

2004

Ghostly Endings: The Evolution of J. M. Barrie's Farewell Miss Julie Logan

Andrew Nash

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/ssl>



Part of the [English Language and Literature Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Nash, Andrew (2004) "Ghostly Endings: The Evolution of J. M. Barrie's Farewell Miss Julie Logan," *Studies in Scottish Literature*: Vol. 33: Iss. 1.

Available at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/ssl/vol33/iss1/12>

This Article is brought to you by the Scottish Literature Collections at Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in *Studies in Scottish Literature* by an authorized editor of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact digres@mailbox.sc.edu.

Andrew Nash

Ghostly Endings: The Evolution of J. M. Barrie's *Farewell Miss Julie Logan*

Farewell Miss Julie Logan, J. M. Barrie's final work of prose fiction, was first published as a free supplement to the *Times* on Christmas Eve 1931. Written in his early seventies, it was Barrie's first extended work of fiction for almost thirty years and the curious nature of publication had perhaps more to do with his ambivalent concern for the work than any deliberate design. Evidence conflicts over how long Barrie had been working on the story by the time he completed a first draft in the summer of 1931. According to Denis Mackail, his official biographer, he had begun it early in the same year,¹ but a reference in a letter sent to Mrs. Raymond Asquith suggests that it may have been in progress as far back as early in 1930:

The thing I've set off writing is badgering me, as I meant it to be six pages and it is now six and twenty and I question whether I have reached the middle. A spate, but I'm afraid of muddy water. A heroine arrived this evening, and there should be no women in the thing at all.²

Viola Meynell, who edited the selection of Barrie's letters that was published the year after Mackail's biography, identifies this "thing" as *Farewell Miss*

¹Denis Mackail, *The Story of J. M. B.* (London, 1941), p. 638.

²Barrie to Mrs. Raymond Asquith, 4 February 1930. *Letters of J. M. Barrie*, ed. Viola Meynell (London, 1942), p. 285. Henceforth *Letters*.

Julie Logan and among his known works it is difficult to think to what else Barrie could be referring. The only other book on which he was engaged in 1930 was *The Greenwood Hat*, a collection of his old newspaper articles, reprinted with a series of ironic commentaries. Further suggestion that the novella was in process in 1930 is provided by Janet Dunbar, who records from evidence contained in Cynthia Asquith's diaries that Barrie's composition of the tale was interrupted by his having to write a speech for the Royal Literary Fund—a speech that was delivered in May 1930, not 1931 as Dunbar appears to imply.³

If the work outlined above is *Farewell Miss Julie Logan*, then an important question is raised as to why there was not meant to be any women in this "thing" and yet the story ends up having an eponymic heroine. It is possible to read too much into the remarks Barrie makes about his methods of writing, or to take them too easily at face value. He always liked to pretend that he was never in total control of the artistic process but the series of working notebooks that are preserved in the Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library at Yale University prove that he was an inveterate planner of his plays and stories. What is perhaps most striking is the similarity that can be drawn here between Barrie and the narrator of *Farewell Miss Julie Logan* itself. Adam Yestreen's story will also involve a futile attempt to repress the feminine and it is tempting to speculate that Barrie is speaking here from within the character of his narrator, trying to keep the heroine out of his consciousness and of his story.

However long Barrie had been working on the story, it is certain that the first version of the work was finished in the middle of 1931. The date 30 June 1931 is recorded on the manuscript and on 6 July Barrie reported to Cynthia Asquith that the work was being taken away for typing. In the letter he sent to her he recorded his ambivalent feelings towards the story: "It is terribly 'elusive' I fear and perhaps mad, but was I not dogged to go through with it!" (*Letters*, p. 224). He did not, however, immediately set about placing the work for publication. One difficulty was size—a novella of twenty thousand words did not translate easily into a book—and Barrie was probably uncertain about if, and how, it should be presented to the public. He had been approached some four years earlier by Geoffrey Dawson, editor of the *Times*, to write an article on Adelphi Terrace—the house in Robert Street where Barrie lived from 1909—but had declined the offer.⁴ Now, with a completed manuscript at his side, he returned to Dawson's suggestion, and without accepting payment offered the work as a free six-page supplement to the newspaper.

