

12-22-2022

Books Received and Noted

Patrick Scott
University of South Carolina - Columbia

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/ssl>



Part of the [Literature in English, British Isles Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Scott, Patrick (2022) "Books Received and Noted," *Studies in Scottish Literature*: Vol. 48: Iss. 2, 232–237.
DOI: 10.51221/suc.ssl.2023.48.2.20
Available at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/ssl/vol48/iss2/21>

This Book Reviews is brought to you by the Scottish Literature Collections at Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in *Studies in Scottish Literature* by an authorized editor of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact digres@mailbox.sc.edu.

BOOKS RECEIVED AND NOTED

This list is intended to provide information or brief notices on a variety of recently-published books on Scottish literature and related topics; inclusion in the list need not preclude possible subsequent discussion in a more formal review, and we hope to include some titles omitted now in subsequent lists. Where the book or e-text has been made available, or we have purchased a copy, entries are based on personal review; some briefer entries have been edited from the publisher's description. The compilers welcome timely information on new publications from publishers or authors.

Corey E. Andrews, *Inventing Scotland's Bard: The British Reception of Robert Burns, 1786-1836* [Scottish Literature Series, no. 6] (Columbia, SC: *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 2022). Pp. xvi + 140. Paper, \$18.00/£14.50. ISBN 979-8835611560

—Corey Andrews's new book follows on from his earlier study *The Genius of Scotland: the Cultural Production of Robert Burns, 1785-1834* (Brill/SCROLL, 2015). In this book, he takes a more granular approach, examining many more examples, and looking at a wider variety of publication genres. The book provides annotated entries and full publication details, year by year, on newspaper and periodical articles, biographical comment, and poetic responses to Burns and his work, from Burns's first book *Poems, Chiefly in the Scottish Dialect* (1786) to the explosion of new biographical and editorial work in the 1830s. The book includes an index to the critics, periodicals, and books that it covers.

Astonishingly, this seems to be the first Burns reception bibliography with this depth of coverage since James Gibson in 1881. The materials reflect a wide spectrum of opinions and critical perspectives, from the contemporaries who encountered Burns on first publication, on to writers of the two succeeding generations, as they encountered newly-published work, and negotiated biographical, religious and political controversy. It

makes a fascinating record of how in these crucial decades critics and readers engaged with Burns's poetry and, Andrews would argue, constructed a national and international icon.

Jack Baldwin, *A Catalogue of Fifteenth-Century Printed Books in Glasgow Libraries and Museums*, 2 vols (Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer/Boydell and Brewer, for the Friends of the Glasgow University Library, 2020). Pp. 664. Hardback, £170. ISBN 9781843844679.

—Alongside the 1062 incunabula at the University of Glasgow, this catalogue also includes 62 from other Glasgow collections: the Mitchell, Kelvingrove, the Burrell collection, the Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons, and the University of Strathclyde. The catalogue, which won the 1922 Breslauer Prize, includes colour illustrations and provides detailed descriptions of the individual copies, including provenance, inscriptions and annotations, bindings, and other evidence of each book's unique story over the past 500 years.

Daniel Cook and James Morris, eds, foreword; Monica Burns, illus., *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner: The Dundee Edition* (Dundee: UniVerse, 2021). Pp. 244. Open access pdf at: <https://doi.org/10.20933/100001190>.

—This edition provides a text of Hogg's novel from the 1824 first edition (though without reproducing the facsimile document that Hogg used as frontispiece), supplemented by some 171 brief annotations by James Morris (given as footnotes), a very brief but very quotable one-page foreword by Valentina Bold ("this is the ultimate Scottish novel and the finest Gothic novel.... elusive and complete"), and three contemporary reviews from the *Examiner*, the *Westminster Review*, and the *Ladies Monthly Museum*. The volume closes with Monica Burns's comic strip/graphic version of Hogg's "The Tale of Auchtermuchty." The edition is available for reading on a phone, but no print format version is listed in the usual sources or by the usual vendors.

