

4-1-1968

Hiroshi Mizuta. Adam Smith's Library: A Supplement to Bonar's Catalogue with a Check-list of the whole Library. (Compiled with an Introduction and Bibliographical Annotations for the Royal Economic Society.) Cambridge. University Press. 1967. xix + 153 pp. \$6.50.

Vincent M. Bevilacqua  
*Cornell University*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/ssl>



Part of the [English Language and Literature Commons](#)

---

## Recommended Citation

Bevilacqua, Vincent M. (2013) "Hiroshi Mizuta. Adam Smith's Library: A Supplement to Bonar's Catalogue with a Check-list of the whole Library. (Compiled with an Introduction and Bibliographical Annotations for the Royal Economic Society.) Cambridge. University Press. 1967. xix + 153 pp. \$6.50.," *Studies in Scottish Literature*: Vol. 5: Iss. 4, 259–263.

Available at: <https://scholarcommons.sc.edu/ssl/vol5/iss4/9>

This Book Reviews is brought to you by the Scottish Literature Collections at Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Studies in Scottish Literature by an authorized editor of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact [digres@mailbox.sc.edu](mailto:digres@mailbox.sc.edu).

## REVIEWS

Hiroshi Mizuta. *Adam Smith's Library: A Supplement to Bonar's Catalogue with a Check-list of the whole Library.* (Compiled with an Introduction and Bibliographical Annotations for the Royal Economic Society.) Cambridge. University Press. 1967. xix + 153 pp. \$6.50.

As he noted himself to William Smellie the printer, Adam Smith was a "beau" in nothing but his books. Smith was, nonetheless, an enthusiastic though selective collector, acquiring in his lifetime a "small but excellent library" of some three thousand volumes, many — according to Smellie — "elegantly" bound, some "superbly" bound, and nearly all bearing his modest bookplate inscribed simply ADAM SMITH. Indeed, his own "Catalogue of Books" — a folio manuscript drawn up in 1781 either by or for Smith — lists by short title and location 1,120 works comprising a total collection of 2,300 volumes. According to the Smith "Catalogue," one could find "Hutcheson's System of Moral Philosophy 2 Vols.," for example, in the "Right Hand Window Book Case," or "Thucydides Bellum Peloponnesiacum 8 Vols." on the "Upper Row" of the "Book Case over the Chimney Piece."

In all, Smith's collection contained works on Language, Literature, and Art; Classics; Law, Politics, and Geography; Political Economy and History; and Philosophy and Science. More than one half were in English; slightly less than one half of the remainder in French; less than one fourth in Latin, Italian, and Greek; with only three volumes in German — all presentation copies and translations of Smith's own works. Among the more interesting titles beyond the expected ones in Economics, Politics, History, and Philosophy are a number on Painting and Architecture (by Bellori, Da Vinci, Palladio, and Reynolds), on Music (by D'Alembert, Chabanon, and Chastellux), on Science (by Galileo, Hooke, Franklin, and Priestley), and on Rhetoric and Belles Lettres (by the Greek and Roman rhetoricians, as well as Kames, Campbell, Blair, and Priestley). Curiously enough for one who at twenty-five delivered the first public lectures on belles lettres in Edinburgh (1748-50), Smith did not hold in his private collection Rollin's popular *Belles Lettres* (1726-28) or Gerard's highly regarded *Essay on Taste* (1759). For the most part, however, Smith's collection reflects accurately his neo-Classical and French tastes in the belles lettres.

On his death in 1790, Smith's library passed by will to his young cousin David Douglas, later Lord Reston. Reston, in turn, bequeathed the library to his two daughters, Mrs. Cunningham of Prestonpans and Mrs. Bannerman of Edinburgh. The entire Bannerman collection (about

#### STUDIES IN SCOTTISH LITERATURE

1,400 volumes) later went to David Douglas Bannerman and ultimately to the New College, Edinburgh. Part of the Cunningham collection was sold at Edinburgh in 1878, a portion of these books being donated to the University of Edinburgh in 1880, others remaining in private hands. A second part of the collection passed to Professor R. O. Cunningham who in his lifetime donated numerous titles to Queen's College, Belfast, the remaining works being sold on his death in 1918 to Dulau & Co. Ltd., London. In 1920 Professor Inazo Nitobé of the Imperial University, Tokyo, purchased from Dulau the 308 volumes of the Cunningham collection comprising the Japanese portion of Smith's library now in the possession of the Faculty of Economics of the University of Tokyo and fortunately still intact despite the great earthquake and fire of 1923 and the late World War. Inevitably various titles have fallen into yet smaller, private collections, thus rather widely dispersing the original Smith library.