Perhaps Barrie wanted to avoid the work being styled as a novel or book, uncertain as he was about its quality. By publishing it as a supplement to a

³Janet Dunbar: *J. M. Barrie: The Man Behind the Image* (London, 1970), p. 285.

⁴Leonee Ormond, *J. M. Barrie* (Edinburgh, 1987), p. 137. Henceforth Ormond.

newspaper he can perhaps be seen as wanting to deflect potential criticism or refusing to allow the work to fall under any easy category of fiction or literature. If this was the case it was unfortunate that the work was to become a victim of its own success. It attracted a good deal of notice and as a response to numerous requests the *Times* management re-issued the work in February 1932, still in the format of a newspaper—printed in small type and in columns—but on special paper and priced at one shilling. The pressure remained, however, for the work to be issued as a book and Barrie agreed to its being published by Hodder and Stoughton, his principal publishers in the U. K. A substantially altered version of the story was duly issued in October the following year, priced at 5s (7s 6d with a leather binding), as part of the uniform edition of his works. During the intervening months Barrie had amended the *Times* text considerably, making a vast number of stylistic changes, adding a few passages of description, and most significantly, changing the ending so as to make the final effect of the work quite different from that of the newspaper version.

Even before the story was published in the *Times*, however, Barrie had subjected it to a long process of revision. The manuscript of the work, held in the Beinecke Library, is accompanied by various typescripts. Two of these are evidently typed versions of the manuscript (one a carbon copy), but each contains corrections and additions in Barrie's hand. Most of these alterations were incorporated into a further typescript which itself contains heavy marginal annotation, again in Barrie's hand. The alterations made in this typescript correspond to the version of the story published in the *Times*, making it likely that this was used as the setting-copy for the newspaper. The story was thus typed, revised, typed up again, revised again, published in the *Times* and then revised thoroughly for the book publication. Such obsessive reworking was not uncharacteristic of Barrie. He had submitted his early Thrums sketches (reprinted from newspaper articles) to a thorough reworking, and had labored over various drafts of the *Tommy* novels that followed.⁵ Most of all, he had made the act of rewriting the basis of his dramatic art, constantly altering and revising the scripts of his plays with every production he oversaw.⁶ It is not surprising, therefore, that even though he was now into his eighth decade he should devote similar time and energy towards revising and improving his final

⁵See my articles, "The Compilation of J. M. Barrie's *Auld Licht Idylls*," *The Bibliothek*, 23 (1998), 85-96; and "A Phenomenally Slow Producer": J. M. Barrie, Scribner's, and the Publication of *Sentimental Tommy*," *Yale University Library Gazette*, 74 (October, 1999), 41-53.

⁶See R. D. S. Jack, *The Road to the Never Land: A Reassessment of J. M. Barrie's Dramatic Art* (Aberdeen, 1991).

prose work.⁷

The changes that Barrie made to the story as it evolved from manuscript draft through the newspaper version and finally to book publication all point to a determination to perfect a number of the most important themes and artistic strategies of the work, notably the use of language, the presentation of the character of the narrator, the theme of repression and the forbidden, and the ambiguity of the ghost story itself. The most significant moments of revision came between newspaper and book, but manuscript variants do indicate areas where Barrie introduced details and ideas—notably the various Jacobite allusions—only after he had completed a first draft. A full list of textual variants between the two published texts is compiled in my recent edition of the story.⁸ Minor changes of punctuation between these two texts are numerous and the demands of newspaper publishing are well illustrated by the fact that the paragraphs are much longer in the *Times* version than in the book. The present essay will look closely at some of the most important changes made over the course of the evolution of the text.

