gilbert Lewis, 25-38. London: Academic Press, 1977.
- Gellner, Ernest. *Relativism and the Social Sciences*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.
- Genders, Roy. *Scented Flora of the World*. London: Hale, 1994.
- Genovese, Eugene. *The World the Slaveholders Made; Two Essays in Interpretation*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1969.
- Gent, Lucy, and Nigel Llewellyn, "Introduction." In *Renaissance Bodies: The Human Figure in English Culture, c. 1540-1660*, edited by Lucy Gent and Nigel Llewellyn, 1-10. London: Reaktion Books, 1990.
- Gentilcore, David. "Purging Filth: Plague and Responses to it in Rome, 1656-7." In *Rome, Pollution, and Propriety: Dirt, Disease, and Hygiene in the Eternal City from Antiquity to Modernity*, edited by Mark Bradley and Kenneth Stow, 153-168. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Gerbi, Antonello. *Nature in the New World: From Christopher Columbus to Gonzalo Fernandez De Oviedo*. Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1985.
- Gerbi, Antonello. *The Dispute of the New World: The History of a Polemic, 1750-1900*.

- Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1973.
- Gerzina, Gretchen. *Black London: Life before Emancipation*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1995.
- Geurts, Kathryn Linn. *Culture and the Senses: Bodily Ways of Knowing in an African Community*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002.
- Giannetti, Laura. "Of Eels and Pears: A Sixteenth-Century Debate on Taste, Temperance, and the Pleasures of the Senses." In *Religion and the Senses in Early Modern Europe*, edited by Wietse de Boer and Christine Göttler, 289-305. Leiden: Brill, 2013.
- Gibbs, Jenna. *Performing the Temple of Liberty: Slavery, Theater, and Popular Culture in London and Philadelphia, 1760-1850*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2014.
- Gibson, James. *The Senses Considered as Perpetual Systems*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1966.
- Gibson, Marion. *Witchcraft and Society in England and America, 1550-1750*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2003.
- Gikandi, Simon. *Slavery and the Culture of Taste*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2011.
- Gikandi, Simon. *Maps of Englishness: Writing Identity in the Culture of Colonialism*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1996.
- Gilbert, Avery. *What the Nose Knows: The Science of Scent in Everyday Life*. New York: Crown Publishers, 2008.
- Gillies, John. *Shakespeare and the Geography of Difference*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.

- Gilman, Sander. *Inscribing the Other*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1991.
- Gilroy, Paul. *Postcolonial Melancholia*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2005.
- Ginzburg, Carlo. *The Night Battles: Witchcraft & Agrarian Cults in the Sixteenth & Seventeenth Centuries*. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins, 1983.
- Ginzburg, Carlo. *The Cheese and the Worms: The Cosmos of a Sixteenth-Century Miller*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1980.
- Ginzburg, Carlo, and Raymond Rosenthal. *Ecstasies: Deciphering the Witches' Sabbath*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1991.
- Glaser, Gabrielle. *The Nose: A Profile of Sex, Beauty, and Survival*. New York: Atria Books, 2002.
- Godbeer, Richard. "Eroticizing the Middle Ground: Anglo-Indian Sexual Relations along the Eighteenth Century Frontier." In *Sex, Love, Race: Crossing Boundaries in North American History*, edited by Martha Elizabeth Hodes, 91-111. New York: New York University Press, 1999.
- Godbeer, Richard. *The Devil's Dominion: Magic and Religion in Early New England*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.
- Goddard, P. A. "Augustine and the Amerindian in Seventeenth-Century New France." *Church History* 67, 4 (1998): 662-681.
- Goetz, Rebecca. *The Baptism of Early Virginia: How Christianity Created Race*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2012.
- Goldenberg, David. *The Curse of Ham: Race and Slavery in Early Judaism, Christianity, and Islam*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2003.
- Goldberg, David Theo. *The Racial State*. Malden, Mass.: Blackwell Publishers, 2002.

- Goldberg, David Theo. *Racist Culture: Philosophy and the Politics of Meaning*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1993.
- Gomel, Elana. "The Plague of Utopias: Pestilence and the Apocalyptic Body." *Twentieth-Century Literature* 46, 4 (2000): 405-433.
- Gomez, Michael. *Reversing Sail: A History of the African Diaspora*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- Gomez, Michael. "African Identity and Slavery in the Americas." *Radical History Review* 75 (1999): 111-120.
- Gomez, Michael. *Exchanging Our Country Marks: The Transformation of African Identities in the Colonial and Antebellum South*. Chapel Hill: UNC, 1998.
- Goodich, Michael. "Sexuality, Family, and the Supernatural in the Fourteenth Century." *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 4, 4 (1994): 493-516.
- Goodman, Glenda. "'But They Differ from Us in Sound': Indian Psalmody and the Soundscape of Colonialism, 1651-75." *WMQ* 69, 4 (2012): 793-822.
- Goodman, Jordan. *Tobacco in History: The Cultures of Dependence*. New York: Routledge, 2016.
- Goodrick-Clarke, Nicholas. *The Western Esoteric Traditions: A Historical Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Goody, Jack. "The Anthropology of the Senses and Sensations." *La Ricerca Folklorica* 45 (2002): 17-28.
- Gose, Peter. "Converting the Ancestors: Indirect Rule, Settlement Consolidation, and the Struggle over Burial in Colonial Peru, 1532-1614." In *Conversion: Old Worlds and New*, edited by Kenneth Mills and Anthony Grafton, 140-174. Rochester, NY:

- University of Rochester Press, 2003.
- Gottlieb, Alma. "Witches, Kings, and the Sacrifice of Identity or The Power of Paradox and the Paradox of Power among the Beng of Ivory Coast." In *Creativity of Power: Cosmology and Action in African Societies*, edited by W. Arens and Ivan Karp, 245-272. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1989.
- Goubert, Jean-Pierre. *The Conquest of Water: The Advent of Health in the Industrial Age*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1989.
- Gould, Stephen Jay. *The Mismeasure of Man*. New York: W. W. Norton, 2008.
- Gould, Stephen Jay. *The Flamingo's Smile: Reflections in Natural History*. New York: Norton, 1985.
- Gowing, Laura. *Common Bodies: Women, Touch, and Power in Seventeenth-Century England*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003.
- Gragg, Larry Dale. *Englishmen Transplanted: The English Colonization of Barbados, 1627-1660*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Gramsci, Antonio. *Prison Notebooks. Volume 1*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2010.
- Grandin, Greg. *The Blood of Guatemala: A History of Race and Nation*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000.
- Grant, Edward. *The Foundations of Modern Science in the Middle Ages: Their Religious, Institutional, and Intellectual Contexts*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Greene, Roland Arthur. *Five Words: Critical Semantics in the Age of Shakespeare and Cervantes*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013.

- Greenblatt, Stephen. *Renaissance Self-Fashioning: From More to Shakespeare*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005.
- Greenblatt, Stephen. *Will in the World: How Shakespeare Became Shakespeare*. New York: W. W. Norton, 2004.
- Greenblatt, Stephen. *Marvelous Possessions: The Wonder of the New World*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2003.
- Greenblatt, Stephen. *Hamlet in Purgatory*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2002.
- Greenblatt, Stephen. "The Touch of the Real." *Representations* 59, 1 (1997): 14-29.
- Greenblatt, Stephen. *Shakespearean Negotiations: The Circulation of Social Energy in Renaissance England*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988.
- Greenblatt, Stephen. "Murdering Peasants: Status, Genre, and the Representation of Rebellion." *Representations* 1 (1983): 1-29.
- Greenblatt, Stephen. "Filthy Rites." *Daedalus* 111, 3 (1982): 1-16.
- Greenblatt, Stephen. "Learning to Curse: Aspects of Linguistic Colonialism in the Sixteenth Century." In *First Images of America: The Impact of the New World on the Old*, edited by Fredi Chiappelli, 561-580. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976.
- Greene, Jack. "Changing Identity in the British Caribbean: Barbados as a Case Study." In *Colonial Identity in the Atlantic World, 1500-1800*, edited by Nicholas Canny and Anthony Pagden, 213-266. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1987.
- Greene Jack, and Philip Morgan. *Atlantic History: A Critical Appraisal*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.

- Greene, Roland. *Unrequited Conquests: Love and Empire in the Colonial Americas*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999.
- Greer, Allan. *Mohawk Saint: Catherine Tekakwitha and the Jesuits*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- Greer, Allan. "Conversion and Ideology: Iroquois Christianity in Seventeenth-Century New France." In *Conversion: Old Worlds and New*, edited by Kenneth Mills and Anthony Grafton, 175-198. Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2003.
- Greer, Allan. "Iroquois Virgin: The Story of Catherine Tekakwitha in New France and New Spain." In *Colonial Saints: Discovering the Holy in the Americas, 1500-1800*, edited by Allan Greer and Jodi Bilinkoff, 235-250. New York: Routledge, 2003.
- Greer, Allan. *The Jesuit Relations: Natives and Missionaries in Seventeenth-Century North America*. Boston: Bedford/St. Martin's, 2000.
- Greer, Allan. *The People of New France*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997.
- Greig, Hannah. "'All Together and All Distinct': Public Sociability and Social Exclusivity in London's Pleasure Gardens, Ca. 1740-1800." *Journal of British Studies* 51, 1 (2012): 50-75.
- Gribbin, Mary, and John Gribbin. *Flower Hunters*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Griffith, Lawrence, and Barbara Temple Lombardi. *Flowers and Herbs of Early America*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2008.
- Griffiths, Richard. "From Sexual Arousal to Religious Rapture: The Importance of the Sense of Smell in the Writings of Zola and Huysmans." In *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, edited by Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham, 263-292. Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003.

- Gronim, Sara Stidstone. *Everyday Nature: Knowledge of the Natural World in Colonial New York*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2007.
- Gronim, Sara Stidstone. "Geography and Persuasion: Maps in British Colonial New York." *WMQ* 58, 2 (2001): 373-402.
- Gross, Ariela. "Beyond Black and White: Cultural Approaches to Race and Slavery." *Columbia Law Review* 101, 3 (2001): 640-690.
- Gross, Ariela. *Double Character: Slavery and Mastery in the Antebellum Southern Courtroom*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2000.
- Gross, Kenneth. *Shakespeare's Noise*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001.
- Grove, Richard. *Green Imperialism: Colonial Expansion, Tropical Island Edens, and the Origins of Environmentalism, 1600-1860*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- Grubb, Eileen MacGrath. "Attitudes towards Black Africans in Imperial Spain." *Legon Journal of the Humanities* 1 (1974): 68-90.
- Gruzinski, Serge, and Eileen Corrigan. *The Conquest of Mexico: the Incorporation of Indian Societies into the Western World, 16th-18th Centuries*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 1993.
- Guasco, Michael. *Slaves and Englishmen: Human Bondage in the Early Modern Atlantic World*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014.
- Gurr, Jens Martin. "The Senses and Human Nature in a Political Reading of *Paradise Lost*." In *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, edited by Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer, 177-195. Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016.

- Gustafson, Sandra. *Eloquence Is Power: Oratory and Performance in Early America*. Chapel Hill, NC: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture by the University of North Carolina Press, 2000.
- Guyatt, Nicholas. *Bind Us Apart: How Enlightened Americans Invented Racial Segregation*. New York: Basic, 2016.
- Habermas, Jürgen. *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: an Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society*. Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 1989.
- Habib, Imtiaz. *Black Lives in the English Archives, 1500-1677: Imprints of the Invisible*. Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2008.
- Hacking, Ian. "'Biopower and the Avalanche of Printed Numbers.'" In *Biopower: Foucault and Beyond*, edited by Vernon Cisney and Nicolae Morar, 65-81. Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016.
- Hacking, Ian. *The Social Construction of What?* Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1999.
- Hair, P. E. H. "Attitudes to Africans in English Primary Sources on Guinea Up to 1650." *History in Africa* 26 (1999): 43-68.
- Hair, P. E. H. "Heretics, Slaves and Witches-As Seen by Guinea Jesuits C. 1610." *Journal of Religion in Africa* 28, 2 (1998): 131-144.
- Hall, Edward. *The Hidden Dimension*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1966.
- Hall, Gwendolyn Midlo. *Slavery and African Ethnicities in the Americas: Restoring the Links*. Chapel Hill: UNC Press, 2005.
- Hall, Joseph. *Zamumo's Gifts: Indian-European Exchange in the Colonial Southeast*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009.

Hall, Kim. ““These bastard signs of fair’: Literary Whiteness in Shakespeare’s Sonnets.”

In *Shakespeare and Race*, edited by Catherine Alexander and Stanley Wells, 64-83. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000.

Hall, Kim. ““Troubling doubles’: Apes, Africans, and Blackface in Mr. Moore’s Revels.”

In *Race, Ethnicity, and Power in the Renaissance*, edited by Joyce Green MacDonald, 120-144. Madison, NJ: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1997.

Hall, Kim. *Things of Darkness: Economies of Race and Gender in Early Modern England*.

Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1995.

Hall, Kim. ““I Rather Would Wish to be a Black-Moor’: Beauty, Race, and Rank in Lady

Mary Wroth’s *Urania*.” In *Women, "Race," and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, edited by Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker, 178-194. London: Routledge, 1994.

Hallett, Nicky. *The Senses in Religious Communities, 1600-1800: Early Modern 'Convents of Pleasure'*. Farnham, Surrey, England: Ashgate, 2013.

Halliday, Stephen. *The Great Stink of London: Sir Joseph Bazalgette and the Cleansing of the Victorian Metropolis*. Stroud: Sutton, 2001.

Hallock, Thomas. *From the Fallen Tree: Frontier Narratives, Environmental Politics and the Roots of a National Pastoral, 1749-1826*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2003.

Hämäläinen, Pekka. *The Comanche Empire*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008.

Hamilakis, Yannis. “Eleven Theses on the Archaeology of the Senses.” In *Making Senses of the Past: Toward a Sensory Archaeology*, edited by Jo Day, 409-420. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2013.

- Hamlin, William. *The Image of America in Montaigne, Spenser and Shakespeare: Renaissance Ethnography and Literary Reflection*. New York: St. Martin's, 1995.
- Hammond, Ron. "The Nose and Stephanger's Elbow." In *Nose Book: Representations of the Nose in Literature and the Arts*, edited by Victoria De Rijke, Lene Oestermarck-Johansen, and Helen Thomas, 11-48. London: Middlesex University Press, 2000.
- Handler, Jerome. "Slave Medicine and Obeah in Barbados, Circa 1650 to 1834." *NWIG: New West Indian Guide* 74, 1-2 (2000): 57-90.
- Handler, Jerome, and Kenneth Bilby. *Enacting Power: The Criminalization of Obeah in the Anglophone Caribbean, 1760-2011*. Kingston, Jamaica: University of the West Indies Press, 2012.
- Hanke, Lewis. *Aristotle and the American Indians: A Study in Race Prejudice in the Modern World*. Chicago: H. Regnery Co., 1959.
- Hannaford, Ivan. *Race: The History of an Idea in the West*. Washington, D. C.: Woodrow Wilson Center Press, 1996.
- Hanson, Neil. *The Great Fire of London in That Apocalyptic Year, 1666*. Hoboken, New Jersey: J. Wiley, 2002.
- Harding, Rachel. *A Refuge in Thunder: Candomblé and Alternative Spaces of Blackness*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2000.
- Harkness, Deborah. "'Strange' Ideas and 'English' Knowledge: Natural Science and Exchange in Elizabethan London." In *Merchants & Marvels: Commerce, Science and Art in Early Modern Europe*, edited by Pamela Smith and Paula Findlen, 137-160. New York, NY: Routledge, 2002.
- Harman, Graham. *Dante's Broken Hammer*. London: Repeater, 2016.

- Harmes, Marcus. "The Devil and Bishops in Post-Reformation England." In *Supernatural and Secular Power in Early Modern England*, edited by Marcus Harmes and Victoria Bladen, 185-206. Farnham, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2015.
- Harper, Roland, E. C. Bate-Smith, and D. G. Land. *Odour Description and Odour Classification: A Multidisciplinary Examination*. New York: American Elsevier Pub. Co., 1968.
- Harrán, Don. "The Jewish Nose in Early Modern Art and Music." *Renaissance Studies* 28, 1 (2014): 50-70.
- Harris, Jonathan Gil. "Introduction: Forms of Indography." In *Indography: Writing the "Indian" in Early Modern England*, edited by Jonathan Gil Harris, 1-22. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012.
- Harris, Jonathan Gil. "Sick Ethnography: Recording the Indian and the Ill English Body." In *Indography: Writing the "Indian" in Early Modern England*, edited by Jonathan Gil-Harris, 133-150. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012.
- Harris, Jonathan Gil. *Untimely Matter in the Time of Shakespeare*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009.
- Harris, Jonathan Gil. "Usurers of Color: The Taint of Jewish Transnationality in Mercantilist Literature and the Merchant of Venice." In *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, edited by Helen Ostovich, Mary Silcox, and Graham Roebuck, 124-138. Newark: Delaware University Press, 2008.
- Harris, Jonathan Gil. "The Smell of Macbeth." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 58, 4 (2007): 465-486.
- Harris, Jonathan Gil. *Foreign Bodies and the Body Politic: Discourses of Social Pathology*

- in Early Modern England*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- Harris, Jonathan Gil. "This is Not a Pipe: Water Supply, Incontinent Sources, and the Leaky Body Politic." In *Enclosure Acts: Sexuality, Property, and Culture in Early Modern England*, edited by Richard Burt and John Michael Archer, 203-229. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994.
- Harris, Stephen. "An Overview of Race and Ethnicity in Pre-Norman England." *Literature Compass* 5, 4 (2008): 740-754.
- Harrison, Renee. *Enslaved Women and the Art of Resistance in Antebellum America*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009.
- Harrod, Howard. *The Animals Came Dancing: Native American Sacred Ecology and Animal Kinship*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2000.
- Hartman, Geoffrey. *The Fateful Question of Culture*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1997.
- Hartman, Saidiya. *Scenes of Subjection: Terror, Slavery, and Self-Making in Nineteenth-Century America*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Harvey, E. Ruth. *The Inward Wits: Psychological Theory in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance*. London: Warburg Institute, 1975.
- Harvey, Elizabeth. *Sensible Flesh: On Touch in Early Modern Culture*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003.
- Harvey, Susan Ashbrook. *Scenting Salvation: Ancient Christianity and the Olfactory Imagination*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006.
- Hawthorne, Walter. *From Africa to Brazil: Culture, Identity, and an Atlantic Slave Trade, 1600-1800*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.

