

1-1-1970

D. M. Lloyd (ed.). *Reader's Guide to Scotland: A Bibliography*. London. The National Book League. 1968. 127 pp. 21 shillings. Colin Smith and Robert S. Walker (eds.). *Library Resources in Scotland*. Glasgow. Scottish Library Association. 1968. viii, 107 pp. 50 shillings.

G. Ross Roy  
*University of South Carolina*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/ssl>

 Part of the [English Language and Literature Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Roy, G. Ross (1969) "D. M. Lloyd (ed.). *Reader's Guide to Scotland: A Bibliography*. London. The National Book League. 1968. 127 pp. 21 shillings. Colin Smith and Robert S. Walker (eds.). *Library Resources in Scotland*. Glasgow. Scottish Library Association. 1968. viii, 107 pp. 50 shillings.," *Studies in Scottish Literature*: Vol. 7: Iss. 3, 203–206.  
Available at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/ssl/vol7/iss3/12>

This Book Reviews is brought to you by the Scottish Literature Collections at Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in *Studies in Scottish Literature* by an authorized editor of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact [dillarda@mailbox.sc.edu](mailto:dillarda@mailbox.sc.edu).

and one might well assume that Burns's forthright views on human relations would be more acceptable in our day than they have been at any time in the past. Of course, there will always be those who love him for the wrong reasons, and as Mr. Lindsay has elsewhere expressed it,

Ay Burns, but whit hae ye dune tae deserve  
sic a fate frae the least o your fellow men,  
whan the day o your birth ilk year maun serve  
as excuse tae display hoo little they ken?

This book should do much to correct that situation and may well become required reading for Burns Club members throughout the world. It will certainly make the haggis, the John Barleycorn, and other aspects of that ritualistic orgy celebrated every 25th of January more meaningful.

FREDERICK L. BEATY

*Indiana University*

D. M. Lloyd (ed.). *Reader's Guide to Scotland: A Bibliography*. London. The National Book League. 1968. 127 pp. 21 shillings.

Colin Smith and Robert S. Walker (eds.). *Library Resources in Scotland*. Glasgow. Scottish Library Association. 1968. viii, 107 pp. 50 shillings.

There is a burgeoning demand for reference books and bibliographies today, but the very existence of such a good market has produced a rather mixed bag, particularly among works which have been issued by reprint houses. Too frequently little research has been done on these volumes before they are offered to the public, with the result that not a few reference books which have been completely superseded are suddenly made available. Of course scholars and librarians are free not to purchase these—*caveat emptor*—but unfortunately the publication of an inferior work may preclude the republication of a much more useful one. Then, too, reprinting without updating a work may finally be a disservice to users since there will then be little likelihood that the work will be updated. A recent example: the facsimile reprint of J. B. Reid's *Concordance to the Poems and Songs of Robert Burns* (originally pub-

lished in 1889) has probably put off any hope for the near future of a revised concordance. And yet Reid appeared before the essential Henley & Henderson edition of Burns's poetry (1896-7), not to mention the recent Oxford Burns edited by Professor James Kinsley, which was announced several years before Reid was republished. Surely what scholars really needed was a completely revised concordance based on the established text.

Fortunately, D. M. Lloyd's *Reader's Guide to Scotland: A Bibliography* is a genuine revision which has brought a useful reference work up to date. The general plan has been to concentrate on recent works of reference, no doubt wisely since the work is essentially for the non-specialist. The coverage is broad and reflects Mr. Lloyd's wide experience at the National Library of Scotland. There are twelve major divisions including sections on history; tourism; arts and crafts; language and literature; philosophy; education; law; administration; agriculture, industry and commerce; food and drink; and sport. A four-page table of contents as well as two indexes, one for personal names and one for corporate "authors," make the book easy to use.

Obviously any reference book as rigorously selective as is this one will invite questions about inclusions and exclusions, and the reviewer runs the risk of riding his own hobby-horse. Conscious of this danger, I wish to make these observations which are in no way meant to detract from my assessment of the book as an extremely valuable work of reference. While it would not be possible to include even all the major bibliographies, I feel that a section on bibliographies would have been most useful—for example George F. Black's *List of Works Relating to Scotland* (1916—first issued in a less extensive form in the *Bulletin of the New York Public Library* in 1914) remains one of the most comprehensive works in existence.

Under the heading "History" there is a section on "Scots Abroad" which, from a total of sixteen titles, includes two on the Scots in Sweden and a third on Ruthven's army in Sweden and Esthonia, but lists only four books on Scottish emigration to North America. Even these are severely selective—one is on emigration to Nova Scotia, another covers the period 1701-83 only, and the other two concern emigration to North Carolina: one on Highland Scots 1732-76, the other on the Ulster Scots or "Scotch-Irish." This does not seem to me to be adequate coverage, for, after all, the total population of North Carolina is about five million, whereas there are at present an estimated twenty-two million Americans of direct Scottish descent. There is no mention of a basic book by William Wilfred Campbell and David Bryce, *The Scotsman in Canada* (2

vols., 1912) or the older work by William J. Rattray, *The Scot in British North America* (4 vols., 1880-4). Again, there is a short perceptive work by Black, *Scotland's Mark on America* (1921), which is worth the general reader's attention.

The section which most interests this reviewer is "Language and Literature," and I am pleased to say that there is little here with which I can quarrel. One point which might confuse users is the statement in a headnote that the Scottish Text Society "has issued to its subscribers definitive critical editions of most of the Scottish poets and prose writers . . . to Robert Fergusson." This statement should, it seems, either remove the necessity of including any further reference to STS volumes, or STS editions of all authors included should be noted. However, several STS editions are listed in the sub-section dealing with literature before 1700, but not for poets after this date—for Allan Ramsay there is no mention of a good edition at all except an entry under the heading "General Collections and Anthologies." The wealth of material by and about Burns, as Mr. Lloyd recognizes, obviously precluded anything more than the inclusion of a handful of titles, but would it not have been useful to include at least another bibliography in addition to Egerer, since this latter lists only so-called complete editions of Burns's works: James Gibson's bibliography, although dated (it was published in 1881) includes material *about* Burns, as does the catalogue of the world's finest Burns collection in the Mitchell Library of Glasgow, issued for the bicentenary of the poet's birth in 1959. But these are minor points when one considers the usefulness of the volume.

*Library Resources in Scotland* fills a very real need for those who are interested in research in Scotland. It can also be used profitably by scholars who wish to know what facilities are available in that nation's libraries. There are entries for a total of 347 libraries. In addition to the usual information about the librarian, the staff, the hours during which the library is open (most useful for the prospective out-of-town user) and admission practices, each entry lists the number of volumes held (with a sub-notation for periodicals), and other material (microforms, etc.), the classification system in use, special subjects, publications of the library, and services offered. These last include whether or not information is given by phone, the lending policies of the library, availability of microfilm readers, photoduplication, and the like.

Of particular interest to the non-Scottish user of this book will be the indexes. These include a topographical index, a type of library index, and (best of all) a subject and name index. Here for the first time the

researcher can find where in Scotland the material he needs is to be found.

This book has come to us from members of the staff of the University of Strathclyde, a young university which is making its mark in the field of library science. The editors rightly call theirs a pioneer work, and they deserve to be congratulated for undertaking it. Their hope to reissue updated editions every three years, too, is most commendable.

G.R.R.