Farewell Miss Julie Logan has been considered Barrie's "one undoubted masterpiece in prose" (Ormond, p. 137).⁹ It is a ghost story, composed in the form of a diary with an epilogue written a quarter of a century later. The narrator, Adam Yestreen, is the minister in a village not dissimilar to the Thrums of Barrie's early works, and both the narrative technique and the setting of the story recall the early Thrums sketches that Barrie had written over forty years before. Why he should have chosen to return to the mode and setting of his earliest work at this late stage in his career is perhaps explained by the fact that he had been reading Herbert Garland's bibliography of his works, which had been published in 1928.¹⁰ Garland had compiled an extensive (if not quite complete) list of the contributions Barrie made to newspapers and magazines in the 1880s, and the author had been prompted to look over some of these

⁷ Another work which caused Barrie a great deal of problems in composition and which also had the same problems of size and development as *Farewell Miss Julie Logan* was *Mrs Lapraik*, which, interestingly, is another ghost story centering on a woman. See R. D. S. Jack, "The Hunt for Mrs Lapraik," *Yale University Library Gazette*, 67 (October, 1992), 47-57.

⁸*Farewell Miss Julie Logan: A J. M. Barrie Omnibus* (Edinburgh, 2000). Henceforth *Julie Logan*.

⁹Ormond provides an excellent, though regrettably brief, commentary on the story. Other short but valuable accounts include Alistair McCleery's Afterword to his edition of the novella (Edinburgh, 1989), pp. 89-94, henceforth McCleery; and Allen Wright in his *J. M. Barrie* (Edinburgh, 1976), pp. 37-41.

¹⁰Herbert Garland, *A Bibliography of the Writings of Sir James Matthew Barrie* (London, 1928).

sketches when compiling his semi-autobiographic book *The Greenwood Hat* (1930). It seems as if this re-reading proved the inspiration for *Farewell Miss Julie Logan* as well, because the setting of the story draws quite explicitly upon a series of sketches Barrie wrote entitled “A Clachan in Winter” that were published in the *Edinburgh Evening Dispatch* between January and May 1890. Some of these sketches were reprinted under the title “Life in a Country Manse” in the *British Weekly* from 9 July to 6 August the following year. It was probably from here that they were again reprinted, this time against the author’s wishes, in a number of unauthorized American editions of his work—Barrie suffered as much as anyone from the lack of protection for British authors in the American market at this time. These early pieces of journalism are narrated in a laid-back, discursive style by a minister who comments largely incidentally on some social aspects of his community. They contain the same references to the English tourists who in *Farewell Miss Julie Logan* have challenged Adam to write about life in the glen during winter, but in these earlier sketches this idea is really only a means to an end for Barrie—a way of creating the credible illusion of a secluded, provincial minister sending in articles to a city newspaper. The idea of being locked in by the snow, which is so structurally and thematically important in *Farewell Miss Julie Logan*, is not developed at all; instead the main focus is on the relationship between the minister and his inquisitive servant girl, Janet. Some of the details of this relationship were transferred to that of Adam and Christily in *Farewell Miss Julie Logan* (such as the minister writing his account on sermon paper), but in the later work the relationship between minister and servant girl is subordinate to the ghost story itself. In terms of content and genre, therefore, the novella was entirely new.

The story begins with Adam explaining how he has been challenged by the English tourists to keep a diary during the winter months when the glen is “locked” in by the snow:

Then, according to the stories that crawl like mists among our hills, where the English must have picked them up, come forms called the ‘Strangers’. You go ‘queer’ yourself without knowing it, and walk and talk with these doolies, thinking they are of your world till maybe they have mischieved you (*Julie Logan*, p. 249).

He goes on to recount his experiences with Julie Logan, a beautiful young woman with whom he falls in love but who in reality is one of the strangers—the ghost of a Jacobite heroine. The diary form gives an immediacy to the texture of Adam’s writing and, as has often been remarked, the most striking difference between the book and the newspaper version is the considerably larger number of Scots words that the minister uses.¹¹ There is no evidence,

¹¹See Ormond, p. 139; McCleery, p. 92.

however, to support McCleery's claim that what appeared in the *Times* was a "linguistically bowdlerized" version (McCleery, p. 92). The existence of the Beinecke Library MS confirms that the text published in the *Times* was based on a completed manuscript and that the book version was an amended text, not an unexpurgated version. The extra Scots is extensive, amounting to over seventy instances in the text. Some of it is straightforward replacement of English words—"speel" for "climb," "shule" for "shovel," "slue" for "slip," "ower" for "over," "hallan" for "passage." Equally straightforward are the application of Scots words as adjectives, as in the description of Dr. John, which changes from being a "gnarled little figure" to a "gnarled, perjink little figure" (*Julie Logan*, p. 260), or the introduction of single words to expand a description, as in the opening of section IV, where "this world" becomes "this wastrie of a world" (p. 268). In addition, Barrie injected a Scots idiom into certain phrases, such as "half nine on the clock" (p. 271), "give it the go-by" (p. 256), "at times of ordinary wet" (p. 269), and "I minded that I was not getting a sound" (p. 296).