- Hayek, F. A. *The Sensory Order: An Inquiry into the Foundations of Theoretical Psychology*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1952.
- Haynes, Stephen. *Noah's Curse: The Biblical Justification of American Slavery*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Healy, George. "The French Jesuits and the Idea of the Noble Savage." *WMQ* 15, 2 (1958):144-167.
- Heffernan, Julián Jiménez. *Shakespeare's Extremes: Wild Man, Monster, Beast*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015.
- Hemphill, C. Dallett. *Bowing to Necessities: A History of Manners in America, 1620-1860*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Hendricks, Margo. "'Obscured by Dreams': Race, Empire, and Shakespeare's *A Midsummer Night's Dream*." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 47, 1 (1996): 37-60.
- Henkin, David. *City Reading: Written Words and Public Spaces in Antebellum New York*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1998.
- Henshaw, Victoria. *Urban Smellscapes: Understanding and Designing City Smell Environments*. New York: Routledge/Taylor & Francis Group, 2014.
- Herman, Bernard. "The Poetics of Urban Space." In *Material Culture in Anglo-America: Regional Identity and Urbanity in the Tidewater, Lowcountry, and Caribbean*, edited by David Shields, 191-201. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2009.
- Herrnstein, Richard, and Charles Murray. *The Bell Curve: Intelligence and Class Structure in American Life*. New York: Free Press, 1994.
- Hertel, Ralf. "The Senses in Literature: From the Modernist Shock of Sensation to

- Postcolonial and Virtual Voices.” In *Volume VI of A Cultural History of the Senses*, edited by Constance Classen and David Howes, 173-194. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.
- Herz, Rachel. *The Scent of Desire: Discovering Our Enigmatic Sense of Smell*. New York: William Morrow, 2007.
- Herz, Rachel. “I Know What I Like; Understanding Odor Preferences.” In *The Smell Culture Reader*, edited by Jim Drobnick, 193-203. Oxford: Berg, 2006.
- Herzog, Tamar. *Frontiers of Possession: Spain and Portugal in Europe and the Americas*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2015.
- Heuman, Gad. *"The Killing Time": The Morant Bay Rebellion in Jamaica*. Knoxville, Tenn.: University of Tennessee Press, 1994.
- Higdon, David. *Wandering into Brave New World*. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2013.
- Higginbotham, Evelyn Brooks. "African-American Women's History and the Metalanguage of Race." *Signs* 17, 2 (1993): 251-274.
- Higgins, Hannah. *Fluxus Experience*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002.
- Hill, Errol. *The Jamaican Stage, 1655-1900: Profile of a Colonial Theatre*. Amherst, Mass.: University of Massachusetts Press, 1992.
- Hill, Tracey. *Pageantry and Power: A Cultural History of the Early Modern Lord Mayor's Show, 1585-1639*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2010.
- Hillman, David. “Visceral Knowledge.” In *The Body in Parts: Fantasies of Corporeality in Early Modern Europe*, edited by David Hillman and Carla Mazzio, 81-106. New York: Routledge, 1997.
- Hillman, David, and Carla Mazzio. “Introduction: Individual Parts.” In *The Body in Parts:*

- Fantasies of Corporeality in Early Modern Europe*, edited by David Hillman and Carla Mazzio, xi-xxix. New York: Routledge, 1997.
- Hiltner, Ken. “‘Belch’s Fire and Rowling Smoke’: Air Pollution in *Paradise Lost*.” In *Milton, Rights and Liberties*, edited by Christophe Tournu, 293-302. Bern: Lang, 2007.
- Hinderaker, Eric, and Peter Mancall. *At The Edge of Empire: the Backcountry in British North America*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2003.
- Hinderaker, Eric, and Rebecca Horn. "Territorial Crossings: Histories and Historiographies of the Early Americas." *WMQ* 67, 3 (2010): 395-432.
- Hindley, Katherine. “Sight and Understanding: Visual Imagery as Metaphor in the Old English Boethius and Soliloquies” In *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, edited by Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer, 21-35. Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016.
- Hodgen, Margaret. *Early Anthropology in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1964.
- Hoenselaars, A. J. *Images of Englishmen and Foreigners in the Drama of Shakespeare and His Contemporaries: A Study of Stage Characters and National Identity in English Renaissance Drama, 1558-1642*. Rutherford, NJ: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1992.
- Hoff, Joan. “Gender as a Postmodern Category of Paralysis.” *Women's History Review* 3, 2 (1994): 149-168.
- Hoffer, Peter Charles. *Sensory Worlds in Early America*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2003.

- Hoffmann, Beata. "Scent in Science and Culture." *History of the Human Sciences* 26, 5 (2013): 31-47.
- Holmberg, Karen. "The Sound of Sulfur and the Smell of Lightning." In *Making Senses of the Past: Toward a Sensory Archaeology*, edited by Jo Day, 49-68. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2013.
- Hopson, Janet. *Scent Signals: The Silent Language of Sex*. New York: Morrow, 1979.
- Horkheimer, Max, Theodor Adorno, and Gunzelin Schmid Noerr. *Dialectic of Enlightenment: Philosophical Fragments*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 2002.
- Hornsby, Stephen. *British Atlantic, American Frontier: Spaces of Power in Early Modern British America*. Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2005.
- Houlberg, Marilyn. "Magique Marasa: The Ritual Cosmos of the Twins and other Sacred Children." In *Fragments of Bone: Neo-African Religions in a New World*, edited by Patrick Bellegarde-Smith, 13-31. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2005.
- Houston, Stephen, David Stuart, and Karl Taube. *The Memory of Bones: Body, Being, and Experience among the Classic Maya*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2006.
- Howes, David. "Can These Dry Bones Live? An Anthropological Approach to the History of the Senses." *Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 119-128.
- Howes, David. "Charting the Sensorial Revolution." *Senses and Society* 1, 1 (2006): 113-128
- Howes, David. "Introduction: Empire of the Senses." In *Empire of the Senses: The Sensual Culture Reader*, edited by David Howes, 1-20. Oxford: Berg, 2005.
- Howes, David. "Freud's Nose: The Repression of Nasality and the Origin of

- Psychoanalytical Theory.” In *Nose Book: Representations of the Nose in Literature and the Arts*, edited by Victoria De Rijke, Lene Oestermarck-Johansen, and Helen Thomas, 265-282. London: Middlesex University Press, 2000.
- Howes, David. “Sensorial Anthropology.” In *The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses*, edited by David Howes, 167-191. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991.
- Howes, David. “Olfaction and Transition: an Essay on the Ritual Uses of Smell.” *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology* 24, 3 (1987): 398-416.
- Howes, David, and Constance Classen. *Ways of Sensing: Understanding the Senses in Society*. New York: Routledge, 2014.
- Hoy, Suellen. *Chasing Dirt: The American Pursuit of Cleanliness*. Bridgewater, NJ: Replica Books, 2000.
- Hsia, R. Po-chia. *A Jesuit in the Forbidden City: Matteo Ricci, 1552-1610*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Hudson, Nicholas. "From 'Nation' to 'Race': The Origin of Racial Classification in Eighteenth-Century Thought." *Eighteenth-Century Studies* 29, 3 (1996): 247-264.
- Hulme, Peter. *Colonial Encounters: Europe and the Native Caribbean: 1492-1797*. New York: Routledge, 1992.
- Hume, Laura Hunt. *Strangers Settled Here Amongst Us: Policies, Perceptions, and the Presence of Aliens in Elizabethan England*. London: Routledge, 2003.
- Hunt, John Dixon. *Garden and Grove: The Italian Renaissance Garden in the English Imagination, 1600-1750*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1996.
- Hurley, Andrew. “Busby’s Stink Boat and the Regulation of Nuisance Trades, 1865-1918.”

- In *Common Fields: An Environmental History of St. Louis*, edited by Andrew Hurley, 145-162. St. Louis: Missouri Historical Society Press, 1997.
- Hyde, Alan. "Offensive Bodies." In *The Smell Culture Reader*, edited by Jim Drobnick, 53-58. Oxford: Berg, 2006.
- Iannini, Christopher. *Fatal Revolutions: Natural History, West Indian Slavery, and the Routes of American Literature*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2012.
- Illich, Ivan. "'The Dirt of Cities, the Aura of Cities, the Smell of the Dead, Utopia in the Odorless City'." In *The Cities Culture Reader*, edited by Malcolm Miles, Iain Borden, and Tim Hall, 355-359. London: Routledge, 2000.
- Inglis, David. "Sewers and Sensibilities: the Bourgeois Faecal Experience in the Nineteenth-Century City." In *The City and the Senses: Urban Culture Since 1500*, edited by Alexander Cowan and Jill Steward, 105-130. Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2007.
- Inglis, David. *A Sociological History of Excretory Experience: Defecatory Manners and Toiletry Technologies*. Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 2001.
- Irmscher, Christoph. *The Poetics of Natural History: From John Bartram to William James*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1999.
- Isaac, Benjamin. *The Invention of Racism in Classical Antiquity*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2004.
- Israel, Jonathan. *Radical Enlightenment: Philosophy and the Making of Modernity, 1650-1750*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- Iyengar, Sujata. *Shades of Difference: Mythologies of Skin Color in Early Modern*

- England*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005.
- Jackson, Will, and Emily Manktelow. "Introduction: Thinking With Deviance." In *Subverting Empire: Deviance and Disorder in the British Colonial World*, edited by Will Jackson and Emily Manktelow, 1-21. Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire; New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015.
- Jacob, Margaret. *The Radical Enlightenment: Pantheists, Freemasons, and Republicans*. Lafayette, LA: Cornerstone Book, 2006.
- Jacobson, Matthew Frye. *Whiteness of a Different Color: European Immigrants and the Alchemy of Race*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1998.
- Jaffee, David. *A New Nation of Goods: The Material Culture of Early America*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010.
- Jameson, Fredric. *The Ancients and the Postmoderns*. London; New York: Verso, 2015.
- Jameson, Fredric. *Postmodernism, or, the Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1991.
- Janacek, Bruce. *Alchemical Belief: Occultism in the Religious Culture of Early Modern England*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2011.
- Janković, Vladimir. *Confronting the Climate: British Airs and the Making of Environmental Medicine*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Jansen, Franz Klaus. "Sense-Oriented Reasoning at Three Progressive Levels in Tribal and Modern Societies." *Philosophy Study* 2, 8 (2012): 579-593.
- Jaritz, Gerhard, and Verene Winiwarter. "On the Perception of Nature in Renaissance Society." In *Nature and Society in Historical Context*, edited by Mikuláš Teich, Roy Porter, and Bo Gustafsson, 91-111. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge

- University Press, 1997.
- Jaudon, T. W. "Obeah's Sensations: Rethinking Religion at the Transnational Turn." *American Literature* 84, 4 (2012): 715-741.
- Jay, Martin. *Downcast Eyes: The Denigration of Vision in Twentieth-Century French Thought*. Berkeley, Calif.: Univ. of California Press, 1994.
- Jay, Martin. "The Debate over Performative Contradiction: Habermas versus the Poststructuralists." In *Philosophical Interventions in the Unfinished Project of Enlightenment*, edited by Axel Honneth, Thomas McCarthy, Claus Offe, and Albrecht Wllmer, 261-279. Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 1992.
- Jeanneret, Michel. *A Feast of Words: Banquets and Table Talk in the Renaissance*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991.
- Jenner, Mark. "Follow Your Nose? Smell, Smelling, and their Histories." *The American Historical Review* 116, 2 (2011): 335-351.
- Jenner, Mark. "Tasting Lichfield, Touching China: Sir John Floyers' Senses." *The Historical Journal* 53, 3 (2010): 647-670.
- Jenner, Mark. "Civilization and Deodorization? Smell in Early Modern English Culture." In *Civil Histories: Essays Presented to Sir Keith Thomas*, edited by Peter Burke, Brian Howard Harrison, Paul Slack, and Keith Thomas, 127-144. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Jenner, Mark. "Quackery and Enthusiasm, or Why Drinking Water Cured the Plague." In *Religio Medici: Medicine and Religion in Seventeenth-Century England*, edited by Ole Peter Grell and Andrew Cunningham, 313-340. Aldershot: Scolar, 1996.
- Jockers, Matthew Lee. *Macroanalysis: Digital Methods and Literary History*. Urbana:

- University of Illinois, 2013.
- Johansen, Thomas Kjeller. *Aristotle on the Sense-Organs*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.
- Johansen, Thomas. "Aristotle on the Sense of Smell." *Phronesis* 41, 1 (1996): 1-19.
- Johnson, Lemuel. *Shakespeare in Africa (& Other Venues): Import & the Appropriation of Culture*. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press, 1998.
- Johnson, Lemuel. *The Devil, the Gargoyle, and the Buffoon: The Negro as Metaphor in Western Literature*. Port Washington, NY: Kennikat Press, 1971.
- Johnson, Mark. *The Meaning of the Body: Aesthetics of Human Understanding*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007.
- Johnson, Mark. *The Body in the Mind: The Bodily Basis of Meaning, Imagination, and Reason*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987.
- Johnson, Sara. "'You Should give them Blacks to Eat': Cuban Bloodhounds and the Waging of an Inter-American War of Torture and Terror." *American Quarterly* 61, 1 (March, 2009): 65-92.
- Johnson, Walter. *River of Dark Dreams: Slavery and Empire in the Cotton Kingdom*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2013.
- Johnson, Walter. "Agency: A Ghost Story." In *Slavery's Ghost: The Problem of Freedom in the Age of Emancipation*, edited by Richard Follett, Eric Foner, and Walter Johnson, 8-30. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins, 2011.
- Johnson, Walter. "The Pedestal and the Veil: Rethinking the Capitalism/Slavery Question." *Journal of the Early Republic* 24 (Summer, 2004): 299-308.
- Johnson, Walter. "The Slave Trader, the White Slave, and the Politics of Racial

- Determination in the 1850s.” *Journal of American History* 87 (June, 2000): 13-38.
- Johnson, Walter. *Soul by Soul: Life inside the Antebellum Slave Market*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1999.
- Johnson, Rosalind. “Parallels between Othello and the Historical Leo Africanus.” *Bim* 18, 170 (1986): 9-34.
- Johnstone, Nathan. "The Protestant Devil: The Experience of Temptation in Early Modern England." *The Journal of British Studies* 43, 2 (2004): 173-205.
- Jones, Eldred. *The Elizabethan Image of Africa*. Charlottesville: Published for the Folger Shakespeare Library by the University Press of Virginia, 1971.
- Jones, Eldred. *Othello's Countrymen; The African in English Renaissance Drama*. London: Published on behalf of Fourah Bay College, the University College of Sierra Leone by Oxford University Press, 1965.
- Jones, Letta. “Plants and Smell – For Whose Benefit?” In *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, edited by Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham, 115-128. Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003.
- Jonsson, Fredrik Albritton. "Climate Change and the Retreat of the Atlantic: The Cameralist Context of Pehr Kalm's Voyage to North America, 1748-51." *WMQ* 72, 1 (2015): 99-126.
- Jordan, Winthrop. *The White Man's Burden: Historical Origins of Racism in the United States*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1974.
- Jordan, Winthrop. *White over Black: American Attitudes toward the Negro, 1550-1812*. Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture at Williamsburg, VA, by the University of North Carolina Press, 1968.

- Jordanova, Ludmilla. "The Art of Seeing in Medicine: Physiognomy 1780-1820." In *Medicine and the Five Senses*, edited by W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter, 122-133. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Jütte, Robert. *A History of the Senses: From Antiquity to Cyberspace*. Cambridge, UK: Polity, 2005.
- Kahn, Douglas. *Noise, Water, Meat: A History of Sound in the Arts*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: M. I. T. Press, 1999.
- Kapitaniak, Pierre. "Reginald Scot and the Circles of Power: Witchcraft, Anti-Catholicism and Faction Politics." In *Supernatural and Secular Power in Early Modern England*, edited by Marcus Harnes and Victoria Bladen, 41-66. Farnham, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2015.
- Kaplan, Paul. *The Rise of the Black Magus in Western Art*. Ann Arbor, Mich.: UMI Research Press, 1985.
- Karant-Nunn, Susan. *The Reformation of Feeling: Shaping the Religious Emotions in Early Modern Germany*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Kaye, Anthony. "The Second Slavery: Modernity in the Nineteenth-Century South and the Atlantic World." *The Journal of Southern History* 75, 3 (2009): 627-650.
- Kearney, Richard. *The Wake of Imagination: Toward a Postmodern Culture*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1988.
- Kearney, Richard, and Brian Treanor. "Introduction: Carnal Hermeneutics from Head to Foot." In *Carnal Hermeneutics*, edited by Richard Kearney and Brian Treanor, 1-14. New York: Fordham University Press, 2015.
- Kemp, Simon, and Garth Fletcher. "The Medieval Theory of the Inner Senses." *American*

- Journal of Psychology* 106 (1993): 559-576.
- Kern, Stephen. "Olfactory Ontology and Scented Harmonies: on the History of Smell." *Journal of Popular Culture* 7, 4 (1974): 816-824.
- Keyes, Sarah. "'Like a Roaring Lion': The Overland Trail as a Sonic Conquest." *The Journal of American History* 96, 1 (June, 2009): 19-43.
- Kezar, Dennis. "Shakespeare's Addictions." *Critical Inquiry* 30, 1 (2003): 31-62.
- Kidd, Colin. *The Forging of Races: Race and Scripture in the Protestant Atlantic World, 1600-2000*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- Kidd, Colin. *British Identities before Nationalism: Ethnicity and Nationhood in the Atlantic World, 1600-1800*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- Kim, Sangkeun. *Strange Names of God: The Missionary Translation of the Divine Name and the Chinese Responses to Matteo Ricci's Shangti in Late Ming China, 1583-1644*. New York: Lang, 2004.
- King, Rachel. "'The Beads With Which We Pray Are Made From It': Devotional Ambers in Early Modern Italy." In *Religion and the Senses in Early Modern Europe*, edited by Wietse de Boer and Christine Göttler, 153-175. Leiden: Brill, 2013.
- King, Stacie, and Gonzalo Sâanchez Santiago. "Soundscapes of the Everyday in Ancient Oaxaca, Mexico." *Archaeologies* 7, 2 (2011): 387-422.
- Kinser, Sam. *Rabelais's Carnival: Text, Context, Metatext*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990.
- Klarer, Mario. "Cannibalism and Carnavalesque: Incorporation as Utopia in the Early Image of America." *New Literary History* 30, 2 (1999): 389-410.
- Klymentiev, Maksym. "Creating Spices for the Mind." *The Senses and Society* 9, 2 (2015):

212-231.

Knapp, Jeffrey. *An Empire Nowhere: England, America, and Literature from Utopia to The Tempest*. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press, 1994.

Knellwolf, Christa. "The Exotic Frontier of the Imperial Imagination." *Eighteenth Century Life* 26, 3 (2002): 10-30.

Knott, Sarah. "The Patient's Case: Sentimental Empiricism and Knowledge in the Early American Republic." *WMQ* 67, 4 (2010): 645-676.

Knott, Sarah. *Sensibility and the American Revolution*. Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia, by the University of North Carolina Press, 2009.

Koerner, Joseph Leo. "The Epiphany of the Black Magus Circa 1500." In Book I of *Volume III of The Image of the Black in Western Art*, edited by David Bindman, Henry Louis Gates, and Karen Dalton, 7-92. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2010.

Koerner, Lisbet. *Linnaeus: Nature and Nation*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1999.

Kohl, James Vaughn, and Robert Francoeur. *The Scent of Eros: Mysteries of Odor in Human Sexuality*. New York: Continuum, 1995.

Kolchin, Peter. "Whiteness Studies: The New History of Race in America." *The Journal of American History* 89, 1 (2002): 154-173.

Konadu, Kwasi. *The Akan Diaspora in the Americas*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2010.