In the belief that the contents of Smith's library would provide valuable insight into the intellectual origins of his writings, scholars in economics have long sought and catalogued the remnants of his collection with a view to determining the works which Smith had at hand during the composition of *The Wealth of Nations* from 1767 to 1776. The first such catalogue, James Bonar's handsome edition of 1894, lists the author, title, and location of about two thirds of the original Smith library (1,000 entries comprising 2,200 volumes), citing in red print numerous quotations from Smith's writings which demonstrate the use Smith made of his library in composing his own works from the early essays on language and literature in the *Edinburgh Review* (1755) to the posthumous *Essays on Philosophical Subjects* (1795), but quoting especially *The Wealth of Nations*. Bonar notes Smith's use of Quesnay, for example, in three passages from *The Wealth of Nations*, as well as Smith's debt to Addison in both the "Essay on the Imitative Arts" and the *Theory of Moral Sentiments* (1759). A second Bonar edition in 1932 retained the same format, adding many newly recovered titles (a 1733 Hudson edition of Longinus, Shaftesbury's *Characteristics*), while expanding and supplementing the citations from Smith's writings, again in red print. About twenty of Bonar's new titles were provided from the Japanese collection by Professor Eijiro Kawai of the Imperial University, Tokyo, the most notable being an entry listed "Smith, Adam. ed. A Catalogue of Books belonging to A.S.," mistakenly dated by Bonar (on the authority of Kawai) as 1761 thereby leading scholars falsely to believe that they had at last a detailed source of the works which Smith owned prior to *The Wealth of Nations*.

## REVIEWS

Since Kawai's list to Bonar was neither correct nor complete, Professor Tadao Yanaihara of the University of Tokyo supplemented Bonar's two editions in 1951 with a "full and detailed catalogue" of the 308 volumes in the Japanese collection, to which he appended a complete listing of the Smith "Catalogue" of 1781 contained in the collection. In general, Yanaihara follows Bonar's format, noting in marginal glosses variances between his entries and Bonar's (largely corrections and new or separate entries), providing brief descriptions of the works cited, and underscoring by cross reference to Bonar's quotations from Smith's writings the use which Smith made of works now in the Japanese collection. The appended Smith "Catalogue" is likewise cross-referenced with Bonar's Catalogue and represents a substantial addition to the total number of known titles from Smith's library listing several works for the first time, including some in rhetoric and belles lettres by Campbell, Harris, Monboddo, Dionysius, and Kames.

The most recent catalogue, by Professor Mizuta of Nagoya University, consists of two parts. "The first part is a Supplement to Bonar's Catalogue listing all the additional books from Adam Smith's Library that have been found by various people at various times since the publication of the second edition of Bonar's Catalogue in 1932." The second part "is a complete check-list of Adam Smith's Library, including both the books recorded by Bonar and all those listed in the present Supplement" (pp. vii). As such, Mizuta's work represents yet a further step in the systematic recovery of Smith's intellectual sources and provides the most complete listing to date of Smith's library.

In compiling his Supplement and Check-list, Mizuta has drawn heavily from Yanaihara and the Smith "Catalogue," as well as from such private holdings as the Rothschild Library (adding Reynolds's *Seven Discourses*), the library of Senator Luigi Einaudi of Italy, the library of Mr. H. Livingstone of Glasgow (containing Hooke's *Secret History*, listed by Bonar as of "unknown" location), and the university libraries of Tokyo, Kyoto, London, Belfast, Edinburgh, Glasgow, Harvard, and Johns Hopkins, making a total Japanese supplementation since 1951 of some 480 titles or 44 percent to Bonar's Catalogues.