Eileen Dunlop, *Scottish Women Writers from 1800 to the Great War* (Edinburgh: National Museums Scotland, 2022). Pp. vi + 170. Paper, £14.99 (reported as \$41 in U.S., 11/12/2022). ISBN 978-1-910682-47-0.

--This book provides an introductory survey of major Scottish women writers of the long 19th century, from Elizabeth Hamilton, Mary Brunton and Susan Ferrier, through to Christina Keith and Violet Jacob. Dunlop argues that Calvinism ("the hostility of the Presbyterian Church and the self-serving attitude of the male hierarchy") had restricted women's opportunities for education and for literary careers, while her postscript points also to the bias in mid 20th-century Scottish criticism: of 254 authors

indexed by name in Wittig's influential *Scottish Tradition in Literature* (1958), only 9 were women, and only seven of those Scottish. This is a work of appreciation, aimed at the general reader, rather than pioneer or specialized critical scholarship, but it recognizes and draws on the substantial research on many of these writers over the decades since Wittig. It would be a useful addition to many school libraries, and for teaching-oriented college collections, and a very useful overview for anyone who needs to catch up.

Thomas Keith, *Robert Burns's Life on the Stage, with a Bibliography of Dramatic Works, 1848-2022* [Scottish Literature Series, no 7]. Columbia, SC: *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 2022. Illustrated. Pp. xiv + 92. Paper, \$16.00/£14.00. ISBN: 9798367306606.

—Over the past 180 years, there have been more than 90 different plays written about Burns's life. Though there is growing interest in how successive generations have reimagined and “remediated” Burns, and there have been some noteworthy essays (cited by Keith) on aspects of the topic, there has been no comprehensive guide to Burnsian plays. Keith's study therefore breaks new ground. For publication in this format, he has updated and revised the entries from the *ur*-version in *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 47.2; he also has added over thirty illustrations and provided a thorough index of dramatists, plays, theatres, and leading actors. His opening essay discusses changing approaches to representing Burns on stage, and his annotated bibliography should become a standard reference, orienting future researchers, including student researchers, to the opportunities for in-depth work on specific plays.

Barbara Leonardi, *Marriage in James Hogg's Work: Plotting for Gender, Class, and Ethnic Equality* (SCROLL, 32) (Leiden: Brill, 2022). Pp. viii + XXX. Hardback, \$119.00. ISBN: 978-90-04-51943-5. Ebook also available.

—“Throughout his career, self-taught Scottish writer James Hogg (1770-1835) violated literary proprieties which discouraged the frank treatment of prostitution, infanticide, and the violence of war. Contemporary reviewers received Hogg's bluntness rather fiercely because, in so doing, he questioned the ideologies of chastity, marriage and military masculinities that informed emerging discourses of the British Empire. This book reveals the strategic use that Hogg made of the marriage plot to challenge the civilising ideal of the motherly heroine as well as martial and sentimental masculinities which supported the discourse of a strong but tamed national vigour, thereby highlighting Hogg's critical use of gender stereotypes in relation to norms of class and ethnicity when deconstructing this plot convention.”

Luiza Lobo, transl. and intro., *Robert Burns 50 Poemas*, 2nd ed. (Lisbon: for the Cascais Burns Club, 2023). Pp. 186. Hardback. No ISBN.

—Portuguese is the first language of over 250 million people, widely spoken not only in Portugal, but also in Latin America and parts of Africa. By contrast with the early appearance and number of French, German, and Italian translations, Burns was scarcely available in Portuguese for the first 200 years after his death. The Brazilian scholar Luiza Lobo began this pioneer volume of verse translations as a Ph.D. project in comparative literature at the University of South Carolina, and in its mature form, her bilingual edition, with an introduction and notes, was published in Rio de Janeiro in 1994.¹ Though it sold an astonishing 1500 copies in its first year, as a paperback that came shrink-wrapped with a miniature of Johnnie Walker Red Label, it is seldom found in original condition, or as bibliographers say, unopened. This attractive and much sturdier hardback volume, which includes all Professor Lobo's Portuguese texts and editorial material, but no whisky, was produced for the Cascais Burns Club, when she delivered the Immortal Memory there in January 2023. It is of historical significance as the first appearance of the Lobo translations in Portugal itself.