Konig, Anika. "Smelling the Difference; the Senses in Ethnic Conflict in West Kalimantan,

- Indonesia.” In *Senses and Citizenships: Embodying Political Life* edited by Susanna Trnka, Christine Dureau, and Julie Park, 120-132. NY: Routledge, 2013.
- Kopelson, Heather Miyano. *Faithful Bodies: Performing Religion and Race in the Puritan Atlantic*. New York: New York University Press, 2016.
- Korda, Natasha. *Shakespeare's Domestic Economies: Gender and Property in Early Modern England*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2002.
- Korhonen, Anu. “Washing the Ethiopian White: Conceptualising Black Skin in Renaissance England.” In *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, edited by T. F. Earle and K. J. P. Lowe, 94-112. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- Kornwolf, James. “The Picturesque in the American Garden before 1800.” In *British and American Gardens in the Eighteenth Century: Eighteen Illustrated Essays on Garden History*, edited by Robert Maccubbin and Peter Martin, 93-106. Williamsburg, VA: Colonial Williamsburg Foundation, 1984.
- Korsmeyer, Carolyn. *Savoring Disgust: The Foul and the Fair in Aesthetics*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Koselleck, Reinhart. *Futures Past: On the Semantics of Historical Time*. New York: Columbia University, 2004.
- Koslofsky, Craig. "Knowing Skin in Early Modern Europe, C. 1450-1750." *History Compass* 12, 10 (2014): 794-806.
- Kott, Jan. *The Bottom Translation: Marlowe and Shakespeare and the Carnival Tradition*. Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1987.
- Kott, Jan. *Shakespeare our Contemporary*. New York: Norton, 1974.

- Krech III, Shepard. *The Ecological Indian: Myth and History*. New York: W. W. Norton & Co, 1999.
- Kriz, Kay Dian. *Slavery, Sugar, and the Culture of Refinement: Picturing the British West Indies, 1700-1840*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008.
- Kroonenberg, Salomon Bernard, and Andy Brown. *Why Hell Stinks of Sulfur: Mythology and Geology of the Underworld*. London: Reaktion Books, 2013.
- Kuhn, Thomas. *The Essential Tension: Selected Studies in Scientific Tradition and Change*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1977.
- Kupperman, Karen. *The Atlantic in World History*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Kupperman, Karen. *Indians and English: Facing Off in Early America*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2000.
- Kupperman, Karen. "Fear of Hot Climates in the Anglo-American Colonial Experience." *WMQ* 41, 2 (1984): 213-240.
- Kusukawa, Sachiko. *Picturing the Book of Nature: Image, Text, and Argument in Sixteenth-Century Human Anatomy and Medical Botany*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011.
- Kutney, Gerald. *Sulfur: History, Technology, Applications & Industry*. Toronto: ChemTec Publishing, 2013.
- Lacan, Jacques. *Ecrits: A Selection*. New York: Norton, 1977.
- Lacan, Jacques, and Jeffrey Mehlman. "The Other Is Missing." *October* 40 (1987): 131-133.
- Lacey, Kate. *Listening Publics: The Politics and Experience of Listening in the Media Age*.

- Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 2013.
- LaCombe, Michael. *Political Gastronomy: Food and Authority in the English Atlantic World*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012.
- Lacoue-Labarthe, Philippe, and Christopher Fynsk. *Typography: Mimesis, Philosophy, Politics*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1989.
- Ladurie, Emmanuel Le Roy. *Times of Feast, Times of Famine: A History of Climate Since the Year 1000*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1988 [1971].
- Ladurie, Emmanuel Le Roy. *Carnival in Romans*. New York: G. Braziller, 1979.
- Ladurie, Emmanuel LeRoy. "Motionless History." *Social Science History* 1, 2 (1977): 115-136.
- Laird, Mark. *The Flowering of the Landscape Garden: English Pleasure Grounds 1720-1800*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999.
- Laird, Mark. "From Callicarpa to Catalpa: The Impact of Mark Catesby's Plant Introductions on English Gardens of the Eighteenth Century." In *Empire's Nature: Mark Catesby's New World Vision*, edited by Amy Meyers, Margaret Beck Pritchard, 184-227. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1998.
- Lakoff, George, and Mark Johnson. *Metaphors We Live By*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008 [1980].
- Laplantine, François, and Philip Jamie Furniss. *The Life of the Senses: Introduction to a Modal Anthropology*. London: Bloomsbury, 2015.
- Laporte, Dominique. *History of Shit*. Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 2000.
- Largey, Gale, and Rod Watson. "The Sociology of Odors." In *The Smell Culture Reader*, edited by Jim Drobnick, 29-40. Oxford: Berg, 2006.

- Latour, Bruno. "How to Talk About the Body?: The Normative Dimension of Science Studies." *Body & Society* 10, 2-3 (2004): 205-229.
- Latour, Bruno. *On Technical Mediation: The Messenger Lectures on the Evolution of Civilization*. Lund, Sweden: Lunds Universitet, 1993.
- Latour, Bruno. "The Enlightenment without the Critique: A Word on Michel Serres' Philosophy." *Royal Institute of Philosophy Lecture Series* 21 (1987): 83-97.
- Lawrance, Jeremy. "Black Africans in Renaissance Spanish Literature." In *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, edited by T. F. Earle, and K. J. P. Lowe, 70-93. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- Lawrence, Christopher. "The Nervous System and Society in the Scottish Enlightenment." In *Natural Order: Historical Studies of Scientific Culture*, edited by Barry Barnes and Steven Shapin, 19-40. Beverly Hills, Calif.: Sage Publications, 1979.
- Lawrence, Louise Joy. *Sense and Stigma in the Gospels: Depictions of Sensory-Disabled Characters*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Lawrence, Susan. "Educating the Senses: Students, Teachers, and Medical Rhetoric in Eighteenth-Century London." In *Medicine and the Five Senses*, edited by W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter, 154-178. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Lawson-Peebles, Robert. *Landscape and Written Expression in Revolutionary America: The World Turned Upside Down*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Lazzarato, Maurizio, and Joshua David Jordan. *Signs and Machines: Capitalism and the Production of Subjectivity*. Los Angeles, CA: Semiotext(e), 2014.
- Le Guérér, Annick. *Scent, the Mysterious and Essential Powers of Smell*. New York: Turtle Bay Books, 1992.

- Leavelle, Tracy. *The Catholic Calumet: Colonial Conversions in French and Indian North America*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012.
- Leavelle, Tracy. "The Catholic Rosary, Gendered Practice, and Female Power in French-Indian Spiritual Encounters." In *Native Americans, Christianity, and the Reshaping of the American Religious Landscape*, edited by Joel Martin and Mark Nicholas, 159-178. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2010.
- Lehrer, Jonah. *Proust Was a Neuroscientist*. Edinburgh: Canongate, 2011.
- Lehrich, Christopher. *The Language of Demons and Angels; Cornelius Agrippa's Occult Philosophy*. Leiden: Brill, 2003.
- Lempert, David. "What Is Development? What Is Progress? The Social Science and Humanities of Utopia and Futurology." *Journal of Developing Societies* 30, 2 (2014): 223-241.
- Lennon, Jack. *Pollution and Religion in Ancient Rome*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- Lepecki, André, and Sally Banes. "Introduction: the Performance of the Senses." In *The Senses in Performance*, edited by Sally Banes and André Lepecki, 1-7. New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Lepore, Jill. *The Name of War: King Philip's War and the Origins of American Identity*. New York: Knopf, 1998.
- Lesch, John. "Systematics and the Geometrical Spirit." In *The Quantifying Spirit in the 18th Century*, edited by Tore Frängsmyr, J. L. Heilbron, and Robin Rider, 73-112. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990.
- Lestringant, Frank. *Mapping the Renaissance World: The Geographical Imagination in the*

- Age of Discovery*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994.
- Lettow, Susanne. "Generation, Genealogy, and Time: The Concept of Reproduction from *Histoire Naturelle* to *Naturphilosophie*." In *Reproduction, Race, and Gender in Philosophy and the Early Life Sciences*, edited by Susanne Lettow, 21-44. Albany: State University of New York, 2014.
- Leventhal, Herbert. *In the Shadow of the Enlightenment: Occultism and Renaissance Science in Eighteenth Century America*. New York: New York University Press, 1976.
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude. *The Savage Mind*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966.
- Levin, Carole, and John Watkins. *Shakespeare's Foreign Worlds: National and Transnational Identities in the Elizabethan Age*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2009.
- Levin, Roy. "Smells and Tastes--Their Putative Influence on Sexual Activity in Humans." *Sexual and Relationship Therapy* 19, 4 (2004): 451-462.
- Levine, Michael. *Levine & Shefner's Fundamentals of Sensation and Perception*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Levitt, Theresa. *The Shadow of Enlightenment: Optical and Political Transparency in France, 1789-1848*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.
- Lewis, Andrew. *A Democracy of Facts: Natural History in the Early Republic*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011.
- Lewis, Jayne. *Air's Appearance*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012.
- Leyerle, Blake. "Refuse, Filth, and Excrement in the Homilies of John Chrysostom." *Journal of Late Antiquity* 2, 2 (2009): 337-356.

- Liebler, Naomi Conn. *Shakespeare's Festive Tragedy: The Ritual Foundations of Genre*. London: Routledge, 1995.
- Lindberg, David. *The Beginnings of Western Science: The European Scientific Tradition in Philosophical, Religious, and Institutional Context, 600 B.C. to A.D. 1450*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992.
- Linebaugh, Peter, and Marcus Rediker. *The Many-Headed Hydra: Sailors, Slaves, Commoners, and the Hidden History of the Revolutionary Atlantic*. Boston: Beacon Press, 2000.
- Lingis, Alphonso. *Sensation: Intelligibility in Sensibility*. Atlantic Highlands, NJ: Humanities Press, 1996.
- Linke, Uli. "Off the Edge of Europe: Border Regions, Visual Culture, and the Politics of Race." In *Senses and Citizenships: Embodying Political Life*, edited by Susanna Trnka, 178-199. New York, NY: Routledge, 2013.
- Lipman, Andrew. *The Saltwater Frontier: Indians and the Contest for the American Coast*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2015.
- Little, Arthur. *Shakespeare Jungle Fever: National-Imperial Re-Visions of Race, Rape, and Sacrifice*. Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press, 2000.
- Little, Arthur. "'An Essence That's Not Seen': The Primal Scene of Racism in *Othello*." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 44, 3 (1993): 304-324.
- Loar, Christopher. *Political Magic: British Fictions of Savagery and Sovereignty, 1650-1750*. New York: Fordham University Press, 2014.
- Lockhart, James. *The Nahuas after the Conquest: A Social and Cultural History of the Indians of Central Mexico, Sixteenth through Eighteenth Centuries*. Stanford,

- Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1992.
- Logue, Alexandra. *The Psychology of Eating and Drinking*. New York: Brunner-Routledge/Taylor & Francis Group, 2004.
- Looby, Christopher. *Voicing America: Language, Literary Form, and the Origins of the United States*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996.
- Loomba, Ania. *Gender, Race, Renaissance Drama*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1989.
- Loomba, Ania. "The Color of Patriarchy: Critical Difference, Cultural Difference, and Renaissance Drama." In *Women, "Race," and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, edited by Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker, 17-34. London: Routledge, 1994.
- Lorensen, Marlene Ringgaard. *Dialogical Preaching: Bakhtin, Otherness and Homiletics*. Gottingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2013.
- Lovejoy, Paul. "Speculations of the African Origins of Venture Smith." In *The Changing Worlds of Atlantic Africa: Essays in Honor of Robin Law*, edited by Robin Law, Toyin Falola, and Matt Childs, 371-386. Durham, NC: Carolina Academic Press, 2009.
- Lovejoy, Paul. "Autobiography and Memory: Gustavus Vassa, Alias Olaudah Equiano, the African." *Slavery & Abolition* 27, 3 (2006): 317-347.
- Lovejoy, Paul. "Identifying Enslaved Africans in the African Diaspora." In *Identity in the Shadow of Slavery*, edited by Paul Lovejoy, 1-29. London: Continuum, 2000.
- Low, Kelvin. "The Social Life of the Senses: Charting Directions." *Sociology Compass* 6, 3 (2012): 271-282.
- Low, Kelvin. *Scents and Scent-Sibilities: Smell and Everyday Life Experiences*. Newcastle

- upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Pub., 2009.
- Low, Kelvin. "Presenting the Self, the Social Body, and the Olfactory: Managing Smells in Everyday Life Experiences." *Sociological Perspectives* 49, 4 (2006): 607-631.
- Low, Kelvin. "Ruminations on Smell as a Sociocultural Phenomenon." *Current Sociology* 53, 3 (2005): 397-417.
- Lowe, Donald. *History of Bourgeois Perception*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982.
- Lowood, Henry. "The New World and the European Catalog of Nature." In *America in European Consciousness, 1493-1750*, edited by Karen Ordahl Kupperman, 295-323. Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, VA, by the University of North Carolina Press, 1995.
- Lubken, Deborah. "Joyful Ringing, Solemn Tolling: Methods and Meanings of Early American Tower Bells." *WMQ* 69, 4 (2012): 823-842.
- Lueck, Bryan. "The Terrifying Concupiscence of Belonging: Noise and Evil in the Work of Michel Serres." *Symposium* 19, 1 (2015): 248-267.
- Lyotard, Jean-François. *Libidinal Economy*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993.
- MacGaffey, Wyatt. "Twins, Simbi Spirits and Lwas in Kongo and Haiti." In *Central Africans and Cultural Transformations in the American Diaspora*, edited by Linda Heywood, 211-236. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- MacGaffey, Wyatt. *Religion and Society in Central Africa: The BaKongo of Lower Zaire*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1986.
- Mack, Adam. *Sensing Chicago: Noisemakers, Strikebreakers, and Muckrakers*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2015.

- Mack, Adam. "The Senses in the Marketplace: Commercial Aesthetics for a Suburban Age." In *Volume V of A Cultural History of the Senses*, edited by Constance Classen, 77-100. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.
- Mackay, Charles. *Extraordinary Popular Delusions and the Madness of Crowds*. New York: Barnes & Noble Books, 2004 [1841].
- MacLachlan, Ian. "Long Distance Love: On Remote Sensing in Shakespeare's Sonnet 109." In *Sensual Reading: New Approaches to Reading in Its Relations to the Senses*, edited by Michael Syrotinski, 57-68. Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2001.
- Maclean, Ian. *Logic, Signs and Nature in the Renaissance: The Case of Learned Medicine*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- MacLeod, Roy. *Nature and Empire: Science and the Colonial Enterprise*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000.
- Mafe, Diana Adesola. "From Ògún to Othello: (Re)Acquainting Yoruba Myth and Shakespeare's Moor." *Research in African Literatures* 35 (2004): 46-61.
- Magee, Judith. *The Art and Science of William Bartram*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2007.
- Magubane, Zine. "Simians, Savages, Skulls, and Sex: Science and Colonial Militarism in Nineteenth-Century South Africa." In *Race, Nature, and the Politics of Difference*, ed. Donald Moore, Jake Kosek, and Anand Pandian, 99-111. Durham: Duke University Press, 2003.
- Majid, Asifa, and Stephen Levinson. "The Senses in Language and Culture." *Senses & Society* 6 (2011): 5-18.
- Major, Richard. *The Life of Prince Henry of Portugal Surnamed the Navigator and Its*

- Results: Comprising the Discovery, Within One Century, of Half the World.*
London: Asher, 1868.
- Malcolmson, Cristina. *Studies of Skin Color in the Early Royal Society: Boyle, Cavendish, Swift.* Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2013.
- Malnar, Joy Monice, and Frank Vodvarka. *Sensory Design.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2004.
- Mancall, Peter. "Tales Tobacco Told in Sixteenth-Century Europe." *Environmental History* 9, 4 (2004): 648-678.
- Manderson, Desmond. "Senses and Symbols: The Construction of Drugs in Historic and Aesthetic Perspective." In *Law and the Senses: Sensational Jurisprudence*, edited by Lionel Bently and Leo Flynn, 199-216. London: Pluto Press, 1996.
- Mandrou, Robert. *Introduction to Modern France, 1500-1640: An Essay in Historical Psychology.* New York: Holmes & Meier, 1976.
- Mangum, Anne. *Reflection of Africa in Elizabethan and Jacobean Drama and Poetry.* Lewiston, NY: E. Mellen Press, 2002.
- Maniatis, Spyros. "Scents as Trademarks: Propertisation of Scents and Olfactory Poverty." In *Law and the Senses: Sensational Jurisprudence*, edited by Lionel Bently and Leo Flynn, 217-235. London: Pluto Press, 1996.
- Marchitello, Howard. *Narrative and Meaning in Early Modern England: Browne's Skull and Other Histories.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Marcus, Leah *Puzzling Shakespeare: Local Reading and Its Discontents.* Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press, 1988.
- Marcuse, Herbert. *Eros and Civilization; a Philosophical Inquiry into Freud.* Boston:

- Beacon Press, 1966.
- Mark, Peter. "Fetishers, 'Marybuckles' and the Christian Norm: European Images of Senegambians and Their Religions, 1550-1760." *African Studies Review* 23, 2 (Sep., 1980): 91-99.
- Mark, Peter. *Africans in European Eyes: The Portrayal of Black Africans in Fourteenth and Fifteenth Century Europe*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University, 1974.
- Marotti, Arthur. *Religious Ideology and Cultural Fantasy: Catholic and Anti-Catholic Discourses in Early Modern England*. Notre Dame, Ind.: University of Notre Dame Press, 2005.
- Marshall, P. J., and Glyndwr Williams. *The Great Map of Mankind: Perceptions of New Worlds in the Age of Enlightenment*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1982.
- Martens, Stephanie. *The Americas in Early Modern Political Theory: States of Nature and Aboriginality*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016.
- Martin, Ann Smart. "Material Things and Cultural Meanings: Notes on the Study of Early American Material Culture." *WMQ* 53, 1 (1996): 5-12.
- Martin, Bronwen. "Smell, Cultural Identity and the Quest for Freedom." In *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, edited by Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham, 169-188. Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003.
- Martin, Kameelah. "Hoodoo Ladies and High Conjurers: New Directions for an Old Archetype." In *Literary Expressions of African Spirituality*, edited by Carol Marsh-Lockett and Elizabeth West, 119-144. Lanham: Lexington Books, 2013.
- Martínez, Maria Elena. *Genealogical Fictions: Limpieza de Sangre, Religion and Gender*

- in Colonial Mexico*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2008.
- Martínez, María Elena. "The Black Blood of New Spain: Limpieza De Sangre, Racial Violence, and Gendered Power in Early Colonial Mexico." *WMQ* 61, 3 (2004): 479-520.
- Marvin, Garry. "Sensing Nature, Encountering the World in Hunting." *Etnofoor* 18, 1 (2005): 15-26.
- Maslen, Sarah. "Researching the Senses as Knowledge." *The Senses and Society* 10, 1 (2015): 52-70.
- Massing, Jean Michel. "The Image of Africa and the Iconography of Lip-Plated Africans in Pierre Decelie's World Map of 1550." In *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, edited by T. F. Earle and K. J. P. Lowe, 48-69. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- Massing, Jean Michel. "From Greek Proverb to Soap Advert: Washing the Ethiopian." *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 58 (1995): 180-201.
- Matar, N. I. *Turks, Moors, and Englishmen in the Age of Discovery*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1999.
- Matory, James Lorand. *Black Atlantic Religion: Tradition, Transnationalism, and Matriarchy in the Afro-Brazilian Candomblé*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2005.
- Mauss, Marcel. *Sociologie et Anthropologie*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1973.
- May, Todd, and Ladelle McWhorter. "Who's Being Disciplined Now? Operations of Power in a Neoliberal World." In *Biopower: Foucault and Beyond*, edited by Vernon Cisney and Nicolae Morar, 245-258. Chicago; London: The University of

- Chicago Press, 2016.
- Mazzio, Carla. "Sins of the Tongue." In *The Body in Parts: Fantasies of Corporeality in Early Modern Europe*, edited by David Hillman and Carla Mazzio, 53-80. New York: Routledge, 1997.
- Mazzolini, Renato. "Skin Color and the Origin of Physical Anthropology (1640–1850)." In *Reproduction, Race, and Gender in Philosophy and the Early Life Sciences*, edited by Susanne Lettow, 131-162. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2014.
- McCandless, Peter. *Slavery, Disease, and Suffering in the Southern Lowcountry*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011.
- McCartney, William. *Olfaction and Odours: an Osphrésiological Essay*. Berlin: Springer-Verlag, 1968.
- McClintock, Anne. "Soft-Soaping Empire: Commodity Racism and Imperial Advertising." In *Travellers' Tales: Narratives of Home and Displacement*, edited by George Robertson, 131-154. London: Routledge, 1994.
- McDonnell, Michael. *Masters of Empire: Great Lakes Indians and the Making of America*. New York: Hill and Wang, a Division of Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2015.
- McGann, Jerome. *Radiant Textuality*. New York: Palgrave, 2004.
- McGhee, J. Alexandra. "Fever Dreams: Obeah, Tropical Disease, and Cultural Contamination in Colonial Jamaica and the Metropole." *Atlantic Studies* 12, 2 (2015): 179-199.
- McGregor, Gaile. *The Noble Savage in the New World Garden: Notes toward a Syntactics of Place*. Toronto, Ont.: University of Toronto Press, 1988.