On numerous occasions, however, Barrie added whole sections which in extending passages of description or reflection allowed the introduction of more Scots into the prose. In the same description of Dr. John quoted above, an added passage describes how: "His blue eyes are hod away in holes, sunken into them, I suppose, because he has looked so long on snow" (pp. 260-1). Similarly, the description of the two streams that run out of Branders in opposite directions was extended to include the line: "In a spate as many new burns come brawling into this loch as there are hairs on a woman's head, and then are gone before they can be counted," (p. 260). Barrie's decision to increase the amount of Scots in this way would appear to pay lip-service to the agendas of the writers of the Scottish renaissance, particularly Hugh MacDiarmid and Lewis Grassie Gibbon, and their commitment to the significance of the Scots language as a primary and unique resource for the Scottish writer. In Barrie's hands the use of Scots becomes a valuable means of strengthening the presentation of the character of the minister. By making the text take the form of a diary Barrie allows Adam's character to emerge through his own writing. The poetic phrases and sensual descriptions with which he fills its pages (symbolically written on sermon paper) point to the essential dichotomy between the demands of the intellect and the lures of the emotions that lies at the center of the minister's personality and drives the narrative itself. It is Adam's struggle to suppress his romantic longings that brings about the loosening of his grip on reality, and the addition of so much synthetic Scots helped Barrie to develop this crucial aspect of the text by frequently injecting a greater poetic quality into the minister's prose. Describing Dr. John's journey to deliver Joanna's baby, for example, the introduction of Scots into Adam's commentary makes the narrative considerably more concise in the book version, which changes from "but the wind was lashing his face and the visibility was so bad that they soon lost each other" to "but a stour of snow was plastering his face and he lost

Fergie at the sleugh crossing" (*Julie Logan*, p. 273). The alliterative "s" sounds add considerably to the effectiveness of the description here and the self-conscious mix of English and synthetic Scots throughout the text makes it clear that this minister is one who likes to think very carefully about his manner of imaginative expression. Indeed at one point in the diary he describes Mistress Lindinnock as "tattooing" at a new tapestry before qualifying his remark by adding in parenthesis: "that cannot be the right word" (pp. 292-3).

Adam's love of beauty and his longing for the unknown exist in conflict, however, with the puritanical demands of his calling, which require him to dismiss any talk of ghosts as "superstitious havers" (p. 240). Though he is patently attracted to a supernatural interpretation for mysterious events—such as the birth of Joanna's baby in Chapter 5—his central role as moral guardian of the community means that he is always forced to uphold the claims of reason and restraint. As Leonee Ormond has remarked, however, Adam's diary "reveals how the young minister's struggles after spiritual perfection are constantly undermined from within," and this vital context between the inner and the outer man was something Barrie worked to develop when he revised the story for book publication (Ormond, p. 138). One of the longest sections that was added to the newspaper version was the description of the manse in Chapter 1 (*Julie Logan*, pp. 250-52), where Barrie extended the presentation of Adam as a man torn between his public and private selves. Here we are given an early indication of how easily Adam is swayed from the intellectual demands of his vocation when he records how he has tried to emulate his predecessors by treading the "Thinking Path" in the manse garden. Forlornly, he concludes that "they were deeper men than I am, and many a time I forget to think, though such had been my intention" (p. 253). Earlier on in this inserted section there is another significant image which also points forward to later events in the story. Describing the manse garden, Adam tells of how his predecessor tore down the jargonelle tree because when in "flourish" it "gave the manse the appearance of a light woman" (p. 253). This image of a former minister attempting to wipe away the illusory presence of a woman not only prefigures Adam's own creation of the illusion of Julie Logan but establishes the very important connection the story goes on to make between Adam's vocation as a minister and his repression of his sexual desires. As with the earlier example, Barrie was clearly working a hint into the story which affects the way we later respond to the character of Adam and his experiences with Miss Julie Logan.