Kirsteen McCue, ed., *Robert Burns's Songs for George Thomson* [Oxford Edition of Robert Burns, IV] (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021). Pp. xcvi + 692. Hardback, ISBN

—The contrast between the two major collections to which Burns contributed, James Johnson's *Scots Musical Museum* and George Thomson's *Select Collection of Original Scottish Airs*, is familiar enough. For many 20th century Burnsians, the simpler format and settings of the Edinburgh-published Johnson series seemed self-evidently more authentic than Thomson's larger, more elegant London-published collection, with its sophisticated arrangements by well-known European composers, not just Pleyel and Kozeluch, but Haydn and Beethoven. In the Thomson series, critics have generally focused more on Burns's texts, and his lengthy letters to Thomson commenting on individual songs, than on Thomson's project as a whole. Kirsteen McCue's expertise, both about Thomson, and about late 18th and early 19th century song performance and culture, makes this the first full-scale scholarly reappraisal of Thomson's achievement.

McCue's Thomson volume might look superficially to be like the earlier volumes devoted to Johnson's *Scots Musical Museum*, edited by Murray Pittock. McCue shares with Pittock the general Oxford Edition

¹ On the project's genesis and approach to translation, see also Luiza Lobo, "The Reception in Brazil of the First Portuguese Translation of Robert Burns," *SSL*, 30 (1998): 249-260.

policy of giving Burns's work (and its original musical setting) in its first published form, and her volume follows Pittock in reproducing the original engraved pages from Thomson in facsimile. Thomson's pages were much larger than Johnson's, and to allow McCue's volume to be shelved in series, it could only be slightly taller than Pittock's, so the Thomson page-images, though still legible, are reduced in size. Increasingly, these editions are consulted on-screen anyway.

However, McCue's edition also differs in a more important way. Murray Pittock's volumes reproduced the entire six-volume run of the Johnson series, Burns and non-Burns alike, freeing him to reassess the Burns attributions without depriving purchasers of the songs he was de-attributing or for which he was recalibrating Burns's contribution. Because of the scope of Thomson's collection her volume reproduces only songs from it that can be attributed to Burns. Indeed, one of the revelations of her edition is the complex publication history and sprawling range of Thomson's project, which continued over a period of nearly fifty years from 1793-1841 and covered Welsh, Irish, and English songs, as well as Scots. A detailed "Note on the Text" (pp. xvii-xxiv) explains how the edition navigates this complexity and why the songs are given new reference numbers, rather than cited by Thomson's numbering, which varied over the fifty years.

The two Oxford song editions differ also, at least in emphasis, in the annotations they offer. Both of course provide basic information on each song's publication history and on manuscripts earlier than the printed text being reproduced, but where Pittock's strength lay in tracing earlier and contemporary printed texts of the Johnson songs, research that underpinned his rating system for Burns's involvement in each song, McCue's unique strength as an editor comes in the music, from her years of research on the different airs for which Burns wrote his songs, and to which they have been set in the Johnson collection and in Thomson's various collections.

McCue's introduction (pp. xxv-xcvi), at 70 pages and well over 25,000 words, constitutes a monograph in its own right. Like Pittock, she is well aware that Johnson's collection cannot be romanticized as the unmediated record of Scottish popular song tradition, and there is of course ample evidence in Burns's letters to Thomson (even if Thomson edited them) that he was fully involved in Thomson's project. McCue avoids any artificial debate about the values or authenticity of the two series, but her wide knowledge of the social context in which Thomson's (and Johnson's and Urbani's) settings would be performed allows her to recognize the importance and influence of the Thomson Burns songs for Burns's cultural status within Britain and also across Europe.

As with the Pittock edition, or any large complex scholarly edition, it is possible, even likely, that over time a few further manuscripts may surface,

or that research on specific songs will add to or modify the annotations here, but this is a remarkable, indeed monumental edition, by far the fullest, most fully-researched, and most sympathetic, study of Burns's contribution to the *Select Collection*, and so of George Thomson's own historic achievement. It should have a long shelf life as the standard study of its topic.