- McHugh, James. *Sandalwood and Carrion*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- McHugh, James. "Seeing Scents: Methodological Reflections on the Intersensory Perception of Aromatics in South Asian Religions." *History of Religions* 51, 2 (2011): 156-177.
- McKendrick, Neil, John Brewer, and J. H. Plumb. *The Birth of a Consumer Society: The Commercialization of Eighteenth-Century England*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982.
- McKenzie, P. R. *Hail Orisha!: A Phenomenology of a West African Religion in the Mid-Nineteenth Century*. Leiden: Brill, 1997.
- McKnight, Kathryn Joy. "'En Su Tierra Lo Aprendio': An African Curandero's Defense Before the Cartagena Inquisition." *Colonial Latin American Review* 12, 1 (2003): 63-84.
- McLachlan, Amy Leia. "Bittersweet: The Moral Economy of Taste and Intimacy in an Amazonian Society." *Senses & Society* 6 (2011): 156-176.
- McLuhan, Marshall. "Inside the Five Sense Sensorium." In *Empire of the Senses: The Sensual Culture Reader*, edited by David Howes, 43-54. Oxford: Berg, 2005.
- McLuhan, Marshall. *The Gutenberg Galaxy: The Making of Typographic Man*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1962.
- McSweeney, Kerry. *The Language of the Senses: Sensory-Perceptual Dynamics in Wordsworth, Coleridge, Thoreau, Whitman, and Dickinson*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1998.
- McVaugh, Michael. "Smell and the Medieval Surgeon." *Micrologus* 10 (2002): 113-132.
- McWilliams, James. "Worshipping Weeds: The Parable of the Tares, the Rhetoric of

- Ecology, and the Origins of Agrarian Exceptionalism in Early America." *Environmental History* 16, 2 (2011): 290-311.
- McWilliams, James. *A Revolution in Eating: How the Quest for Food Shaped America*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2005.
- Meens, Rob. "'A Relic of Superstition' Bodily Impurity and the Church from Gregory the Great to the Twelfth Century Decretists." In *Purity and Holiness: The Heritage of Leviticus*, edited by Marcel Poorthuis and Joshua Schwartz, 281-293. Leiden: Brill, 2000.
- Meissner, W. W. *To the Greater Glory: A Psychological Study of Ignatian Spirituality*. Milwaukee, Wis.: Marquette University Press, 1999.
- Mello e Souza, Laura de. *The Devil and the Land of the Holy Cross: Witchcraft, Slavery, and Popular Religion in Colonial Brazil*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2003.
- Mendelsohn, J. Andrew. "The World on a Page: Making a General Observation in the Eighteenth Century." In *Histories of Scientific Observation*, edited by Lorraine Daston and Elizabeth Lunbeck, 396-420. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011.
- Menella, J. A., and G. K. Beauchamp. "The Ontogeny of Human Flavor Perception." In *Tasting and Smelling*, edited by Gary Beauchamp and Linda Bartoshuk, 199-221. San Diego: Academic Press, 1997.
- Mennella, J. A., and G. K. Beauchamp. "Olfactory Preferences in Children and Adults." In *The Human Sense of Smell*, edited by David Laing, Richard Doty, and W. Breipohl, 167-180. Berlin: Springer-Verlag, 1991.
- Merchant, Carolyn. *The Death of Nature: Women, Ecology, and the Scientific Revolution*.

- San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1980.
- Merleau-Ponty, Maurice. *The World of Perception*. London: Routledge, 2004.
- Merleau-Ponty, Maurice. *Phenomenology of Perception*. London: Routledge, 2002.
- Merleau-Ponty, Maurice. *The Primacy of Perception, And Other Essays on Phenomenological Psychology, the Philosophy of Art, History, and Politics*. Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1964.
- Merrell, Floyd. *Capoeira and Candomblé: Conformity and Resistance in Brazil*. Princeton, NJ: Markus Wiener Publishers, 2005.
- Merrell, James. *Into the American Woods*. New York: Norton, 1999.
- Meyer, Birgit. "Introductions: From Imagined Communities to Aesthetic Formations: Religious Mediations, Sensational Forms, and Styles of Binding." In *Aesthetic Formations: Media, Religion, and the Senses*, edited by Birgit Meyer, 1-30. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Midelfort, H. C. Erik. *Exorcism and Enlightenment: Johann Joseph Gassner and the Demons of Eighteenth-Century Germany*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2005.
- Miles, Margaret. *Image as Insight: Visual Understanding in Western Christianity and Secular Culture*. Boston: Beacon Press, 1985.
- Miles, Robert. *Gothic Writing, 1750-1820: A Genealogy*. London: Routledge, 1993.
- Miller, Joseph. "Retention, Reinvention, and Remembering: Restoring Identities through Enslavement in Africa and under Slavery in Brazil." In *Enslaving Connections: Changing Cultures of Africa and Brazil during the Era of Slavery*, edited by José Curto and Paul Lovejoy, 81-121. Amherst, NY: Humanity Books, 2004.

- Miller, Willi. *The Anatomy of Disgust*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1997.
- Milner, Matthew. "The Physics of Holy Oats: Vernacular Knowledge, Qualities, and Remedy in Fifteenth-Century England." *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies* 43, 2 (2013): 219-245.
- Milner, Matthew. "To Captivate The Senses: Sensory Governance, Heresy, and Idolatry in Mid-Tudor England." In *Religion and the Senses in Early Modern Europe*, edited by Wietse de Boer and Christine Göttler, 307-327. Leiden: Brill, 2013.
- Milner, Matthew. *The Senses and the English Reformation*. Farnham, England: Ashgate, 2011.
- Miramon, Charles de. "Noble Dogs, Noble Blood: The Invention of the Concept of Race in the Late Middle Ages." In *The Origins of Racism in the West*, edited by Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac, and Joseph Ziegler, 200-216. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
- Miura, Nagamitsu. *John Locke and the Native Americans: Early English Liberalism and its Colonial Reality*. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2013.
- Mohanram, Radhika. *Imperial White: Race, Diaspora, and the British Empire*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2007.
- Molina, J. Michelle. "Technologies of the Self: The Letters of Eighteenth-Century Mexican Jesuit Spiritual Daughters." *History of Religions* 47, 4 (2007): 282-303.
- Money, John. "Teaching in the Market-Place, or 'Caesar adsum jam forte: Pompey aderat': the Retailing of Knowledge in Provincial England during the Eighteenth Century." In *Consumption and the World of Goods*, edited by John Brewer and Roy Porter, 335-380. London; New York: Routledge, 1993.

- Monod, Paul Kléber. *Solomon's Secret Arts: The Occult in the Age of Enlightenment*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2013.
- Montagu, Ashley. *Man's Most Dangerous Myth: The Fallacy of Race*. Cleveland: World Pub. Co., 1997 [1942].
- Moogk, Peter. *La Nouvelle France: The Making of French Canada: a Cultural History*. East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 2000.
- Moore, James. *Indian and Jesuit: A Seventeenth-Century Encounter*. Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1982.
- Moore, R. I. *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Power and Deviance in Western Europe, 950-1250*. Oxford, UK: Blackwell, 1987.
- Moretti, Franco. *Distant Reading*. London: Verso, 2013.
- Moretti, Franco. *The Bourgeois: Between History and Literature*. NY: Verso, 2013.
- Moretti, Franco. *Graphs, Maps, Trees: Abstract Models for a Literary History*. London: Verso, 2005.
- Moretti, Franco. *Atlas of the European Novel, 1800-1900*. London: Verso, 1998.
- Moretti, Franco. *Signs Taken for Wonders: Essays in the Sociology of Literary Forms*. London: NLB, 1983.
- Morgan, Jennifer. *Laboring Women: Reproduction and Gender in New World Slavery*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004.
- Morgan, Jennifer. "'Some could suckle over their shoulder': Male Travelers, Female Bodies, and the Gendering of Racial Ideology, 1500-1770." *WMQ* 54 (1997): 167-192.
- Morgan, Philip. "Encounters Between British and 'Indigenous' Peoples, c. 1500-1800." In

- Empire and Others: British Encounters with Indigenous Peoples, 1600-1850*, edited by M. J. Daunton, and Rick Halpern, 43-78. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999.
- Morrison, Kenneth. *The Solidarity of Kin: Ethnohistory, Religious Studies, and the Algonkian-French Religious Encounter*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2002.
- Morrison, Susan Signe. *Excrement in the Late Middle Ages: Sacred Filth and Chaucer's Fecopoetics*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.
- Morrissey, Robert Michael. *Empire by Collaboration: Indians, Colonists, and Governments in Colonial Illinois Country*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015.
- Morrissey, Robert Michael. "The Terms of Encounter; Language and Contested Visions of French Colonization in the Illinois Country, 1673-1702." In *French and Indians in the Heart of North America, 1630-1815*, edited by Robert Englebert and Guillaume Teasdale, 43-75. East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 2013.
- Morrissey, Robert Michael. "‘I Speak It Well’: Language, Cultural Understanding, and the End of a Missionary Middle Ground in Illinois Country, 1673-1712." *Early American Studies* 9, 3 (2011): 617-648.
- Moshenska, Joseph. *Feeling Pleasures. Sense of Touch in Renaissance England*. Corby: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Mosley, Stephen. *The Chimney of the World: A History of Smoke Pollution in Victorian and Edwardian Manchester*. Cambridge, UK: White Horse Press, 2001.
- Moslund, Sten Pultz. *Literature's Sensuous Geographies: Postcolonial Matters of Place*.

- New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015.
- Mosteller, Frederick, and David Wallace. *Applied Bayesian and Classical Inference: The Case of the Federalist Papers*. New York: Springer-Verlag, 1984.
- Mudimbe, Valentin. "Romanus Pontifex (1454) and the Expansion of Europe." In *Race, Discourse, and the Origin of the Americas: A New World View*, edited by Vera Lawrence Hyatt and Rex Nettleford, 58-65. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995.
- Mukerji, Chandra. *From Graven Images: Patterns of Modern Materialism*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1983.
- Mullin, Michael. *Africa in America: Slave Acculturation and Resistance in the American South and the British Caribbean, 1736-1831*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1992.
- Mumford, Lewis. *Technics and Civilization*. New York: Harcourt, Brace and Co, 1934.
- Mundy, Barbara. "Extirpation of Idolatry and Sensory Experience in Sixteenth-Century Mexico." In *Sensational Religion*, edited by Sally Promey, 515-536. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014.
- Murray, David. "Object Lessons: Fetishism and the Hierarchies of Race and Religion." In *Conversion: Old Worlds and New*, edited by Kenneth Mills and Anthony Grafton, 199-217. Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2003.
- Murray, Molly. "Performing Devotion in the 'Masque of Blacknesse'." *Studies in English Literature 1500-1900* 47, 2 (2007): 427-449.
- Myrdal, Gunnar, and Sissela Bok. *American Dilemma: The Negro Problem and Modern Democracy*. Piscataway: Transaction Publishers, 1994.

Nagel, Joane. *Race, Ethnicity, and Sexuality: Intimate Intersections, Forbidden Frontiers*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2003.

Nancy, Jean-Luc. "Rethinking Corpus." In *Carnal Hermeneutics*, edited by Richard Kearney and Brian Treanor, 77-91. New York: Fordham University Press, 2015.

Nancy, Jean-Luc. *The Sense of the World*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997.

Nash, Gary. "The Image of the Indian in the Southern Colonial Mind." In *The Wild Man Within: An Image in Western Thought from the Renaissance to Romanticism*, edited by Edward Dudley and Maximillian Novak, 55-86. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1973.

Nash, Richard. *Wild Enlightenment: The Borders of Human Identity in the Eighteenth Century*. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2003.

Nava, Alexander. *Wonder and Exile in the New World*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2013.

Negri, Antonio. "At the Origins of Biopolitics (translated by Diana Garvin)." In *Biopower: Foucault and Beyond*, edited by Vernon Cisney and Nicolae Morar, 48-64. Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016.

Neill, Michael. "'Noises,/Sounds, and Sweet Airs': The Burden of Shakespeare's *Tempest*." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 59, 1 (2008): 36-59.

Neill, Michael. "'Mulattos,' 'Blacks,' and 'Indian Moors': Othello and Early Modern Constructions of Human Difference." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 49, 4 (1998): 361-374.

Neill, Michael. "Unproper Beds: Race, Adultery, and the Hideous in *Othello*." *Shakespeare*

- Quarterly* 40, 4 (1989): 383-412.
- Neuburger, Mary. "To Chicago and Back: Aleko Konstantinov, Rose Oil, and the Smell of Modernity." *Slavic Review* 65, 3 (2006): 427-445.
- Newhauser, Richard. "The Multisensoriality of Place and the Chaucerian Multisensual." In *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, edited by Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer, 199-218. Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016.
- Newhauser, Richard. "John Gower's Sweet Tooth." *The Review of English Studies* 64, 267 (2013): 752-769.
- Newman, Andrew. "Early Americanist Grammatology." In *Colonial Mediascapes: Sensory Worlds of the Early Americas*, edited by Matt Cohen and Jeffrey Glover, 76-99. Lincoln: Nebraska, 2014.
- Newman, Karen. "'And Wash the Ethiop White': Femininity and the Monstrous in *Othello*." In *Shakespeare Reproduced: The Text in History and Ideology*, edited by Jean Howard and Marion O' Connor, 143-162. New York: Methuen, 1987.
- Newman, Simon. *A New World of Labor: The Development of Plantation Slavery in the British Atlantic*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013.
- Newman, William. *Promethean Ambitions: Alchemy and the Quest to Perfect Nature*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004.
- Nieva, Rosario Acosta. "The Americas: Make-Up and Hygiene in Aztec Civilization on the Eve of Conquest (1500-21)." In *Perfume, a Global History: From the Origins to Today*, edited by Marie-Christine Grasse, 89-93. Paris: Somogy Art Publishers, 2007.

- Nightingale, C. H. "Before Race Mattered: Geographies of the Color Line in Early Colonial Madras and New York." *American Historical Review* 113, 1 (2008): 48-71.
- Norton, Marcy. *Sacred Gifts, Profane Pleasures: A History of Tobacco and Chocolate in the Atlantic World*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2008.
- Norton, Marcy. "Tasting Empire: Chocolate and the European Internalization of Mesoamerican Aesthetics." *The American Historical Review* 111, 3 (2006): 660-691.
- Novick, Tzi. "Peddling Scents: Merchandise and Meaning in 2 Corinthians 2:14-17." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 130, 3 (Fall, 2011): 543-549.
- Nugent, Joseph. "The Human Snout: Pigs, Priests, and Peasants in the Parlor." *The Senses and Society* 4, 3 (2009): 283-301.
- Nussbaum, Felicity. *The Limits of the Human: Fictions of Anomaly, Race, and Gender in the Long Eighteenth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.
- Nussbaum, Felicity. "Being a Man: Olaudah Equiano and Ignatius Sancho." In *Genius in Bondage: Literature of the Early Black Atlantic*, edited by Vincent Carretta and Philip Gould, 54-71. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2001.
- Nussbaum, Martha Craven. *Hiding from Humanity: Disgust, Shame, and the Law*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004.
- Nutton, Vivian. "Galen at the Bedside." In *Medicine and the Five Senses*, edited by W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter, 7-16. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Nwankwo, Ifeoma Kiddoe. *Black Cosmopolitanism: Racial Consciousness and Transnational Identity in the Nineteenth-Century Americas*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005.

- Nyongó, Tavia Amolo Ochieng'. *The Amalgamation Waltz: Race, Performance, and the Ruses of Memory*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2009.
- O' Brien, Jean. *Firsting and Lasting: Writing Indians Out of Existence in New England*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010.
- O' Malley, John. "Trent, Sacred Images, and Catholics' Senses of the Sensuous." In *The Sensuous in the Counter-Reformation Church*, edited by Marcia Hall and Tracy Elizabeth Cooper, 28-48. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013.
- O' Malley, John. *The Jesuits: Cultures, Sciences, and the Arts, 1540-1773*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999.
- O' Neal, John. *The Authority of Experience: Sensationist Theory in the French Enlightenment*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1996.
- O' Quinn, Daniel. *Entertaining Crisis in the Atlantic Imperium, 1770-1790*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2011.
- O' Toole, Rachel Sarah. *Bound Lives: Africans, Indians, and the Making of Race in Colonial Peru*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2012.
- Ogilvie, Brian. *The Science of Describing: Natural History in Renaissance Europe*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006.
- Ogundiran, Akinwumi. "The End of Prehistory? An Africanist Comment." *The American Historical Review* 118, 3 (2013): 788-801.
- Oldenburg, Scott. "Headless in America: The Imperial Logic of Acephalism." In *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, edited by Helen Ostovich, Mary Silcox, and Graham Roebuck, 39-57. Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2008.