Adam's self-portrait in this early chapter was something Barrie had struggled to perfect as he worked the story through its various drafts. In the manuscript there are some passages that were deleted and did not appear in any published version where the minister emphasizes his lack of physical prowess—he claims never in his life to have played any outdoor game—and also talks of an affection he had during his Divinities for a dog, whom he nursed and taught to jump over his stick. Coolly, he observes that "this was going too

far for a minister, and I decided with a heavy heart that I must give him away." These references to the minister's stunted capacity for fun and affection were cut in the published versions in favor of developing the references to his fiddle, which becomes the central symbol of his sexual and aesthetic repression. Adam repeatedly presents himself as sexually inadequate and convulsed with fear whenever he is placed in the company of women and his fiddle becomes a substitute object for the expression of his sexual desires. Early on in the story he notes how the fiddle distracted him at university away from his "intellectuals." Now, having been called to the glen, he never plays it but admits to taking it "out of its case nows and nans to fondle the strings" (p. 250). Adam's love of music is emphasis again of his love for beauty, but his response to the instrument is obviously being espoused in sexual terms, and the moments in the text that establish these connections were developed only after Barrie had completed a first draft of the story. The episode where Adam thinks he hears the violin playing by itself was not part of the original draft and only inserted later into the margins of the typed copy of the MS:

I suppose I did not stand still in my darkened hallan for more than half a minute, and when I struck a light to get at a candle the music stopped. There is no denying that the stories about the Spectrum flitted through me, and it needed a shove from myself to take me up the stair. Of course there was nobody. I had come back with the tune in my ears, or was it caused by some vibration in the air. I found my fiddle in the locked press just as I had left it, except that it must have been leaning against the door, for it fell into my arms as I opened the press, and I had the queer notion that it clung to me. I could not compose myself till I had gone through my manse with the candle, and even after that I let the instrument sleep with me (*Julie Logan*, p. 270).

The fiddle is clearly meant to represent a displaced object for the minister's sexual desires and, as Ormond has perceptively remarked, Adam's comment that "it might be hard on a fiddle never to be let do the one thing it can do" is an indirect reflection on himself and his own repression (Ormond, p. 141).

The symbolism of the fiddle was developed further in an important remark that Adam makes later on in the story which was also composed only when Barrie was revising the first typescript. After he first meets Julie Logan, Adam sits down to write about her and comments that "I am thinking I could pick her up better on my fiddle than in written words" (*Julie Logan*, p. 282). This revealing remark exposes what the poetic texture of the minister's writing has already made clear: Adam is an artist who is always looking to express reality in artistic terms, and in this sense *Farewell Miss Julie Logan* deals with the same core idea that permeates all of Barrie's fiction—the relationship between reality and the creative imagination. Adam emerges from the story as a latter-day relation of Gavin Ogilvy, Tommy Sandys and the other creative artists that

populate Barrie's earlier fiction published over thirty years before.¹² Like these characters, Adam responds to reality by attempting to capture it in artistic forms and ends up confusing the form with reality. Like Tommy Sandys he is only able to fall in love with creatures of his own imagination and only able to experience moments of heightened emotion within fantasy. It is significant that when, in his own words, he goes "queer" and is released from his inhibitions, he claims that "love was one of the words I did not scruple to handle" (*Julie Logan*, p. 299). Expression of love is possible for Adam only when he has been cut off from the inhibiting and restricting sense of reality by which he forces himself to live.