Kelsey Jackson Williams, Jane Stevenson, and William Zachs, *A History and Catalogue of the Lindsay Library, 1570–1792: The Story of 'Some bonie litle bookes'* [Library of the Written Word, vol. 103—The Handpress World, vol. 82] (Brill, 2022). Pp. xxvi + 513. Hardback, €169.00/\$204.00. ISBN: 978-90-04-50377-9. E-Book ISBN: 978-90-04-50379-3.

—The collection assembled by the Lindsays of Balcarres was Jacobean Scotland's largest library, and this catalogue represents the collecting activities of at least four generations, from the late 16th till the early 18th century. By the late 18th century, the 6th Earl of Balcarres was in America, and, according to a later family member, his wife, living in Edinburgh, “permitted the greater part of the Library to be torn up, and thrown away, used by grocers for wrapping up bacon—almost all the books were destroyed.”² This account was much exaggerated: in 1792, after Balcarres House was sold to the earl's brother, enough books survived to be worth sending to auction, and in 1825 further “remnants of the ancient Library” were transferred to the new family home at Haigh Hall, Lancashire. There the 25th and 26th Earls of Crawford (8th and 9th of Balcarres) would build the wide-ranging rare book, scientific, and manuscript collections that was catalogued in four volumes in 1910 as the *Bibliotheca Lindesiana*.³ Haigh Hall was sold in the late 1940s, and the 81 volumes still there with a pre-1792 Lindsay provenance were repatriated to Balcarres House (for these, see Appendix C, pp. 486–489).

The purpose and parameters of this new catalogue are quite different from those of the *Bibliotheca Lindesiana*. By reconstructing the contents of the original Balcarres library, this substantial volume sets out to challenge prior understandings of pre-Union Scotland's book culture. Chapters on the complex history of the library up to the Restoration (Stevenson, pp. 3–77) and from Restoration to Enlightenment (Williams, pp. 78–112) are followed by a detailed account of how the library has been reconstructed for this project, including the manuscript booklists in the Balcarres muniments, Zachs's discovery of purchases from Balcarres in the

² *Bibliotheca Lindesiana, Catalogue of the Printed Books Preserved at Haigh Hall....*, 4 vols (Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1910), I: vii.

³ *Ibid.*, and see Nicolas Barker, *Bibliotheca Lindesiana* (London: printed for presentation to the Roxburghe Club, 1977).

Bell & Bradfute business ledgers, and the unique copy of the 1792 auction catalogue in the Bodleian, and much work in later sale and library records (Zachs and Williams, pp. 113-161).⁴ The Acknowledgements record help from over twenty different libraries, on both sides of the Atlantic in tracking down copies known from these manuscript sources.

The heart of the book is the catalogue itself, with entries for 1,762 titles from a library that has not existed as a single entity for over 200 years (pp. 165-425, “principally” compiled and researched by Williams). The total number may have run to somewhere between 2,500 and 6,200 volumes (Preface). Throughout the library’s history, books had been added and dispersed, and only a minority of the books once known to be in the Lindsay library were now available to be fully examined and described. For the majority of the books that can now be identified, reconstructing the library has involved working from the limited (and sometimes inaccurate) descriptions in earlier sources, to fill gaps and where possible identify editions. Appendices (pp. 426-444) transcribe or reproduce these sources, with annotations: the earlier manuscript booklists, the 1792 printed sale catalogue, and a shelf-list of the current library at Balcarres House. The volume concludes with 40 pages of indexes.

Inevitably, most scholars are likely to dive for the indexes to track titles of particular interest. Any library or private collector who thinks they might have a book that got away should check their shelves and communicate with the authors. However, the volume is more than the sum of its parts. The opening essays constitute a collaborative monograph in their own right, and the authors’ goal has been, in both essays and catalogue, to show the library’s international importance and to recover the intellectual history behind its formation.

⁴ While the contents page assigns individual authorship to each section, the preface makes clear in each case the collaborative role taken by the other contributors.