- Oldfield, J. R. "The 'Ties Of soft Humanity': Slavery and Race in British Drama, 1760-1800." *Huntington Library Quarterly* 56, 1 (Winter, 1993): 1-14.
- Oldridge, Darren. *The Devil in Early Modern England*. Stroud: Sutton, 2000.
- Oliver, Sandra. *Food in Colonial and Federal America*. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 2005.
- Olmos, Margarite Fernández, and Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert. *Creole Religions of the Caribbean: An Introduction from Vodou and Santería to Obeah and Espiritismo*. New York: New York University Press, 2011.
- Olwell, Robert. "Seeds of Empire: Florida, Kew, and the British Imperial Meridian in the 1760s." In *The Creation of the British Atlantic World*, edited by Elizabeth Mancke and Carole Shammas, 263-282. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2005.
- Ong, Walter. "The Shifting Sensorium." In *The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses*, edited by David Howes, 25-30. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991.
- Ong, Walter. *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word*. London: Methuen, 1982.
- Ong, Walter. "African Talking Drums and Oral Noetics." *New Literary History* 8, 3 (1977): 411-429.
- Ong, Walter. *Interfaces of the Word: Studies in the Evolution of Consciousness and Culture*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1977.
- Ong, Walter. *Ramus, Method, and the Decay of Dialogue; From the Art of Discourse to the Art of Reason*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1958.
- Ono-George, Meleisa, "'Washing the Blackamoor White': Interracial Intimacy and

- Coloured Women's Agency in Jamaica." In *Subverting Empire: Deviance and Disorder in the British Colonial World*, edited by Will Jackson and Emily Manktelow, 42-60. Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire; New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015.
- Onyeka. *Blackamoors: Africans in Tudor England, Their Presence, Status and Origins*. London: Narrative Eye, 2013.
- Orgel, Stephen. *The Illusion of Power: Political Theater in the English Renaissance*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975.
- Orkin, Martin. "Othello and the 'Plain Face' Of Racism." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 38, 2 (1987): 166-188.
- Otter, Chris. *The Victorian Eye: A Political History of Light and Vision in Britain, 1800-1910*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008.
- Pagden, Anthony. *European Encounters with the New World: From Renaissance to Romanticism*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993.
- Padgen, Anthony. "Ius et Factum: Text and Experience in the Writings of Bartolome de Las Casas." In *New World Encounters*, edited by Stephen Greenblatt, 85-100. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.
- Pagden, Anthony. *The Fall of Natural Man: The American Indian and the Origins of Comparative Ethnology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982.
- Palazzo, Eric. "Art and the Senses: Art and Liturgy in the Middle Ages." In *Volume II of A Cultural History of the Senses*, edited by Constance Classen and Richard Newhauser, 175-194. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.

- Palencia-Roth, Michael. "The Cannibal Law of 1503." In *Early Images of the Americas: Transfer and Invention*, edited by Jerry Williams and Robert Earl Lewis, 21-64. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1993.
- Palmer, Richard. "In Bad Odour: Smell and its Significance in Medicine from Antiquity to the Seventeenth Century." In *Medicine and the Five Senses*, edited by W. F. Bynum and Roy Porter, 61-68. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Palmié, Stephan. *The Cooking of History: How Not to Study Afro-Cuban Religion*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2013.
- Palmié, Stephan. "Afterword, Other Powers: Tylor's Principle, Father William's Temptations and the Power of Banality." In *Obeah and Other Powers: The Politics of Caribbean Religion and Healing*, edited by Diana Paton and Maarit Forde, 316-340. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012.
- Palmié, Stephan. "Ecué's Atlantic: An Essay in Methodology." *Journal of Religion in Africa* 37, 2 (2007): 275-315.
- Palmié, Stephan. "Genomics, Divination, Racecraft." *American Ethnologist* 34 (2007): 205-222.
- Paravisini-Gebert, Lizabeth. "Women Possessed: Eroticism and Exoticism in the Representation of Women as Zombie." In *Sacred Possessions: Vodou, Santería, Obeah, and the Caribbean*, edited by Margarite Fernandez Olmos and Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert, 37-58. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1997.
- Parent, Anthony. *Foul Means: The Formation of a Slave Society in Virginia, 1660-1740*. Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia, by the University of North Carolina Press, 2003.

- Parés, Luis Nicolau. "The Hula 'Problem': Ethnicity on the Pre-Colonial Slave Coast." In *The Changing Worlds of Atlantic Africa: Essays in Honor of Robin Law*, edited by Robin Law, Toyin Falola, and Matt Childs, 323-346. Durham, NC: Carolina Academic Press, 2009.
- Parés, Luis Nicolau. "Ethnic-religious Modes of Identification among the Gbe-speaking People in Eighteenth and Nineteenth century Brazil." In *Africa, Brazil, and the Construction of Trans-Atlantic Black Identities*, edited by Barry Boubacar, Elisee Akpo Soumonni, and Livio Sansone, 179-208. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press, 2008.
- Parker, Patricia. "Rude Mechanicals." In *Subject and Object in Renaissance Culture*, edited by Margreta De Grazia, 43-82. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Parker, Patricia. *Shakespeare from the Margins: Language, Culture, Context*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996.
- Parker, Patricia. "Fantasies of Race and Gender: Africa, Othello, and Bringing to Light." In *Women, "Race," and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, edited by Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker, 84-100. London: Routledge, 1994.
- Parker, Patricia. *Literary Fat Ladies: Rhetoric, Gender, Property*. London: Methuen, 1987.
- Parker, Robert. *Miasma: Pollution and Purification in Early Greek Religion*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1983.
- Parkin, David, "Wafting on the Wind: Smell and the Cycle of Spirit and Matter." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 13, (2007): S39-S53.
- Parkinson, Robert. *The Common Cause: Creating Race and Nation in the American Revolution*. Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American

- History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia, by the University of North Carolina Press, 2016.
- Parrinder, Geoffrey. *West African Psychology: A Comparative Study of Psychological and Religious Thought*. Cambridge: James Clarke & Co., 2002.
- Parrinder, Geoffrey. *West African Religion: A Study of the Beliefs and Practices of Akan, Ewe, Yoruba, Ibo, and Kindred Peoples*. London: Epworth Press, 1961.
- Parrish, Susan Scott. *American Curiosity: Cultures of Natural History in the Colonial British Atlantic World*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006.
- Parsons, Christopher. "Natives, Newcomers, and Nicotiana: Tobacco in the History of the Great Lakes Region." In *French and Indians in the Heart of North America, 1630-1815*, edited by Robert Englebert and Guillaume Teasdale, 21-41. East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 2013.
- Paster, Gail Kern. "The Pith and Marrow of Our Attribute: Dialogue of Skin and Skull in *Hamlet* and Holbein's *The Ambassadors*." *Textual Practice* 23, 2 (2009): 247-265.
- Paster, Gail Kern. *Humoring the Body: Emotions and the Shakespearean Stage*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004.
- Paster, Gail Kern. "The Epistemology of the Water Closet: John Harrington's *Metamorphosis of Ajax* and Elizabethan Technologies of Shame." In *Material Culture and Cultural Materialisms*, edited by Curtis Perry, 139-158. Turnhout: Brepols Publishers, 2001.
- Paster, Gail Kern. "Nervous Tension." In *The Body in Parts: Fantasies of Corporeality in Early Modern Europe*, edited by David Hillman and Carla Mazzio, 107-125. New York: Routledge, 1997.

- Paster, Gail Kern. *The Body Embarrassed: Drama and the Disciplines of Shame in Early Modern England*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1993.
- Paterson, Mark. "Haptic Geographies: Ethnography, Haptic Knowledges and Sensuous Dispositions." *Progress in Human Geography* 33, 6 (2009): 766-788.
- Paton, Diana. *The Cultural Politics of Obeah: Religion, Colonialism and Modernity in the Caribbean World*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2015.
- Paton, Diana. "The Trials of Inspector Thomas: Policing and Ethnography in Jamaica." In *Obeah and Other Powers: The Politics of Caribbean Religion and Healing*, edited by Diana Paton and Maarit Forde, 172-197. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012.
- Paton, Diana. "Witchcraft, Poison, Law, and Atlantic Slavery." *WMQ* 69, 2 (2012): 235-264.
- Paton, Diana. *No Bond but the Law: Punishment, Race, and Gender in Jamaican State Formation, 1780-1870*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2004.
- Paton, Diana. "Punishment, Crime, and the Bodies of Slaves in Eighteenth-Century Jamaica." *Journal of Social History* 34, 4 (2001): 923-954.
- Paulett, Robert. *An Empire of Small Places: Mapping the Southeastern Anglo-Indian Trade, 1732-1795*. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2012.
- Payer, Peter. "The Age of Noise." *Journal of Urban History* 33, 5 (2007): 773-793.
- Pentcheva, Bissera. *The Sensual Icon: Space, Ritual, and the Senses in Byzantium*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2010.
- Perron, Paul. "Isaac Jogues: From Martyrdom to Sainthood." In *Colonial Saints: Discovering the Holy in the Americas, 1500-1800*, edited by Allan Greer and Jodi

- Bilinkoff, 153-168. New York: Routledge, 2003.
- Peters, Julie Stone. "Orality, Literacy, and Print Revisited." In *Time, Memory, and the Verbal Arts: Essays on the Thought of Walter Ong*, edited by Dennis Weeks and Jane Susan Hoogestraat, 27-61. Selinsgrove: Susquehanna University Press, 1998.
- Petersen, Alan. *The Body in Question: A Socio-Cultural Approach*. London: Routledge, 2007.
- Pettigrew, William. *Freedom's Debt: The Royal African Company and the Politics of the Atlantic Slave Trade, 1672-1752*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2013.
- Pfaff, Donald and Carl Pfaffmann. *Taste, Olfaction, and the Central Nervous System: A Festschrift in Honor of Carl Pfaffmann*. New York: Rockefeller University Press, 1985.
- Picciotto, Joanna. *Labors of Innocence in Early Modern England*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2010,
- Pickering, Andrew. *Science as Practice and Culture*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992.
- Pickett, Holly Crawford. "The Idolatrous Nose: Incense on the Early Modern Stage." In *Religion and Drama in Early Modern England: The Performance of Religion on the Renaissance Stage*, edited by Jane Hwang Degenhardt and Elizabeth Williamson, 19-38. Farnham, Surrey, England: Ashgate, 2011.
- Pike, David. "Sewage Treatments: Vertical Space and Waste in Nineteenth-Century Paris and London." In *Filth: Dirt, Disgust, and Modern Life*, edited by William Cohen and Ryan Johnson, 51-77. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005.

- Platt, Peter. *Reason Diminished: Shakespeare and the Marvelous*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1997.
- Pocock, J. G. A. *The Machiavellian Moment: Florentine Political Thought and the Atlantic Republican Tradition*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1975.
- Popkin, Richard. "The Philosophical Basis of Eighteenth-Century Racism." *Studies in Eighteenth-Century Culture* 3 (1973): 245-262.
- Porteous, J. Douglas. "Smellscape." In *The Smell Culture Reader*, edited by Jim Drobnick, 89-106. Oxford: Berg, 2006.
- Porteous, J. Douglas. *Landscapes of the Mind: Worlds of Sense and Metaphor*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1990.
- Portuondo, María. *Secret Science: Spanish Cosmography and the New World*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009.
- Potter, David. "Odor and Power in the Roman Empire." In *Constructions of the Classical Body*, edited by James Porter, 169-189. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1999.
- Prager, Carolyn. "'If I Be Devil': English Renaissance Response to the Proverbial and Ecumenical Ethiopian." *Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies* 17, 2 (Fall, 1987): 257-279.
- Prance, Ghilleen, and Mark Nesbitt. *The Cultural History of Plants*. New York: Routledge, 2005.
- Rice, James. *Nature and History in the Potomac Country: From Hunter-Gatherers to the Age of Jefferson*. Baltimore, Maryland: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2009.
- Pratt, Mary Louise. *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation*. London:

- Routledge, 1992.
- Pratt, Mary Louise. "Scratches on the Face of the Country; or, What Mr. Barrow Saw in the Land of the Bushmen." *Critical Inquiry* 12, 1 (1985): 119-143.
- Press, Daniel, and Steven Minta. "The Smell of Nature: Olfaction, Knowledge and the Environment." *Ethics, Place & Environment* 3, 2 (2000): 173-186.
- Price, Richard. "On the Miracle of Creolization." In *Afro-Atlantic Dialogues: Anthropology in Diaspora*, edited by Kevin Yelvington, 115-147. Santa Fe: School of American Research Press, 2006.
- Price, Richard. "Dialogical Encounters in a Space of Death." In *New World Orders: Violence, Sanction, and Authority in the Colonial Americas*, edited by John Smolenski and Thomas Humphrey, 47-65. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005.
- Price, Richard. "The Miracle of Creolization; a Retrospective." *New West Indian Guide* 75 (2001): 35-64.
- Promey, Sally. "Religion, Sensation, and Materiality: An Introduction." In *Sensational Religion*, edited by Sally Promey, 1-22. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014.
- Purnell, Carolyn. *The Sensational Past: How the Enlightenment Changed the Way We Use Our Senses*. New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 2017.
- Putnam, Lara. "Rites of Power and Rumors of Race: The Circulation of Supernatural Knowledge in the Greater Caribbean, 1890–1940." In *Obeah and Other Powers: The Politics of Caribbean Religion and Healing*, edited by Diana Paton and Maarit Forde, 243-267. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012.
- Putnam, Lara. "To Study the Fragments/Whole: Microhistory and the Atlantic World."

- Journal of Social History* 39, 3 (2006): 615-630.
- Quiviger, François. *The Sensory World of Italian Renaissance Art*. London: Reaktion Books, 2010.
- Rabinow, Paul, and Nikolas Rose. "Biopower Today." In *Biopower: Foucault and Beyond*, edited by Vernon Cisney and Nicolae Morar, 297-325. Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2016.
- Rahming, Melvin. "Reading Spirit: Cosmological Considerations in Garfield Linton's *Voodooism: A Book of Foretelling*." In *Literary Expressions of African Spirituality*, edited by Carol Marsh-Lockett and Elizabeth West, 35-62. Lanham: Lexington Books, 2013.
- Ramachandran, Ayesha. *The Worldmakers: Global Imagining in Early Modern Europe*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016.
- Ramey, Lauri. *Slave Songs and the Birth of African American Poetry*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.
- Ramsay, Stephen. *Reading Machines; Toward an Algorithmic Criticism*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2011.
- Ramsey, Kate. *The Spirits and the Law: Vodou and Power in Haiti*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011.
- Rancière, Jacques. *Proletarian Nights: the Workers' Dream in Nineteenth-Century France*. London: Verso Books, 2012.
- Rancière, Jacques. *The Politics of Aesthetics: The Distribution of the Sensible*. London: Continuum, 2004.
- Rancière, Jacques, and Steve Corcoran. *Dissensus: On Politics and Aesthetics*. London:

- Continuum, 2010.
- Rasmussen, Susan. "Matters of Taste: Food, Eating, and Reflections on 'the Body Politic' in Tuareg Society." *Journal of Anthropological Research* 52, 1 (1996), 61-83.
- Rath, Richard Cullen. "Hearing Wampum: The Senses, Mediation, and the Limits of Analogy." In *Colonial Mediascapes: Sensory Worlds of the Early Americas*, edited by Matt Cohen and Jeffrey Glover, 290-314. Lincoln: Nebraska, 2014.
- Rath, Richard Cullen. *How Early America Sounded*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2003.
- Rath, Richard Cullen. "Drums and Power: Ways of Creolizing Music in Coastal South Carolina and Georgia, 1730-99." In *Creolization in the Americas*, edited by David Buisseret and Steven Reinhardt, 99-130. College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 2000.
- Rath, Richard Cullen. "African Music in Seventeenth-Century Jamaica: Cultural Transit and Transition." *WMQ* 50, 4 (Oct., 1993): 700-726.
- Rawcliffe, Carole. "'Delectable Sights and Fragrant Smelles': Gardens and Health in Late Medieval and Early Modern England." *Garden History* 36, 1 (2008): 3-21.
- Redden, Andrew. "Vipers under the Altar Cloth: Satanic and Angelic Forms in Seventeenth-Century New Granada." In *Angels, Demons and the New World*, edited by Fernando Cervantes and Andrew Redden, 146-170. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.
- Reddy, William. *The Navigation of Feeling: A Framework for the History of the Emotions*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- Redfield, Marc. *The Politics of Aesthetics: Nationalism, Gender, Romanticism*. Stanford,

- Calif: Stanford University Press, 2003.
- Rediker, Marcus. *The Slave Ship: A Human History*. New York: Penguin Books, 2008.
- Regan, Shaun. "Learning Not to Curse: Swearing, Testimony, and Truth in Olaudah Equiano's *The Interesting Narrative*." *The Eighteenth Century* 54, 3 (2013): 339-358.
- Regis, Pamela. *Describing Early America: Bartram, Jefferson, Crèvecoeur, and the Rhetoric of Natural History*. DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 1992.
- Reichel-Dolmatoff, Gerardo. "Tapir Avoidance in the Colombian Northwest Amazon." In *Animal Myths and Metaphors in South America*, edited by Gary Urton, 107-124. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1985.
- Reid-Maroney, Nina. *Philadelphia's Enlightenment, 1740-1800: Kingdom of Christ, Empire of Reason*. Westport, Conn: Greenwood Press, 2001.
- Reinarz, Jonathan. *Past Scents: Historical Perspectives on Smell*. Champagne: Illinois, 2014.
- Reinarz, Jonathan. "Learning to Use Their Senses: Visitors to Voluntary Hospitals in Eighteenth-Century England." *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 35, 4 (2012): 505-520.
- Reinarz, Jonathan. "Uncommon Scents: Smell and Victorian England." In *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, edited by Martin Bronwen and Felizitas Ringham, 129-148. Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003.
- Reis, João José. "Domingos Pereira Sodre, a Nago Priest in Nineteenth-Century Bahia." In *The Changing Worlds of Atlantic Africa: Essays in Honor of Robin Law*, edited by Robin Law, Toyin Falola, and Matt Childs, 387-410. Durham, NC: Carolina

- Academic Press, 2009.
- Reis, João José. *Death Is a Festival: Funeral Rites and Rebellion in Nineteenth-Century Brazil*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2003.
- Reiss, Timothy. *Knowledge, Discovery, and Imagination in Early Modern Europe: The Rise of Aesthetic Rationalism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Reisz, Emma. "Curiosity and Rubber in the French Atlantic." *Atlantic Studies* 4, 1 (2007): 5-26.
- Relaño, Francesc. *The Shaping of Africa: Cosmographic Discourse and Cartographic Science in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002.
- Rhys-Taylor, Alex. "Urban Sensations: A Retrospective of Multisensory Drift." In *Volume VI of A Cultural History of the Senses*, edited by Constance Classen and David Howes, 55-75. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.
- Richardson, Alan. "Romantic Voodoo: Obeah and British Culture, 1797-1807." In *Sacred Possessions: Vodou, Santería, Obeah, and the Caribbean*, edited by Margarite Fernandez Olmos and Lizabeth Paravisini-Gebert, 171-194. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1997.
- Richardson, Catherine. *Shakespeare and Material Culture*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Richardson, David. "Shipboard Revolts, African Authority, and the Atlantic Slave Trade." *WMQ* 58, 1 (2001): 69-92.
- Richter, Daniel. *Before the Revolution: America's Ancient Pasts*. Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2011.
- Richter, Daniel. *Facing East from Indian Country: a Native History of Early America*.

- Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 2001.
- Richter, Daniel. "Whose Indian History?" *WMQ* 50, 2 (1993): 379-393.
- Richter, Daniel. *The Ordeal of the Longhouse: The Peoples of the Iroquois League in the Era of European Colonization*. Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture, Williamsburg, Virginia, by the University of North Carolina Press, 1992.
- Rieusset-Lemarié, Isabelle. "What Taste and Smell Add to the Political Interpretation of the Kantian Aesthetic Judgement by Arendt and Deleuze." *Proceedings of the European Society for Aesthetics* 4 (2012): 412-432.
- Rijke, Hugo de. "The Point of Long Noses: Tristram Shandy and Cyrano de Bergerac." In *Nose Book: Representations of the Nose in Literature and the Arts*, edited by Victoria De Rijke, Lene Oestermarck-Johansen, and Helen Thomas, 55-76. London: Middlesex University Press, 2000.
- Rindisbacher, Hans. "The Stench of Power." In *The Smell Culture Reader*, edited by Jim Drobnick, 137-147. Oxford & New York: Berg, 2006.
- Rindisbacher, Hans. *The Smell of Books: A Cultural-Historical Study of Olfactory Perception in Literature*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1992.
- Rinella, Michael. *Pharmakon: Plato, Drug Culture, and Identity in Ancient Athens*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2010.
- Ringham, Felizitas. "The Language of Smell." In *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, edited by Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham, 23-36. Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003.
- Rinne, Katherine. "Urban Ablutions: Cleansing Counter-Reformation Rome." In *Rome*,

- Pollution, and Propriety: Dirt, Disease, and Hygiene in the Eternal City from Antiquity to Modernity*, edited by Mark Bradley and Kenneth Stow, 182-201. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Robertson, David. "Incensed over Incense: Incense and Community in Seventeenth-Century Literature." In *Writing and Religion in England, 1558-1689: Studies in Community-Making and Cultural Memory*, edited by Roger Sell and A. W. Johnson, 389-409. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009.
- Robertson, Elizabeth. "Afterword: From Gateways to Channels. Reaching towards an Understanding of the Transformative Plasticity of the Senses in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods." In *The Five Senses in Medieval and Early Modern England*, edited by Annette Kern-Stähler, Beatrix Busse, and Wietse de Boer, 286-296. Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2016.
- Robertson, Karen. "Pocahontas at the Masque." *Signs* 21, 3 (1996): 551-583.
- Rodaway, Paul. *Sensuous Geographies: Body, Sense, and Place*. London: Routledge, 1994.
- Rodney, Walter. *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa*. Fahamu Kenya: Pambazuka Press, 2012.
- Roeder, George. "Coming to Our Senses." *Journal of American History* 81 (Dec., 1994): 1113-1122.
- Romanyshyn, Robert. *Technology as Symptom and Dream*. London: Routledge, 1989.
- Roodenburg, Herman. "Introduction: Entering the Sensory Worlds of the Renaissance." In *Volume III of A Cultural History of the Senses*, edited by Constance Classen, 1-18. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.

- Rosen, Christine. "Noisome, Noxious, and Offensive Vapors, Fumes and Stenches in American Towns and Cities, 1840-1865." *Historical Geography* 25 (1997): 49-82.
- Rosenfeld, Sophia. "The Social Life of the Senses: A New Approach to Eighteenth Century Politics and Public Life." In *Volume IV of A Cultural History of the Senses*, edited by Constance Classen and Anne Vila, 21-40. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.
- Ross, Charles. *Civil War Acoustic Shadows*. Shippensburg, Pa: White Mane Books, 2001.
- Rotter, Andrew J. "Empires of the Senses: How Seeing, Hearing, Smelling, Tasting, and Touching Shaped Imperial Encounters." *Diplomatic History* 35, 1 (2011): 3-19.
- Royster, Francesca. "White-Limed Walls: Whiteness and Gothic Extremism in Shakespeare's *Titus Andronicus*." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 51, 4 (2000): 432-455.
- Royster, Francesca. "The 'End of Race' and the Future of Early Modern Cultural Studies." *Shakespeare Studies* 26 (1998): 59-70.
- Rucker, Walter. "Conjure, Magic, and Power: The Influence of Afro-Atlantic Religious Practices on Slave Resistance and Rebellion." *Journal of Black Studies* 32, 1 (2001): 84-103.
- Rudy, Gordon. *Mystical Language of Sensation in the Later Middle Ages*. New York: Routledge, 2002.
- Rupert, Linda. *Creolization and Contraband: Curaçao in the Early Modern Atlantic World*. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2012.
- Rushforth, Brett. *Bonds of Alliance: Indigenous and Atlantic Slaveries in New France*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2012.
- Rusnock Andrea. "Biopolitics: Political Arithmetic in the Enlightenment." In *The Sciences in Enlightened Europe*, edited by William Clark, Jan Golinski, and Simon Schaffer,

- 49-68. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999.
- Russell-Wood, A. J. R. "Before Columbus: Portugal's African Prelude to the Middle Passage and Contribution to Discourse on Race and Slavery." In *Race, Discourse, and the Origin of the Americas: A New World View*, edited by Vera Lawrence Hyatt and Rex Nettleford, 134-168. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995.
- Safier, Neil. *Measuring the New World: Enlightenment Science and South America*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008.
- Said, Edward. *Orientalism*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1978.
- Sale, Carolyn. "Black Aeneas: Race, English Literary History, and the 'Barbarous' Poetics of *Titus Andronicus*." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 62, 1 (2011): 25-52.
- Sandberg, Brian. "Beyond Encounters: Religion, Ethnicity, and Violence in the Early Modern Atlantic World, 1492-1700." *Journal of World History* 17, 1 (2006): 1-25.
- Saucier, Catherine. "The Sweet Sound of Sanctity: Sensing St Lambert." *The Senses and Society* 5, 1 (2010): 10-27.
- Saunders, Ben. "Iago's Clyster: Purgation, Anality, and the Civilizing Process." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 55, 2 (2004): 148-176.
- Savage, John. "Slave Poison/Slave Medicine: The Persistence of Obeah in Early Nineteenth-Century Martinique." In *Obeah and Other Powers: The Politics of Caribbean Religion and Healing*, edited by Diana Paton and Maarit Forde, 149-171. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012.
- Savage, John. "'Black Magic' and White Terror: Slave Poisoning and Colonial Society in Early 19th Century Martinique." *Journal of Social History* 40, 3 (2007): 635-662.
- Sawday, Jonathan. *The Body Emblazoned: Dissection and the Human Body in Renaissance*

- Culture*. London: Routledge, 1995.
- Scammell, G. V. "Essay and Reflection: On the Discovery of the Americas and the Spread of Intolerance, Absolutism, and Racism in Early Modern Europe." *The International History Review* 13, 3 (1991): 502-521.
- Scarre, Geoffrey, and John Callow. *Witchcraft and Magic in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century Europe*. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001.
- Schafer, R. Murray. *The Tuning of the World*. New York: A.A. Knopf, 1977.
- Schaffer, Simon, "Enlightened Automata." In *The Sciences in Enlightened Europe*, edited by William Clark, Jan Golinski, and Simon Schaffer, 126-168. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999.
- Schaffer, Simon. "Visions of Empire; Afterword." In *Visions of Empire: Voyages, Botany, and Representations of Nature*, edited by David Philip Miller and Peter Hanns Reill, 335-352. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Schechner, Richard. "Rasaesthetics." In *The Senses in Performance*, edited by Sally Banes and André Lepecki, 10-28. New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Scheer, Monique. "Are Emotions a Kind of Practice (And Is That What Makes Them Have a History)? A Bourdieuan Approach to Understanding Emotion." *History and Theory* 51 (May 2012): 193-220.
- Schiebinger, Londa. *Plants and Empire: Colonial Bioprospecting in the Atlantic World*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2004.
- Schiebinger, Londa. "Gender and Natural History." In *Cultures of Natural History*, edited by Nicholas Jardine, James Secord, and E. C. Spary, 163-177. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.

- Schiebinger, Londa. *Nature's Body: Gender in the Making of Modern Science*. Boston, Mass: Beacon Press, 1993.
- Schiebinger, Londa. "The Anatomy of Difference: Race and Sex in Eighteenth-Century Science." *Eighteenth-Century Studies* 23, 4 (1990): 387-405.
- Schier, Volker. "Probing the Mystery of the Use of Saffron in Medieval Nunneries." *The Senses and Society* 5, 1 (2010): 57-72.
- Schivelbusch, Wolfgang. *Tastes of Paradise: A Social History of Spices, Stimulants, and Intoxicants*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1992.
- Schmidt, Benjamin. *Inventing Exoticism: Geography, Globalism, and Europe's Early Modern World*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2015.
- Schmidt, Gary. *The Iconography of the Mouth of Hell: Eighth-Century Britain to the Fifteenth Century*. Selinsgrove, Pa.: Susquehanna University Press, 1995.
- Schneider, Jane. "Fantastical Colors in Foggy London: The New Fashion Potential of the Late Sixteenth Century." In *Material London, Ca. 1600*, edited by Lena Cowen Orlin, 109-127. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2000.
- Schoenfeldt, Michael Carl. *Bodies and Selves in Early Modern England: Physiology and Inwardness in Spenser, Shakespeare, Herbert, and Milton*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- Schrader, Abby. "Market Pleasures and Prostitution in St. Petersburg." In *Russian History Through the Senses: From 1700 to the Present*, edited by Matthew Romaniello and Tricia Starks, 67-94. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2016.
- Schroth, Raymond. *The American Jesuits: A History*. New York: New York University, 2007.

- Schuler, Monica. *"Alas, Alas, Kongo": A Social History of Indentured Africa Immigration into Jamaica, 1841-1865*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1980.
- Schwartz, Hillel. *Making Noise: From Babel to the Big Bang & Beyond*. Brooklyn, NY: Zone Books, 2011.
- Schwenger, Peter. "Phenomenology of the Scream." *Critical Inquiry* 40, 2 (2014): 382-395.
- Scodel, Joshua. *Excess and the Mean in Early Modern English Literature*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2002.
- Scott, James. *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990.
- Scott, Julius. "A Common Wind: Currents of Afro-American Communication in the Age of the Haitian Revolution." PhD. Dissertation. Duke University, 1986.
- Scully, Virginia. *A Treasury of American Indian Herbs: Their Lore and Their Use for Food, Drugs, and Medicine*. New York: Crown Publishers, 1970.
- Sebeok, Thomas. *Signs: An Introduction to Semiotics*. Toronto, Ont.: University of Toronto Press, 2001.
- Segal, Charles. "Synaesthesia in Sophocles." *Illinois Classical Studies* 2 (1977): 88-96.
- Seiler, Thomas. "Filth and Stench as Aspects of the Iconography of Hell." In *The Iconography of Hell*, edited by Clifford Davidson and Thomas Seiler, 132-140. Kalamazoo, MI: Western Michigan University, 1992.
- Serres, Michel, and Anne-Marie Feenberg-Dibon. *Malfeasance: Appropriation through Pollution?* Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2011.
- Serres, Michel. *The Five Senses: a Philosophy of Mingled Bodies*. London: Continuum,

- 2009.
- Serres, Michel, and Lawrence Schehr. *The Parasite*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1982.
- Seshadri-Crooks, Kalpana. *Desiring Whiteness: A Lacanian Analysis of Race*. London: Routledge, 2000.
- Sewell Jr., William. "Geertz, Cultural Systems, and History: From Synchrony to Transformation." *Representations* 59, 1 (1997): 35-55.
- Shapin, Steven. *The Scientific Revolution*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1996.
- Shapin, Steven. "Homo Phrenologicus: Anthropological Perspectives on an Historical Problem." In *Natural Order: Historical Studies of Scientific Culture*, edited by Barry Barnes and Steven Shapin, 41-72. Beverly Hills, Calif.: Sage Publications, 1979.
- Shapin, Steven, and Simon Schaffer. *Leviathan and the Air-Pump: Hobbes, Boyle, and the Experimental Life*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2011.
- Shapiro, Barbara. *Probability and Certainty in Seventeenth-Century England: A Study of the Relationships between Natural Science, Religion, History, Law, and Literature*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1983.
- Shapiro, Lisa. "How We Experience the World: Passionate Perception in Descartes and Spinoza." In *Emotion and Cognitive Life in Medieval and Early Modern Philosophy*, edited by Martin Pickavé and Lisa Shapiro, 193-216. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Shapiro, Stephen. *The Culture and Commerce of the Early American Novel: Reading the Atlantic World-System*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2008.

- Sharma, Sanjay. "Unravelling Difference: Towards a Sensory Multiculture." *Senses & Society* 6 (2011): 284-305.
- Sharpe, J. A. *Instruments of Darkness: Witchcraft in England, 1550–1750*. London: Penguin, 1996.
- Shaw, Jenny. *Everyday Life in the Early English Caribbean: Irish, Africans, and the Construction of Difference*. Athens, University of Georgia Press, 2013.
- Shennen, Stephen. "Ethnic Ambiguity: A Cultural Evolutionary Perspective." In *Ethnic Ambiguity and the African Past: Materiality, History, and the Shaping of Cultural Identities*, edited by Francois Richard and Kevin MacDonald, 272-285. Walnut Creek, California: Left Coast Press, Inc.
- Sheridan, Richard. *Doctors and Slaves: A Medical and Demographic History of Slavery in the British West Indies, 1680-1834*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.
- Shields, David. "The Atlantic World, the Senses, and the Arts." In *The Oxford Handbook of the Atlantic World, C.1450-C.1850*, edited by Nicholas Canny and Philip Morgan, 130-146. Oxford: New York, 2011.
- Shields, David. *Oracles of Empire: Poetry, Politics, and Commerce in British America, 1690-1750*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990.
- Shipman, Pat. *The Evolution of Racism: Human Differences and the Use and Abuse of Science*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 1994.
- Shoemaker, Nancy. "The Body as a Source of Sameness and Difference in Eighteenth Century American Indian Diplomacy East of the Mississippi." In *A Centre of Wonders: The Body in Early America*, edited by Janet Moore Lindman and Michele Lise Tarter, 211-222. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2001.

- Shore, Laurence. "The Enduring Power of Racism: A Reconsideration of Winthrop Jordan's *White Over Black*." *History and Theory* 44, 2 (2005): 195-226.
- Shore, Paul. *Jesuits and the Politics of Religious Pluralism in Eighteenth-Century Transylvania: Culture, Politics, and Religion, 1693-1773*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007.
- Shotwell, Alexis. *Knowing Otherwise: Race, Gender, and Implicit Understanding*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2011.
- Shove, Elizabeth. *Comfort, Cleanliness and Convenience: The Social Organization of Normality*. Oxford, England: Berg, 2003.
- Shular, Jack. *Calling Out Liberty: The Stono Slave Rebellion and Universal Struggle for Human Rights*. Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2009.
- Shusterman, Richard. *Thinking through the Body: Essays in Somaesthetics*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Shyllon, F. O. *Black People in Britain 1555-1833*. London: Published for the Institute of Race Relations by Oxford University Press, 1977.
- Sidbury, James. *Becoming African in America: Race and Nation in the Early Black Atlantic*. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Siedentop, Larry. *Inventing the Individual: The Origins of Western Liberalism*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2014.
- Siegel, Rudolph. *Galen on Sense Perception: His Doctrines, Observations and Experiments on Vision, Hearing, Smell, Taste, Touch and Pain, and Their Historical Sources*. Basel: S. Karger, 1970.
- Silva, Cristobal. *Miraculous Plagues: An Epidemiology of Early New England Narrative*.

- Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Silverblatt, Irene. "Andean Witches and Virgins: Seventeenth Century Nativism and Subversive Gender Ideologies." In *Women, "Race," and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, edited by Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker, 259-271. London: Routledge, 1994.
- Silverman, David. "Indians, Missionaries, and Religious Translation: Creating Wampanoag Christianity in Seventeenth-Century Martha's Vineyard." *WMQ* 62, 2 (2005): 141-174.
- Simonsen, Gunvor. "Belonging in Africa: Frederik Svane and Christian Protten on the Gold Coast in the Eighteenth Century." *Itinerario* 39, 1 (2015): 91-115.
- Simonsen, Gunvor. "Skin Color as a Tool of Regulation and Power in the Danish West Indies in the Eighteenth Century." *Kruispunt* 187 (2001): 191-216.
- Simmons, Alison. "Descartes on the Cognitive Structure of Sensory Experience." *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* 67, 3 (Nov., 2003): 549-579.
- Singleton, Theresa. "Slavery and Spatial Dialectics on Cuban Coffee Plantations." *World Archaeology* 33, 1 (2001): 98-114.
- Sladen, Chris. "Past Scents: The Importance of a Sense of Smell to the Historian." In *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, edited by Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham, 149-168. Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003.
- Slaughter, M. M. *Universal Languages and Scientific Taxonomy in the Seventeenth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982.
- Slaughter, Thomas. *The Natures of John and William Bartram*. New York: Knopf. 1996.
- Slauter, Eric Thomas. *The State as a Work of Art: The Cultural Origins of the Constitution*.

- Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009.
- Slenes, Robert. "The Great Porpoise-Skull Strike: Central-African Water Spirits and Slave Identity in Early Nineteenth-century Rio De Janeiro." In *Central Africans and Cultural Transformations in the American Diaspora*, edited by Linda Heywood, 183-208. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Sliwa, Martyna, and Kathleen Riach. "Making Scents of Transition: Smellscapes and the Everyday in 'old' and 'new' Urban Poland." *Urban Studies* 49 (2012): 23-42.
- Sloan, Phillip. "The Idea of Racial Degeneracy in Buffon's *Histoire Naturelle*." In *Studies in Eighteenth-Century Culture*, edited by American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies, 293-322. Cleveland, Ohio: Press of Case Western Reserve University, 1971.
- Smith, Bruce. "Afterword: Senses of an Ending." In *Shakespearean Sensations Experiencing Literature in Early Modern England*, edited by Katharine Craik and Tanya Pollard, 208-217. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.
- Smith, Bruce. *The Key of Green: Passion and Perception in Renaissance Culture*. Chicago: University of Chicago, 2009.
- Smith, Bruce. "How Sound is Sound History?: A Response to Mark Smith." *The Journal of The Historical Society* II: 3-4 (Summer/Fall 2002): 307-315.
- Smith, Bruce. *The Acoustic World of Early Modern England: Attending to the O-Factor*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999.
- Smith, Ian. "We Are Othello: Speaking of Race in Early Modern Studies." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 67, 1 (2016): 104-124.
- Smith, Ian. *Race and Rhetoric in the Renaissance: Barbarian Errors*. New York: Palgrave

- Macmillan, 2009.
- Smith, Ian. "White Skin, Black Masks: Racial Cross-Dressing on the Early Modern Stage." *Renaissance Drama* 32 (2003): 33-68.
- Smith, Ian. "Barbarian Errors: Performing Race in Early Modern England." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 49, 2 (1998): 168-186.
- Smith, Ian. "Those 'slippery customers': Rethinking Race in *Titus Andronicus*." *Journal of Theatre and Drama* 3 (1997): 45-58.
- Smith, Jeffrey Chipps. *Sensuous Worship: Jesuits and the Art of the Early Catholic Reformation in Germany*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2002.
- Smith, Jillyn and Chris Smith. *Senses and Sensibilities*. New York: J. Wiley, 1989.
- Smith, Justin. *Nature, Human Nature, and Human Difference: Race in Early Modern Philosophy*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2015.
- Smith, Mark. "Transcending, Othering, Detecting: Smell, Premodernity, Modernity." *Postmedieval* 3, 4 (2012): 380-390.
- Smith, Mark. "Getting in Touch with Slavery and Freedom." *The Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 381-391.
- Smith, Mark. "The Senses in American History: A Round Table Still Coming to 'Our' Senses: An Introduction." *Journal of American History* 95, 2 (2008): 378-380.
- Smith, Mark. "Producing Sense, Consuming Sense, Making Sense: Perils and Prospects for Sensory History." *Journal of Social History* 40, 4 (2007): 841-858.
- Smith, Mark. *Sensing the Past: Seeing, Hearing, Smelling, Tasting, and Touching in History*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007.
- Smith, Mark. *How Race Is Made: Slavery, Segregation, and the Senses*. Chapel Hill:

- University of North Carolina Press, 2006.
- Smith, Mark. "Finding Deficiency. On Eugenics, Economics, and Certainty." *American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 64, 3 (2005): 887-900.
- Smith, Mark. "Making Scents Make Sense: White Noses, Black Smells, and Desegregation." In *American Behavioral History: An Introduction*, edited by Peter Stearns, 181-200. New York: New York University Press, 2005.
- Smith, Mark. "Making Sense of Social History." *Journal of Social History* 37, 1 (2003): 165-186.
- Smith, Mark. *Listening to Nineteenth-Century America*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2001.
- Smith, Mark. *Debating Slavery: Economy and Society in the Antebellum American South*. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- Smith, Mark. "Old South Time in Comparative Perspective." *American Historical Review* 101 (December, 1996): 1432-1469.
- Smith, Pamela. *The Body of the Artisan: Art and Experience in the Scientific Revolution*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004.
- Smith, Pamela. *The Business of Alchemy: Science and Culture in the Holy Roman Empire*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994.
- Smith, Peter. *Between Two Stools: Scatology and Its Representations in English Literature, Chaucer to Swift*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2012.
- Smith, Steven. *Modernity and Its Discontents: Making and Unmaking the Bourgeois from Machiavelli to Bellow*. New Haven; London: Yale University Press, 2016.
- Smolenski, John. *Friends and Strangers: The Making of a Creole Culture in Colonial*

- Pennsylvania*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010.
- Smolenski, John. "Introduction: The Ordering of Authority in the Colonial Americas." In *New World Orders: Violence, Sanction, and Authority in the Colonial Americas*, edited by John Smolenski and Thomas Humphrey, 1-16. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005.
- Snowden, Frank. *Before Color Prejudice: The Ancient View of Blacks*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1983.
- Snowden, Frank. *Blacks in Antiquity: Ethiopians in the Greco-Roman Experience*. Cambridge, Mass: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1970.
- Sobel, Mechal. *The World They Made Together: Black and White Values in Eighteenth-Century Virginia*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1987.
- Solander, Tove. "Signature Scents." *The Senses and Society* 5, 3 (2010): 301-321.
- Soyinka, Wole. "Shakespeare the Living Dramatist." In *Shakespeare and Race*, edited by Catherine Alexander and Stanley Wells, 82-100. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Spary, Emma. "Of Nutmegs and Botanists." In *Colonial Botany: Science, Commerce and Politics in the Early Modern World*, edited by Londa Schiebinger and Claudia Swan, 187-203. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005.
- Spary, Emma. "Political, Natural, and Bodily Economies." In *Cultures of Natural History*, edited by Nicholas Jardine, James Secord, and E. C. Spary, 178-196. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Specter, Michael. *Denialism: How Irrational Thinking Hinders Scientific Progress, Harms the Planet, and Threatens Our Lives*. New York: Penguin Press, 2009.

- Sperber, Dan. *Rethinking Symbolism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1975.
- Springer, James Warren. "An Ethnohistoric Study of the Smoking Complex in Eastern North America." *Ethnohistory* 28, 3 (1981): 217-235.
- Stafford, Barbara Maria. "Presuming Images and Consuming Words: The Visualization of Knowledge from the Enlightenment to Post-Modernism." In *Consumption and the World of Goods*, edited by John Brewer and Roy Porter, 462-477. London; New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Stallybrass, Peter, and Allon White. *The Politics and Poetics of Transgression*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1986.
- Stallybrass, Peter, and Ann Rosalind Jones. "Fetishizing the Glove in Renaissance Europe." *Critical Inquiry* 28, 1 (2001): 114-132.
- Stanbury, Sarah. *The Visual Object of Desire in Late Medieval England*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008.
- Stanev, Hristomir. *Sensory Experience and the Metropolis on the Jacobean Stage (1603-1625)*. Farnham: Ashgate Publishing Ltd., 2014.
- Stanev, Hristomir. "The City Out of Breath: Jacobean City Comedy and the Odors of Restraint." *Postmedieval* 3, 4 (2012): 423-435.
- Stearns, Peter, and Carol Stearns. "Emotionology: Clarifying the History of Emotions and Emotional Standards." *American Historical Review* 90, 4 (October, 1985): 813-836.
- Stearns, Raymond Phineas. *Science in the British Colonies of America*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1970.
- Steedman, Carolyn. *Dust*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2001.

- Stenslund, Anette. "A Whiff of Nothing: The Atmospheric Absence of Smell." *The Senses and Society* 10, 3 (2016): 341-360.
- Stepan, Nancy. *Picturing Tropical Nature*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2001.
- Stepan, Nancy. *The Hour of Eugenics: Race, Gender, and Nation in Latin America*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1991.
- Stepan, Nancy. *The Idea of Race in Science: Great Britain, 1800-1960*. Hamden, Conn.: Archon Books, 1982.
- Stern, Julia. *The Plight of Feeling: Sympathy and Dissent in the Early American Novel*. Chicago, Ill.: University of Chicago Press, 1997.
- Stevens, Benjamin. "The Scent of Language and Social Synaesthesia at Rome." *Classical World* 101, 2 (2008): 159-171.
- Stevens, Catherine. "'You shal reade marvelous straunge things': Ludwig Lavater and the Hauntings of the Reformation." In *Supernatural and Secular Power in Early Modern England*, edited by Marcus Hermes and Victoria Bladen, 141-162. Farnham, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2015.
- Stewart, Dianne. *Three Eyes for the Journey: African Dimensions of the Jamaican Religious Experience*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- Stewart, Susan. *Poetry and the Fate of the Senses*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002.
- Stoddart, D. Michael. *Adam's Nose, and the Making of Humankind*. Hoboken, NJ: Imperial College Press, 2015.
- Stoddart, D. Michael. *The Scented Ape*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- Stolcke, Verene. "Invaded Women: Gender, Race, and Class in the Formation of Colonial

- Society.” In *Women, "Race," and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, edited by Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker, 272-286. London: Routledge, 1994.
- Stoler, Ann Laura. *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power: Race and the Intimate in Colonial Rule*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002.
- Stoler, Ann Laura. *Race and the Education of Desire: Foucault's History of Sexuality and the Colonial Order of Things*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1995.
- Stoler, Ann Laura, and Frederick Cooper. “Between Metropole and Colony: Rethinking a Research Agenda.” In *Tensions of Empire: Colonial Cultures in a Bourgeois World*, edited by Frederick Cooper and Ann Laura Stoler, 1-58. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997.
- Stoller, Paul. *The Taste of Ethnographic Things: The Senses in Anthropology*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1989.
- Stow, Kenneth. “Was the Ghetto Cleaner...” In *Rome, Pollution, and Propriety: Dirt, Disease, and Hygiene in the Eternal City from Antiquity to Modernity*, edited by Mark Bradley and Kenneth Stow, 169-181. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Straughan, E. R. "The Smell of the Moon." *Cultural Geographies*. 22, 3 (2015): 409-426.
- Straus, Erwin. *Man, Time, and World: Two Contributions to Anthropological Psychology*. Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press, 1982.
- Straus, Erwin. *The Primary World of Senses: A Vindication of Sensory Experience*. New York: Free Press of Glencoe, 1963.
- Stroud, Ellen. “Dead Bodies in Harlem: Environmental History and the Geography of Death.” In *The Nature of Cities*, edited by Andrew Isenberg, 62-76. Rochester, NY:

- University of Rochester Press, 2006.
- Stuurman, Siep. "Francois Bernier and the Invention of Racial Classification." *History Workshop Journal* 50 (2000): 1-21.
- Summers, David. *The Judgement of Sense: Renaissance Naturalism and the Rise of Aesthetics*. Cambridge, Mass.: Cambridge University Press, 1994.
- Sutton, David. *Remembrance of Repasts: An Anthropology of Food and Memory*. Oxford: Berg, 2001.
- Sweet, James. *Domingos Álvares: African Healing, and the Intellectual History of the Atlantic World*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2011.
- Sweet, James. *Recreating Africa: Culture, Kinship, and Religion in the African-Portuguese World, 1441-1770*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2003.
- Sweet, James. "The Iberian Roots of American Racist Thought." *WMQ* 54, 1 (1997): 143-166.
- Swingen, Abigail Leslie. *Competing Visions of Empire: Labor, Slavery, and the Origins of the British Atlantic Empire*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2015.
- Synnott, Anthony. "A Sociology of Smell." *Canadian Review of Sociology/Revue Canadienne De Sociologie* 28, 4 (2008): 437-459.
- Synnott, Anthony. "Puzzling over the Senses: From Plato to Marx." In *The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses*, edited by David Howes, 61-69. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991.
- Taladoire, Eric. "The Americas: Hygiene, Body Care and Physical Appearance in Pre-Hispanic Meso-American Societies." In *Perfume, a Global History: From the Origins to Today*, edited by Marie-Christine Grasse, 23-30. Paris: Somogy Art

- Publishers, 2007.
- Talbot, Ann. *"The Great Ocean of Knowledge": The Influence of Travel Literature on the Work of John Locke*. Leiden: Brill, 2010.
- Tarr, Joel. *The Search for the Ultimate Sink: Urban Pollution in Historical Perspective*. Akron, Ohio: University of Akron Press, 1996.
- Taussig, Michael. *What Color Is the Sacred?* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009.
- Taussig, Michael. *The Magic of the State*. New York: Routledge, 1997.
- Taussig, Michael. *Mimesis and Alterity: A Particular History of the Senses*. New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Taussig, Michael. *The Nervous System*. New York: Routledge, 1992.
- Taussig, Michael. *Shamanism, Colonialism, and the Wild Man: A Study in Terror and Healing*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1986.
- Taylor, Alan. *American Colonies*. New York: Viking, 2001.
- Taylor, Charles. *The Language Animal: The Full Shape of the Human Linguistic Capacity*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2016.
- Taylor, Charles. "Inwardness and the Culture of Modernity." In *Philosophical Interventions in the Unfinished Project of Enlightenment*, edited by Axel Honneth, Thomas McCarthy, Claus Offe, and Albrecht Wllmer, 88-112. Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 1992.
- Taylor, Diana. *The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2003.
- Taylor, Eric. *Lethal Mists: An Introduction to the Natural and Military Sciences of Chemical, Biological Warfare and Terrorism*. Huntington, NY: Nova Science,

1998.

- Teich, Mikuláš. "Mapping the Human Genome in the Light of History." In *Nature and Society in Historical Context*, edited by Mikuláš Teich, Roy Porter, and Bo Gustafsson, 308-331. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Telles, Edward Eric. "The Project on Ethnicity and Race in Latin America (PERLA): Hard Data and what is at Stake." In *Pigmentocracies: Ethnicity, Race, and Color in Latin America*, edited by Edward Eric Telles, 1-35. Chapel Hill: UNC Press, 2014.
- Telo, Mario. "Aristophanes, Cratinus and the Smell of Comedy." In *Synaesthesia and the Ancient Senses*, edited by Shane Butler and Alex Purves, 53-70. Durham, UK: Acumen, 2013.
- Teslow, Tracy. *Constructing Race: The Science of Bodies and Cultures in American Anthropology*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- Thick, Malcolm. "Root Crops and the Feeding of London's Poor in the Late Sixteenth and Early Seventeenth Centuries." In *English Rural Society, 1500-1800: Essays in Honour of Joan Thirsk*, edited by Joan Thirsk, John Chartres, and David Hey, 279-296. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- Thomas, Keith. "Cleanliness and Godliness in Early Modern England." In *Religion, Culture, and Society in Early Modern Britain: Essays in Honour of Patrick Collinson*, edited by Patrick Collinson, Anthony Fletcher, and Peter Roberts, 56-83. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.
- Thomas, Keith. *Man and the Natural World: Changing Attitudes in England, 1500-1800*. London: Allen Lane, 1983.
- Thomas, Keith. *Religion and the Decline of Magic*. New York: Scribner, 1971.

- Thompson, Barbara. "The African Female Body in the Cultural Imagination." In *Black Womanhood: Images, Icons, and Ideologies of the African Body*, edited by Barbara Thompson and Ifi Amadiume, 27-48. Hanover, NH: Hood Museum of Art, Dartmouth College in Association with University of Washington Press, 2008.
- Thompson, C. J. S. *The Mystery and Lure of Perfume*. Philadelphia: J.B. Lippincott, 1927.
- Thompson, Emily Ann. *The Soundscape of Modernity: Architectural Acoustics and the Culture of Listening in America, 1900-1933*. Cambridge, Mass.: M. I. T. Press, 2002.
- Thompson, Katrina Dyonne. *Ring Shout, Wheel About: The Racial Politics of Music and Dance in North American Slavery*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2014.
- Thompson, Michael. *Rubbish Theory: The Creation and Destruction of Value*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1979.
- Thompson, Robert Farris. *Face of the Gods: Art and Altars of Africa and the African Americas*. New York: Museum for African Art, 1993.
- Thompson, Robert Farris. *Flash of the Spirit: African and Afro-American Art and Philosophy*. New York: Random House, 1983.
- Thornton, John. *A Cultural History of the Atlantic World, 1250-1820*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Thornton, John. "Religious and Ceremonial Life in the Congo and Mbundu Areas, 1500-1700." In *Central Africans and Cultural Transformations in the American Diaspora*, edited by Linda Heywood, 71-90. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Thurkill, Mary. *Sacred Scents in Early Christianity and Islam*. Lanham: Lexington Books,

- 2016.
- Thurkill, Mary. "Odors of Sanctity: Distinctions of the Holy in Early Christianity and Islam." *Comparative Islamic Studies* 3, 2 (2009): 133-144.
- Tilley, Christopher. *A Phenomenology of Landscape: Places, Paths, and Monuments*. Oxford, UK: Berg, 1994.
- Tise, Larry. *Proslavery: A History of the Defense of Slavery in America, 1701-1840*. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1987.
- Todorov, Tzvetan. *On Human Diversity: Nationalism, Racism, and Exoticism in French Thought*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1993.
- Todorov, Tzvetan. *The Conquest of America: The Question of the Other*. New York: Harper & Row, 1984.
- Tokarev, Sergeij. "Toward a Methodology for the Ethnographic Study of Material Culture." In *American Material Culture and Folklife: A Prologue and Dialogue*, edited by Simon Bronner, 77-101. Ann Arbor, Mich.: UMI Research Press, 1985.
- Tokson, Elliot. *The Popular Image of the Black Man in English Drama, 1550-1688*. Boston, Mass.: G. K. Hall, 1982.
- Tomlin, Christopher. "Law's Wilderness: The Discourse of English Colonizing, the Violence of Intrusion, and the Failures of American History." In *New World Orders: Violence, Sanction, and Authority in the Colonial Americas*, edited by John Smolenski and Thomas Humphrey, 21-46. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005.
- Tomlinson, Gary. *The Singing of the New World: Indigenous Voice in the Era of European Contact*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2007.

- Toner, Jerry. "Smell and Christianity." In *Smell and the Ancient Senses*, edited by Mark Bradley, 158-170. London; New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2015.
- Totelin, Laurence. "Smell as Sign and Cure in Ancient Medicine." In *Smell and the Ancient Senses*, edited by Mark Bradley, 17-29. London; New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2015.
- Trotter, David. *Cooking with Mud: The Idea of Mess in Nineteenth-Century Art and Fiction*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Trouillot, Michel-Rolph. *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History*. Boston, Mass.: Beacon Press, 1995.
- Tul'chinskii, G. L. "The Word and Body of Postmodernism - From the Phenomenology of Irresponsibility to the Metaphysics of Freedom." *Russian Studies in Philosophy* 42, 3 (2003): 5-35
- Tullett, William. "The Macaroni's 'Ambrosial Essences': Perfume, Identity and Public Space in Eighteenth-Century England." *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 38, 2 (2015): 163-180.
- Turin, Luca. *The Secret of Scent: Adventures in Perfume and the Science of Smell*. New York: Ecco. 2006.
- Turner, Alice. *The History of Hell*. New York: Harcourt Brace, 1993.
- Turner, Victor. *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors; Symbolic Action in Human Society*. Ithaca NY: Cornell University Press, 1974.
- Turner, Victor. *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1967.
- Tyler-Whittle, Michael Sidney. *The Plant Hunters: Being an Examination of Collecting*

- with an Account of the Careers & the Methods of a Number of Those Who Have Searched the World for Wild Plants*. New York, NY: Lyons & Burford, 1997.
- Tyson, Danielle. *Sex, Culpability, and the Defence of Provocation*. London: Routledge, 2013.
- Tzanaki, Rosemary. *Mandeville's Medieval Audiences*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003.
- Udris, Raynalle. "Smell and Otherness in 20th Century Texts: An Ideological Investigation of Scent with Special Reference to European Modernist Texts, French Women's Writings and Beur Literature." In *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, edited by Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham, 293-322. Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003.
- Underdown, David. "The Taming of the Scold: Enforcement of Patriarchal Authority in Early Modern England." In *Order and Disorder in Early Modern England*, edited by Anthony Fletcher and John Stephenson, 116-136. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.
- Ungerer, Gustav. *The Mediterranean Apprenticeship of British Slavery*. Madrid: Editorial Verbum, 2008.
- Uroh, Chris. "Looking Through a Broken Mirror: Blackness, Shared Memory, Shared Identity and Shared Destiny." In *Africa, Brazil, and the Construction of Trans-Atlantic Black Identities*, edited by Barry Boubacar, Elisee Akpo Soumonni, and Livio Sansone, 127-146. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press, 2008.
- Usman, Aribidesi. "The Landscape and Society of Northern Yorubaland." In *Archaeology of Atlantic Africa and the African Diaspora*, edited by Akinwumi Ogundiran and Toyin Falola, 149-159. Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 2010.