The developments to the symbolism of the fiddle were accompanied in revision by similar additions to the Jacobite theme of the story. In an attempt to overcome his "backsliding" with the fiddle, Adam lends it to the local postman on condition that he abstain from playing "the baneful Jacobite lilt" of which he is so fond. Posty, however, finds this irresistible, claiming "She likes that kind best, and she is ill to control once she's off." The extent to which the Jacobite songs are presented as being unnaturally repressed is extended by the imagery in the next sentence when Adam declares "it is pretty to hear him in the gloaming, letting the songs loose like pigeons" (*Julie Logan*, p. 270). The dual symbolism of the violin opens up another level to the text, taking us beyond the individual psyche of Adam to the collective psyche of Scotland.¹³ In the revision of his first draft Barrie increased the Jacobite allusions and was evidently working to effect the clear structural link that exists in the published versions between Adam's repression of his romantic longings and the community's—and by extension Scotland's—repression of the Jacobite past.

In the manuscript, Chapter 2 of the story is called "The Spectrum" and the section where Dr. John and Adam relate the story of "Someone Who Was With Him" (*Julie Logan*, pp. 262-3), which becomes the title of the chapter in the published versions, was added only after the manuscript had first been typed. Thus the first draft of the story did not connect the Julie Logan who appears to Adam with the story of the Jacobite heroine who according to local legend fed Prince Charlie when he lay fevered in the glen "for a time in July month" (p. 262). A further significant change was made to the chapter that follows the

¹²Gavin Ogilvy is the narrator of *The Little Minister* (1891) and Tommy Sandys the eponymous hero of *Sentimental Tommy* (1896) and *Tommy and Grizel* (1900). For a discussion of the way these two earlier characters are presented as creative artists, see my articles "From Realism to Romance: Gender and Narrative Technique in J. M. Barrie's *The Little Minister*," *Scottish Literary Journal*, 26 (June 1999), 77-92; and "'Trying to be a Man': J. M. Barrie and Sentimental Masculinity," *Forum for Modern Language Studies*, 35 (April 1999), 113-127.

¹³McCleery has followed this argument so far as to call the text a "condition of Scotland" novel (p. 91).

account of the story of this Jacobite heroine, where Dr. John proposes to Adam that

All the clash about folk of nowadays meeting 'Strangers' when the glen is locked comes out of that troubled past.... In a white winter, as you have jaloused yourself, there is ower little darg for a hardy race and they hark back by the hearthstone to the forgotten, ay, and the forbidden. But I assure you, Mr Yestreen, despite the whispers, the name of the '45 is buried in its own stour. Even Posty, though he is so gleg with the pipes, gets by himself if you press him about what his old ballants mean (*Julie Logan*, p. 264).

The Jacobite past is presented as having been consigned to an unspoken history but the key words "ay and the forbidden" are not in the original manuscript and were only inserted later, significantly at the same time as Barrie was developing the violin as a symbol of forbidden sexuality. It seems clear from his revisions that Barrie was using the theme of the forbidden to try to link the individual and national aspects of the story: the Jacobite past is something which Scotland has confined to an unreal ghost-world in the same way as Adam feels he must confine his imaginative and sensual desires to the realm of fantasy. It can only be brought back into the present through the world of art and the imagination, just as Adam can only realize his emotional desires artistically.¹⁴

The parallel was developed still further in the treatment of time and stillness in the text. The freezing in time of the Jacobite past parallels the freezing in both time and space of Adam's present. As he is locked in by the snow and becomes more and more cut off from the outside world, Adam comes to believe that time has become suspended. In a further passage which was also added during the first phase of revision, Adam observes:

Sometimes I stand by my window...and I have felt that night was waiting, as it must have done once, for the first day. It is the stillness that is so terrible. If only something would crack the stillness (*Julie Logan*, p. 271).

These added references to the stillness make crucial the later conversation between Dr. John and Adam in the epilogue where the two men conclude that if a supernatural interpretation to the story is to be embraced, it must be to do with the stillness of the glen:

This would have meant that the glen, instead of the minister, does sometimes go queer in the terrible stillness of the time when it is locked. 'We should have to think', the doctor said, with the kettle in his hand, 'that it all depended on the still-

¹⁴Barrie made a further addition to the Jacobite theme when he revised the newspaper version, inserting the reference which links the flushing of Julie Logan's throat with that of Mary Stewart (*Julie Logan*, p. 285).

ness of the glen. If it got to be stiller than themselves it woke them up, and they were at their old plays again.' (*Julie Logan*, pp. 305-6)