In his Supplement, Mizuta follows Bonar's format, adding further bibliographical information to Yanaihara's short-title listing of the Smith "Catalogue" and where necessary to Bonar's Catalogue as well, including full or corrected titles, places and dates of publication, and the present location of previously missing works. More important still,

## STUDIES IN SCOTTISH LITERATURE

Mizuta cites where in *The Wealth of Nations* and the *Moral Sentiments* newly listed works are referred to—as, for example, Smith's reference in the *Moral Sentiments* to Hutcheson's *Inquiry into the Original of our Ideals of Beauty and Virtue* (1725) listed in the Smith "Catalogue" but not in the 1932 Bonar Catalogue. The Check-list is short-titled and cross-referenced with Bonar's Catalogue, Smith's "Catalogue," and the Mizuta Supplement. Many entries cited in the column designated "this Supplement" are wholly new to all other Smith catalogues: note, for instance, Reid's *Essays on the Intellectual Powers of Man* (1785) hitherto not known to have been part of Smith's library. In short, Mizuta's work is accurate, complete (though "Cassendi Opera 6 Toms." listed in Smith's "Catalogue" does not appear in the "all-inclusive" Check-list-Index), and invaluable to anyone who wishes to determine the sources which may have influenced the character of Smith's works. According to Mizuta, his Supplement together with Bonar's Catalogue "should contain a description of all books known to have belonged to Adam Smith" (pp. vii).

In his Introduction, Mizuta provides a brief review of the leading British-Japanese additions to Bonar's Catalogues since 1894, and includes as additional prefatory matter a "Guide" to the present volume, a "List of Locations," and a "List of Sources of Additions." Unfortunately, though understandably in light of his economist's orientation, Mizuta does not provide from the newly recovered titles examples of Smith's use of his library in his philosophical essays and literary works, especially his lectures on rhetoric and belles lettres edited and published in 1963 by John M. Lothian from student notes taken in 1762-63 at Glasgow University. (See Ernest C. Mossner, rev. of Adam Smith, *Lectures on Rhetoric and Belles Lettres*, ed. John M. Lothian [London, 1963], *SSL*, II [1965], 199-208.) On the whole, however, the work is an admirable piece of scholarship, handsomely composed and printed.

While Smith's personal library doubtless was considerably more limited in 1748-50 and 1762-63 than the 1,120 titles listed in his "Catalogue" of 1781 or the nearly 1,600 titles represented by subsequent catalogues, for students of Scottish literature Mizuta's Supplement and Check-list should provide such insight into the sources of Smith's Edinburgh and Glasgow lectures as may further "explain" the traditional orientation and philosophical inclination of his lectures on rhetoric and belles lettres. Indeed, the clear predominance of Greek and Roman authors in Smith's collection (Aristotle, Cicero, Quintilian, Isocrates, Demetrius, Dionysius, Longinus, Aphthonius, and Hermogenes) demonstrates the classical direction of his reading in rhetoric and—together



## REVIEWS

with his ethical theory and the prevailing neo-Classicism of the day — accounts for the prominence of the doctrine of stylistic “propriety” in his theory of rhetoric.

The Mizuta Check-list likewise demonstrates what rhetorical works Smith did not own — notably Ramian and Stylistic rhetorics of the sixteenth century (Fenner and Fraunce, Sherry and Peacham) — further explaining his traditional orientation and apparent rejection of Ramian-figurist rhetoric, as well as suggesting that Smith read his classical rhetoric in the original and not in one of the popular compendia of the day like Stirling’s *System of Rhetorick* (1733) or Holmes’s *Art of Rhetoric Made Easy* (1739), neither of which appears to have been in his library. Yet Smith’s inclusion in his library of Priestley’s *Lectures on Oratory and Criticism* (1777) — even more perhaps than his inclusion of Campbell’s esteemed *Philosophy of Rhetoric* (1776) and Blair’s widely popular *Lectures on Rhetoric and Belles Lettres* (1783) — indicates that rhetoric and belles lettres were of considerable lifelong interest to him and not a mere inclination of his youth, as in fact does his large collection of Burke’s speeches and Massillon’s sermons. It now remains for students of Scottish literary history to apply the insight provided by Mizuta’s Supplement and Check-list to Smith’s lectures on rhetoric and other literary works and thereby to suggest insofar as possible the origins of Smith’s understanding of rhetoric and belles lettres.

VINCENT M. BEVILACQUA  
CORNELL UNIVERSITY