- Valencius, Conevery Bolton. *The Health of the Country: How American Settlers Understood Themselves and Their Land*. New York: Basic Books, 2003.
- Van Andel, Tinde, Sofie Ruysschaert, Kobeke Van de Putte, and Sara Groenendijk. "What Makes a Plant Magical?: Symbolism and Sacred Herbs in Afro-Surinamese *Winti* Rituals." In *African Ethnobotany in the Americas*, edited by Robert Voeks and John Rashford, 246-284. New York: Springer, 2013.
- Van Beek, W. E. A. "The Dirty Smith: Smell as a Social Frontier among the Kapsiki/Higi of North Cameroon and north-eastern Nigeria." *Africa* 62 (1992): 38-58.
- Van de Port, Mattijs. "'Don't Ask Questions, Just Observe!': Boundary Politics in Bahian Candomblé." In *Aesthetic Formations: Media, Religion, and the Senses*, edited by Birgit Meyer, 31-52. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Van Dyke, Ruth. "Imagined Narratives: Sensory Lives in the Chacoan Southwest." In *Making Senses of the Past: Toward a Sensory Archaeology*, edited by Jo Day, 390-408. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2013.
- Van Sant, Ann Jessie. *Eighteenth-Century Sensibility and the Novel: The Senses in Social Context*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Van Stipriaan, Alex. "The Ever-Changing Face of Watramama in Suriname: A Water Goddess in Creolization since the Seventeenth Century." In *Sacred Waters: Arts for Mami Wata and Other Divinities in Africa and the Diaspora*, edited by Henry John Drewal, 525-548. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2008.
- Vaughan, Alden. "The Origins Debate: Slavery and Racism in Seventeenth-Century Virginia." *The Virginia Magazine of History and Biography* 97, 3 (1989): 311-354.
- Vaughan, Alden, and Virginia Vaughan. "Before Othello: Elizabethan Representations of

- Sub-Saharan Africans." *WMQ* 54, 1 (1997): 19-44.
- Vaughan, Alden, and Virginia Vaughan. *Shakespeare's Caliban: A Cultural History*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- Vaughan, Virginia. *Performing Blackness on English Stages, 1500-1800*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- Verbeek, Caro, and Cretien van Campen. "Inhaling Memories: Smell and Taste Memories in Art, Science, and Practice." *Senses and Society* 8, 2 (2013): 133-148.
- Vigarello, Georges, and Jean Birrell. *Concepts of Cleanliness: Changing Attitudes in France since the Middle Ages*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Vinge, Louise. *The Five Senses*. Lund: Gleerup, 1975.
- Vitullo, Juliann. "Taste and Temptation in Early Modern Italy." *The Senses and Society* 5, 1 (2010): 106-118.
- Voeks, Robert. *Sacred Leaves of Candomblé: African Magic, Medicine, and Religion in Brazil*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1997.
- Voeks, Robert. "African Medicine and Magic in the Americas." *Geographical Review* 83, 1 (1993): 66-78.
- Vogt-Spira, Gregor. "Senses, Imagination, and Literature." In *Rethinking the Medieval Senses*, edited by Stephen Nichols, Andreas Kablitz, and Alison Calhoun, 51-72. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2008.
- Volmer, Stephanie. "William Bartram and the Forms of Natural History." In *Fields of Vision: Essays on the Travels of William Bartram*, edited by Kathryn Holland Braund and Charlotte Porter, 71-80. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2010.

- Von Germeten, Nicole. *Violent Delights, Violent Ends: Sex, Race, and Honor in Colonial Cartagena De Indias*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2013.
- Von Staden, Heinrich. "Women and Dirt." *Helios* 19, 1-2 (1992): 7-29.
- Von Stuckrad, Kocku. *Locations of Knowledge in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Esoteric Discourse and Western Identities*. Leiden: Brill, 2010.
- Voskuhl, Adelheid. *Androids in the Enlightenment: Mechanics, Artisans, and Cultures of the Self*. Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press, 2013.
- Vroon, P. A, Anton van Amerongen, and Hans de Vries. *Smell: The Secret Seducer*. New York: Farrar, Straus & Giroux, 1997.
- Wade, Nicholas. *A Troublesome Inheritance: Genes, Race, and Human History*. New York: The Penguin Press, 2014.
- Wahab, Amar. *Colonial Inventions: Landscape, Power, and Representation in Nineteenth-Century Trinidad*. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars, 2010.
- Wailoo, Keith. "Inventing the Heterozygote: Molecular Biology, Racial Identity, and the Narratives of Sickle-Cell Disease, Tay-Sachs, and Cystic Fibrosis." In *Race, Nature, and the Politics of Difference*, edited by Donald Moore, Jake Kosek, and Anand Pandian, 235-253. Durham: Duke University Press, 2003.
- Waite, Gary. *Heresy, Magic and Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe*. Basingstoke; New York, N.Y.: Palgrave, 2003.
- Waldron, Jennifer Elizabeth. *Reformations of the Body: Idolatry, Sacrifice, and Early Modern Theater*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.
- Walker, D. P. *Unclean Spirits: Possession and Exorcism in France and England in the Late Sixteenth and Early Seventeenth Centuries*. Philadelphia, PA: University of

- Pennsylvania Press, 1981.
- Walker, D. P. *Spiritual and Demonic Magic: From Ficino to Campanella*. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1975.
- Walker, D. P. *The Decline of Hell; Seventeenth-Century Discussions of Eternal Torment*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1964.
- Walker, Timothy. "Acquisition and Circulation of Medical Knowledge within the Early Modern Portuguese Colonial Empire." In *Science in the Spanish and Portuguese Empires, 1500-1800*, edited by Daniela Bleichmar, 247-270. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 2009.
- Wall, Cynthia. *The Prose of Things: Transformations of Description in the Eighteenth Century*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006.
- Wallerstein, Immanuel. *World-Systems Analysis: An Introduction*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2004.
- Wallis, Faith. "Medicine and the Senses: Feeling the Pulse, Smelling the Plague, and Listening for the Cure." In *Volume II of A Cultural History of the Senses* edited by Constance Classen and Richard Newhauser, 133-152. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.
- Wallis, Faith. "Signs and Senses: Diagnosis and Prognosis in Early Medieval Pulse and Urine Texts." *Social History of Medicine* 13, 2 (2000): 265-278.
- Wallis, Patrick. "Consumption, Retailing, and Medicine in Early-Modern London." *The Economic History Review* 61, 1 (2008): 26-53.
- Walmsley, Emily. "Race, Place, and Taste, Making Identities through Sensory Experience." *Etnofoor* 18, 1 (2005): 43-60.
- Walsham, Alexandra. "The Reformation and 'The Disenchantment of the World'"

- Reassessed." *The Historical Journal* 51, 2 (2008): 497-528.
- Walter, Katie. "The Form and the Formless: Medieval Taxonomies of Skin, Flesh, and the Human." In *Reading Skin in Medieval Literature and Culture*, edited by Katie Walter, 119-140. New York, New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.
- Walthall, John. *French Colonial Archaeology: The Illinois Country and the Western Great Lakes*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1991.
- Walthall, John, and Thomas Emerson. "Indians and French in the Midcontinent." In *Calumet & Fleur-De-Lys: Archaeology of Indian and French Contact in the Midcontinent*, edited by John Walthall and Thomas Emerson, 1-16. Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1992.
- Walvin, James. *Black Ivory: A History of British Slavery*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2001.
- Wang, Orrin Nan Chung. *Romantic Sobriety: Sensation, Revolution, Commodification, History*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2011.
- Warren, Stephen. *The Worlds the Shawnees Made: Migration and Violence in Early America*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2014.
- Warren, Wendy Anne. "'The Cause of Her Grief': The Rape of a Slave in Early New England." *The Journal of American History* 93, 4 (2007): 1031-1049.
- Waselkov, Gregory, and Kathryn Holland Braund. *William Bartram on the Southeastern Indians*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1995.
- Washington, Joseph. *Anti-Blackness in English Religion, 1500-1800*. New York: E. Mellen Press, 1984.
- Waskul, D. D., and Phillip Vannini. "Smell, Odor, and Somatic Work: Sense-Making and

- Sensory Management.” *Social Psychology Quarterly* 71, 1 (2008): 53-71.
- Waskul, D. D., Phillip Vannini, and Janelle Wilson. "The Aroma of Recollection: Olfaction, Nostalgia, and the Shaping of the Sensuous Self." *The Senses and Society* 4, 1 (2009): 5-22
- Waskul, D. D., Phillip Vannini, and Simon Gottschalk. *The Senses in Self, Society, and Culture: A Sociology of the Senses*. New York: Routledge, 2012.
- Watson, Lyall. *Jacobson's Organ and the Remarkable Nature of Smell*. New York: W. W. Norton, 2000.
- Watson, Robert. *Back to Nature: The Green and the Real in the Late Renaissance*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2006.
- Watson, Tim. *Caribbean Culture and British Fiction in the Atlantic World, 1780-1870*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- Wayne, Don. ““Pox on Your Distinction!”: Humanist Reformation and Deformations in *The Staple of News*.” In *Renaissance Culture and the Everyday*, edited by Patricia Fumerton and Simon Hunt, 67-91. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1999.
- Wear, Andrew. *Knowledge and Practice in Early Modern English Medicine, 1550-1680*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Weaver, Jace. *The Red Atlantic: American Indigenes and the Making of the Modern World, 1000-1927*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2014.
- Weaver, Karol. *Medical Revolutionaries: The Enslaved Healers of Eighteenth-Century Saint Domingue*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2006.
- Webster, Charles. “Alchemical and Paracelsian Medicine.” In *Health, Medicine, and*

- Mortality in the Sixteenth Century*, edited by Charles Webster, 301-334. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.
- Weheliye, Alexander. *Habeas Viscus: Racializing Assemblages, Biopolitics, and Black Feminist Theories of the Human*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2014.
- Weismantel, May. "Coming to Our Senses at Chavin de Huantar." In *Making Senses of the Past: Toward a Sensory Archaeology*, edited by Jo Day, 113-136. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 2013.
- Wheeler, Jo. "Stench in Sixteenth-Century Venice." In *The City and the Senses: Urban Culture Since 1500*, edited by Alexander Cowan and Jill Steward, 25-38. Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2007.
- Wheeler, Roxann. "'Betrayed by Some of My Own Complexion': Cugoano, Abolition, and the Contemporary Language of Racialism." In *Genius in Bondage: Literature of the Early Black Atlantic*, edited by Vincent Carretta and Philip Gould, 17-38. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2001.
- Wheeler, Roxann. *The Complexion of Race: Categories of Difference in Eighteenth-Century British Culture*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2000.
- Wheeler, Roxann. "The Complexion of Desire: Racial Ideology and Mid-Eighteenth-Century British Novels." *Eighteenth-Century Studies* 32, 3 (1999): 309-332.
- White, Hayden. "The Forms of Wildness: Archaeology of an Idea." In *The Wild Man Within; An Image in Western Thought from the Renaissance to Romanticism*, edited by Edward Dudley and Maximillian Novak, 3-38. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1973.
- White, Jeannette. "'Is Black so Base a Hue': Shakespeare's Aaron and the Politics and

- Poetics of Race." *CLA Journal* 40, 3 (1997): 336-366.
- White, Richard. "Creative Misunderstandings and New Understandings." *WMQ* 63, 1 (2006): 9-14.
- White, Richard. *The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires, and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1650–1815*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- White, Sam. "'Shewing the Difference Between Their Conjuraton, and Our Invocation on the Name of God for Rayne': Weather, Prayer, and Magic in Early American Encounters." *WMQ* 72, 1 (2015): 33-56
- White, Shane. "'It Was a Proud Day': African Americans, Festivals, and Parades in the North, 1741-1834." *Journal of American History* 81, 1 (1994): 13-50.
- White, Shane, and Graham White. *The Sounds of Slavery: Discovering African American History through Songs, Sermons, and Speech*. Boston: Beacon Press, 2005.
- White, Shane, and Graham White. *Stylin': African American Expressive Culture from Its Beginnings to the Zoot Suit*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1998.
- White, Shane, and Graham White. "Slave Hair and African-American Culture in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries." *Journal of Southern History* 61 (1995): 45-76.
- Whitford, David. *The Curse of Ham in the Early Modern Era: The Bible and the Justifications for Slavery*. Farnham, England: Ashgate Pub. Ltd., 2009.
- Whitlock, Gillian. "Volatile Subjects: *The History of Mary Prince*." In *Genius in Bondage: Literature of the Early Black Atlantic*, edited by Vincent Carretta and Philip Gould, 72-86. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2001.
- Wickberg, Daniel. "What Is the History of Sensibilities? On Cultural Histories, Old and

- New." *American Historical Review* 112, 3 (2007): 661-684.
- Wickman, Thomas. "'Winters Embittered with Hardships': Severe Cold, Wabanaki Power, and English Adjustments, 1690—1710." *WMQ* 72, 1 (2015): 57-98.
- Widmer, Alexander. "Seeing Health like a Colonial State: Pacific Island Assistant Physicians, Sight, and Nascent Biomedical Citizenship in the New Hebrides." In *Senses and Citizenships: Embodying Political Life*, edited by Susanna Trnka, 200-220. New York, NY: Routledge, 2013.
- Wiley, Norbert. *The Semiotic Self*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994.
- Willie, Staffan Muller. "Walnuts at Hudson's Bay, Coral Reefs in Gotland: The Colonialism of Linnaean Botany." In *Colonial Botany: Science, Commerce, and Politics in the Early Modern World*, edited by Londa Schiebinger and Claudia Swan, 34-48. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2005.
- Williams, Gwyn. *Person and Persona: Studies in Shakespeare*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1981.
- Williams, Raymond. *Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1985.
- Wilson, C. Anne. *Food and Drink in Britain*. Chicago: Academy Chicago, 1991 [1973].
- Wilson, Donald, and Richard Stevenson. *Learning to Smell: Olfactory Perception from Neurobiology to Behavior*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 2006.
- Wilson Edward, and José María Gómez Durán. *Kingdom of Ants: José Celestino Mutis and the Dawn of Natural History in the New World*. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins, 2010.
- Wilson-Lee, Edward. *Shakespeare in Swahililand: In Search of a Global Poet*. New York:

- Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2016.
- Winter, Joseph. "From Earth Mother to Snake Woman: The Role of Tobacco in the Evolution of Native American Religious Organization." in *Tobacco Use by Native North Americans: Sacred Smoke and Silent Killer*, edited by Joseph Winter, 265-304. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2000.
- Winter, Ruth. *The Smell Book: Scents, Sex, and Society*. Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1976.
- Winterer, Caroline. *American Enlightenments: Pursuing Happiness in the Age of Reason*. New Haven; London: Yale University Press, 2016.
- Winterbourne, A. T. "Is Oral and Olfactory Art Possible?" *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 15, 2 (Apr., 1981): 95-102.
- Wisecup, Kelly, and T. W. Jaudon. "On Knowing and Not Knowing About Obeah." *Atlantic Studies* 12, 2 (2015): 129-143.
- Witgen, Michael. *An Infinity of Nations: How the Native New World Shaped Early North America*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012.
- Wohlcke, Anne. *The Perpetual Fair: Gender, Disorder, and Urban Amusement in Eighteenth-Century London*. Manchester; New York: Manchester University Press, 2016.
- Wood, Gordon. *The Creation of the American Republic, 1776-1787*. Chapel Hill: Published for the Institute of Early American History and Culture at Williamsburg, VA, by the University of North Carolina Press, 1969.
- Woodbridge, Kenneth. "The Nomenclature of Style in Garden History." In *British and American Gardens in the Eighteenth Century: Eighteen Illustrated Essays on Garden History*, edited by Robert Maccubbin and Peter Martin, 19-25.

- Williamsburg, VA: Colonial Williamsburg Foundation, 1984.
- Woodward, Walter William. *Prospero's America: John Winthrop, Jr., Alchemy, and the Creation of New England Culture, 1606-1676*. Chapel Hill: Published for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture by the University of North Carolina Press, 2010.
- Woolgar, C. M. "The Social Life of the Senses: Experiencing the Self, Others, and Environments." In *Vol. II of A Cultural History of the Senses*, edited by Constance Classen and Richard Newhauser, 23-44. London: Bloomsbury, 2014.
- Woolgar, C. M. *The Senses in Late Medieval England*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006.
- Worrall, David. *Harlequin Empire: Race, Ethnicity and the Drama of the Popular Enlightenment*. London: Pickering & Chatto, 2007.
- Wourm, Nathalie. "The Smell of God: Scent Trails from Ficino to Baudelaire." In *Sense and Scent: An Exploration of Olfactory Meaning*, edited by Bronwen Martin and Felizitas Ringham, 79-100. Dublin: Philomel Publications, 2003.
- Wright, George. "Hendiadys and Hamlet." *PMLA* 96, 2 (Mar., 1981): 168-193.
- Wright, Michelle. *Physics of Blackness: Beyond the Middle Passage Epistemology*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2015.
- Wrigley, Richard. "Making Sense of Rome." *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies* 35, 4 (2012): 551-564.
- Wulf, Andrea. *Founding Gardeners: The Revolutionary Generation, Nature, and the Shaping of the American Nation*. New York: Knopf, 2011.
- Wulf, Andrea. *The Brother Gardeners: Botany, Empire & the Birth of an Obsession*. New

- York: Knopf, 2008.
- Yale, Elizabeth. *Sociable Knowledge: Natural History and the Nation in Early Modern Britain*. Baltimore: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016.
- Yamin-Pasternak, Sveta, Andrew Kliskey, Lilian Alessa, Igor Pasternak, and Peter Schweizer. "The Rotten Renaissance in the Bering Strait: Loving, Loathing, and Washing the Smell of Foods with a (Re)Acquired Taste." *Current Anthropology* 55, 5 (2014): 619-646.
- Yates, Julian. *Error, Misuse, Failure: Object Lessons from the English Renaissance*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2003.
- Yokota, Kariann Akemi. *Unbecoming British: How Revolutionary America Became a Postcolonial Nation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Young, Dianne. "The Smell of Green-ness: Cultural Synaesthesia in the Western Desert (Australia)." *Etnofoor* 18, 1 (2005): 61-77.
- Young, Jason. *Rituals of Resistance: African Atlantic Religion in Kongo and the Lowcountry South in the Era of Slavery*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2007.
- Young, Robert. *White Mythologies: Writing History and the West*. London: Routledge, 2008.
- Zack, Naomi. *Philosophy of Science and Race*. New York; London: Routledge, 2002.
- Ziegler, Joseph. "Physiognomy, Science, and Proto-Racism, 1200–1500." In *The Origins of Racism in the West*, edited by Miriam Eliav-Feldon, Benjamin Isaac, and Joseph Ziegler, 181-199. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
- Zika, Charles. *The Appearance of Witchcraft: Print and Visual Culture in Sixteenth-*

- Century Europe*. London: Routledge, 2007.
- Zimring, Carl. "Dirty Work: How Hygiene and Xenophobia Marginalized the American Waste Trades, 1870-1930." *Environmental History* 9, 1 (2004): 80-101.
- Ziser, Michael. *Environmental Practice and Early American Literature*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013.
- Ziser, Michael. "Sovereign Remedies: Natural Authority and the 'Counterblaste to Tobacco'," *WMQ* 62, 4 (2005): 719-744.
- Zupanov, Ines. "Twisting a Pagan Tongue: Portuguese and Tamil in Sixteenth-Century Jesuit Translations." In *Conversion: Old Worlds and New*, edited by Kenneth Mills and Anthony Grafton, 109-139. Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2003.