The suggestion is that the ghosts of the Jacobite past can only be awoken when the present becomes stiller than the past—in forms other than the actual and the historical—a suggestion which develops the interplay in the story between fantasy and reality, myth and history.¹⁵

Time and the relationship between past and present pervade the Epilogue of the story, written by Adam a quarter of a century later. Now married with a flourishing parish in a mining district, he recounts the one occasion when he revisited the glen, commenting on the different emotions he now has from those held by the young Adam. Even though he claims to be older and wiser, he is patently drawn to his youthful longings; when revising the first manuscript Barrie extended the references Adam makes to his divided self by inserting what now form the final three sentences of the story. The first draft of the narrative concluded with Adam anticipating that time will “no doubt efface even memory of Miss Julie Logan; and of mornings I may be waking up without the thought that I have dropped her in the burn.” The additional sentences, however, ironically undercut Adam’s prediction, and the published text suggests that the minister’s internal division remains unbroken:

Of course it is harder on young Adam. I have a greater drawing to the foolish youth that once I was than I have pretended. When I am gone it may be that he will away back to that glen (*Julie Logan*, p. 307).

The alterations to language, character and theme that I have been discussing so far are not perhaps as significant, however, to the overall effect of the work as are the changes Barrie made to the events of the ghost story itself. These range from the introduction of small episodes that increase the sense of the uncanny to one substantial alteration in the epilogue which makes the final version of the work a much more ambiguous and ultimately satisfying ghost story. In contrast to the ambiguity of the final text, the *Times* version is comparatively straightforward in its espousal of the ghost story; it simply attributes the uncanny events that occur to the delusions of Adam. In revision, however, Barrie saw the opportunity to exploit the potential provided by the narrative form of his work. Because the story is told entirely from Adam’s perspective, there is no objective ground upon which to assess his delusions and there remains the possibility of an open interpretation of the events. Furthermore, it is only in the last two chapters that Adam writes from the vantage point of believing that he was “away” in his mind. As Barrie perhaps realized, this introduces the possibility that his earlier narrative might itself be construed as un-

¹⁵Cairns Craig deals with this crucial dynamic of the story in his book *Out of History* (Edinburgh, 1996), p. 58.

stable and the telling episode where Adam records that his diary entry has twice disappeared was an addition Barrie made to the *Times* version:

To write this account of the glen when it is locked has been an effort, for the reason that I have done it twice already and in the morning it was not there. I sat down by lamplight on both occasions to write it and thought I had completed my tasks, but next morning I found just a few broken lines on otherwise blank pages. Some of them were repeated again and again like a cry, such as 'God help me', as if I were a bird caught in a trap (*Julie Logan*, pp. 270-71).

Two further changes that are made towards the end of the story also show how the author was keen to introduce a greater element of ambiguity into the text. The first of these comes in the crucial scene in Chapter 9 during the night of Hogmanay when Adam looks into the reflection of the Grand House in the burn and thinks that he sees "a throng of people in the hall" in the "Highland dress of lang syne" (*Julie Logan*, p. 295). It is only when he realizes that he has not heard any music that he considers looking up from the reflection to see whether, in fact, the throng is there at all. At this point the two versions depart significantly. In the newspaper text Adam contemplates to himself:

The company were as quiet as their reflections. If I had been an imaginative man I might have thought that the real house, which was invisible to me where I sat, was not lit up at all, and that what I saw in the water was just a reflection come trailing back from other days. I took a step or two to make sure about this, and then all the men in the water suddenly stood still, with their hands on dirk or broadsword. I thought they had heard a disquieting sound, and then I knew that what they heard have been my own movement. After that I sat very mouse, looking at nothing but the reflections. I was sure now that, despite the dancing, it was a gathering of the hunted folk as stealthy as the night itself.

In the much-altered book version, however, the episode is considerably more ambiguous:

The company were as quiet as their reflections. This made me look across the pond at the window itself, which so far I had been jouking lest the company there should take tent of me. I had a mistrust they were up to ploys that were not for a minister to see, and would mischief me if they caught me spying. But that stealthy stillness garr'd me look up and I took a step or two to see better. They were all on the move, but at once stopped, hands on dirk, and I opined they suspected a watcher. I doukit, and after that, except for a wink now and again, I looked at nothing but the reflections. I knew I was in danger, but this did not greatly fash me so long as I was not caught (*Julie Logan*, p. 296).

It is not at all certain from this description where Adam is looking when he sees the company stop with "hands on dirk." Whilst in the newspaper version it is made clear that he is looking at the men in the water, in the book ver-

sion it appears that at this moment Adam is unable to distinguish between the men in the water and the men (if there are any men) in the house. The ambiguousness succeeds in creating a much more convincing presentation of Adam's disordered mind, unable as he is to distinguish between reality and the fictions he has himself created.

The most significant alteration that Barrie made to the plot of the story, however, was to introduce a final twist to the tale which makes the text ultimately resistant to a purely rational interpretation. As Adam is staring at the reflection of the Grand House, he believes he sees Julie Logan filling a basket with food, which he later carries for her further along the side of the burn. After they have "said the kind of things a man and woman never say till they know each other through and through," Julie Logan tempts Adam to carry her in his arms into the burn, whereupon she reveals to him that she is a Papist and at that "awful word" Adam drops her into the burn (*Julie Logan*, p. 299). In the Epilogue, Adam recounts the events of the days immediately following these final experiences with Miss Julie Logan. "Pithless and bedded with fevers," he recalls how once, "in the middle of my rally, I escaped everybody and made for the sheep bield to decide for certain that the basket was not still there" (p. 301). In the *Times* version Adam records that "I dug for it with my hands as if there had once been a basket, and the only result of my senseless escapade was that it retarded my recovery for another month." In revision, however, Barrie changed the events of this episode completely. In the book version Adam later explains to Dr. John that he *did* find the basket that day, where it had been left, and that his "soul was so affrighted" that he "prayed long" and carried it down to the burn and "tore it to bits" (p. 307).

The effect of this alteration is obviously to refuse to allow the text to completely dismiss the possibility of a supernatural interpretation. In the *Times* version it is not implied that Julie Logan was anything other than a figment of the minister's imagination, whereas in the book version Adam's discovery of the basket raises the possibility that he really did experience what he later described in his diary, or at least that the exact events of that night are not something which we can deduce from the available evidence. And the necessary structural changes that Barrie made to the remainder of this final chapter illustrate how he worked to introduce into the final text a more balanced contest between a rational and a supernatural understanding of Adam's tale. The section where he meets up again with Dr. John (*Julie Logan*, pp. 303-5) was altered considerably in revision to accommodate the changed episode of the basket. In the *Times* version the two men simply talk amiably, evading the experiences of the past before Dr. John persuades Adam to "drop conjecture" and think of Julie Logan "if think I must, as what I had once called her, the end of a song." In the book version, however, Barrie allowed his character to talk more openly of the past events and conjecture how Adam might have been led to believe in his delusions. Both characters attempt to explain away a supernatural interpretation of the events, with Dr. John gravely concluding that "the af-

fair could only be construed naturally" so long as they accepted that the experiences Adam once thought he had gone through were "nothing but the fancies of a crazy man" (p. 306). At this point Adam decides to break his "many years' old resolution to keep the thing dark from all" and tells his friend of how he found the basket:

At first he was spurning it, nor can I say for certain that he believes it now. I leave it at that, but fine I know it would be like forsaking the callant that once I was to cast doubt on what lies folded up in his breast (*Julie Logan*, p. 307).

With this remark Adam's divided self refuses to make judgment and reinforces the essential element of ambiguity which Barrie worked to inject into the story when revising the *Times* version. The younger Adam still clings to a romantic interpretation of events, however much the older Adam may forsake them, and it is crucial to the overall theme of the story that the text conclude with the idea that there is more than one way of seeing things, because it is has been precisely this failure on Adam's part to reconcile fantasy and reality that has been the subject of the story. By changing the ending of the text and preventing it from coming down completely on the side of a realist interpretation, Barrie provided a much more appropriate conclusion. After all, as the story has shown, not to allow the imagination to run its rein is to end up losing your mind.

Institute of English Studies
University of London